

# Online Identity Assurance National Stakeholder Group

## Minutes of Second Meeting

Date: 19 June 2018

Venue: The Melting Pot, 5 Rose Street, Edinburgh

---

### Attendees (Members of the National Stakeholder Group)

Roger Halliday	Scottish Government (Chair)
Bob Miller	Argyll and Bute Council
Geraldine Eastwood	Northern Ireland Civil Services
Niamh Webster	Scottish Government Ingage Team
Danielle Logan	Young Scot
David Laughlin	National Entitlement Card Programme Office
John Welford	No2ID
Penni Rocks	Scottish Government Health and Social Care Integration
Emma Harvey	Scottish Government Ingage Team
Arlene Stuart	Scottish Government Social Security
Debbie Walker	Transport Scotland
David Lord	No2ID
Douglas White	Carnegie UK Trust
Iain Forrester	Citizens Advice Scotland
Kirsten Urquhart	Young Scot
Stuart Law	National Records of Scotland
Martyn Wallace	Local Government Digital Office
Anna Grant	Carnegie UK Trust
Gordon Hanning	Transport Scotland
Lee Calder	Registers of Scotland
Andy Campbell	Improvement Service

### Apologies (Members)

John Finlay	Transport Scotland
Rachel Heydecker	Carnegie UK Trust
Alan Ferrier	National Records of Scotland
Emma Pollock	Education Scotland
Joy Bramfitt-Wanless	Disclosure Scotland
Douglas Shirlaw	Convention of Scottish Local Authorities (COSLA)
Cameron Walker	Improvement Service
Paul Dymock	Student Awards Agency for Scotland
David McNeill	SCVO
Tommy Laughlin	Scotland IS
Stephanie Brown	Registers of Scotland

### Attendees (Public Registration)

Harriet de Wet	We are Snook
Stuart Young	etive
Alex Stobart	Mydex
Jackie Devine	Kainos

Derick James	Symphonics Software
Bruce Ryan	Public Interest
Luke Jeavons	Soprasteria

### **Attendees (Scottish Government 'Programme Team' and Digital Directorate Delivery Partners)**

Susie Braham	Scottish Government
Mike Crockart	Scottish Government
Gavin Ross	Scottish Government
Jess Roscoe	Scottish Government
Stephen Peacock	Scottish Government
Ross Clark	Scottish Government
Leona Devlin	Scottish Government
Gillian Munro	Scottish Government
Andy Robertson	Independent Assurance Review Team
George Whitley	Independent Assurance Review Team

### **Item 1 – Welcome and Introductions**

1. Roger Halliday welcomed all to the second meeting of the National Stakeholder Group and provided a brief overview of the work that was completed during the Discovery Phase of the Scottish Government Online Identity Assurance Programme along with an outline of the work that is underway to move the programme on to Alpha.

### **Item 2 – Minutes and Actions from First Meeting on 9 February 2018 (Paper OIASG – First Meeting Minutes)**

2. Jess Roscoe provided a description of how the feedback from the workshop held at the first National Stakeholder Group meeting has been used to develop the approach to delivery of the programme (at **Annex A** of Paper OIASG – First Meeting Minutes).

3. Attendees noted the minutes without comment.

### **Item 3 – Updated Remit and Terms of Reference (Paper OIASG-04)**

4. Attendees noted the inclusion of new members to the Group.

### **Item 4 – Outputs from the Discovery Exercise (Paper OIASG-05)**

5. Susie Braham presented some of the outputs of the '[Online Identity Assurance Discovery Service Design](#)' report, prepared by WeAre Snook.

6. Susie provided detail on the **3 recurring themes** contained within the report, these are:

- **Convenient**

Interviewees had expressed frustration with having to deal with:

- complex services

- navigating through different governments and agencies
  - forms that are asking the same things in different ways
  - providing the same information to multiple departments and agencies.
- **Cautious**  
Research indicated that people were concerned with:
    - the reliability of organisations to hold personal data securely
    - access and control of personal data
    - the need for a range of options to suit people's motivations and concerns.

- **Barriers to Access**

The report indicates that significant consideration should be given to those individuals who lack digital skills, use assisted technologies or do not have online access from home. It is likely that third sector groups who support clients with their online applications will be affected by this work and care should be taken to understand their needs.

7. The report also outlines 'Seven Easy Steps' which map a hypothetical user journey to illustrate the basic components of an online identity service.

8. Mike Crockart provided an overview of the key points that emerged from the **Technical Options Discovery** noting that:

- There is unlikely to be a "One size fits all" solution which could be implemented, we will need an approach that could allow multiple digital identity solutions to be used.
- This approach could take a number of forms such as a catalogue or portal but it should allow for integration and a common user experience.
- There is a need for segregation to prevent data being combined to create an aggregated view of a person without their knowledge.
- Existing Scottish identity assets on their own are not sufficient on their own but could be part of any future solution or part of a migration path. GOV.UK Verify should also be part of the solution if we can "plug in" to it and provide a common approach for existing Verify users.
- Any solution should be prepared to build support for hard to reach groups
- We should explore digital identity solutions built around an optional Personal Data Store to address both identity and personal data requirements and also work with an eye to the future to support migration to a Distributed Ledger Technology (DLT) / Blockchain if that technology becomes mature.
- Additional clarity is needed to determine how much control the user should have over the sources that data is taken from, and also how much control and choice users should have over where their attribute data is stored.

## **Item 5 – Open Government and Communications Update**

9. Ross Clark presented an update on Open Government and informed the Group of upcoming communications and engagement work.

## **Item 6 – Updated Programme Plan (Paper OIASG-06)**

10. Gavin Ross set out the measures being taken ahead of Alpha to ensure the solution to be delivered is financially and technically feasible, will involve public sector partners and produce a prototype solution that can be tested with users.

11. Gavin also provided feedback from the recent Programme Board and Expert Group meetings, which included:

- The need for diligence in balancing service provider and user needs,
- The desirability of service specific research,
- The need to clearly define a set of key goals and measurable improvements.

## **Item 7 – Views on the programme so far**

12. Attendees were divided into tables for the workshop discussions and asked to consider and share their views on the programme so far (as described in the items above). The following questions were used to facilitate the discussion:

- What did the Discovery do well?
- What did the Discovery do less well?
- What should we do more of in Alpha?
- What should we do less of in Alpha?
- What feedback should we take to the Minister tomorrow?

13. **Annex A** contains the outputs from the workshop discussion.

## **Future meetings**

14. The next full meeting of the National Stakeholder Group is planned to take place around the **end of October**. Further details will be issued by the project team nearer the date.

## **Actions**

15. No actions were indicated at this meeting.

## **Any Other Business**

16. There were no items of AOB.

## Online Identity Assurance National Stakeholder Group Outputs from Second Meeting Workshop Discussion

1. The National Stakeholder Group were asked to reflect and share their thoughts on the programme to date and to consider and comment on the Alpha (as it was described in the first half of the meeting). The following themes emerged from these discussions:

Phase	DISCOVERY		ALPHA
Question	a) what went well during the discovery phase?	b) what could have been improved during the discovery phase?	c) what should we do more of?
Comments from the Group	Communications and engagement with stakeholders have been helpful, in particular our approach to Open Government and the publishing of papers and blogs online.	The Group requested that we communicate the content of the technical discovery more clearly.	It was suggested that we do more to better understand the needs of service providers – designing a process based on specific services and, where appropriate, using data available to partners.
	The Group indicated that they are happy with the broad membership of the Group and the level of consultation we have had with stakeholders.	Some queries were raised regarding the 'ask' of the Group and how the Programme Board and Expert Group's remit sit alongside the National Stakeholder Group.	We should be mindful of, and incorporate, user experience throughout the design process and be especially careful to engage with all demographics to ensure their needs are reflected.

	The Group were largely enthusiastic with regards to the approach to user research and were pleased to have had the opportunity to attend and contribute to the Discovery Phase of the programme at the Show and Tell in March.	The Group expressed some concerns about how we are interacting with, and including the needs of, service providers in this programme and in particular how myaccount will play into this work.	Privacy must be a key consideration throughout Alpha.
		The Group asked for greater clarity on the objective of alpha and how it will affect the success of the programme.	We should consider the broad range of interests within the Group and reflect this by ensuring we provide clearer explanation on technical issues.

2. The Scottish Government OIA programme team plan to take on the feedback raised at during the workshop session, with a view to addressing these over the coming months. Progress in this area will be covered at the next National Stakeholder Group meeting.

**NEW ACTION 19/6/18-1** For the OIA programme team to take on board the feedback shared during the workshop discussion (Annex A), to inform the next phase of the work.