Evaluation of Police and Fire Reform: Year 3 National Key Informants Report and Summary of Evidence

CRIME AND JUSTICE

social research

Evaluation of Police and Fire Reform:

Year 3 National Key Informants Report and Summary of Evidence

SIPR, What Works Scotland and ScotCen

May 2018

Contents

Introduction

In February 2015 the evaluation of police and fire reform in Scotland began. It is being undertaken by the Scottish Institute for Policing Research (SIPR), ScotCen Social Research and What Works Scotland.

The Year 1 report[1] was published in June 2016 and provided a review of publically available evidence up to the end of 2015[2] and national key informant interviews.

The Year 2 report[3] published in August 2017 comprised a Main Report and an Annex, with the focus on findings from four geographical case studies which examined local experience and perceptions of the way police and fire and rescue services are being delivered to local communities.

Year 3 has produced a series of publications, the first was published in February 2018 and comprised of a Main Report focusing on findings from a thematic case study on partnership working, prevention and innovation[4].

This report will present the findings from the third year of the evaluation which focuses on interviews with national key informants. Annex one provides an overview of Policing 2026, annex two presents a summary of evidence from 2017 and annex three provides an overview of key findings from the evaluation of Dutch and Norwegian police reforms.

Background

In year one of the evaluation national key informant interviews were conducted with 33 senior representatives from across policing (13), fire (9) in Scotland and a range of national bodies out with the two services, including other criminal justice sector agencies, local authorities and third sector organisations (11). The focus of these interviews were the perceptions of the processes and experiences of reform to better understand how and the why the aims of reform have (or have not) been met.

The evaluation is now in the third year and has revisited 17 of the national key informants (or their replacements) from policing (4), fire (6) and national bodies out with the services (7). The purpose of these interviews was to gather the perceptions of senior representatives regarding where the services are on the journey to transformation and how things have changed since they were interviewed two years ago. As with previous interviews undertaken for the evaluation, one of the

---

[1] See Evaluation of Police and Fire Reform: Year 1 Summary Report
http://www.gov.scot/Resource/0050/00502138.pdf

[2] See Annex 1: Evidence Review http://www.gov.scot/Resource/0050/00502122.pdf

[3] See the Year 2 evaluation report http://www.gov.scot/Resource/0052/00523031.pdf

[4] See the Year 3 report on partnership, innovation and prevention
http://www.gov.scot/Publications/2018/02/2267

tasks of the analysis presented here is to make sense of sometimes competing or apparently contradictory voices and perspectives – not by weighing 'perceptions' against 'reality' and determining which is most accurate, but by treating the way that people think and feel about reform as an important part of the social reality under investigation. The focus of this report then is on understanding national perceptions of the experience of reform and drawing out the wider significance and implications of these perceptions for the next stages of the reform journey. We also need to keep in mind that such perceptions are a snapshot of views at a particular moment in time. The evidence captured in this phase of the evaluation is rooted in longer narratives about policing, fire and social and organisational change.

How the data was collected

All of the national key informant interviews took place face to face. Ethical approval for the national key informant element of the evaluation was obtained from NatCen Social Research (NatCen) Ethics Committee. Access was granted to conduct the research with police officers and firefighters through the Scottish Government protocols.

Access to all participants was arranged directly with them or their assistants. Before the interviews the purpose of the evaluation and why they had been invited to take part was explained to all potential participants. Verbal consent was recorded before commencing the interview.

With the consent of participants, the interviews were digitally recorded and transcribed verbatim. All interview data were stored securely, with access limited to the research team. Interview data were coded with NVivo, a software package for qualitative data analysis, using an analytical framework based on the key themes discussed by interviewees. This system of coding facilitates the organisation and analysis of qualitative transcripts and provides a tool to explore the range and diversity of views expressed by participants.

Context

This report will discuss the perspectives of the national key informants for both services. It should however, be noted that the services are working within different contexts. SFRS has been responding to a changing demand environment in which dealing with fires is becoming less of a focus than in the past with consequent implications for the firefighter role. The need for change within SFRS is thus not only a result of reform. In 2016, the Scottish Government produced a Framework for Scotland, outlining their strategic vision and long term expectations of SFRS in terms of protecting communities; the evolving role of SFRS; and governance,

accountabiltiy and performance [5]. SFRS are currently conducting a public consultation on transformation to help shape the future of the service[6].

Police Scotland and the Scottish Police Authority have produced a 10 year strategy document outlining their vision for a transformed service, Policing 2026[7] (an overview of this strategy can be found in Annex 1). The key pillars of this vision focus on prevention, protection, communities, knowledge and innovation. Unlike SFRS, Police Scotland continue to be the focus of intense media and political scrutiny and there are continuing challenges in relation to the role of the Scottish Police Authority and in relation to the leadership of the service. It should be noted that in the period from late 2017 there has been some signficant changes in leadership at the SPA with the recruitment of a chair and seven new board members. The Executive have also appointed a new interim Chief Officer, with further senior officer recruitment currently taking place, including a timetable for recruiting a new Chief Constable.

These differences in context mean that the experiences of the Police Scotland and SFRS will be examined separately in this report but the broader conclusions and lessons of this phase of reform discussed at the end will draw together findings from both police and fire and rescue.

Relevance of the strategic aims of reform

When the national key informants were interviewed in 2015 they explained 'how' and 'why' the strategic aims of reform had (or had not) been met[8]. These aims are:

Aim 1 – to protect and improve local services despite financial cuts, by stopping duplication of support services eight times over and not cutting front line services

Aim 2 – to create more equal access to specialist support and national capacity – like murder investigation teams, firearms teams or flood rescue – where and when they are needed

Aim 3 – strengthen the connection between services and the communities they serve by providing an opportunity for more local councillors to be involved in shaping local services for better integration with community planning

In 2015, the services were 2 years into the reform process and it was found at that stage that there was plausible and credible evidence of progress being made towards achieving the aims of reform. Two years later and respondents from both services feel they have largely achieved aims 1 and 2. For both services aim 3 is viewed as a high priority but also the hardest to achieve.

---

[5] SFRS Framework for Scotland 2016 http://www.gov.scot/Resource/0050/00505071.pdf

[6] https://firescotland.citizenspace.com/sfrs-communications/your-service-your-voice/

[7] http://www.scotland.police.uk/assets/pdf/138327/386688/policing-2026-strategy.pdf

[8] See Evaluation of Police and Fire Reform: Year 1 Summary Report
http://www.gov.scot/Resource/0050/00502138.pdf

On the whole both services still see the relevance in the original aims. There was a view within SFRS, however, that it would be helpful to have another aim which reflects the future of the services as they move into a process of transformation. Police Scotland, still view the aims as relevant but are also focused on their Policing 2026 strategy. Both services are therefore very much focused on planning for a 'transformation phase' and having to confront key questions regarding the financial sustainability of different models of service deliveryin the future:

'How do you create a sustainable organisation in to the future that meets people's needs, that helps to improve outcomes for people, and, again, has a very strong focus on prevention?' (7 SFRS interviewee)

'So almost trying to work out "what does policing look like in the future?", because that should be what reform's about' (2 partner interviewee)

Journey to transformation

Defining Transformation

Defining transformation is not a straightforward process. SFRS interviewees tended to express a shared view of transformation, highlighting the need for the service to focus on changing demands including climate change, terrorism and prevention. Interviewees in Police Scotland, though they have a 10 year strategy[9] for the service, highlighted elements including prevention, wellbeing and cultural change.

From integration and consolidation to transformation

In Year One (2015/16) of the evaluation, both services saw themselves in the 'consolidating' and 'integrating' phase of the journey and real 'transformation' was still to take place with significant challenges ahead.

In 2017 for both police and fire there was a belief amongst the interviewees that they were on 'the cusp of *true* transformation' (13 SFRS interviewee). However, there were differing perspectives on where they were in relation to the integration and consolidation stages of reform.

For SFRS there was a consensus that they had done much of the 'groundwork' (6) and are starting to 'now look and feel like a national service' (6) but that they still have some consolidation work to do before moving into transformation. As part of this consolidation phase they are working on standardising processes, governance arrangements and accountability.

For Police Scotland, the development of Policing 2026[10] was viewed to have provided strategic direction and though they are early into the transformation

---

[9] Policing 2026 http://www.scotland.police.uk/assets/pdf/138327/386688/policing-2026-strategy.pdf An overview of the strategy can be found in Annex 1

[10] http://www.scotland.police.uk/assets/pdf/138327/386688/policing-2026-strategy.pdf

journey, they have a plan of how to achieve it. However, there was a view from outside the service that Police Scotland are still struggling with the integration phase of reform which might delay the scope to engage in more fundamental transformation (5).

Strategy and implementation

Although SFRS do not have a strategic document outlining their vision for transformation equivalent to Policing 2026, interviewees stated that the service did have a clear vision for the future. There were, however, differing views amongst the partner organisations, with some suggesting that SFRS know what they need to do as well as understanding their constraints; while others believed that the service is struggling to determine their role over the next 10 years and therefore needs a strategy document[11]. It should, however, be noted that SFRS has a statutory duty to produce a three year strategic plan that outlines how it will meet the various Ministerial priorities detailed within the Fire and Rescue Framework for Scotland, which it does adhere to. SFRS has also commenced a public consultation process on it's Service Transformation aspirations which will inform the organisations future direction.

Police Scotland have developed a 10 year strategy, Policing 2026, which has been based on detailed assessment of demand, academic evidence regarding good practice in policing, the Christie principles, and engagement and consultation with the workforce and community. They have also looked at international examples for different models of policing which have helped inform their strategy. Policing 2026 has therefore provided a vision for the future and a focus for where the organisaiton needs to be. The next phase is the process of developing a 3 year implementation plan[12] for how to operationalise the strategy and start to develop new programmes and initiatives. There is an understanding that this will take time to develop.

'The segment 2026 has been developed. They're starting to develop their implementation plans around some of that stuff there, so, to me, there's definitely a… sea change now about …looking towards the future' (2 partner interviewee)

'It does feel like they have really bought the ticket on transformation now and are … fully committed to the transformation agenda now' (3 partner interviewee)

However, some partner organisations had concerns about both the speed at which Police Scotland were moving towards implementation and the level of detail set out in the 2026 strategy:

'What 2026 says, it's all fine words, and its relatively easy to put together and we're saying well actually yeah that sounds...that sounds fine but we need the detail, we need the implementation plan' (9 partner interviewee)

---

[11] SFRS are conducting a public consultation on transformation to help shape the future of the service, due to close on the 14th May 2018 https://firescotland.citizenspace.com/sfrs-communications/your-service-your-voice/

[12] Details of the 3 year implementation plan was presented at the SPA Board Public Session on 19th December 2017 and can be found at http://www.spa.police.uk/assets/126884/434534/item7.1

'The models that are presented to us are presented on the basis of plausibility … rather than of evidence or detailed modelling, or experience, or replication of a model that's worked elsewhere. It just seems...it just seems not as rigorous as you might expect for a large organisation (4 partner interviewee)

Drivers and vision for transformation

Representatives of both services felt they were on the 'cusp' of transformation and were making progress towards this. There was also a sense amongst all the interviewees that change was inevitable and necessary whether reform had happened or not, due to the affects of austerity. As such, in moving into the transformation stage, a key driver for both services was identified as reductions in budget[13]. For Police Scotland, interviewees highlighted the need (and the challenge) of being able to deliver the service based on a balanced, sustainable budget. Reduced finances are also viewed by SFRS as a driver of transformation, but there is also an acknowledgement that even without financial pressures they would still need to transform due to the reduction in fires and changing demands[14].

An environment of changing demands exist for both services and it is acknowledged that there is a need to adapt, analyse, assess and understand these demands, and ensure that both Police Scotland and SFRS have the structures and resources in place to meet them. There is also a recognition in both services that there is a need to transform the mind-sets and culture to ensure the workforce embraces the new challenges they face.

For SFRS the focus is on the need to be adaptable to new risks such as terrorism and climate change. Connected to this, are the changing roles and expectations of firefighters and the need to have pay and terms and conditions that reflect this. This changing role also includes a widening of the prevention role as part of a transformation agenda, focusing on health, safety and wellbeing, particularly of vulnerable populations.

'So 'transformation' for us is about maintaining, you know, the foundation of the traditional services that communities would expect from us, but being able to widen the role and respond to a much wider community safety I guess role, and 'community safety' in its *broadest* sense from medical to terrorism to weather, and everything in between' (13 SFRS interviewee)

One of the interviewees also suggests that the Retained Duty System in rural and remote areas is a risk to the service due to the challenges of delivering training, maintianing IT systems and a lack of retained firefighters, and consequently this is also driving a transformation agenda.

---

[13] The Scottish Government has committed to maintaining the police budget in real terms for the duration of the current Parliament and has provided additional funding for reform in each year since the single service was established. Police Scotland has also retained VAT money following the UK Government decision to remove VAT liability (worth approximately £22 million in 18/19).

[14] Further details of the financial pressures facing SFRS can be found at Audit Scotland (2017) Scottish Fire and Rescue Service: Planning report to the audit and risk assurance committee on the 2016/17 audit http://www.audit-scotland.gov.uk/uploads/docs/report/2017/aap_1617_scottish_fire_rescue.pdf. This report will be discussed in Year 3 evidence review.

For Police Scotland delivering on Policing 2026 is central to the transformational phase. For some of the interviewees much of this hinges on creating a healthy organisation which delivers on the wellbeing of the public and workforce:

'95% of our budget is spent on our *people*, and…we can't spend more time worrying about putting fuel in our cars or batteries in our radios than we do about making sure our *people* can do their job, feeling well and …appreciated for what they do. So that feels, to me, the kind of the bit still to come of the transformation journey' (8 Police Scotland interviewee)

There is also recognition of the need for fundamental cultural shift in relation to developing a skilled workforce able to deal with an expanding role focused increasingly on prevention and early intervention. With this, there is an understanding that there is a need to work across agencies to find solutions.

There was however, a difference between how the interviewees from both police and fire viewed partnership working in a transformative context. Many described the need to work across organisations and combine resources through enhanced partnership working, particularly due to the impact of austerity. However, another vision for transformation was described as the creation of a single emergency service consisting of the police, fire and ambulance services. This was viewed as true transformation, but unrealistic to happen in the current political climate[15].

Transformation is also viewed by both services as an ongoing process of improvement and a journey, not something that will happen quickly. It is also viewed as an opportunity to start questions of what the services should look like over the next few years.

'Transformation journey is to make sure that we give the best services to promote community safety' (13 SFRS interviewee)

'That's why I'm saying it never *ends*, transformation…It is genuinely continuous improvement' (7 SFRS interviewee)

'We're probably just on the cusp of *true* transformation, because we're now in a space where, having tried to build the *foundations* if you like, we can start to look towards 'Well, what does the future service look like?', so what's the new risks that we're facing? What demands are there for our services now and in to the future? How does technology play in to that? You know?' (13 SFRS interviewee)

---

[15] This is discussed in further detail in the year 3 evaluation report – Thematic Case Study – Partnership, Innovation and Prevention and can be accessed http://www.gov.scot/Publications/2018/02/2267

Challenges and opportunities

In the journey to transformation respondents felt that both services face a range of challenges but are also creating opportunities in how to address these. These challenges include having an approriately skilled workforce and leadership to undertake transformation; changes to organisational culture; the impact the changes are having on the workforce; effectively consulting and communicating internally and externally; and achieving efficiencies.

A skilled workforce and leadership

Starting to move into the transformative phase and ask questions of where the services should be, are identified as significant challenges and one that requires appropriate skills and expertise to undertake it. The Year One evaluation report recommended undertaking regular reviews of skill requirements needed for transformational change, with a need for a wide range of expertise as the services enter 'transformation'.

A challenge identified by the service is having the skills and knowledge in place to not only continue to carry out the roles and responsibilities as emergency services but also create and deliver a vision for transformation. For several interviewees, the focus should be on the skills and knowledge required for the leaders of the services, including abilities in programme and change management, high levles of adaptability and flexibility and strong communication skills.

SFRS interviewees highlighted the importance of strong support from the leadership for change. Due to the diversifying of the firefighter role, having softer skills to develop the prevention role was also seen to be a key skill for the leadership teams. Effective communication and engagement was valued by SFRS, with an acknowledgement that there was a need to improve this when going into the next stages of reform. As such, the management team are in the process of visiting stations across Scotland to communicate the vision for the future of the service. It is also suggested that SFRS have taken professional help in engagement and analysis to prepare them for transformation and ensure they are taking a structured approach.

In Police Scotland there was an acknowledgement that in the early stages of reform many in the leadership lacked the skills and knowledge for transformaitonal change. However, they have now invested in professional programme managers and change managers from outside the service with the required expertise for the next stages of reform to deliver Policing 2026[16].

---

[16] Herrington (2017) from the Australian Institute of Police Management discusses the importance of leadership in building learning organisations in a presentation at SIPR's 2017 conference titled 'The success of failure: can we really build learning organisations in policing?'

Organisational culture[17]

As has been identified, having clear strategies, leadership and skills in place, are essential as the services move into transformation. However, another critical element is changes to the organisational culture which existed under legacy arrangements. Year one of evaluation highlighted how reform involves cultural as well as structural change and that there may be tension between 'old' and 'new' ways of working.

In relation to the journey to transformation, SFRS interviewees had differing views on the impact of the changes on the culture of the service. One view was that there had been a shift in the last couple of years, with firefighters now viewing themselves as part of a national service rather than legacy arrangements while others felt that culture change will take a generation:

'Culture change will take at least a generation…Its myth and legacy and all of that bit that's all wrapped up in it and to change that is debatable, it's part of your history, you can't change history. You can try and change people's attitude towards it but some people will always live in history' (5 partner interviewee)

For Police Scotland, there was a view that there has been a significant change in culture through a move away from a focus on performance to empowerment and greater localism. It was however, identified that it is necessary to build a culture of trust, confidence and learning from mistakes. As in SFRS, there was also recognition that the emotional attachment that officers had to legacy arrangements will take years to work through.

'You've had that kinda cultural and emotional change from being part of something for…you know? – depending on how long their service has been…from being part of something … in the legacy forces, moving in to the new thing… there's that emotional attachment around there, and…that'll take years to … to work through' (2 Police Scotland interviewee)

Impact on the workforce[18]

The next stages of transformation will have a major impact on the workforce of both organisations. For SFRS there will be much more of a focus on creating a preventative service, requiring a culture shift for firefighters who have traditionally seen their role as more reactive and senior management recognise that the workforce will require support and to be listened to through this transition:

 'A lot of fire-fighters joined the Fire Service because that...they want...they're intelligent, they're articulate, but they're action focused. They want to do that type

---

[17] What aspects of existing Scottish Police Service organisational culture might help or hinder the Reform process was explored in a study undertaken by Tatnell and Elliott (2012) Mapping police organisational culture: evidence from a study of Scottish policing, an overview can be accessed here http://www.sipr.ac.uk/downloads/SIPR_Annual_Report_12.pdf on page 38

[18] The impact on the workforce on a local level in four geographical case study areas across Scotland is discussed in the Year 2 evaluation report http://www.gov.scot/Resource/0052/00523031.pdf

of activity so the shift that we've made from an emergency response to a preventative service has been a big...don't underestimate the culture and the psychological shift that we've made to do that. And to extend the role it will also involve a cultural and a psychological shift for our workforce and we need to focus on that, and we need to support that change' (12 SFRS interviewee)

Prevention has been a key part of the fire fighter role for several years. However, to try to acknowledge the impact on the workforce due to the widening of the prevention role, SFRS have conducted a cultural audit of the organisation, which resulted in an action plan being produced and they are monitoring progress in this area on a regular basis.

It is generally felt that local police officers have experienced a lot of changes already in the reform process due to the cumulative effects of reductions in police staff, redeployments to specilaist units and the restructuring of beat areas. This has led to some concern that the workforce are experiencing 'change fatigue' (3 Police Scotland interviewee) although other interviewees emphasised that officers are also frustrated about not being involved in shaping the change that is occurring. As such, a key success factor for transformation identified by several interviewees is the ability to meaningfully engage the workforce:

'I think that varies in different areas and different departments or staff groups, but I think, *broadly* speaking, people are actually not fatigued by *change*. I think they're fatigued potentially by not being involved or not being able to shape the change that, quite rightly…I think the appetite to see the type of change that we've described, if it truly supports people in their role and allows them to do their job better in a more effective way, is something that broadly people would welcome, and have welcomed in the consultation and engagement that we've done' (10 Police Scotland interviewee)

Consultation and communication

To help with the cultural changes and impacts on the workforce which are required to move forward into transformation, effective consultation and communication with the workforce and public are required. SFRS strategic management has been sending letters and visiting the workforce across the country. Communication with the workforce on the transformation agenda is part of their process for consultation, as they want to ensure that the staff understand the vision when they are engaging the public:

'It's an _ev_olution rather than a _rev_olution, that we have to take no…just our *staff* with us …but we need to be comfortable wi' the changes that we're suggesting because we are suggesting some quite dramatic changes to…how they do things, but the people we deliver the service *for* need to be comfortable with it as well' (6 SFRS interviewee)

Police Scotland have engaged in a large scale consultation around Policing 2026 which was described by a national key informant as *'unprecedented'* (10 Police Scotland interviewee) in its nature and scale. Police Scotland received 1715 responses to the consultation, which was supplemented by additional feedback

they received from events and activities with staff, partners and public, before and during the consultation[19].

'I think that the transformation journey, if you go back a bit, and is true *all* the time, is the thing we didn't do well was actually *communicate*' (8 Police Scotland interviewee)

There were however, different views about how the process was undertaken. Partners expressed concern as to how meaningful and representative the consultation was, while interviewees from Police Scotland suggested that the approach was not just about quantity of responses but also about interacting with different members of the community[20].

'So we got a huge level of kind of responses. It's not all about quantity, but I think the *quality* of how we designed the interactions as well, that the public consultation exercise wasn't about just receiving replies from people who chose to interact with us. We went out to people that we thought had a stake in policing, and found different ways through a kinda themed approach' (10 Police Scotland interviewee)

Police Scotland interviewees recognised that during the first few years of reform they have not effectively communicated about the changes. However, in the development of Policing 2026, communication is now a priority both internally and externally. Despite this, some of the partners still felt that there had been a lack of communication from Police Scotland about how they intend to take transformation forward (4, 16).

Achieving efficiencies

One of the biggest challenges facing the services is achieving efficiencies. SFRS interviewees indicated that the organisation is on track in making sustainable savings and this is even described as having been the 'easy part' (1 SFRS interviewee). This has been achieved through shutting the headquarters, merging control rooms, reducing the number of strategic managers and reducing duplication. Despite these savings, the predominant belief is that fires are still reducing and the public have not experienced any changes in the service they receive. However, it is identified that there is still more to be done and that a challenge will be the continuous impact on the budget. Concerns were also raised about where the fire service will sit as priority in terms of public spending in the future. As such, suggestions were made about how the service can manage these uncertainties, including, building flexibility into the transformation programme in how they design and deliver the service, focusing on prevention, looking at different crewing models and distribution of resources and creating national terms and conditions for the workforce:

---

[19] For more information on the Policing 2026 consultation see
https://consult.scotland.police.uk/consultation/2026/

[20] Policing 2026 Consultation Analysis Report (2017)
https://consult.scotland.police.uk/consultation/2026/results/policing-2026---consultation-analysis-report.pdf

'Both prevention and flexibility, that's what allows us to, *we* think, deal with whatever financial scenarios come our way' (7 SFRS interviewee)

Police Scotland interviewees highlighted the challenges in realising efficiencies. Several respondents suggested that the savings required were unsustainable. Partners also stated that savings that had been made had led to inefficiencies; for example, police officers are backfilling support staff roles, leading to officers being less available to support communities.

'We were forced in the short term to make decisions about saving money that weren't always particularly intuitive in support of improving service' (10 Police Scotland interviewee)

Partner organisations also suggest that Police Scotland will struggles to achieve a balanced budget in the next 3 years but that better joint working between the emergency services could help. Police Scotland interviewees also highlighted that though they would like to move to a co-production model with other organisations, this is challenging as they work with yearly budgets and they are therefore unable to commit to long-term strategies with partners. Public finances are identified are being an ongoing challenge but that potentially more efficiencies could be gained in the corporate services[21].

Some wider implications of reform

Some of the wider implications of reform include partnership working, prevention and innovation. All of these elements were discussed with the national key informants in Year 1 of the evaluation and in Year 3 they were explored as thematic case studies in four geographical areas. Interviewees continue to emphaise the importance of the Christie principles[22] and suggested that both services have been *'heavily influenced'* (1 SFRS interviewee) by them.

For SFRS there is a view that the management team *'really believe in it'* (12 SFRS interviewee) and that their work is underpinned by the principles, particularly in relation to prevention. Police Scotland have embedded the principles in Policing 2026 although they identify some challenges given that a tendency for individuals to prioritise their own organisations first when faced with planning decisions:

'I think people get the *principles* of it, but, when it comes to it, you always put your own organisation first, and things like community planning partnerships for example haven't had much .. It's all been a bit 'optional' (8 Police Scotland interviewee).

There is also concern that since reform responsibility sits at the centre of Police Scotland which has led on a local level to divisional commanders not having the same decision making or budgetary authority as their equivalents in other

---

[21] I6 is not discussed by interviewees but has been reviewed by Audit Scotland highlighting the financial implications of the failure of the programme. Audit Scotland (2017) *i6: A Review* http://www.audit-scotland.gov.uk/uploads/docs/report/2017/nr_170309_i6_review.pdf
[22] Commission on the future delivery of public services (2011) http://www.gov.scot/resource/doc/352649/0118638.pdf

organisations, leading to an imbalance in relation to partnership working and meaningful collaboration[23].

Partner organisations also identified the challenge in operationalising the Christie principles and the tensions between balancing immediate needs with the delayed benefits from prevention and early intervention work.

Partnership working

As has been discussed reform and the journey to transformation has had a significant impact internally for both services. It has also impacted on their external partnerships and ways of working with other organisations. In the year one report, there was a strong sense among the national key informants that significant opportunities had opened up for more effective partnership working as a result of reform.

Two years on, for SFRS reform is viewed as having improved partnership working, helping the service to build on its reputation as a 'can do' organisation (12 SFRS interviewee). The introduction of local senior officers in each local authority to help coordinate partnerships as well as diminishing budgets encouraging partners to share resources were both highlighted as important catalysts of partnership working. Another significant factor identified was as a national service SFRS felt they now have a louder voice and greater access to strategic level conversations than existed under legacy arrangements.   An example of an innovative partnership initiative highlighted by interviewees was joint working with the ambulance service to respond to out-of-hospital cardiac arrests[24].

Regarding Police Scotland there was a view that reform initially set back partnership working due to the initial focus on integration of the service. However, the view is that now the service has settled down, there is a move towards empowering partnership working in local areas. The local outcome improvement plans (LOIP)[25] and locality plans are also suggested as leading to a stronger focus on working with partners and providing flexibility to make adaptions in local areas.

The partners' perspective since reform for both service is that partnership working is now more purposeful with regular board meetings between partners taking place. Local leadership from local senior officers and divisional commanders is viewed as critical to how partnerships work. Both Police Scotland and SFRS are perceived by

---

[23] It should be noted that Police Scotland are developing a Local Approaches to Policing Programme through Policing 2026, which will test different approaches to tackling local issues in different areas of Scotland.

[24] The work SFRS have been carrying out on out-of-hospital cardiac arrests is referred to as a good practice example of wider activities in a report commissioned by National Joint Council for Local Authority Fire and Rescue Services (NJC) in 2017 https://www.fbu.org.uk/sites/default/files/attachments/Broadening%20Responsibilities%20of%20FRS%20-%20Main%20Report%20-%20Final%20with%20Summary%20Fo....pdf

[25] The Community Empowerment (Scotland) Act 2015 requires Community Planning Partnerships to prepare and publish local outcome improvement plans (LOIP) which set out the local outcomes to be prioritised for improvement http://www.safercommunitiesscotland.org/2016/05/03/community-empowerment-scotland-act-2015-in-detail/

partners as willing to work jointly and engage with local priorities. Co-location is also identified as helping to encourage partnership working.

Prevention

As the services plan for transformation, prevention is a key aim in their strategic documents including Policing 2026[26] and SFRS Framework for Scotland 2016[27]. The interviewees for SFRS discuss the shift to a prevention focus for the service. This is identified as a necessary shift due to the reduction in house fires and seen as part of a change in organisational culture away from focusing on reaction and response.

'We've changed our aim, the number one aim is prevention as opposed to response. We've got to be there to respond but that prevention is far better than cure. So if we...if we adapt our home fire safety visits to safe and well visits, we can look at the things, we can educate, we can do some preventative work to stop people perhaps slipping, tripping and falling' (12 SFRS interviewee)

Partners suggest SFRS are now more focused on vulnerability and are seen as a trusted service by the public who allow them access into their homes. There is also a view among the partners that SFRS are good at talking about their wider community safety role in public, which ensures there is an understanding by the public of their prevention role in the community.

Interviewees had differing views about the prevention role for Police Scotland. There is a view that they are still developing their strategy for prevention and thinking about how to ensure that it becomes an ethos rather than a series of ambitions (10 Police Scotland interviewee). There was also a view that they are not clear as to how combine enforcement with education and prevention. Partners suggested that the police are not good at talking about the preventative side of their role and as such the public believe the role is mainly enforcement and crime focused, even though day-to-day policing includes much preventative work. There was also a view from partners that the police need to work with other organisations more in a prevention role, with solutions being believed to exist across Community Planning Partnerships and the public and voluntary sectors, not just sitting with the police.

A model named THRIVE[28] (Threat, Harm, Risk, Investigation, Vulnerability and Engagement) was mentioned by police interviewees as a good example of their prevention agenda, where a tailored response based on risk and vulnerability is provided to those who come into contact with the police, prioritising the most vulnerable.[29].

---

[26] http://www.scotland.police.uk/assets/pdf/138327/386688/policing-2026-strategy.pdf

[27] SFRS Framework for Scotland 2016 http://www.gov.scot/Resource/0050/00505071.pdf

[28] THRIVE is now referred to as a new Contact and Assessment model

[29] Description of THRIVE can be found in the Justice Committee written submission from January 2017 http://www.parliament.scot/S5_JusticeCommittee/Inquiries/DLP_Police_Scotland.pdf

Innovation

Innovation is another key aspect of the transformation agenda. The leadership of both services recognise that they do not have all the answers and that it is important to engage and empower the whole organisation in innovative practice to help them move into transformation.

The interviewees for SFRS discuss innovation in two ways: through practice and technology. With regards to practice, SFRS discuss the need to pull firefighters out of their comfort zone and work innovatively in partnerships and prevention, as well as their traditional role of following set rules in emergency situations.

'That's a big cultural shift for us … going into an emergency situation…You know you need to follow the rules, you need to be part of that team…. So then in the new world of working in partnership in the new world of doing different things, you're asking people to behave differently. You're asking them to be innovative, so we've done a cultural audit, we've got a cultural action plan. We are listening to what people are saying in relation to these things. And we've still got a journey to go on it but there's encouraging signs that...because we have got an intelligent workforce, and we should never forget that, and don't treat them like they're not…. we've got to send the signals out that we know you know, and we trust you and we encourage you' (12 SFRS interviewee)

Having national capacity is believed to have provided an opportunity for SFRS to explore and introduce new technologies which are viewed as innovative. For example, Ultra High Pressure Suppression Systems which allows firefighters to put out a fire from outside the building quickly and more safely. The next phase of technological advance in the service is suggested to be introducing a new command and control IT system, which will link the control room with front line staff, for example, through the use of body cameras.

'Having the national capability gives you the ability to look at innovation differently, to look at new technologies and how you might harness them, and then bring it in, as I say, *consistently* across the country' (7 SFRS interviewee)

Some partner organisations, however, do question the level of Scotland-specific innovation in SFRS, suggesting that much of their work is happening not only across Scotland but also throughout the UK. However, this raises the question about whether innovative practice needs to be born of new ideas or whether it can simply be the revisiting of tried and tested methods, adapted for particular locations and/or issues. In regards to Police Scotland, one of the partners explains the importance of not discounting ideas because they have been tried before.

'We need to be careful that, you know, we don't... we don't write things off as *not* being innovative just because they've been done before' (2 partner interviewee)

The Year One report recommended that a strategic approach to innovation needed to be developed as the services moved into the transformation phase. For Police Scotland, Policing 2026 outlines innovation as one of its key areas of focus, with the strategy being viewed as a key driver for innovative practice in the service.

Interviewees explain that Police Scotland were looking inwardly for the first 3-4 years of reform, but now they are actively seeking support from experts in innovation, particularly in academic institutions. Partners do highlight the challenges the service faces in delivering innovation on a local level and in evaluating innovative practice. From the partner's perspective, innovation is about empowering leadership, culture and taking risks:

'It's definitely about the culture of the leadership that says actually the command structure doesn't always know best, sometimes you kind of need to free people up at the local level to try different things, to actually learn something' (3 partner interviewee)

Conclusions and Wider Lessons

This report has examined the perspectives and perceptions of national key informants drawn from Police Scotland, SFRS and partner organisaitons, focusing on their assessments of the current phase of reform. From their observations, several key conclusions emerge:

- Both Police Scotland and SFRS are developing a discourse around the transformation of service delivery and which is being articulated through key documents (Policing 2026 and the SFRS Framework);

- While the meaning of transformation has aspects which are specific to each of the services, there is a shared concern around a shift towards more preventative activity, partnership working and innovation;

- There are several major challenges that both organisations will face in driving forward a transformation agenda, ranging from having the relevant skills to facilitate change through to the need for effective communication, consultation and engagement with their workforce, partners and the public;

- While the structural changes associated with reform at a national level have enabled transformational activity to occur at scale and 'top down', there is still a need for local empowerment, autonomy and experimentation in order to allow some changes to happen from the 'bottom up'.

The experiences of the integration and consolidation of police and fire and recue services provide a number of wider lessons that are relevant to the transformation phase of reform. These lessons include:

- Communicating effectively the 'what', 'how' and 'why' of change within organisations between the leadership and wider workforce, and between organisations and external partners;

- Focusing on the anticipated outcomes of transformational change and being clear about how these will be realised;

- Embedding a culture of evaluation in order to answer the 'so what' questions associated with innovation activities associated with the transformation phase of reform;

- Recruiting people with the relevant skills and capacity to deliver change, including the use of change experts;

- Managing expectations of the public and workforce around the time needed to bring about transformational change.

Annex 1 - Policing 2026 overview

In 2016 Police Scotland published a 10 year strategy for policing in Scotland. The strategy intended to provide clear direction towards improvement and sustainability. The vision for the service is outlined as 'sustained excellence in service and protection' and purpose 'to improve the safety and wellbeing of people, places and communities in Scotland'.

The strategy outlines how the next stages of reform will require innovation and commitment to deliver transformation at all levels throughout the service.

Five key areas of focus for the strategy are highlighted as:

Protection - Based on threat, risk and harm

Prevention - Tackling crime, inequality and enduring problems facing communities

Communities - Focus on localism, diversity and the virtual world

Knowledge - Informing the development of better services

Innovation - Dynamic, adaptable and sustainable

To achieve their core purpose and vision, the strategy also outlines six strategic objectives including:

Improving public contact, engagement and service

Strengthen effective partnerships

Empower, enable and develop our people

Invest in our use of information and technology

Enhance cyber and forensic capabilities

Transform corporate support services

Annex 2 – Summary of Evidence in 2017

Introduction

This report provides a summary of evidence as part of a four year evaluation commissioned by the Scottish Government, examining whether the aims of Police and Fire reform have been met and considering what lessons might be learnt for any future public service reforms. The evaluation is now in the third year and this summary of references will draw on published reports in 2017. In this period 33 reports (23 relating to police, 8 fire, and 2 referring to both) were collated through consultation with Police Scotland, SFRS, SPA, HMICS, HMFSI and Audit Scotland, as well internet searches for relevant evidence.

The evidence review for Year 1 (Annex 1[30]) was published in June 2016 and consisted of publicly available evidence produced to the end of November 2015.

The evidence review for Year 2 (Annex 1[31]) was published in August 2017 and presented evidence from between November 2015 and December 2016.

This report will provide a summary of how the documentary evidence relates to each of the three aims of reform, as well as highlighting some additional relevant themes.

Reform Aim 1: To protect and improve local services despite financial cuts, by stopping duplication of support services eight times over and not cutting front line services.

Police Scotland

- Much of the evidence for reform aim 1 is internally focused with documents produced by Police Scotland and SPA, as well as receiving external scrutiny from Audit Scotland, HMICS and academics. These documents identify progress being made in achieving this aim, as well as the challenges of governance, appropriate use of public money, gathering and monitoring data and measuring impact.
- The HMICS inspection of call handling found that staff were providing a good service despite intensive change and development. However, on a

---

[30] http://www.gov.scot/Resource/0050/00502122.pdf

[31] http://www.gov.scot/Resource/0052/00523139.pdf

local level in Tayside response officers were feeling stretched to meet demand. As such, there was an identified need for the division to gather and monitor data to ensure resources are effectively distributed.

- Audit Scotland (2017) highlight in their 2016/17 audit of the Scottish Police Authority 'unacceptable' poor governance and poor use of public money in the SPA and Police Scotland. However, it is acknowledged that steps have been taken to ensure such occurrences are not repeated, such as a new chair and interim chief officer. These appointments should ensure that the culture, policies and operating systems of the SPA and Police Scotland are improved.

- A study by Hail (2017) found that front line officers claimed their was too much change since reform, local support was varied depending on local leadership and communication was an issue during the implementation of reform.

SFRS

- The evidence relating to reform aim 1 for SFRS mainly comes from Audit Scotland and HMFSI and includes some challenges such as the financial environment and staffing levels, but also explains what SFRS are doing to address these challenges.

- Audit Scotland in their planning report to the audit and risk assurance committee on the 2016/17 audit found that SFRS faces a challenging financial environment for the foreseeable future though the service are developing a long-term financial strategy to look at how it reduce costs to meet the challenge of making significant savings each year.

- HMFSI in their control room inspection identified the challenge of maintaining minimum staffing levels at all times but that are plans are in place in rectify this.

- In the SFRS code of conduct they outline principles relating to focuses on their purpose and outcomes for the people and communities of Scotland.

Reform Aim 2: To create more equal access to specialist support and national capacity – like murder investigation teams, firearms teams or flood rescue – where and when they are needed.

Police Scotland

- The majority of the evidence relating to reform aim 2 was produced by the HMICS during thematic inspections with a continued commitment outlined in their annual scrutiny plan to examine firearms, forensics and cyber-crime. Both areas of good practice and ongoing challenges have been identified in the local and thematic inspections.

- HMICS produced a review of the proposed transfer of the Scottish operations of British Transport Police to Police Scotland. This report outlines issues to be resolved relating to costs, financial impact, development of performance measures, workforce strategy and impact on the staff.

- The HMICS inspection of SPA forensic services found an inconsistency of processes across Police Scotland due to legacy ICT systems and divisional approaches. Also identified was weak communication, strategic leadership and a lack of effective support from the SPA Board and its partners.

- A local HMICS inspection found that there was evidence of effective event planning within Tayside, with good use being made of specialist national resources.

- The SPA's annual review outlined evidence of new national capacity and capability across all divisions' e.g. major investigation teams to support murder investigations. Challenges are identified as they work towards delivering Policing 2026. The SPA would expect to see more evidence of how these demands on policing are being assessed and responded to within the context of having national capabilities and capacity.

SFRS

- The evidence which corresponds with reform aim 2 is produced by HMFSI and the Scottish Government, who outline the actions already being taken by SFRS to ensure equal access and make recommendations for the future.

- A HMFSI inspection of operations control room in Dundee and service delivery and support in Highland, Western Isles, Orkney Islands and Shetland Islands, recommended that the Service should consider the new fire-fighting technologies, such as Ultra High Pressure Suppression Systems or high pressure misting, for remote rural locations where there are recruitment or reduced availability issues.

- The delivery plan for the Scottish Government's Justice Vision and Priorities outline the key actions SFRS will make towards priority 2 - 'We enable our people, economy and infrastructure to respond to major risk, recover from emergencies and adapt to emerging threats'. The actions include SFRS continuing to work with partners to identify flooding and other risks, in order to prioritise and target its use of resources and support improved outcomes for communities.

Reform Aim 3: To strengthen the connection between services and communities, by creating a new formal relationship with each of the 32 local authorities, involving many more local councillors and better integrating with community planning partnerships.

Police Scotland

- The evidence relating to reform aim 3 is both internally and externally focused, with Policing 2026 outlining police Scotland's commitment to communities and focusing on localism.

- Areas of good practice were identified in relation to partnership working in local area inspections and the HMICS review of stop and search found that Police Scotland had built strong working relationships with organisations representing children and young people.

- In a local inspection of Tayside, HMICS did suggest that there is a need for more a more evaluative approach to partnership working to assess the impact and outcomes of partnership activity.

- Written submissions were provided to the Justice sub-committee on Policing on Police Scotland's engagement with black and minority ethnic (BME) communities. The Coalition for Racial Equality and Rights would like to see a representative, responsive, collaborative and accessible police force. Police Scotland outlined the actions they are taking to tackle racism and promote equality and community cohesion, both internally and externally.

- A study by Malik (2017) on the SPA and police governance, identified the challenges for the SPA in holding Police Scotland to account. For effective governance of transformation, one of the recommendations that the SPA establish autonomy to position itself as a buffer between local and centrally elected representatives, and the police.

- The SPA in their annual review, states that they would expect to see further improvement with Local Policing Plans in terms of their evidence based development, implementation and ongoing performance assessment, as well as evidence of Police Scotland's contribution to each authority's Local Outcome Improvement Plan.

SFRS

- Reform aim 3 evidence is both internally and externally focused, with internally strategic documents outlining the focus on communities and local inspections and academic work highlighting examples of good practice and the broadening role of the firefighter in the community.

- In local area inspections, HMFSI, found examples of strong local partnerships and structures in place for scrutiny

- SFRS outline their commitment to people and communities, and partnership working in their strategic documents relating to corporate governance and communications and engagement.

- A study by Williams et al (2017) examining the broadening role of the fire service across the UK, highlighted Scotland as a good practice example of partnership working in relation to firefighters responding to out of hospital cardiac arrests in pilot areas.

Additional Emerging Themes

Additional themes emerged from the evidence which fall outside of the aims of reform, but are important for both services in helping them to achieve the aims and move into transformation.

Prevention

Prevention is a key strategic priority for both services moving into transformation and is outlined in the Policing 2026 Strategy and Justice Vision and Priorities.

In the local area inspections HMFSI also made recommendations in relation to prevention work in regards to resources and staffing.

Transformation

A key theme discussed by Police Scotland, SFRS, Audit Scotland and the SPA is transformation, in which they are outlining the vision for the future of the services. The strategy documents for the services including Policing 2026 and SFRS Communications and Engagement Strategy, outline their commitment to transformation.

Academics (Malik, 2017) also make recommendations regarding progress towards the governance of transformation through the SPA engaging with external stakeholders and clarifying their role.

ICT

ICT arrangements for Police Scotland were discussed in external reports by HMICS, SPA and Audit Scotland. Audit Scotland conducted a review of i6, setting out the history of the i6 programme and main reasons for terminating the contract. They also highlight the urgent need for the SPA and Police Scotland to determine

the next steps to procuring, developing and delivering the IT system. In the Annual Review of Policing 2016/17, the SPA suggest work is underway towards alternative ICT solutions to i6, as part of the investment in technology associated with Policing 2026.

Training

Areas of good practice are identified by HMICS in the thematic inspections of call handling and stop and search, with consistent, national approaches to training being highlighted. HMICS recommend equality and diversity training for Police Scotland and the SPA. In a written submission to the Justice Sub-Committee on Policing, Police Scotland outline a commitment to work with the SPA to promote equality and intercultural competency training. The HMFSI local inspections also make recommendations regarding training needs for firefighters, particularly in regards to introducing standard training conditions for retained duty staff.

Evaluation

In the local inspections, HMICS highlight the need for Police Scotland to have more evaluative approaches to activities to ensure they are achieving positive outcomes for local communities. In Police Scotland's written submission to the Justice Sub-Committee on Policing, they outline that they will work with partners including the SPA to develop an effective process for monitoring and evaluating the impact of stop and search practice on minority ethnic communities

Scrutiny

Examples of structures being in place for local scrutiny arrangements were found in the HMFSI local area inspections. SFRS also highlight the importance of scrutiny in their mainstreaming report.

On a national scale for Police Scotland, HMICS found improved scrutiny of stop and search activities and highlighted the need for the SPA to have scrutiny arrangements that take place in an open and transparent way.

Leadership

Effective leadership is identified as an important factor for both services in moving forward into transformation, with a need for good communication between the leaders and workforce. Audit Scotland acknowledge that ongoing changes in leadership in the SPA and Police Scotland are causing instability. On a local level, HMICS identified examples of effective and visible leadership, with leaders feeling more empowered to identify local solutions to local problems.

SFRS outline in their Code of Corporate Governance the need to develop the capacity and capability of the strategic leadership team to be effective.

Annex 3 - International Evidence

Key findings from the evaluation of the Dutch police reform[32]

In 2013 the Netherlands established a national police force. The main reasons for this reform were to stop the fragmentation of the police forces, to promote co-ordination, and to improve policing of organised crime and terrorism. Unlike Scotland, budgetary constraints were of very little relevance in the decision to create a new police system.

In November 2017 the formal evaluation of the Dutch Police Act 2012 was published. This evaluation was based on the legal obligation of the Minister set out in the Police Act 2012, to send an evaluation of the Act to the Dutch Parliament before 1st October 2017. Because of the time taken to create a new coalition government in the Netherlands after the elections of March 2017, the publication of this evaluation was delayed.

The responsibility for the evaluation was in the hands of the 'independent' Committee on the Evaluation of the Police Act 2012, set up by the Minister in October 2013. After some other publications in the years 2014 and 2016, the final report (including five annexes) was formally presented to the Minister (and from that moment it was also made public). The Minister has not given any indication of what he is intending to do with the recommendation and conclusions of the Committee, and has postponed his response.

The Members of the Committee did not do empirical research themselves, but contracted universities and consultancy organizations to conduct four different studies. The four studies dealt with different issues:
- the governance of the police
- legal aspects of the Police Act (especially the relation between the Chief Constable and the Minister and the distribution of formal powers between these two positions);
- the performance of the police (in a very broad sense);
- and the supportive (non-operational) facilities of the National Police (such as the management of buildings, cars, uniforms, etc.).

Later on, it was decided also to have a fifth study, which gave an overview of the developments of the Dutch police system since the late 1980s and made an overview of the findings and conclusions of all studies available with regard to the Dutch police system. The five studies were also published on 16 November 2017as Annexes of the Final Report of the Committee.

Based on these studies, the conclusions of the Committee were:
- The transition to the National Police was much more complex and took much more time than was originally envisioned;.

---

[32] This material on the Dutch police reform has been kindly provided by Professor Jan Terpstra, University of Nijmegen.

- Because the implementation of the Police Act 2012 is only halfway (and the plans have been changed since 2013), it is very difficult to have an evaluation now. For that reason the Committee says that about five years from now there should be a new evaluation of the Police Act as they expect that only then a more definite evaluation will be possible;

- There has been 'a huge underestimation of the complexity of the process of transition'. There has been too much emphasis (especially during the first three years since the start of the National Police) on top-down management, creating all kinds of resistance and problems. According to the Committee it has been a wise decision to change this style of change management in 2016 (more bottom-up, more time, less pressure on the police).

- The Police Act creates tensions and problems in the relation between the Minister and the Chief Constable. The Minister should be more at a distance and the Chief Constable should have more managerial room.

- The creation of the National Police has had a negative impact on local policing, with the local mayors and municipal councils of the smaller municipalities have lost much of their influence on local policing.

- The creation of national supportive facilities proved to be much more difficult than originally it was assumed (especially the creation of National IT-systems).

The Committee also made a list of twelve recommendations, which include:

- There should be a better distribution of powers and responsibilities in the governance of the police (both nationally and at the regional and local levels).

- The Chief Constable should have more room for making policy and managerial decisions and should be less dependent on the Minister.

- The territorial structure of the police should be changed (many of the areas are too large and/or artificial).

- The national policy and management of the police should leave more room for flexibility and for local initiatives/priorities.

- It is recommended that at the local level a new form of municipal policing be created because the National Police Force neglects the importance of local availability and police presence;

- In 2022 there should be a new evaluation of the Police Act 2012 and the Committee presumes that then it will possible to say more about the implementation of the Police Act and the impact on police performance;

- There are still many challenges, elements that have not been realized until now, but the Committee believes strongly that further progress in this process can be realized within the policy frames of the Police Act 2012. In other words, there is no need for a new Police Act and there should be no return to the regional structure that there used to exist before 2013.

Key findings from the evaluation of the Norwegian police reform[33]

Norwegian police reform is a strategic plan for improving and developing the police service towards 2020. The purpose is to provide an improved and more modern police service, and to provide safety to the public.

Difi the Agency for Public Management and eGovernment are conducting a 4 year evaluation of police reform. In 2017 the key themes explored include management, leadership, culture and attitudes in the police. The findings from the evaluation so far include:

- The term 'community policing reform' is problematic – many functions are in fact centralised
- The goals and intended effects are ambitious and at times contradictory
- Employees and the municipalities have little confidence in reform
- The municipalities are concerned that local knowledge must not be eroded
- The employees want change, but have little confidence that the goals of reform will be reached
- Tight deadlines challenge collaboration with the unions
- Planning and implementation have taken a lot of time and capacity
- Citizen's confidence in the police has increased from 2016 to 2017
- Reform activities are largely on schedule

In regards to culture, attitudes and leadership

- The police culture is complex
- Some common features:
- Action-orientated, proud of their work, taking care of each other
- Self-righteous, lack of interest in cooperating and learning from others, oral tradition
- It takes time to change organisational culture
- Management and leadership issues must be addressed on all levels

Difi's recommendations

- There is a need for clarifying and communicating realistic goals for reform

---

[33] This material on the Norwegian police reform has been kindly provided by Vivi Lassen, Oddbjorg Bakli and Ingunn Botheim.

- The Police Directorate must balance the need for unified management and standardisation with the police districts need for local autonomy and local adoption

- The police's ICT systems should be prioritised

- There is a need for a more long-term approach in governing reform

- Leadership measures have been initiated, but they need to reach further out - also to the first-line managers

- The chiefs of police must be clear about what constitutes the desired organisational culture and management style in their police district

- The police must take into great consideration the need for new competences in order to meet the changes in crime and technology.

Conclusion

Annex two and three have provided a summary of evidence relating to police and fire reform in Scotland in 2017. The evidence was examined regarding how it related to the aims of reform, as well as identifying additional emerging themes and international evidence. This report supplements the work produced in year 3 of the evaluation including a thematic case study of partnership, innovation and prevention, and a revisit of the national key informant's perspective of the reform journey.

Bibliography

Audit Scotland (2017) *i6: A Review* http://www.audit-scotland.gov.uk/uploads/docs/report/2017/nr_170309_i6_review.pdf

Audit Scotland (2017) *Scottish Fire and Rescue Service: Planning report to the audit and risk assurance committee on the 2016/17 audit* http://www.audit-scotland.gov.uk/uploads/docs/report/2017/aap_1617_scottish_fire_rescue.pdf

Audit Scotland (2017) *The 2016/17 audit of the Scottish Police Authority* http://www.audit-scotland.gov.uk/uploads/docs/report/2017/s22_171208_spa.pdf

Hail, Y. (2017) *Local policing in transition: examining the impacts and implications of police reform in Scotland* SIPR Research Summary No 25 http://www.sipr.ac.uk/downloads/Research_Summaries/Research_Summary_25.pdf

HMFSI (2017) *Local area inspection Scottish Borders* http://www.gov.scot/Resource/0051/00513893.pdf

HMFSI (2017) *Local area inspection Moray* http://www.gov.scot/Resource/0052/00527046.pdf

HMFSI (2017) The Scottish Fire and Rescue Service operations control room in Dundee and service delivery and support in Highland, Western Isles, Orkney Islands and Shetland Islands http://www.gov.scot/Resource/0052/00522953.pdf

HMICS (2017) *Annual scrutiny plan 2017-18* https://www.hmics.scot/sites/default/files/publications/HMICS%20Scrutiny%20Plan%202017-18.pdf

HMICS (2017). *Audit and assurance review of stop and search: phase 2* *https://www.hmics.scot/sites/default/files/publications/HMICS%20Audit%20and%20Assurance%20Review%20of%20Stop%20and%20Search%20Phase%202.pdf*

HMICS (2017) Strategic overview of British Transport Police in Scotland including the proposed transfer to Police Scotland *https://www.hmics.scot/sites/default/files/publications/HMICS20171208PUB.pdf*

HMICS (2017) *Corporate strategy 2017-20* https://www.hmics.scot/sites/default/files/publications/HMICS20171130PUB.pdf

HMICS (2017). *Independent Assurance Review Police Scotland – Call Handling Update Report.* https://www.hmics.scot/sites/default/files/publications/HMICS%20Independent%20Assurance%20Review%20Police%20Scotland%20%E2%80%93%20Call%20Handling%20-%20Update%20Report.pdf

HMICS (2017) Local policing+ inspection programme. Inspection of Tayside division
https://www.hmics.scot/sites/default/files/publications/HMICS20171116PUB.pdf

HMICS (2017) *Strategic overview of provision of forensic medical services to victims of sexual crime*
https://www.hmics.scot/sites/default/files/publications/HMICS%20Overview%20of%20Provision%20of%20Forensic%20Medical%20Services%20to%20Victims%20of%20Sexual%20Crime.pdf

HMICS (2017) *Strategic review of undercover policing in Scotland – term of reference*
https://www.hmics.scot/sites/default/files/publications/HMICS%20Strategic%20Review%20of%20Undercover%20Policing%20in%20Scotland%20-%20Terms%20of%20Reference.pdf

HMICS (2017). *Thematic Inspection of the Scottish Police Authority – Phase 1 Review of Openness and Transparency*
https://www.hmics.scot/sites/default/files/publications/HMICS20170621PUB.pdf

HMICS (2017) Thematic inspection of the Scottish Police Authority Forensic Services
https://www.hmics.scot/sites/default/files/publications/HMICS20170627PUB.pdf

HMICS and Care Inspectorate (2017) *Joint thematic review of MAPPA in Scotland: progress review*
https://www.hmics.scot/sites/default/files/publications/HMICS20170629PUB.pdf

Justice Sub-Committee on Policing (2017) *Police Scotland's engagement with black and minority ethnic (BME) communities*. Written submission from Coalition for Racial Equality and Rights
http://www.parliament.scot/S5_JusticeSubCommitteeOnPolicing/General%20Documents/20171026CRER-BME.pdf

Justice Sub-Committee on Policing (2017) *Police Scotland's engagement with black and minority ethnic (BME) communities.* Written submission from Police Scotland
http://www.parliament.scot/S5_JusticeSubCommitteeOnPolicing/General%20Documents/20171026PS-BME.pdf

Justice Sub-Committee on Policing (2017) *Report on governance of the Scottish Policing Authority* https://sp-bpr-en-prod-cdnep.azureedge.net/published/JSP/2017/5/25/Report-on-governance-of-the-Scottish-Police-Authority/1st%20Report,%202017.pdf

Malik, A (2017) *Steering from the centre: The Scottish Police Authority and police governance in Scotland* SIPR Research Summary No. 28
http://www.sipr.ac.uk/downloads/Research_Summaries/Research_Summary_28.pdf

Police Scotland (2017) *Our 10 year strategy for policing in Scotland*
http://www.scotland.police.uk/assets/pdf/138327/386688/policing-2026-
strategy.pdf?link=landing1

Police Scotland (2017) *Policing 2026 Consultation Analysis Report*
https://consult.scotland.police.uk/consultation/2026/results/policing-2026---
consultation-analysis-report.pdf

Scottish Government (2017) Justice in Scotland: Vision and Priorities
http://www.gov.scot/Resource/0052/00522274.pdf

Scottish Government (2017) Justice Vision and Priorities: Delivery Plan 2017-18
http://www.gov.scot/Resource/0052/00522271.pdf

Scottish Police Federation (2017) *Personal protective equipment survey 2017*
http://www.spf.org.uk/wp-content/uploads/2017/11/PPE-Survey-Final-Report.pdf

SFRS (2017) Code of corporate governance
*http://www.firescotland.gov.uk/media/1133907/sfrs_code_of_corporate_governance
_v2.0_may_2017_.pdf*

SFRS (2017) *Communications and engagement strategy 2017-2020*
http://www.firescotland.gov.uk/media/652229/sfrs_comms_and_engagement_strate
gy_v1_0.pdf

SFRS (2017) *Scottish Fire and Rescue Service mainstreaming report 2017*
http://www.firescotland.gov.uk/media/340299/sfrs_mainstreaming_report_2017.pdf

SPA (2017) Annual review of policing 2016/17: Improving policing for Scotland's
communities http://www.spa.police.uk/assets/128635/294812/407810

SPA (2017) Strategic delivery review: quarter two 2017/18
http://www.spa.police.uk/assets/126884/429778/deliveryreview

Williams, J, Newton, A, Talbot, J, Skedgel, C, Herbland, A, Skinner, A, Mikrut, T,
Wilmore, I and Jones, K. (2017). *Broadening Responsibilities: Consideration of the
potential to broaden the role of uniformed fire service employees*. Commissioned by
National Joint Council for Local Authority Fire and Rescue Services (NJC)
https://www.fbu.org.uk/sites/default/files/attachments/Broadening%20Responsibiliti
es%20of%20FRS%20-%20Main%20Report%20-
%20Final%20with%20Summary%20Fo....pdf

social research

GSR
GOVERNMENT SOCIAL RESEARCH
Social Science in Government