

Online Identity Assurance Programme Board (OIAPB)

Minutes of Third meeting

Date: 8 November 2018

Venue: St Andrew's House, Edinburgh

Attendees:

Doreen Grove (Open Government, Scottish Government), **Penni Rocks** (eHealth, Scottish Government), **Ruchir Shah** (SCVO), **Gavin McLachlan** (University of Edinburgh) (Chair, Expert Group), **Geoff Huggins** (NHS Education for Scotland), **Martyn Wallace** (Scottish Local Government Digital Office), **Douglas Shirlaw** (COSLA), **Andy McClintock** (Chief Digital Officer, Scottish Government),

Apologies:

Colin Cook (Director Digital, Scottish Government), **Greg Colgan** (SOLACE)

Online Identity Assurance (OIA) Project Team:

Roger Halliday (Chief Statistician and Chief Data Officer) (Chairing in Colin's absence), **Susie Braham** (Strategic Lead), **Mike Crockart** (Delivery Lead), **Gavin Ross** (Policy and Governance Lead), **Maria Campbell** (Communications and Engagement Lead), **Lesley Allen** (Transformation Manager), **Ross Clark** (Communications and Engagement), **Madeleine Fleming** (Policy Support Officer), **Rob Pengilley** (Office of the Chief Information Officer).

1. Welcome and introductions

1.1 Roger Halliday welcomed all to the meeting. Roger highlighted some changes to membership of the group. Greg Colgan, from Dundee City Council is the new SOLACE representative, replacing Esther Gunn-Stewart. Geoff Huggins now represents NHS Education for Scotland. Roger also highlighted changes within the OIA Programme Team, introducing Lesley Allen who will take over from Susie Braham on an interim basis, following Susie's departure on maternity leave.

2. Note and actions from the first meeting

Paper – First Meeting Minutes

- 2.1 Progress against actions were noted, with all previous actions completed.
- 2.2 The minutes were approved.

3. Update on Progress since last meeting May 23

Paper – OIAPB-09 – Updated Programme Plan

- 3.1 Susie outlined the progress made since the last meeting, including a period of pre-Alpha planning work and recent internal assurance reviews.
- 3.2 Ruchir commented that feedback he has heard from stakeholders about the processes that have been taken to date has been positive, with the impression that this is a well-informed programme. He credited this as being due to the open and consultative way that the programme has been run from the beginning.
- 3.3 The board noted the updated programme plan.

4. Stakeholder and Communications Update

Paper – OIAPB-10 – Draft Communications and Engagement Strategy

- 4.1 Maria presented the draft communications and engagement strategy, encompassing both the Stakeholder Engagement plan and Programme Vision.
- 4.3 The Board provided comment in the following areas:
 - The Board would like to see more mention of why Scottish Government is doing this work in this way, e.g. people having trust in public services.
 - Measurable indicators should be articulated clearly to ensure that we are reaching out to all areas of the population
 - Security and cyber security providers should be included within the list of stakeholder groups.

- Focus for any citizen engagement should be on showing people what having a digital identity could mean for them and how they can use it, as opposed to general awareness raising about the programme.
- The 5Rights agenda should be included within the programme vision.
- The vision should also make mention of how people will be supported if they have problems accessing or using their digital identity.

Action Point 08/11/18-1: OIA Team to update the Stakeholder Engagement plan and Programme Vision to reflect the comments of the board

5. Expert Group Feedback

Paper – OIAPB-11 – Expert Group Third Meeting Feedback

5.1 Gavin McLachlan presented the Feedback from the Expert Group (at **Annex A**), which the Board noted.

5.2 Following a question from the Open Government network on self sovereign identity, Ruchir asked if the programme was considering the full spectrum of potential digital identity technologies. Gavin McLachlan replied that there are a number of technologies at different maturities and that the intention of the programme should be to be open to new technology approaches if and when they become available.

6. Plans for Alpha

Paper – OIAPB-12 – Plans for Alpha

6.1 Mike introduced the plans for alpha, outlining the two work stream structure detailed in OIAPB-12.

6.2 The discussion that followed covered the following points:

- The different options for developing digital identity including personal data stores and using existing sources of digital identity.

- It was clarified that biometrics (e.g. facial recognition) was within the scope of the work.
- The development of identity standards in this programme was highlighted
- That there is a need for a less technical version of the plans for alpha to share with people who are not familiar with the work and wider interests
- The need for clearer information about how the partnership with OIX will work to deliver the alpha

Action 08/11/18-2: The OIA Programme team (Communications and Engagement Team) to consider how to communicate the plans for Alpha in a non-technical way

7. Digital First Assessment Outcomes

7.1 Mike outlined the outcomes of the recent Digital First (D1) internal assessment. The Digital First Service Standard is a set of 22 criteria that all digital services developed by Scottish Central Government sector organisations and Scottish Government corporate services must meet. He explained the criteria which are not yet met and what is being done to address these. Mike was asked for clarifications as to what type of open licence will be used for publishing the outcomes from the OIX work.

7.3 The Board also asked about the options available to services who would require an identity solution before the first proposed live service comes on stream in 2020. Further discussions and planning are required for services which are seeking to be an early adopter of a common approach.

Action 08/11/18-3: OIA Team to share details of the open licence for sharing OIX outcomes.

Action 08/11/18-4: OIA Programme Team to arrange to meet Geoff around the potential for early adopter services, within health.

8. Next Steps

8.1 The next meeting is proposed to be scheduled for February 2019 and dates will be circulated.

8.2 Under AOB, one further question asked at the meeting was about how recent announcements about the future of Gov.uk Verify affect this programme. The OIA

Team clarified that GDS is involved in the Alpha from a standards perspective and would be informing this element of the work programme.

8.3 An invitation was extended to Ruchir to write a guest post on the programme for the Digital Scotland blog.

Action 08/11/18-5: OIA Team to contact Ruchir regarding a potential guest blog post

Actions Log

Number	Owner	Description	Progress	Status
08/11/18-1	OIA Team	OIA Team to update the Stakeholder Engagement plan and Programme Vision to reflect the comments of the board	07/12/18 - Completed Stakeholder Engagement plan and Programme Vision updated.	Closed
08/11/18-2	OIA Team	The OIA Programme team (Communications and Engagement Team) to consider how to communicate the plans for Alpha in a non-technical way	10/01/18 – Closed, added to communications and stakeholder plans.	Closed
08/11/18-3	OIA Team	OIA Team to share details of the open licence for sharing OIX outcomes.	Updated: 06/02/19 – OIX will publish a white paper with outcomes of Alpha without licencing requirements.	Open
08/11/18-4	OIA Team	OIA Programme Team to arrange to meet Geoff around the potential for early adopter services, within health.	Meeting held 05/03/19 – potential early adopted services identified.	Closed
08/11/18-5:	OIA Team	OIA Team to contact Ruchir regarding a potential guest blog post	07/12/18 Blog post with Ruchir published	Closed
23/5/18-1	OIA Team	OIA team to prepare document classification information for use by the Programme Board, and for this to be circulated	02/11/18 Agreed terminology for sharing of papers. Expectation is all are “for publication” with exceptions labelled such as “publication following approval of the Programme Board”	Closed
23/5/18-2	OIA Team	OIA team to engage with colleagues in Health, Social Security and Local Government as potential Service Providers, to include within the alpha phase. This should include work to further define the service	09/7/18 Workshop scheduled for 25 July 2018. 02/11/18 Plans for alpha published, ongoing engagement with Service Providers as part of programme.	Closed

		questions that an alpha would answer.		
23/5/18-3	OIA Team	OIA team to engage Improvement Service and GDS to help scope and plan the alpha phase.	20/6/18 – workshop with Improvement Service planned. 02/11/18 – both involved in scope and planning of alpha, ongoing interactions with both IS and GDS as part of programme.	Closed
23/5/18-4	OIA Team	OIA team to develop communications and messaging, aimed at clear methods of communicating the aims, activities and benefits of the programme.	02/11/18 Draft Communications and Stakeholder Engagement strategy and product vision for consideration and 08/11/18 Programme Board.	Closed
26/1/18-1	OIA Team	OIA team to update the Remit and Terms of Reference with the changes indicated.	23/5/18 – Remit updated and accepted by Board	Closed
26/1/18-2	OIA Team	OIA Team to invite a representative from COSLA to the Programme Board	23/5/18 – Douglas Shirlaw invited and attended	Closed
26/1/18-3	OIA Team	OIA team to consider how to approach additional external experts.	23/5/18 – completed, OIA team contacted a number of organisations and individuals with specific expertise in this area during the Discovery phase.	Closed
26/1/18-4	OIA Team	OIA team to amend the stakeholder plan with the changes proposed.	23/5/18 – updated and published.	Closed
26/1/18-5	OIA Team	OIA Team to circulate the proposed membership for the Expert Group to the Programme Board.	23/5/18 – completed following first meeting.	Closed

Feedback from Expert Group to Programme Board

1. Data Strategy and Policy

- The Strategy should create links to the **Young Scot 5Rights** agenda – How Scotland can realise the rights of children and young people in the digital world
- 2 areas within the Strategy have deliverables for OIA: firstly the updated **Privacy Principles**; secondly legal documentation or intellectual property rights – it is important to consider the sequencing of this work
- **A data strategy policy definition** is required, and there also needs to be a mapping exercise to take forward **Data Protection Impact assessments** – There are likely to be elements from the UK Privacy and Consumer Advisory Group DPIA and World Bank ID principles which could be reused
- An OIA **Trust Framework** should be developed, encompassing standards, legislation, commercial relationships and liability
- The programme needs to consider **sequencing and the timetable** for developing the data strategy in conjunction with the technical delivery of the Alpha.
- There was some concern within the expert group that the wider work on policy might slow down the OIA project.
- Need to ensure we address the concerns from many of the same groups who had concerns about the previous identity proposals.
- There will be two outputs from this Data Strategy and policy work, to inform:
 - Online identity policy and principals
 - The legal documents signed by citizen and service provider

2. Detailed Plans for Alpha

- **Opportunities for Scottish SMEs** – need for more targeted communications about opportunities for involvement with programme, including making it clear that “observers” can be involved in the OIX work
- **Lessons learned** should be drawn from the experiences of both Verify and myaccount wherever possible
- There were questions on whether the Alpha was focussed on **Integration or User Experience** – it was confirmed that it will focus on both
- **Communications and engagement** should include wider work with privacy groups and citizen engagement
- A clear plan is required for how **business change** will be managed with so many organisations working together during the Alpha
- It was agreed that an **OIX representative** should be an attendee at Expert Group meetings, for the duration of the Alpha

- The risk of commercial companies pitching directly to service providers should be added to the **Risk Register**
- The Expert Group proposed a large 6 month Alpha including **Disclosure Scotland** and a **Local Authority**
- We proposed two streams within the Alpha:
 1. Prove **reuse** - myaccount to Local Authorities
 2. Prove **vulnerable person's needs** - more disclosure Scotland
- We should set a **target number of citizens** who should experience and comment on the Alpha – needs to be a large enough number to sufficiently test

3. **Product Vision**

- **Accountability/transparency** – The vision should include a section stating that Scottish Government will build trust and accountability around data use.
- Consider whether this programme might contribute to a **standards based open market**
- Suggested adding a description on benefits to **commercial providers**
- Suggested adding a description on benefits to Scottish **Government**
- Need to add a statement about the **mobile use case** – most online services will be accessed through mobiles in the future – it must be “mobile first” in design, vision and delivery.

4. **User Research**

- A plan is required for how we will deal with those who are '**digitally disenfranchised on purpose**'- i.e. have the ability to access services online but choose not to.
- **User Research** - The importance of identifying the target number of users for testing under the project objectives. Consulting a wide range of citizens in the course of the programme was emphasised.
- The **full service wrap** of the Online Identity Assurance product, including support for users and relying parties should be considered and addressed in the Business Case to be developed during the Alpha