

# **TACKLING PREJUDICE AND BUILDING CONNECTED COMMUNITIES**

**SCOTTISH GOVERNMENT RESPONSE TO THE REPORT  
OF THE INDEPENDENT ADVISORY GROUP ON HATE  
CRIME, PREJUDICE AND COMMUNITY COHESION**

**JUNE 2017**

## FOREWORD



There is no excuse for hate crime and prejudice. Scottish Government is absolutely committed to tackling it wherever it happens, whenever it happens and whoever it happens to. Those who don't experience it may not see it. But the reality is - an attack on one is an attack against us all.

The report of the Independent Advisory Group on Hate Crime, Prejudice and Community Cohesion we established last year was published in September of last year. I want to reiterate my thanks to Dr Duncan Morrow and the other members of the group for an insightful report with recommendations that reach across society. We accept the recommendations made within the report, and this response seeks to set out how we will go about implementing them. In doing so, I am clear that this is not for Government alone to do – and I know that there are many key partners who stand ready to support us in their work.

In reading the Advisory Group's report, I was struck by the testimony of those who experience hate. These personal insights and experiences can be lost when we discuss policy and law. These are people experiencing persistent, low level abuse and harassment many times a day – in public, on transport, at schools, at home and in work. Those experiences are traumatic, isolated and damaging to community cohesion. Whole communities can end up isolating themselves from society and enjoy less opportunity to interact and engage with other communities, leading to weaker integration. It is not good enough that people in our country are experiencing this. So I repeat - wherever it happens, whenever it happens, whoever it happens to – it needs to be tackled and it needs to stop.

Scotland is a diverse, multi-cultural society and that diversity is our strength. These are the words – we need to make them a reality. This can only happen if we take a broad approach. We must continue to talk up the benefits of equality, diversity and inclusion in our society. And we must never hesitate to shine a light on prejudice where it exists. Important as it is that victims of hate crime secure justice and perpetrators are tackled, we must recognise that this is about more than reporting a crime to the police. Achieving equality is a priority for this Government, and we have placed it the heart of our mission to create a fairer Scotland. We must do that if we are to create a Scotland – One Scotland – where there is simply no place for hatred and prejudice.

A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to read 'Angela Constance', with a long, sweeping underline.

**ANGELA CONSTANCE**

Cabinet Secretary for Communities, Social Security and Equalities

## **CONTENTS**

ADVISORY GROUP .....	3
POLICY CONTEXT .....	4
RECOMMENDATIONS .....	5
Strategic coordination and leadership.....	5
Terminology .....	6
Public awareness and education .....	7
Justice .....	9
Public Services and employment.....	10
Digital and online abuse .....	11
Data collection and evidence .....	11
ACTIONS WE WILL TAKE .....	13

## ADVISORY GROUP

At a summit convened by the Scottish Government on 14 October 2015, Ministers announced their intention to establish an Independent Advisory Group on Hate Crime, Prejudice and Community Cohesion. The main purpose of the group was to provide evidenced findings and recommendations which the Scottish Government can then take forward in partnership with communities to help eliminate hate crime for good.

The membership of the Advisory Group including Dr Duncan Morrow (chair and Director of Community Relations at the University of Ulster); John Wilkes (then Chief Executive of the Scottish Refugee Council); Pauline Kelly (Hate Crime Officer at Glasgow Community Safety Partnership); Rowena Arshad (Head of Moray House School of Education and Co-Director of the Centre for Education for Racial Equality in Scotland) and Morag McLaughlin (former Area Fiscal at the Crown Office and Procurator Fiscal Service, who served on the Advisory Group until May 2016). The Advisory Group's terms of reference were to:

- Take forward consideration of the nature, extent and impact of hate crime and broader hate behaviour on modern Scottish life. This should include considering existing evidence; identifying what further evidence is needed; and considering a realistic and achievable programme for gathering that evidence;
- Assess current practice to tackle hate crime, hate behaviour, reduce prejudice and build community cohesion, engaging with stakeholders and communities throughout on the issues of important to them whilst considering whether improvement can be delivered in these areas in a holistic and coordinated way; and use the evidence, information and views gathered provide initial findings to Scottish Ministers on future priorities and actions in this area in the spring of 2016.
- Provide independent and specialist expertise on the development of a robust policy agenda to tackling hate crime.
- Take a consensual, thematic approach to working with a broad range of stakeholders, interest groups and representative organisations, and aim to create a space for free and open discussions.

The Advisory Group met a number of times in 2014 and 2015. These included 5 general plenary meetings in Edinburgh and Glasgow which involved work planning, key stakeholder engagement and exploration of relevant issues. The Advisory Group also hosted a number of thematic roundtable discussions with stakeholder groups on the issues of race, faith, sexual orientation and gender identity, disability, and children and young people.

Stakeholders engaged with included Police Scotland; Crown Office and Procurator Fiscal Service; Education Scotland; BEMIS Scotland; the Coalition of Minority Ethnic Voluntary Organisations (CEMVO); the Coalition for Racial Equality and Rights (CRER); the Equality Network; Stonewall Scotland; LGBT Youth Scotland; LGBT Health and Wellbeing; Inclusion Scotland; People First; the Scottish Commission for Learning Disability; British Deaf Association; Muslim Council for Scotland; Scottish Council of Jewish Communities; Interfaith Scotland; Youthlink Scotland; the Scottish Youth Parliament; and the Scottish Trade Unions Congress.

The Scottish Government commends the Advisory Group for its thoughtful and measured work in a short space of time, and is grateful to the members of the Group for giving up their time to participate.

## **POLICY CONTEXT**

A cohesive society is one with a common vision and a sense of belonging by all communities; a society in which the diversity of people's backgrounds and circumstances is appreciated and valued; and a society in which similar life opportunities are available to all. The Scottish Government is committed to building strong, resilient and supportive communities, and ensuring that community cohesion is maintained and strengthened is key to this. Community cohesion is absolutely essential in ensuring that we are truly 'One Scotland' where people live in peace and everyone has the opportunity to flourish. Hate crime and prejudice threaten community cohesion, and have a corrosive impact on Scotland's minority communities as well as broader society. We believe that it is never acceptable and we are committed to tackling it.

Scotland is becoming a more diverse country, particularly with free movement of people from other parts of Europe to Scotland and with the arrival of refugees and asylum seekers from other countries. Shifting cultural attitudes over years and decades have created a climate where diversity is much more accepted and recognised within society, and individuals and communities feel more able to celebrate their identities. We do not articulate what 'Scottish values' are in the same way that the UK Government has articulated 'British values', nor do we seek to. Nevertheless, we have spoken of common themes that run throughout Scottish society, including traditions of fairness, a collective spirit, a commitment to equality and a respect for rights. This is the broad vision to which the Government holds.

It is important in this not to project any sense of complacency or "Scottish exceptionalism". Prejudice continues to permeate parts of Scottish society, and a significant minority of the Scottish population continue to feel it is acceptable to hold prejudicial views. Minorities continue to experience hate crime and prejudice in their daily lives. Social attitudes are influenced by the prevailing media narrative, often around international events, that can sometimes inflame tensions and seek to characterise communities in negative ways. More broadly, persistent inequalities continue to be rooted within Scottish society and there remains much more to do to deliver true equality and equality of opportunity for everyone in Scotland.

Scotland's national outcomes set out that our collective vision is for a more equal Scotland where young people are confident and responsible citizens; we have strong, resilient, supportive and safe communities where people take responsibility for their own actions and how they affect others; that we tackle the inequalities in Scotland; and we take pride in a strong, fair and inclusive national identity. In response to the Christie Commission, our approach has a focus on prevention, on continual improvement, and working in partnership at both national level and locally. We have worked hard over many years to build close relationships and partnerships with Scotland's diverse communities and, in our work to create an inclusive and cohesive Scotland, we value diverse communities for themselves and for their wider societal and economic contributions. We value people's and communities' assets

and strengths, and through focusing on these strengths we help to create conditions that foster good relations, develop social capital and build capacity within communities to improve outcomes. Working with communities in this way enables people to shape and co-produce the services they use, drawing on their knowledge and skills to develop person-centred solutions.

Frequent engagement at Ministerial and official level with community leaders enables a collective approach to deliver outcomes, as well as an opportunity to discuss their issues and concerns. Positive relationships are also fostered with communities through Police Scotland's approach to engaging and providing community reassurance as required, and Police Scotland have well developed critical links with numerous community groups and strategic stakeholders at a local and national level. We have supported third sector organisations working towards race and religious equality; published a Race Equality Framework to tackle racism and race discrimination; and published Scotland's ESOL (English for Speakers of Other Languages) Strategy, setting out our approach to English language provision to enable new Scots to integrate and contribute to Scottish life through work, study, family and local communities. We promote dialogue and understanding between different faiths (along with those with no faith) and seek to foster an atmosphere where diversity is seen as a strength and there is mutual understanding of different ways of life.

We recognise too the danger from people who seek to spread hate and disrupt our way of life. We have demonstrated that we will take robust action to challenge intolerance, prejudice and discrimination. We are strongly committed to keeping Scotland safe, and where individuals or groups try to use violence or the threat of violence to advance their aims, we will work with others to firmly counter them. Whilst it is clear that we are taking action to build an inclusive, cohesive and safe Scotland, we are not complacent and there remains more to be done. We will continue to develop our approach towards an inclusive and cohesive Scotland, with the actions outlined in this response forming part of that work.

## RECOMMENDATIONS

### Strategic coordination and leadership

*The Advisory Group recommended that the Scottish Government should encourage a greater **multi-agency strategic and operational approach** towards tackling hate crime, eradicating prejudice and building community cohesion that is clearly linked to community planning structures and underpinned by guidance for partners.*

We agree that a strong multi-agency response towards these issues is essential and to support this we will establish a multi-agency delivery group to take forward the implementation of the recommendations within the Advisory Group's report. This will have Ministerial oversight, and will include key stakeholders such as Police Scotland, the Crown Office and Procurator Fiscal Service. We will ask the group to consider measures to promote a strategic approach towards tackling hate crime, eradicating prejudice and building community cohesion, whilst respecting the independent responsibilities of COPFS and Police Scotland.

We also recognise the importance of ensuring our approach to building community cohesion is informed by expert advice and opinion. To support this, we will establish an Advisory Panel on Community Cohesion, to provide expert advice on how we can strengthen our approach to building cohesive communities and safeguarding people from harm.

More generally, we will work to ensure that our approach to tackling hate crime and prejudice and building community cohesion is appropriately located within the Scottish Government's broader strategic agenda around promoting equality and tackling discrimination. Linking to initiative such as the Race Equality Framework, the Disability Delivery Plan and the New Scots refugee integration strategy reflects the importance of effectively tackling hate crime in these communities, and the necessity of working closely with communities to take this work forward.

We also recognise that our key partners are doing important work in this area. In addition to Police Scotland, we continue to work closely with the Crown Office and Procurator Fiscal Service (COPFS) who continue to engage with stakeholders. Following their successful biennial conference on Tackling Prejudice in March 2016, COPFS are planning a further conference for March 2018. They have received wide recognition for their work on corporate equality and diversity, and have worked closely with stakeholders to raise awareness, develop teaching resources, and train ambassadors for community cohesion and safety. We will continue to work closely with Police Scotland, COPFS and others to reduce hate crime and build community cohesion.

*The Advisory Group recommended that the Scottish Government should develop clear plans for taking forward the **public sector equality duty to 'foster good relations'**, and encourage other public bodies to do likewise. It also recommended that **local examples of good practice** in tackling hate crime should be identified and presented in a consistent way to inform policy and practice.*

We recognise that it can sometimes be challenging for public authorities to apply the 'fostering good relations' aspect of the Public Sector Equality Duty. We will work with the Scottish National Equality Improvement Programme (SNEIP) Board to share best practice in applying this aspect of the Duty, and consider with them what further guidance and support may be required for public authorities in this area. Through the SNEIP, we are in the process of developing a collaborative hub to share best practice in fulfilling the Public Sector Equality Duty, and will use this to share this practice across public service practitioners. We will task the multi-agency delivery group with identifying examples of good practice in tackling hate crime, and use the collaborative hub to share these.

## **Terminology**

*The Advisory Group recommended that the Scottish Government should lead discussion on the **development of clearer terminology and definitions** around hate crime, prejudice and community cohesion.*

Hate crime is defined in law as a criminal act that is aggravated by prejudice held by the perpetrator in relation to the victim or victims. The criminal act can take any form

as stated under criminal law (including breach of the peace, assault etc). Prejudice is defined as a preconceived opinion that is not based on reason or actual experience. As for community cohesion, we believe that a cohesive society is one with a common vision and a sense of belonging by all communities; a society in which the diversity of people's backgrounds and circumstances is appreciated and valued; and a society in which similar life opportunities are available to all.

We recognise that the term 'hate crime' can sometimes be challenging in relation to recognition of the event by both victim and perpetrators, and we will continue to engage with stakeholders on these matters. We will also engage in dialogue on how to strengthen the understanding of links between prejudice and hate crime, and "what works" to tackle prejudice. We will continue to articulate our definition of community cohesion along with our approach to it, to ensure this is widely understood. Across all of these concepts, we will consider how terminology and definition may become more useful in seeking to tackle and address these issues.

In some cases, specific terminology exists that has been agreed internationally and which helps to better define these issues. One example is the definition of anti-Semitism<sup>1</sup> which was agreed by the International Holocaust Remembrance Alliance in May 2016. We have already said that we find the definition to be helpful in describing manifestations of anti-Semitism. We will adopt the definition to inform our work in this area, and work with stakeholders to better understand how the definition translates into improved practice for tackling anti-Semitism.

On 26 January the Minister for Community Safety and Legal Affairs announced that Lord Bracadale would carry out an independent review of hate crime legislation. Although not specifically stated within his remit, Lord Bracadale may consider the terminology and definitions used in relation to hate crime legislation.

## **Public awareness and education**

*The Advisory Group recommended that **public education should be undertaken to improve understanding of the nature and extent of hate crime.***

At a parliamentary debate on working together to tackle hate crime and prejudice that took place on 9 November, the Cabinet Secretary for Communities, Social Security and Equalities announced that the Scottish Government would develop a country-wide campaign to raise awareness of the effects of hate crime on individuals and communities.

Our approach taking this campaign forward will be three fold. We want to raise awareness amongst people who are at risk of experiencing hate crime to increase their understanding of what it constitutes and encourage them to report it. We want to ensure that perpetrators understand the impact of their behaviour on people and society. We want the wider population to have a better understanding of what a hate crime is. And we want anyone who witnesses such crimes to have a greater knowledge of safe intervention methods that may be adopted during or after the

---

<sup>1</sup> [https://www.holocaustremembrance.com/sites/default/files/press\\_release\\_document\\_antisemitism.pdf](https://www.holocaustremembrance.com/sites/default/files/press_release_document_antisemitism.pdf)

crime has taken place, as well as providing advice on all the various available options that can be used to report these crimes safely and confidentially.

*The Advisory Group recommended that the Scottish Government should encourage all **primary and secondary educational institutions to use Curriculum for Excellence** to address issues of prejudice and hate crime. It also recommended that the Scottish Government and Education Scotland should **utilise the schools inspection framework** to better monitor how schools are tackling issues relating to prejudice and equality, including identifying models of best practice and supporting efforts to raise standards in all schools.*

The Scottish Government published revised guidance on relationships, sexual health and parenthood (RSHP) in 2014, which addresses these issues. Many local authorities have already changed their planning and delivery of RSHP and personal & social education to include the revised guidance. Going forward, we will progress the implementation of our new relationships and behaviour policy, which supports local authorities and schools to further improve relationships and behaviour in their learning communities.

We are also refreshing our National Approach to Anti-bullying for Scotland's Children and Young People, which includes bullying based on prejudice, and this will be published later in 2017. The Deputy First Minister recently agreed to a request from the Scottish Parliament's Equalities and Human Rights Committee for further engagement by the Committee on this issue. The Scottish Government will carefully consider the issues raised by the Committee and will publish the refreshed guidance later this year.

Education Scotland is continuing to self-evaluate how well it delivers its equality duties, and there are a number of on-going initiatives including the production of a revised strategy and policy on equality which is currently being consulted on internally.

The self-evaluation tool 'How Good is our School 4' was launched in September 2015 and came into force for all schools in August 2016. This national self-evaluation framework includes a safeguarding quality indicator on ensuring wellbeing, equality and inclusion. This indicator focuses on ensuring wellbeing entitlements and protected characteristics supports all learners to maximise their successes and achievement. Education Scotland's inspection and review work has a key role in ensuring inclusion by promoting equality and fairness for all learners. It does this by making sure establishments and services are held accountable to stakeholders, and by driving improvement and capacity building, through evaluating the extent to which education and service providers bring about inclusion and equity in education. 'How Good is Our School 4' and 'How Good is Our Early Learning and Childcare' include this indicator. From August 2016, all inspectors of early learning and childcare establishments, primary, secondary, special and independent schools inspections have included evaluation of this indicator.

Education Scotland will report on quality indicator evaluations across establishments and on evidence of the quality of practice. They already undertake analysis of intelligence and evidence from inspection activity, and from partners in their wide

range of professional networks, which is used to identify gaps and strengths in provision; review existing Education Scotland materials on the National Improvement Hub and corporate website in relation to good practice; and contribute to the development and provision of policy advice, if appropriate. More generally, in sharing practice, Education Scotland issues newsletters, updates inspectors on sector leading practice, local authority link officers sharing interesting best practice and professional networks used to exemplify areas of emerging practice.

*The Advisory Group recommended that key stakeholders that contribute to the professional development and continuing professional development of teachers (e.g. Education Scotland, University Schools of Education, local authorities, and the General Teaching Council of Scotland) should seek to develop the **capacity of the teaching workforce to better understand issues of prejudice and equality** in the context of their role as educational professionals.*

The Scottish Government expects all new, guidance and promoted teachers – and eventually all teachers – to undertake training on equality. We will work with the General Teaching Council for Scotland (GTCS) and Education Scotland to provide more support to teachers on equality issues through Initial Teacher Education programmes and CPD. The Scottish Government recently published a content analysis of Initial Teacher Education (ITE), including the equalities element of ITE, and will now consider the findings with universities and the GTCS. The results of this piece of work, alongside GTCS’s work to review the Teaching Standards, represent the first steps towards discussions on future content.

*The Advisory Group recommended that Education Scotland should explore further the potential of **youth work** (as a model of peer-led intervention) to contribute to tackling hate crime and prejudice. It also recommended that youth work practice in the area of challenging prejudice and promoting inclusion and cohesion should be shared with relevant partners including police, schools and local government.*

We know youth work organisations and the youth work sector are continuously engaging with young people and other professionals in innovative collaborative ventures with schools, colleges and key services around employability, sports, culture, health, justice amongst other things. Youth work contributes positively to a wide range of government policies and has a significant impact in improving the life chances of young people. In partnership with a range of stakeholders, we will continue to implement the National Youth Work Strategy of 2014-19, and we will work with the sector to identify steps to progress this recommendation. In this context, we will take forward work with youth work organisations specifically to build capacity and share practice around hate crime and prejudice.

## **Justice**

*The Advisory Group recommended that the Scottish Government should **consider whether the existing criminal law provides sufficient protections** for those who may be at risk of hate crime, for example based on gender, age or membership or other groups such as refugees and asylum seekers.*

As part of his independent review of hate crime legislation, Lord Bracadale is considering whether changes need to be made to the current laws, whether existing offences should be extended to cover other groups; and whether all hate crimes should be brought into one area of legislation. The review will include public consultation with key stakeholders and is expected to report to Ministers in early 2018.

*The Advisory Group recommended that Police Scotland and its partners should review the effectiveness of the **third party reporting** centre network and develop action steps to improve this, as well as address **barriers to reporting**.*

The Scottish Government will ask the multi-agency delivery group to look at these issues and consider how to address barriers, ensuring that our approach is informed by Police Scotland's on-going work to develop the third party reporting infrastructure. Police Scotland have conducted an internal review of the third party reporting process and identified a number of areas for potential improvement. Recommendations around the recognition and recording methods used to capture support provided to third party reporting centres are currently being progressed.

*The Advisory Group recommended that the Scottish Government and partners should explore the use of **restorative justice methods** with victims and perpetrators of hate crime.*

The Scottish Government is committed to publishing general guidance relating to restorative justice soon. This is being developed in collaboration with restorative justice experts and those with expertise in dealing with victims' issues, to ensure that the interests of all those participating in the restorative justice process are reflected. We will consider further how we disseminate this guidance to support restorative justice approaches in relation to prejudice based crime, where this is seen to be appropriate.

## **Public Services and employment**

*The Advisory Group recommended that local government and key partners should **afford building community cohesion greater prioritisation** within community planning structures, and link this to targets to reduce the incidence of hate crime and isolation. They also recommended that public services should ensure that their **systems for managing complaints and feedback** and reporting on the outcomes of complaints and feedback are fit for purpose, and work with affected minority communities to develop these further.*

It is of course a matter for local government and community planning partners to decide what they prioritise based on their local circumstances. So to support their considerations and highlight the Advisory Group's recommendations, we will invite CoSLA and other relevant partners to join the multi-agency delivery group so we can work together to consider these issues further.

*The Advisory Group recommended that the Scottish Government work with all stakeholders (including transport providers and workers) to consider how better to protect those experiencing hate crime on **public transport**.*

One of the actions in 'Going Further', the Scottish Government's new Accessible Travel Framework to support disabled people to travel, is to develop a transport hate crime charter which will be modelled on the current 'Together Let's Drive Hate Crime Out' charter and will be agreed with transport service providers providing clear, common standards and consistent processes. The Charter will deliver one of the co-produced actions in the Framework which were agreed between disability organisations, transport providers, local and national government. We want it to ensure culture change on transport, so victims and witnesses feel increasingly confident in reporting hate crime and challenging it in a safe way. Although this approach has been developed in coproduction with disabled people's organisations, it is also relevant to and will consider the impact on other protected characteristics. Many of the steps to be taken under this action will have positive impacts for everyone, such as trying to ensure consistent CCTV retention timescales that support the work of the police.

*The Advisory Group recommended that the Scottish Government work with employer bodies and others to explore improved methods to prevent, detect and respond to **hate crime and prejudice in the workplace**.*

We will gather further evidence of individual experience of hate crime and prejudice in the workplace. Thereafter, we will convene key stakeholders to discuss further work in this area in the context of our wider ambitions around the Fair Work agenda.

### **Digital and online abuse**

*The Advisory Group recommended that the Scottish Government undertake work with key stakeholders to improve the monitoring of and response to **online hate crime and prejudice**.*

The independent review of hate crime legislation being carried out by Lord Bracadale will consider the effectiveness of the current legislative framework in tackling online hate crime. Following receipt of his recommendations, we will consider any recommendations that Lord Bracadale makes in this area and reflect upon what further protections may be necessary in respect of online hatred and threatening communications. More broadly, we recognise that, with the rise in use of social media, hatred and prejudice has manifested itself much more visible in online settings. Recognising the serious concerns around this, the Scottish Government will engage with stakeholders on what more we can do to prevent and tackle online hatred and misogyny.

### **Data collection and evidence**

*The Advisory Group recommended that the Scottish Government works with partners to improve the **monitoring and data collection** in relation to hate crime, and to develop methods to include qualitative indices of improvement in community cohesion for minorities.*

We agree that developing the evidence base on hate crime is a key priority and have already begun work to support this. We previously outlined plans to produce more

detailed information on police recorded hate crime and are working with Police Scotland as they develop their hate crime data. Once complete, the intention is to produce more detailed hate crime statistics. Input from equality stakeholders will be important to us as we take this work forward.

On community cohesion, we are in the process of refreshing the National Performance Framework which includes National Outcome 11 (which states that “we have strong, resilient and supportive communities where people take responsibility for their own actions and how they affect others”). An internal steering group jointly chaired by the Chief Social Policy Adviser and the Director for Safer Communities has been taking this forward, and consideration is being given to the introduction of qualitative indicators which would complement an expanded quantitative data set.

## ACTIONS WE WILL TAKE

- **Establish a national multi-agency delivery group with Ministerial oversight** to take forward the implementation of the Advisory Group's recommendations.
- **Establish an Advisory Panel on Community Cohesion**, to provide expert advice on how we can strengthen our approach to building cohesive communities and safeguarding people from harm.
- **Review our approach to engaging with communities**, to ensure that we are aware of their issues and concerns
- In summer 2017, **set out a range of initiatives supported through our Equality Budget** that will contribute to tackling hate crime and prejudice, and building community cohesion
- Work with disabled people's organisations to implement **our action plan on disability** '*A Fairer Scotland for Disabled People*' to address the underreporting of disability hate crime.
- Work through the **Race Equality Framework** to engage with minority ethnic communities in building community cohesion and safety, and improving the lives of Scotland's minority ethnic communities.
- Work with the Scottish National Equality Improvement Programme to **share best practice around fostering good relations** in communities and consider what further guidance and support may be required to enable them to do this
- **Engage in dialogue around definitions and terminology**, taking account of any conclusions that Lord Bracadale's review of hate crime legislation may offer in this regard.
- **Adopt the international definition of anti-Semitism**, and engage with stakeholders on how this translates into improved practice on the ground
- **Develop a public awareness campaign** around the impacts of hate crime in partnership with stakeholders, and run this later in 2017 to coincide with wider awareness raising initiatives.
- **Progress the implementation of our new relationships and behaviour policy**, which supports local authorities and schools to further improve relationships and behaviour in their learning communities
- **Publish a refreshed approach to anti-bullying**, including prejudice-based bullying

- **Consider learning from evaluation of the education inspection indicator** relating to inclusion, and work with Education Scotland to ensure that best practice is disseminated
- Explore further the potential of **youth work** (as a model of peer-led intervention) to contribute to tackling hate crime and prejudice.
- **Consider the recommendations of Lord Bracadale’s independent review** of hate crime legislation, and set out how we intend to implement these
- Through the newly established multi-agency delivery group, **consider how to break down barriers to reporting** and inform this with Police Scotland’s work on developing the third party reporting infrastructure.
- **Publish guidance for delivery of restorative justice in Scotland** which will ensure that where restorative justice processes are available, these will be delivered in a coherent, consistent, victim focussed manner across Scotland
- **Agree a hate crime charter with public transport operators** which provides clear, common standards and consistent processes for dealing with hate crime on public transport
- Work with the STUC and others to **gather evidence of hate crime experienced within the workplace**, with an initial focus on front line workers
- Engage with key stakeholders to **consider further steps to prevent and tackle online hatred and misogyny**
- Develop our approach to **gathering evidence around hate crime**, and bring forward a new hate crime publication later in 2017
- Set a specific outcome within our **Equality Outcomes** on hate crime, and report on progress through our Mainstreaming and Equality Outcomes publication.
- To better measure progress in this area, **strengthen national outcome 11 of the National Performance Framework** which focuses on our efforts to build strong, inclusive and supportive communities and ensure that the rights and wellbeing of Scotland’s minority communities are central to our business.
- **Publish an update on progress** relating to the implementation of the Advisory Group’s recommendations in 2020.

Published by The Scottish Government



© Crown copyright 2017

ISBN: 978-1-78851-041-7

Produced for The Scottish Government by APS Group Scotland, 21 Tennant Street, Edinburgh EH6 5NA  
PPDAS265539 (06/17)

**W W W . g o v . s c o t**