

Appendices

Appendix A – Non-participant observation framework

The ethnographers should take "skeleton" notes throughout each Assembly weekend and flesh these out afterwards from their recollection of the events. It is important for observers to attend the Assembly with an open mind rather than pre-determined ideas of what to observe, and so the observation framework set out here is a very loose guide.

Things to observe

The observation should focus on the key actors in the Assembly e.g. the members, the conveners, the facilitators, and the speakers and the interactions and dynamics within and between each group. This should include all sessions of the Assembly including the breaks.

Particular attention should be paid to participants' mood, the atmosphere at the Assembly, and presence of key deliberative norms (e.g. inclusion, justification of views, storytelling, respect to the views of others, listening, and turning points in people's opinions etc.).

- Members – how did they interact with each other? What do they talk about? Do they say positive or negative things about the Assembly? Are cliques forming? Is everyone made welcome? Do they listen intently? How do they express their views?
- Facilitators – how do the facilitators' manage the discussions? What techniques do they use? Do they express opinions? How do they keep the discussion focused? How do they ensure all participants are included? How do they manage more vocal members? How do they involve quieter members?
- Conveners – how did the Conveners communicate with the members? Did the members seem engaged and interested? Bored? Or intimidated?
- Speakers – how did the presenters put across their information? How did people react to it? What kinds of questions did they ask e.g. clarification or more information? What was the gender balance of the members asking the questions? How did the speakers respond to the questions asked? Did all questions get answered?
- General organisation – reflect on the clarity of purpose and structure of the two days. Consider the physical environment; timing and timekeeping. Did the process, as a whole, seem balanced in terms of opportunities for learning and discussing? Was the flow of the sessions appropriate?

Writing notes – things to jog your memory

When writing up field notes, to jog the memory, perhaps consider the following:

- What actually happened?
- Who was involved?

- Atmosphere – what kind of room was it? How did people feel? Did the atmosphere change over the course of the event?
- The ‘silent majority’ – if there was a hostile/aggressive atmosphere, did this come from everyone or where there just one or two particularly loud voices? What about the ‘silent majority’? Do you think the loud voices represented the views of the rest of the room?

Remember you are a person too!

Reflect on your own feelings and reactions to the event in which you have participated.

- Note how certain events/actions/atmospheres made you feel and why.
- These can be written in a personal or diary format.
- Reflect on why that might have been after the event.

Appendix B – Fieldnotes key themes

Empirical codes

Code name	Definition	Note
Convener speech act	Instances of verbal and non-verbal communication by a convener during the Assembly. This cluster focuses on what conveners communicated, rather than the quality of that communication.	This code only applies to convener speech acts during the Assembly itself. The convener was often not present during the facilitator (de)briefs.
Facilitator speech act	Instances of verbal and non-verbal communication by a facilitator during the Assembly. This cluster focuses on what facilitators communicated, rather than the quality of that communication.	This code only applies to convenor speech acts during the Assembly itself. Facilitator speech acts during facilitator (de)briefs can be found through the 'reflective practice' cluster.
Member speech act	Instances of verbal and non-verbal communication by a member during the Assembly. This cluster focuses on what members communicated, rather than the quality of that communication.	
Expert speech act	Instances of verbal and non-verbal communication by an expert speaker during the Assembly. This cluster focuses on what experts communicated, rather than the quality of that communication.	
Secretariat speech act	Instances of verbal and non-verbal communication by a representative of the secretariat during the Assembly. This cluster focuses on what the secretariat communicated, rather than the quality of that communication.	
Materials/Tools/Techniques	Codes that specify the use and function of physical materials, organisational tools and communication techniques during the Assembly.	This includes the digital tools used in the second half of the Assembly.
Other People	Codes that specify the people that are present during the Assembly, as well as their roles.	
Procedures	Codes that specify the procedures the Assembly follows, as well as the format of deliberation. This cluster focuses on how deliberations proceeded, not on the quality of those proceedings.	
Results	Codes that specify the output of deliberation. This cluster focuses on what the output is, not on the quality of that output.	

Topics	Codes that specify the topics of deliberation.
Evidence	Codes that specify the evidence being presented at the Assembly. This cluster focuses on what the evidence is, not the quality of that evidence.
Research	Codes that relate to the activities of the research team. This includes gathering consent for audio-recordings.
Time/Place	Codes that specify the time and location of the events. This includes codes that describe the space the events are taking place in.

Analytical axial codes

Code name	Definition	Note
Equality	Codes that evaluate whether horizontal power-relations are maintained between (subgroups of) members, between members and support staff and between members and experts.	
Inclusivity	Codes that evaluate whether the deliberations are fully inclusive, in the sense of providing support for members that need it, and in maintaining a safe and welcoming environment for all members to contribute.	
QoFacilitation	Codes that evaluate the quality of facilitation, beyond the maintenance of inclusion and equality.	This code can be combined with the member and facilitator speech act codes to assess what members and facilitators themselves thought about the quality of facilitation.
Learning	Codes that evaluate whether experts provided learning opportunities by presenting information in a clear, concise and accessible way; whether members learned from evidence sessions; and whether members applied this knowledge during deliberations.	
Justification/QoDeliberation	Codes that evaluate whether the principle of reason-giving is applied by members during the deliberations.	This code can be combined with the convenor, member and facilitator speech act codes to assess what the convenor, members and facilitators themselves thought about the quality of deliberation.
Contextualisation/QoFraming	Codes that evaluate whether the principle of reason-giving is applied	This code can be combined with the convenor, member and

	by convenors, facilitators and other support staff when explaining and framing the procedures and deliberation formats.	facilitator speech act codes to assess what the convenor, members and facilitators themselves thought about the quality of framing. This code also includes those moments in which members were unsure about what they were supposed to do.
Reflective practice	Codes that highlight the iterative nature of the process; evaluate the responsiveness of the process to member and facilitator feedback; and the adaptability of the process to unforeseen circumstances.	This code also includes the Q&A sessions during the pre-Assembly facilitator briefs.
Mutual trust/cooperation	Codes that evaluate whether the Assembly performed a socialising role: whether the Assembly encourages mutual trust between members and between members and support staff, whether it fosters personal relations and whether it creates a positive atmosphere. In brief, whether the Assembly encourages 'commoning'.	
Metadeliberation	Codes that evaluate the extent to which members (are encouraged to) deliberate about the process itself, and member- and facilitator expressions about the quality of the process itself.	
Transparency	Codes that evaluate the extent to which the Assembly was visible to the broader Scottish public, and the impact of this visibility on the process itself.	
Agenda-setting	Codes that evaluate the extent to which the topics of deliberation of the Assembly are the product of member input, and the extent to which members feel they are in control of the agenda.	
Output	Codes that evaluate the quality of the output, as determined by the non-participant observers, members and support staff.	This code also refers to all those moments in which a standard was set for the output of the Assembly. i.e. "the results need to be clear".
Incidents/lessons learned	Codes that identify lacuna or insufficiencies throughout the Assembly, and codes that show how these issues are or might be mitigated.	This code also includes all the post-Assembly facilitator debriefs.

Appendix C – Member survey questions

Weekend	Survey	Variable	Survey item	Response categories
1, 8	Post	Age	<p>In which group are you? Please tick the age category (in years) that applies to you.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • 16-21 • 22-29 • 30-44 • 45-59 • 60-74 • 74+ 	Single option
1, 8	Post	Gender	<p>What best describes your gender identity? Would you describe yourself as a...?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Man • Woman • In another way 	Single option
1, 8	Post	Education	<p>What is the highest level of education that you have completed?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • University degree/Higher Education • Other further education, including apprenticeships and professional qualifications (e.g. diplomas and NVQS) • Secondary school/College (up to 18 years of age) • Secondary schooling (up to 16 years of age) • Primary schooling (up to 11 or 12 years of age) • Other 	Single option
8	Post	Income	<p>What was your total take-home income for everyone in your household for the month of January 2020 (before the COVID-19 pandemic)?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Less than £500 • Between £500 and £1000 • Between £1000 and £1800 • Between £1800 and £3000 • Between £3000 and £5200 • More than £5200 • Don't know • Prefer not to say 	Single option
8	Post	Ethnicity	<p>What is your ethnic group?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • White – Scottish • White – other British • White – Irish • White – other • Mixed or multiple ethnic group • Asian, Asian Scottish or Asian British • African • Caribbean or Black • Other ethnic group 	Single option

			<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Don't know • Prefer not to say 	
8	Post	Disability	<p>Do you have any long-standing physical or mental impairment, illness, or disability, expected to last 12 months or more?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Yes • No • Don't know • Prefer not to say 	Variable converted to binary 1 = Yes, 0 = otherwise
COVID-19				
5	Pre	COVID contact	<p>As far as you are aware, have you or anyone close to you had COVID-19/coronavirus?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • I have had COVID-19/coronavirus diagnosed by medical professional/test • I have had suspected COVID-19/coronavirus, but not confirmed by medical professional • Someone else in my household had COVID-19/coronavirus • Someone else in my household had suspected COVID-19/coronavirus – not confirmed by medical professional • Someone close to me has had COVID-19/coronavirus • No • Don't know 	Multiple choice
5	Pre	Shielding	<p>Were you or anyone you live with identified as someone who should be shielding?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Yes • No • Don't know 	Single option
5	Pre	Caring	<p>Do you have caring responsibilities for any of the following?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • School age children or younger living in your household • School age children or younger who are not living in your household • Elderly relatives • Family or friends with long-term health conditions • No caring responsibilities • Other (please describe) 	Multiple choice
5	Pre	Caring change	<p>Have you had to make any changes since the start of the Coronavirus crisis to help you manage any child care or other caring responsibilities you may have?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Stopped working altogether • Reduced working hours but with same pay • Reduced working hours and pay • Changed working pattern (i.e. working different hours) 	Multiple choice

			<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Asked other people (partner/friends/family) for more help providing childcare/unpaid care) • Reduced hours of childcare/unpaid care provided • Organised professional carers to help look after someone in your family • Other (please describe) 	
5	Pre	Key worker	Are you a key worker (by key worker, we mean being in a job which the government has said is vital to public health and safety during the coronavirus lockdown) <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Yes • No • Don't know 	Single option
5	Pre	COVID employment	As a result of the coronavirus health crisis, have you experience or are you currently experiencing any changes to your work? <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Been furloughed • Lost my job temporarily • Lost my job permanently • Changed to working at home • My salary has been reduced • My working hours have been cut • Taken unpaid leave • Other (please describe) 	Multiple choice
5	Pre	COVID trust	During the coronavirus pandemic, how much do you trust the Scottish Government to work in Scotland's best interests? <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • A great deal • Quite a lot • Not very much • Not at all • Unsure 	Single option

Experience of the weekends

			Can you let us know your views about the arrangements leading up to this and during this weekend?	
1, 2, 3, 4, 5, 6, 7	Post	X	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The support and assistance provided by the Citizens' Assembly secretariat • The communication about the arrangements leading up to the weekend • Organisation of the weekend 	1 = very dissatisfied; 5 = very satisfied
2, 3, 4, 5, 6, 7	Post	X	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The level of contact from the Citizens' Assembly secretariat more generally 	
2, 3, 4	Post	X	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The process for refunding your expenses/payment of gift of thanks 	
1,2	Post		Do you have any other comments you would like to make about the arrangements leading up to and during this weekend?	Open
3, 4	Post		Do you have any comments about your experience of the hotel, including accommodation, your	Open

overnight stay and the meals provided throughout the weekend?

We would also like to understand how satisfied you were with different aspects of the Assembly over the weekend overall. How much do you agree or disagree with the following statements?

1, 2, 3, 4, 5, 6, 7, 8	Post	X	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> I didn't always feel free to raise my views and ideas for fear of others' reactions One or more people in my small group were particularly influential in helping me think through the issues we were discussing 	1 = strongly disagree; 5 = strongly agree; don't know
1, 2, 3, 4, 5, 6, 7	Post	X	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> The convenors explained the purpose of the weekend well I have had ample opportunity in the small group discussions to express my views My fellow participants respected what I had to say, even when they didn't agree with me One or more of the people in my small group tended to dominate the discussions 	
2, 3, 4, 5, 6, 7, 8	Post	X	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> I had already formed my opinion and the discussion had little effect on me 	
1	Post	X	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> The table facilitator made sure that opposing arguments were considered The table facilitator sometimes tried to influence the group with their own ideas 	

We would like to understand your experience of working with the facilitation team. To what extent do you agree or disagree with the following statements for each day of the weekend?

2, 3, 4, 5, 6, 7, 8	Post	X	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> I felt included by my table/breakout room facilitator The table/breakout room facilitator sometimes tried to influence the group with their ideas 	Separate questions for Saturday and Sunday
2, 3, 4, 5, 6, 7	Post	X	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> The table/breakout room facilitator made sure that opposing arguments were considered I felt respected by my table/breakout room facilitator 	1 = strongly disagree; 5 = strongly agree; don't know
8	Post	X	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> The Lead Facilitator (in the main room) explained the purpose of the weekend well 	

4, 5	Post		If you 'strongly agree' or 'tended to agree' with the statement 'the table/breakout room facilitator sometimes tried to influence the group with their ideas', can you briefly describe why you felt this way?	Open
------	------	--	---	------

6, 7	Post		Do you have any other comments about your experience of your facilitators this weekend?	Open
------	------	--	--	------

3, 4	Post		<p>Can you let us know your views about the format of the weekend in relation to the following:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Visibility of the presentations Sound quality of the speaker presentations Noise levels during the small group discussions Movement between rooms Time for discussion with other members 	1 = very dissatisfied; 5 = very satisfied
------	------	--	---	---

			<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Length of breaks 	
3, 4	Post		Any additional comments about the general format of the weekend?	Open
5, 6, 7, 8	Post		What device did you use to participate in the Assembly this weekend? <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Computer/laptop with video camera Computer/laptop without a video camera Tablet/iPad Smartphone Mobile phone Landline Other (please detail) 	Single option
5, 6, 7, 8	Post		To what extent do you agree or disagree with the following statements? <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Distractions in my home environment reduced my ability to participate in the Citizens' Assembly this weekend Connection difficulties reduced my ability to participate in the Citizens' Assembly this weekend The device I was using reduced my ability to participate in the Citizens' Assembly this weekend The length of the sessions online reduced my ability to participate in the Citizens' Assembly this weekend 	1 = strongly disagree; 5 = strongly agree
			And to what extent do you agree or disagree with the following statements?	
5, 6, 7	Post	X	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> The online tools (e.g. Google Docs, Jamboard) helped me to participate in the Assembly 	1 = strongly disagree; 5 = strongly agree
5, 6	Post	X	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> The online tools (e.g. Google Docs, Jamboard) were easy to use 	
7	Post	X	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> My facilitator used the online tools (e.g. Google Docs, Jamboard) to record our sessions accurately 	
5, 6, 7	Post		Do you have any other comments about your ability to participate in the Citizens' Assembly this weekend?	Open
2, 3, 4, 5	Pre		In general, how are you feeling about participating in the Assembly this weekend? <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Excited Concerned Prepared Confused Confident Nervous 	1 = not at all; 5 = very much; don't know
5	Pre		Do you have any concerns or worries about taking part online?	Open
2, 3, 5	Pre		What are your hopes for this weekend?	Open

How much do you agree or disagree with the following statements?

1, 2, 3, 4, 5, 6, 7	Pre, Post	X	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> I understand what I am expected to do over the following Assembly weekends 	1 = strongly disagree; 5 = strongly agree; don't know
1, 2, 3, 4, 5, 6, 7	Post	X	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> This weekend has made me feel that I want to continue as an Assembly member 	
2, 3, 4, 5, 6, 7	Post	X	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> The Assembly is diverse enough to ensure a broad range of perspectives are considered 	
3, 4 5	Post Pre, Post	X	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> I am concerned about whether the Assembly will achieve its aims The Assembly's priorities seem to lack focus I am concerned about recommendations the Assembly will make 	
2	Post	X	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> It is clear to me how the statements agreed this weekend will guide the rest of the Assembly meetings 	
3	Pre	X	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> I would still participate in the Assembly if I did not receive the £200 gift of thanks 	
5, 6, 7	Post		Do you intend to participate in the next Assembly weekend?	1 = yes; 2 = no; don't know
Weekend 2				
2	Post		How much do the final statement on the kind of country we are seeking to build reflect your own views?	1 = not at all; 5 = very much; don't know
2	Post		How much do you feel you influenced these statements on the kind of country we are seeking to build?	1 = not at all; 5 = very much; don't know
2	Post		And how much do you agree with the way in which the final statements on the kind of country we are seeking to build were agreed?	1 = not at all; 5 = very much; don't know
2	Post		The final session on Sunday involved prioritising topics for discussion at future weekends. How much do the prioritised topics reflect your own views?	1 = not at all; 5 = very much; don't know
2	Post		And how much do you agree with the way in which the topics were prioritised for discussion in future weekends?	1 = not at all; 5 = very much; don't know
Weekend 3				
3	Pre		In weekend 2, there was a focus on creating and agreeing a list of statements on the kind of country we are seeking to build. His weekend focuses on the statement: "The kind of Scotland we are seeking to build will be a sustainable country balancing the environmental, economic and social impacts for the good of the country and its citizens."	1 = not at all; 5 = very much; don't know

To what extent does this statement reflect your views on ‘the kind of country we are seeking to build’?			
3	Pre	How much do you agree with the decision to focus on this statement this weekend?	1 = strongly disagree; 5 = strongly agree; don't know
Weekend 5			
5	Pre	Since the work of the Assembly was postponed due to the COVID-19 pandemic, to what extent do you feel the following issues have become more or less important to the work of the Assembly? <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Scotland's finances • Taxation in Scotland • Delivering Scotland's climate change targets • Employment/Fair work in Scotland • Pursuing a wellbeing economy • Scotland's constitutional position 	
Weekend 6			
6	Post	How much do you agree or disagree with the following statements? <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • I liked the way that we developed the element of the vision statement in my small group • My views are reflected in the element of the vision statement we developed in my small group • The 90% consensus required for each element to be agreed was fair 	1 = strongly disagree; 5 = strongly agree; don't know
6	Post	How much does the final vision statement for the Assembly reflect your own views?	1 = not at all; 5 = very much; don't know
6	Post	How much do you feel you influenced the final vision statement for the Assembly?	1 = not at all; 5 = very much; don't know
6	Post	How much do you agree with the way in which the final vision statement for the Assembly was approved? (this was the one that was completed on Zoom)	1 = strongly disagree; 5 = strongly agree; don't know
Weekend 7			
7	Post	How much do you agree or disagree with the following statements? <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • I liked the way we developed the recommendations in my small group • The information prepared by the Secretariat and sent to me before the weekend helped my group to develop recommendations • My views are reflected in the recommendations we created in my small group 	1 = strongly disagree; 5 = strongly agree; don't know

		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> In my small group, many people just stated positions without justifying them I had an influence over the recommendations we created in my small group 	
7	Post	What evidence did you draw on to help you develop recommendations? <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Evidence from my life experience Evidence from my professional experience Evidence from my family, friends or community Evidence from speakers in Assembly sessions Evidence from the information sent to me before this weekend Papers provided at the Assembly Evidence offered by other Assembly members Evidence from sources outside the Assembly Other 	Multiple choice
7	Post	If you drew on evidence from ‘sources outside the Assembly’ or ‘other sources’, can you briefly describe what this was?	Open
7	Post	How much do you agree or disagree with the following statements? <ul style="list-style-type: none"> I was happy with the options presented for voting on the recommendations next weekend I think other options should have been presented for voting on the recommendations next weekend I accept the outcome of the vote this weekend 	1 = strongly disagree; 5 = strongly agree; don't know
7	Post	How much do you feel the list of recommendations presented by other groups on Sunday reflect the work of the Assembly?	1 = not at all; 5 = very much; don't know
7	Post	How much do you feel the list of recommendations presented by other groups on Sunday reflect your own views?	1 = not at all; 5 = very much; don't know
Weekend 8			
8	Post	At what point during the weekend did you vote on recommendations? <ul style="list-style-type: none"> When the vote opened in the main room As the recommendations were being presented in the main room As soon as we went to our breakout room After a discussion with other members in the breakout room In the breakout room, after I spent some time thinking about the recommendations Other (please explain) 	Single option
8	Post	Why did you decide to vote at that point?	Open
8	Post	Different people have different views about the recommendations of the Citizens' Assembly. What about you? Would you say that you support...	Single option

		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • All of the recommendations • Some of the recommendations • A few of the recommendations • None of the recommendations • I don't know 	
8	Post	How much do you support these different recommendations? <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The strongly supported recommendations • The majority supported recommendations • The minority supported recommendations • The not supported recommendations 	1 = not at all; 4 = I support these a lot; don't know
8	Post	Which for you is the most important recommendation of the Citizens' Assembly, and why?	Open
8	Post	Which for you is the least important, and why?	Open
8	Post	To what extent were the following aspects important to you when you voted on each of the recommendations? <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The outcome resulting from the recommendation was clear • The recommendation was realistic • The recommendation was supported by evidence • The recommendation could impact my own experiences • The recommendation could impact the experiences of my friends and family • The recommendation could impact the people of Scotland 	1 = not at all important; 5 = very important; don't know
8	Post	To what extent do you agree or disagree with the following statements? <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The way in which the Assembly's recommendations were agreed is fair • The way in which the recommendation of the Assembly will be reported is appropriate • I had influence over the Assembly's recommendations • The Assembly's recommendations reflect my own views 	1 = strongly disagree; 5 = strongly agree; don't know
8	Post	To what extent are you willing to defend the Assembly's recommendations when talking to the following groups of people? <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Your friends and family • Your local community • Your elected representatives (politicians) • Journalists in the media • The broader public 	1 = not at all; 5 = very much; don't know
8	Post	In your opinion, how much influence will the recommendations that this Citizens' Assembly has produced have on future decision making in Scotland?	1 = not at all; 5 = very much; don't know

8	Post		In your opinion, how much influence should the recommendations that this Citizens' Assembly has produced have on future decision making in Scotland?	1 = not at all; 5 = very much; don't know
8	Post		What did you enjoy the most about participating in the Citizens' Assembly?	Open
8	Post		And what did you enjoy the least about participating in the Citizens' Assembly?	Open
8	Post		How much do you agree or disagree with the following statements? <ul style="list-style-type: none"> I had an influence over how the Assembly worked I am happy with how much members were involved in influencing how the Assembly worked 	1 = strongly disagree; 5 = strongly agree; don't know
8	Post		Did you choose to be part of the Members Reference Group for the Citizens' Assembly?	1 = yes; 2 = no; don't know
8	Post		Why did you choose/not choose to be part of the Members Reference Group?	Open
8	Post		Do you have any other comments you'd like to make about participating in the Citizens' Assembly of Scotland?	Open
Activities since the previous weekend				
1	Post		How much do you think you will explain or talk to friends about family about what you are doing as an Assembly member?	1 = not at all; 10 = a great deal
6	Post		Do you think you will explain or talk to friends and family about what the Assembly did this weekend?	1 = yes; 2 = no; don't know
6	Post		If yes, what will you say to friends and family about what happened this weekend?	Open
2, 3, 4	Pre		Since the [previous weekend], to what extent did you explain or talk to friends about family about what you are doing as an Assembly member?	1 = not at all; 10 = a great deal
5	Pre		Since the last face to face weekend in February, to what extent have you explained or talked to friends and family about what you were doing as an Assembly member?	1 = not at all; 10 = a great deal
3, 4	Pre		In the time between this weekend and the last, did you consider leaving the Assembly?	1 = yes; 2 = no
5	Pre		In the time between the last face to face meeting and the Assembly re-starting online, did you consider leaving the Assembly?	1 = yes; 2 = no
3, 4, 5	Pre		Whether you answered yes or no, please can you briefly describe why you felt this way?	Open
2, 3, 4	Pre		Have you visited the members section of the Assembly website?	1 = yes; 2 = no
2	Pre	X	How useful did you find the following materials for helping you to prepare for this weekend? <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Weekend 1 report Factsheets on Scotland's constitution Explanation of terms on constitutional issues 	1 = did not use; 5 = very

3	Pre	X	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Agenda for weekend 2 • Claim forms and travel factsheet • Weekend 2 report • Materials used during weekend 2 • Outputs from weekend 2 • Data Briefing • Background resources • Agenda for weekend 3 • Summary paper for weekend 3 • Position papers from speakers • Weekend 3 fact sheets 	useful; don't know
4	Pre	X	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Agenda for weekend 4 • Outline for weekend 4 • Scotland's finances: explanation of terms and useful materials • Tax education gap factsheet • Summary of members' views on weekend 3 political panel • Weekend 3 report • Research data briefing 	
5	Pre		<p>How useful have you found the following materials or activities for helping you to prepare for returning online?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Technical induction session • Emails from secretariat • 'Whatsapp' group messages • 'Journey so far' materials – summary papers and interim report on the Citizens' Assembly website • 'Journey so far' materials – videos on the Citizens' Assembly website • 'Journey so far' materials – summaries and horizon scanning overview paper on the Citizens' Assembly website • Speaker catch up videos on the Citizens' Assembly website • Members' Forum (your priorities) 	1 = did not use; 2 = not at all useful; 6 = very useful; don't know
5	Pre		<p>Do you have any other comments about the information, activities or support available to you ahead of taking part online?</p>	Open
8	Post		<p>Before the weekend, members were sent a pack of information about the recommendations. How useful did you find this for helping you prepare for the weekend?</p>	1 = not at all useful; 5 = very useful; I did not receive the pack; don't know
2, 3, 4, 5	Pre		<p>Have you tried to gather more information about any of the topics that were introduced in the previous Assembly weekend?</p>	1 = Yes; 2 = No

2, 3, 4, 5	Pre		<p>People will have different reasons for not seeking additional information about the topics introduced in the previous weekend. If you had to choose, which of the following reasons best applies to you?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • I felt I knew enough about the topics • I wasn't interested to look for more information • I wanted to but never got around to it • Other reason (please specify) 	Single option
<p>What kind of information did you try to gather?</p>				
2, 3, 4, 5	Pre	X	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • I went looking for more information about living in Scotland • I went looking for more information about citizens' assemblies in general • I went looking for more information about the Citizens' Assembly of Scotland • I went looking for more information about another topic (please describe) 	Multiple choice
2	Pre	X	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • I went looking for more information about how Scotland makes decisions 	
3	Pre	X	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • I went looking for more information about what makes people happy • I went looking for more information about how wider quality of life informs decision making and measuring what makes a good country • I went looking for more information about values 	
4, 5	Pre	X	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • I went looking for more information about the idea of a wellbeing economy • I went looking for more information about Scotland's climate change targets 	
4	Pre	X	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • I went looking for more information about the National Performance Framework • I went looking for more information about employment in relation to a sustainable society 	
5	Pre	X	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • I went looking for more information about Scotland's finances • I went looking for more information about taxation in Scotland • I went looking for more information about Scotland's constitutional position/options • I went looking for more information about fair work and employment 	
1, 8	Post		<p>Where do you get most of your information about the challenges facing Scotland?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Television • Radio • Newspapers • Magazines • Books • Websites 	Multiple choice

		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Blogs • Family and friends • Colleagues • Associations/organisations/ charities • Politicians • Government reports • Local council • Social media (Facebook, twitter, etc.) • Academic articles 	
2, 3, 4	Pre	<p>If you have gathered more information about the topics introduced in the previous weekend, how useful did you find the following sources of information?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Television • Radio • Newspapers • Magazines • Books • Websites • Blogs • Family and friends • Colleagues • Associations/organisations/ charities • Politicians • Citizens' Assembly of Scotland website • Government reports • Local council • Social media (Facebook, twitter, etc.) • Academic articles 	1 = did not use; 6 = very useful; don't know
3, 4	Pre	<p>Do you have any other comments about the information available to you before or after your participation in the weekend meeting?</p>	Open
2, 3, 4 5 6, 7, 8	Pre, Post Pre Post	<p>For each questions, do you feel you have the information required to answer this question yourself?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • What kind of country are we seeking to build? • How best can we overcome the challenges Scotland and the world face in the 21st century, including those arising from Brexit? • What further work should be carried out to give us the information we need to make informed choices about the future of the country? 	1 = no, not at all; 4 = yes, definitely; don't know
2, 3, 4 5 6, 7, 8	Pre, Post Pre Post	<p>And for each questions, do you feel the Citizens' Assembly as a whole is able to answer it?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • What kind of country are we seeking to build? • How best can we overcome the challenges Scotland and the world face in the 21st century, including those arising from Brexit? 	1 = no, not at all; 4 = yes, definitely; don't know

			<ul style="list-style-type: none"> What further work should be carried out to give us the information we need to make informed choices about the future of the country? 	
8	Post		<p>Finally, for each question, do you feel the Citizens' Assembly has answered it?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> What kind of country are we seeking to build? How best can we overcome the challenges Scotland and the world face in the 21st century, including those arising from Brexit? What further work should be carried out to give us the information we need to make informed choices about the future of the country? 	1 = no, not at all; 4 = yes, definitely; don't know

Knowledge and attitudes				
--------------------------------	--	--	--	--

1, 2, 3, 4 5 8	Pre, Post Pre Post		<p>On a scale of 0 to 10, how much do you feel you know about life in Scotland?</p>	0 = not at all; 10 = a great deal
----------------------	-----------------------------	--	--	-----------------------------------

2, 3, 4, 8	Post		<p>How much do you agree or disagree with the following statements?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> The information I have received during the Assembly weekend has been fair and balanced between different viewpoints We have heard a broad range of diverse opinions from the speakers I have heard a broad range of diverse opinions from Assembly members 	1 = Strongly disagree; 5 = strongly agree; don't know
------------	------	--	---	---

			<p>To what extent did you find the following activities helpful for your learning this weekend?</p>	
1, 2, 3, 4	Post	X	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Small group discussions Conversations I had in the breaks 	1 = not at all; 5 = very much; don't know
1	Post	X	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Conveners presentation Speaker presentation – Nicola McEwen Question and Answer session with Nicola 	
2	Post	X	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Friday evening session on evidence (Phil Allen) Friday evening session on critical thinking (Kaela Scott) Presentations from George Bangham on Saturday morning Presentation from Elke Heins on Saturday afternoon 	
3	Post	X	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Political panel on Saturday 	
4	Post	X	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Tax choice exercise on Sunday 	
3, 4	Post	X	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Friday evening learning dinner Presentations from experts on Saturday Question and Answer sessions 	

Weekend 1				
------------------	--	--	--	--

1	Post		<p>To get a sense of the impact of the Citizens' Assembly process how would you respond to the following statements?</p>	1 = not at all; 5 = very
---	------	--	---	--------------------------

		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • I feel I have learnt something new about Scotland by listening to the presentations on factors about Scotland • I feel that hearing from other members about their experiences of living in Scotland has provided me with more information about life in Scotland • I feel that hearing from other members about their experiences of living in Scotland made me change my mind about things I thought I knew 	much; don't know
1	Post	<p>To what extent did input from Nicola McEwen increase your knowledge and understanding of the following topics?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Scotland's current constitutional position • How Scotland's constitutional position has changed over time • Possible future changes to Scotland's constitutional position 	1 = not at all; 5 = very much; don't know
Weekend 2			
2	Pre	<p>Part of the weekend will focus on personal well-being, in other words what makes people happy. On a scale of 0 to 10, how much do you feel you know about this topic?</p>	1 = not at all; 10 = a great deal
2	Pre	<p>The weekend will also focus on how wider quality of life informs decision making and how we measure what makes a good country. On a scale of 0 to 10, how much do you feel you know about this topic?</p>	1 = not at all; 10 = a great deal
2	Pre	<p>Part of the weekend will also focus on what values are and the role they play in shaping the country we live in. On a scale of 1 to 10, how much do you feel you know about this topic?</p>	1 = not at all; 10 = a great deal
2	Post	<p>On Saturday morning there was input from George Bangham who provided information about what makes a good life. How much do you agree or disagree with the following statements?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • I understood everything that was presented by the speaker • I learnt something new by listening to the speaker • I trusted what the speaker said 	1 = strongly disagree; 5 = strongly agree; don't know
2	Post	<p>On Saturday afternoon there was input from Elke Heins who provided information about values. How much do you agree or disagree with the following statements?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • I understood everything that was presented by the speaker • I learnt something new by listening to the speaker • I trusted what the speaker said 	1 = strongly disagree; 5 = strongly agree; don't know
2	Post	<p>How much have you changed your mind about kind of country we should seek to build as a result of your participation this weekend?</p>	0 = not at all; 10 = a great deal; don't know

2	Post	<p>And how important were the following activities for changing your mind?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Hearing from other Assembly members • Listening to the presentation on what makes a good life from George Bangham • Listening to the presentation on values from Elke Heins • Creating my individual statements on Saturday afternoon • Selecting 10 statements from other tables on Saturday afternoon • Reviewing the clusters of statement on Saturday afternoon • Ranking the statements on Sunday (into high, medium and low) and then choosing the top 10 	1 = not at all; 5 = very much; don't know
Weekend 3			
3	Pre, Post	<p>Which of the following constitutional options do you think would help Scotland to be a “a sustainable country balancing the environmental, economic and social impacts for the good of the country and its citizens?”</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • No change to current constitutional arrangements • More devolution for Scotland • Federalism for all of the UK • Scottish Independence • Other option (please specify) • Don't know 	Single option
3	Pre, Post	<p>How much do you agree or disagree with the following statements?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The environment might be important but at the end of the day everyone needs a job and that should take priority • I think it is right to keep growing our economy indefinitely • We need to fundamentally change our economic model to help tackle climate change • Rather than focusing on wealth we should build an economy that prioritises quality of life 	1 = strongly disagree; 5 = strongly agree; don't know
3	Pre, Post	<p>On a scale of 0 to 10, how much do you feel you know about the Sustainable Development Goals?</p>	1 = not at all; 10 = a great deal
3	Pre, Post	<p>On a scale of 0 to 10, how much do you feel you know about the idea of a 'wellbeing economy'?</p>	1 = not at all; 10 = a great deal
3	Pre, Post	<p>On a scale of 0 to 10, how much do you feel you know about how to deliver on Scotland's climate change targets?</p>	1 = not at all; 10 = a great deal
3	Pre, Post	<p>On a scale of 0 to 10, how much do you feel you know about employment and job creation in relation to a sustainable economy?</p>	1 = not at all; 10 = a great deal

3 8	Pre, Post Post	Approximately what percentage of the Scottish population were living in relative poverty in 2015-18? <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • 20% • 40% • 60% • 80% • Don't know 	Single option
3 8	Pre, Post Post	Approximately what percentage of Scotland's electricity comes from renewables? <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • 20% • 40% • 60% • 80% • Don't know 	Single option
3 8	Pre, Post Post	The 'living wage' is best described as... <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The minimum income necessary for a worker to meet their basic needs • The average wage • 60% of median earnings in the country • The minimum legal wage • Don't know 	Single option
3	Post	On Saturday morning there was input from Chris McCorkindale who provided information about constitutional options. How much do you agree or disagree with the following statements? <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • I understood everything that was presented by the speaker • I learnt something new by listening to the speaker • I trusted what the speaker said 	1 = strongly disagree; 5 = strongly agree; don't know
3	Post	On Saturday afternoon, 3 speakers (Sandy Begbie, Katherine Trebeck and Andy Kerr) provided input about approaches to overcoming the sustainability challenge in Scotland. How much do you agree or disagree with the following statements? <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • I understood everything that was presented by the speaker • I learnt something new by listening to the speaker • I trusted what the speaker said 	Question asked for each speaker 1 = strongly disagree; 5 = strongly agree; don't know
3	Post	How much have you changed your mind about the issues discussed this weekend?	1 = not at all; 10 = a great deal; don't know
3	Post	And how important were the following activities for changing your mind? <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Hearing from other Assembly members • Listening to the presentation on constitutional options from Chris McCorkindale • The Q&A session with Chris McCorkindale • Listening to the Political Panel 	1 = not at all; 5 = very much; don't know

			<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Listening to the Convener's presentation on sustainability • Listening to the presentation on overcoming the sustainability challenge from Sandy Begbie • Listening to the presentation on overcoming the sustainability challenge from Katherine Trebeck • Listening to the presentation on overcoming the sustainability challenge from Andy Kerr • The panel discussion and Q&A session with the 3 speakers 	
Weekend 4				
4	Pre		This weekend focusses on Scotland's finances, including where funding comes from and how decisions about tax and spending are taken. How much do you agree with the decision to focus on this topic this weekend?	1 = strongly disagree; 5 = strongly agree; don't know
4	Pre, Post		Which of these statements come closest to your own view? <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Taxes should be increased, in order to extend and improve public services • Taxes should be left as they are • Taxes should be cut, even if it means some reductions in public services • Don't know 	Single option
4	Pre, Post		How much do you agree or disagree with the following statements?	
4	Pre, Post	X	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Scotland should be allowed to set a different rate of VAT to the rest of the UK • Local authorities, not the Scottish Government, should set business rates in their local areas • Taxes on income from work should be increased • Taxes on income from wealth (e.g. inheritance) should be increased 	1 = strongly disagree; 5 = strongly agree; don't know
4 5 8	Pre, Post Pre Post	X	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Tax should be used to encourage positive behaviours 	
4	Pre, Post		On a scale of 0 to 10, how much do you feel you know about where funding for Scottish public services comes from?	1 = not at all; 10 = a great deal
4	Pre, Post		On a scale of 0 to 10, how much do you feel you know about how decisions about public spending are taken in Scotland?	1 = not at all; 10 = a great deal
4	Pre, Post		On a scale of 0 to 10, how much do you feel you know about the range of different taxes?	1 = not at all; 10 = a great deal
4	Pre, Post		On a scale of 0 to 10, how much do you feel you know about tax powers in Scotland?	1 = not at all; 10 = a great deal

4 8	Pre, Post Post	The Scottish Government budget for 2019/20 was approximately: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> £36.5 billion £42.5 billion £58.5 billion £64.5 billion Don't know 	Single option
4 8	Pre, Post Post	Approximately, what is the current top rate of Income Tax on earned income in Scotland? <ul style="list-style-type: none"> 30% 40% 45% 46% 50% 56% 60% Don't know 	Single option
4 8	Pre, Post Post	The current financial situation in Scotland is: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> The money raised in Scotland is more than the money spent in Scotland or for Scotland The money raised in Scotland is less than the money spent in Scotland or for Scotland The money raised in Scotland is equal to the money spent in Scotland or for Scotland Don't know 	Single option
4 8	Pre, Post Post	Scotland currently has the power to decide the tax rates for: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Income and council tax Income, business, land and buildings, landfill and council tax Income, VAT, business, alcohol, cigarettes and council tax Income, business, land and buildings, alcohol, cigarettes and council tax Don't know 	Single option
4	Post	On Saturday morning, there was input from Fraser McKinlay who provided an overview of Scotland's finances. How much do you agree or disagree with the following statements? <ul style="list-style-type: none"> I understood everything that was presented by the speaker I learnt something new by listening to the speaker I trusted what the speaker said 	1 = strongly disagree; 5 = strongly agree; don't know
4	Post	On Saturday morning, there was also input from David Bell who provided further information about the key issues and debates around Scotland's finances. How much do you agree or disagree with the following statements? <ul style="list-style-type: none"> I understood everything that was presented by the speaker 	1 = strongly disagree; 5 = strongly agree; don't know

		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • I learnt something new by listening to the speaker • I trusted what the speaker said 	
4	Post	<p>After lunch on Saturday afternoon, you returned to the lecture theatre to hear presentations on tax. Firstly, there was David Phillips who provided an introduction to the tax system. How much do you agree or disagree with the following statements?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • I understood everything that was presented by the speaker • I learnt something new by listening to the speaker • I trusted what the speaker said 	1 = strongly disagree; 5 = strongly agree; don't know
4	Post	<p>Secondly, there was Charlotte Barbour who provided information about Scotland's Tax System. How much do you agree or disagree with the following statements?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • I understood everything that was presented by the speaker • I learnt something new by listening to the speaker • I trusted what the speaker said 	1 = strongly disagree; 5 = strongly agree; don't know
4	Post	<p>Following these presentations, you heard from a panel of speakers (Russell Gunson, Laurie MacFarlane and Ewan MacDonald-Russell) on tax choices to create a sustainable society. How much do you agree or disagree with the following statements?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • I understood everything that was presented by the speaker • I learnt something new by listening to the speaker • I trusted what the speaker said 	Question asked for each of the speakers 1 = strongly disagree; 5 = strongly agree; don't know
4	Post	<p>How much have you changed your mind about the issues discussed this weekend?</p>	1 = not at all; 10 = a great deal; don't know
4	Post	<p>And how important were the following activities for changing your mind?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Hearing from other Assembly members • Listening to the presentation on Scotland's finances from Fraser McKinlay • Listening to the presentation on Scotland's finances from David Bell • The Q&A session on Saturday morning • Listening to the presentation on taxation from David Phillips on Saturday afternoon • Listening to the presentation on Scotland's tax system from Charlotte Barbour on Saturday afternoon • Listening to the panel presentation on tax choices from Russell Gunson • Listening to the panel presentation on tax choices from Laurie MacFarlane • Listening to the panel presentation on tax choices from Ewan MacDonald-Russell 	1 = not at all; 5 = very much; don't know

- The Q&A session on Saturday afternoon on tax choices
- Tax choices exercise on Sunday

Weekend 5

5	Post	<p>This weekend you watched videos on the impact of COVID and priorities for recovery. How much do you agree or disagree with the following statements?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • I understood everything that was explained in the videos • I learnt something new by listening and watching the videos • I trusted the information presented in the videos 	1 = strongly disagree; 5 = strongly agree; don't know
5	Pre	<p>How much do you agree or disagree with the following statements?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • In the long term, climate change is as serious a crisis as COVID-19 • A universal basic income is a nice idea but would never work in reality • The priority right now should be restarting the economy, even if it's at the expense of the environment • I think this is the ideal time to reform the tax system • We need to fundamentally change how citizens are involved in decision making • Rather than focusing on economic growth, we should be rebuilding an economy that prioritises wellbeing and tackles inequalities 	1 = strongly disagree; 5 = strongly agree; don't know
8	Post		
5	Pre	<p>How much do you feel you know about the impact of the COVID-19 crisis on the economy?</p>	0 = not at all; 10 = a great deal
8	Post		
5	Pre	<p>How much do you feel you know about the impact of the COVID-19 lockdown measures on the environment?</p>	0 = not at all; 10 = a great deal
8	Post		
5	Pre	<p>How much do you feel you know about the unequal impact of the COVID-19 crisis on different groups of society?</p>	0 = not at all; 10 = a great deal
8	Post		

Weekend 8

8	Post	<p>How much do you agree or disagree with the following statements?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • I have learned a lot during the Assembly • I have had sufficient information to participate effectively • The Assembly has helped me clarify my views about issues discussed during the Assembly 	1 = strongly disagree; 5 = strongly agree; don't know
8	Post	<p>What have you learnt during the Assembly that has really stood out for you?</p>	Open
8	Post	<p>Citizens' assemblies are often described as involving 'deliberation'. From your experience of</p>	Open

taking part in the Assembly, how would you describe or define deliberation?			
8	Post		How much have you changed your mind about the issues discussed during the Assembly? 0 = not at all; 10 = a great deal; don't know
8	Post		And how important were the following activities for changing your mind? <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Hearing from other Assembly members • Listening to presentations from expert speakers • Listening to the Political Panel • The Q&A sessions • Small group work 1 = not at all; 5 = very much; don't know

Thoughts about democratic life in Scotland

How much do you agree or disagree with the following statements?			
1, 2, 3, 4, 8	Post Pre	X	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • I think my opinion is as valid as anyone else's • I enjoy participating in discussions and debates • I feel comfortable challenging someone's opinion during a conversation 1 = strongly disagree; 5 = strongly agree; don't know
2, 3, 4, 8	Post Pre	X	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • I feel nervous speaking in front of a group • I am open to changing my mind when I hear good reasons to do so

And how much to you agree or disagree with the following statements?			
1, 2, 3, 4	Post Pre	X	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • I feel I know enough to participate in politics • People like me don't have a say about what the Scottish Government does • No system is perfect but the political system in Scotland works fairly well • The Scottish Government doesn't care much about what people like me think • I am satisfied with how democracy works in Scotland at the national level • I am satisfied with how democracy works in Scotland at the local level • Sometimes Scottish politics seems so complicated that I cannot understand what is happening 1 = strongly disagree; 5 = strongly agree; don't know
2, 3, 4, 8	Post Pre	X	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • I consider ordinary citizens to be able to participate in politics • I consider the participants in this Citizens' Assembly to be able to participate in politics • I trust ordinary citizens to make good political decisions • People are open to changing their minds when they hear good reasons to do so
8	Post	X	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • As a result of participating in the Assembly, I would like to become more involved in democracy • Being part of this Assembly made me realise that being a politician is easy

- After working in this Assembly, I think I could do the job of a politician
- The Assembly shows that making good policies is difficult

How would you respond to the following statements?

1, 2, 3, 4, 8	Post	X	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Citizens' assemblies are a good way of involving people in making recommendations on important issues • The Scottish Government should invest more in events such as citizens' assemblies • Initiatives like citizens' assemblies are just an opportunity for governments to defend choices they've already made 	1 = strongly disagree; 5 = strongly agree; don't know
2, 3, 4, 8	Post	X	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Citizens' assemblies are a good way of findings out what citizens think about issues 	

8	Post		The Citizens' Assembly has been working on behalf of the people of Scotland. What do you think will be the longer term impact of the Citizens' Assembly for democracy in Scotland?	Open
---	------	--	---	------

Political attitudes and views about Scotland

1, 8 3, 4, 5	Post Pre		Some people feel closer to certain political parties than others. If you had to choose is there a political party that you feel closer to?	Single option
			<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Scottish Conservative and Unionist Party • Scottish Labour Party • Scottish Green Party • Scottish Liberal Democrats • Scottish National Party • Other (please specify) • Don't know/undecided • Prefer not to say 	

1, 8 3, 4, 5	Post Pre		And how close would you say you feel to that party?	0 = not at all close; 10 = very close
-----------------	-------------	--	--	---------------------------------------

1, 2, 3, 4, 8 5	Post Pre		How would you respond to the following statements?	-5 = definitely not; 5 = definitely yes
			<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Scotland should be an independent country • The Scottish Parliament should have more power • Scottish values are different from values in the rest of the UK • Challenges facing Scotland are different from those facing the rest of the UK 	

1	Post		To better understand the current level of engagement of Citizens' Assembly members, please tell us whether you have done any of the following in the last 12 months.	1 = yes; 2 = no; don't know
			<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Been involved with an interest group or campaign • Attended a public meeting/community council meeting 	

		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Participated in an online forum (e.g. social media, digital platforms) • Taken part in a consultation or a survey • Signed a petition • Contacted an MP, MSP or Local Councillor • Attended a protest, rally or demonstration • Volunteered or provided unpaid help 	
2	Pre	In political matters people sometimes talk of ‘the left’ and ‘the right’. On a scale of 0 to 10, where would you place your views?	0 = left; 10 = right; don't know
2	Pre	And where would you place the view of the typical person in Scotland?	0 = left; 10 = right; don't know
2	Pre	And where would you place the view of the typical person in England?	0 = left; 10 = right; don't know
2	Pre	And where would you place the view of the typical person in Wales?	0 = left; 10 = right; don't know
Miscellaneous			
1, 2, 3, 4, 5, 6, 7	Post	Do you have any other comments you'd like to make?	Open
8	Post	Would you like us to keep in touch with you about the findings from this research? (this would involve us sending you the research report or inviting you to an event)	Yes; No

Appendix D – Population survey scripts

Survey	Panelbase instructions	Survey item	Response categories
1, 2	Ask all If yes, thank and close	1) Could you tell us if you were a member of the Citizens' Assembly of Scotland? <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Yes, I was a member of the Citizens' Assembly of Scotland • No, I was not a member of the Citizens' Assembly of Scotland 	Single code
1, 2	Ask all Screen out if not 16 or over Autocode into ranges 16-21, 22-29, 30-44, 45-59, 60-74, 75+ for quota monitoring (some of these will be grouped for targets but we want to keep an eye on them split out)	2) Please type your age in the box below.	Open response
1, 2	Ask all	3) What best describes your gender identity? Would you describe yourself as a...? <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Man • Woman • In another way 	Single code
1, 2	Ask all	4) In which region of Scotland do you live? <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Highland: Argyll and Bute, Highland, Moray, Orkney, Shetland, Comhairle nan Eilean Siar • North East: Aberdeen City, Aberdeenshire, Dundee, Angus • Mid Scotland and Fife: Clackmannanshire, East Dunbartonshire, NE Fife, Perth and Kinross, Stirling, West Dunbartonshire • Central: Falkirk, North Lanarkshire • Glasgow: Glasgow City Council • Lothian City of Edinburgh, Midlothian, West Lothian • West: East Renfrewshire, Inverclyde, North Ayrshire, Renfrewshire • South: Dumfries and Galloway, East Ayrshire, East Lothian, Scottish Borders, South Ayrshire, South Lanarkshire 	Single code
1, 2	Ask all	5) Where do you get most of your information about the challenges facing Scotland? Please select all that apply. <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Television 	Multicode

-
- Radio
 - Newspapers
 - Magazines
 - Books
 - Websites
 - Blogs
 - Family and friends
 - Colleagues
 - Associations/organisations/charities
 - Politicians
 - Government reports
 - Local council
 - Social media (Facebook, Twitter, etc.)
 - Academic articles
 - Don't know
-

1, 2	Ask all Grid	<p>6) Please tell us whether you have done any of the following in the last 12 months.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Been involved with an interest group or campaign • Attended a public meeting/ community council meeting • Participated in an online forum (e.g. social media, digital platforms) • Taken part in a consultation or a survey • Signed a petition • Contacted an MP, MSP or Local Councillor • Attended a protest, rally or demonstration • Volunteered or provided unpaid help 	Single code yes, no, don't know
1, 2	Ask all Ask in this order	<p>7a) How much do you agree or disagree with the following statements?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • I think my opinion is as valid as anyone else's • I enjoy participating in discussions and debates • I feel comfortable challenging someone's opinion during a conversation • I feel nervous speaking in front of a group • I am open to changing my mind when I hear good reasons to do so 	Single code for each 1 = Strongly disagree; 2 = Tend to disagree; 3 = Neither agree nor disagree; 4 = Tend to agree; 5 = Strongly agree; Don't know
1, 2	Ask all Ask in this order	<p>b) How much do you agree or disagree with the following statements?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • I feel I know enough to participate in politics • People like me don't have a say about what the Scottish Government does • No system is perfect but the political system in Scotland works fairly well 	Single code for each 1 = Strongly disagree; 2 = Tend to disagree; 3 = Neither agree nor disagree;

		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The Scottish Government doesn't care much about what people like me think • I am satisfied with how democracy in Scotland works at the national level • I am satisfied with how democracy works in Scotland at the local level • Sometimes Scottish politics seems so complicated that I cannot understand what is happening • I consider ordinary citizens to be able to participate in politics • I trust ordinary citizens to make good political decisions • People are open to changing their minds when they hear good reasons to do so 	<p>4 = Tend to agree; 5 = Strongly agree; Don't know</p>
1, 2	Ask all Randomise	<p>8) How much do you agree or disagree with the following statements?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The environment might be important but at the end of the day everyone needs a job and that should take priority • I think it is right to keep growing our economy indefinitely • We need to fundamentally change our economic model to help tackle climate change • In the long term, climate change is as serious a crisis as COVID-19 • A universal basic income is a nice idea but would never work in reality • I think this is the ideal time to reform the tax system • We need to fundamentally change how citizens are involved in decision making • Rather than focusing on economic growth, we should be rebuilding an economy that prioritises wellbeing and tackles inequalities 	<p>Single code for each 1 = Strongly disagree; 2 = Tend to disagree; 3 = Neither agree nor disagree; 4 = Tend to agree; 5 = Strongly agree; Don't know</p>
1, 2	Ask all	<p>9) Which of these statements comes closest to your own view?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Taxes should be increased, in order to extend and improve public services • Taxes should be left as they are • Taxes should be cut, even if it means some reductions in public services • Don't know 	<p>Single code</p>
1, 2	Ask all	<p>10) How much do you agree or disagree with the following statements?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Tax should be used to encourage positive behaviours • Scotland should be allowed to set a different rate of VAT to the rest of the UK • Taxes on income from work should be increased 	<p>Single code for each 1 = Strongly disagree; 2 = Tend to disagree;</p>

		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Taxes on income from wealth (e.g. inheritance) should be increased 	3 = Neither agree nor disagree; 4 = Tend to agree; 5 = Strongly agree; Don't know
1, 2	Ask all	11) Please tell us on a scale of 0 to 10, how much you feel you know about life in Scotland?	Single code 0 = not at all; 10 = a great deal
1, 2	Ask all	12) Approximately what percentage of the Scottish population were living in relative poverty in 2015-18? <ul style="list-style-type: none"> 20% 40% 60% 80% Don't know 	Single code
1, 2	Ask all	13) The 'living wage' is best described as... <ul style="list-style-type: none"> The minimum income necessary for a worker to meet their basic needs The average wage 60% of median earnings in the country The minimum legal wage Don't know 	Single code
1, 2	Ask all	14) Approximately, what is the current top rate of Income Tax on earned income in Scotland? <ul style="list-style-type: none"> 30% 40% 45% 46% 50% 56% 60% Don't Know 	Single code
1, 2	Ask all	15) The current financial situation in Scotland is [choose only 1 answer]: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> The money raised in Scotland is more than the money spent in Scotland or for Scotland The money raised in Scotland is less than the money spent in Scotland or for Scotland The money raised in Scotland is equal to the money spent in Scotland or for Scotland Don't know 	Single code

1, 2	Ask all	<p>16) Scotland currently has the power to decide the tax rates for [choose only 1 answer]:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Income and council tax • Income, business, land and buildings, landfill and council tax • Income, VAT, business, alcohol, cigarettes and council tax • Income, business, land and buildings, alcohol, cigarettes and council tax • Don't know 	Single code
1, 2	Ask all -1 – 5 scale Ask in this order	<p>17) How would you respond to the following statements?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Scotland should be an independent country • The Scottish Parliament should have more power • Scottish values are different from values in the rest of the UK • Challenges facing Scotland are different from those facing the rest of the UK 	Single code for each -1 = definitely not; 5 = definitely yes; don't know
1, 2	Ask all	<p>18) Some people feel closer to certain political parties than others. If you had to choose is there a political party that you feel closer to?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Scottish Conservative and Unionist Party • Scottish Labour Party • Scottish Green Party • Scottish Liberal Democrats • Scottish National Party • Other (please specify) • Don't know/Undecided • Prefer not to say 	Single code
1, 2	Ask all other than 'don't know' and 'prefer not to say' above 0 – 10 scale	<p>19) And how close would you say you feel to that political party?</p>	Single code 0 = not at all close; 10 = very close
1, 2	Ask all 0 – 10 scale	<p>20) In political matters people sometimes talk of 'the left' and 'the right'. On a scale of 0 to 10 where 0 is the most left and 10 is the most right, where would you place your views on this scale, generally speaking?</p>	Single code 0 = left; 10 = right; don't know
1	Ask all 0 – 10 scale	<p>21) And where would you place the views of the typical person in Scotland?</p>	Single code 0 = left; 10 = right; don't know
1	Ask all 0 – 10 scale	<p>22) And where would you place the views of the typical person in England?</p>	Single code

			0 = left; 10 = right; don't know
1	Ask all 0 – 10 scale	23) And using the same scale where would you place the views of the typical person in Wales?	Single code 0 = left; 10 = right; don't know
1, 2	Ask all	24) How interested, if at all, would you say you are in politics? <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Not at all interested • Not very interested • Fairly interested • Very interested • Don't know 	Single code
1, 2	Ask all 0 – 10 scale	25) Which statement comes closest to your view?	Single code 0 = you can't be too careful in dealing with people; 10 = most people can be trusted; don't know
1, 2	Ask all	26) After more than 20 years of devolution, what impact has the establishment of the Scottish Parliament had on the governance of Scotland? <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Made it better • Made it worse • Made no difference • Don't know 	Single code
1, 2	Ask all Randomise	27) And now we'd like to ask you some questions about your views on devolution. For each please indicate whether you think the Scottish Parliament has made things better, made them worse or made no difference <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Creating policy that better fits Scotland's socio-economic conditions • Tackling social injustice • Raising educational standards • Tackling knife crime • Improving democratic accountability • Involving citizens in decision making • Tackling drug deaths • Improving the quality of health and social care 	Single code for each Made things better; Made them worse; Made no difference; Don't know
1, 2	Ask all	28a) Which of the following is the most important problem facing Scotland today?	Single code

	Randomly give half the sample a) and the other half b) Randomise	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • UK's withdrawal from the European Union • Health • The economy • Immigration and asylum • Scotland's place in the UK • Crime • International terrorism • Education • The environment • Pensions • Reform of the UK political system • Tax • Family life and childcare • Transport • None of these • Don't know 	
		28b) What is the most important problem facing Scotland today?	Open response
1, 2	Ask all	29) People have different preferences about Scotland's constitutional future. What about you? Which one of the following options would be your preference for Scotland's future <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • For things to stay as they are • For the Scottish Parliament to have more powers • For the Scottish Parliament to have fewer powers • For Scotland to become independent • Other [open response] • None of these • Don't know 	Single code
1, 2	Ask all 0 – 10 scale Grid	30) On a scale of 0 to 10 where 0 is know nothing at all and 10 is know a lot, how much do you feel you know about the following? <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The Scottish Parliament • The UK Parliament • The Citizens' Assembly of Scotland 	Single code for each 0 = I know nothing at all; 10 = I know a lot
1, 2	Ask all Randomise	31) Different people have different understandings of the Citizens' Assembly of Scotland. If you had to describe what it does, what would you say? Please select all that apply. <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • It gives citizens a chance to discuss issues facing Scotland • It is another opportunity for politicians to talk to each other • It is mostly so Assembly members can talk about independence 	Multicode

		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • It is mostly about identifying challenges facing Scotland • It is mostly about finding solutions to issues facing Scotland like poverty or climate change • Other [open response] • Don't know 	
1, 2	Ask all 0 – 10 scale Randomise	<p>32) Citizens' assemblies can do different things. How much would you be in favour of a citizens' assembly in Scotland doing each of the following? Please use the following scale, where 0 means strongly against and 10 means strongly in favour.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Identifying key challenges facing Scotland • Proposing policy solutions for the challenges Scotland faces • Identifying constitutional options for Scotland 	Single code for each 0 = strongly against; 10 = strongly in favour; 98 = it depends; 99 = don't know
2	Ask all 0 – 10 scale Randomise	<p>On a scale of 0 to 10 where 0 is no trust and 10 is complete trust, how much trust would you place in a citizens' assembly that had the following responsibilities?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Write a summary for the general public of a challenge facing Scotland • Give the general public advice on how to vote in an election • Give advice to elected officials on whether to adopt specific laws • Give elected officials advice on which problems should be their highest priority • Set priorities for elected officials that force them to take action on certain issues • Force Scottish elected officials to vote for or against specific legislation • Make decisions on behalf of the wider public on questions put to them by elected officials • Make decisions on behalf of the wider public on issues that the citizens' assembly chooses to study 	Single code for each 0 = no trust; 10 = complete trust; don't know
2	Ask all 0 – 10 scale Randomise	<p>And what about legitimacy. On a scale of 0 to 10 where 0 is no legitimacy and 10 is complete legitimacy, how much legitimacy would you say a citizens' assembly has to do any of the following tasks?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Write a summary for the general public of a challenge facing Scotland • Give the general public advice on how to vote in an election • Give advice to elected officials on whether to adopt specific laws 	Single code for each 1 = no legitimacy; 10 = complete legitimacy; Don't know

-
- Give elected officials advice on which problems should be their highest priority
 - Set priorities for elected officials that force them to take action on certain issues
 - Force Scottish elected officials to vote for or against specific legislation
 - Make decisions on behalf of the wider public on questions put to them by elected officials
 - Make decisions on behalf of the wider public on issues that the citizens' assembly chooses to study
-

2	Ask all Randomise	What issues should be put to a citizens' assembly?	Multicode
		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Criminal Justice Reform • Drug Policy • Local Taxes • Land Reform • Assisted dying • Health and Social Care • UK's withdrawal from the European Union • Migration Policy • Scotland's place in the UK • Crime • International terrorism • Education • The environment • Social Security • Reform of the UK political system • Transport • None of these • Other [open response] • Don't know 	

2	Ask Randomise	What issues should not be put to a citizens' assembly?	Multicode
		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Criminal Justice Reform • Drug Policy • Local Taxes • Land Reform • Assisted dying • Health and Social Care • UK's withdrawal from the European Union • Migration Policy • Scotland's place in the UK • Crime • International terrorism • Education • The environment • Social Security • Reform of the UK political system • Transport 	

		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • None of these • Other [open response] • Don't know 	
2	Ask all Randomise	<p>Who should have the power to initiate citizens' assemblies in Scotland?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Scottish Government • Scottish Parliament • UK Government • UK Parliament • Public services in Scotland (e.g. NHS) • People via petitions • All the above • None of the above 	Multicode
2	Ask all	<p>Some people argue that local or national legislatures – such as local councils or the Scottish Parliament – should include members selected at random (chosen by lottery) from the wider population. Others disagree. What about you?</p> <p>Would you say legislatures should include:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • A mix of elected and randomly selected individuals • Only elected individuals • Only randomly-selected individuals • Don't know 	Single code
2	Ask all	<p>And what about for the Scottish Parliament? Would you say it should include:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • A mix of elected and randomly selected individuals • Only elected individuals • Only randomly-selected individuals • Don't know 	Single code
2	Ask all	<p>And what about for local councils? Would you say that local councils should include:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • A mix of elected and randomly selected individuals • Only elected individuals • Only randomly-selected individuals • Don't know 	Single code
2	Ask all	<p>Some people say that a separate citizens' panel composed of randomly-selected individuals should advise different legislatures. Others disagree. What about you? Thinking of the area where you live, how much do you agree or disagree with the following statements?</p>	Single code for each 1 = Strongly disagree; 2 = Tend to disagree;

		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • A citizens' panel should be created to advise my local council • A citizens' panel should be created to advise the Scottish Parliament 	<p>3 = Neither agree nor disagree; 4 = Tend to agree; 5 = Strongly agree; Don't know</p>
1, 2	Ask all Randomise (other than 'fixed' codes)	<p>33) Some people we've heard from have engaged with the Citizens' Assembly of Scotland but others have not. What about you? How, if at all, have you engaged with the Citizens' Assembly of Scotland? (Select as many options as applicable)</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • [Fixed] N/A - I have had no engagement with the Citizens' Assembly • I have visited the Citizens' Assembly website • I have read news articles about it • I have followed or discussed it on social media • I have discussed it with my friends and/or family • I have heard about it via political parties • I have heard about via TV or radio • I have volunteered to join the next citizens' assembly [QC CHECKS] • I have discussed it with my work colleagues • [Fixed] Other [open response] 	Multicode
1, 2	Least filled routing – please split into Group A 'informed' and Group B 'not informed' which should be balanced on age, sex, and code 0&1 combined at understanding of the Citizens' Assembly (question 30)		
1, 2	Group A	<p>Before you continue, we ask you to read the following information carefully. The first Citizens' Assembly recently took place in Scotland. It brought together over 100 members who were selected at random (similar to the lottery for jury duty) from the Scottish population and were broadly representative according to age, gender, ethnicity and political attitudes. The members were paid for their work and all of their expenses were covered by the Assembly organisers. Over the course of 8 weekends, the members listened to expert presentations, discussed with each other in small groups, developed their own recommendations and voted on them in order to address the following 3 questions:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • What kind of country are we seeking to build? 	

		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • How best can we overcome the challenges Scotland and the world face in the 21st century, including those arising from Brexit? • What further work should be carried out to give us the information we need to make informed choices about the future of the country? 	
1, 2	Group B	We would now like to ask you some questions about the Citizens' Assembly of Scotland. Some people have heard about the Citizens' Assembly and some people have not – that's ok. Please just answer the questions based on what you know about the Citizens' Assembly.	
1, 2	Ask all	<p>34) Members of the Citizens' Assembly were selected at random and were broadly representative of the Scottish Population. If you had been selected, how likely is it that you would have accepted the invitation to participate in the Citizens' Assembly?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Not at all likely • Not very likely • Somewhat likely • Very likely • Don't know 	Single code
1, 2	Ask all 0 – 10 scale Grid	<p>35) Please take a moment to think about the participants that have taken part in this Citizens' Assembly. On a scale of 0-10, where 0 means not at all accurate and 10 means completely accurate, how accurate do you think the following statements about the participants are?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The participants of the Citizens' Assembly are people like me. • The participants of the Citizens' Assembly have similar experiences to me. • The participants of the Citizens' Assembly have a similar background to me. • On the whole, the participants of the Citizens' Assembly are a good reflection of the population of Scotland 	Single code for each 0 = not at all accurate; 10 = completely accurate; Don't know
1, 2	Ask all Ask in this order	<p>36) How much do you agree or disagree with the following statements?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Citizens' assemblies are a good way of involving people in making recommendations on important issues. The Scottish Government should invest more in events such as citizens' assemblies. 	Single code for each 1 = Strongly disagree; 2 = Tend to disagree; 3 = Neither agree nor disagree;

		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Initiatives like citizens' assemblies are just an opportunity for governments to defend choices they've already made. • Citizens' assemblies are a good way of finding out what citizens think about issues. • Citizens' assemblies should be given the power to make decisions 	<p>4 = Tend to agree; 5 = Strongly agree; Don't know</p>
1, 2	Ask all	<p>37) Different people will have different views about the recommendations of the Citizens' Assembly. What about you? Would you say that you support...</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • All of the recommendations • Some of the recommendations • A few of the recommendations • None of the recommendations • Don't know 	Single code
1, 2	Ask all	<p>38) On a scale of 0-10, how willing are you to accept the recommendations of the Citizens' Assembly?</p>	<p>Single code 0 = not at all willing; 10 = completely willing; don't know¹</p>
1, 2	Ask all	<p>39) The Assembly's recommendations reflect my own views.</p>	<p>Single code 1 = Strongly disagree; 2 = Tend to disagree; 3 = Neither agree nor disagree; 4 = Tend to agree; 5 = Strongly agree; Don't know</p>
1	Ask all Randomise	<p>40) To what extent do you agree that the Scottish Government should implement the following recommendations?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Make decisions jointly with citizens through mini assemblies on issues that affect everyone, including all under-represented groups. These should be called at the start of each parliamentary session and be set up to examine specific issues. Their recommendations must be debated in Parliament before the assemblies are disbanded. 	<p>Single code for each Strongly disagree; Disagree; Agree; Strongly agree; Don't know</p>

¹ For the second wave, a labelling error was made in the online survey and the scale was instead labelled 'I know nothing at all' and 'I know a lot'

-
- Ethically invest in our society by ensuring everyone has a central bank account provided at birth for every citizen (for example, £1000 which cannot be spent until you reach a certain age) contributed to on a regular basis throughout a citizen's lifetime by means of a Universal Basic Income, which provides a real living income to ensure people don't worry about food, living costs and creates our own model of working by blending our own ideas with the best tried and tested methods from other countries.
 - Make the payment of a living wage a legal requirement for all employers.
 - Work with Westminster to make zero hours contracts illegal.
 - Publish a register of organisations which shows compliance with tax and employment measures using the green/amber/red system.
 - Raise the minimum wage for young people aged 16–24 to a national living wage.
 - Reduce waste and unnecessary use of nonbiodegradable products and be the first to ban these and become a world leader in this area. This must be accompanied by a consistent approach to recycling throughout the country which minimises pollution and the use of landfill.
 - Ensure that all NHS staff receive higher wages and enhanced employment packages to facilitate the retention of staff and strengthen recruitment.
 - Seek to gain greater powers which would allow us to negotiate and agree our own international and trade relations.
 - Work and negotiate with the UK government and others to seek to gain maximum control, and be able to manage its own immigration laws and arrangements to the benefit of Scotland and its people.
 - Work with Westminster to lower the age of the state pension, ensuring that retiring at state pension age is not enforced by employers
 - Work with councils and other stakeholders, including tenant associations (such as Living Rent), to implement rent caps across the country, give all young people entitlement to affordable social housing, simplify the information available to young people about welfare support for housing, strictly enforce rules for landlords including housing associations, to maintain good

quality repair of housing, and make buying property more accessible

- Have more devolved powers over how the tax system can be made fairer for all citizens and how tax revenue can be used. For example, to become more self-sufficient and have control of industries like fishing and renewable energy, in terms of investment & financial benefits
- Undertake a full review of the criminal justice system to improve outcomes for communities, offenders and victims. This would include the reintroduction of community policing, involving citizens in improving local communications and services

2 Least filled routing – please split into Group A ‘informed’ and Group B ‘not informed’ which should be balanced on age, sex, and code 0&1 combined at understanding of Citizens’ Assembly (question 30)

ASK ALL – GIVE GROUP A Q28a AND GROUP B Q28b (SAME LIST OF RECOMMENDATIONS, JUST SLIGHTLY DIFFERENT QUESTION TEXT)

Ask all
Give Group A a) and Group B b)
(same list of recommendations, just slightly different question text)

a) To what extent do you agree that the Scottish Government should implement the following recommendations made by the Citizens’ Assembly of Scotland?

b) To what extent do you agree that the Scottish Government should implement the following recommendations?

- Make decisions jointly with citizens through mini assemblies on issues that affect everyone, including all under-represented groups. These should be called at the start of each parliamentary session and be set up to examine specific issues. Their recommendations must be debated in Parliament before the assemblies are disbanded.
- Ethically invest in our society by ensuring everyone has a central bank account provided at birth for every citizen (for example, £1000 which cannot be spent until you reach a certain age) contributed to on a regular basis throughout a citizen’s lifetime by means of a Universal Basic Income, which provides a real living income to ensure people don’t worry about food, living costs and creates our own model of working by blending our own ideas with the best tried and tested methods from other countries.
- Make the payment of a living wage a legal requirement for all employers.
- Work with Westminster to make zero hours contracts illegal.

Single code for each
Strongly disagree;
Disagree;
Agree;
Strongly agree;
Don’t know

- Publish a register of organisations which shows compliance with tax and employment measures using the green/amber/red system.
- Raise the minimum wage for young people aged 16–24 to a national living wage.
- Reduce waste and unnecessary use of nonbiodegradable products and be the first to ban these and become a world leader in this area. This must be accompanied by a consistent approach to recycling throughout the country which minimises pollution and the use of landfill.
- Ensure that all NHS staff receive higher wages and enhanced employment packages to facilitate the retention of staff and strengthen recruitment.
- Seek to gain greater powers which would allow us to negotiate and agree our own international and trade relations.
- Work and negotiate with the UK government and others to seek to gain maximum control, and be able to manage its own immigration laws and arrangements to the benefit of Scotland and its people.
- Work with Westminster to lower the age of the state pension, ensuring that retiring at state pension age is not enforced by employers
- Work with councils and other stakeholders, including tenant associations (such as Living Rent), to implement rent caps across the country, give all young people entitlement to affordable social housing, simplify the information available to young people about welfare support for housing, strictly enforce rules for landlords including housing associations, to maintain good quality repair of housing, and make buying property more accessible
- Have more devolved powers over how the tax system can be made fairer for all citizens and how tax revenue can be used. For example, to become more self-sufficient and have control of industries like fishing and renewable energy, in terms of investment & financial benefits
- Undertake a full review of the criminal justice system to improve outcomes for communities, offenders and victims. This would include the reintroduction of community policing, involving citizens in improving local communications and services

1, 2	Ask all Ask in this order	<p>41) For each question, do you feel you have the information required to answer this question yourself?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • What kind of country are we seeking to build? • How best can we overcome the challenges Scotland and the world face in the 21st century, including those arising from Brexit? • What further work should be carried out to give all of us living in Scotland the information we need to make informed choices about the future of the country? 	Single code for each No, not at all; No, not really; Yes, mostly; Yes, definitely; Don't know
1, 2	Ask all Ask in this order	<p>42) And for each question, do you feel the Citizens' Assembly of Scotland as a whole has answered it?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • What kind of country are we seeking to build? • How best can we overcome the challenges Scotland and the world face in the 21st century, including those arising from Brexit? • What further work should be carried out to give all of us living in Scotland the information we need to make informed choices about the future of the country? 	Single code for each No, not at all; No, not really; Yes, mostly; Yes, definitely; Don't know
1, 2	Ask all	<p>43) What is the highest level of education that you have completed?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • University Degree/ Higher Education • Other further education, including apprenticeships and professional qualifications (e.g. diplomas and NVQS) • Secondary school/ College (up to 18 years of age) • Secondary schooling (up to 16 years of age) • Primary schooling (up to 11 or 12 years of age) • Other [Open response] 	Single code
1, 2	Ask all	<p>44) What is your ethnic group?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • White - Scottish • White - other British • White - Irish • White - other • Mixed or multiple ethnic group • Asian, Asian Scottish or Asian British • African • Caribbean or Black • Other ethnic group • Don't know • Prefer not to say 	Single code

1, 2	Ask all	<p>45) Do you have any long-standing physical or mental impairment, illness, or disability, expected to last 12 months or more?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Yes • No • Don't know • Prefer not to say 	Single code
1, 2	Ask all	<p>46) What was your total take-home income for everyone in your household for the month of January 2020 (before the COVID-19 pandemic)? Note: please count all earnings, tax credits etc., but deduct taxes, health insurance etc., for everyone in your household</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Less than £500 • Between £500 and £1000 • Between £1000 and £1800 • Between £1800 and £3000 • Between £3000 and £5200 • More than £5200 • Don't know • Prefer not to say 	Single code
1, 2	Ask all Pull through from profile if possible	<p>47) Did you vote in the December 2019 UK Parliamentary Election which led to a Conservative majority government? If so, who did you vote for?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Conservative • Labour • Liberal Democrat • SNP • Other • Did not vote • Can't remember • I was not eligible to vote 	Single code
1, 2	Ask all	<p>48) Who would you vote for if a UK Parliamentary Election took place tomorrow?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Conservative • Labour • Liberal Democrat • SNP • Other • Would not vote • Don't know/ Not sure • Prefer not to say 	Single code
1, 2	Ask all Pull through from profile if possible	<p>49) Did you vote in the referendum on an independent Scotland in September 2014? If so, how did you vote in response to the question: Should Scotland be an independent country?</p>	Single code

		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • I voted Yes • I voted No • I did not vote 	
1, 2	Ask all	50) If another Scottish independence referendum was held tomorrow how would you vote in response to the question: Should Scotland be an independent country? <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Yes • No • Don't know • Would not vote 	Single code
1	Ask all Pull from profile if possible	51) Did you vote in the May 2016 Scottish Parliamentary Election? If so, who did you vote for with your constituency vote? <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Conservative • Labour • Liberal Democrat • SNP • Other • Did not vote • Can't remember • I was not eligible to vote 	Single code
2		Did you vote in the May 2021 Scottish Parliamentary Election? If so, who did you vote for with your constituency vote? <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Conservative • Labour • Liberal Democrat • SNP • Other • Did not vote • Can't remember • I was not eligible to vote 	
1, 2	Ask all	52) If another Scottish Parliamentary Election was held tomorrow, who would you vote for with your constituency vote? <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Conservative • Labour • Liberal Democrat • SNP • Green • Other • Would not vote • Don't know/ Not sure • Prefer not to say 	Single code
1, 2	Ask all Pull through from profile if possible	53) Did you vote in the June 2016 referendum on the UK's membership of the EU? If so, how did you vote?	Single code

-
- The UK should remain in the EU
 - The UK should leave the EU
 - Did not vote
-

1, 2	Ask all	54) What is your current working status?	Single code
		<ul style="list-style-type: none">• Employed – full time• Employed – part time• Contract worker with a contract of less than two years• Self Employed• Unemployed• Not working due to ill health / disability• Student• Retired• Housewife / Househusband • Other	

1, 2	Ask all	55) Is the home you live in...	Single code
		<ul style="list-style-type: none">• Owned / being bought on a mortgage• Rented from a private landlord• Rented from local authority or housing association• Other	

Appendix E – Population survey analysis variables

Variable	Survey item	Response categories	Coding
DV1 Support for more assemblies	<p>To what extent to you agree that the Scottish Government should implement the following recommendations?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Make decisions jointly with citizens through mini assemblies on issues that affect everyone, including all under-represented groups. These should be called at the start of each parliamentary session and be set up to examine specific issues. Their recommendations must be debated in Parliament before the assemblies are disbanded. 	<p>Strongly disagree; Disagree; Agree; Strongly agree; Don't know</p>	<p>Coded from 0 (strongly disagree) to 1 (strongly agree)</p>
DV2 Answered core question	<p>And for each question do you feel that the Citizens' Assembly of Scotland as a whole has answered it?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> What kind of country are we seeking to build? 	<p>No, not at all; No, not really; Yes, mostly; Yes, definitely; Don't know</p>	<p>Coded from 0 (No, not at all) to 1 (Yes, definitely)</p>
Age	<p>Please type your age in the box below</p>		<p>Coded from 0 (youngest) to 1 (oldest)</p>
Female	<p>What best describes your gender identity? Would you describe yourself as a...</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Man Woman In another way Prefer not to answer 	<p>Single option</p>	<p>Coded as binary 1 = female 0 = otherwise</p>
University	<p>What is the highest level of education that you have completed?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> University Degree/Higher Education Other further education, including apprenticeships and professional qualifications (e.g. diplomas and NVQs) Secondary school/College (up to 18 years of age) Secondary schooling (up to 16 years of age) Primary schooling (up to 11 or 12 years of age) Other 	<p>Single option</p>	<p>Coded as binary 1 = university 0 = otherwise</p>
Newspapers	<p>Where do you get most of your information about the challenges facing Scotland?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Television Radio Newspapers 	<p>Multiple choice</p>	<p>Coded as 1 = newspapers 0 = otherwise</p>

- Magazines
- Books
- Websites
- Blogs
- Family and friends
- Colleagues
- Associations/organisations/charities
- Politicians
- Government reports
- Local council
- Social media (Facebook, Twitter etc.)
- Academic articles
- Don't know

Right wing	In political matters people sometimes talk of 'the left' and 'the right'. On a scale of 0 to 10 where 0 is the most left and 10 is the most right, where would you place your views on this scale, generally speaking?	Scale 0 = most left; 10 = most right; Don't know	Coded from 0 (most left wing) to 1 (most right wing)
Activity index	Please tell us whether you have been involved in any of the following in the last 12 months. <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Been involved with an interest group or campaign • Attended a public meeting/community council meeting • Participated in an online forum (eg social media, digital platform) • Taken part in a consultation or a survey • Signed a petition • Contacted an MP, MSP or Local Councillor • Attended a protest, rally or demonstration • Volunteered or provided unpaid help 	Multiple choice	Additive index running from 0 (involved in none) to 1 (involved in all)
Party ID	Some people feel closer to certain political parties than others. If you had to choose is there a political party that you feel closer to? <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Scottish Conservative and Unionist • Scottish Labour Party • Scottish Green Party • Scottish Liberal Democrats • Scottish National Party • Other • Don't know/undecided • Prefer not to say 	Single option	Coded as 1 = feel close to a party 0 = otherwise
SNP supporter	Some people feel closer to certain political parties than others. If you had to choose is there a political party that you feel closer to? <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Scottish Conservative and Unionist 	Single option	Coded as 1 = SNP 0 = other party

-
- Scottish Labour Party
 - Scottish Green Party
 - Scottish Liberal Democrats
 - Scottish National Party
 - Other
 - Don't know/undecided
 - Prefer not to say

Yes leaner

If another Scottish independence referendum was held tomorrow how would you vote in response to the question: Should Scotland be an independent country?

- Yes
- No
- Don't know
- Would not vote

Single option

Coded as

1 = Yes

0 = otherwise

Appendix F – Expert speaker survey questions

Survey item	Response categories
What motivated you to be an expert speaker at the Citizens' Assembly of Scotland?	Open
What were your expectations of presenting at the Assembly (including the Q&A with members, if applicable)?	Open
How much do you agree or disagree with the following statements? a. I was given enough information about how the Citizens' Assembly operates b. The overall aims of the Citizens' Assembly were clearly explained in advance c. I understood my role within the Citizens' Assembly process d. I was adequately briefed about what was required in my contribution	Closed scale response, strongly agree to strongly disagree
Is there any way any of the above could have been improved?	Open
How much time (in hours) did you spend on preparation for the Assembly?	Closed response, less than an hour to over 10 hours
To what extent did your experience of presenting at the Assembly of Scotland align with your expectations, and why?	Open
What did you think of the questions you were asked by the members at the Assembly?	Open
Is there anything else you think could be improved in terms of the delivery of similar sessions in the future?	Open
How much time (in hours) did you spend on any follow-up work for the Assembly?	Closed response, none to over 10 hours
What was the most rewarding aspect of being an external speaker at the Assembly?	Open
What was the most challenging aspect of being an external speaker at the Assembly?	Open
What do you think makes for a good external speaker at a Citizens' Assembly?	Open
Would you participate in another Citizens' Assembly in the future?	Closed scale response, strongly agree to strongly disagree
Can you please explain your answer to the above question?	Open
Do you have any other comments to add about your experience as an expert witness at the Citizens' Assembly?	Open

Appendix G – Internal interview schedules

Interviews with facilitators

Introduction

Reminder about purpose of research, confidentiality and consent.

Describe the broad structure of the interview and the main themes that will be covered.

Background – prior training and experience

- Prior experience of public engagement facilitation in general, and of facilitating deliberative approaches in particular.
- Prior training in public engagement facilitation in general, and in facilitating deliberative approaches in particular
- How would you describe your role as a facilitator in general [ethos, philosophy], and your approach to facilitation practice? What is the most important aspect of that role/practice, for you?

Preparation for Assembly

- Views on what they were given by way of preparation for the Assembly overall before it began. [Prompt for written material, training, meetings.]
- Did they feel that gave them a good understanding of their role and what was expected? [understanding the roles of the other people working on the Assembly?]
- Personal preparation: What preparation did you do yourself? Was this different to other experiences of facilitation? How prepared did you feel ahead of the Assembly starting?

Experience at Assembly meetings

- Views on the overall **design** of the Assembly, and the role they were asked to play in that as facilitators.
- Views on **remit**?
- What do you understand deliberation to involve?
- How did design/remit shape their experience as a facilitator. Did they feel enabled to use their facilitation practice?
- Views on the pre-briefing and material given to them before each Assembly process. [possible prompts for whether it was: clear, understandable, reasonable, confusing, impractical] How prepared did you feel ahead of the weekends?
- Experience of working with secretariat and design team, and their respective roles. [describe that experience, views on that experience]

Focusing on the Assembly meetings themselves...

- How would you describe your experience of working with members? [your facilitation role and relationship with the Assembly members?]
- What were their experiences of the engagement of members.
- What are their views on the range of **tasks** they were asked to do with members? [prompt with examples, e.g. tax exercise, recommendation formation, add others]
- What worked well?
- How well did they feel members engaged with the **evidence** they were given.
- Views on the quality of **deliberation** they saw from members.
- Overall comparisons between facilitating face-to-face and online:
 - What most changed for them when the Assembly went online?
 - How did they adapt their facilitation practice online?
 - What changed for members when the Assembly went online?

Final reflections

- What was the most rewarding part of the experience for you? And the most challenging?
- Was there anything that surprised you about the whole experience?
- Views on the final report and recommendations?
- In retrospect, what single thing could have been differently to improve the Assembly? Is there anything you personally would have done differently?
- Is there anything else you would like to say that we have not covered?

Interview with the Assembly's organisers and stewarding group interviews

Introduction

Reminder about purpose of research, anonymity and consent

Describe the broad structure of the interview and the main themes that will be covered

Background

- Description of role played in the Assembly
- How they got involved in the Assembly and their past experience of public engagement.

Experience of working together on design, organisation and delivery of the Assembly

- Intro: The design, organisation and running of the Assembly involved a number of people/ organisations working together [prompt - convener, secretariat, design team, stewarding group]
- How would you describe the respective roles and responsibilities of these organisations?
- Reflections on the experience of working with these other people/organisations. What worked well, what could have worked better/ differently.

Set up and preparation for Assembly

- Reflections on the arrangements to set up the Assembly, and their role in that [prompt on what stage they became involved].

Assembly Remit and Design

- Views on the remit and how the Assembly was designed to meet it.
- Impact of moving on-line.
- Views on the selection of evidence topics and speakers.
- Reflections on their experience of their own learning and knowledge gain through the process.

Assembly meetings

- Reflections on their experience of working with members [with reference to specific role]. What were their experiences of the engagement of members.
- Views on the quality of evidence provided, opportunities for learning [Q&A, other information and learning materials]
- How well did they feel members engaged with the evidence they were given.

- Views on the quality of **deliberation** they saw from members.
- What do they understand deliberation to involve?
- Overall comparisons between face-to-face and online, and what most changed for them when the Assembly went online?

Communication and public understanding

- Reflections on the challenges and successes of communicating to wider public and media about the Assembly? [specific focus on individual role]

Impact of the Assembly

- Reflections on the final report and the recommendations of the Assembly.
- Views on the impact of the Assembly and its report, and how that has been received by the government, the parliament, the media.

Final reflections

- What do they think of the Assembly recommendations?
- What was the most rewarding part of the experience for you? And the most challenging?
- Was there anything that surprised you about the whole experience?
- What learning have you taken away from this experience?
- What would you highlight to others involved in public engagement in the future? What would you say to someone in the same role as the one you played?
- What do they think of democratic approaches now? And the future use?
- In retrospect, what could have been done differently to improve the Assembly? Is there anything you personally would have done differently?
- Is there anything else you would like to say that we have not covered?

Appendix H – External interview schedules

Interviews with Scottish Government officials and politicians

Had you heard about citizens' assemblies before the Citizens' Assembly of Scotland? Did you have a view about them?

When/how did you hear about the Assembly for the first time?

- What did you think about it then?
- Has that view changed in any way?
- What caused it to change?

Did you have an opportunity to track the progress of the Assembly?

- Were you able to attend any of the sessions?
- Did you see any media coverage of the process?
- Were updates provided to parliament?

What is your understanding of the purpose of the Assembly?

- Do you think it has achieved it?
- What did you think to the remit given to the Assembly?

What are your thoughts about how the Assembly operated?

- Were you happy with the process of choosing the participants?
- Were you happy with how the Assembly reached its decisions?

What do you think of the Assembly's recommendations?

- Are there any recommendations that surprised you or you found interesting?
- Any that you particularly like/ dislike?

Any views/reflections about the impact of the Assembly on:

- on parliament
- on government/ policy
- your political party
- on Scottish public opinion/ debate

Should Scotland have more citizens' assemblies?

- Why?/ Why not?

- If so what do you see as the role of politicians in this type of process?

Interviews with journalists

Had you heard about citizens's assemblies before the Citizens' Assembly of Scotland? Did you have a view about them?

When/how did you hear about the Assembly for the first time?

- What did you think about it then?
- Has that view changed in any way?
- What caused it to change?

Why did you decide to report on the Assembly?

- What made it newsworthy?
- What aspects of the process did you think it was important to communicate?
- What aspects of the issue did you think it was important to communicate?
- What are the challenges of reporting on a citizens' Assembly?
- How did this evolve over the course of the Assembly?

What is your understanding of the purpose of the Assembly?

- Do you think it has achieved it?
- What did you think to the remit given to the Assembly?

What did you think to the Assembly's communication strategy?

- How could it be improved to enable great awareness of the Assembly?

Should Scotland have more citizens' assemblies?

- Why?/ Why not?
- Would you report on it? Why?/ Why not?
- What do you see as the role of journalists in this type of process?

Appendix I – Internal interviews coding framework

Code Name	References	Percentage
Assembly output	71	2.06%
Dissatisfied	37	1.07%
Inconsistency of outputs	3	0.09%
Report too long	2	0.06%
Too many or broad recommendations	28	0.81%
Untapped potential of process	4	0.12%
Members' ownership of outputs	8	0.23%
Range in use of evidence informing recommendations	11	0.32%
Satisfied	12	0.35%
Skew of outputs	3	0.09%
Design	86	2.49%
Clarity of design	11	0.32%
Design related challenges to facilitation	31	0.90%
Complexity of activities	4	0.12%
Constraints of venue	9	0.26%
Note taking	7	0.20%
Timings for tasks and activities	11	0.32%
Insufficient time for planning and preparation	33	0.96%
Voting process	11	0.32%
Evidence	53	1.53%
Catering for different forms of learning	14	0.41%
Didactic format of evidence session	5	0.14%
Instructions to speakers	5	0.14%
Pitch of information sessions	13	0.38%
Quality or balance of evidence	13	0.38%
Structure of evidence leading to fragmented engagement rather than a narrative	3	0.09%
Governance	150	4.34%
Civil Service skills vs citizens' assembly expertise	30	0.87%
Clarity or transparency of decision making	32	0.93%
Decisions already made	12	0.35%
Independent Secretariat	12	0.35%
No control of design process	20	0.58%
Secretariat involvement in design process	44	1.27%
Impact and legacy	70	2.03%
Constitutional implications	3	0.09%
Establishing legitimacy of the Assembly process	18	0.52%
Government reception of the Assembly	43	1.24%
Government engagement with the Assembly	12	0.35%
Questions about impact and accountability	29	0.84%
Need to embed Assembly learning at a variety of levels	6	0.17%
Learning opportunity	18	0.52%
Media and communications	102	2.95%

Challenge of remit	12	0.35%
Government engagement	4	0.12%
Insufficient comms resource or skillset	9	0.26%
Lack of media strategy at offset	2	0.06%
Media coverage of the Assembly	27	0.78%
Media strategy_engagement with journalists	8	0.23%
Media strategy_focus on members	15	0.43%
Media strategy_focus on process	1	0.03%
Media strategy_report publication	2	0.06%
Media strategy_shift online	1	0.03%
Media strategy_social media	3	0.09%
Political antagonism to the Assembly	2	0.06%
Public awareness of the Assembly	12	0.35%
Stakeholder engagement	4	0.12%
Member engagement	128	3.71%
Challenging members	6	0.17%
High retention rate	6	0.17%
Impact of move online on engagement	41	1.19%
Challenges to engagement	30	0.87%
Loss of informal spaces	12	0.35%
Related to technology and online etiquette	13	0.38%
Related to time elapsed since in-person	5	0.14%
Importance of established relationships	5	0.14%
Positive changes	5	0.14%
Intensity of proceedings	3	0.09%
Legitimacy of process for members	7	0.20%
Members feeling empowered	10	0.29%
Members strongly engaged with process	13	0.38%
Members' understanding of task or process	7	0.20%
Support to members in move online	5	0.14%
Supporting member welfare	25	0.72%
Varying levels of engagement	5	0.14%
Member Learning and Engagement with Evidence	25	0.72%
Inconsistency in member preparation between weekends	1	0.03%
Increased confidence and communication skillset	2	0.06%
Member engagement affected by expert speaker charisma	10	0.29%
Members feeling overwhelmed by information	7	0.20%
Members not understanding information given	2	0.06%
Members positively engaged with evidence	3	0.09%
Move online	57	1.65%
Challenges to design	5	0.14%
Challenges to facilitation	39	1.13%
Attention split across multiple screens	2	0.06%
Challenge to support member learning	3	0.09%
Group size	6	0.17%
Harder to promote inclusion and engagement	10	0.29%
Increased multi-tasking	5	0.14%

Removal of body language cues	6	0.17%
Slower process	2	0.06%
Technological issues	3	0.09%
Uncertainty about facilitation techniques compared to in person	2	0.06%
Positive changes for facilitation	5	0.14%
Easier to encourage participation	2	0.06%
More independence	3	0.09%
Support for facilitators	8	0.23%
Quality of deliberation	117	3.39%
Consensus versus challenge	19	0.55%
Impact of design on deliberation	49	1.42%
Dependent on evidence sessions	2	0.06%
Dependent on time available to deliberate	21	0.61%
Focus on output instead of deliberation	10	0.29%
Variable according to group or task	5	0.14%
Impact of remit on deliberation	12	0.35%
In-person compared to online	11	0.32%
Low levels of deliberation	7	0.20%
Member deliberation in informal spaces	7	0.20%
Member group dynamics	6	0.17%
Use of evidence within deliberations	6	0.17%
Quality of facilitation	91	2.63%
Assembly facilitation training	4	0.12%
Confidence in transferability of facilitation skills and techniques	6	0.17%
External views on the facilitation team	7	0.20%
Range in experience levels	33	0.96%
Prior facilitation experience	19	0.55%
Deliberation	4	0.12%
Deliberation by another name	2	0.06%
Involvement in DemSoc	2	0.06%
Online workshops	1	0.03%
Participatory budgeting	2	0.06%
Public engagement	4	0.12%
Senior management facilitation	1	0.03%
Short table facilitation	3	0.09%
Prior work experience	9	0.26%
Community work	2	0.06%
Encouraging inclusion or involvement	2	0.06%
Marginalised groups	2	0.06%
Media	1	0.03%
Training	2	0.06%
Range of facilitation techniques	3	0.09%
Views of role of facilitator	37	1.07%
Building member confidence	2	0.06%
Building rapport	2	0.06%
Ensuring outcome is achieved	6	0.17%
Managing balance of voices	9	0.26%

Managing group dynamics	1	0.03%
Neutrality vs providing a challenge	7	0.20%
Supporting decision-making	6	0.17%
Supporting member learning	4	0.12%
Relationships	82	2.37%
Between members	5	0.14%
Between members and facilitators	8	0.23%
Team spirit	63	1.82%
Felt alienated from the larger team	8	0.23%
Insufficient time to develop relationships and ensure clarity of roles	7	0.20%
Supportive or collaborative team	24	0.69%
Took time to gain trust	24	0.69%
With members	6	0.17%
Remit	160	4.63%
Breadth as an opportunity	30	0.87%
Direction determined by members (agree or not)	28	0.81%
Constitutional undercurrent	12	0.35%
Decision not to refine the remit	22	0.64%
Too broad	70	2.03%
Breadth a challenge to design	43	1.24%
Challenge to planning of evidence	21	0.61%
Challenge to planning of sessions	5	0.14%
Breadth a challenge to facilitation	9	0.26%
Uncertainty about direction of the Assembly	12	0.35%
Uncertainty about final output of the Assembly	14	0.41%
Roles and responsibilities	152	4.40%
Did not feel prepared	8	0.23%
Felt prepared	13	0.38%
Insufficient resources on design team	3	0.09%
Negative experience	17	0.49%
Positive experience	5	0.14%
Understanding of roles	106	3.07%
Clear	3	0.09%
Convener's role	30	0.87%
Design team's role	7	0.20%
Role of research	5	0.14%
Secretariat's role	10	0.29%
Stewarding Group's role	29	0.84%
Unclear	22	0.64%
Understanding of deliberation	37	1.07%
Approach to contention	10	0.29%
Collaborative decision-making	6	0.17%
Inclusion	2	0.06%
Increased understanding underlying opinions	5	0.14%
Iterative process	3	0.09%
Unclear understanding	2	0.06%

Use of evidence	9	0.26%
Understanding of deliberative facilitation	18	0.52%
Acknowledged difference between citizens' assemblies format and other participatory formats	2	0.06%
Facilitation approach	6	0.17%
Focus on outputs at end of tasks	5	0.14%
Iterative process	4	0.12%
Total	3,454	100.00%

Appendix J – External interviews coding framework

Research question/Code	Sub code	Frequency	Percentage
What is the level of public awareness through the different stages of the Assembly?			
	Covid (effects of)	16	2.49%
	Civil servants' awareness	4	0.62%
	Journalists' awareness	6	0.93%
	Politicians' awareness	12	1.87%
	Public awareness	6	0.93%
Do public perceptions evolve throughout the process and if so, how?			
	Covid	1	0.16%
	Time	1	0.16%
What shapes public perceptions?			
	Behind the scenes work	1	0.16%
	Communications strategy	1	0.16%
	Issues being discussed	1	0.16%
	Link to Independence	1	0.16%
	Media reporting	5	0.78%
	Personalities	1	0.16%
	Public cynicism	2	0.31%
	Talking shop	2	0.31%
	Timing and nature of announcement	1	0.16%
To what extent des the public engage in the learning process?		5	0.78%
How does the media reporting of the Assembly evolve during the process, from announcement to completion?			
	Media reporting at announcement	3	0.47%
	Media reporting during the Assembly	21	3.27%
	Media reporting at completion of Assembly	5	0.78%
How do journalists' and politicians' perceptions of the Assembly evolve throughout the process?			
	Journalists' perceptions	14	2.18%
	Politicians' perceptions	3	0.47%
Is the work of the Assembly coherently linked to the relevant institutions?			
	Link to the relevant institutions	4	0.62%
	Feed into the work of Government	22	3.43%
	Feed into the work of Parliament	14	2.18%
	With what impact?	55	8.57%
What were the challenges of initiating, organising, designing and implementing the Assembly process?			
	Designing the Assembly	9	1.40%
	Implementing the Assembly	7	1.09%
	Organising the Assembly	5	0.78%
To what extent were these challenges met?		23	3.58%
Announcement of the Assembly			
	Excitement	4	0.62%

Link to Independence	4	0.62%
Presentation	2	0.31%
Scepticism	1	0.16%
Timing	1	0.16%
Assembly personnel		
Assembly personnel	3	0.47%
Change in government personnel	4	0.62%
Changes in Assembly personnel	6	0.93%
Change in format		
Negative	2	0.31%
Positive	1	0.16%
Communications strategy		
Aftermath of the Assembly	2	0.31%
Aims	2	0.31%
During the Assembly	4	0.62%
Success	2	0.31%
Website	1	0.16%
Youtube	3	0.47%
Deliberation		
Explicit mentions	6	0.93%
Implicit mentions	9	1.40%
Lack of deliberation	5	0.78%
Expectations		
Pessimistic	6	0.93%
Support	4	0.62%
Uncertain of purpose	2	0.31%
Financial costs		
Expensive	1	0.16%
Media coverage	1	0.16%
Paying members	1	0.16%
Value for money	1	0.16%
Future assemblies		
Topics	11	1.71%
Lessons	11	1.71%
Mixed views	4	0.62%
Neutral mention	3	0.47%
Opposition	2	0.31%
Support	10	1.56%
Independence of the Assembly		
Benefits	8	1.25%
Assembly asserted its independence	3	0.47%
Concerns	2	0.31%
Issues discussed		
Link to recommendations	2	0.31%
Narrower focus	3	0.47%
Reflections	5	0.78%

Learning process		
Aftermath of the Assembly	1	0.16%
Deliberation	4	0.62%
Information provided to members	2	0.31%
Outcomes	2	0.31%
Remit	5	0.78%
Space for discussions	1	0.16%
Link to other assemblies		
Climate Assembly	11	1.71%
Irish Assembly	18	2.80%
Other assemblies	1	0.16%
Members		
_Members_After completion of the Assembly	2	0.31%
_Members_Engagement	6	0.93%
_Members_Expectations	1	0.16%
_Members_Inclusion	12	1.87%
_Members_Media	2	0.31%
_Members_Number of members	2	0.31%
_Members_Positive experience	1	0.16%
_Members_Relationships	1	0.16%
_Members_Support	1	0.16%
Motivation behind the Assembly		
Change in presentation	1	0.16%
Consultation exercise	1	0.16%
Doing politics differently	2	0.31%
Future of Scotland	2	0.31%
Scottish Independence	12	1.87%
Personalities		
Importance of	1	0.16%
Members	1	0.16%
Politicians	2	0.31%
Secretariat	1	0.16%
Political parties views		
All political parties	1	0.16%
Green Party	7	1.09%
Labour	3	0.47%
Lib Dems	2	0.31%
SNP	4	0.62%
Tories	1	0.16%
Process narrative		
Financial costs	1	0.16%
Lessons learned	1	0.16%
Members	2	0.31%
Next steps	1	0.16%
Purpose	1	0.16%
Recommendations	1	0.16%
Tensions with Assembly personnel	1	0.16%

Recall		5	0.78%
Recommendations			
	Broadness of the recommendations	5	0.78%
	Feasibility of the recommendations	13	2.02%
	Government response	9	1.40%
	Lack of contentious recommendations	1	0.16%
	Managing the recommendations	2	0.31%
	Opposition to recommendations	1	0.16%
	Radical recommendations	3	0.47%
	Level of support	2	0.31%
	Support	3	0.47%
	Mandate	3	0.47%
Remit			
	Broadness of remit	28	4.36%
	Designing the remit	9	1.40%
Report			
	Its impact	1	0.16%
	Lessons from it	1	0.16%
	Presentation	1	0.16%
	Support for it	5	0.78%
	Wording	1	0.16%
Scottish Independence			
	Not discussed	2	0.31%
	Not suitable for the Assembly	1	0.16%
	Use of citizens' assemblies	1	0.16%
Spectrum of opinions on the Assembly			
	Neutral	4	0.62%
	Opposition	4	0.62%
	Support	22	3.43%
Total		642	100.00%

Appendix K – Discourse Quality Index coding framework

Subject	Items	Modalities
Assembly session	Weekend (W)	1-7
	Day (D)	1 = Saturday; 2 = Sunday
	Session number	
	Table number (TN)	
Assembly members	Speech act (SA)	0 = Speech act without demand (only use * codes); 1 = Speech act with demand (apply all codes)
	Pertinence (P)*	0 = Speech act not relevant; 1 = Speech act relevant
	Level of justification of demand (LJD)	0 = No justification; 1 = Inferior justification; 2 = Qualified justification
	Level of generality of argument (LGA)	0 = No argument in the speech act; 1 = Argument refers to personal interest; 2 = Argument refers to group interest; 3 = Argument refers to marginalised groups; 4 = Argument refers to general interest
	Respect towards demands (RTD)*	0 = No respect; 1 = Neutral; 2 = Explicit respect; NA = there are no demands as yet
	Respect towards person (Civility) (RTP)*	0 = No respect; 1 = Neutral
	Respect towards counter-arguments (RTC)*	0 = Counterarguments are ignored; 1 = Counterarguments are acknowledged but degraded; 2 = Counterarguments are acknowledged but the response is neutral; 3 = Counterarguments are acknowledged and valued; NA = No counter-arguments have been made
	Request for information (RI)*	0 = No request for information in the speech act; 1 = Request for information about process in the speech act; 2 = Request for information about content in the speech act

	Expert opinion (EO)*	0 = No reference to expert opinion in the speech act; 1 = Agreement with expert by Assembly member in the speech act; 2 = Disagreement with expert by Assembly member in the speech act
	Storytelling (S)*	0 = No storytelling in the speech act; 1 = Storytelling in the speech act
	Process opinion (PO)*	0 = No comment about the Assembly process; 1 = Negative comment about the Assembly process; 2 = Neutral comment about the Assembly process; 3 = Positive comment about the Assembly process
	Conflict intervention (CI)	EX = Facilitator is part of conflict; 0 = Facilitator does not intervene when conflict arises; 1 = Facilitator steers discussion away from conflict; 2 = Facilitator encourages Assembly members to resolve conflict; NA = There is no conflict to resolve
	Length of speech act (LSA)*	Number of characters (no spaces)
	Useful passage to quote (UPQ)*	Y or N
Facilitators	Facilitator number (FN)	
	New ideas and interpretations (NII)	0 = Facilitator does not introduce a new idea or interpretation in the discussion; 1 = Facilitator introduces a new idea or interpretation in the discussion
	Quality of interpretation (QI)	0 = No response to interpretation; 1 = Negative response to interpretation; 2 = Neutral response to interpretation; 3 = Positive response to interpretation
	Argumentation (A)	0 = Facilitator does not ask for justification; 1 = Facilitator asks for justification
	Invite to speak (IS)	0 = Facilitator does not invite an Assembly member to speak; 1 = Facilitator invites an Assembly member to speak
	Taking a position (TP)	0 = Facilitator takes a position on the issue under discussion; 1 = Facilitator does not take a position on the issue under discussion

Synthesis (SYN)	0 = Facilitator does not synthesise; 1 = Facilitator synthesises; NA = There are no comments to synthesise
Quality of synthesis (QS)	0 = No response to synthesis; 1 = Negative response to synthesis; 2 = Neutral response to synthesis; 3 = Positive response to synthesis
Length of speech act (FLSA)	Number of characters (no spaces)
Useful passage to quote (UPQ)	Y or N

The Discourse Quality Index method was initially applied to parliamentary debates (Jaramillo and Steiner 2019). Its application to the Assembly’s small group discussions enables us to assess the extent that deliberation occurred, assess which deliberative norms were more prevalent and when, and thereby reflect on the quality of the facilitation.

In order to contextualise the coding framework to a citizens’ assembly we adopt developments in the coding framework made by other researchers. In the original DQI (Steenbergen et al. 2003) there was a distinction between ‘qualified’ and ‘sophisticated’ justifications of demands, depending on the number of reasons given for a demand. However, following other studies (Davidson et al. 2017; Marien et al. 2020), we accept that, from a deliberative perspective, it is not necessarily superior to have more reasons for a demand, providing a reason is offered that is concretely linked to the demand. Furthermore, we take the distinction between respect for ‘persons’ and ‘ideas’ from Marien et al. (2020), along with the coding of speech acts without demands with ‘non-justification’ related codes. This means that each contribution, or speech act, from each participant in the discussion is coded. This is important, as we need to know whether other deliberative norms such as pertinence and respect are present even when a demand is not made. It also helps us establish the extent demands are made by the Assembly members (Elstub et al. 2021a). From Bobbio (2013) we adopt codes for pertinence, and storytelling (see also Elstub and Pomatto 2017). The former enables us to establish the extent the discussion stayed on topic. The latter now widely acknowledged to be an important element of deliberation, not included in the original DQI, as it aids inclusion and makes arguments accessible (Steiner 2012). Given that previous studies have found limited use in the original ‘participation’ code (Davidson et al. 2017), where interruptions needed to be acknowledged by the speaker, we do not include this code. Instead, we code for length (similar to Elstub and Pomatto 2017) and number of speech acts per AM to assess how inclusive the discussions were. Following Elstub et al. (2021a) and Elstub et al. (2021b) we did not apply the original ‘constructive politics’ code. This code was used to assess whether participants move away from their starting position on the issue and offer mediating proposals. However, in mini-publics the participants rarely enter the discussions with set positions to defend as politicians might in parliamentary debate, but rather develop their opinions through the discussion. Indeed, one of the advantages of mini-publics is that participants do not have strong views on this issue at hand and therefore are more openminded (Elstub 2014). In order to help us address some of our other research questions, we also code for the extent the members expressed a need for more

information, explicitly referred to information provided by the speakers, or discussed the Assembly process. Finally, to enable analysis of how deliberation evolved throughout the Assembly process, we code the weekend, day, session number and table at which the discussion occurs.

Given the importance of facilitation to deliberative quality in mini-publics (Escobar 2019) we follow Ravazzi (2013) and code the facilitators contributions to the discussions as well. This includes aspects like whether the facilitators invite Assembly members to speak or to justify their demands, how they deal with conflict between members or whether they offer their own opinions on the issues being discussed or synthesise the opinions of members, and if they do whether the Assembly members vocally appreciate these contributions or not. Beyond these changes we utilise the original DQI codes (Steenbergen et al. 2003). The codebook is designed so that a higher score generally means more deliberative. The one exception is from the facilitation codes 'new idea or interpretation.' As coding a higher score for the absence of something is counter-intuitive, in these instances a lower score was actually preferable. These codes were then flipped when we moved to the statistical analysis.

As is common practice in DQI analysis, we treat each code separately, rather than aggregating them into an overall score of deliberative quality. This is because not all deliberative norms carry equal credence (Davidson et al. 2017).

Appendix L – Discourse Quality Index analysis: inter coder reliability tests

All coding of the sample of small group discussions transcripts identified for the DQI analysis was completed by one coder. In order to ensure that codes had been applied reliably, 20% of speech acts were double coded. We calculated percentage agreement and Cohen’s kappa agreement between coders to control for inter-coder agreement by chance. The results of these tests are displayed in the table below. All scores are above the common thresholds for satisfactory reliability.

Item	Percentage agreement	Cohen’s kappa	Level of agreement
Speech act format (SAF)	100	1	Perfect
Pertinence (P)*	100	1	Perfect
Level of justification of demand (LJD)	91	0.857	Almost perfect
Level of generality of argument (LGA)	70	0.642	Substantial
Respect towards demands (RTD)*	86	0.803	Substantial
Respect towards person (Civility) (RTP)*	100	1	Perfect
Respect towards counter-arguments (RTC)*	98	0.881	Almost perfect
Request for information (RI)*	91	0.649	Almost perfect
Expert opinion (EO)*	98	0.811	Substantial
Storytelling (S)*	98	0.791	Moderate
Process opinion (PO)*	100	N/A	Substantial
Conflict intervention (CI)	90	0.769	Substantial
New ideas and interpretations (NII)	90	0.633	Substantial
Quality of interpretation (QI)	85	0.595	Moderate
Argumentation (A)	97	0.908	Almost perfect
Invite to speak (IS)	87	0.694	Substantial
Taking a position (TP)	100	1	Perfect
Synthesis (SYN)	92	0.538	Moderate
Quality of synthesis (QS)	82	0.428	Moderate

Appendix M – Discourse Quality Analysis scores

Criterion	Percentage coded
Speech act format	
Speech acts without demands	17.01%
Speech acts with demands	82.99%
Pertinence	
SA not relevant	0.53%
SA relevant	99.47%
Level of justification	
No justification	33.43%
Inferior justification	60.25%
Qualified justification	6.33%
Level of generality	
No argument in the speech act	33.43%
Argument refers to personal interest	3.71%
Argument refers to group interest	19.53%
Argument refers to marginalised groups	22.42%
Argument refers to general interest	20.91%
Respect towards demands	
No respect	33.43%
Neutral	60.25%
Explicit respect	6.33%
Respect towards person	
No respect	1.18%
Neutral	98.82%
Respect towards counter-argument	
Counter-arguments are ignored	14.96%
Counter-argument are acknowledged but degraded	34.65%

Counter-arguments are acknowledged but the response is neutral	27.56%
Counter-arguments are acknowledged and valued	22.83%

Conflict Intervention

Facilitator does not intervene when conflict arises	8.34%
Facilitator steers discussion away from conflict	1.39%
Facilitators encourages Assembly members to resolve conflict	1.18%
NA: There is no conflict to resolve	89.09%
EX: Facilitator is part of conflict	0.00%

Request for information

No request for information in the speech act	80.34%
Request for information about process in the speech act	6.94%
Request for information about content in the speech act	12.71%

Expert opinion

No reference made to expert opinion in the speech act	96.47%
Agreement with expert by Assembly member in the speech act	2.78%
Disagreement with expert by Assembly member in the speech act	0.75%

Storytelling

No storytelling in the speech act	94.98%
Storytelling in the speech act	5.02%

Process opinion

No comment about the Assembly process	93.16%
Negative comment about the Assembly process	0.96%
Neutral comment about the Assembly process	2.88%
Positive comment about the Assembly process	2.99%

Appendix N – Facilitation scores for sample of small group discussions

Criterion	Percentage coded
New idea or interpretation	
No new idea or interpretation	68.09%
New idea or interpretation	31.91%
Quality of interpretation	
N/A	67.92%
No response to interpretation	5.73%
Negative response to interpretation	2.45%
Neutral response to interpretation	3.76%
Positive response to interpretation	20.13%
Argumentation	
Does not ask for justification	87.56%
Asks for justification	12.44%
Invite to speak (reordered)	
Facilitator prevents contribution	0.98%
Facilitator does not invite contributions	34.70%
Facilitator invites contributions	64.32%
Taking a position	
Facilitator takes a position	14.59%
Facilitator does not take a position	85.41%
Synthesis	
Facilitator does not synthesise	91.65%
Facilitator synthesises	8.35%

Quality of synthesis

N/A	91.65%
Negative response to synthesis	0.00%
Neutral response to synthesis	1.15%
Positive response to synthesis	5.56%

Useful passage to quote

Yes	3.60%
No	96.40%

Appendix O – Media analysis Excel coding framework

Key	Description
Month	The month and year of publication
Date	The exact date of publication
Publication	Name of the publication
Publication: likely readership with source of data	Evidence of likely publication readership, including any demographic information together with source data
Publication type	Type of publication (newspaper, magazine, etc.)
Publication Sub-Type	Additional details about the type of publication, including newspaper print type (broadsheet, tabloid, compact, etc.)
Publication Frequency	How often the publication is printed (daily, weekly, quarterly, etc.)
Publication: Online or print	Whether the publication source is print only, online only, or both
Publication: local, regional, national or international	N/A
Publication: Pro-Independence vs. Pro-Union	Recorded when a publication has explicitly stated their opposition/ support for Scottish independence in a public manner
Political stance other	Any notable, publicly expressed political stances of the publication that may influence their reporting of the Assembly (e.g. left-leaning, nationalist)
Journalist/ author type	Whether the author is a journalist (including journalist type), politician, stakeholder, convener or another type of author
Journalist(s) or author(s)	The name of the journalist or author
Reach (approximate)	Calculated reach (readership) of the entire publication, not necessarily the story itself. This measure is the same for all articles where reach is available, ensuring the same limitation across the data. This has been calculated through the Kantar media monitoring platform where available
Lace of article	The page number or website visibility of the article
Word count (relevant to the Assembly)	Word count, only counting the text relevant to the Assembly
Mention or article focus	The level of direct discussion about the Assembly itself within the article on a scale from mention to article focus

Key themes (1-4)	Broad key themes and sub-themes of the article content. This included several rounds of coding, including familiarisation, initial coding, recoding and grouping. These key themes are the same as the overall key themes identified through the line-by-line grounded theory code book in NVivo, although adapted to provide an 'overall article' view of the top 1-4 themes, as appropriate, that the article is covering. The key themes should be considered as equally spread across the 1-4 codes for each article
General overview	A more in-depth overview of the article content of approximately 1-3 sentences
Evidence of content from press releases	Any evidence of information from the Assembly's secretariat press releases, compared with the article content
Skew	The overall positive to negative skew of the article. 'Positive/neutral' would indicate a story is more positive than neutral, and 'neutral/positive' would indicate a story is more neutral than positive, and so on
Link to article	N/A
Search method source	The means by which the data source was collected, including the database the article was found through

Appendix P – Media analysis codes

Code name	Frequency	Percentage
Cost	15	5.7
Cost	22	5.7
Design and remit	26	6.8
General overview of the Assembly	12	3.1
Remit	6	1.6
Announcement of Assembly's remit	4	1.0
Recruitment	2	0.5
Modelled on the Irish Citizens' Assembly	1	0.3
Recruitment_Member retention	1	0.3
Experience	21	5.5
Members	18	4.7
Facilitator	2	0.5
Convener	1	0.3
Legitimacy	17	4.4
Impartiality of the Assembly	10	2.6
Critique of the Assembly's value	4	1.0
General legitimacy of the Assembly	1	0.3
Links to the SNP	1	0.3
Transparency of decision making	1	0.3
Other	29	7.6
Discussion of deliberative democratic models	17	4.4
David Martin Resignation	7	1.8
Convener_David Martin	2	0.5
Missing islands from Assembly map	1	0.3
Public engagement_Letters from the public	1	0.3

Public engagement_Public appeal to the Assembly	1	0.3
Outputs	58	15.1
Final Report	18	4.7
Vision statements	10	2.6
Recommendations_Rent caps	9	2.3
Member statements	7	1.8
Recommendations_Tax	4	1.0
Recommendations	3	0.8
Recommendations_4-day working week	3	0.8
Recommendations_Constitutional	2	0.5
Recommendation_Covid-19 briefings and health experts	1	0.3
Recommendations_More citizens' assemblies	1	0.3
Political and ideological	71	18.5
Assembly is a tool for independence	9	2.3
Green Party	8	2.1
Need to fix a broken political system	7	1.8
SNP	6	1.6
Labour_Richard Leonard speech	5	1.3
Second debate in parliament	4	1.0
Cross-party support	3	0.8
Potential government response	3	0.8
Stakeholder_Electoral Reform Society	3	0.8
Labour	2	0.5
Recommendations of the Assembly at odds with SNP policy	2	0.5
Scotia Future	2	0.5
Stakeholders_Living Rent	2	0.5
Support for the Assembly_Conservative	2	0.5
Conservatives	2	0.5

Generating partisan support for the Assembly	1	0.3
Liberal Democrat	1	0.3
Partisan views on the Assembly general	1	0.3
Party political_SNP	1	0.3
Political discussion other	1	0.3
Stakeholder_Common Weal	1	0.3
Stakeholder_Sortition	1	0.3
Stakeholder_What Works Scotland	1	0.3
Stakeholders_Engagement with the recommendations	1	0.3
Stakeholders_Explicit support of the recommendations	1	0.3
Support for the Assembly_Labour	1	0.3
Potential impact	74	19.3
Future of deliberative democracy in Scotland	29	7.6
Future of Scotland	18	4.7
Democracy	10	2.6
Cross-party support	3	0.8
Finding common ground	3	0.8
Reaching consensus	3	0.8
Constitutional	2	0.5
Future of deliberative democracy in the UK	2	0.5
House of Citizens	2	0.5
Community development	1	0.3
Empowerment of citizens	1	0.3
Process and content	65	17.0
Postponement of the Assembly	21	5.5
Politician's panel (weekend 3)	14	3.7
Reporting on weekend 3 content	13	3.4
Use of expert speakers	5	1.3

Topic_Tax	4	1.0
Consensus building	2	0.5
Assembly reconvening	1	0.3
Reporting on weekend 1 content	1	0.3
Reporting on weekend 2 content	1	0.3
Reporting on weekend 4 content	1	0.3
Topic_Covid 19	1	0.3
Topic_Sustainability	1	0.3

Total	383	100.0
--------------	------------	--------------