

# **A Culture Strategy for Scotland**

**Analysis of responses to  
the public consultation:**

**Full Analysis Report**



**January 2019**

## Contents

<b>Introduction</b> .....	<b>1</b>
Background to the consultation .....	1
Profile of respondents.....	1
Analysis and reporting .....	2
<b>A vision for culture in Scotland</b> .....	<b>4</b>
Views of those who supported the vision .....	5
Views of those who did not support the vision .....	9
<b>Ambition 1: Transforming through culture</b> .....	<b>10</b>
Views of those who supported the ambition .....	11
Views of those who did not support the ambition .....	17
<b>Ambition 2: Empowering through culture</b> .....	<b>25</b>
Views of those who supported the ambition .....	26
Views of those who did not support the ambition .....	29
<b>Ambition 3: Sustaining culture</b> .....	<b>35</b>
Views of those who supported the ambition .....	36
Views of those who did not support the ambition .....	40
<b>Delivering “A Culture Strategy for Scotland”</b> .....	<b>50</b>
<b>Monitoring and evaluating the strategy</b> .....	<b>57</b>
<b>Other comments</b> .....	<b>61</b>
<b>Impact assessments</b> .....	<b>63</b>
Annex 1 – Organisations responding to the consultation by type .....	73
Annex 2 – Practice examples provided .....	78

# Introduction

## Background to the consultation

This report presents analysis of responses to a consultation on “A Culture Strategy for Scotland”.

The Scottish Government has been working to develop a draft culture strategy over the past 18 months. It is based on feedback that was obtained from a wide range of audiences (including those working in cultural, arts and heritage and creative sectors, other stakeholders, and the general public) through a series of ‘culture conversations’ in 2017 and 2018. Through these events, the Scottish Government sought to understand, in relation to culture, what is important to the people of Scotland, what is working well, what changes are needed, and what kind of future they would like to see.

The draft strategy sets out a vision for culture, and a set of three ambitions, along with aims and actions in each case. The draft strategy document also provides some background, contextual information about culture in Scotland.

The consultation on the draft strategy opened on 27 June and closed on 19 September 2018. The consultation paper is available on the Scottish Government’s website at: <https://beta.gov.scot/publications/culture-strategy-scotland-draft-consultation/>.

## Profile of respondents

In total, 216 responses were available for analysis<sup>1</sup>.

The majority of responses were received through the Scottish Government’s Citizen Space consultation hub. Where consent has been given to publish the response, it can be found at: [https://consult.gov.scot/culture-tourism-and-major-events/culture-strategy/consultation/published\\_select\\_respondent](https://consult.gov.scot/culture-tourism-and-major-events/culture-strategy/consultation/published_select_respondent).

Respondents were asked to identify whether they were responding as an individual or on behalf of a group or organisation. Most responses (146 responses) were submitted by groups or organisations. The remaining 70 responses were submitted by individual members of the public, with one of these on behalf of a discussion group held on Shetland.

Organisational respondents were allocated to one of nine groups by the analysis team and the Scottish Government<sup>2</sup>.

---

<sup>1</sup> Two responses were removed because neither a name nor email address had been provided. This approach is in line with the Scottish Government’s standard procedure for consultation analysis.

<sup>2</sup> Please note that a list of organisation typologies was developed by the analytical team with assistance from the Scottish Government, and organisations were assigned to the most appropriate typology. In many cases organisations could fall into more than one typology so the analytical team selected the one that they felt was the most appropriate.

A breakdown of the number of responses received by respondent type is set out in Table 1 below and a full list of organisational respondents can be found in Annex 1.

**Table 1: Respondents by type**

Type of respondent	Number
Organisations:	
Academics, University, Higher Education or Further Education	6
Culture (arts, cultural heritage, creative industries) organisation, group or company	46
Faith Group	2
Local Authority or Culture Trust	16
National Collections and Performing Companies	9
Public Body	11
Representative or umbrella group	34
Third sector	16
Union or political party	6
<b>Organisations</b>	<b>146</b>
Individuals	
Individual (on behalf of a community)	1
<b>Individuals</b>	<b>70</b>
<b>All respondents</b>	<b>216</b>

Individual respondents were the largest single group. They included a number of respondents who identified themselves as working, or having worked, in the culture sector. The views expressed by individual respondents were often very similar to those expressed by the organisations that responded to the consultation.

The largest group of organisational respondents were the culture organisations, groups or companies. These respondents ranged from organisations working across Scotland through to smaller community-based groups or businesses. They also included arts, cultural heritage or creative industries respondents as well as respondents working more widely across culture.

Respondents came from across Scotland, from Shetland in the north to Dumfries and Galloway and the Scottish Borders in the south, and from Comhairle nan Eilean Siar in the west to Fife in the east.

## Analysis and reporting

The remainder of this report presents a question-by-question analysis of the comments made. A small number of respondents did not make their submission on the consultation questionnaire but submitted their comments in a statement-style format. This content was analysed qualitatively under the most directly relevant consultation question.

The comment rate was often very high, particularly in the earlier questions where around 4 in 5 respondents tended to comment. Comments were sometimes very detailed and extensive and not all issues raised can be covered in a summary analysis of this type.

The analysis presented below is designed to give an overview of the type and range of views expressed. These views were often diverse, and many issues were raised by one or a small number of respondents. When a larger proportion of respondents made a comment, this has been noted within the analysis.

# A vision for culture in Scotland

The consultation paper suggests that the draft strategy is bold and ambitious and is centred on the fundamental value of culture and its empowering and transformative potential. There is a commitment to long-term change through greater collaboration and integration across culture, communities and policy development. The vision statements are that:

- Culture in Scotland is innovative, inclusive and open to the wider world.
- Cultural excellence – past, present and emerging – is celebrated and is fundamental to future prosperity and wellbeing.
- Culture’s empowering and transformative power is experienced by everyone.

**Question 1: What is your view of the vision as set out above?**

**Question 2: If you have any further comments on the vision, please provide them below. What do you like, or dislike, or what would you change?**

**Table 2: Question 1 – What is your view of the vision as set out above?**

	Support	Do not support	Don't know	Not answered	Total
Organisations:					
Academics, University, Higher Education or Further Education	6				6
Culture (arts, cultural heritage, creative industries) organisation, group or company	42	1	2	1	46
Faith Group				2	2
Local Authority or Culture Trust	14	1		1	16
National Collections and Performing Companies	9				9
Public Body	9		1	1	11
Representative or umbrella group	25		1	8	34
Third sector	15			1	16
Union or political party	4	1		1	6
<b>Total organisations</b>	<b>124</b>	<b>3</b>	<b>4</b>	<b>15</b>	<b>146</b>
<b>% of organisations answering</b>	<b>95%</b>	<b>2%</b>	<b>3%</b>		
Individuals	50	10	5	4	69
Individual (on behalf of a community)	1				1
<b>Total Individuals</b>	<b>51</b>	<b>10</b>	<b>5</b>	<b>4</b>	<b>70</b>
<b>% of individuals answering</b>	<b>77%</b>	<b>15%</b>	<b>8%</b>		
All respondents	175	13	9	19	216
% of all respondents	81%	6%	4%	9%	
<b>% of all those answering</b>	<b>89%</b>	<b>7%</b>	<b>5%*</b>		

\* if figures do not sum to 100% this is due to rounding.

A clear majority of respondents – 89% of those answering the question – supported the vision set out in the draft strategy. Organisational respondents were more likely to be supportive than individuals (95% of those answering and 77% of those answering respectively).

The further comments made were often extensive and, as at other questions, the analysis below presents a summary overview. Please note that general comments about the accessibility of the draft strategy are covered at the analysis at Question 17.

## **Views of those who supported the vision**

Those who supported the vision often went on to make a broad statement of support, with further comments including that the vision is positive, inclusive, comprehensive, or ambitious. For example:

*The vision provides a wide and diverse interpretation of culture – which offers an inclusive path to engage as many individuals as possible. This is an important message for Scotland to send out.*

(Culture organisation, group or company respondent)

There was some support for the ‘broad-brush’, non-prescriptive approach taken to describing culture in the draft strategy, including reference to the full range of activities created and experienced by communities throughout Scotland and culture’s contribution to wellbeing.

In terms of elements of the draft strategy which respondents particularly liked, there was reference to the empowering and transformative themes, with some respondents noting these, or the draft strategy more widely, to be very much in line with the ethos behind the work of their own organisations. There was also support for the emphasis on cross-sectoral working.

However, although supporting the overall vision, others suggested the draft strategy could be more ambitious. There were calls for the draft strategy to be more inspirational, motivating or exciting and a specific suggestion that:

*...there is a need for a simple, inspirational overarching vision statement that sets the time for the strategy and that is used by government to vocally, passionately and publicly express the importance of cultural activity and acknowledge that culture is for everyone.*

(Representative or umbrella group respondent)

The absence of a definition of culture was also an issue for some respondents and it was suggested that such a definition should be included. Further comments included that whilst finding an agreeable definition of culture would be challenging, the draft strategy and its vision and aims would benefit from the clarity a definition would bring.

Suggestions for change to the vision itself included that it should:

- better reflect that education will be key, with a suggestion that the vision should include a reference to education. This was the most frequently made suggestion for change. There was also specific reference to lifelong learning.
- take a pro-active approach to raising cultural awareness across government departments, including education and skills and external affairs.
- recognise the important economic role of culture.
- place a stronger emphasis on helping under-represented people and communities to access cultural power structures to ensure diverse lived experience is better reflected.
- be more specific and time-bound. For example, the vision could set out a bold picture of what culture in Scotland should look like in 2030.

Other suggested changes to the draft strategy included:

- acknowledging that enjoyment of the arts and participation in cultural life of the community is a human right, as set out in Article 27 of the United Nations Universal Declaration of Human Rights.
- recognising that diversity of culture and the diversity of provision and participation are significant strengths in Scotland.
- creating a better balance and recognition of all culture sectors and types throughout.
- drawing a distinction between cultural curators and cultural creators.
- more explicitly making the connection between culture and the individual – especially in the spirit and context of Community Learning and Development strategies, and the Community Empowerment (Scotland) Act 2015.
- recognising the intrinsic value of culture. It was suggested that there is a danger that, as currently expressed, culture could be perceived as a function solely in the service of other areas of public policy.
- considering the duality of the national and the regional. Specifically, it was suggested that the strong regional elements of that identity and culture should be acknowledged.
- referring to place-making, including cultural regeneration and provision to further facilitate this and create an environment for creativity based in communities.
- giving additional consideration to the ‘right’ to access and participate in culture for all. This may include culture as a part of lifelong learning and development and integration into society.

Some respondents identified sectors or areas that they wished to see greater coverage or prominence on in the draft strategy. These included:

- most frequently, heritage, including reflecting the range and depth of Scotland’s heritage – from museums, libraries and archives, to historic

buildings, industrial sites, parks, landscape and natural heritage as well as intangible cultures, traditions and people's memories.

- built heritage specifically. It was suggested that built heritage is one of Scotland's most important cultural assets both at the level of individual experience and at community level.
- conservation and heritage science, reflecting the importance of the conservation subsector in enabling the arts, creative industries and cultural heritage and to recognise conservation as a cultural practice itself.
- the nation's archives, including for the contribution the archive sector makes to the cultural life of Scotland, enhancing our knowledge and understanding of a broad range of aspects of culture. It was suggested that archives provide the foundation of cultural projects because they are core repositories for culture and the cultural resources bequeathed to us by previous generations.
- libraries, including the public libraries that make a significant but under-recognised contribution by working in local communities to encourage participation, provide access and increase opportunity.
- craft and applied arts. It was suggested that craft practice is significant in Scotland and needs to be recognised, preferably as both an art form and a creative industry.
- the range of other important manifestations, influencers and contributors in relation to Scotland's culture, such as sports, religion, multi-culturalism and food.
- a greater commitment to Scottish culture, not simply culture in Scotland.

It was also noted that there is no mention of the work or role of the creative unions and the importance of their work in giving a collective voice to artists and practitioners and to improve the working lives of these people.

Other issues which respondents wished to see addressed included that:

- culture is sometimes described as a vehicle for other outcomes, and is sometimes used as an outcome or output in its own right – this could be clearer.
- the relationship between the vision statement and the National Outcome could be more clearly articulated.
- the draft strategy could be clearer in stating the Government's role in stimulating cultural activity through support for local and national organisations and institutions that provide platforms for people to create, appreciate and enjoy cultural activity.

In terms of the vision (as opposed to the draft strategy document which is discussed further at Question 17), suggested additions included that:

- specified and detailed actions and measures are needed. This was a frequently made point and was sometimes connected to a suggestion that the

current actions do not give a sense of how the vision will be delivered. A specific suggestion was that the final strategy should be accompanied by an action plan.

- timescales should be added, along with which organisations have responsibility for delivering the vision.
- how this draft strategy will relate to other relevant strategies and key policies, and how it enables other agencies and organisations to better fulfil their visions and aims should be included.
- it should make stronger links to priority programmes in education such as the National Improvement Framework, Scottish Attainment Challenge, Developing the Young Workforce, National Youth Work Strategy and the Adult Learning Statement of Ambition.

### **Innovation and inclusiveness**

Respondents sometimes commented on culture in Scotland being innovative, inclusive and open to the wider world. Many of the issues raised are covered at subsequent questions, but particular issues to arise at Question 1 included that it would be useful to provide further information about what is meant by innovation. It was suggested that innovation can simply refer to new practices, products or exhibitions and shows but, more fundamentally, it indicates a transformative approach which can change how we see, not just what we see.

Other comments included that while innovation is important it can lead to exclusion if it becomes the dominant factor. It was also noted that ‘innovative’ does not reflect that fact that many cultures are traditional and long-established and that they are as valid as new expressions. It was also stressed that Scotland needs to keep effective, established projects and ways of working.

### **Cultural excellence**

The reference to cultural excellence was welcomed by some, with one respondent commenting that they are:

*...keen to ensure that the idea of ‘excellence’ is acknowledged and championed throughout the strategy....ensuring excellent cultural provision is available to all should be a priority for Government.*

(Representative or umbrella group respondent)

Further comments included that the draft strategy should acknowledge there is good work being done across the sector, and that it would be helpful to highlight examples of excellence in cultural provision or good practice to show what success might look like.

Suggested additions included extending this part of the vision to include excellence of experience across all genres, whether in formal or informal learning, participation, performance at all levels of ability, or as an audience member.

However, a frequently raised issue was that excellence implies there is a standard against which cultural activity can be judged, and that this could be seen as elitist. For example, it was commented that:

*...often 'cultural excellence' can be a problematic term that invokes hierarchy and elitism – who determines the excellence? Especially in an artistic and funding context, where is the power dynamic in this relationship and how do we break down structural privilege (and) support transparency?*

(Culture organisation, group or company respondent)

## **Views of those who did not support the vision**

Those who did not support the vision, or did not know if they did, raised very similar issues to those who had offered support. These included that the vision is vague, so broad as to almost be a truism, or that:

*...a vision should be aspirational and clear to all, allowing a diverse range of individuals and organisations to contribute to its realisation. Having it in three parts and using conditional language in some places might work against this.*

(Culture organisation group or company respondent)

It was again suggested that a definition of culture is required.

It was also felt that more emphasis could be given to the role of cultural heritage, and that if the draft strategy suggests delivery will only be achieved through creative processes, those working in the cultural heritage sector will feel excluded.

There was a similar suggestion that the vision could more adequately include the cultural component of the built environment and landscape of Scotland. It was suggested that this is one of the most far-reaching and permanent aspects of any country's national culture, participated in by everyone, visitors and locals alike.

Others raised issues about delivery of the draft strategy and asked if it is practical, affordable or realistic.

More broadly, it was suggested that culture should evolve spontaneously and naturally and without government interference.

# Ambition 1: Transforming through culture

The draft strategy is structured around three key ambitions, the first of which focuses on transforming Scotland through culture. The consultation paper notes that the cultural and creative sectors are a significant and unique force within society that contribute to physical wellbeing, mental health and community strength. Yet this contribution could be significantly boosted by better inter-sector and cross-sector partnerships that plan for the long-term.

**Ambition 1 – Transforming through culture: Recognising that culture and creativity are central to Scotland’s cultural, social and economic prosperity.**

**Question 3: What is your view of the ambition, ‘Transforming through culture’ as set out above?**

**Question 4: If you have further comments on the ambition ‘Transforming through culture’, please provide them below. What do you like, dislike, or what would you change?**

**Table 3: Question 3 – What is your view of the ambition, ‘Transforming through culture’**

	Support	Do not support	Don’t know	Not answered	Total
Organisations:					
Academics, University, Higher Education or Further Education	6				6
Culture (arts, cultural heritage, creative industries) organisation, group or company	42	1	1	2	46
Faith Group	1			1	2
Local Authority or Culture Trust	13	1		2	16
National Collections and Performing Companies	9				9
Public Body	9		1	1	11
Representative or umbrella group	25		2	7	34
Third sector	13	1		2	16
Union or political party	4	1		1	6
<b>Total organisations</b>	<b>122</b>	<b>4</b>	<b>4</b>	<b>16</b>	<b>146</b>
<b>% of organisations answering</b>	<b>94%</b>	<b>3%</b>	<b>3%</b>		
Individuals	48	9	8	4	69
Individual (on behalf of a community)	1				1
<b>Total Individuals</b>	<b>49</b>	<b>9</b>	<b>8</b>	<b>4</b>	<b>70</b>
<b>% of individuals answering</b>	<b>74%</b>	<b>14%</b>	<b>12%</b>		
<b>All respondents</b>	<b>171</b>	<b>13</b>	<b>12</b>	<b>20</b>	<b>216</b>
<b>% of all respondents</b>	<b>79%</b>	<b>6%</b>	<b>6%</b>	<b>9%</b>	
<b>% of all those answering</b>	<b>87%</b>	<b>7%</b>	<b>6%</b>		

\* if figures do not sum to 100% this is due to rounding.

A clear majority of respondents – 87% of those answering the question – supported the ‘Transforming through culture’ ambition. Organisational respondents were more likely to support the ambition than individuals (94% of those answering and 74% of those answering respectively).

The analysis below begins with comments made by those who supported the ambition and concludes with an analysis of comments made by those who did not. Issues raised by those who did not answer Question 3, or who did not know at Question 3 tended to raise similar themes to those who supported the ambition.

## **Views of those who supported the ambition**

Respondents who supported the ambition often went on to stress the importance of placing culture at the heart of broader transformation. The power of culture to transform was noted, both in terms of the positive impact on individuals, communities and places, and in the potential of artists to lead debate on issues faced by society. It was seen as important for the draft strategy to strike the right balance between the Scottish Government supporting and promoting culture and ensuring that it remains free from political interference and remains true to its aspiration of being inclusive and open to all across Scotland.

In terms of reach and potential, a number of respondents noted that they were pleased to see culture taking its place through an outcome in the National Performance Framework. It was suggested that this is a key recognition that culture is not about ‘additional benefit’ but is essential to our quality of life and wellbeing.

The importance of creating an open and inclusive approach was highlighted:

*Culture only matters if it's shared. Unless people have access to cultural resources, those resources cannot have an impact upon people's lives.*

(Culture organisation, group or company respondent)

Further comments included that open knowledge is as important for culture as for industry, education and other sectors. It was suggested that public access to items within the cultural commons, such as out of copyright artworks, is important for maintaining the cultural health of the nation.

The importance of ensuring that everybody can access cultural events and opportunities was also raised, with particular points including that:

- for some communities, such as British Sign Language users, the economic and social benefits of cultural participation may be harder to deliver. Suggestions for positive change included setting up a British Sign Language TV channel and giving deaf people free access to cultural and arts events.
- there are still very limited opportunities for people with profound and multiple learning disabilities to access culture.
- it must be remembered that there are many small and scattered communities within Scotland that are not geographically based but which share the same

or a similar heritage. Central funding to the relevant communal umbrella bodies is, therefore, necessary to reach those groups and individuals.

- there is scope for the draft strategy to consider more concrete ways in which accessibility can be realised, including through a creative and inclusive use of translation.

It was suggested that the draft strategy should articulate the barriers to culture so that they can be addressed. Barriers to culture engagement identified by respondents included:

- having to demonstrate change even if a model is working in order to secure project funding for something 'new'.
- the lack of affordable, appropriate spaces in which to practise creative cultural activity is a key issue for voluntary arts groups across Scotland.
- threats to the continued existence of live performance spaces.
- the erosion of support for culture at a local authority level, including through reduction in grants for community-led culture.
- people working in culture not feeling valued for the work they do and with low pay and long hours.

Some respondents noted the important role that their own organisation or others working in the same sector could play in transforming through culture. There was particular reference to:

- museums, including as being in a unique position to deliver across many policy areas.
- archives, by casting light on the communities that engage with them. It was suggested that the funding of public archives needs to reflect their role in transforming through culture.
- conservation and heritage science, which enable the impact of heritage to be maintained in the long-term.
- faith-based communities, including the central place the church has played in the arts through commissioning, sharing works with communities and exploring aspects of faith through the medium of the arts.

Respondents also identified areas which they felt should be given greater emphasis or coverage in the final strategy. These included:

- intangible cultural heritage, including the role of traditions and how they can be safeguarded and celebrated as an integral and valued part of Scotland's culture.
- traditional crafts and skills.

There were also suggestions about additional themes or groups of people that could be acknowledged or considered in the draft strategy including:

- the role of charitable or philanthropic support in cultural development in Scotland, for example through supporting the development of V&A Dundee.
- the role of the arts in helping people experiencing homelessness.

In addition, it was highlighted that the third sector also galvanises opportunities to access and support vulnerable people who can benefit from arts and culture but who may be unlikely to engage with it on their own. It was suggested that the draft strategy needs to do more to ensure that the third sector is seen as an equal partner in the delivery of arts and culture as well as the mechanism through which people access culture.

In terms of how the transformation ambition itself should be defined or phrased, comments included that:

- recognising culture is insufficiently ambitious. It was suggested that 'embedding' could be an alternative.
- it should also refer to wellbeing and not just prosperity.

Other comments included that balance is key, and that economic considerations should not have automatic precedence over other measures of prosperity. With a slightly different emphasis it was suggested that:

*While the intrinsic value of creativity and cultural tradition should not be overlooked, Scotland's multi-faceted national culture and the local and regional cultures and the creativity on which it is built have a vital contribution to make to the 'whole economy approach' promoted in Scotland's Economic Strategy.*

(Local Authority or Culture Trust respondent)

On a connected point, it was suggested that the draft strategy should include cross-referencing between existing legislative and policy frameworks. There was specific reference to:

- the Community Empowerment (Scotland) Act 2015.
- the Social Enterprise Strategy for Scotland.
- links to public health reforms.

It was also suggested that this section of the draft strategy would benefit from more concrete examples of how transformation can be achieved.

### **Culture and health**

The consultation paper notes that culture contributes to health and wellbeing in a myriad of ways, from improving the overall environment for individuals and communities, to offering alternatives and complementary activities that support treatment and care.

Some respondents noted the important role that their own organisation or sector already plays, including that a number of third sector organisations are using cultural approaches to support people's health and wellbeing. Examples given

included working with local nurseries and schools, community groups and unemployed young people to deliver creative workshops on food growing, gardening, and environmental art.

However, issues about funding were also raised, including that museum programmes that focus on health and wellbeing, community cohesion and education often operate on very small budgets, and are reliant on external funding beyond Government grants.

More generally, it was suggested that projects can be difficult to get off the ground for funding reasons and that identifying additional funding streams would be very valuable. It was also reported that it can be difficult to demonstrate the value of cultural services or projects with a health and wellbeing angle and this can make it difficult to justify spend on what may not be seen as an essential service.

Finally, it was suggested that the draft strategy needs a much stronger emphasis on the need for the worlds of health and social care to join forces with the worlds of arts and culture in a shared effort to improve and nurture people's health and wellbeing.

### **Culture and education, children and young people**

The consultation paper states that culture and creativity empower young people, building their self-confidence, enabling them to express their thoughts and emotions, and encouraging them to work collaboratively with others.

Some of those who commented noted the importance of ensuring children and young people have access to culture. For example, it was suggested that:

*Arts and culture in Scotland will not benefit and inspire positive change for less advantaged citizens unless we are able to provide frequent, high quality access to the arts, from the earliest possible age. It is therefore essential that our youngest citizens are able to access arts and cultural activities from infancy.*

(Culture organisation, group or company respondent)

A number of other comments focused on the delivery of, or access to culture through schools and included that it will be at the pre-school, primary and secondary school stages that the foundations, enabling a lifetime of appreciation, participation in, and understanding of, the inherent value of culture, will be built.

In terms of how those foundations can be built, comments included that:

- more could be done to support culture across the curriculum and not just in arts subjects.
- extra-curricular opportunities need to be maximised giving children the opportunity to pursue activities that are of interest to them.
- the scope should be expanded to include early years, further education, youth work and lifelong learning establishments.

Other respondents commented on:

- the loss of specialist teachers in schools.
- the current disparity between local authorities regarding instrumental music provision.
- difficulties for young people from marginalised communities accessing higher education in the arts and culture.

In terms of the draft strategy itself, it was suggested that it could contain a bolder statement of intent about the need for arts delivery in schools and that it is an opportunity to highlight a training need across education practitioners. Free access to instrumental music tuition was specifically raised by a number of respondents.

### **Culture and technology**

The consultation paper states that technological change is transforming how culture is developed, produced, delivered and experienced, such as online streaming, digitisation and in online communities. It also notes that technology offers both new opportunities for expanding culture and improving access to certain types of culture.

Further comments sometimes echoed this perspective, including that if the final strategy is to be a living document it must take cognisance of the upcoming digital and technological advances and the significant opportunities and implications these will have for the arts and cultural sector.

There was specific reference to the importance of recognising new and emerging technologies, including the growth of virtual reality, immersive technology and 360° filming, augmented reality, live streaming and performance capture. It was suggested that while the draft culture strategy rightly identifies how digitisation and online streaming offers new opportunities to engage with culture, it is also changing the form of culture itself.

In terms of challenges faced, comments included:

- that there is currently no support for existing technological infrastructure in organisations that are actively addressing digital access to provision. It was suggested that the draft strategy should set out support and a financial commitment to access culture via technology for people with disabilities.
- an academic respondent reporting that the majority of their funding for new technologically-oriented opportunities has come through the UK Government's National Productivity Investment Fund.

In terms of opportunities, it was reported that the music industry has always responded to technological advancements with creativity and that, while the digital era has presented the industry with challenges, it also presents opportunities as long as musicians and creative content creators are fairly remunerated for this work.

It was also suggested that Scotland's continuing capacity to engage in and lead innovation across the creative and cultural sectors could be further highlighted through the draft strategy.

### **Culture and climate change**

The consultation paper explains that the draft strategy aims to place culture and creativity at the heart of a progressive and innovative society where the struggle against climate change will become even more vital and relevant to everyone.

One suggestion was that the 'Transforming through culture' ambition should recognise the environmental impact, with the ambition being 'Transforming through culture: Recognising that culture and creativity are central to Scotland's cultural, social, environmental and economic prosperity'.

Other comments included that the Scottish museums sector is committed to doing what it can to influence behavioural change with respect to climate change, and that culture can both support the campaign against extraction of fossil fuels as well as imagine a post fossil fuel future for Scotland.

Issues raised included that:

- the relationship between arts organisations and oil and gas company sponsorship needs to be considered.
- there is a need for investment in the fabric of museum buildings in order to reduce their impact on the environment.

### **Collaboration, co-operation and policy integration**

The consultation paper suggests that developing a more collective understanding of what culture does will mean that culture will be better integrated across other policy areas.

Some respondents noted the importance of taking a collaborative approach, including suggesting that a more structured and sustained approach to collaboration across disciplines would be welcome. In terms of how any approach should be taken forward, suggestions included that:

- it will be important for cultural heritage to have a place at the table.
- the draft strategy should consider how cultural life in all its forms can be successfully integrated within other policy areas, including health and wellbeing, learning and attainment, planning, place-making and community regeneration.
- the support and partnership of Scotland's local authorities will be key to helping facilitate the building of effective networks, partnerships and sharing of best practice.
- there needs to be more detail here about how culture is expected to feature in Local Outcome Improvement Plans and Community Planning.

In remote and rural areas, support is needed to create partnerships with businesses outside the culture, heritage and arts sector.

## **Views of those who did not support the ambition**

Some of those who did not support the ambition asked whether society needed to be transformed or queried the role of culture in that transformation. Some respondents also queried whether there is evidence about the use of culture to deliver other outcomes, for example, around health and wellbeing. Other comments focused on which sectors, groups or types of people will be central to any transformation. They included that:

- the cultural heritage sector should be given greater recognition for the key role it plays.
- local authorities have a big part to play and their cultural planning will be key.

Further issues raised included that:

- there is no explanation of why linguistic diversity is regarded as a strength.
- with reference to climate change, a perception that the intention of the government to pay artists to deliver its message is stated clearly, and that paying artists to speak on the state's behalf is not acceptable in an open, democratic society.
- alternatively, and as expressed by some who supported the ambition, that environmental sustainability is essential to cultural, social and economic prosperity and that the ambition should be amended to that effect.

On a similar theme to comments made by those who supported the ambition, it was also felt that culture does not always have to act in transformative ways to be of value and that its intrinsic value should be recognised.

**Question 5: Please provide comments on the aims and actions under this ambition. What do you like, or dislike, or what would you change?**

In their general comments at Question 5, some respondents made a broad statement of support for the various aims and actions set out, with further comments including that they are all relevant or progressive.

Others suggested that more specific and measurable aims or actions will be required. It was suggested that:

- further definition of the aims could help ensure that the associated actions are the most appropriate.
- academic and sectoral reports on both benefits of culture and recommendations on addressing inequality of access, representation and

inclusion in the arts should be drawn together to produce a cohesive action plan.

It was also suggested that government should first examine barriers to innovation and creative approaches to problem solving across policy, public sector activity and investment.

In terms of who should be involved in delivering the aims or actions, comments included that:

- it is vital that local authorities are at the core of how these aims are delivered. They need to be an important partner in the actions listed as, so often, the funding, projects and partnerships needed to achieve these aims are delivered through local government.
- strategic or steering groups should include British Sign Language or representatives of deaf culture, not just disability groups and those who focus on hearing 'loss' or 'impairment'.

Issues raised included that the actions outlined for 'Transforming through culture' all feel quite high-level and top-down, which runs counter to other aspects of the draft strategy which seek to empower individuals and communities in a new way. Specifically, it was suggested that the actions should support communities that are not engaged.

Other general comments made often reflected issues already covered at the analysis presented at Question 4 or elsewhere.

### **Aim 1: Place culture as a central consideration across all policy areas.**

Those who commented often made a statement of support for Aim 1, including suggesting that, if achieved, it could be critical in delivery of key elements of the vision, especially that 'culture is to be experienced by everyone'. To be successful it was suggested that the aim:

*...should not be seen as a bid to other fields by culture for more territory, funding or clout, but as a reminder and statement to those non-cultural policy areas that culture is essential to achieving their aims, and an offer to help achieve them.*

(Representative or umbrella group respondent)

It was suggested that active engagement at the highest levels of government will be required, particularly in an economic and political climate which is increasingly uncertain. It was also suggested that, in addition to policies, funding streams and grant-making responsibilities and their respective processes, would also need to be aligned and simplified.

Others were looking for changes or additions to the aim, including suggesting that:

- 'consideration' is not strong enough and does not suggest definitive action.

- the aim would be strengthened by clear reference to tourism and visitor attractions and their links to economic regeneration and wellbeing.

There was also a concern that this aim may not be realistic.

**Action 1: Develop a new cultural leadership post within Scottish Government, supported by strategic thinkers from across the culture sectors and beyond. The role will support creative and innovative thinking and highlight the benefits of a more connected and multi-disciplinary approach across all areas of government and its major stakeholders to consider the big societal issues faced in Scotland today and in the future.**

Views were mixed amongst those who made specific reference to the new cultural leadership post.

Many respondents made a clear statement of support, including suggesting that the role will be crucial to helping deliver the changes proposed. For example, it was suggested that:

*The Cultural Leadership post could be a game changing shift in policy making. It is vital that they are able to work across departments to ensure policy makers throughout the Scottish Government understand the benefits of and their responsibility to consider culture in their work.*

(Representative or umbrella group respondent)

Suggestions for how any post should be framed included that:

- it should be akin to the Chief Medical Officer or Chief Scientific Officer.
- the postholder would need to be given sufficient authority and resources to effect change. This was a frequently raised issue.
- it would be essential for this post to have the influence and resources to work across all Scottish Government policy areas.
- it may be most effective if focused on influencing and enabling.
- the strategic thinkers should be from across the full breadth of the culture sector and include individual artists. It was suggested that it will be important that this group reflects Scotland's geography and demographic diversity. In terms of those beyond the cultural sector, those with a knowledge and awareness of marginal groups should be included.
- consideration should be given to a complementary support structure for the post, such as cultural champions in each policy area who could be networked with each other, with the leadership post and with cultural leaders in local authorities and Community Planning Partnerships.

Queries were also raised, including whether artists will be involved in the selection process for the post, and whether the postholder would be accessible and accountable to the arts community. There were also questions about the

relationship between the role and Scottish Ministers, Creative Scotland and the other public bodies and major institutions that support Scotland's culture sectors.

Alternative approaches or suggestions included:

- the postholder could be a 'champion', 'advocate' or 'protector' rather than a leader.
- the role should be clearly designated as an ambassador for culture, both within government and in facing outward into the community.
- a Cultural Leadership Team could be a better way forward. Specifically, it was suggested that the sheer breadth of experience and expertise required to execute such a position effectively could be an issue, and that a committee or collaborative approach would be more effective.

Comments on the potential of the post, included that:

- the post-holder might have an international ambassadorial role.
- the post-holder's first action should be to engage immediately and meaningfully with the Learning Directorate to ensure that arts and culture are, once again, a well-funded core element of the curriculum and that training and pathways into the cultural sector/creative industries are supported and promoted.
- a strong link could be made with teacher education and career-long professional learning for teachers.

Some respondents commented that they would need more information about the proposed role before being able to take a position. Other points made included that:

- there is little clarity about the purpose and remit of the role. It was suggested that the generalist nature of the description, the lack of any clearly defined authority or leadership role and the lack of any commitment to resources undermines the original aim it addresses.
- there is a risk of complicating an already busy landscape and it would be helpful to understand the wider strategy for cross-government engagement and collaboration with executive agencies and sector bodies.
- funding of the role could divert resources away from grassroots organisations.

Fewer respondents disagreed with, or were not convinced as to the benefits of, developing a new post. Their further comments included that it could create another layer of bureaucracy and that the resources could be better used elsewhere.

There were concerns about whether the post holder would have sufficient authority to drive change and a question as to whether one individual can really represent the whole culture sector. Other issues raised included that:

- it is not clear how the new leadership role differs significantly from existing leadership roles, including within the Scottish Government or Creative Scotland.
- there was also reference to the role of Scottish Enterprise, the network of local authorities, and Arts and Business Scotland.
- there are already impressive cultural leaders working at grassroots level across Scotland and the money would be better spent supporting them to achieve the ambitions and actions set out in the draft strategy.

Finally, there was a concern running across this action, and the development of national partnership for culture (Action 2 below), that black and minority ethnic communities will be inevitably disadvantaged by these approaches. Further comments included that black and minority ethnic groups are under-represented within the culture sector, particularly in positions of leadership and academia, and that if an internal post is to be created, it should be accompanied by a panel of partners within the sector which includes black voices; if this is not the case, the inequality will be perpetuated.

**Aim 2: Open up the potential of culture as a transformative opportunity across society.**

There were relatively few comments specifically about Aim 2, although some respondents noted their support for the aim or made suggestions about how the potential of culture to transform could be opened up. These included:

- shifting away from short-term goals and the thinking that often comes with them. Specifically, the proposed changes in the draft strategy must be protected for the longer term if they are to have an effect.
- using data on existing activity and matching that data with the best research on initiatives that have already been proven to have an impact.

It was also suggested that achieving the aim will require a review of the role of cultural activity within our society and that this review should be carefully designed by a multi-disciplinary team with expertise in facilitated methods of consultation and debate. Another suggestion was that the Scottish Government should support the establishment of an academic centre of excellence to research and support the development of cross-sector cultural integration using arts and health as a key model of practice.

Other comments on the aim itself included that it is meaningless or that further consideration needs to be given to whether culture can or should address inequality or climate change. Some wanted the draft strategy to recognise that evaluation and evidence gathering on arts and health is advanced and that it consistently articulates the societal value of creative and cultural engagement.

**Action 2: Develop a national partnership for culture that includes working with academic partners to develop new approaches to measuring an extended view of culture and better articulate the benefits of culture to society.**

Respondents often noted their agreement with Action 2, including suggesting that the development of a national partnership is essential. Benefits of the approach identified included that:

- it could help achieve consensus on national priorities across cultural organisations.
- it could help explore ways of sharing good practice.

There was a request for further information on the proposed membership of any national partnership with suggestions including:

- representatives from Further Education and Community Learning and Development.
- individuals and organisations directly involved in cultural production or presentation.
- all of Scotland's creative industries' unions.
- the Scottish Contemporary Art network.

It was also suggested that any approach should include international connections and there was reference to Internationalising Social Enterprise – A Strategy for Scotland as setting out an approach based on academic and agency partnerships.

There was a query as to why academic partners have been singled out, and a suggestion that academic contribution can move things away from plain English and being easily accessible. Other issues raised included that a national partnership is a top-down approach, and something should be done to connect with communities and give them a say.

With reference to approaches to measuring an extended view of culture, comments included:

- it is incredibly hard and is possibly damaging to the development of cultural initiatives.
- to have an impact it is essential to first accurately map existing cultural provision and existing research on the impact of different types of cultural provision.
- action research or similar approaches might be better suited to this work than desk-based research.
- it should be remembered that for small organisations, measuring the impact of their work is already a huge undertaking.

Not all respondents who commented agreed with the action, with their further comments including that work is needed to understand how culture contributes to transformation in society and that more thinking is required before a move to measurement of an extended view of culture.

It was also suggested that Action 2 does not flow from Aim 2 and offers a very narrow interpretation of what 'opening up' the potential of culture could mean. Specifically, it was suggested that there is more to this than measuring. A revised version of the action proposed was that it should read '...develop a national partnership for culture that includes working with academic partners to articulate and measure the benefits of culture to society.'

**Aim 3: Position culture as central to progress in health and wellbeing, economy, education, reducing inequality and realising a greener and more innovative future.**

Respondents often welcomed the aim of positioning culture as central to progress in health and wellbeing, economy, education, reducing inequality and realising a greener and more innovative future. Further comments included that increasing the sector's involvement in social innovation can build resilience by attracting greater public support and awareness of the importance of culture.

However, there were also questions as to whether the aim is achievable within the current funding environment. Other issues included that the reference to 'a greener future' is insufficient and environmental sustainability should be embedded throughout the draft strategy.

As at other questions, it was also noted that the case for culture for its own sake must continue to be made.

**Action 3: Develop alliances that support social change through culture and promote leadership and joined-up working across the culture sector, other sectors, local and national government and communities.**

Respondents often gave their support for the approach, with further comments including that alliances and joined-up working is crucial. It was suggested that:

*The strategy should provide encouragement and opportunities for local and national government to adopt a more inclusive and timely approach to engaging with cultural heritage across the wider agendas including economic regeneration, education, equalities and health and wellbeing.*

(Local Authority or Culture Trust respondent)

As at Action 2, there were suggestions about who should form part of any alliances. These included:

- the National Performing Companies.

- individuals. It was noted that artists are also active citizens, for example as members of community councils, school governors, community groups and movements for change across our society.
- trade unions.

It was also suggested that there should be specific reference to the role of Community Planning Partnerships in developing alliances.

More widely, it was suggested that developing alliances should begin with cultural organisations working at community level. It was frequently noted that there is already a lot of joined-up thinking and working across the sector and suggested that existing alliances, often working slightly below the radar, should be sought out and strengthened before 'the wheel is reinvented'.

In terms of how any alliances should be set up and run, further comments included that it will be important to design collaborations that can be sustained rather than being shorter-term and project-based. Other comments included that:

- it will be important not to force partnerships or alliances to the detriment of any of the partners.
- alliances must be based on being equal partners.
- it is not clear who would be responsible for developing alliances.
- participatory arts practitioners are already good at working together but are not particularly highlighted in the draft strategy.

However, concerns were also raised about Action 3, including that it is not clear how the action will be delivered and lead to change.

It was also seen as important to ensure culture retains its ability to be independent from government and can continue to question, criticise and challenge.

### **Other suggested aims or actions**

Finally, a small number of additional aims or actions were suggested. These included:

- an aim to recognise the potential of cultural heritage, conservation and heritage science to act as subject for climate change research and communication.
- an action for government and funders to offer guidance and signposting on best practice in environmental sustainability and to encourage compliance with guidelines.

## Ambition 2: Empowering through culture

The draft strategy's second ambition focuses on empowering through culture. The consultation paper describes culture as for, and of, each and every community across Scotland, with everyone having the opportunity to flourish through culture.

**Ambition 2 – Empowering through culture: Opening up and extending culture so that it is of and for every community and everyone.**

**Question 6: What is your view of the ambition 'Empowering through culture'?**  
**Question 7: If you have further comments on the ambition, 'Empowering through culture' please provide them below. What do you like, dislike, or what would you change?**

**Table 4: Question 6 – What is your view of the ambition 'Empowering through culture'?**

	Support	Do Not Support	Don't know	Not answered	Total
Organisations:					
Academics, University, Higher Education or Further Education	6				6
Culture (arts, cultural heritage, creative industries) organisation, group or company	39	1	1	5	46
Faith Group	1			1	2
Local Authority or Culture Trust	14	1		1	16
National Collections and Performing Companies	9				9
Public Body	9		1	1	11
Representative or umbrella group	24		3	7	34
Third sector	12	1	1	2	16
Union or political party	4	1		1	6
<b>Total organisations</b>	<b>118</b>	<b>4</b>	<b>6</b>	<b>18</b>	<b>146</b>
<b>% of organisations answering</b>	<b>92%</b>	<b>3%</b>	<b>5%</b>		
Individuals	49	9	7	4	69
Individual (on behalf of a community)	1				1
<b>Total Individuals</b>	<b>50</b>	<b>9</b>	<b>7</b>	<b>4</b>	<b>70</b>
<b>% of individuals answering</b>	<b>76%</b>	<b>14%</b>	<b>11%</b>		
All respondents	168	13	13	22	216
% of all respondents	78%	6%	6%	10%	
<b>% of all those answering</b>	<b>87%</b>	<b>7%</b>	<b>7%*</b>		

\* if figures do not sum to 100% this is due to rounding.

A clear majority of respondents – 87% of those answering the question – supported the 'Empowering through culture' ambition. Organisational respondents were more

likely to support the ambition than individuals (92% of those answering and 76% of those answering respectively).

The analysis below begins with comments made by those who supported the ambition and concludes with an analysis of comments made by those who did not. Issues raised by those who did not answer Question 7, or who did not know at Question 7, tended to raise similar themes to those who supported the ambition.

## **Views of those who supported the ambition**

Many respondents expressed general support for this ambition, including approval for an accessible, inclusive approach, the importance of community-based culture or the emphasis on poorer communities and social justice. It was also suggested that greater emphasis could be placed on the power of culture to break down barriers within and between communities.

However, a number of respondents raised issues with respect to the wording, in terms of both tone and clarity, including that it is vague, and that statements are too general or lack practical details. It was also thought that the ambition is poorly worded and could appear to take a top-down approach. In particular, the phrase 'opening up and extending culture' was suggested as potentially implying that communities do not already engage in cultural activities and as running counter to the inclusive approach to culture which it is trying to promote. Suggestions included making it clear that the proposals would build on existing success or would sustain and extend participation, or that there should be a distinction between culture itself as 'by and for all', while 'opening up' the opportunities offered by the cultural sector.

A number of respondents proposed alternative wording for the ambition including:

- 'opening up and extending perceptions of culture so that it is recognised as for, and of, every community and everyone'.
- 'opening up and extending culture so that is of, and for, every community and individual'.
- 'recognising that culture is for every community and everyone'.
- 'increase opportunities to influence and participate in culture that represents all Scotland's communities'.
- 'expand the idea and practice of cultural activity to be genuinely inclusive for every community and place in our society'.

Several respondents commented on the approach taken in the draft strategy not to define what is meant by 'culture', with suggestions including that it would be helpful to include examples of what culture might mean for different people. Some respondents thought there was a risk of being too vague or too open-ended, allowing both focus and resources to be spread too thinly. In particular, it was argued that care should be taken to ensure that diversification does not affect the sustainability of Scotland's cultural heritage offer, and that 'heritage' should be referenced specifically since many communities are involved in cultural activity through engagement with their local heritage.

It was suggested that the draft strategy could give more of a sense of the range of grassroots cultural activity currently thriving across Scotland, and a number of respondents pointed to current projects they saw as being in line with the ambition or suggested that the draft strategy could complement or build on existing initiatives. Examples of such initiatives included:

- theatre or music groups for those with learning disabilities.
- a poetry group at a local community's art centre.
- archive projects.
- tailored musical activities for people at every stage of life.
- opportunities to develop film-making skills and to engage with UK independent films.

### **Importance of community ownership**

Respondents often agreed with the emphasis placed on communities and place, sometimes expressing a view that grassroots culture is not currently valued. There was also support for the draft strategy's position that local culture is just as important as national culture. The importance of encouraging communities to take ownership of their cultural assets was highlighted, as was the need for more emphasis on listening to what communities want culturally, without making assumptions.

### **Importance of excellence**

*There does not need to be a tension here between excellence/aspiration and access/inclusion.*

(Two Culture organisation, group or company respondents)

While acknowledging the importance of inclusion, a number of respondents suggested that the draft strategy could do more to recognise and support cultural excellence or to strike a balance between 'inclusive culture' and 'quality culture'. It was argued that there is no conflict between pursuit of excellence and the extended view of culture envisaged by the draft strategy.

### **Data collection**

A number of respondents commented on issues associated with collection of data. This included the need to reach a consensus on data sharing between organisations and that full consultation across the sector would need to take place before any changes to how cultural engagement is measured, are introduced. It was also argued that requirements to measure and report on success should be proportionate to the scale of delivery since this can be an onerous task for small organisations. Monitoring and evaluation are discussed further at Question 16.

## Resource issues and the role of volunteers

*Empowering is great, but it still requires financial investment.*

(Individual respondent)

A number of respondents highlighted issues associated with funding, often pointing to the degree to which existing grassroots projects rely on volunteers or referencing the effects of recent cuts in public spending. Comments included:

- that there needs to be financial investment, including in education, where there have been cuts to music lessons and libraries. Loss of capacity, skills, and resources has eroded cultural opportunities.
- that the role of volunteers should be highlighted alongside a recognition of the importance of experienced professionals.
- that although volunteer-run groups are often self-funding there is a need for strategic, developmental support and seed funding initiatives to boost capacity or that without proper resources, there is risk of burn out or disillusionment at grassroots level.

## Comments on the consultation paper

Comments on access, participation and engagement included:

- the draft strategy suggests children living in poverty who engage in cultural activities could become 'the audiences of the future.' Why not the artists, creators and heritage professionals of the future?
- there could be mention of work done by the Scottish Arts and Homelessness Network and by Scottish Prison Arts.

With respect to the communities and geography section of the consultation paper suggestions included:

- the need for recognition that a 'community' may comprise people identifying with a common interest or faith rather than a local area. Deaf communities and British Sign Language users were often referenced, with a particular suggestion that deaf children in mainstream schools may not have opportunities to attend deaf clubs or organisations where they can experience deaf culture.
- particular care is needed to ensure black and minority ethnic groups are involved in the movement to extend the view of culture and develop opportunities to participate in culture.
- that transport is often a limiting issue, especially for school children, and that for a family living on universal credit, fares could represent a significant proportion of income.
- geographical isolation can be overcome by tours from national bodies and organisations, not only performing, but also providing opportunities for young people to attend workshops.

It was also suggested that, in the light of regional variations, it would be useful to define what levels of cultural provision should be available, whether this should be live or could be digital, and the extent to which it could be affected by location or population size.

### **Additions suggested**

Respondents also suggested a diverse range of issues that they felt should be included in this section of the draft strategy. Those cited most frequently were:

- to emphasise the importance of culture within education, where there was suggested to be evidence that the Curriculum for Excellence provides less opportunity for creative and artistic expression within schools.
- to include museums, which hold collections of cultural importance and help to define a sense of community.

Other topics, often raised by only a single respondent, included:

- reference to integration with other strategies such as the anti-poverty, public health and digital inclusion strategies.
- a cultural infrastructure policy to ensure ‘the right spaces in the right places’.
- stronger reflection of the culture of the Highlands and Islands, including crofting lifestyles.
- consideration of the loss of craft making skills.
- consideration of how Scotland’s cultural offering and diversity can be emphasised internationally including through the tourism industry.
- greater emphasis on participation and engagement of older members of society living in poverty.
- greater reference to the role of religion.
- support for opening up and extending the ability for everyone to access a career in heritage.

### **Views of those who did not support the ambition**

The small number of respondents who did not support the ambition referred to the greater importance of basic subsistence issues or suggested that people on low incomes *are* taking part in culture, but not culture that the government funds.

Others raised issues regarding aspects of the scope, tone or wording, reflecting similar themes to those who supported the ambition.

Other comments included that the ambition should read ‘recognising the value of culture in daily life, supporting access, and encouraging exchanges.’

**Question 8: Please provide comments on the aims and actions under this ambition. What do you like, or dislike, or what would you change?**

A number of respondents expressed general support for the aims under this ambition although sometimes added further comment including that:

- the actions are vague or that more specific and measurable actions will be necessary.
- the actions could more obviously flow from the aims.
- it would be helpful to explain integration with other Scottish Government policies in similar areas.

Other respondents noted support for one or more aim, although sometimes disagreement in other instances. Amongst issues raised were that:

- this section is too inward looking or should take a broader view.
- an unintended consequence could be to weaken the base of Scotland's cultural heritage offer, including by reducing numbers attending individual sites or events and by fragmenting funding opportunities.

Suggested additions included:

- that it would be appropriate to include mention of engaging with 'great' art alongside the community driven nature of the aims.
- more emphasis could be placed on how the use of technology can help facilitate the actions and that improved distribution options – for example, broadband provision – should be addressed. It was also argued that technology/digital culture could be represented more strongly, and that social media should be identified specifically rather than digital networks.
- consideration should be given to the languages of all minority groups alongside Gaelic.
- intergenerational aspects of culture could be mentioned.
- international connections should be considered.
- cultural experience and opportunities for participation and learning should be incorporated within the school curriculum.
- the potential power of blurring of the boundaries between different types of culture should be stated.

**Aim 1: Extend the view of culture to include the everyday and emerging, the established and more formal.**

Among comments welcoming Aim 1 were that this resonates in island communities where respect for the continuity of established traditions is evident in many aspects of life and core to defining cultural identity. It was also noted that Scotland has a wealth of migrant cultures that are often overlooked, and it was suggested that this aim places value on cultural diversity. Issues raised with respect to Aim 1 included that it requires better explanation, is too all-inclusive or requires clarity around how quality will be recognised, and success measured.

Other points on Aim 1 included:

- why this is not already happening should be investigated.
- that planning policy could ensure that consideration is given to the cultural importance of grassroots live music venues and that these venues should enjoy recognition as culturally important spaces.
- there should be another action addressing how to foster a greater sense that more formal expressions of culture can be for everyone, to avoid perpetuating an idea that different types of culture are for different types of people.

**Action 1: Promote an inclusive and extended view of culture which recognises and celebrates the value and importance of emerging, everyday and grassroots culture and creativity.**

The emphasis on emerging, every day and grassroots culture and creativity was welcomed by a number of respondents, although it was noted that there is no practical detail on how this would be promoted. It was also suggested it may not be helpful to categorise different types of cultural activity since this may reinforce boundaries rather than promote inclusion. The absence of a role for quality and excellence was also noted, with an argument that excellence does not equate to elitism.

Other suggestions included:

- the action could be modified to end ‘...and creativity in all languages and forms.’
- there will be a need for some sort of selection and prioritisation which should be based on the significance of the cultural assets being considered.
- it would be helpful to reference intangible cultural heritage or living culture.
- the issue of broadcasting and the launch of the new BBC Scotland channel should be included.

**Aim 2: Develop opportunities for people to take part in culture throughout their lives.**

Amongst respondents who expressed support for Aim 2, some gave examples of groups already providing opportunities to participate. The importance of exposure to culture at an early age was often highlighted, with a suggestion that early years policy should be referenced explicitly throughout the draft strategy. Issues raised with respect to Aim 2 included that this could be read as suggesting that there are specific, ‘acceptable’ cultural activities, or that the Scottish Government could be perceived as seeking to use artists in the promotion of its political philosophy.

Other comments on opportunities to take part in culture throughout life included:

- a suggestion that the draft strategy should reflect the growing evidence for the use of social prescribing as an alternative to traditional GP appointments, especially for the elderly.
- reporting benefits realised by providing art in hospitals and in care homes, including for people with dementia.
- an observation of the value of culture to people at the end of life, including in coming to terms with dying and preserving their legacy.

It was also noted that participation may be limited by infrastructure, with a suggestion that the aim should be reworded to read ‘Develop the infrastructure and opportunities to allow people to participate in culture throughout their lives’.

**Action 2: Develop an approach that supports long-term partnerships between cultural and creative organisations, businesses and organisations in Scotland’s most deprived communities, including schools, care homes and organisations working towards achieving social justice.**

Although Action 2 was often welcomed, there was a view that the phrase ‘most deprived communities’ should be amended, including a suggestion it should be changed to ‘most deprived areas’. Other comments with respect to the wording of Action 2 included: a suggestion that people in their own homes and unable to access cultural activities should also be supported; that early years should be included; and that the draft strategy should seek to support access to culture for everyone, from all walks of life.

With specific reference to partnerships, the importance that these should be long term was often highlighted, with a requirement for longer-term funding arrangements than currently available. In addition, the need for an ethical framework to be in place before such partnerships are created was suggested, especially when working in deprived areas. It was also argued that communities should decide with whom they want to work, with a suggestion that local groups should receive funding to commission central cultural organisations.

Suggestions were also made with respect to individual organisations that could be or would like to be involved, and to sectors that the draft strategy could reference as partners including:

- the college sector and community learning and development.
- the science and health engagement sectors.

Local authorities and Integrated Joint Boards were also suggested to have a role to play in forming partnerships, and existing partnerships – such as those involving historic houses – were noted. The importance of business engagement, including strategic development with an awareness of the tourism industry, was also highlighted.

**Aim 3: Recognise each community's own local culture in generating a distinct sense of place, identity and confidence.**

A number of respondents expressed support for Aim 3 including a suggestion that it is one of the most important aims in the draft strategy. It was argued to be very important for communities to feel valued and that one of the ways they can do this is through the culture of a place. As an example, the Heritage Lottery Fund's 'Great Place Scheme' was described as encouraging Scotland's communities to put heritage at the heart of local plans and decision-making.

Among further comments about Aim 3 were that it is inclusive but potentially insular or limiting, rather than opening up broader horizons, or that there is a risk that only the 'cultural elite' within a community will participate. Recognition of the importance of cultural heritage alongside contemporary culture in place-making and destination development was also suggested to be important. While it was suggested that too great a focus is placed on geographic communities, when many communities are not defined by geography, recognition of the challenges arising from geographic inequalities was also welcomed.

Since Scotland is a multi-cultural country, it was argued that the draft strategy should be published in a number of different languages.

**Action 3: Explore ways in which people can have a greater say in shaping the cultural life of their communities including participatory models of decision-making and community ownership.**

Several respondents specifically welcomed Action 3, with comments including that this is innovative or critical to the success of the draft strategy. However, it was also suggested that the wording is vague or could be strengthened, that there is currently insufficient detail, and that the draft strategy needs to convince people that empowering is genuinely about real engagement with communities and enabling self-determination. In particular, it was argued that three years after the Community Empowerment Act 2015 was enacted, there was more that the Scottish Government could now do beyond exploring ways for people to shape their communities. However, it was also suggested that the 2015 Act should not be used as a way for government or local authorities to avoid their responsibilities.

Comments specific to participatory budgeting included that this can be challenging and must not become a burden to communities. It was argued that co-creation/co-production requires local infrastructure and experience and that, while participatory budgeting models may be suitable in areas with a large population including administrators and volunteers, smaller rural communities may lack adequate capacity.

The need to improve the models used was suggested, as was the need to provide enough support and allow sufficient time for what can be a challenging process, and to pilot the proposed approaches. The importance of government continuing to

take responsibility for expanding cultural infrastructure and supporting cultural programmes was also highlighted.

In addition, it was reported that the heritage community has concerns that the consequences may not be fully explained when communities acquire heritage assets. There was an associated suggestion that advice on differences between rural and urban communities in relation to such acquisitions should be provided.

Other points on individuals shaping the cultural life of their communities included that:

- wider access to different arts and cultural experiences will put people in a stronger position to define the kinds of experiences they want to bring to their communities.
- existing structures such as Community Planning Partnerships and arts forums or networks could be involved.
- a relationship between community culture and increased health and wellbeing should be at the forefront of the draft strategy.

As a means of delivering on Actions 2 and 3, a policy of support for cultural centres in communities of all sizes was proposed. While varying according to the context of the specific community, it was suggested such centres would all be accessible, inclusive and supportive of people participating in cultural activity.

## Ambition 3: Sustaining culture

The third ambition set out in the draft strategy focuses on sustaining culture. Specifically, it refers to nurturing culture to grow as a diverse and positive force in society across Scotland.

**Ambition 3: Sustaining and nurturing culture to flourish and to evolve as a diverse, positive force in society, across all of Scotland.**

**Question 9: What is your view of the ambition ‘Sustaining culture’?**  
**Question 10: If you have further comments on the ambition, ‘Sustaining culture’ please provide them below. What do you like, dislike, or what would you change?**

**Table 5: Question 9 – What is your view of the ambition ‘Sustaining culture’?**

	Support	Do not support	Don't know	Not answered	Total
Organisations:					
Academics, University, Higher Education or Further Education	6				6
Culture (arts, cultural heritage, creative industries) organisation, group or company	41	1	1	3	46
Faith Group	1			1	2
Local Authority or Culture Trust	12		1	3	16
National Collections and Performing Companies	9				9
Public Body	9		1	1	11
Representative or umbrella group	26		1	7	34
Third sector	13		1	2	16
Union or political party	4	1		1	6
Total organisations	121	2	5	18	146
<b>% of organisations answering</b>	<b>95%</b>	<b>2%</b>	<b>4%</b>		
Individuals	53	9	3	4	69
Individual (on behalf of a community)	1				1
Total Individuals	54	9	3	4	70
<b>% of individuals answering</b>	<b>82%</b>	<b>14%</b>	<b>5%</b>		
All respondents	175	11	8	22	216
% of all respondents	81%	5%	4%	10%	
<b>% of all those answering</b>	<b>90%</b>	<b>6%</b>	<b>4%*</b>		

\* if figures do not sum to 100% this is due to rounding.

A clear majority of respondents – 90% of those answering the question – supported the ‘Sustaining culture’ ambition. Organisational respondents were more likely to support the ambition than individuals (95% of those answering and 82% of those answering respectively).

The analysis below begins with comments made by those who supported the ambition and concludes with an analysis of comments made by those who did not. Issues raised by those who did not answer Question 9, or who did not know at Question 9 tended to raise similar themes to those who supported the ambition.

## **Views of those who supported the ambition**

Respondents often made a general statement of support for the ambition including welcoming the consultation paper's recognition that ongoing strategic direction and investment are required to support a flourishing cultural sector and cultural life across Scotland. The breadth of the ambition was also welcomed, including because it encompasses evolving forms of cultural practice and participation.

However, it was also suggested that this section of the draft strategy could be bolder, for example by setting out that 'Scotland wants to be world leading and have a thriving economy and that we believe that having a strong culture sector is key to this'. It was also suggested that 'nurturing' should be emphasised over sustaining or that the ambition should be broadened to include products of culture as well as cultural practice.

Others were looking for further detail about how priorities will be set, including around funding. It was also suggested that detailed actions and measurables are needed.

Other comments included that it will be important to draw on past strengths as well as future innovation and development and that there is a great deal of potential learning for the culture sector from outside of its own expertise, and this could be explored further.

One area which it was felt had been given insufficient emphasis was education and it was suggested that:

*To ensure that Scotland's future generations are able to fully realise their creative (and therefore arguably societal) potential they require to have the means to express their creativity and to understand and be inspired by their culture. This will empower them in the future and will primarily happen by exposure to creative practitioners and teachers. This should be a key priority of Scottish Government at all levels in the education sector.*

(Culture organisation, group or company respondent)

Further comments included that exposure to the positive benefits of culture from outside formal education are also vital and should be supported, particularly in programmes for youth.

In addition to funding issues (noted below), it was suggested that Brexit-related challenges need to be covered in more depth in the draft strategy. Examples given included issues related to freedom of movement and the potential loss of current European conventions which safeguard much of our natural heritage. It was also suggested that the draft strategy needs to provide more clarity on EU regulatory competences in respect of Intellectual Property.

## **Economy, funding and support**

With reference to the economy, it was suggested that culture plays an important and pivotal role in attracting visitors to Scotland and that tourism and culture go hand-in-hand. It was suggested that for tourism to flourish, it is important that culture and events receive sufficient funding from both public and private sources for them to be sustainable and vibrant.

Many of the further comments also addressed funding issues, including that supporting the capacity and resilience of the sector will be key and that this will require financial investment.

The increasing competition for limited and often reducing resources was recognised, along with a range of specific challenges including that:

- the culture sector in general is not well paid, and that ‘project culture’, relying heavily on grants from the third sector, results in short-term contracts with little or no job security for many.
- investment in the fabric of buildings, such as museum buildings, has not been carried out and will have long-term consequences.
- there has been an erosion of infrastructure, such as community halls and public transport at local government level.
- Brexit is likely to have a negative impact, including on funding opportunities. It was suggested that the draft strategy needs to provide more clarity in terms of what will happen to funding beyond Creative Europe 2020 and its successor programmes.
- care will need to be taken not to spread funding so thinly that it undermines the delivery of the draft strategy.

In terms of approaches going forward, comments included that although additional funding can be brought in from other sources, such as the private sector, stable Government funding is crucial. It was also suggested that:

- there is a need to maximise the benefits of previous investment in heritage by showing organisations the advantages of focusing on sustainability and resilience.
- funding for organisations that are accepted as important and strategic should be extended to longer than 3 years.
- capital funding will be important.
- public funding has a key role to play in encouraging an entrepreneurial approach from organisations in the sector.

It was also suggested that the draft strategy could mobilise and incentivise the cultural sector to navigate the social investment landscape. Specifically, it was suggested that outline support to develop new business operating models could be offered.

The importance of including social enterprises among key strategy partners was also highlighted.

With reference to working with the private sector or on a more commercial basis, comments included that there is significant potential in boosting commercial aptitude and awareness within the leadership of the cultural and heritage sectors. Failure to do so was perceived by some as carrying a significant opportunity cost in lost self-generated income from commercial activities such as licensing, events, retail and other trading activities.

In terms of support required, comments included that quality business support designed for the cultural sector is needed. A programme of sector-specific support developed and delivered by the sector, for the sector, was proposed.

### **Working together and leadership**

Comments included that there is a general perception that there is not currently enough collaboration to deliver on the proposed ambitions and that there is a need to demonstrate how wider partnerships can be beneficial bringing various sectors together in relation to culture and also heritage.

It was suggested that, in order to develop the conditions and skills for creativity to thrive, and to elevate creative practitioner status, it is vital that the Government and the whole public sector take a lead in best practice, for example, by commissioning Scotland's best designers for public contracts.

A regret was expressed that the draft strategy is silent on the current and future strategic relationship between the Scottish and UK Governments in supporting culture. The need for joint working between these organisations to ensure that, taking account of the balance of reserved and devolved powers, Scotland may access, benefit from and complement UK-wide cultural developments and investments, was suggested.

### **Cultural workforce and developing excellence**

There was support for the draft strategy's focus on skills development and for the recognition of the role of freelancers.

In terms of what is required going forward, comments included that a sector-wide approach is needed for skills development and it needs to be supported with adequate investment. It was also suggested that:

- a comprehensive system of supporting artists and organisations, from when they are first training to when they are considered world class, is needed.
- the needs of freelancers and micro-businesses need to be considered, not least because they make up a substantial part of the cultural sector.
- there should be a more explicit commitment to resourcing skills development across cultural heritage.

There was also support for the focus on digital skills, with further comments including that the development of digital skills will be of central importance to the sector and support will be required.

A public body respondent reported that a very significant number of organisations applying to them for funding lack the skills and capability to make effective use of digital technology for maintaining heritage, for engaging the public with heritage, and for operating in a digital world.

It was seen as essential that the cultural workforce has the appropriate leadership, skills, training, and aptitudes to meet the rapidly changing demands of emerging technologies and it was suggested that alignment with Scotland's overall Digital Strategy for skills and infrastructure is required.

There was also support for the recognition of the contribution volunteers make across the culture sector with a high number of organisations depending on volunteers to make their organisation viable. However, it was reported that volunteering in some areas is in decline and that this reduction – and the potential consequences should this continue – needs to be acknowledged if the sustainability of the sector is to be maintained.

### **Culture and diversity**

It was suggested that fair and inclusive representation is essential to a flourishing Scottish cultural heritage scene, but that the cultural heritage sector suffers from multiple barriers (perceived and actual) to both employment and engagement that need to be addressed.

Further comments included that:

- if our cultural producers are diverse, audiences and participants will also be diverse.
- greater diversity amongst employees in cultural organisations and funders including senior teams, boards and volunteers, will be key.
- given that the language of the cultural sector is almost uniformly English, the encouragement of British Sign Language users to become visible role models would be a positive step for supporting the aspirations of deaf children and for increasing awareness of British Sign Language and deaf culture.

### **International working**

The importance of looking outward was recognised and it was suggested that an international focus has a vital role to play, not just in promoting Scotland's diverse cultural assets, but in enriching and constantly renewing our culture at home through meaningful contact and exchange with cultural policy and best practice from around the world.

Further comments included that the diaspora of Scottish-trained creative practitioners and designers is proof of their internationally-recognised worth but could be argued as illustration of a present failing in the wider Scottish cultural scene and wider economy.

Suggestions included that Scotland's international ambitions could be more clearly articulated in the draft strategy. It was also suggested that there is scope to strengthen the draft strategy in terms of what it says about Scotland's cultural relationship with the wider world, particularly in relation to how Scotland is viewed externally from a cultural point of view; how international flows and influences contribute to culture in Scotland; and how Scotland can learn from the experiences of other nations.

## **Views of those who did not support the ambition**

Those who did not support the ambition suggested:

- the associated actions are not bold enough.
- that culture does not need money to flourish and that by developing the conditions for culture to thrive and linking this to the economy we place restrictions on whose culture is acceptable
- the ambition fails adequately to engage with the built environment as an existing and continuous source of cultural capital.

**Question 11: Please provide comments on the aims and actions under this ambition. What do you like, or dislike, or what would you change?**

In their general comments at Question 11, respondents often made a broad statement of support for the various aims and actions set out. They also made further comments including that it may be necessary to clarify in more detail the proposed roles of various players, such as local authorities, businesses and voluntary organisations, in sustaining the draft strategy.

It was also suggested that timescales and further detail on the aims and actions would be welcome and that the actions do not always obviously flow from the aims. Other comments included that:

- the aims and actions would all benefit from considering the need for audiences as much as practitioners.
- museums form a core part of Scotland's tourist offer and the Scottish Government should work with local authorities across Scotland to do more to enable local museums to make the most of tourism opportunities.
- there is a need for bespoke strategies for rural and small town contexts in order to sustain cultural activities and economies.
- there should be an action relating to Value Added Tax on existing buildings.

Not all respondents supported the aims and actions and it was suggested that Government does not have an active participatory role to play in most of the areas covered under the sustaining culture ambition, other than to provide arm's length funding.

Other comments included that Scotland already has the skills to help culture thrive, and that what is needed is adequate funding and appreciation for those of all ages who contribute to our cultural industries.

**Aim 1: Develop the conditions and skills for culture to thrive, so it is cared for, protected and produced for the enjoyment of all present and future generations.**

Some respondents offered their support for the aim with their further comments including that:

- the conditions and skills start at primary school level for participants and professionals.
- its associated actions should include volunteer-led groups.

It was suggested that the second half of the aim is not clear, including what 'cared for, protected and produced' means in this context. Suggestions as to how the aim should be rephrased included that:

- 'protected' should be replaced with 'safeguarded'.
- 'produced' should be replaced with either 'generated' or 'created'.
- it should emphasise 'experience' as much as 'conditions and skills'.

**Action 1: Explore new funding models to support the culture sector and to develop the creative economy that includes new partnerships and examining the potential of Scottish Government powers such as Scottish National Investment Bank, devolved tax and legislative powers that will generate a collective responsibility to supporting culture in the long-term.**

Many of the further comments at Question 11 focused on exploring new models to support the culture sector. Although there was significant support for the action, there were also calls for more explanation of what new funding models might look like and a query about whether the Scottish Government would take the lead in determining these new funding models.

As at other questions, the need for Government or arm's length funding, was raised. Any suggestion that public cultural institutions will be encouraged to find alternatives to Government funding was seen as worrying, and there was a general call to move away from short-term and piecemeal funding to a more sustainable, strategic and long-term approach. For example:

*A strong and supportive system of funding, from micro grants to multi-year agreements, is at the core of a cultural industry that is able to develop and plan for success while also nurturing emerging generations of artists and arts workers.*

(National Collections and Performing Companies respondent)

It was suggested that sufficient Government funding is critically important for the culture sector to thrive and is a pre-requisite for leveraging investment into culture from other sources. However, it was also acknowledged that there is much more that Government can do to support the sector including:

- encouraging ties to business and ethical philanthropy, placing culture central to the economy, and increasing avenues of self-generated income.
- developing new taxation models to support the failing infrastructures.
- introducing a tourist tax to raise money for heritage attractions.
- exploring new measures which might support and encourage stronger partnerships between businesses and culture.

It was also suggested that the draft strategy should articulate a better understanding of the needs of artists and creative practitioners, recognising their fundamental importance to the sector, in order to invest in, and sustain, their careers.

As at the previous question, it was also noted that Brexit will close doors to European funding, which some believed could create even further constraints within funding models already stretched to breaking point.

In terms of what any new funding models should take into account or be able to support, comments included that they should:

- place greater emphasis on cultural participation and inclusion at the local level and through third sector and grassroots activity.
- recognise the value and continuing future importance of major cultural institutions, as hubs for generating increased investment, thanks to their capacity to leverage additional support for independent artists.
- recognise that many other organisations in Scotland's cultural sector can be equally strong ambassadors internationally and that funding should also be directed towards them accordingly.
- provide centralised funding to support cultural activities among the various small and disparate minority communities.
- recognise the need for appropriate remuneration for creation of artworks and artistic labour of all types.
- include artists and makers and the peripheral infrastructure supporting them, both physical (such as studio space or rehearsal space) and non-physical (such as cultural journalism).
- ensure that deaf culture is able to thrive. At present, funding models are not clear or accessible and funding may be project-specific and thus narrow in its remit, inadvertently excluding deaf culture.
- include capital investment funding models such as land value capture and planning gain instruments as well as entrepreneurial partnerships between

national government, local government, local communities, universities and developers.

- be based on an understanding of which art forms are truly popular rather than following previous funding arrangements.
- be informed by assessments of all likely benefits and disadvantages.

It was suggested that the development of new funding models offer a key opportunity to empower local authorities to help find new solutions. A further suggestion was that funding provides a clear case for the draft strategy benefitting from two different strands – one for grassroots, voluntary sector and the other for the professional creative sector. The very different funding needs and barriers for both were noted and it was suggested that there should be more opportunities for micro funding. The creation of a Cultural Sustainability Fund for rural Scotland was suggested and funds targeting the most deprived communities was also welcomed.

There was specific reference to the plans around the Scottish National Investment Bank, including that an investment fund of this nature would need to come with business support and could follow models used for social ventures. It was also noted that as the majority of the sector is made up of small and medium-sized enterprises, alternatives, such as community bonds, might be a better option for smaller organisations.

In terms of the draft strategy document itself, suggestions included that it would benefit from a more candid acknowledgment of the existing funding landscape or should refer to current funding model developments, such as how funding for culture can be leveraged through City Region Deals or Creative Scotland.

**Action 2: Develop programmes to support skills development, leadership and innovation to prepare for the future including digital.**

Some respondents noted their support for developing programmes to support skills development, leadership and innovation to prepare for the future.

Their further comments included that skills development programmes are vital and that ensuring that Scotland's cultural legacy is both protected and made accessible, is dependent upon developing and maintaining an appropriately skilled workforce. However, it was also noted that skills development should consider the demand side of the equation, not just supply.

With specific reference to the digital element, comments included that it should be embedded throughout the draft strategy. Other comments included that digital skills are a particular issue for the cultural heritage sector, and specifically that the skills required to ensure that digital records and creations are selected, preserved and made available, are very scarce.

In terms of specific suggestions for delivering the action, suggestions included:

- carrying out a skills audit of traditional skills.

- further development of existing work, such as that by the forum for social enterprises to access peer support, share resources and develop effective solutions to shared challenges.
- third sector organisations who work with marginalised groups are an invaluable source of information and support in terms of skills, training and consultancy opportunities.

Respondents sometimes commented on the importance of the early years and school stages, with points raised including that strong links with science, technology, engineering and mathematics subjects and the Curriculum for Excellence are crucial. Specifically, it was suggested that consideration be given to how the Curriculum for Excellence supports young people to make informed choices about studying cultural subjects and how those studies might inform their future career choices, with clear career pathways signposted.

The role of key strategies such as Developing the Young Workforce was also noted.

Respondents also raised notes of caution, including that there are already programmes focused around skills, leadership, innovation and digital and that the market may already be saturated. It was suggested that culture-specific programmes would need to distinguish themselves from other offerings or combine with something that already works.

Not all respondents supported the action, with their further comments including a query as to whether more training opportunities for young people at school are really needed.

**Aim 2: Value, trust and support creative people – for their unique and vital contribution to society and the economy.**

Some respondents noted their support for the aim, with further comments including that:

*...it would be a cultural advance in itself if recognition were finally given to those who make their contribution to Scotland's cultural life entirely outwith the shelter of regular public funding. It is one of the eternal paradoxes of public funding of the arts, that it crowds out the very grassroots community, voluntary and freelance work upon which a thriving national culture – its raison d'être – depends.*

(Culture organisation, group or company respondent)

The particular challenges that some deaf people can experience were noted, including that it can be difficult for prospective deaf tour guides to meet the costs of training programmes. More generally, it was suggested that support could be given to help deaf people develop their professional networking and marketing skills, so they are better able to access wider society. Other suggestions included that:

- resourcing will be required.

- it will be important to develop mechanisms which make use of the contribution of creative people, particularly around contributing to, and working with, the organisations which are local to them.

In terms of the draft strategy itself, suggestions included that it should acknowledge that skills development is strong in some areas, for example within the museums and historic environment sector.

**Action 3: Support the freelance cultural workforce and nurture skills, talent and excellence by exploring ways to improve their economic and social status and adopt a broad and long-term approach to supporting skills development from early years onwards.**

Many respondents noted their agreement with supporting the freelance cultural workforce, nurturing skills and talent and adopting a long-term approach to supporting skills development. Further comments included that the relatively short-term nature of cultural project funding, the prevalence of short-term contracts and the generally low rates of pay can cause particular issues for freelancers. There was also a call for further detail on how the draft strategy could support skills development and a suggestion that the two elements of the action, supporting freelancers and skills development, should be separated out.

In terms of how this action could be taken forward comments included that:

- greater investment in skills development and training is needed.
- the draft strategy should broaden its definition of the workforce to include those who do not directly make or produce work and this group should be supported to develop and nurture their skills.
- the approach should support artists, creatives and practitioners to try things and take risks.
- Scotland should look to models and learning from across the UK and internationally.
- the draft strategy could support the culture sector to explore the opportunities and challenges of digital developments.
- support should begin at school age where it is perceived that the curriculum could better support creative arts learning.
- there should be investment in schools to make the arts of equal importance to science, technology, engineering and mathematics subjects.

Suggestions that related specifically to freelance workers included:

- the cultural leadership post (Action 1 under Transforming culture) could encourage new ways of supporting freelance workers.
- there should be a commitment to revising employment law and making legislative change to support freelance workers. It was noted that many

working in the cultural sector, and most artists, are freelance, suffering all the disadvantages of self-employment with none of the advantages.

- it would be useful to develop a map of key flows of funding across Scotland benefiting different parts of the freelance cultural workforce, such as the programming and production budgets of large-scale institutions.
- strong links exist between the private 'freelance' sector and social enterprises, and supporting long-term sustainability of social enterprises would, in turn, create more opportunities for freelancers to work with social enterprises.

In terms of the draft strategy itself, it was suggested that it could benefit from referencing what already exists. For example, the Curriculum for Excellence, the Developing the Young Workforce programme, Modern and Foundation Apprenticeships, Skills 4.0 and the Creative Learning Partnership.

Suggestions about how Action 3 should be presented or phrased included that:

- it should be more specific, for example by setting out a minimum creative wage for artists and freelancers.
- 'freelance' should be removed and the whole cultural workforce should be supported.
- instead of 'exploring ways to improve their economic and social status' it should read 'improving their economic and social status'.

Other views included that successful artists and crafts people are already highly regarded. It was also suggested that the draft strategy's comments on the practice of freelance work are far too broad, simplistic and applied too expansively.

**Aim 4: Encourage greater openness and diverse cultures to reflect a changing Scotland in the 21<sup>st</sup> century.**

There was support for encouraging greater openness and diverse cultures, with further comments including that Scotland has always been open to people from diverse backgrounds and they are key to our cultural wealth. It was also suggested that openness to difference and inclusion are fast becoming a hallmark of Scotland's reputation internationally and its understanding of itself.

However, there was a query as to what is meant by openness and it was also suggested that the aim should refer to enhancing diversity. More generally, it was suggested that promoting inclusion and diversity could have a greater presence in the draft strategy.

With reference to diversity, it was suggested that the British Film Institute's Diversity Standards offer a valuable framework by which to ensure that all publicly-funded activity in the sector works to advance this agenda.

**Action 4: Increase inclusive opportunities to broaden the backgrounds of those working and volunteering in the culture sectors.**

Some respondents noted their agreement with increasing inclusive opportunities to broaden the backgrounds of those working and volunteering in the culture sectors. Further comments included that progress will demand substantive action and a concerted effort, including in examining structures that are currently excluding people from diverse backgrounds and marginalised groups and reinforcing the *status quo*.

It was proposed that a detailed action plan be developed, with all organisations held to account for its delivery. Further comments included that it is important that Action 4 be tied to explicit, objective targets with a robust understanding of the baseline, rather than just a broad 'increase in inclusive opportunities'.

Other specific actions which respondents identified as necessary included:

- carrying out a robust and detailed exploration of the diversity and pathways of Scotland's creative sector to ensure we can benchmark against data-driven information.
- exploring how to improve the economic conditions of the cultural workforce.
- clarifying how existing equalities and diversity legislation and policies need to improve in order to allow Action 4 to happen.

It was also suggested that actions will need to be tailored to specific groups and sustained to provide a pipeline of support for talented people to enter, develop and progress in the culture sector. Other issues seen as important included:

- ensuring that there are opportunities within local communities for people of all ages to participate in culture and the arts.
- increasing funding for libraries, galleries, and museums in local areas and preserving and sharing our history, the history of the working class, of women, of minorities, of the marginalised and their contribution to our culture.
- as a sector that has traditionally lacked representation from many areas of society, including ethnic minorities and people with lower socio-economic status, Scottish museums have an important role to play in diversifying the cultural workforce.

As at previous questions, the key role that education has to play was noted and there was also a reference to ensuring that deaf culture is promoted, and that people from the deaf community and British Sign Language users are given genuine opportunities to work and participate in culture.

However, there were concerns about the reference to volunteers and that, while recognising the vital role they play, it is important that professional cultural practitioners should not be expected to work for inadequate or no pay. Specifically, it was noted that volunteering is often seen as an opening for young people seeking careers in the arts, but this tends to advantage those from more privileged backgrounds with access to additional sources of income.

Finally, it was suggested that promoting tolerance of expressions of cultural identity is also extremely important and that it might be helpful for the draft strategy to articulate how tolerance of cultural expression may be promoted and encouraged.

**Action 5: Develop a longer-term and more strategic approach to supporting international ambitions and partnerships across the breadth of the culture sector.**

Some respondents noted their agreement with developing a longer-term and more strategic approach to supporting international ambitions and partnerships across the breadth of the culture sector. Further comments included that it is important that Scotland continues to develop links with the rest of the UK, the rest of Europe and the wider world in order to learn from and share with the experiences of other countries.

The impact of budget restraints on this type of internationally-focused working was noted, with a Local Authority or Culture Trust respondent reporting that they have a tradition of bringing European artists and performances to their area, but this has reduced significantly in recent years.

As at previous questions, concerns about the negative impact of Brexit on the cultural sector were raised, and it was suggested that international ambitions and partnership will be key post-Brexit, if the draft strategy is to deliver on its vision of culture as 'open to the wider world'.

Ideas about how the approach could be framed included:

- creating a greater synergy between cultural engagement and broader national aims.
- developing a more strategic approach to supporting international ambitions and partnerships. Specifically, developing a new strategic national approach and resource for helping international opportunities develop to fruition.
- Creative Scotland could take a more collaborative approach to developing international programmes and look at international partnerships within Europe.
- where appropriate, such as for a National Performing Company, touring widely, bringing international artists to Scotland to exchange ideas and also creating international co-productions can all be important.

It was also suggested that culture has an important diplomatic function which should be acknowledged as part of the promotion of foreign policy.

In terms of how international ambitions are presented in the draft strategy, it was suggested that international connectivity should be presented earlier in the draft strategy, should recognise the importance of connectivity within the UK, or should be set out as an ambition rather than an action. It was also suggested that this section of the draft strategy could recognise more clearly that a global outlook is critical, not just for professional and national success, but also for individuals navigating their lives in our increasingly interconnected world.

## Delivering “A Culture Strategy for Scotland”

The final culture strategy will highlight where individuals, communities, and organisations are already working towards the vision, ambition and aims of the draft strategy.

**Question 12: Please provide details of any examples of good work and best practice, from Scotland or internationally, that you think could be included in the final strategy? We are interested in a range of different approaches.**

Many respondents gave an example at Question 12, sometimes noting that they saw the organisations, initiatives or projects they cited as representing good practice or more generally as doing good work.

The examples given were diverse and the amount of supporting information supplied also varied considerably, from only a name or website link through to very extensive detail. Summary information on the suggestions made is set out at Annex 2 to this report.

There was considerable diversity and range in the nature of the examples given. These included local projects or organisations, local and national festivals, wider Scottish-based initiatives (often as an integral part of programmes run by organisations), as well as examples of national and international co-operation and collaboration.

In this context those responsible for national collections, whether of data or artefacts, were keen to highlight their ongoing work in widening access to their records through database development, online cataloguing and digitalisation. They highlighted the importance of this work in widening accessibility to such records to explore and document the wider context within which Scottish culture and cultural activities can be understood and developed by all. This includes widening access for individuals, communities, scholars, educational /research establishments, culture related organisations (both locally and nationally) and for all those involved, directly or indirectly, in potentially creating a robust culture strategy for Scotland and associated delivery programmes and activities.

In terms of specific organisations and projects identified, many of these reflected themes highlighted in the consultation document relating to widening access and working across policy areas. These included, for example, links to:

- education, children and young people.
- health, wellbeing and patient/care groups.
- minority and marginalised groups.
- disadvantaged and lower income communities and individuals.
- culture as a catalyst in successful regeneration.

A number of examples related to the use of digital solutions, skills and applications including the use of 'state of the art' or 'cutting edge' technology and how these can be effective in taking culture to new audiences.

Other examples focused on successful approaches used in the delivery of culture-related services and activities including:

- networking, collaboration and partnerships, including in rural areas or in multi-purpose venues or hubs.
- pooling and sharing of resources.
- providing support, services and skills to artists and the cultural workforce.

A number of specific festivals and events were also mentioned as either examples of good practice or as potential sources from which to learn.

**Question 13: What can you or your organisation do to support the vision, aims, ambitions and actions of the strategy?**

A number of organisations reported that their current work is very much in line with the vision and ambitions set out. Respondents sometimes referred to their own organisation's strategies, policies and actions as embracing key concepts highlighted in the draft strategy such as widening access, working in partnerships, collaborating, and extending and diversifying audiences.

Some respondents referred to existing activities or programmes which they felt were delivering important and relevant work, including in relation to health, education, volunteering and engaging marginalised communities. For example, one respondent commented that:

*We aim to be the vehicle for ensuring marginalised, vulnerable and disadvantaged groups have access to quality, enriching cultural experiences, which give them a voice and the capacity for achieving social, environmental and cultural change.*

(Culture organisation, body or group respondent)

Otherwise the range of activities and wider work very much reflected the diversity reported in answer to Question 12.

Some respondents noted that they would review their approach to ensure it is closely aligned with the final strategy or would be interested in being involved in the rollout of activity from the final strategy, for example by acting as:

*....as an exemplar for the Culture Strategy ambitions, exploring new models of funding, public engagement and data analysis, working across disciplines to deliver innovative and inclusive solutions.*

(Culture organisation, body or group respondent)

A Public Body respondent commented that they are ready and willing to work with the Scottish Government and in partnership with other policy sectors to enshrine

the spirit of this draft strategy in public sector collaboration, to contribute to a detailed action plan and to realise its ambitions.

There was also a call for additional consultation and discussions so that local authorities can shape delivery of the ambitions and better understand the role they will play in realising the draft strategy's vision.

Others also commented on the role that they or others can play in delivering the draft strategy, including as partners, artists, consultants or volunteers. Those highlighting this potential ranged from retired professionals with particular culture-related expertise, through to organisations representing the views and interests of their members to the Scottish Government.

Some respondents offered to be exemplars or ambassadors for the draft strategy's ambitions through their own best practice or by providing case studies for the final strategy. Others saw scope to assist in promoting the final strategy internationally and attracting international cultural input and expertise to Scotland.

Respondents also identified ways in which they or their organisation could support the draft strategy. These included networking and being able to promote or facilitate partnership in culture, for example by:

- building on/feeding into existing national/international partnerships.
- providing contacts – either specialist or local.
- providing advice and support in building culture and community partnerships with non-culture organisations.
- developing new collaborations/collaborative programmes.

There was also specific reference to promoting the draft strategy in other sectors – especially in education and health, but also in policy areas such as regeneration.

Some respondents suggested they could play a role in training and skills development, including promoting diversity and the inclusion of minorities. For example, one respondent commented that they can support the draft strategy:

*...in terms of offering information, advice, training and consultancy on a number of areas such as physical and intellectual access.*

(Third sector respondent)

Others felt they could contribute around widening access and diversifying audiences, often noting this approach is already critical to their work. For example:

*... the infrastructure and expertise we have developed and the ethos with which we operate has provided the basis for establishing models of best practice, which are responsive and adaptable to the existing and emerging needs of Scotland's diverse and differing communities.*

(Culture organisation, group or company respondent)

Other ideas around widening access included:

- sharing items from collections.
- further developing a new national collection of art for display, free of charge, in healthcare settings around Scotland.
- focusing on widening access for rural communities.

A range of respondents offered specific technical skills to support the ongoing development of the draft strategy. The provision of research and information was one such area where the emphasis was on an ability to facilitate collaborative research, bringing together a range of skills and interests. The focus was on working together to improve the evidence base, including undertaking surveys, database development or impact studies on behalf of the Scottish Government and/or culture organisations/projects, where respondents already had experience. Others offered their consultation, mediation and workshop skills.

Other areas where specialist expertise and support were offered focused on:

- funding solutions, such as the development and sharing of successful funding models, including experience in successful crowdfunding.
- setting up new organisations and structures, as well as business and co-production models, which are likely to have wider applicability in the culture business.
- promoting and developing digital applications, skills and technologies in culture including building digital capacity, providing guidance and support, and widening access/extending audience reach.
- festival and event support.

Finally, some respondents made a commitment to continuing to provide awards and grants to support artists and/or cultural development in Scotland, including in new activity areas. There were also commitments to continuing to provide opportunities for internships, residencies, traineeships and apprenticeships.

#### **Question 14: What do you think success for the strategy will look like?**

A wide variety of views were expressed as to what is likely to constitute success for the draft strategy, and what success will look like, with some respondents giving an overall vision of what success would look like for them. Comments often focused on themes around inclusivity and engaged communities, with specific examples set out below:

*The cultural landscape will be more inclusive, creating opportunities for all communities to engage and take advantage of cultural activity.  
Communities will be at the heart of decision making.*

(Third sector respondent)

*Real success ... won't happen quickly but will be seen in successive generations across all of Scotland enjoying a richer, more rewarding personal and communal life, engaged in their communities, confident in their self-expression, and, where relevant, supported to pursue their creative ambitions to the very highest level.*

(Academics, University, Higher Education or Further Education respondent)

Respondents often thought success would be represented by culture having a much higher profile and increased perceived value across all policy areas and levels of government in Scotland – a theme very much reflected in responses to earlier consultation questions. There was particular reference to the importance of the new cultural leadership post role proposed and the support structures around it. The proposal for the post is covered at Question 5.

It was also suggested that success will be measured by how culture is represented across every policy area and that making culture a central part of policy across national and local government is an important aim, but one which needs to be communicated to all key decision makers and influencers. Specifically, it was suggested that organisations need to stop viewing culture as merely an ‘add on’, a ‘desirable’ rather than an ‘essential’, and certainly not as a ‘luxury’ that cannot be afforded.

Education was the policy area most often mentioned, with further comments including that from the earliest age, children should have a real understanding of what cultural experiences are and confidence in their right to access and engage with them. However, there were queries about how easy this representation of success for the draft strategy will be to deliver. For example, one respondent commented that:

*While we know there is a focus on science, technology, engineering and mathematics subjects in schools, what we have seen is a reduction in the focus on arts, culture and creativity. Teachers are pushed for time and do not have the skills, knowledge or interest to pass this on.*

(Cultural organisation, group or company respondent)

Areas highlighted as being key to success included health and wellbeing, and the scope of culture to deliver real and impactful difference to areas of need, such as health and wellbeing and social or rural isolation, was highlighted. It was suggested that the draft strategy should set out a more explicit commitment to fostering cross-sectoral, multi-disciplinary partnership working with a strong commitment to generating more joined-up thinking and working between the health and cultural sectors. It was also suggested that the work of a sports organisation in engaging NHS Trusts from across Scotland to evidence the impact of physical activity on health could offer learning for the culture sector.

For some, only evidence of an end to the perceived elitism of culture among those working in culture, among communities and the public, will be the true indicator of success:

*When 'culture is for the elite' is forgotten and culture is part of everyone's daily life.*

(Individual respondent)

Wider access, irrespective of where someone lives and their socio-economic status, was also seen as being at the heart of a successful national strategy.

For some, existing cultural provision in Scotland is too focused on high-end outputs that are a crucial part of the national cultural offer, and that appeal mostly to visitors and tourists but only to a minority of Scottish residents. There was a call for priorities and activities to be more focused on Scotland's citizens and its diverse communities, including those with disabilities (including British Sign Language users), wider rural representation and specific cultural communities including Gaelic, Scots and Doric and minority populations. Shifting the gender balance of those accessing and attending cultural activities was also mentioned.

For some it is the focus on Glasgow and Edinburgh (and the Central Belt more widely) for cultural events that needs to change:

*Broadening the scope of cultural events beyond Edinburgh, bringing investment to smaller towns and more rural locations, and broadening the cultural offer available in these places to be more inclusive and less exclusively Scotland focused.*

(Individual respondent)

With respect to measuring such key aspects of success, the emphasis was very much on changes in approach and perception. Where specific measures were mentioned this was in terms of mapping cultural provision, monitoring or profiling attendances as well as tracking income from culture.

Moving on from these high-level indicators of success, ensuring that the draft strategy has 'teeth' and accountability was seen as important. The focus of comments was on prioritising and measuring, as well as effective monitoring and evaluation. These themes are covered further at Question 16 but, in summary, it was suggested that progress and success should be identified by:

- the draft strategy having clear prioritised objectives that are specific, measurable, achievable, relevant and time-bound, supported by an action plan that indicates how they will be resourced.
- key indicators of success being specified as part of strategy development.
- key milestones being achieved.
- performance measures being identified, published and reported against.
- forms of measurement being meaningful.

Other examples of success given were:

- an improvement in the perceived value of culture among Scotland's population, beyond government and policy makers.
- increased vibrancy, levels of confidence, creativity, diversity and quality in the culture offer, including the skills of practitioners working in the sector.
- the development of new funding models and a 'shake up' in how funding is awarded.
- a cultural workforce who can make a 'decent' living and who have career opportunities and pathways to progressing in their field.
- Scotland is seen as a world leader in culture development, inclusion and provision, beyond the current Edinburgh Festivals.

Finally, it was noted that no matter what indicators or performance measures were used to gauge success, it must be understood that success will look different in each part of Scotland and will not look the same any two years in a row.

# Monitoring and evaluating the strategy

The consultation paper explains that the Scottish Government wants to establish a Measuring Change Group consisting of key analytical stakeholders, research experts and academics that will be responsible for providing advice on the development of an appropriate approach to monitoring and evaluation of the Culture Strategy. The intention to learn from what works well and to avoid reducing impact evaluation to simplistic target and output indicators is emphasised.

**Question 15: What is your view of the proposed approach to monitoring and evaluating the strategy set out in section 5?**

**Question 16: If you have further comments on the proposed monitoring and evaluation approach, please provide them below.**

**Table 6: Question 15 – What is your view of the proposed approach to monitoring and evaluating the strategy set out in section 5?**

	Support	Do not support	Don't know	Not answered	Total
Organisations:					
Academics, University, Higher Education or Further Education	6				6
Culture (arts, cultural heritage, creative industries) organisation, group or company	24	3	13	6	46
Faith Group			1	1	2
Local Authority or Culture Trust	8		4	4	16
National Collections and Performing Companies	4		5		9
Public Body	7	1	1	2	11
Representative or umbrella group	15		7	12	34
Third sector	7	1	4	4	16
Union or political party	2	2		2	6
Total organisations	73	7	35	31	146
<b>% of organisations answering</b>	<b>63%</b>	<b>6%</b>	<b>30%</b>		
Individuals	38	8	17	6	69
Individual (on behalf of a community)			1		1
Total Individuals	38	8	18	6	70
<b>% of individuals answering</b>	<b>59%</b>	<b>13%</b>	<b>28%</b>		
All respondents	111	15	53	37	216
% of all respondents	51%	7%	25%	17%	
<b>% of all those answering</b>	<b>62%</b>	<b>8%</b>	<b>30%</b>		

\* if figures do not sum to 100% this is due to rounding.

A majority of respondents – 62% of those answering the question – supported the proposed approach to monitoring and evaluating the draft strategy, while 8% did not support the approach and 30% said they did not know. The views of those who

did not support the approach and who left a comment are noted at the end of the analysis below. First, the views of those who supported the approach, those who did not know and those who did not answer are considered together, since in practice there was much overlap.

Respondents sometimes suggested they were unable to judge the proposed approach without further detail. However, the intention to monitor was often welcomed or acknowledged to be necessary, with the proposed approach described as interesting, positive, and pragmatic. The need to improve on current monitoring methods was noted, including suggestions that questions on culture in the Scottish Household Survey should be reviewed. Although it was argued that the draft strategy contains few measurable outcomes, that the process will be difficult, subjective to an extent, and will require a lot of work to develop useful measures, it was also suggested that there is an opportunity to:

- refresh how impact is understood and measured.
- develop metrics which measure the pattern of provision and its change over time across Scotland.
- develop a comprehensive evidence base on the health of culture and cultural participation.

### **Measuring Change Group and stakeholder involvement**

Several respondents welcomed inclusion of the Academic Roundtable<sup>3</sup> as part of the Measuring Change Group or suggested that it will be important to know who the academic members will be. Others noted that they would be interested in knowing who group members are more generally or observed that membership should reflect the diversity of the sector.

Additional suggestions included:

- representation or a subgroup for British Sign Language users. Such representation was suggested to be in line with the British Sign Language National Plan 2017-2023.
- representation for the archives sector, for museums or from across government.
- representation on a rotational basis, so organisations being monitored can feel included.

A small number of respondents noted that they expected to be, or would welcome the opportunity to be, part of the Measuring Change Group as part of the Academic Roundtable<sup>3</sup>, while respondents from a range of respondent types suggested that they would also like to contribute to the process. It was suggested that there should be transparency around appointments, with terms and conditions for membership made available.

---

<sup>3</sup> The Academic Roundtable was a group of academics that was convened to provide advice on evidence and research during the development of the strategy.

The importance of stakeholder involvement was noted by several respondents and the intent to work collaboratively with key partners was welcomed. In particular, it was suggested that communities and grassroots organisations should be involved.

### **Approach to monitoring and evaluation**

Respondents who commented on statements made in the consultation paper with respect to the proposed approach, most frequently:

- welcomed the commitment to ‘avoid reducing impact evaluation to simplistic target and output indicators’, sometimes still expressing a view that monitoring will become a set of targets and a tick box exercise.
- welcomed the intention to focus on ‘longer-term change rather than immediate impacts’. One respondent urged:

*...that the commitment to long-term approaches articulated within this document, are not sacrificed in the desire to demonstrate impact in the short-term.*

(Representative or umbrella group respondent)

Other intentions set out in the consultation paper and noted as positive included:

- ‘avoiding a restrictive evaluation approach that might stifle the independence and creativity of cultural activity’.
- taking a learning-centred approach to monitoring.
- the commitment to work with key partners.
- alignment with the new National Outcome for culture, and indicators on the refreshed National Performance Framework. It was also suggested that alignment to United Nation’s Sustainable Development goals could add further weight.

Respondents also made comments with respect to the types of data they thought should be collected, with the most frequent arguments in favour of a focus on greater use of:

- qualitative (or soft) data.
- longitudinal studies.
- case studies.

It was also seen as important to keep monitoring simple to avoid any additional burden or costs to either delivery bodies or smaller organisations. The need for investment in data collection was suggested, along with ensuring that any new approaches align with those already used in the sector. Other elements suggested to be desirable or important in the system for monitoring and evaluation included:

- guidance and support on collecting and recording data, or a simple tool that grassroots cultural groups can use to demonstrate their impacts.
- regular feedback on progress.

Respondents who did not support the proposed approach sometimes referred to their more general disagreement with the draft strategy or took a view that any monitoring approach would represent additional box ticking. Specific issues raised included that:

- monitoring and evaluation need to be built into the ambitions and actions or should be embedded in creative practice.
- the logic modelling referenced in the consultation paper can be challenging for charities and is not representative of success.

## Other comments

**Question 17: Please use this section to provide any other comments that you wish to share about the strategy.**

Question 17 invited respondents to share any further comments on the draft strategy. Respondents sometimes summarised the points that they had raised at earlier questions or made points that have already been covered in the analysis presented above. The focus of the analysis at Question 17 is on issues that have not been covered elsewhere.

### **Layout, design and structure of the strategy**

A number of respondents raised issues about the draft strategy document itself, including that, although necessarily wide ranging, it is too long and repetitive in places. It was also suggested to be complex and difficult to understand at times, with an associated concern that the appearance and wording may itself be a barrier. Careful consideration as to how the draft strategy can be owned and used by as wide a constituency of stakeholders as possible was suggested.

The importance of inclusive visual design within the finished document was highlighted. Other comments included that:

- graphics and images should be used as much as possible.
- the photography used in the document needs to represent cultural heritage, including museums. Also, there are currently two pictures of ceilidhs on successive pages and one of these should be replaced. A suggestion was to include a photo of Mela or the Chinese New Year.
- the 'Women of the Hill' image on the cover is an amazing photograph but might be off-putting to some sections of the community as it could be perceived as promoting a narrow view of culture as 'high-brow art'. There should be more imagery that speaks to the everyday.

Finally, in terms of the document itself, it was suggested that a summary version with infographics would provide a vital synopsis of the document's context, to provide a quick way-in for community cultural participants and partners outside the cultural sector.

As at previous questions, there were suggestions about other groups or sectors that should be covered in the draft strategy. In particular, the value of playwrights and playwriting in Scotland was highlighted, including that:

*The work of playwrights' cuts across the vision and aims of the draft Strategy – Transforming, Empowering and Sustaining. For example, playwrights work consistently in local communities and environments such as schools, universities, for youth, elderly and community organisations and in prisons.*

(Representative or umbrella group representative)

There was an associated suggestion that playwriting in Scotland should become recognised and supported as a strategic priority, national asset or protected sector.

Other sectors or groups that respondents wished to see covered in the draft strategy included:

- designer makers and the Made in Scotland programme which is of cultural significance.
- civic design as a cultural activity and the contribution that good civic design and effective management of cultural resources makes to well-being.
- listed buildings or conservation areas and the contribution they make to culture in Scotland.
- photography, and in particular the use made by individuals with smart phones. It was suggested that photography is the art form of choice of the 21<sup>st</sup> century and that Government organisations need to address ways in which ideas and concepts can also be expressed through images with associated text, rather than all text and some imagery.
- the broadcast media need to figure more explicitly as they remain part of the general cultural dynamic in some form for most people in Scotland.
- the media, beyond television viewing, such as those using social media and community radio, newspapers or newsletters.
- university museums, as centres of enterprise and experimentation and as making research visible and supporting public understanding of research.

It was also suggested that the draft strategy can challenge the culture around dying, death and bereavement, creating public openness, awareness and acceptance. An opportunity to start to remove some of the fear that surrounds death was highlighted, along with opportunity to change Scottish culture and transform people's lives and deaths.

Other comments at Question 17 included that:

- the draft strategy should refer to UNESCO's 2030 Agenda for Sustainable Development.
- There should be specific mention of the National Creative Learning Network.

# Impact assessments

The consultation paper notes that the draft strategy has been pre-screened as having no or minimal effects on the environment and the relevant information has been submitted to the Consultation Authorities as part of the statutory Strategic Environmental Assessment process. Partial assessments have also been carried out to consider how the draft strategy may impact on equality, the rights and welfare of children, business (including third sector) and regulation.

**Question 18: Do you think the partial Equality Impact Assessment has identified where the strategy might impact on people differently depending on characteristics such as age, disability, gender, race, religion or belief, sexual orientation or gender identity?**

**Question 19: If you have further comments on the Equality Impact Assessment, please provide them below.**

**Table 7: Question 18 – Do you think the partial Equality Impact Assessment has identified where the strategy might impact on people differently depending on characteristics such as age, disability, gender, race, religion or belief, sexual orientation or gender identity?**

	Yes	No	Don't know	Not answered	Total
Organisations:					
Academics, University, Higher Education or Further Education	5		1		6
Culture (arts, cultural heritage, creative industries) organisation, group or company	15	3	17	11	46
Faith Group				2	2
Local Authority or Culture Trust	8	1	3	4	16
National Collections and Performing Companies	2		4	3	9
Public Body	5	1		5	11
Representative or umbrella group	11	1	11	11	34
Third sector	4	1	5	6	16
Union or political party	3		1	2	6
<b>Total organisations</b>	<b>53</b>	<b>7</b>	<b>42</b>	<b>44</b>	<b>146</b>
<b>% of organisations answering</b>	<b>52%</b>	<b>7%</b>	<b>41%</b>		
Individuals	25	5	30	9	69
Individual (on behalf of a community)			1		1
<b>Total Individuals</b>	<b>25</b>	<b>5</b>	<b>31</b>	<b>9</b>	<b>70</b>
<b>% of individuals answering</b>	<b>41%</b>	<b>8%</b>	<b>51%</b>		
All respondents	78	12	73	53	216
<b>% of all respondents</b>	<b>36%</b>	<b>6%</b>	<b>34%</b>	<b>25%</b>	
<b>% of all those answering</b>	<b>48%</b>	<b>7%</b>	<b>45%</b>		

\* if figures do not sum to 100% this is due to rounding.

Opinion was mixed as to whether the partial Equality Impact Assessment has identified where the draft strategy might impact on people differently depending on characteristics such as age, disability, gender, race, religion or belief, sexual orientation or gender identity. The largest proportion of respondents – 48% of those answering the question – thought it had. However, 45% of those answering the question did not know.

Relatively few respondents went on to make a further comment and each of the issues set out below were raised by one or a small number of respondents.

Points made by respondents who thought the partial Equality Impact Assessment had identified where the draft strategy might impact on people differently included that it appears evidence based and fair.

There was a view that throughout the draft strategy, the term ‘diversity’ is used both in relation to ethnic diversity and in relation to overall diversity of cultural output or activity. This was seen as unhelpful and as risking conflating these concepts. It was suggested that the term ‘race equality’ or ‘representation of minority ethnic individuals and communities’ be used instead of diversity in the context of race equality.

Further comments included that it will be important for young people and children to have an input and also that it is very important that efforts are made to open up opportunities for a dialogue so that disabled people, including artists, are actively engaged in discussions. Other suggestions included:

- a Human Rights and Equality Integrated Impact Assessment should be carried out.
- a more detailed Equality Impact Assessment will be required once the draft strategy has been developed further.
- it is important to recognise the different cultures and heritages of children and young people. This is particularly important when, for example, there are only a very small number of children in a school who share the same heritage.
- rural inequalities and the barriers of rural disadvantage to participation are under-recognised.
- the protection of the rights and economic independence of freelance workers and writers could be tied in with the Equality Impact Assessment.
- options from elsewhere which offer interesting models for engaging people, such as those in prison, should be considered.
- the work in progress from Glasgow Women’s Library on equalities could be included in the draft culture strategy as an example of best practice in this area.

Other comments included that it is not clear why the organisations selected to comment on the partial Equality Impact Assessment in advance of the full consultation were chosen. It was noted that these organisations (set out in Annex A

of the Partial Equality Impact Assessment document) do not include any with an interest in dyslexia and this was seen as an omission.

Those who did not know or did not think the partial Equality Impact Assessment has identified where the draft strategy might impact on people differently suggested that insufficient information has been made available to make an assessment. Other comments included that:

- the Equality Impact Assessment refers to analysis of the arts, however this does not cover the breadth of the sectors represented by the draft Culture Strategy.
- the impact upon linguistic minorities, including British Sign Language users, must be noted.
- there is no reference to the Gypsy Traveller community.
- the Lesbian, Gay, Bisexual and Transgender reference should perhaps be to the Lesbian, Gay, Bisexual, Transgender and Queer community.

Other suggested omissions included reference to the lack of equalities awareness in the culture sector and the impact this has. It was also noted that there is no mention of adult and community learning despite this being how most disadvantaged communities will encounter culture and creativity.

Finally, the Equality Impact Assessment's conclusion that there would be no differential impact on protected characteristic groups and that everyone would benefit was questioned. It was suggested that there was not enough detail and that the final Equality Impact Assessment should have sections specific to each protected characteristic group, examine available evidence, highlight evidence gaps, and recommend actions that should be taken to ensure all groups – especially those that are disadvantaged – are able to benefit from the draft strategy.

**Question 20: Do you think the partial Children’s Rights and Welfare Impact Assessment sets out how the proposals presented in the strategy might impact on the rights and welfare of children?**

**Question 21: If you have further comments on the Children’s Rights and Welfare Impact Assessment, please provide them below. For example, what would you add or change?**

**Table 8: Question 20 – Do you think the partial Children’s Rights and Welfare Impact Assessment sets out how the proposals presented in the strategy might impact on the rights and welfare of children?**

	Yes	No	Don’t know	Not answered	Total
Organisations:					
Academics, University, Higher Education or Further Education	5		1		6
Culture (arts, cultural heritage, creative industries) organisation, group or company	11	3	20	12	46
Faith Group				2	2
Local Authority or Culture Trust	8	2	2	4	16
National Collections and Performing Companies	2		4	3	9
Public Body	5		1	5	11
Representative or umbrella group	6		16	12	34
Third sector	4		7	5	16
Union or political party	3		1	2	6
<b>Total organisations</b>	<b>44</b>	<b>5</b>	<b>52</b>	<b>45</b>	<b>146</b>
<b>% of organisations answering</b>	<b>44%</b>	<b>5%</b>	<b>51%</b>		
Individuals	25	4	30	10	69
Individual (on behalf of a community)			1		1
<b>Total Individuals</b>	<b>25</b>	<b>4</b>	<b>31</b>	<b>10</b>	<b>70</b>
<b>% of individuals answering</b>	<b>42%</b>	<b>7%</b>	<b>52%*</b>		
All respondents	69	9	83	55	216
% of all respondents	32%	4%	38%	25%	
<b>% of all those answering</b>	<b>43%</b>	<b>6%</b>	<b>52%</b>		

\* if figures do not sum to 100% this is due to rounding.

Opinion was again mixed as to whether the partial Children’s Rights and Welfare Impact Assessment sets out how the proposals presented in the draft strategy might impact on the rights and welfare of children. A small majority of respondents – 52% of those answering the question – did not know, while 43% of those answering thought it did and 6% of those answering thought it did not.

All of the issues set out below were raised by only one or a small number of respondents.

Comments by those who 'did not know' included that there is very little information about how the draft strategy might actively promote children's rights and welfare, for example through early years cultural provision and cultural activities which support life skills, confidence and wider achievement as well as supporting attainment.

Other comments included that:

- greater consideration of barriers to participation and access to cultural activities – including, equal access for children and young people to education in the arts and culture – would be welcome.
- it is important to consider deaf children whose home circumstances do not readily offer them access to British Sign Language.

It was suggested that there should be a stronger requirement on local authorities to support, deliver and measure culture, including because their support through education and community work is key. It was also suggested that the draft strategy itself requires more explicit acknowledgement of, and reference to, the early years.

Those who thought the assessment does set out how the proposals presented in the draft strategy might impact on the rights and welfare of children sometimes noted that all children should have easy and early access to a range of culture or that access to a range of culture through education, both formal and informal, is a basic right. They also suggested additions to the Assessment, including:

- it should mention deaf children and British Sign Language to make sure that they receive the support required on an equal basis with others.
- the importance of museums for children should be included.

In terms of changes to the draft strategy itself it was suggested that it should refer to the United Nations Convention on the Rights of the Child and include the Safe, Healthy, Achieving, Nurtured, Active, Respected, Responsible and Included indicators in the draft strategy.

It was also noted that there is a lack of data about the impact of culture and creativity on specific groups of children and young people, and that this will need to be addressed by the Measuring Change Group.

Those who did not think the assessment sets out how the proposals presented in the draft strategy might impact on the rights and welfare of children suggested it is lacking in detail, incomplete or inconclusive. Specific elements identified as missing included:

- how the delivery of the draft strategy will impact areas such as the Curriculum for Excellence, the National Improvement Framework and community learning and development.
- clear and detailed actions to support safe cultural activity relating directly to, or in support of, the rights and welfare of children.

It was also suggested that final assessment should draw on all available evidence, such as the 2008 Scottish Government report on Children's Participation in Culture and Sport, in assessing the final strategy's aims and actions.

**Question 22: How do you think this strategy might impact upon people on low incomes, people living in deprived areas, people in material deprivation, people with no / or low wealth and people from different socio-economic backgrounds? Please provide comments below.**

Many respondents identified positive or potentially positive impacts for the groups of people listed, although sometimes noting that their expectation is based on successful implementation of the draft strategy.

Among specific outcomes suggested were:

- greater access to or engagement in cultural activities. This was the most frequently identified outcome.
- greater visibility of the cultures of people in the groups listed.
- a cultural sector that reflects wider society.
- other economic and social benefits.

However, it was also suggested that there may be little or, potentially, no impact at least initially, and that long-term support and engagement will be required to deliver potential benefits. The difficulties in engaging with disadvantaged groups were also noted with a suggestion that change will take a long time. The need for more specific targets or tangible actions and regional priorities to reflect local factors were suggested for the draft strategy.

The difficulties in evaluating such impacts were also suggested, and the need to develop an appropriate evidence base was highlighted.

Amongst the actions identified as necessary for positive impacts to be realised were to:

- listen to the views of the people in these communities and address issues of cultural confidence. This was the most frequently identified action.
- commit to more co-production.
- embed cultural activities in education.
- let people know what is available.
- provide adequate resources and, potentially, reallocate resources within the culture budget or to less affluent areas.
- overcome barriers to participation, including both financial and transport.
- write the draft strategy in an accessible way using imagery rather than too much text.

Greater involvement for local authorities and the voluntary sector was also proposed, with a suggestion that these are under-represented in the draft strategy. Providing opportunities for third sector bodies to be involved in procurement of cultural programmes was suggested to have potential to bring future investment, while it was also argued that funding processes should be modified to make it easier for disadvantaged groups to apply.

Risks identified as having the potential to prevent benefits from being realised included a lack of buy-in from experienced cultural actors and a perceived gap between 'custodians of culture' and the wider population.

Only a small number of respondents argued that the draft strategy might have negative impacts for the groups listed, including by wasting money or taking money from education and health budgets, or by being expected to participate in 'other people's culture'.

**Question 23: Do you think the partial Business and Regulatory Impact Assessment identifies how the proposals presented in the Strategy might impact on businesses, the third (voluntary) sector or have any regulatory impact?**

**Question 24: If you have further comments on the Business and Regulatory Impact Assessment, please provide them below. For example, what would you add or change?**

**Table 9: Question 23 – Do you think the partial Business and Regulatory Impact Assessment identifies how the proposals presented in the Strategy might impact on businesses, the third (voluntary) sector or have any regulatory impact?**

	Yes	No	Don't know	Not answered	Total
Organisations:					
Academics, University, Higher Education or Further Education	5		1		6
Culture (arts, cultural heritage, creative industries) organisation, group or company	9	2	21	14	46
Faith Group				2	2
Local Authority or Culture Trust	7		5	4	16
National Collections and Performing Companies	1		5	3	9
Public Body	4	1	1	5	11
Representative or umbrella group	2		19	13	34
Third sector	3	1	7	5	16
Union or political party	2		2	2	6
<b>Total organisations</b>	<b>33</b>	<b>4</b>	<b>61</b>	<b>48</b>	<b>146</b>
<b>% of organisations answering</b>	<b>34%</b>	<b>4%</b>	<b>62%</b>		
Individuals	21	6	31	11	69
Individual (on behalf of a community)			1		1
<b>Total Individuals</b>	<b>21</b>	<b>6</b>	<b>32</b>	<b>11</b>	<b>70</b>
<b>% of individuals answering</b>	<b>36%</b>	<b>10%</b>	<b>54%</b>		
<b>All respondents</b>	<b>54</b>	<b>10</b>	<b>93</b>	<b>59</b>	<b>216</b>
<b>% of all respondents</b>	<b>25%</b>	<b>5%</b>	<b>43%</b>	<b>27%</b>	
<b>% of all those answering</b>	<b>34%</b>	<b>6%</b>	<b>60%</b>		

\* if figures do not sum to 100% this is due to rounding.

A majority of respondents – 60% of those answering the question – did not know if the partial Business and Regulatory Impact Assessment identifies how the proposals presented in the draft strategy might impact on businesses, the third (voluntary) sector or have any regulatory impact. Of the remaining respondents, 34% of those answering thought it did and the remaining 6% of those answering thought it did not.

Only a small number of respondents went on to make a further comment, with those comments tending to be brief. Each issue set out below was raised by only one respondent.

Comments often focused on the impact the draft strategy will have and included that:

- the greater recognition of the contribution and role of the voluntary sector in cultural provision and opportunities will impact greatly on that sector.
- cultural businesses should benefit from the validation of their contribution to the country, including economically and socially.
- there needs to be a balance between commercial and social value.
- the draft strategy lacks sufficient clear and specific, measurable, achievable, relevant and time-bound detail to determine how it might impact on businesses, the third sector or have any regulatory impact.

A query raised was whether it is appropriate to have a single assessment that covers both the private and third sectors. It was also noted that the majority of care services in Scotland are delivered by the 'independent sector' and it was suggested that reference to the third sector is not sufficiently inclusive.

There was also a comment that the assessment that the draft strategy does not impose any additional burdens or duties on the sector may not be correct if:

- increased reporting and evaluation are expected.
- funding is targeted too much into particular areas of short-term activity rather than recognising the long-term need for maintenance of cultural assets such as museum collections.

It was also suggested that the delivery of the actions and any programmes or initiatives could impact on businesses operating in the cultural sector. For example, that procurement processes are often barriers to successful engagement with small community-based groups and do not recognise the core funding requirements of smaller organisations.

Other issues identified included that:

- addressing the varying needs across businesses and services in different sectors is significantly challenging.
- encouraging enterprise and growth of new business-to-business arrangements would be welcome.
- there is no mention of how the enterprise network, including Scottish Enterprise, might work with cultural and heritage organisations to realise social, economic and environmental impacts.
- there is no recognition of the financial challenges small culture-based businesses face, for example in relation to rent and business rates.

## **In conclusion**

This report has presented a detailed analysis of responses to the Scottish Government's consultation on a draft "A Culture Strategy for Scotland". A broad range of respondents made submissions, often providing detailed further comments. At the closed questions, there were consistently high levels of support for the vision, ambitions and actions set out. Respondents often went on to make suggestions about how the draft strategy could be further developed, sometimes noting their own interest in being involved in both that development process and the delivery of the final "A Culture Strategy for Scotland".

## Annex 1 – Organisations responding to the consultation by type

<b>Academics, University, Higher Education or Further Education</b>
Academics Roundtable
CHEAD
Glasgow Kelvin College
Royal Conservatoire of Scotland
Scottish Graduate School for Arts and Humanities
University of Glasgow
<b>Culture (arts, cultural heritage, creative industries) organisation, group or company</b>
Applied Arts Scotland
Architecture & Design Scotland
Art Fund
Art in Healthcare
Art in Hospital
Arts & Health Network Scotland
Beltane Fire Society
'Burns Scotland' – the nationally recognised Burns collection.
Cockburn Association
Collective response on behalf of the following organisations: National Youth Orchestras of Scotland, National Youth Choir of Scotland, Red Note Ensemble, Live Music Now! Scotland, Hebrides Ensemble, Scottish Ensemble, sound, Dunedin Consort
Cove Park Ltd
Craft Scotland
Crawick Multiverse Trust
Cutting Edge Theatre
Deaf History Scotland
Deveron Projects
Drake Music Scotland
Dunedin Consort
Edinburgh Art Festival
Edinburgh Festival Fringe Society
Edinburgh Printmakers
Fife Contemporary Art & Craft (St Andrews) Ltd
Fun Palaces Scotland and Science Ceilidh

Grieg Society of Scotland
Historic Houses
Impact Arts (Projects) Ltd
Making Music
MG ALBA
Moray: Arts Development Engagement
Morlaggan Rural Settlement Group
National Youth Orchestras of Scotland
Office For The Design Economy
Orchar Fine Art Gallery
Scottish Sculpture Workshop
Scottish Society for the History of Photography
Starcatchers
The Deaf Heritage Collective
The Institute of Conservation (Icon)
The Society of John De Graeme
The Stove Network. Dumfries
Traditional Music & Song Association of Scotland
University of Dundee Museum Services
V&A Dundee
WASPS LTD
Wikimedia UK
With One Voice
<b>Faith Group</b>
Scottish Council of Jewish Communities
The Archdiocese of St Andrews and Edinburgh
<b>Local Authority or Culture Trust</b>
Aberdeen City Council
City of Edinburgh Council
Comhairle nan Eilean Siar
Culture Aberdeen
Falkirk Community Trust – on behalf of Falkirk Council
Glasgow City Council, Historic Glasgow Strategy

Glasgow Life
Leisure & Culture Dundee
Live Borders
North Ayrshire Council
Paisley Partnership Board
Perth and Kinross Council
Renfrewshire Leisure Ltd
Scottish Borders Council
Stirling Council
VOCAL – the national association of culture and leisure managers
<b>National Collections and Performing Companies</b>
National Galleries of Scotland
National Library of Scotland
National Museums Scotland
National Records of Scotland
National Theatre of Scotland
RSNO – Royal Scottish National Orchestra
Scottish Ballet
Scottish Chamber Orchestra
Scottish Opera
<b>Public Body</b>
Bòrd na Gàidhlig
British Council Scotland
Built Environment Forum Scotland
Creative Scotland
Education Scotland
Heritage Lottery Fund
Highlands and Islands Enterprise
Historic Environment Scotland
Scottish Council on Archives
Scottish Library and Information Council
VisitScotland

<b>Representative or umbrella group</b>
Archives and Records Association – Legislation and Standards Working Group
Association for Cultural Enterprises
Association of Public Libraries Scotland
Association of Scotland's Self-Caterers
British Film Institute
Co-operative Development Scotland
Creative Carbon Scotland
Culture Counts
Culture, Heritage and Arts Assembly, Argyll and the Isles
DG Unlimited
Festivals Edinburgh
Glasgow Women's Library
Industrial Museums Scotland
Interface
Literature Alliance Scotland
Museums Association
Museums Galleries Scotland
National Museum Directors' Council
National Youth Arts Advisory Group c/o Young Scot
Outset Scotland
Playwrights' Studio, Scotland; Scottish Society of Playwrights; on behalf of a group of individual playwrights
Royal Society of Arts Fellows' Media, Creative Industries, Culture & Heritage Network
Scottish Borders Cultural Forum
Scottish Contemporary Art Network
Scottish Environment LINK
Society of Authors in Scotland
SURF – Scotland's Regeneration Forum
The Royal Society of Edinburgh
The Work Room
Theatres Trust
Traditional Arts and Culture Scotland

University Museums in Scotland
Voluntary Arts Scotland
Youth Theatre Arts Scotland
<b>Third sector</b>
British Deaf Association (Scotland)
Children in Scotland
Coalition for Racial Equality and Rights
Scotland's Learning Partnership
Tayport / Ferry-Port-On-Craig Community Fund
The National Trust for Scotland
Turning Point Scotland
Voluntary Health Scotland
Advocating Together (Dundee)
Deaf Action
Marie Curie
PAMIS
Scottish Care
Scottish Partnership for Palliative Care
Senscot
Social Enterprise Alliance Midlothian, on behalf of Midlothian Third Sector Interface
<b>Union or Political Party</b>
Equity
Musicians' Union
Prospect Trade Union
Scottish Artists Union
Scottish Family Party
Scottish Trades Union Congress

## Annex 2 – Practice examples provided

### Examples of Organisations

Organisation	Location	Focus
Acme Studios	London	Acme provide affordable homes, studio space, residencies and awards to fine artists.
Adventures in Light	Scotland	Adventures in Light brings together a 3D artist, a filmmaker and a carpenter to create dynamic projected installations for musical and cultural performances. They use the consortium model which involves groups of companies coming together to pool their resources for buying, selling, marketing, sharing facilities or joint bidding for contracts.
Alchemy Film and Arts	Hawick, Scottish Borders	Alchemy Film and Arts take culture to new audiences through digital mediums and also run a Film and Moving Image Festival.
Art in Hospital	Glasgow	Art in Hospital is an artist-led organisation which supports people affected by dementia to develop their creativity through art workshops. They also use art as a stimulus for communication.
Artist Placement Groups	UK	Artist Placement Groups is an artist-run organisation seeking to refocus art outside the gallery, predominantly through attaching an artist in a business or governmental context for a period of time. Their idea of an open brief is interesting.
Ave a Go Gallery	Australia	
Ayrshire Operatic Experience	Ayrshire	Ayrshire Operatic Experience was set up by David Douglas. He partnered with professional opera singers and a community cast to provide peer learning by delivering programmes, such as The Gaelic Opera and Scots Opera, which saw 63 primary school groups participating and experiencing opera for the first time.
Ballet Lorent	Newcastle	Ballet Lorent is a dance theatre company providing access and participation opportunities.
Barrowland Ballet	Glasgow	Barrowland Ballet is a dance theatre company providing access and participation opportunities.
Beyond Borders	Scotland	Beyond Borders Scotland is a not-for profit organisation, dedicated to facilitating dialogue and international cultural exchange.
Bijli	UK	Bijli is a company focused on creating work that encourages diversity across cultures and art forms for Scottish and UK communities, and beyond. It comprises playwright-led companies in the UK and Scotland.
Borders LIVE Touring	Scotland	Borders LIVE Touring works with volunteer promoters, community-based halls and venues to bring high quality, live, professional performances to Scottish Borders communities.
British Film Institute	UK	British Film Institute promotes and preserves filmmaking and television in the United Kingdom. The BFI Film Hub provides people from all backgrounds across Scotland the best possible access to screen culture. Based at Glasgow Film Theatre, the Hub serves as the national leader for BFI's film audience network, which brings together many film organisations across the UK, providing them with funding to exhibit and cultivate audience engagement with UK independent film including in

		areas with low cultural engagement. BFI also supports the charity Into Film who work to integrate film into formal education. They provide teacher training and materials to make the most of film as a teaching resource across a vast range of subjects. BFI also works with Creative Scotland to offer young people in Scotland the opportunity to deepen their relationship with film and develop their skills and employment prospects through the BFI Film Academy. This provides young people aged 16 to 19 years of age the chance to create their own film.
Casco Art Institute	Netherlands	Casco Art Institute is a non-profit public art institution.
Centre For Contemporary Arts (CCA)	Glasgow	Centre For Contemporary Arts is an example of an organisation using open source programming and resourcing.
CHArts	Argyll and the Isles	CHArts is a cross-sector partnership which aims to promote cultural activity in Argyll and the Isles. They use digital networking as a communications tool for collaboration between disciplines.
Children's Parliament	Scotland	Children's Parliament is Scotland's Centre of Excellence for Children's Participation and Engagement.
Community Co-operatives	UK	Community Co-operatives offer a model of providing services to communities or developing community assets. Model allows investment to be raised from individuals who, as owners, are involved in decision-making.
Cooper Gallery	Dundee	Cooper Gallery at the University of Dundee provides a unique space for exhibitions and events and offers a curated programme of four major shows a year, comprising contemporary artists invited from UK and abroad. This is an example of an institution which actively engages with social issues through their exhibitions and event programming.
Creative Arts Business Network	Scottish Borders	Creative Arts Business Network deliver projects that develop skills and leave a skills legacy. Recognised for its dedicated support for the creative arts sector in the Scottish Borders.
Crescent Arts Centre	Belfast	Crescent Arts Centre is an arts venue which stages dance, music, theatre with classes and workshops.
Crossing Borders	Scottish Borders	Crossing Borders brings artists and craft makers from the Scottish Borders together to promote creative talent in the area. They represent painters and printmakers, ceramic and glass artists, sculptors, photographers and woodworkers, artists working creatively in textiles, jewellery, metal and leather work. The website highlights examples of members work and also features the galleries and associates who lend their support.
Cultural Foundations – Social Service of Commerce and Social Service of Industry	Brazil	Cultural Foundations – Social Service of Commerce and Social Service of Industry – are long-standing organisations funded by 1.5% payroll tax on workers in industry and commerce to promote social welfare, community development, quality of life and cultural development. Interventions include connecting grassroots cultural movements to wider national and international artists and practice.
Deveron Arts	Huntly, Scotland	Deveron Arts is an example of an organisation which highlights how cultural work can be presented within smaller communities and which is driven by a sense of community-building.
DG Unlimited	Dumfries and	DG Unlimited is the umbrella organisation that represents Dumfries and Galloway's creative sector.

	Galloway	It is an example of an organisation which places dialogue with the region's cultural sector at the heart of its approach to arts development and plays a leadership role in championing and advocating the region's cultural sector.
Digital Preservation Coalition	UK	Digital Preservation Coalition aims to ensure that the UK's digital memory is maintained. It is funded by annual subscriptions from members. It has also taken part in several EU projects in the past.
Drake Music	Scotland	Drake Music develops opportunities for a wide cross-section of disabled people at all levels of music making, allowing access and celebrating ability.
Dumfries House	Dumfries	Dumfries House is a historic house of outstanding architectural and historical interest complete with Chippendale furniture collection and the work of eminent cabinetmakers. This includes a 2000-acre estate which is open 365 days a year with free entry and parking. The Prince's Foundation is undertaking a major restoration project which is now focused on the estate and the community. It is a driver of wider heritage-led regeneration in the area and is the hub for a range of educational /training programmes.
Dundee Heritage Trust	Dundee	Dundee Heritage Trust has run a number of cross-generational memory exchange projects in collaboration with professional facilitators using images and handling collections as the basis of sharing memories of Dundee.
Dundee Rep Theatre Engage	Dundee	Dundee Rep Theatre Engage provide a range of cultural events which are welcoming and accessible.
Eastgate Theatre	Peebles	Eastgate Theatre offers a wide variety of festivals, community engagement and education activities.
Edinburgh's Netherbow	Edinburgh	Edinburgh's Netherbow uses the consortium model which involves groups of companies coming together to pool their resources for buying, selling, marketing, sharing facilities or joint bidding for contracts.
Emergents	Highlands & Islands	Emergents was a craft, fashion, textile and literature support organisation in the Highlands & Islands until recently.
Fire Exit	UK and Scotland	Fire Exit comprises playwright-led companies in the UK and Scotland.
Fun Palaces	UK	Fun Palaces champion diverse everyday culture in communities. They are part of a UK-wide campaign for cultural democracy which is lead by Voluntary Arts Scotland in Scotland. They are working to empower communities to make culture, using a combination of arts, craft, science, technology, digital, heritage and sports activities available to all ages in a bid to inspire community-led transformation.
Glasgow Connected Arts Network	Glasgow	Glasgow Connected Arts Network offers support and networking services for creative artists.
Gallery of Modern Art	Glasgow	Gallery of Modern Art actively engages with social issues through exhibitions and events.
Indepen-dance	Glasgow	Indepen-dance is an inclusive dance ensemble, with a fast-growing reputation for innovative and high quality touring productions.
Inform Theatre	Dundee	Inform Theatre is a youth theatre for people with learning disabilities linked to education and training. It is an off-shoot of the Illuminate Ensemble at the Dundee Rep.

Institute of Conservation (Icon)	Scotland	Institute of Conservation provide support, advocacy, excellence and engagement. Current work strands include supporting skills development, education and training, promoting sustainable career paths into conservation, developing standards for apprenticeships and extending opportunities for engagement at entry level, carrying out research on the conservation workforce to support capacity-building, working in partnership with the Restoration Trust to develop a project that engages people with mental health issues in the practice of conservation. The Institute of Conservation's Scotland Group represents conservators, heritage scientists and preservation specialists working in Scotland. Icon Scotland Group already supports the delivery of Our Place in Time.
Inventory for Living Culture or Intangible Cultural Heritage	Scotland	Inventory for Living Culture or Intangible Cultural Heritage take an inclusive approach which involves migrant communities. Scotland's approach is regarded as best practice by other nations.
Kettle of fish		Kettle of fish uses the consortium model which involves groups of companies coming together to pool their resources for buying, selling, marketing, sharing facilities or joint bidding for contracts.
Livity	London	Livity is a youth marketing agency working in culture and with business. Young people from Brixton work on advertising campaigns for brands such as Google and Barclays, develop skills and confidence and become more employable.
Local Voices	Scotland	Local Voices seeks to help communities across Scotland identify, collect and engage with their local heritage. They aim to celebrate the traditions and diversity of local communities in the global age, taking in language, song, story, music and memory.
Luminate	Scotland	Luminate, Scotland's creative ageing organisation, celebrates creativity at all ages and enhances the cultural contribution and engagement of Scotland's older people across Scotland.
LUX Scotland	Scotland	LUX Scotland aims to create a collection of Scottish moving image, sourcing that work from Alchemy Film Moving Image Festival, Modern Edinburgh Film School, Glasgow Film Festival and The Margaret Tait Award.
Maggie's Centres	Scotland	Maggie's Centres offer a programme of support which includes creative writing, expressive art and gardening therapy.
Marie Curie Hospices	Glasgow and Edinburgh	Marie Curie Hospices Day Therapies Units offer a range of activities including art and music. Staff work with patients using activities to promote quality of life such as music sessions, photography, textiles and movie sessions. They have a grand piano for use by patients and staff. They also involve local schools in creative and cultural activities, including an art competition to rename wards, creating decorations for the hospice and in storytelling and memory work. The Marie Curie Nursing Service is also delivered in people's homes.
McDougalls Theatre Company	Scotland	McDougalls Theatre Company is a touring theatre company which produces engaging theatre for children and families using magic and music.
McManus Galleries	Dundee	McManus Galleries house a museum and art gallery which offer a collection of fine and decorative art as well as a natural history collection. They provide a range of cultural activities which are welcoming and accessible.
Mount Stuart Trust	Isle of Bute	Mount Stuart Trust offers the public the opportunity to enjoy Mount Stuart house and its gardens

		and surrounding grounds and to benefit from its collections and archives.
Music Co-OPERative Scotland	Scotland	Music Co-OPERative Scotland uses the consortium model which involves groups of companies coming together to pool their resources for buying, selling, marketing, sharing facilities or joint bidding for contracts.
Music in Health and Care	UK	Music in Health and Care brings live music to thousands of people in care settings across the UK.
Mustarinda	Finland	Mustarinda Association aims to preserve the diversity of nature and culture by bringing together artists, scientists, and people from various public and private organizations for discussions, seminars, exhibitions, residencies, and happenings. Their goal is to create an environment for new ways of thinking and cooperating. They offer residency rooms for artists, writers and researchers.
National Galleries of Scotland	Scotland	National Galleries of Scotland offers various projects/programmes including the Gallery Social (dementia programme), community sessions (family programme) and outreach programmes (past and present including prison project 'Mirrors').
National Museums of Scotland	Scotland	National Museums of Scotland runs Maths Week Scotland, a 3-year national programme of maths engagement activity funded by the Scottish Government's Directorate for Learning, which shows cross-departmental funding in action.
National Trust for Scotland	Scotland	National Trust for Scotland uses outdoor learning to increase understanding, appreciation and sustainable management of Scotland's heritage in partnership with the Scottish Government and Scottish Natural Heritage.
NESTA	UK	Nesta is an innovation foundation which acts through a combination of practical programmes, investment, policy and research, and the formation of partnerships to promote innovation across a broad range of sectors.
North Edinburgh Arts	Edinburgh	North Edinburgh Arts offers local residents a place to relax, explore, learn, meet, share, volunteer and enjoy.
Northlight Arts	Dunbar	Northlight Arts is an artist-led organisation delivering innovative public arts projects and educational initiatives locally.
Northlight Heritage	Glasgow	Northlight Heritage is an independent charity which investigates the past for the benefit of present communities and future generations.
P4P	Scotland	P4P supports the third sector to access public procurement and other contracting opportunities. They provide tailored one-to-one support including identifying potential procurement opportunities, developing a 'bid library', training and support and advice on areas such as tender writing, European Single Procurement documents, reviewing submissions and gathering feedback.
PAMIS	Scotland	PAMIS provides support for people with profound and multiple learning disabilities, including supporting individuals and groups to participate in cultural activities.
Peoples Parish	Scotland	Peoples Parish is an initiative of the Traditional Arts and Culture Scotland which seeks to inspire and support creative neighbourhood projects in each of Scotland's 871 civil parishes, connecting local stories, traditions and cultural memory with the distinct local voices, culture and creativity of these places today.

Pink Lane Jazz Co-op	Newcastle	Pink Lane Jazz Co-op is a cultural venue which issues community shares.
Plantation Productions	Govan	Plantation Productions is an arts and media charity which seeks to improve wellbeing for people through creative participation.
Platform	Glasgow	Platform is an arts centre in Easterhouse which offers a year-round programme of cutting-edge theatre, exhibitions, workshops, gigs and participation opportunities. The work of this organisation shows how cultural work can be presented within smaller communities driven by a sense of community-building.
Playlist For Life	UK	Playlist For Life is a UK music and dementia charity which uses the music of a person's life to keep them connected to themselves and their loved ones throughout their dementia journey.
Project Ability	Glasgow	Project Ability provide workshops and artist development activities.
Renfrewshire Leisure Heritage Services	Renfrewshire	Renfrewshire Leisure Heritage Services supports a Creative Therapies Worker who works with young vulnerable people using museum collections to break down barriers and build relationships. Also runs twice-monthly Reminiscence Session making use of the extensive photographic and document archive managed by Renfrewshire Leisure.
Rig Arts	Greenock	Rig Arts is a socially engaged arts and film charity.
River Culture		
Rockfield Centre		The Rockfield Centre delivers projects which include youth, volunteers and the community.
Romano Lav	Glasgow	Romano Lav promotes equality for the Roma people in Scotland.
Scottish Artists Union	Scotland	Scottish Artists Union is currently using funding from the Scottish Government, through the Scottish Trade Unions Congress Learning programme, to create a learning programme which addresses needs of artists and makers.
Scone Palace	Perth	Scone Palace is used as a music venue.
Scottish Dance Theatre	Dundee	Scottish Dance Theatre is a contemporary dance company based at Dundee Repertory Theatre in Dundee, Scotland
Scottish Opera	National	Scottish Opera run Dementia Friendly opera productions in the form of participatory creative group workshops for people living with dementia, intergenerational programmes involving nursery and primary aged children and residents of care homes.
Scottish Society for the History of Photography	Scotland	Scottish Society for the History of Photography offers the international journal, Studies in Photography, to the public. It also supports the Higher Photography program and is seeking to create a digital platform to offer as a resource to schools.
Screen Argyll	Argyll	Screen Argyll delivers projects which include youth, volunteers and the community.
Screen Facilities Scotland	Scotland	Screen Facilities Scotland is a trade body, cooperative consortium, and member organisation affiliated to the UK Screen Association representing facilities and services companies working in the screen and media industries in Scotland. This organisation uses the consortium model which involves groups of companies coming together to pool their resources for buying, selling, marketing, sharing facilities or joint bidding for contracts.
Shetland Amenity Trust	Shetland	Shetland Amenity Trust seeks to preserve and protect the architectural heritage of Shetland and it

		owns and operates many historical buildings and runs interesting projects.
Shetland Arts	Shetland	Shetland Arts is empowering Shetland people to value their culture. It offers access to courses for a small number of participants using new tools for delivery.
Shetland Arts Development Agency	Shetland	Shetland Arts Development Agency seeks to encourage and assist in promoting and advancing the creation, practice and presentation and study of all forms of art – visual, performing and creative – and is delivering exciting projects.
Shetland Forwards	Shetland	Shetland Forwards promotes and celebrates the Shetland dialect. This unique dialect, with both Nordic and Scottish roots, is a valued and essential element of Shetland's distinctive heritage and culture. They offer good quality resources and provision and support for volunteering.
Shetland Museum and Archive	Shetland	Shetland Museum and Archive provides Shetland's rich heritage and culture and a conservation service which preserves this rich history.
Solar Bear	Glasgow	Solar Bear is a theatre company which offers access and engages widely with other organisations.
Starcatchers	Scotland	Starcatchers is a national arts and early years organisation promoting cultural empowerment and changing lives.
Stove Network	Dumfries and Galloway	Stove Network is a regional alliance of rural communities which operate as a 'Chamber of the Arts' offering artists and creators a say. They manage access for funding based on local communities' priorities for cultural support and advancement and also as a catalyst in town centre regeneration.
Taigh Chearsabhagh	Isle of North Uist Outer Hebrides	Taigh Chearsabhagh is a museum and arts centre for visitors and the local community.
Tamarack Institute	Canada	Tamarack Institute provides research and ideas on community and cultural change.
Tarbert Castle	Tarbert	Tarbert Castle delivers projects which include youth, volunteers and the community.
The Work Room	Glasgow	The Work Room is an artist-led organisation supporting the freelance cultural workforce.
Timespan	Helmsdale, Sutherland	Timespan is a cultural institution offering a wide variety of activities including access to archives.
Traditional Arts and Culture Scotland	Scotland	Traditional Arts and Culture Scotland connects creative arts and community heritage, locally, nationally and internationally.
Tramway visual arts	Glasgow	Tramway visual arts offers programming expertise especially in international partnerships such as with China over a sustained period of time.
Transport Museum	Glasgow	Transport Museum makes connections with the community and schools, gives volunteers hands-on experience to restore vehicles as well as producing street art and murals around the city.
Travelling Gallery		Travelling Gallery brings contemporary art to communities throughout Scotland. Its dual focus is to create highly engaging exhibitions and to provide a unique platform for arts education. This is a great example of making art inclusive and accessible for all.
University of Highlands and Islands	Highlands & Islands	University of Highlands and Islands provides access to courses for small numbers through innovative delivery.
UK Research and Innovation group (formerly Research	UK	UK Research and Innovation is a new body which works in partnership with universities, research organisations, businesses, charities, and government to create the best possible environment for

Council UK)		research and innovation to flourish. They aim to maximise the contribution of each of their component parts, working individually and collectively. They work with their many partners to benefit everyone through knowledge, talent and ideas. This is a good example of a model with co-funded effort within specific topic areas.
Unlimited Theatre	UK	Unlimited Theatre comprises playwright-led companies in the UK.
Village Pub Theatre	UK	Village Pub Theatre brings theatre to pubs.
W.A.G.E	USA	W.A.G.E aim "...to establish sustainable economic relationships between artists and the institutions that contract our labour, and to introduce mechanisms for self-regulation into the art field that collectively bring about a more equitable distribution of its economy. "
WASPS	Scotland	WASPS is a financially self-sufficient cultural organisation, charity and social enterprise, that provides initiatives and mentors other cultural organisations.
Willows Centre		
Witsherface	Glasgow	Witsherface is a female-led comedy production company which works with women in working class communities through playwriting and comedy.
Workers Theatre	Scotland	Workers Theatre is a new project which aims to create a co-operatively owned and managed theatre in Scotland.
World Federation of Deaf Culture	International	World Federation of Deaf Culture champions deaf people's rights including the right to access to sign language from the earliest possible age.
Youth Theatre Arts Scotland	Scotland	Youth Theatre Arts Scotland is a national support and development organisation for Scotland's youth theatre sector.

## Examples of Culture Projects

Project	Location	Focus
Belfast Music Trail	Belfast	Belfast Music Trail provide access to culture, important cultural spaces and regular work for musicians, particularly traditional musicians who work in rural areas.
Block Partys	USA	Block Partys is a project that develops lasting skills.
Borders Heritage Festival	Scottish Borders	Borders Heritage Festival is a project that develops lasting skills.
Borders Youth Music	Scottish Borders	Borders Youth Music is a project that develops lasting skills.
Cashback for Creativity		Cashback for Creativity is a project that develops lasting skills.
Celtic Connections		Celtic Connections is a project that develops lasting skills.
Citizens' Theatre's community company and Learn Department	Glasgow	Citizens' Theatre's community company and Learn Department is a key part of the principal producing theatre in the west of Scotland which offers access to a wide range of people including people with learning disabilities, deaf people and young people to participate in the arts.
Crawick Multiverse	Dumfries & Galloway	Crawick Multiverse is a major land restoration and art project using landscape art to transform an open cast coal mine into an accessible space for collaborations between arts, culture, heritage and science. It delivers community empowerment and engagement and ideas exchange at a national and international level.
CREATE Renfrewshire	Renfrewshire	CREATE Renfrewshire involves young people in various creative arts.
Creative Learning Network	Scotland	Creative Learning Network encourages collaborative working across the education, culture and communities sectors and brings together those with an interest in children and young people's creative learning at the local authority level, working with Creative Scotland and Education Scotland. The network seeks to build young people's confidence, achievements and skills for future life and work.
Cultural Impact Study	Aberdeen	Cultural Impact Study by Aberdeen City Council used EKOSGEN who developed a toolkit which can be used by funded organisations to record data as part of their evaluation process. This information allows the Council and partners to better understand the cultural value of the work being undertaken in the city, enabling more constructive conversations and aiding future planning.
Culture Themed Towns	Wigtown & Kirkcudbright	Culture Themed Towns offer a platform for community and businesses to come together for the benefit of local residents and to appeal to tourists and visitors with an interest in creativity.
Cultured Mongrel (Emma Jane Park)	Dumfries & Galloway	Cultured Mongrel (Emma Jane Park) is a freelance artist with experience in dance, theatre, links with mental health and bringing performance into people's homes.
CUPIDO project	North Sea Region	CUPIDO project aims to develop new business opportunities in the cultural and cultural heritage sector around the North Sea, to reinforce the economic position, competitiveness and social cohesion

		of local rural communities in areas with a declining population.
Dance Base	Edinburgh	Dance Base offers projects that develop lasting skills. They pioneered Dance for Parkinson's programmes.
Dare to Dream	Dundee	Dare to Dream involves four young women with profound and multiple learning disabilities educated the wider public and highlighted the need for lifelong learning opportunities. They told their story through theatre and dance and highlighted the barriers to their dreams.
Deveron Projects – Huntly Cultural Health Worker	Huntly	Deveron's project – Huntly Cultural Health Worker – is an example of a project that develops lasting skills.
Deveron Projects & Aberdeenshire Council – Syrian Resettlement Team	Aberdeenshire	Deveron's projects with Aberdeenshire Council – Syrian Resettlement Team – is an example of a project that develops lasting skills.
Dogstar Theatre Company	Scotland & Internationally	Dogstar Theatre Company is a touring theatre company presenting new plays across a wide range of communities in Scotland and internationally. This provides opportunities for Scottish-based writers and artists.
Dunoon Burgh Halls Trust	Dunoon	Dunoon Burgh Halls Trust is a community arts project focused on raising local ambitions and aspirations. It includes a gallery, a theatre, a café and a community space. It supports local artists and provides creative expertise and opportunities.
Developing the Young Workforce – Employability	Scotland	Developing the Young Workforce – Employability is a network of 21 industry-led Regional Groups which have been established across Scotland to ensure that all of Scotland's young people are fully and fairly supported into employment by bridging the gap between education and employers. The groups aim to encourage and support employers to engage directly with schools and colleges and challenge and support employers to recruit more young people into their workforce.
Edinburgh International Festival Schools Partnership Project	Edinburgh	Edinburgh International Festival Schools Partnership Project is a three-year schools partnership model piloted at Castlebrae Community High School.
Falkirk FC – A Fan's View exhibition	Callendar House	Falkirk FC – A Fan's View exhibition at Callendar House in 2018 is an example of good practice in museum and public engagement practice supporting a local interest group and widening the audience base.
Five Minute Theatre	National Theatre of Scotland	Five Minute Theatre offers five minute pieces of theatre from anyone anywhere in the world.
Forth Valley Social Enterprise – Stirling Highland Games Project	Stirling	Forth Valley Social Enterprise – Stirling Highland Games Project is a vibrant cultural social enterprise which offers volunteering and employability opportunities.
Get It Loud In Libraries	Scotland	Get It Loud In Libraries widens the cultural activities offered in libraries by introducing digital storytelling, live music performances and skills development programme for young people aged 14-25

		years in all participating areas.
Glasgow Women's Library	Glasgow	Glasgow Women's Library supports and represents others in their cultural output.
Green Tease	Hawick	Green Tease is an informal events programme connecting cultural practices and environmental sustainability across Scotland.
Growing Old Competitively exhibition	Falkirk	Growing Old Competitively exhibition by photographer Alex Rotas at Callendar House challenges stereotypes about ageing by showing photographs of older people in sport ranging from elite athletes to members of the community simply keeping fit and active.
Hands up for Trad	Scotland	Hands up for Trad is the home of Scottish traditional music. This project develops skills and leaves a lasting legacy.
Hawick film and video club	Hawick	Hawick film and video club develops lasting skills.
Healthy Minds	Aberdeen	Healthy Minds is a joint project between Aberdeen City Council and National Health Service Grampian for people recovering from a mental health condition which offers sport, creative writing, art, craft and music.
Hebrides Ensemble	Hebrides	Hebrides Ensemble stream live concerts from Perth Concert Hall to remote communities in Gairloch and South Uist.
Helix Park/The Kelpies	Falkirk	Helix Park/The Kelpies is an example of where the council made the space available and people in their tens of thousands use that space.
Historic Environment Scotland's British Sign Language Days at Edinburgh Castle	Edinburgh	Historic Environment Scotland's British Sign Language Days at Edinburgh Castle involve a historian who is a deaf British Sign Language User who was commissioned to develop tours in British Sign Language drawing on information relevant to the deaf community, with deaf cultural material incorporated, social space provided and communication support / interpreters on hand. Each British Sign Language Day has been popular, with attendees reporting an unprecedented level of engagement with the heritage sector and pride at seeing deaf culture and British Sign Language recognised as a part of Scotland's cultural heritage.
Imaginate and National Museums of Scotland Edinburgh Children's Festival	Edinburgh	Imaginate and National Museums of Scotland Edinburgh Children's Festival provided seed funding for the creation of work.
Impact Arts Craft Café	Edinburgh	Impact Arts Craft Café offers a café for care home residents and summer residency programme at the National Museum Scotland for 16-19 year olds based on creative workshops.
Inclusive Learning Journey	Dundee	Inclusive Learning Journey is a project designed by the University of Dundee's students, using multi-sensory stories developed by children in mainstream schools. This project raises awareness in schools and communities as well as providing a resource suitable for engaging people with profound and multiple learning disabilities when they visit venues in their local community.
Information and Culture Team	Ayrshire	Information and Culture Team is a partnership where Primary 6 students from St Peter's Primary School in Saltcoats performed their own Gaelic tales and legends in story and songs in the

		refurbished Saltcoats Town Hall.
Inspiration Point		Inspiration Point is a web-based site of resources for young people wishing to develop their creative practice.
Jigsaw of Homelessness Support	Manchester	Jigsaw of Homelessness Support is a project which adopts a 'whole-society' approach to tackling homelessness including the arts.
Jupiter Artland	West Lothian	Jupiter Artland is a contemporary sculpture park and art gallery which provides free access learning programmes for schools and community groups as well as classes and events which require payment.
Limestreet Complex	Liverpool	Limestreet Complex is a project in which students from college teach elderly people art skills.
Living Voices project	Scotland	Living Voices project is a national programme developed by the Scottish Poetry Library and the Scottish Storytelling Centre offering older people activities that use a mix of story, song and poetry to prompt conversation, reminiscence and creative response, supporting wellbeing, social connection and staff development.
Localities Bid Fund	Scottish Borders	Localities Bid Fund is aligned to the themes of the Scottish Borders Community Planning Partnership's Community Plan and the Council's Corporate Plan. This project develops lasting skills for participants.
My Time	Scotland	My Time is an inspiring project partnership between the Scottish Poetry Library and Voluntary Arts Scotland.
National Centre for Children's Literature	Dumfries	National Centre for Children's Literature is based in the childhood home of JM Barrie which is currently undergoing major refurbishment to provide a new national centre for children's literature in Scotland.
National Galleries of Scotland Outreach Team and Works+ (The Bear that Cares)	Scotland	National Galleries of Scotland Outreach Team and Works+ (The Bear that Cares) is a project that develops lasting skills.
Neu Reekie!	Edinburgh	Neu Reekie! is a project which brings together spoken word, music, animation and film in an inventive and inclusive way.
New Found Sound as part of the Hippodrome Silent Film Festival (Hippfest)	Hippodrome Silent Film Festival	New Found Sound as part of the Hippodrome Silent Film Festival (Hippfest) took place during Scotland's first Festival celebrating silent film and live music. Pupils worked with professional arts practitioners to create content for the festival.
New Scots	St Mungo Museum of Religious Life and Art	New Scots is a permanent exhibition telling the stories of former refugees and asylum seekers living in Glasgow. It explores issues of cultural identities and the concept of 'home' through objects that former refugees and people within the asylum process have donated to, or chosen from, Glasgow Museums Collections, and an accompanying film.
Northern Voices Community Projects	Tyneside, North East England	Northern Voices Community Projects aims to offer a platform for the views and experiences of those people living in the North East of England who are normally denied a voice and contributes to the culture of the region through a projects, publishing and events programme which celebrates its

		diverse communities. Recent projects have involved a commemoration of the Hartley Pit Disaster of 1862, a touring show in Northumbrian churches and, performing poetry on the beaches.
Paisley's UK City of Culture	Paisley	Paisley's UK City of Culture is an example of community-owned and driven buy-in to the transformation of a place through culture.
Peerie Makers	Shetland	Peerie Makers is a project which seeks to pass on traditional cultural skills to young people.
Percent for Art Scheme	Ireland	Percent for Art Scheme is a project that develops skills and leaves a skills legacy.
Playwrights Studio Scotland – Borders Project	Scottish Borders	Playwrights Studio Scotland – Borders Project is a project that develops skills and leaves a skills legacy.
Polmont Young Offenders Institution	Falkirk	Polmont Young Offenders Institution is developing a relevant, vibrant library service using professional librarian funded by the Scottish Prison Service and managed by the Falkirk Community Trust.
Positive Notes Choir	Dundee	Positive Notes Choir is a project for people with learning disabilities, led by the Occupational Therapy Service, Dundee.
Punchdrunk Enrichment	UK	Punchdrunk Enrichment inspires and engages participants through community theatre projects that focus on the innate creativity and imagination of the individual. Productions include Captain's Orders and The Lost Lending Library
Questions of Life and Death project	Dumfries & Galloway	Questions of Life and Death project uses state-of-the-art technology to explore stories from the archaeological bone collections with local young people in deprived areas. Giving them the opportunity to participate in 'CSI-style' cold cases designed to uncover the stories of medieval Scotland, while learning to use modern technology and learn about science, technology, engineering and mathematics.
Reminiscence Sessions	Renfrewshire	Reminiscence Sessions work with older people using photographic and document archives to bring back memories and to promote social contact.
RE-Tune Project	Glasgow	RE-Tune Project is a volunteer-led project offering people with mental health difficulties the chance to make, and then play, their own stringed instrument.
Romani Cultural Arts		Romani Cultural Arts is a partnership which aims to deliver cultural projects to help the Romany and traveller community to break down inequalities.
Romantic Scotland Exhibition	National Galleries of Scotland	Romantic Scotland Exhibition is an exhibition which toured to the Nanjing Museum in 2017-18. This was a partnership between the National Galleries for Scotland and Historic Environment Scotland.
Room For Art		Room For Art is a ground-breaking project addressing health inequalities and achieving significant health and wellbeing outcomes.
Scottish Arts and Homelessness Network	Scotland	Scottish Arts and Homelessness Network has undertaken the first Scottish Review of Arts and Homelessness.
Scottish Arts Council pARTners programme	Scotland	Scottish Arts Council pARTners programme ran from 2004 to 2007. It gave communities with little experience of the arts new opportunities to engage with professional artists by providing opportunities for high quality participation in the arts for hard to reach groups, through artist(s)/arts organisation(s)

		residencies across Scotland. This included the Scottish Sculpture Workshop and Callendar House for example.
Scottish Boat Building Scheme – Scottish Maritime Museum 2014	Irvine, Ayrshire	Scottish Boat Building Scheme project provided education and qualifications in traditional and modern boat building and repair which involved young people, local community, long term unemployed and volunteers.
Scottish Book Trust pilot project	North Ayrshire	Scottish Book Trust pilot project, digital stories, created by various community groups, aimed at helping people get digitally connected by sharing their stories. The project involves using iPads and selected apps to create images, video, animation and audio which allows participants to tell their own unique story in the form of a short film.
Scottish Borders Cultural Forum	Scottish Borders	Scottish Borders Cultural Forum project that develops skills and leaves a skills legacy.
Scottish Coastal Rowing project	Scotland	Scottish Coastal Rowing project has contributed to place-making and identity, community cohesion, health and wellbeing, and a revitalisation of an inclusive traditional sport with equal opportunities and skills development.
Scottish Council on Archives – Archives Preservation Project	Scotland	Scottish Council on Archives – Archives Preservation Project – seeks to preserve archive material to ensure Scotland’s collections are available for future generations. This includes storage, environmental control, handling, risk management, disaster planning and survival of digital material.
Scottish Council on Archives – Online Catalogue Project	Scotland	Scottish Council on Archives – Online Catalogue Project – seeks to widen and improve ease of access to all national archive source material for academic and family history research purposes and for a wide range of creative activity both in Scotland and internationally.
Scottish Prison Arts Network	Scotland	Scottish Prison Arts Network comprises artists across art forms engaged in the field of criminal justice. The network provides a focus for sharing practice, connecting artists and supporting organisations and articulating the importance and impact of making art with offenders and their families in Scotland.
Scottish Ten	Scotland	Scottish Ten is an international partnership between Historic Environment Scotland and Glasgow School of Art and Japan. It led to the incorporation of Scottish industrial heritage features in a world heritage site. It is an example of digital diplomacy and also involves India and China.
See Think Make	Scotland	See Think Make is an example of how to provide emerging artists with the opportunity to develop their leadership potential at the start of their professional journey, gaining an Arts Award in the process.
Sign Out Loud		Sign Out Loud involves community choirs which help change the perceptions of the deaf community and the role of music.
Sliabh Luachra Music Trail	Ireland	Sliabh Luachra Music Trail provides access to culture, important cultural spaces and regular work for musicians, particularly traditional musicians who work in rural areas.
STAR Project	Paisley	STAR Project is a community organisation, delivering sustainable and positive social outcomes in Renfrewshire. Established in 1999, employing a person centred approach, the Star Project deliver group and individual support to build safer, more connected and resilient families and communities.

		The project supports people through the cultural assets in their community.
SURGE	Glasgow	SURGE seeks to develop street arts, physical theatre and circus in Scotland. They work with artists, performance companies and educators at all levels of experience. They provide participation opportunities and broaden access widely.
Tayberry Tales		Tayberry Tales is a multi-sensory storytelling project.
The Portal	Govan	The Portal is a community arts venue offers a wide range of arts and creative opportunities to people of all ages and abilities.
The Prince's Foundation – Outreach	New Cumnock	The Prince's Foundation – Outreach – is a regeneration project which turned the Town Hall into a community and activity space.
The Prince's Foundation Education Arm	Cumnock	The Prince's Foundation Education Arm, based at Dumfries House, offers innovative and inspiring skills-based courses including traditional arts and heritage craft skills, architecture and design, science, engineering and hospitality. Education programmes range from primary schools to postgraduate level. Partners include University of Oxford, Royal Conservatoire of Scotland and the Royal Drawing School.
Thomas Clement Douglas artwork commission		Thomas Clement Douglas artwork commission is a project which works with local voluntary groups to realise aspirations.
Trails Centre		Trails Centre is attached to a library and an oral history collection.
Understanding Cinema	Edinburgh	Understanding Cinema is a project offered by Filmhouse/Centre for the Moving Image.
Visible Fictions	Scotland	Visible Fictions offer immersive theatre interventions in school settings.
Wave Particle		Wave Particle is an artist-led organisation which supports and directs a team approach to rural projects.
WHALE Poetry Group	Wester Hailes	WHALE Poetry Group is a partnership between Scottish Poetry Library and Open Book.
White Gold @Sugar Sheds	Greenock	White Gold @Sugar Sheds was a community dance/theatre, casting, skills development and heritage engagement project staged during the Commonwealth Games 2014.
Woodburn Art Club	Woodburn	Woodburn Art Club is an art club for young people stimulating creativity, empowering and developing skills in a fun, supportive and non- school environment.

## Examples of Culture Initiatives or Programmes

Initiative/Programme	Location	Focus
Access for Young People	Scotland	Access for Young People is a programme that National Trust for Scotland, working in partnership with Young Scot and Historic Environment Scotland and the Historic Houses Association, use to engage young people and encourage them to learn, explore and experience more of Scotland's history by offering access to historic attractions for £1.
Art Room (The)		Art Room offers art and creative writing opportunities during a difficult time in their lives.
Barras Action Plan	Glasgow	Barras Action Plan offers a programme involving arts, community and heritage.
Born to Write Programme	Scotland	Born to Write Programme is an initiative which works in communities traditionally excluded from theatre.
Bright Club		Bright Club offers a stand-up comedy programme which brings art and science together.
Class Act programme	Traverse Theatre	Class Act programme is an education project, challenging senior pupils from across Edinburgh to become playwrights; creating brand new scripts to be premiered on the Traverse stage.
Code Clubs in Public Libraries	Scotland	Code Clubs in Public Libraries aims to expose young people to coding skills, which are now a core component of computing science, in a way that is fun and engaging. By having a games-based focus and collaborative feel, the clubs enable children to develop confidence, self-esteem and leadership skills.
Consortium Co-operatives		Consortium Co-operatives brings groups of companies together to pool resources including buying, selling, marketing, sharing facilities or joint tendering for contracts.
Creative People and Places	England	Creative People and Places is a cross-art form model initiated and funded by Arts Council England with the primary objective of championing creative producers working in areas with lower levels of engagement with culture.
Cultural Rucksack Programme	Norway	Cultural Rucksack Programme is a national programme of arts and culture in Norwegian schools where there is a cultural entitlement for all young people.
Cultural Strategy for the Scottish Borders	Scottish Borders	Cultural Strategy for the Scottish Borders led to the establishment of a Cultural Forum which meets regularly and brings together practitioners, makers and administrators.
Culture 21 programme	Scotland	Culture 21 programme was developed by United Cities and Local Government. It articulates the importance of culture for enriching lives, developing citizenship and improving sustainable development. This includes a range of indicators and means of evaluating which there may be merit in adopting or adapting within a Scottish context nationally and locally.
Culture Aberdeen	Aberdeen	Culture Aberdeen is a new 10 year strategy for culture across the city developed with a network of organisations. The strategy was also translated into Doric, showing a shared commitment to the heritage and language of north-east Scotland
Culture and health Events	Glasgow Museums	Culture and health Events include workshops, talks, activities and Sunday tea parties for older people, who live alone and may have little contact with family or friends, in an effort to tackle loneliness and social isolation.

Dumfries and Galloway's Major Events Strategy	Dumfries & Galloway	Dumfries and Galloway's Major Events Strategy recognises the important contribution of culture to the region's economy with four of the seven 'Signature Events' being cultural to help generate future growth.
Dundee City Pipe Band and Youth Music Initiative	Dundee	Dundee City Pipe Band and Youth Music Initiative offer music opportunities for participation.
Earshot	Scotland	Earshot, by BBC Scotland, was a joint broadcast with Radio Scotland and Radio5.
Edinburgh Performing Arts Development programme	Edinburgh	Edinburgh Performing Arts Development programme offers opportunities for participation.
E-Force	Scotland	E-Force was an initiative by BBC Scotland in the 1980s/90s to give basic broadcast training to young unemployed people and to promote new broadcasting talent.
El Sistema		This is a publicly financed, voluntary sector, music-education program, founded in Venezuela in 1975. Based on this approach Sistema Scotland seeks to create permanent social change in some of the most deprived communities in Scotland. They use participation in the Big Noise orchestra programmes to change lives by fostering confidence, discipline, teamwork, pride and aspiration in the children and young people taking part. This enables the children and young people to reach their full potential, leading successful and fulfilled lives. This philosophy has a knock on effect for their families and the wider community in general.
Elderflowers and Forget Me Notes		Elderflowers and Forget Me Notes offer professional arts practitioners, trained to work in healthcare environments with vulnerable people living with dementia.
European City of Culture Valetta 2018	Valetta, Malta	European City of Culture gives a valuable platform to those cities who take part. The cultural programme in Valetta in 2018 spans the arts, free local events, a psychiatry and arts conference and looks at welcoming other cultures, in this instance Turkish music.
Falkirk Townscape Heritage Initiative	Falkirk	Falkirk Townscape Heritage Initiative uses arts and cultural activity as a starting point for public engagement in regeneration of a Conservation Area.
Feel good Fridays	Glasgow	Feel good Fridays are music sessions, photography, textiles and movie sessions run by Marie Curie.
Festivals partnerships	Edinburgh	Festivals partnerships are strategic partnerships which provide space for events, drive participation and encourage engagement with permanent displays, help audiences make connections across Edinburgh's cultural offerings and encourage cross-fertilisation of cultural experiences.
Forget Me Not programme	Capital Theatre	Forget Me Not programme offers activities to enable those experiencing dementia and their carers to be able to take part in creative activities.
Gallery Social	National Galleries of Scotland	Gallery Social is a programme for people experiencing dementia which connects to social care. There are also community sessions within the family programme and a creativity summer school.
Head Start Summer School	Fife	Head Start Summer School offers senior Fife school pupils who are interested in studying visual art and craft beyond school workshops introducing them to new techniques and materials, run by artists.
High Flyers		High Flyers is a programme to support the development, confidence and leadership within established businesses.

High Street Action Plan	Glasgow	High Street Action Plan is a heritage, arts, community initiative.
Insider /Tipi sessions	Dell of Abernethy	Insider /Tipi sessions offer a cultural programme in a rural location.
Jury of Peers' grant assessment system	Canada Council of the Arts	Jury of Peers' grant assessment system gives opportunities to artists/creative professionals in the grant process including those who are marginalised. This benefits the decision-making process and the individuals involved.
Library Makerspace	Garnock Valley, Beith, Dalry & Kilbirnie	Library Makerspace is a concept where a range of activities can take place, ranging from traditional crafts to cutting edge technology, offering the chance to learn new skills, free access to tuition and equipment, the opportunity for the local community to volunteer to share knowledge and a link up with social enterprise team to encourage business start-ups.
Live Literature		Live Literature funding by the Scottish Book Trust helps people to engage with Scottish literature.
Making Progress	Highlands & Islands	Making Progress is a programme supporting the business development of emerging makers.
Museum Socials	Scotland	Museum Socials is run for people living with dementia, their friends, families and carers. It is delivered through partnership with National Galleries of Scotland, National Library of Scotland, St Cecilia's Hall: Concert Room and Music Museum and Edinburgh Zoo, providing invaluable respite for carers and stimulation for those living with dementia.
Music Education Partnership Group		Music Education Partnership Group is a partnership of many organisations with direct interest in the delivery of music education in Scotland over the broad canvas of the formal, informal, and non-formal sectors.
Music For Life		Music For Life aims to deliver tailored musical activities for people at every key stage of life across the nation, from new-borns to those in later life. Providing a broad range of activities for early years, nurseries and schools, teenagers and students, families, accessing lives, working lives and retired and later life.
National Galleries of Scotland – digitising National Collection	National Galleries of Scotland	National Galleries of Scotland – digitising National Collection – offers a programme to develop future skills with trainees.
National Records of Scotland	Scotland	National Records of Scotland's Genealogy programme links Scots across the world with their cultural roots.
National working	National	National working developed by National Museums Scotland, in consultation and collaboration with the Scottish museum sector and other groups, delivered through three successive national strategies. Achievements include a free National Training Programme, loans programme, seven national touring exhibitions provided to local museums as part of a development programme aimed at building capacity through collaboration, a Collections Advice Policy fostering the sharing of National Museums Scotland's specialist curatorial expertise with local museums, annual outreach programmes, Powering Up!, a national science engagement programme funded by the ScottishPower Foundation, now in its fourth year, delivering new science, technology, engineering and mathematics learning in partnership with

		local museums and schools, and through outreach to areas of social deprivation, advice and funding for acquisitions by local museums through the National Fund for Acquisitions.
New Blood Programme		New Blood Programme gives young people inspiration and evidence pathways of the steps to follow post school in order to work in the creative sector. The partnership runs across a trust, college and schools.
Paris Pacte Parisien	Paris	Paris Pacte Parisien partners cultural organisations with social welfare organisations. This model is also being implemented in Manchester.
Regional Screen Scotland /Screen Machine	Scotland	Regional Screen Scotland /Screen Machine links with community cinema and the Screen Machine.
Scottish Contemporary Art Network, Scottish Artists Union and Engage Scotland's Visual Arts Manifesto		Scottish Contemporary Art Network, Scottish Artists Union and Engage Scotland's Visual Arts Manifesto which makes public their commitment to working together to champion the visual arts sector and to take action on the challenges the sector faces.
Scotland-Venice Visual Art Programme	National Galleries of Scotland	Scotland + Venice Visual Art programme is delivered in partnership with the British Council, Creative Scotland and National Galleries of Scotland. It is part of the Venice Biennale of International Art, which gives an international stage for Scotland's art.
Scottish Ballet Dance for Parkinson's programme	Scotland	Scottish Ballet Dance for Parkinson's programme is a pioneering Dance for Parkinson's programme.
Scottish Community Reinvestment Trust	Scotland	Scottish Community Reinvestment Trust allows third sector organisations to pool resources for the mutual benefit of the sector and the communities it serves and develops financial models that may be useful for the culture sector.
Scottish Council on Archives – Education and Community Archives		Scottish Council on Archives – Education and Community Archives – enables equal access to the archival heritage for minority and disadvantaged groups, children and young people across Scotland. Led by its Education Committee and guided by a strategic plan, further developing skills and confidence in developing and implementing outreach programmes, leading to a significant increase in engagement with schools and communities.
Scottish Council on Archives – Fundraising for Archives	Scotland	Scottish Council on Archives – Fundraising for Archives – supports the delivery of a comprehensive fundraising training programme for archivists in Scotland.
Scottish Council on Archives – Skills for the Future Programme		Scottish Council on Archives – Skills for the Future Programme – is part of the Opening Up of Scotland's Archives project and part of a wider partnership project with The National Archives, University of Dundee and the Archives and Record Association UK and Northern Ireland. This includes a 12 month traineeship programme focusing on diversifying the sector, addressing skills gaps and providing new routes into working in archives.
Scottish Graduate School for Arts and Humanities	Scotland	Scottish Graduate School for Arts and Humanities Internship and Artist Residency programme

Internship and Artist Residency programme		
SHIFT	Highlands & Islands	SHIFT is a creative exchange programme with Iceland.
Smart Plastics	Edinburgh	Smart Plastics is a group formed to develop new products from biodegradable and recyclable plastics through an academic collaboration with the Green Materials Laboratory at the University of Edinburgh. Motivated to minimise their carbon footprint, reduce the energy used in the ceramic making process, and to use recyclable or biodegradable materials this project is breaking new ground in developing the use of polymers, plastics and new materials in each participant's practice.
Travel grant system	Canada Council of the Arts	Travel grant system is a rolling grant fund enables artists to present and promote their work internationally.
West Lothian policy on public art	West Lothian	West Lothian policy on public art as West Lothian is the home of internationally recognised pieces of public art, with over 80 artworks in the region.
Year of Young People	National Museums of Scotland	Year of Young People project took place in 2018 as part of the National Museums of Scotland's 'Kick the Dust' programme and partnership with impact Arts which included summer residences with over 200 young people from Edinburgh, Glasgow, Renfrewshire and Ayrshire.
Youth Music Initiative	Scotland	Youth Music Initiative offers support for young musicians across Scotland.

## Examples of Culture Events

Event Name	Location	Focus
Article 12 in Scotland Events	Scotland	Article 12 in Scotland Events offers events to celebrate Gypsy, Roma and Traveller History Month. These events promote greater understanding of these cultures and challenging stereotypes through creative means.
Big Burns Supper		Big Burns Supper is the world's biggest Burns night celebration.
Book Week Scotland	Scotland	Book Week Scotland offers events throughout Scotland promoting engagement with Scottish literature.
Casting the Net – From town to coast	Borders / Berwickshire	Casting the Net – From town to coast offers an Easter festival of net making and knitting in Eyemouth and Selkirk.
Clin d'oeil		Clin d'oeil is a deaf film and arts festival.
Deaffest	England	Deaffest is a deaf film and arts festival.
Death on the Fringe	Edinburgh	Death on the Fringe is a series of shows and events looking at death and dying, combines fringe shows with a programme of talks and lectures for an audience of invited guests from academia, health and social care providers, and community organisations.
Early Doors for Autism	National Museums of Scotland	Early Doors for Autism events provide opportunities for autistic young people and their carers/families to explore the galleries and exhibitions in a context in which they feel comfortable. Museum staff have had specialist training in order to facilitate these sessions.
Edinburgh Festival	Edinburgh	Edinburgh Festival offer a successful and diverse festival which has been running for over 70 years.
Edinburgh Fringe Festival	Edinburgh	Edinburgh Fringe Festival is an anarchic, open, accessible festival.
Fighting for Life	Edinburgh	Fighting for Life is a play by Brian Daniels commissioned by Helen Findlay on the lack of care offered to families with members suffering from motor neurone disease.
Fire Festivals	Shetland	Fire Festivals is a community driven event creating channels for creativity and sense of belonging
GLOW festival	Edinburgh College	GLOW festival is a creative industries festival for students
Knowledge Exchange Cultural Strategy Event	Glasgow	Knowledge Exchange Cultural Strategy Event brings together representatives and practitioners of colour with a range of governance and strategic representatives from cultural organisations of scale in Scotland.
Lentfest	Glasgow	Lentfest is an annual festival of faith and the arts held by The Archdiocese of Glasgow Arts Project.
Live Borders Museum Service's Exhibitions	Scottish Borders	Live Borders Museum Service's Exhibitions regularly feature exhibitions curated with local community involvement.
Lubimovka New Plays Festival	Moscow	Lubimovka New Plays Festival is an event where playwrights explore each other's work, leading to commissions and a translation exchange with a leading playwright development organisation in the USA.

Melrose Book Festival	Scottish Borders	Melrose Book Festival attracts wide audience beyond local and has good speakers.
National Theatre of Scotland's Educational activity	National Theatre of Scotland	National Theatre of Scotland's Educational activity offers a rich array of activities to encourage participation.
Pentlands Book Festival	Edinburgh	Pentlands Book Festival is an annual event linked to Book Week Scotland.
Rip It Up: The Story of Scottish Pop	National Museums of Scotland	Rip It Up: The Story of Scottish Pop was a special exhibition exploring Scottish artists' creativity and contribution to popular music over the past 60 years. It was a catalyst for a major cultural celebration, including talks and performances, BBC Scotland TV and Radio documentary series, and a series of accompanying concerts.
Screenplay Film Festival		Screenplay Film Festival offers film education; widening culture access to for young people and others.
Shetland Folk Festival	Shetland	Shetland Folk Festival is noted for its hospitality.
SPECTRA Festival of Light	Aberdeen	SPECTRA Festival of Light brings together local, national and international artists.
Spring Fling	Scotland	Spring Fling offers visual arts and crafts open studios event.
Sunday Teas	Shetland	Sunday Teas offers cultural value, tackles mental health issues, isolation and provides an opportunity for participation.
The Alchemy Film and Moving Image Festival	Hawick	The Alchemy Film and Moving Image Festival is an excellent example of a sustainable and vibrant international festival which started, and is still based and delivered, in Hawick.
The Night With.....		The Night With.....programme of contemporary and classical music events are placed in informal venues to promote wider community access.
To Absent Friends	Edinburgh	To Absent Friends is a festival of storytelling and remembrance providing people with an opportunity to tell stories, celebrate and reminisce about those we love who have died. Events range from large-scale concerts to community meals to storytelling evenings to private remembrance ceremonies.
Wigtown Book Town/Kirkcudbright Artists Town		Wigtown Book Town/Kirkcudbright Artists Town is where culture is an integral part of everyday life. This offers a platform for communities and business to come together for the benefit of local residents and to appeal to tourists and visitors with an interest in culture and creativity.
XpoNorth	Scotland	XpoNorth is Scotland's Leading Creative Industries Festival.

## Weblink only provided

Title	Weblink
Me Notes	<a href="http://www.alzscot.org/services_and_support/search/2288_the_forget_me_notes_singing_group_edinburgh">www.alzscot.org/services_and_support/search/2288_the_forget_me_notes_singing_group_edinburgh</a>
Alex Rotas Photography	<a href="http://alexrotasphotography.co.uk/">http://alexrotasphotography.co.uk/;</a>
Argyll & Isles	<a href="https://explorechartsargyllandisles.org/directory">https://explorechartsargyllandisles.org/directory</a>
Argyll Crafters	website unavailable
Art In Healthcare	<a href="https://www.artinhealthcare.org.uk/blog.php">https://www.artinhealthcare.org.uk/blog.php</a>
Arts in Health Commissions	<a href="https://www.deirdre-nelson.co.uk/Arts-in-Health-Commissions">https://www.deirdre-nelson.co.uk/Arts-in-Health-Commissions</a>
Bird Yarns	<a href="https://www.deirdre-nelson.co.uk/Birdyarns">https://www.deirdre-nelson.co.uk/Birdyarns</a>
Casting the Net from Town to coast	<a href="https://bordersartstrust.wordpress.com/">https://bordersartstrust.wordpress.com/</a>
CHArts Argyll and the Isles + AITC	<a href="https://medium.com/@chartsargyll/wild-about-argyll-and-charts-join-forces-3ab46118e4e6">https://medium.com/@chartsargyll/wild-about-argyll-and-charts-join-forces-3ab46118e4e6</a>
CHArts Digital network	<a href="https://www.explorechartsargyllandisles.org/">https://www.explorechartsargyllandisles.org/</a>
CHArts inclusive network	<a href="https://www.chartsargyllandisles.org/hubs">https://www.chartsargyllandisles.org/hubs</a> this has created 5 new hub networking events.
CHArts partnerships	<a href="https://www.explorechartsargyllandisles.org/events/195-musicians-info-session-roundtable-argyll-the-isles-19th-september-5-30-8-30">https://www.explorechartsargyllandisles.org/events/195-musicians-info-session-roundtable-argyll-the-isles-19th-september-5-30-8-30</a>
Clin-Doeil Festival	<a href="https://www.clin-doeil.eu/en-gb/festival?_rdr">https://www.clin-doeil.eu/en-gb/festival?_rdr</a>
Creative Dundee	<a href="https://creativedundee.com/">https://creativedundee.com/</a>
Creative Edinburgh	<a href="https://www.creative-edinburgh.com">https://www.creative-edinburgh.com</a>
Creative Renfrewshire	<a href="https://creativerenfrewshire.com/">https://creativerenfrewshire.com/</a>
Cultural Social Enterprise Network	<a href="https://senscot.net/network/cultural/">https://senscot.net/network/cultural/</a>
Culture Aberdeen	<a href="https://www.aberdeencity.gov.uk/services/leisure-culture-and-sport/culture-aberdeen-cultural-strategy-2018-2028">https://www.aberdeencity.gov.uk/services/leisure-culture-and-sport/culture-aberdeen-cultural-strategy-2018-2028</a>
Deaf Artists	<a href="http://www.tenartists.co.uk/artists/ruaridh">http://www.tenartists.co.uk/artists/ruaridh</a>
Deaf Artists	<a href="http://christophersacre.com/website/Home.html">http://christophersacre.com/website/Home.html</a>
Deaf Artists	<a href="http://www.louisestern.com/">http://www.louisestern.com/</a>
Deaf Artists	<a href="https://www.rubbena.com/">https://www.rubbena.com/</a>
Deaf Artists	<a href="https://www.rit.edu/ntid/dccs/dada/">https://www.rit.edu/ntid/dccs/dada/</a>
Deaf Artists	<a href="http://nancyourke.com/">http://nancyourke.com/</a>
Deaf Comedians	<a href="http://www.beautifulbsl.co.uk/">http://www.beautifulbsl.co.uk/</a>
Deaf Comedians	<a href="https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=H1A_li5FVj8">https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=H1A_li5FVj8</a> (The Maloes Show)
Deaf Crafts	<a href="https://www.deafcog.co.uk/craft-weekend">https://www.deafcog.co.uk/craft-weekend</a>
Deaf Crafts	<a href="http://www.deafvibe.co.uk/html/deafvibeprojects.html">http://www.deafvibe.co.uk/html/deafvibeprojects.html</a>
Deaf Crafts	<a href="http://mkdeafzone.org.uk/category/hobbies-crafts/">http://mkdeafzone.org.uk/category/hobbies-crafts/</a>
Deaf Crafts	<a href="https://www.bid.org.uk/about-us-menu-deaf-cultural-centre/deaf-cultural-centre-intro/arts-culture">https://www.bid.org.uk/about-us-menu-deaf-cultural-centre/deaf-cultural-centre-intro/arts-culture</a>
Deaf Crafts	<a href="https://www.neemacrafts.com/">https://www.neemacrafts.com/</a>

Deaf Crafts	<a href="https://www.nid.org.za/deaf-crafts/">https://www.nid.org.za/deaf-crafts/</a>
Deaf Festivals	<a href="https://deaffest.co.uk/">https://deaffest.co.uk/</a>
Deaf Festivals	<a href="https://deaffest.co.uk/2018/08/02/cornwall-mini-deaffest-2018/">https://deaffest.co.uk/2018/08/02/cornwall-mini-deaffest-2018/</a>
Deaf Festivals	<a href="https://www.clin-doeil.eu/en-gb/festival">https://www.clin-doeil.eu/en-gb/festival</a>
Deaf Museums	<a href="http://www.bdhs.org.uk/museum/">http://www.bdhs.org.uk/museum/</a>
Deaf Museums	<a href="https://www.gallaudet.edu/museum/deaf-museums-and-exhibitions">https://www.gallaudet.edu/museum/deaf-museums-and-exhibitions</a>
Deaf Theatres	<a href="https://www.deafinitelytheatre.co.uk/">https://www.deafinitelytheatre.co.uk/</a>
Deaf Theatres	<a href="https://www.thedeafinstitute.co.uk/">https://www.thedeafinstitute.co.uk/</a>
Deaf Theatres	<a href="http://rameshmeyyappan.com/about.php">http://rameshmeyyappan.com/about.php</a>
Deaf Theatres	<a href="http://ntd.org/">http://ntd.org/</a>
Deafinitely Theatre	<a href="http://www.deafinitelytheatre.co.uk">www.deafinitelytheatre.co.uk</a>
Death On the Fringe	<a href="http://www.deathonthefringe.org">www.deathonthefringe.org</a>
Diggorg Brown Collaboration	<a href="http://www.diggorybrown.com/about.html">http://www.diggorybrown.com/about.html</a>
Digital Heritage Programmes in the Highlands and Islands	<a href="https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=5vKRRi7fKk8">https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=5vKRRi7fKk8</a>
Edinburgh College	<a href="http://www.edinburghcollege.ac.uk/glow">www.edinburghcollege.ac.uk/glow</a>
Elderflowers	<a href="http://www.heartsminds.org.uk/elderflowers/">www.heartsminds.org.uk/elderflowers/</a>
Falkirk Townscape Heritage Initiative	<a href="http://falkirkthi.com">http://falkirkthi.com</a>
Fèisean nan Gàidheal	<a href="http://www.feisean.org/en/">www.feisean.org/en/</a>
Frances Whitehead	<a href="http://www.franceswhitehead.com">www.franceswhitehead.com</a>
FVSE	<a href="https://www.fvse.org.uk/">https://www.fvse.org.uk/</a>
GalGael	<a href="https://www.galgael.org">https://www.galgael.org</a>
Get It Loud In Libraries	<a href="https://vimeo.com/channels/storybirdproject">https://vimeo.com/channels/storybirdproject</a> .
Graeae	<a href="http://www.graeae.org">www.graeae.org</a>
Growing Old Competitively	<a href="https://bit.ly/2QlrObB">https://bit.ly/2QlrObB</a>
Harris, World Craft City	<a href="https://www.wccinternational.org/copy-of-bornholm">https://www.wccinternational.org/copy-of-bornholm</a>
Highlands and Islands Enterprise	<a href="http://www.hie.co.uk">http://www.hie.co.uk</a>
Highlands and Islands Enterprise Community Support	<a href="http://www.hie.co.uk/community-support">www.hie.co.uk/community-support</a>
Hippodrome Silent Film Festival (Hippfest)	<a href="https://bit.ly/2PPPIRn">https://bit.ly/2PPPIRn</a>
Impact Arts	<a href="https://www.impactarts.co.uk/content/our-work/">https://www.impactarts.co.uk/content/our-work/</a>
Ingingerness	<a href="http://www.ingingerness.com/artclub/">http://www.ingingerness.com/artclub/</a>
Inspiration Point	<a href="http://www.inspiration-point.co.uk/">http://www.inspiration-point.co.uk/</a>
Jangling Space	<a href="https://www.janglingspace.org/">https://www.janglingspace.org/</a>
Jigsaw of Homelessness Support	<a href="http://www.with-one-voice.com/jigsaw-homeless-support">http://www.with-one-voice.com/jigsaw-homeless-support</a>

Living Voices Project	<a href="http://www.scottishpoetrylibrary.org.uk/learn/living-voice">www.scottishpoetrylibrary.org.uk/learn/living-voice</a>
Luminate Scotland	<a href="https://www.luminatescotland.org">https://www.luminatescotland.org</a>
Made in Easterhouse	<a href="https://www.deirdre-nelson.co.uk/MadeinEasterhouse-shopping-list">https://www.deirdre-nelson.co.uk/MadeinEasterhouse-shopping-list</a>
Maggie's Centres	<a href="http://www.maggiescentres.org/cancerlinks/living-cancer/managing-emotions/creative-therapies/">www.maggiescentres.org/cancerlinks/living-cancer/managing-emotions/creative-therapies/</a>
Make Works, including their residency programmes with Hospitalfields and Dundee Design Festival	<a href="https://make.works">https://make.works</a>
Making Music	<a href="https://www.makingmusic.org.uk/news/read-results-new-study-links-between-leisure-time-music-groups-and-communities">https://www.makingmusic.org.uk/news/read-results-new-study-links-between-leisure-time-music-groups-and-communities</a>
Marie Curie Edinburgh	<a href="http://www.mariecurie.org.uk/help/hospice-care/hospices/edinburgh/services">www.mariecurie.org.uk/help/hospice-care/hospices/edinburgh/services</a>
Marie Curie Glasgow	<a href="http://www.mariecurie.org.uk/help/hospice-care/hospices/glasgow/services">www.mariecurie.org.uk/help/hospice-care/hospices/glasgow/services</a>
Marie Curie St Columbus	<a href="http://www.stcolumbushospice.org.uk/putting-art-heart-hospice/">www.stcolumbushospice.org.uk/putting-art-heart-hospice/</a>
Museum Galleries Scotland	<a href="https://www.museumsgalleriesscotland.org.uk/media/1094/going-further-the-national-strategy-for-museums-and-galleries-in-scotland.pdf">https://www.museumsgalleriesscotland.org.uk/media/1094/going-further-the-national-strategy-for-museums-and-galleries-in-scotland.pdf</a>
Museum School	<a href="http://museumschool.org/">http://museumschool.org/</a>
Music in Health and Care – MiHC	Music in Health and Care – MiHC
National Performing Companies Criteria	<a href="https://www.gov.scot/Publications/2017/03/1699/7">https://www.gov.scot/Publications/2017/03/1699/7</a>
Nordic Horizons	<a href="http://www.nordichorizons.org/">http://www.nordichorizons.org/</a>
Northlands Creative	<a href="https://northlandscreative.co.uk">https://northlandscreative.co.uk</a>
Norwegian artist Scholarships	<a href="https://www.culturalpolicies.net/web/norway.php?aid=813">https://www.culturalpolicies.net/web/norway.php?aid=813</a>
Open Book Reading	<a href="http://openbookreading.com/">http://openbookreading.com/</a>
Open Jar Collective	<a href="https://openjarcollective.wordpress.com/">https://openjarcollective.wordpress.com/</a>
P4P	P4P <a href="https://p4p.org.uk/">https://p4p.org.uk/</a>
Paris Pacte Parisien	<a href="http://www.federationsolidarite.org/images/stories/sites_regions/Ile_de_France/Précarité/AnnuaireStructuresSocialeCulturelles_22-09-HD.pdf">http://www.federationsolidarite.org/images/stories/sites_regions/Ile_de_France/Précarité/AnnuaireStructuresSocialeCulturelles_22-09-HD.pdf</a>
Pink Lane Jazz Co-op	<a href="http://www.jazz.coop/support-us">www.jazz.coop/support-us</a>
Playlist For Life	<a href="http://www.playlistforlife.org.uk">www.playlistforlife.org.uk</a>
Regional Screen Scotland	<a href="https://www.regionalscreenscotland.org/">https://www.regionalscreenscotland.org/</a>
SAU Rates of Pay	(weblink only accessible to members)
Scottish Care	<a href="http://www.scottishcare.org/resources/directed-by-north-merchiston/">http://www.scottishcare.org/resources/directed-by-north-merchiston/</a>
Scottish Chamber Orchestra Masterworks-American-Minimalism	<a href="https://www.sco.org.uk/latest/1221-masterworks-american-minimalism">https://www.sco.org.uk/latest/1221-masterworks-american-minimalism</a>
Scottish Chamber Orchestra Wester-Hailes-Residency	<a href="https://www.sco.org.uk/creative-learning/current-projects/1191-wester-hailes-residency">https://www.sco.org.uk/creative-learning/current-projects/1191-wester-hailes-residency</a>

SCRT	<a href="https://www.scrt.scot/">https://www.scrt.scot/</a>
See Think Make	<a href="https://www.seethinkmake.co.uk/">https://www.seethinkmake.co.uk/</a>
Shetland Perrier Makers	<a href="https://www.crowdfunder.co.uk/peeriemakers-shetland/">https://www.crowdfunder.co.uk/peeriemakers-shetland/</a>
Solar Bear	<a href="http://www.solarbear.org.uk">www.solarbear.org.uk</a>
Spring Fling	<a href="http://www.spring-fling.co.uk">http://www.spring-fling.co.uk</a>
Story Bird Project	<a href="https://vimeo.com/channels/storybirdproject">https://vimeo.com/channels/storybirdproject</a> .
Swedish EPR Agreement	<a href="http://earights.org/what-is-mu-swedish-epr/">http://earights.org/what-is-mu-swedish-epr/</a>
Tamarack Community	<a href="http://www.tamarackcommunity.ca/">http://www.tamarackcommunity.ca/</a>
The Arrival	<a href="https://thearrival2018.wordpress.com/">https://thearrival2018.wordpress.com/</a>
The Art Room	<a href="http://www.princeandprincessofwaleshospice.org.uk/hospice-care/our-services/the-art-room/the-art-room-sharing-best-practice">www.princeandprincessofwaleshospice.org.uk/hospice-care/our-services/the-art-room/the-art-room-sharing-best-practice</a>
The Bridges Chair, a collaboration by The Orkney Furniture Maker and Gareth Neal for The New Craftsmen Gallery, London	<a href="https://www.thenewcraftsmen.com/makers/gareth-neal/">https://www.thenewcraftsmen.com/makers/gareth-neal/</a>
The Engine Shed	<a href="https://www.engineshed.scot">https://www.engineshed.scot</a>
The Glasgow School of Art's Restoration of the Mackintosh Building (after the fire in 2014)	<a href="http://www.gsa.ac.uk/about-gsa/mackintosh-building-restoration/">http://www.gsa.ac.uk/about-gsa/mackintosh-building-restoration/</a>
The Stove	<a href="https://www.thestove.org/">https://www.thestove.org/</a>
The Work Room	<a href="https://www.artsprofessional.co.uk/magazine/article/dance-partners">https://www.artsprofessional.co.uk/magazine/article/dance-partners</a>
To Absent Friends	<a href="http://www.toabsentfriends.org.uk">www.toabsentfriends.org.uk</a>
Uist Wool	<a href="https://www.uistwool.com">https://www.uistwool.com</a>
Upland's Modern Heritage Craft	<a href="http://www.weareupland.com/projects/modern-heritage-craft">http://www.weareupland.com/projects/modern-heritage-craft</a>
Upland's Modern Makers	<a href="http://www.weareupland.com/projects/modern-heritage-craft">http://www.weareupland.com/projects/modern-heritage-craft</a>
Voluntary Code of Practice for Social Enterprise in Scotland	<a href="http://www.se-code.net/">http://www.se-code.net/</a>
Watershed+	<a href="http://www.calgary.ca/CSPS/Recreation/Pages/Public-Art/Watershed-Visual-Language-Project.aspx">http://www.calgary.ca/CSPS/Recreation/Pages/Public-Art/Watershed-Visual-Language-Project.aspx</a>
We Are Unlimited	<a href="http://www.weareunlimited.org.uk">www.weareunlimited.org.uk</a>
Whale Arts	<a href="http://www.whalearts.co.uk/news/wester-hailes-poetry-residency">www.whalearts.co.uk/news/wester-hailes-poetry-residency</a>
Why Creativity Matters	<a href="https://www.voluntaryarts.org/Pages/Category/why-creativity-matters">https://www.voluntaryarts.org/Pages/Category/why-creativity-matters</a>
Woodburn Art Club	<a href="http://www.ingingerness.com/artclub/">http://www.ingingerness.com/artclub/</a>
XopoNorth	<a href="https://xponorth.co.uk/">https://xponorth.co.uk /</a>
Youtube	<a href="https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=imcJbkECvmk">https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=imcJbkECvmk</a>
Youtube	<a href="https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=Xo0DKxlltNA">https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=Xo0DKxlltNA</a>



Scottish Government  
Riaghaltas na h-Alba  
gov.scot

© Crown copyright 2019

**OGL**

This publication is licensed under the terms of the Open Government Licence v3.0 except where otherwise stated. To view this licence, visit [nationalarchives.gov.uk/doc/open-government-licence/version/3](https://nationalarchives.gov.uk/doc/open-government-licence/version/3) or write to the Information Policy Team, The National Archives, Kew, London TW9 4DU, or email: [psi@nationalarchives.gsi.gov.uk](mailto:psi@nationalarchives.gsi.gov.uk).

Where we have identified any third party copyright information you will need to obtain permission from the copyright holders concerned.

This publication is available at [www.gov.scot](http://www.gov.scot)

Any enquiries regarding this publication should be sent to us at  
The Scottish Government  
St Andrew's House  
Edinburgh  
EH1 3DG

ISBN: 978-1-78781-415-8 (web only)

Published by The Scottish Government, January 2019

Produced for The Scottish Government by APS Group Scotland, 21 Tennant Street, Edinburgh EH6 5NA  
PPDAS498706 (01/19)

W W W . G O V . S C O T