

BRIEFING FOR THE FIRST MINISTER

BUSINESS FOR SCOTLAND ANNUAL DINNER

19 January 2023

Key message	A successful economy can help people live happier, healthier and more fulfilling lives. We would use the full powers of independence to build an inclusive, fair, wellbeing economy that works for everyone in Scotland.
What	A 15 minute keynote address
Why	Opportunity to engage with key stakeholders on Government's commitment to continue to work in collaboration with business to make Scotland fairer and more prosperous.
Who	Up to 350 Business for Scotland (BfS) members and their guests who are pro-independence
Where	Crowne Plaza Glasgow, Congress Road , Glasgow G3 8QT Venue tel: 0141 306 9988
When	19 January 2023, 18:30 – 21:55 FM will attend 18:30 – 20:00 <i>Ops Note to follow separately</i>
Likely themes	Business for Scotland Chief Executive, Gordon MacIntyre-Kemp, has suggested that your speech might cover: <ul style="list-style-type: none">• Recognising the role of Business for Scotland (BfS) as a Think Tank with a strong focus on the Wellbeing Economy• Economy narrative – including the impact of Brexit• Signal that SG is keen to engage with business• “Road to Independence” – BfS is keen for the event to offer clarity eg outlining the pros and cons of particular approaches• GERS• Independence Currency Paper [Redacted S.30(b)(i)]
Media	<i>Communications Plan To follow separately</i>
Supporting official	Emily Mackintosh, Special Adviser
Attached documents	<i>Speech to follow separately</i> Annex A: Purpose, Agenda and Key Lines to Take Annex B: BfS Background and Biographies of key guests Annex C: Independence {Redacted S.30(b)(i)} Annex D: Economy Key Messages

PURPOSE, AGENDA AND KEY LINES TO TAKE

Purpose and Background to event

You have agreed to deliver the keynote address at the Annual Business for Scotland Dinner. The event, usually attended by a business audience of around 350 guests, offers attendees the opportunity to network over dinner and enjoy speeches in the company of some of Scotland's politicians and business people. Guests will mainly be from SMEs, 70% of which are from across central Scotland and largely supporters of Scottish independence.

Gordon MacIntyre-Kemp is **keen for you to meet** [Redacted S.38(1)(b)] who have relocated to Edinburgh and are key supporters of independence as well as investors. [Redacted S.38(1)(b)] who is keen to invest significantly in Scotland. These guest will be introduced during the VIP reception.

Running Order: (amended to accommodate FM's diary commitments).

6:15pm: Guest arrival and VIP drinks reception with FM (FM to arrive nearer 6:30pm)

7:00pm: Guests called into the main hall

7:05pm: First Minister and other Top Table guests piped in followed by performance by VIP [Redacted S.38(1)(b)]

7:15pm: Host welcome and introduction to the FM - [Redacted S.38(1)(b)] - Comedian and YouTuber

7:25pm: Keynote speech by Nicola Sturgeon MSP, First Minister of Scotland

7:45pm: FM re-joins Top Table after speech, **leaving at 8PM**

KEY MESSAGES AND LINES TO TAKE

Economy

- Our vision for Scotland is to transition to a **wellbeing economy** - that is, an economic system which serves people and planet first and foremost.
- Wellbeing is an explicit part of our national purpose as a country, underpinning Scotland's National Performance Framework. It is Scotland's strategic wellbeing framework.
- Our **National Strategy for Economic Transformation** sets our vision for a wellbeing economy and contains bold actions, within the powers and budget available to us, to deliver prosperity for all Scotland's people and places, within safe environmental limits.
- We are **committed to working with businesses that understand the need to put societal wellbeing and environmental sustainability at the heart of their strategies.**

Building a New Scotland

- People in Scotland have given a clear mandate for a referendum on independence.
- I am pleased that, on 10 January this year, a majority of members elected to Parliament by the people of Scotland backed a motion calling on the UK Government to respect the right of people in Scotland to choose their constitutional future.
- Independence provides the **opportunity to use new powers to pursue priorities tailored to Scotland's needs** – including the full range of economic and other policy tools to take decisions based on our own needs.
- Independence will allow us the chance to replicate the success of many neighbouring countries which are more prosperous, productive and fairer than the UK.
- According to **GERS, Scotland's notional deficit in 2021-22 has fallen** rapidly (from 22.7% to 12.3%) and has fallen faster than the UK's, due to Scotland's oil and gas industry.
- **Scotland's notional deficit can be expected to fall further and faster than the UK's** next year, with the UK continuing to benefit from Scotland's natural wealth to fund its response to the cost crisis.
- **Using sterling at the point of independence makes sense, providing continuity** to people, business and the economy.
- Moving to a Scottish pound in due course would give Scotland control over monetary policy - which can be used directly as part of Scotland's macroeconomic framework.
- **Scotland would continue to use the pound until the time is right** to move to a Scottish pound.
- Continuing to use the pound would be a sensible interim arrangement and would also provide time to set up the new institutions we'll need as a newly independent state.
- The UK Government's decision to take Scotland out of the **EU Single Market** is damaging Scottish trade and the economy.
- **The best thing for Scottish trade is independence and re-joining the EU.**
- For trade in Scottish manufactured goods, international markets are more significant than UK.
- Remember that Scotland is the rest of the UK's second biggest market

Energy Strategy

- The draft ESJTP, launched on 10 January, sets out our vision that, by 2045, Scotland will have a flourishing, climate friendly energy system that delivers affordable, resilient and clean energy supplies for Scotland's households, communities and businesses.
- We are taking action to transform and expand Scotland's energy generation sector and transform the way we use energy – reducing demand across our heat, industry

and transport sectors and replacing fossil fuel demand with zero carbon technologies.

- We must seize the huge opportunity that the energy transition presents and deliver maximum benefits to Scotland's people, communities and economy from our vast renewable energy resources.
- The consultation is open until 4th April, we welcome views to help shape the final ESJTP.

Green Freeports – Firth of Forth and Inverness and Cromarty Firth (announced 13 Jan 2023)

- We were delighted to announce on Friday that Inverness and Cromarty Firth and the Firth of Forth are the two Green Freeport locations selected jointly by Scottish and UK Ministers.
- Green Freeports will support businesses to create high-quality, well-paid new jobs; promote regeneration; and make a significant contribution to achieving our net zero ambitions.
- We look forward to working closely with the successful consortia in order to ensure that they deliver maximum positive impact as soon as possible.

Contact: [Redacted S.38(1)(b)]

ANNEX B

BFS BACKGROUND AND BIOGRAPHIES

Business for Scotland

Business for Scotland Ltd is a business network, business and economic policy lobbying and economic consulting company that runs multiple social policy and political campaigns. Believe in Scotland is the name of one of Business for Scotland's campaigns.

Believe in Scotland is the national co-ordinating body for the grassroots Yes campaign. We offer support service training and campaign materials to 128 local independence campaigning groups and 5 national campaign groups who are affiliated to Believe in Scotland. Believe in Scotland therefor is 133 affiliated Yes campaigns working cooperatively to promote Scottish independence.

Gordon MacIntyre-Kemp, Founder and Chief Executive of Business for Scotland.



Before joining Business for Scotland as its MD and CEO Gordon ran a social media and sales & marketing consultancy. He worked as an economic development planning professional, and in marketing roles specialising in pricing modelling and promotional evaluation for global companies. He is a proponent of the emerging New Economics School.

[Redacted S.38(1)(b)]

ANNEX C

INDEPENDENCE [Redacted S.30(b)(i)]

The Supreme Court judgment has demonstrated the weakness of the UK's constitution.

- No matter how the people of Scotland vote, or how often they elect parliaments that support a referendum and support independence, they can be told 'no' by the UK Prime Minister.
- This cannot be right, and there are few stronger or more powerful arguments for independence than that.

ECONOMIC & FISCAL IMPLICATIONS

There is no reason whatsoever that Scotland could not emulate the success of comparable independent European countries that are far wealthier per head than the UK.

- As an independent member of the EU, free from the damage of Brexit, Scotland would be part of the huge Single Market, which is seven times the size of the UK.
- Pre-pandemic, Norway's national income per head was around 48% higher than the UK's, Ireland's 45% higher, Denmark's 30%, Netherlands' 25% and Austria's was 24% higher (all figures 2019).
- Through membership of the EU, independent Ireland has dramatically reduced its trade dependence on the UK, diversifying into Europe and in the process its national income per head has overtaken the UK's.

FUTURE OIL & GAS REVENUE

The Scottish Government would set up a dedicated Building a New Scotland Fund to invest up to £20bn over the first decade of an independent Scotland.

- This would be funded from oil and gas revenues and other windfall income, and where necessary from borrowing.
- The economy paper recognises that oil and gas production will decline over the longer term and that such revenues are volatile.
- That is why we have been clear that these revenues would not be used to support day-to-day resource spending.

DEFICIT & DEBT

Independence would provide the Scottish Government with full powers to manage the economy and public finances effectively and in a way that meets the needs of Scotland.

- We recognise that, in the early years of independence, we may need to borrow to balance the needs of ongoing public service provision whilst ensuring that long-

term investment projects to support Scotland's resilience and enable inclusive, Net Zero, and sustainable growth are prioritised.

- Setting credible and responsible fiscal rules, and demonstrating that there is a plan in place to meet them, is essential to ensuring market confidence in a newly independent Scotland.

According to GERS, Scotland's notional deficit in 2021-22 has fallen rapidly (from 22.7% to 12.3%) and has fallen faster than the UK's, due to Scotland's oil and gas industry.

- Scotland's notional deficit can be expected to fall further and faster than the UK's next year, with the UK continuing to benefit from Scotland's natural wealth to fund its response to the cost crisis.
- The IFS states that Scotland's budget deficit in 2022-23 is likely to be similar to the UK as a whole, for the first time in over a decade. (IFS, 1 Dec 2022)

PENSIONS

The position on pensions is the same as was set out in the 2013 White Paper: current pensioners will receive their pensions as now – on time and in full, with all accrued pensions rights honoured and protected.

- The Scottish Government fully recognises the importance of pensions, whether occupational or State, to the people of Scotland.
- For those people living in Scotland in receipt of the UK state pension at the time of independence, the responsibility for the payment of that pension will transfer to the Scottish Government.
- Clearly, following a vote for independence, the Scottish and UK Governments would open negotiations on a range of issues. This would cover distribution of existing UK liabilities and assets, including those relating to pensions.

An independent Scotland will have full powers to protect and improve both state and occupational pensions, encourage saving for secure retirement, and set the State Pension Age at a level appropriate to Scottish circumstances.

CURRENCY

Using sterling at the point of independence makes sense, because it provides people, business and the economy with continuity. However, moving to a Scottish pound in due course would give Scotland control over monetary policy - which can be used directly as part of Scotland's macroeconomic framework.

EU ACCESSION/MEMBERSHIP

There is a clear process for joining the EU, provided for in Article 49 of the Treaty of the European Union. We understand and respect the conditions and process which an independent Scotland would be required to meet and follow.

- Where possible and appropriate, Scotland is continuing to align with EU law which will ease the path for Scotland's re-accession to the EU as an independent state.
- The terms of membership will be subject to negotiations with the European Commission, the European Parliament and EU member states, consistent with the EU treaties.
- Given the merit-based nature of the EU accession process, Scotland would be well placed to fulfil the requirements smoothly and quickly.
- We also already have a high degree of legal and regulatory alignment with the EU body of law.

JOINING THE EURO

Joining the euro does not happen automatically after joining the EU.

- Joining the euro would happen only when an independent Scotland decided this was the right course of action to take, and only once the conditions for doing so (known as the convergence criteria) were met.
- The convergence, or Maastricht, criteria measure EU member states' preparedness to adopt the euro. They are defined as a set of macroeconomic indicators, which focus on: price stability, sound public finances, exchange-rate stability and long-term interest rates.
- The timing of adoption of the euro by member states is determined by the speed at which the required convergence criteria are met. This can be many years after joining the EU.
 - Sweden, for example, joined in 1995 and does not use the Euro.
 - Bulgaria, Czechia, Hungary, Poland, and Romania, still retain their own currencies, in some cases approaching 20 years after accession.

BORDERS

The UK Government's decision to take Scotland out of the EU Single Market is damaging Scottish trade and the economy. The best thing for Scottish trade is independence and re-joining the EU.

- This will remove Brexit trade barriers with 27 countries and provide the ability to trade freely within a market seven times by population than the size of the UK.
- The benefits of EU membership would be felt by business and, especially, by exporters.
- The OBR expect UK GDP to be 4% lower as a result of Brexit in the long run. This equates to around £100 billion in output and £40 billion in public revenues lost as a consequence of Brexit each and every year.
- In Scotland, this equates to a cut in public revenues of around £3 billion per year.

For trade in Scottish manufactured goods, international markets are more significant than the UK.

- The data for 2019 shows that the value of Scotland's manufactured goods exports to the EU and the rest of the world was £19 billion, higher than the value of

manufactured exports to the rest of the United Kingdom at £11 billion. This is why international markets are such critical trading relationships for Scotland.

BORDER WITH rUK –

This is only an issue because of Brexit and the UK Government’s disastrous hard Brexit policy.

- Under an arrangement called the Common Travel Area, people would be able to move freely across the UK and Ireland as now. It is in all parties’ interests for that to continue in the event of Scottish independence.
- Nobody would seriously argue that Scotland would not remain in the Common Travel Area. But in addition people in Scotland will regain their free movement rights across the EU.

Remember that Scotland is the rest of the UK’s second biggest market.

- Exports from the rest of the UK to Scotland were worth £66bn in 2019.
- Of course, it would be in both sides’ interests to make trade between Scotland and England as easy as possible.
- While we will need to work through the regulatory and customs issues in a way that will fulfil the requirements of EU membership, the benefits of being in a marketplace around seven times the size of the UK outweigh the challenges.
- Our prospectus sets out several pragmatic measures to facilitate trade between Scotland and the UK.
- As an EU member state in its own right Ireland diversified its trade and became substantially wealthier.

ANNEX D

ECONOMY KEY MESSAGES

WELLBEING ECONOMY

Our vision for Scotland is to transition to a wellbeing economy - that is, an economic system which serves people and planet first and foremost.

- Wellbeing is an explicit part of our national purpose as a country, underpinning Scotland’s National Performance Framework. It is Scotland’s strategic wellbeing framework.
- Scotland is leading the wellbeing economy agenda on the international stage and we are proud to be founding members of the Wellbeing Economy Governments network (WeGo) with New Zealand and Iceland.
- Last year we published a Wellbeing Economy Monitor to track our progress towards realising our vision. We also published a Wellbeing Economy Toolkit to support local councils and regional economic partnerships to embed wellbeing economy principles into their economic plans and strategies.
- Examples of our work to build a wellbeing economy in practice include our policies on: Just Transition to Net Zero, Community Wealth Building, Scottish National

Investment Bank core missions, our approach to becoming a Fair Work Nation, and legislation and policies on the Circular Economy, Land Reform, and our strategic mission and plans to tackle Child Poverty.

ECONOMIC TRANSFORMATION

Our National Strategy for Economic Transformation sets our vision for a wellbeing economy and contains bold actions, within the powers and budget available to us, to deliver prosperity for all Scotland's people and places, within safe environmental limits.

- The strategy's programmes and actions are focused around delivering on our ambitions for a fairer, greener and wealthier economy, in which sustainable, inclusive growth and improving productivity are regarded as important building blocks of a wellbeing economy – not ends in themselves.
- In light of the intensification of the cost crisis since NSET was published, work is underway to prioritise and bring forward the actions which will help mitigate these pressures whilst ensuring the foundations are there to transform the Scottish economy over the next ten years. These were included within the programme delivery plans published last month (31 Oct).
- **Equality Impact Assessments** for each of the strategy's programmes, along with an EQIA on the strategy as a whole, were published on 31 October alongside NSET delivery plans.
 - a **Centre of Expertise in Equality and Human Rights** has been established within the SG to embed human rights and equality in economic policy development.

BUSINESS PURPOSE

We are committed to working with businesses that understand the need to put societal wellbeing and environmental sustainability at the heart of their strategies.

- Purposeful businesses play a pivotal role in solving societal and environmental problems. They benefit from increased innovation, engaged workforces, productivity and long-term profitability.
- Last week (10 Jan) we published our response to the Business Purpose Commission for Scotland's report setting out where we are already making progress and where we plan to build on our approach to promote purposeful business in Scotland.

ITEM 2 - Business for Scotland annual dinner (19 January 2023) – running order – emails between Business for Scotland and Scottish Government

From: [Redacted S.38(1)(b)]@businessforscotland.co.uk>

Sent: Thursday, January 5, 2023 4:54 PM

To: [Redacted S.38(1)(b)]@gov.scot>

Cc: [Redacted S.38(1)(b)]@businessforscotland.co.uk; [Redacted S.38(1)(b)]@gov.scot>

Subject: Re: Rescheduling the FM address to the BfS Annual Dinner - CONFIRMED DATE AS THURSDAY 19 JANUARY 2023

Hi [Redacted S.38(1)(b)]

Attached is the internal running order that we are working with at the moment. Unlikely to be any major changes.

Thanks,

[Redacted S.38(1)(b)]

On 5 Jan 2023, at 16:41, [Redacted S.38(1)(b)]@gov.scot> wrote:

Hi [Redacted S.38(1)(b)]

Happy New Year to you, too.

Thanks for that prompt confirmation. [Redacted S.38(1)(b)] will be in touch to arrange a suitable time with you and [Redacted S.38(1)(b)].

Thanks for confirmation that you are keen for the First Minister to arrive in time for the reception. From memory (not always reliable!) this wasn't part of the original discussion and I'm unable to confirm at this stage whether there is scope in First Minister's calendar to arrive by that time. We will pursue with her office and see what we can do.

If you can provide the final programme, as soon as possible that may help us achieve that. In addition, if you can offer an indication of anyone in particular that you would wish the First Minister to meet at the reception that may also be useful. I can't see a programme on your website.

I've just issued a calendar invite for 14:00 on Monday to have a quick chat with Gordon – and you if you are available [Redacted S.38(1)(b)].

Look forward to receiving further info from you as early as possible and to speaking with you on Monday.

Many thanks

[Redacted S.38(1)(b)] **Strategic Business Engagement Team Lead**
Scottish Government | Strategic Business Engagement and Events | Economic

Strategy Directorate | 3rd Floor | 5 Atlantic Quay | 150 Broomielaw | Glasgow | G2 8LU

Mob: [Redacted S.38(1)(b)] email: [Redacted S.38(1)(b)]@gov.scot

I am working remotely and am available by email or MS Teams

[Please note: I'm sending this email at a time convenient for me. Even if I've emailed you at an odd time, I don't expect a response outside of your working hours; when you are caring for others; on a non-work day or at the weekend]

From: [Redacted S.38(1)(b)]@businessforscotland.co.uk

Sent: 05 January 2023 15:28

To: [Redacted S.38(1)(b)]@gov.scot

Cc: [Redacted S.38(1)(b)]@businessforscotland.co.uk; [Redacted S.38(1)(b)]@gov.scot>

Subject: Re: Rescheduling the FM address to the BfS Annual Dinner - CONFIRMED DATE AS THURSDAY 19 JANUARY 2023

Hi [Redacted S.38(1)(b)],

Happy New Year!

[Redacted S.39(1)]

We will get everything we can to you for Wednesday 11th and Gordon will be available on Monday anytime after 2pm for a chat about the FM's speech.

Only thing to urgently note is that the VIP reception starts at 6:15pm and runs until 7pm when guest will be seated so we would like the FM to be there for 6:15 to allow enough time for everyone to say hello.

Many thanks,

[Redacted S.38(1)(b)]

On 5 Jan 2023, at 14:01, <[Redacted S.38(1)(b)]@gov.scot> wrote:

Hi Gordon

Happy New Year! Hope all is well with you.

[Redacted S.39(1)]

Also, from our perspective it would be good to have a chat as early as possible next week so we can have all the information we need to offer appropriate preparation to First Minister. Please can you provide the following info **by close Wed 11 January 2023**:

- Final detailed programme – currently FM has scheduled to arrive around 19:00 but early confirmation of the programme would allow us to confirm that;
- Who will greet First Minister on arrival (including any contact details);

- Confirmation of any other Scottish Government Ministers or officials invited and attending;
- Other guest speakers;
- Confirmation of guests (preferably with photos/ bios if you have them) of those at First Minister's table;
- Full guest list – as many of those attending as you will have by close 11 Jan (recognising people still accept right up to the wire!);

Finally, ahead of 11 January it would be good for us to have a quick chat to ensure the First Minister covers off in her speech anything in particular you would like her to mention. Would you be free on Monday afternoon, any time between 14:00 and 16:00?

Many thanks in advance.

[Redacted S.38(1)(b)] **Strategic Business Engagement Team Lead**
Scottish Government | Strategic Business Engagement and Events | Economic Strategy Directorate | 3rd Floor | 5 Atlantic Quay | 150 Broomielaw | Glasgow | G2 8LU

Mob: [Redacted S.38(1)(b)] email: [Redacted S.38(1)(b)]@gov.scot

I am working remotely and am available by email or MS Teams

[Please note: I'm sending this email at a time convenient for me. Even if I've emailed you at an odd time, I don't expect a response outside of your working hours; when you are caring for others; on a non-work day or at the weekend]

ITEM 3 - Business for Scotland annual dinner (19 January 2023) – revised running order – emails between Business for Scotland and Scottish Government

From: [Redacted S.38(1)(b)]

Sent: Thursday, January 12, 2023 5:57 PM

To: 'Gordon MacIntyre-Kemp' <[Redacted S.38(1)(b)]@businessforscotland.co.uk>

Cc: [Redacted S.38(1)(b)]@gov.scot>

Subject: RE: Revised BfS Annual Dinner running order

Hi Gordon

Many thanks for your time earlier and for sharing this revised running order. The First Minister thanks you for adapting the programme and is content with the revised plan. I just wanted to note that it's likely to be closer to 18:30 before she arrives depending on traffic.

In terms of who from SG will be accompanying the First Minister, Special Adviser Emily Mackintosh and First Minister's private secretary, [Redacted S.38(1)(b)], will be there on the night. Emily thinks that not many Special Advisers have been invited and wonders if that is correct/ could be updated? Emily is comfortable with either a seat at a table or not, whichever you can accommodate.

Also, have many Ministers been invited and accepted?

I know you mentioned on Monday about not sharing the full guest list for GDPR reasons, however, [Redacted S.39(1)] we would need to receive details of who will be at the VIP reception and who will be at the First Minister's table. As you suggested, in the format of CEO of X company is fine, but we need to be aware of who is in the room for security and audience purposes. Please can you share those by close Monday at the latest?

Finally, thank you for sharing your request to meet. I have shared with the First Minister's office and we will come back to you as soon as possible with a response.

Many thanks again for your cooperation, Gordon.

Kind regards

[Redacted S.38(1)(b)] | Strategic Business Engagement Team Lead
Scottish Government | Strategic Business Engagement and Events | Economic Strategy Directorate | 3rd Floor | 5 Atlantic Quay | 150 Broomielaw | Glasgow | G2 8LU

Mob: [Redacted S.38(1)(b)] email: [Redacted S.38(1)(b)]@gov.scot

I am working remotely and am available by email or MS Teams

[Please note: I'm sending this email at a time convenient for me. Even if I've emailed you at an odd time, I don't expect a response outside of your working hours; when you are caring for others; on a non-work day or at the weekend]

From: Gordon MacIntyre-Kemp <[Redacted S.38(1)(b)]@businessforscotland.co.uk>
Sent: 12 January 2023 13:52
To: [Redacted S.38(1)(b)]@gov.scot>
Cc: [Redacted S.38(1)(b)]@gov.scot>
Subject: Revised BfS Annual Dinner running order

Hi [Redacted S.38(1)(b)],

Following on from our conversation this morning I have attached the reworked the running order that will enable the FM to leave at 8 pm, having rejoined the top table after her talk. This will also allow for an earlier dinner service.

I hope this meets with your approval and seems to me the best way to handle the the situation.

Yours for Scotland

Gordon MacIntyre-Kemp

Revised running order attachment

6:15pm: Guest arrival and VIP drinks reception with FM
7:00pm: Guests called into the main hall Bar closes at 7pm
7:05pm - 7:17pm: Top Table (inc FM) piped in followed by performance by VIP [Redacted S.38(1)(b)]
7:17pm - 7.25:pm: Host welcome and introduction to the FM- [Redacted S.38(1)(b)] - Comedian and YouTuber
7:25pm – 7.45pm: Keynote speech by Nicola Sturgeon MSP, First Minister of Scotland 7.45pm FM re-joins Top Table after speech leaving at 8pm.
7.45pm: Full dinner service, bar re-opens, background music Scottish Spotify list, raffle ticket reminder push + heads and tails collection.
9:05pm: [Redacted S.38(1)(b)] Heads & Tails (fundraising game)
9:20pm: - [Redacted S.38(1)(b)] introduces BfS CEO, Gordon MacIntyre-Kemp Bar closes
9:25pm: Annual address by Gordon MacIntyre-Kemp and introduction to Keynote Speaker
9:40pm: Keynote speech by Nicola Sturgeon MSP, First Minister of Scotland Raffle takes place behind the scenes
10:00pm: Gordon thanks the FM and is joined by [Redacted S.38(1)(b)] for the fundraising auction
10:15pm: [Redacted S.38(1)(b)] sums up event
10:20pm: Vote of thanks by Director of BfS Distribute raffle prizes where possible Bar re-opens
10:25pm: Official proceedings end – event continues till 11:30pm
11:45pm: Clean up begins, table runners and sashes off chairs, pick up all BfS material, pens left on tables plus stands and unclaimed prizes.

Cabinet Secretary for Wellbeing Economy, Fair Work and Energy – Neil Gray
Briefing for Meeting with Gordon MacIntyre Kemp, Business for Scotland

What	Meeting with Gordon MacIntyre Kemp, Founder and CEO of Business for Scotland
Where	Parliament, Room T4.22b
When	Thursday 22 June 2023, 11:00 – 11:30 (30 minutes)
Key messages	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The Scottish Government is committed to continuing its global leadership role in the transition to a wellbeing economy as a strategic priority and defining mission • We will use the powers we currently have to grow a fairer, greener economy, which meets the needs and aspirations of people, and where businesses across Scotland thrive and prosper. • Our position is that a wellbeing economy transition requires us to think differently about the economy – it is not grow first, redistribute and clean up later, but a model that is equitable, sustainable and dynamic from the outset. • The just transition to a net-zero, nature positive, wellbeing economy – one that serves people, not the other way around - is based on the principles of prosperity, equality, sustainability and resilience for current and future generations. • Delivering the National Strategy for Economic Transformation, in tandem with vital work to eradicate child poverty and reform public services, sets us on a path – within available powers - to a fairer, greener, more prosperous country.
Who	Gordon MacIntyre Kemp, Founder and CEO of Business for Scotland
Why	Follow up from a joint meeting with the Cabinet Secretary WEFWE and the First Minister on 11 May 2023 to discuss Business for Scotland’s wellbeing economic project and the Scottish Government’s commitment to transitioning to a wellbeing economy.
Official support	[Redacted S.38(1)b] Head of Wellbeing Economy and Capability Unit, Strategic Business and Economic Engagement Division ([Redacted S.38(1)b])
Briefing contents	Annex A Biography and Background Annex B Wellbeing Economy Monitor and Economy dashboard Annex C Hot Topics and Sensitivities Annex D Wellbeing Economy Top Lines Annex E New Deal for Business Group Annex F Pensions in an Independent Scotland Annex G Press Publications Full Text

ANNEX A – BIOGRAPHY AND BACKGROUND

BIOGRAPHY



Gordon MacIntyre Kemp

Before founding Business for Scotland. Gordon ran a social media and sales & marketing consultancy. He worked as an economic development planning professional, and in marketing roles specialising in pricing modelling and promotional evaluation for global companies. He is a proponent of the emerging New Economics School.

BACKGROUND

Business for Scotland

With over 4,000 members comprised of business owners and senior managers, Business for Scotland campaigns for business and economic policies that will allow their members' businesses to thrive and bring greater prosperity to Scotland. They publish articles and research reports to influence, provide expert opinion, and provide evidence and advice to both the Scottish and UK Parliaments. They also organise networking events, conferences and dinners.

Business for Scotland Ltd is a business network, business and economic policy lobbying and economic consulting company that runs multiple social policy and political campaigns. Believe in Scotland is the name of one of Business for Scotland's campaigns.

Believe in Scotland is the national co-ordinating body for the grassroots Yes campaign. We offer support service training and campaign materials to 128 local independence campaigning groups and 5 national campaign groups who are affiliated to Believe in Scotland. Believe in Scotland therefor is 133 affiliated Yes campaigns working cooperatively to promote Scottish independence.

Key Projects

Scotland the Brief: A 200-page book, which investigates the breadth, structure and quality of Scotland's economy. A second edition was published in November 2022 and the book has sold over 60,000 copies in total.

Believe in Scotland: A national campaigning organisation for Scottish independence, managed by Business for Scotland. Believe in Scotland is advised by a Steering Group consisting of elected representatives from 17 regions across Scotland and representatives from 9 national campaigns.

Clarity – Rethinking Economics: A newly proposed annual conference to bring together leading economists, policymakers, business people and influencers to create a new economic approach that focuses on fairness, the environment and people to deliver a fairer, more prosperous society.

Scotianomics: Publishes research reports that aim to educate and inform on the Scottish economy, its strengths, threats and opportunities. They have also given evidence and policy advice to organisations such as the Scottish Government, UK Government, and the OECD. They champion the Wellbeing Economic Approach, which is broadly in line with the Scottish Government's approach to the wellbeing economy.

SCOTIANOMICS PUBLICATIONS

'Investigation into the requirement for and optimum level of a Wellbeing Pension' April 2023

This report presents the concept of a Wellbeing Pension, calculating the amount required to act as a starting point (as base level of public pension) to ensure that all pensioners receive an adequate income throughout retirement to live with dignity and end the pensioner poverty levels caused by the inadequacies of the current UK pension system. The report called for the introduction of a “wellbeing pension” of £225 per person, per week. It proposes that this should replace current state pension provision. In response to rising inflation, Scotianomics updated the analysis in April and revised the call to £235 per person per week from 2023/24.

Background:

- The report makes well observed comments around the causes of pensioner poverty, the gender pensions gap, and widening financial inequalities among older people.
- It aims to make the case for a flat rate state pension as a tool for improving the incomes of those with small or no occupational pensions provision, and making sure that all pensioners have an adequate income to live a dignified life.
- The report provides analysis of the levels of both the new state pension (introduced in 2016) and the basic state pension rates (in place before that date). The analysis doesn't include the various additional elements of the basic state pension or the passported elements of the pensions credit which means that many of the income calculations and comparisons are not robust.
- The report also uses forecast UK level National Insurance Contributions to demonstrate the “affordability” of the wellbeing pension. Again this analysis over simplifies the use of forecasting and the demand led nature of pensions spending and funding.
- The report uses the Minimum Income Standard, developed by Loughborough University, to set the rate of the Wellbeing pension. The MIS is also being used by the Living Wage Foundation to encourage employers to offer a “Living Pension” to encourage better occupational pensions savings.
- At the SNP party conference in October 2022, it was agreed that, in an independent Scotland, a “real living pension” would be set at £220 a week, based on 2022-23 levels.
- The current full UK state pension is £203.85 per week.
- Officials met with Gordon MacIntyre-Kemp of Scotianomics in November last year to discuss their analysis of the Wellbeing Pension. There were no actions from that discussion.
- Initial analysis of the Scotianomics recommendations suggests that raising the state pension to a flat rate of £235 in 2023-24 would have added £1.8 billion to the state pensions bill in Scotland – an increase of around 17%.
- By 2028/29, the cost would increase to £2.3 billion – 18% more than the current system and costs will continue to grow thereafter.

Lines to take on this issue are included in [Annex C](#)

‘Public Attitudes Toward Wellbeing Economics in Scotland’ September 2020

This report draws upon the analysis of a Panelbase survey commissioned by Scotianomics to evaluate the current public attitude towards the adoption of a wellbeing economic approach in Scotland. They conclude that there is significant support for the adoption of a wellbeing economic approach in Scotland, with a majority of respondents endorsing many of the wellbeing values and policies.

PRESS PUBLICATIONS

Gordon MacIntyre Kemp has recently authored the following articles - full text in [ANNEX G](#)

- *‘Why the wellbeing economy could be key to Scotland's independence’* – The National – 6 May 2023
 - Discusses the inadequacies of using GDP as a measure of economic health . Argues that ‘GDP measures wealth, not wealth distribution, and that simple fact

renders it almost useless as a guide for economic policy unless inequality, poverty, boom and bust cycles, poor environmental outcomes, unhappiness and indeed slower growth are your goals.'

- This article indicates that Scotianomics will shortly be publishing a paper on defining and quantifying the Wellbeing Economic Approach, which will be an international analysis of wellbeing economics with a focus on measuring and quantifying success.
 - Lines to take on measuring a wellbeing economy are included in Annex C.
- *'Wellbeing is key for Scotland's economy – not the Growth Commission'* – The National – 24 March 2023
 - Written during the leadership contest, this article states that a thriving society cannot exist without a thriving economy or a thriving economy without a thriving society.
 - It advocated for a 'Wellbeing Economic Approach' which recognises that quality of life, equality, fairness, sustainability, happiness and health are all outcomes that should be given equal weight to traditional measures such as GDP.

ANNEX B – WELLBEING ECONOMY MONITOR AND ECONOMY DASHBOARD

Progress on the wellbeing economy: June 2023

Summary of progress

For the 14 indicators included in the national Wellbeing Economy Monitor, performance has been improving for six of the indicators, maintaining for six and worsening for two.

Improving indicators: greenhouse gas emissions; the percentage of employees earning below the real living wage; active travel (which includes walking and cycling); the percentage of adults with low or no qualifications; community ownership of assets; and income inequality. [NOTE - This assessment of income inequality has not yet been made public].

Maintaining indicators: biodiversity; young people's participation in education, training or employment; relative poverty; child poverty; the gender pay gap; and investment as a share of GDP.

Worsening indicators: wealth inequality and preventable deaths. Wealth inequality increased between 2016-18 and 2018-20, however it has been broadly stable since 2006-2008 (when data collection began). For preventable deaths, if COVID-19 deaths are excluded, the rate has remained broadly stable over the last few years.

Worsening	Maintaining	Improving
Wealth inequality	Biodiversity	Greenhouse gas emissions
Preventable deaths	Young people's participation	Employees earning below the real living wage
	Relative poverty	Active travel
	Gender pay gap	Low educational attainment
	Child poverty	Income inequality
	Investment	Community ownership

New data which we can use to make updated performance assessments has become available for several indicators since the publication of the December 2022 national WEM update. An updated performance assessment has not been provided in the table above for the active travel indicator due to the incomparability of recent annual data, nor for the biodiversity indicator because data for only 2 of the 3 elements of the composite indicator have been updated.

- **Relative poverty** after housing costs affected 21% of the population in 2019-2022. It has been stable since 2015-18.
- **Child poverty** (or the proportion of children living in combined low income and material deprivation after housing costs) was 11% in 2019-22. The long-term trend has been broadly stable.
- **Income inequality** has been decreasing since the most recent high in 2015-18. In 2019-22, the top ten percent of the population had 18% more income (before housing costs) than the bottom forty.
- **The gender pay gap** in weekly earnings slightly increased from 10.3% in 2021 to 10.9% in 2022. The gender pay gap in 2020 of 10.0% was the lowest reported since data collection began in 1997.
- **Investment as a share of GDP** slightly decreased from 18.6% in 2021 to 18.4% in 2022. The rate in 2021 was the highest since 2007. Investment as a share of GDP has been persistently lower in Scotland than in most of our comparator countries.
- **Biodiversity** in terms of terrestrial species abundance increased by 2% in 2019, however marine species abundance declined by 8%. The most recent available data for terrestrial occupancy is for 2016. Since 1994, terrestrial occupancy has increased (+24%), terrestrial abundance has been broadly stable (up 1%), and marine abundance has fallen by 41%.
- **Active travel** – In 2021, 56.2% of journeys under two miles were on foot and 2.8% of journeys under five miles were by bicycle.

Latest economic statistics

- **GDP:** Scotland's GDP remained flat (0.0%) in March 2023 (UK: -0.3%) and more broadly grew 0.4% over Q1 2023 (UK: 0.1%) with the quarterly pace of growth strengthening slightly from the second half of 2022.
- **Business activity:** PMI monthly business survey data for Scotland indicated a third consecutive month of growth in business activity in April (54.3) at the strongest rate in ten months.
- **Labour market:** In Q1 2023, Scotland's unemployment rate was 3.1% (down 0.1 p.p annually), the employment rate was 75.3% (down 0.2 p.p), and the inactivity rate was 22.2% (up 0.3 p.p).
- **Payrolled employees:** In April 2023, there is an estimated 2.43 million payrolled employees in Scotland, down 5,000 over the month, however 48,000 higher than in February 2020 prior to the pandemic.
- **Job vacancies:** Vacancy rates remain elevated however recruitment activity has softened. Weekly online job vacancies (w/b 2 June) were 51% higher than in Feb 2020 (down from +56% during Oct), while the RBS Report on Jobs shows demand for permanent staff rose in May but at its slowest pace since the start of 2021.
- **Labour shortages:** At the end of April, 38% of businesses reported experiencing a shortage of workers, down from a recent peak of 45% during August 2022 but broadly in line with the same point last year.
- **Inflation:** UK inflation fell to 8.7% in April, down from 10.1% in March, and from its recent peak of 11.1% in October. The fall over the month was largely driven by the fall in the contribution of electricity and gas prices as the sharp rises last April dropped out of the annual comparison. However, wider inflationary pressures remain. Food and non-alcoholic drink prices rose 19.1% over the year to April. In May, the Bank of England forecast inflation to fall to 5.1% in Q4 2023.
- **Earnings:** PAYE median monthly nominal pay grew 9.3% over the year in April and by 0.6% in real terms. This is the first positive annual real terms growth since January 2022, though was moderate overall.
- **Scottish Consumer Sentiment:** The Scottish Consumer Sentiment Indicator weakened by 2.5 points in April to -16.0, remaining below the series average overall and reflects weak household sentiment regarding the economy, household financial security and spending.
- **Trade:** Comparing with the previous year, when oil and gas are excluded, Scotland's international goods exports increased by 20.5% in 2022 compared to 2021. This compares to a 13.3% increase for the UK.
- **Forecast:** Latest economic forecasts from May remain subdued. The Scottish Fiscal Commission forecast Scotland's economy to grow 0.2% in 2023 rising to 0.9% in 2024. At a UK level, the Bank of England forecast the UK economy to grow 0.25% in 2023 rising to 0.75% in 2024.
- **Govt borrowing costs:** Govt 10-year bond yields have risen sharply over the past year as inflation, interest rates and economic risks have risen. Bond yields at 12 June: UK (4.24%); Germany (2.38%); US (3.75%).

GDP and labour market

- Scotland's GDP remained flat (0.0%) in March 2023 and grew 0.4% over the first quarter as a whole.
- In January – March, the unemployment rate was 3.1% (down 0.1 p.p annually).

GDP: Monthly Growth Rates in 2022 and 2023 (%)

	2022						2023		
	Jul	Aug	Sep	Oct	Nov	Dec	Jan	Feb	Mar
Scotland	0.1	0.2	-0.7	0.7	0.1	-0.6	0.5	0.3	0.0
UK	0.4	0.0	-0.7	0.7	0.2	-0.5	0.5	0.0	-0.3

Labour Market: January – March 2023

		Rate (%)	Change (% pt) over:		Level ('000)	Change ('000's) over:	
			Quarter	Year		Quarter	Year
		Scotland	Employment	75.3	-1.2	-0.2	2,683
	Unemployment	3.1	-0.2	-0.1	86	-7	-2
	Inactivity	22.2	1.4	0.3	766	49	13
UK	Employment	75.9	0.2	0.3	32,995	182	363
	Unemployment	3.9	0.1	0.2	1,329	60	71
	Inactivity	21.0	-0.4	-0.4	8,730	-156	-134

Next Key Releases

Scotland		UK	
Labour Market Statistics (Feb – April)	13 June	UK GDP (April)	14 June

ANNEX C – HOT TOPICS AND SENSITIVITIES

NEW DEAL FOR BUSINESS

- Ministers are acutely aware of the challenging operating environment that businesses continue to face in the wake of Brexit, recovery from the Covid pandemic, the current conflict in Ukraine and the resulting cost impacts.
- In the Policy Prospectus, the First Minister pledged to help business and trade to thrive and maximise the opportunity of the green economy, with fairness at its heart – a New Deal for Business.
- Only by working closely with business can we hope to achieve an economy which prospers while caring for people and planet. This is our vision for a wellbeing economy
- The New Deal for improved relationships with business will allow us to better identify how, within a limited budget, we can achieve our shared ambitions of delivering a growing economy that increases wellbeing for everyone.
- Involving businesses at an early stage of policy development will be one of the key aims of the New Deal for Businesses Group.
- The Group brings together the key issues that business tell us are important and we want to work with members of to shape the work taken forward.
- The Cabinet Secretary Wellbeing Economy, Fair Work and Energy has said: We want to deepen our relationship with business, not only by engaging and communicating, but actively working together to achieve common goals and align Scottish Government policy with business.
- The Group is due to complete its recommendations and report to the First Minister by the end of June 2023.

ECONOMIC GROWTH AND WELLBEING ECONOMY

Issue: Scotianomics' vision sets out that all factors that enhance an individual's wellbeing should be on the same footing as economic growth. These factors include but are not limited to: the quality of the living environment; human development through increased education and health outcomes; stronger community ties and reduced inequality; and investment in future generations are what contribute to greater economic and societal wellbeing.

Lines to take:

- Whilst we are bound to a failed UK economic model and do not hold all the financial levers needed, we will use all the powers we do have to build a fair, green and growing economy which meets the needs and aspirations of people.
- We will help business and trade to thrive and support economic growth for a purpose - to drive improved living standards, promote wellbeing, reduce poverty, and deliver sustainable high quality public services.
- The Scottish Government seeks to transition to a new economic model which is equitable, sustainable and dynamic from the outset.
- The wellbeing economy approach emphasises that economic growth should not only be sustainable and inclusive but should also serve as a means to an end – that of collective wellbeing of people and planet – rather than be considered an end in itself.
- We need to embed equality, inclusion and environmental sustainability into everything we do in NSET.
- These principles are central to our policies on Community Wealth Building, the Just Transition to Net Zero and climate resilience, the Scottish National Investment Bank, Fair Work, Land Reform, the Circular Economy, and the Scottish Child Payment.

WELLBEING PENSION

- I am very concerned about the hardship older people are facing in this cost-of-living crisis.
- We remain concerned about the continuing low levels of Pension Credit take-up and continue to urge the UK Government to make further efforts to improve this.
- The most recent figures on the take-up of Pension Credit published by the UK Government comes from 2019-20 which estimates that only 66% of families who were entitled to Pension Credit received it.
- The Scottish Government welcomes and appreciates the recent efforts of DWP to increase awareness of Pension Credit, but we urge them to double these efforts.
- The Scottish Government encourages people in Scotland to access all of the support they are entitled to. We do this by funding local authority and third sector welfare rights and money advice services, some of which are also integrated into NHS services and provide regulated and accredited advice on income maximisation.
- We urge the UK Government to stick to their promise to protect the Triple Lock, especially as the cost-of-living continues.

Potential questions for Scotianomics:

- Based on their analysis, what would the additional cost of paying the wellbeing pension of £235 per week be in Scotland?
- How could this be funded?
- Might there be knock-on effects on intergenerational fairness?
- If the key aim of the wellbeing pension is to address pensioner poverty and income inequalities – are there other more targeted approaches that could be explored?

MEASURING A WELLBEING ECONOMY

Issue: In a recently published article, Gordon MacIntyre Kemp indicated that Scotianomics will shortly be publishing a paper on defining and quantifying the Wellbeing Economic Approach, which will be an international analysis of wellbeing economics with a focus on measuring and quantifying success.

Lines to take:

- What we measure matters. It matters because it drives political focus and public activity.
- The limitations of GDP as a measure of economic success are well documented.
- Traditional economic metrics like GDP will remain an important measure but cannot be viewed in isolation.
- To help us assess Scotland’s progress in creating a wellbeing economy, we have published a Wellbeing Economy Monitor – which tracks broader outcomes of economic activity using indicators relating to health, equality, fair work and the environment, among others.
- The Monitor has been developed to complement and look beyond GDP to measure other indicators of economic success that relate to the wellbeing of people and the natural environment, based on Scotland’s National Outcomes and the UN Sustainable Development Goals.
- This is in line with the “four capitals” approach, reflecting the importance and interconnectedness of all four capitals - social, economic, human and natural – for long-term, sustainable outcomes for the wellbeing of future generations.

ANNEX D – WELLBEING ECONOMY

As we transition to a wellbeing economy, we will use the powers we currently have to grow a fairer, greener economy, which meets the needs and aspirations of people, and where businesses across Scotland thrive and prosper.

- Our transition to a wellbeing economy requires us to think differently about the economy – it is not simply grow first, redistribute and clean up later, but a model that is equitable, sustainable and dynamic from the outset.
- Our leadership in forming the Wellbeing Economy Governments (WEGo) group and delivering the National Strategy for Economic Transformation, harnessing the opportunities of the net zero transition and tackling structural inequalities, sets us on a path to a fairer, greener, more prosperous country.
- Our Wellbeing Economy Toolkit provides a guide for local authorities to support economic development across Scotland's communities and regions, based on Scotland's National Outcomes.
- Our policies on Community Wealth Building, Just Transition plans, the Circular Economy Bill, Fair Work plans, the Scottish National Investment Bank, Land Reform Bill, and the Scottish Child Payment are some examples of our wellbeing economy transition in practice.
- Independence would allow Scotland to make greater progress, but, until then, we call for the devolution of additional powers - in relation to energy, the economy and employment law - to the Scottish Parliament to support Scotland's transition to a wellbeing economy.

The Scottish Government is committed to continuing Scotland's international leadership in the transition to a wellbeing economy – an economy which is strong and resilient, and which works for people, not the other way round.

- A net zero, nature positive, wellbeing economy serves people first and is based on the principles of prosperity, equality, sustainability and resilience for current and future generations.
- The First Minister's policy prospectus sets out three interlinked missions of tackling poverty; prioritising public services; and seizing the opportunities of net zero to grow a fairer, greener economy, as we transition to a wellbeing economy.
- Whilst we are bound to a failed UK economic model and do not hold all the financial levers needed, we will use all the powers we do have to build a fair, green and growing economy which meets the needs and aspirations of people.
- We will help business and trade to thrive and support economic growth for a purpose to drive improved living standards, promote wellbeing, reduce poverty, and deliver sustainable high quality public services.
- Going beyond a traditional understanding of the economy that focuses on GDP in isolation, a wellbeing economy allows people to fulfil their potential and includes things like health, equality, fair work and the environment.
- What we measure matters. We have published a Wellbeing Economy Monitor to track broader outcomes beyond GDP on issues such as health, equality, fair work and the environment. It will be published at least once a year and will help to assess Scotland's progress in building a wellbeing economy.

ANNEX E – NEW DEAL FOR BUSINESS GROUP

NEW DEAL FOR BUSINESSES GROUP

Ministers are acutely aware of the challenging operating environment that businesses continue to face in the wake of Brexit, recovery from the Covid pandemic, the current conflict in Ukraine and the resulting cost impacts.

- In the Policy Prospectus, FM pledged to help business and trade to thrive and maximise the opportunity of the green economy, with fairness at its heart.
- We want to ensure that we are truly co-designing policy with Scottish businesses – and so involving businesses at an early stage of policy development is one of the key aims of the New Deal for Business Group.
- The group recognises the importance of deepening our relationship with business not only through engaging and communicating with them, but by actively aligning our policy with business and working in partnership on common goals.
- It is focussing on four key areas – sharing awareness of the economic and business environment; developing the best environment to do business; enhanced partnership working; and a transition to a wellbeing economy. I (Cab Sec Wellbeing Economy) co-chair the group, along with Dr Poonam Malik, Head of Investments at the University of Strathclyde. Five subgroups sit under the Group, each led by Group members who will bring in representatives from the wider business community to provide advice and experience. As set out in the Policy Prospectus, we will help business and trade to thrive and support economic growth for a purpose to drive improved living standards, promote wellbeing, reduce poverty, and deliver sustainable high quality public services. The new deal will allow us to better identify within a limited budget how we can achieve our ambitions of delivering a growing economy that increases wellbeing for everyone.

NEW DEAL FOR BUSINESS WELLBEING ECONOMY SUB-GROUP

The subgroup will develop a shared appreciation and articulation of how business contributes to a Wellbeing Economy and SG Missions and agreement on key areas where we will actively work together in partnership with business to maximise this.

- The knowledge and expertise of our businesses, large and small, will be critical to Scotland achieving its aim of transitioning to a wellbeing economy.
- The (non-SG) co-chairs of the Wellbeing Economy sub-group are: Louisa McDonnell (BITC), Sara Thiam (SCDI) and Nathalie Agnew (Muckle Media).
- The sub-group intends, by the end of June, to agree a set of actions that business can take to support the transition to a Wellbeing Economy.

ANNEX F – PENSIONS IN AN INDEPENDENT SCOTLAND

Top Lines

- The position on pensions is the same as was set out in the 2013 White Paper: current pensioners will receive their pensions as now – on time and in full, with all accrued pensions rights honoured and protected.
- The Scottish Government fully recognises the importance of pensions, whether occupational or State, to the people of Scotland.
- For those people living in Scotland in receipt of the UK state pension at the time of independence, the responsibility for the payment of that pension will transfer to the Scottish Government.
- The White Paper produced for Scotland's 2014 referendum stated clearly that [QUOTE]:
“for those people living and working in Scotland at the time of independence, the UK

pension entitlement they have accrued prior to independence will become their Scottish State Pension entitlement. "Any pension entitlement accrued in Scotland after independence will also form part of that Scottish State Pension; and on retirement, the Scottish State Pension will be paid by the Scottish Government." (p429, Scotland's Future)

- Clearly, following a vote for independence, the Scottish and UK Governments would open negotiations on a range of issues. This would cover distribution of existing UK liabilities and assets, including those relating to pensions.
- [Redacted S.30(c)]
- After independence, pensions policy, as well as responsibility for payments, will be decided by governments the people of Scotland vote for.
- An independent Scotland will also have full powers to protect and improve both state and occupational pensions, encourage saving for secure retirement, and set the State Pension Age at a level appropriate to Scottish circumstances.

ANNEX G – PRESS PUBLICATIONS

Gordon MacIntyre Kemp has recently produced the following articles for The National:

'Why the wellbeing economy could be key to Scotland's independence' – The National – 6 May 2023

The single most important policy area in Scotland right now is the SNPs renewed and elevated commitment to the wellbeing economy approach. It lies at the heart of both the new SNP leadership's plans to build a better Scotland and at the heart of the new case for independence.

This will become an increasingly contentious issue because it doesn't appeal to those with socialist or capitalist tunnel vision. They have a vested interest in spreading misinformation. Their key claim is that wellbeing economics is all well and good but because we can't measure it, it cannot be used as a policy benchmark.

It might come as a shock to some political commentators, but we can in fact measure national wellbeing and its impact on society and on the economy. Those who say you can't are simply admitting they do not know how.

If there is a problem with measuring wellbeing in economics, it's not the difficulty of the task at hand but rather that when you do, you realise that all past measures of the economy, the conclusions drawn and approaches implemented have been completely wrong. The concept that economic growth as measured by GDP is the bellwether that all economic policy should follow has become a semi-religious mantra. GDP remains popular as it serves as a measure to justify a solely neo-capitalist economic approach but that approach has failed completely.

That fact is generally understood by the public but it is not accepted by political parties or the mainstream media. Almost all attempts so far to create measures for wellbeing seek only to add wellbeing tick-boxes to current wrong-headed economic measures, rather than to ask the question – what is the best way to measure the socioeconomic wellbeing of the nation?

The problem is that poor wellbeing outcomes are built into the foundations of our economic system. GDP measures wealth, not wealth distribution, and that simple fact renders it almost useless as a guide for economic policy unless inequality, poverty, boom and bust cycles, poor environmental outcomes, unhappiness and indeed slower growth are your goals. We need a broad-based indicator of socioeconomic progress, not a single net-wealth indicator such as GDP.

If you are not yet convinced of the inadequacy of GDP as a measure of economic health, consider that the internationally sanctioned Russian economy is predicted to grow more quickly than the UK's next year. Although the UK having applied self-sanctions in the form of Brexit explains its low growth, it doesn't explain why Russia's economy is growing. To put it simply, war increases GDP. Every bullet fired and missile launched adds to GDP but that doesn't mean the Russian economy is performing well.

The US will have to rebuild after a disastrous tornado season. The local economies of those devastated towns will boom through reconstruction. Would a less environmentally destructive wellbeing economic approach have made climate-related disasters less frequent? The science certainly suggests it would.

Neo-capitalism ignores the fact that GDP measures societal negatives which ironically are often the root causes of future poor GDP performance. Let's be clear – our current economic system has negative outcomes for society and the planet hard-wired into the system.

The wellbeing economic approach as defined by the wellbeing economics think tank Scotianomics is about the overall socioeconomic health of the nation. In a nutshell, it's a plan that recognises that quality of life, equality, fairness, sustainability, happiness, and health are all outcomes that should be given equal weight to GDP in economic planning.

It creates a virtuous cycle – you can't have a thriving economy without a thriving society and you can't have a thriving society without a thriving economy. We must cast last century's outdated ideas of left and right and class struggle into the bin of history and accept we can't solve the new and deadly serious problems of this century with the failed ideas of the last.

What if the only way to maintain positive growth (that adds to national wellbeing without harming the environment) and positive societal outcomes is to maintain a socioeconomic equilibrium that requires the simultaneous implementation of ideas for improving society and business that have previously been considered mutually exclusive?

There is clearly a hunger for a new economic approach but all we are offered is rebranded versions of last century's ideas of socialism and capitalism. We can't just keep the old system and paper over the cracks with some wellbeing tick-boxes because the system doesn't have cracks, it has unbridgeable chasms.

Scotianomics (the economics think tank from Business for Scotland) has championed the wellbeing economic approach for many years, first researching the core socioeconomic values of the Scottish people and then suggesting policies and approaches that match those values.

Now we must ask the question: How do we measure the impact of the wellbeing economic approach? Many nations, especially Scandinavian countries, are already making moves towards wellbeing-led policies, so nothing we are suggesting is radical, new or even untested. However, we are suggesting bringing the best of those ideas together in a new approach and system for measuring their impact providing a framework for policy development. It's simply a question of seeking new and improved outcomes from the economy. To achieve this, we require a different set of measures.

Next week, Scotianomics will publish our paper *Defining and Quantifying the Wellbeing Economic Approach* – an international analysis of wellbeing economics with a focus on measuring and quantifying success. This will speed up the journey towards a holistic system for designing and quantifying the desired outcomes of the wellbeing economic approach and provide international wellbeing economy comparisons called the Scotianomics Wellbeing Economy Index. We hope this will act as a yardstick against which the wellbeing impact of socioeconomic policy can be measured and tested.

'Wellbeing is key for Scotland's economy – not the Growth Commission' – The National – 24 March 2023

ONE key issue seems to have dominated the [SNP](#) leadership hustings – the Wellbeing Economic Approach, accepted as a core direction of the Scottish Government. Over the past few days, it has been debated in Parliament and come under attack from the usual – and some unusual – quarters.

When the SNP published the Sustainable Growth Commission – an economic plan for an independent Scotland – it went down rather well with large corporate Tory donors and the Unionist broadsheets.

It went down like a lead balloon with the wider Yes movement and most SNP members and marked the first real public spats between the SNP and the left wing of the grassroots movement. Bridges were burned – some still seem irreparable.

Business for Scotland (BfS) didn't like the report either. Every idea we submitted to the commission was ignored, but upon reading it, we knew it could never become policy. So, we kept the bridges unburned and instead worked hard to champion the Wellbeing Economic Approach.

We found we were pushing at an open door with the Scottish Government, which was enhanced by a growing understanding of concepts of wellbeing in government across a range of nations. Scotland, New Zealand, Iceland, Wales, Finland and Canada formed the Group of Wellbeing Economy Governments to promote sharing of wellbeing economics expertise and practices.

The Wellbeing Economy Alliance, a collaboration of organisations and individuals working to transform the economic system, added to the momentum.

BfS set up our think tank Scotianomics.org, with a focus on researching and developing wellbeing-focused economic policies. We have two full-time researchers working on measuring and monitoring systems for the wellbeing economy and how it impacts economic and social change.

We have been sharing our research and polling work with the SNP and in October to November 2021, we teamed up with the SNP, Scottish Greens, SIF, The National and the National Yes Network to deliver one million copies of a wellbeing economics newspaper to homes across Scotland. Job done, we thought – the Sustainable Growth Commission was dead and wellbeing economics would be the foundation upon which a fairer, greener, healthier, happier and prosperous independent Scotland would be built.

At this year's Business for Scotland Annual Dinner, one of the biggest cheers of the night came when Nicola Sturgeon in her keynote speech said: "First of all, I want to acknowledge the contribution that Business for Scotland makes – not just to the campaign for independence but to so many other policy issues as well. Your proposals for a wellbeing economy are important contributions to the big and massively important discussion about how we transform Scotland's economy for the future."

There can be no doubt that the wellbeing economy is a red-line issue for myself and Business for Scotland.

The SNP Equality and Fairness Commission set the tone for Scottish Government policy on social protections and equality, while the work done by BfS and Scotianomics set the tone for how the wellbeing economy could make the whole nation wealthier and the economy fitter for this century's challenges.

BfS asked the SNP leadership contenders 10 questions. One was: "Do you agree that the Sustainable Growth Commission's conclusions are now out-of-date and are made redundant by the damage of Brexit, the pandemic and the current economic and cost of living crisis?"

All three candidates agreed. Although both Kate Forbes and Humza Yousaf pointed out that some of the research findings were still relevant, it's clear that the commission's conclusions – which can best be described as tartan austerity – are not a fit model for Scotland's future.

On Wednesday, Holyrood debated the transition to a wellbeing economy and although there is still a lot of research and policy work required, the direction of travel for the SNP is set away from sustainable growth and towards wellbeing economics.

Tory MSP Stephen Kerr doesn't get it. He was panned for his comments that the term is "almost totally meaningless" and that, "wellbeing could only be prioritised if the country's economy was growing".

There is good growth and bad growth and what Kerr cannot accept is that growth must not come at the expense of equality or the environment. If it does, then it damages the nation's wellbeing. I can laugh off Kerr's comments. He clearly lacks the capacity to consider anything outside the pseudo-religious mantra of neo-capitalism – new banking crisis, anyone?

However, I have also been given pause by some of Forbes's recent comments – she seems to be simultaneously championing both wellbeing economics and sustainable growth – two mutually exclusive concepts. She also signalled a move to the right, telling the FT: "Victory on March 27 would bring a change of tone to Scottish Government economic policy, focusing more on wealth creation than the social spending and redistribution stressed by Sturgeon."

At her campaign launch event, she also said: "I think I have the respect and experience to ensure we do put sustainable economic growth front and centre of our plans."

That worries me a bit. In a nutshell, the Wellbeing Economic Approach recognises that quality of life, equality, fairness, sustainability, happiness and health are all outcomes that should be given equal weight to traditional measures such as GDP. The tribalistic and simplistic mantras of left and right are last century's ideas and unfit for the problems of the modern world.

You can't have a thriving society without a thriving economy or a thriving economy without a thriving society. They are two sides of the same coin.

We must stop swinging the pendulum from left to right and back again and instead seek balance in our socioeconomic and environmental approaches. It's also a huge bonus that the Wellbeing Economic Approach significantly boosts independence support.

A recent Panelbase poll commissioned by Believe in Scotland found Yes support at 48% but when respondents were asked how they would vote if a Wellbeing Economic Approach was part of the vision for independence, Yes jumped to 56%.

CABINET SECRETARY FOR WELLBEING ECONOMY, FAIR WORK AND ENERGY

MEETING WITH GORDON MacINTYRE KEMP, BUSINESS FOR SCOTLAND

Thursday 22 June 2023, 10:30-11:00

Attendees

- Neil Gray MSP, Cabinet Secretary for Wellbeing Economy, Fair Work and Energy
- Gordon MacIntyre Kemp, Founder and CEO, Business for Scotland
- [Redacted S.38(1)(b)], Scottish Government, Head of Wellbeing Economy and Capability
- [Redacted S.38(1)(b)], Ministerial Private Office

Agenda

1. Update on Business for Scotland/Scotianomics Wellbeing Economy Project
2. Scottish Government Wellbeing Economy policy agenda
3. Plans for business engagement around Wellbeing Economy policy
4. Revisiting past plans for joint working – PLC events

Discussion

NG provided an update on his recent visit to Iceland for the first Wellbeing Economy Forum, which was also attended by representatives from Luxembourg. One notable contribution was on the importance of tackling the causes of mental health.

NG indicated that the priority going forward is the New Deal for Business. An interim report is expected to be published on 29 June and will help form a foundation for engagement. There are Wellbeing Economy elements, such as supporting a strong business landscape for growth, taking opportunities in the context of a tight labour market to address Fair Work, and opening up space for further progress towards a Wellbeing Economy.

NG highlighted that the annual report for the National Strategy for Economic Transformation was published on 21 June, and said there will be a statement on the Stewart Review on women in entrepreneurship on 29 June.

GMK set out that he views national wellbeing and business wellbeing as being complementary, and noted the strong connections between economic and social wellbeing – a strong economy needs a strong society and vice versa. He stated that Business for Scotland is distinctive because it seeks opportunities for sustainable growth and wants to build a better society.

NG noted that the New Deal for Business work is vital because it is about government and business working together towards shared ambitions, involving business at an early stage of policy development and strengthening Business and Regulatory Impact Assessments.

GMK referred to a problem of alienation within workforces, which can be addressed when businesses engage in their communities and invest in their workers.

NG added that this also improves businesses – there is increasing recognition that resilience depends on treating employees well and adopting sustainable practices. There is a need to explain this to businesses through an effective narrative so the conversation moves on to how our ambitions can be achieved.

NG explained that there had been a lot of business input into the New Deal for Business work, including through the central group and the five sub-groups.

[Redacted S.30(b)(ii)]

NG said his Summer tour will focus on introductory meetings but he is looking to engage with businesses around Wellbeing Economy going forward [Redacted S.30(b)(ii)].

GMK informed NG that he has started writing a newsletter/blog called *Reinventing Scotland: a wellbeing economy approach*. NG asked to be kept up to date.

**CABINET SECRETARY FOR WELLBEING ECONOMY, FAIR WORK & ENERGY
BUSINESS FOR SCOTLAND SALTIRE LUNCH – 28 JULY 2023**

What	Business For Scotland – Saltire Club Lunch
Where	Cannonball Restaurant & Bar 356 Castlehill Edinburgh EH1 2NF 356 Castlehill - Google Maps
When	Friday 28 July 2023 12:30 – 14:30 (The Cabinet Secretary is free to leave from 14:30)
Key message(s)	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • For Scotland, economic success means making the most of the incredibly rich resources we have and using that to build an economy that works for people and planet, not the other way around. • Economic activity should serve a purpose. It should be a sustainable means to improved health and wellbeing, rather than simply an end in itself. • It is the Scottish Government’s view that people who live in Scotland have the right to choose how they should be governed and to decide if Scotland should become an independent country. • Ministers committed to giving people information about Scotland’s constitutional future, and we are continuing with that work. The fourth paper in the Building a New Scotland series published in June 2023, and focuses on the need for a written constitution. Further material in the Building a New Scotland series is in preparation covering matters including pensions and social security, EU membership, energy, defence, and foreign affairs.
Who	Business for Scotland Saltire Club members. This is a premium membership of the organisations that holds 10 lunches a year for the 60 or so members who are all pro-independence businesspeople.
Why	You agreed to participate in the Business for Scotland Saltire Club lunch and this offers an opportunity to talk about the shared ambition on Wellbeing Economy.
Supporting official	[Redacted S.38(1)(b)], Wellbeing Economy policy lead. [Redacted S.38(1)(b)]. You will be greeted by Gordon McIntyre-Kemp , Founder and Chief Executive of Business for Scotland, [Redacted S.38(1)(b)]
Briefing contents	Annex A: Purpose, Agenda and Opening Remarks Annex B: Lines to take for Discussion Annex C: Background and Key Biographies Annex D: Progress on the Wellbeing Economy: June 2023

ANNEX A

PURPOSE, AGENDA AND OPENING REMARKS

Purpose:

Cabinet Secretary agreed to attend and speak at the Saltire Lunch in Edinburgh on Friday, July 28. The invite was extended following a 1:1 meeting on Wellbeing Economy with Gordon MacIntyre-Kemp who has indicated that the lunch offers an opportunity for the Cabinet Secretary to talk about the shared ambition on an economy that is fair, green, and growing.

[Redacted S.30(b)(i)]

You will be seated between Gordon MacIntyre-Kemp and [Redacted S.38(1)(b)]. The other speaker is [Redacted S.38(1)(b)].

Agenda:

- **12:30-12:35:** Introductory remarks from Gordon MacIntyre-Kemp, Founder & CE.
- **12:35-13:00:** Lunch starter served, and networking commences.
- **13:00-13:15:** starter course cleared **followed by opening remarks from the Cabinet Secretary** followed by [Redacted S.38(1)(b)]. Each speaker has 4 minutes.
- **13:15-14:30: Main Course** served followed by discussion and Q&A facilitated by Gordon McIntyre-Kemp
- **14:30:** Close and the Cabinet Secretary is free to leave.

Suggested Points for Opening Remarks:

- Thank you for the invitation to join you today and I'm delighted to have this opportunity to talk to you about our shared ambition for a Wellbeing Economy for Scotland.
- The Scottish Government is committed to continuing its global leadership role in the transition to a Wellbeing Economy as a strategic priority and defining mission.
- The just transition to a net-zero, nature positive, Wellbeing Economy – one that serves people, not the other way around – is based on the principles of prosperity, equality, sustainability, and resilience for current and future generations.
- We will use the powers we currently have to grow a fairer, greener economy, which meets the needs and aspirations of people, and where businesses across Scotland thrive and prosper.
- Our position is that a Wellbeing Economy transition requires us to think differently about the economy – it is not grow first, redistribute, and clean up later, but a model that is equitable, sustainable, and dynamic from the outset.
- We will support economic growth for a purpose to drive improved living standards, promote wellbeing, reduce poverty, and deliver sustainable high quality public services.
- Delivering the National Strategy for Economic Transformation, in tandem with vital work to eradicate child poverty and reform public services, sets us on a path – within available powers - to a fairer, greener, more prosperous country.

- Scotland will only be a successful nation if our businesses are successful and support our contribution to achieving a Wellbeing Economy, where business and trade can thrive while caring for people and planet.
- The New Deal for Business Group is supporting a reset to our relationship with a focus on co-designing policies that will have an impact on business, where possible.
- The Scottish Government, trade bodies and businesses should work together to better establish the business case for supporting a Wellbeing Economy and find ways to showcase the benefits and share good practice to all parts of the business community in Scotland.
- This should be led by business, building on the work of the Business Purpose Commission, through their networks, because they are best placed to understand how to craft the message. A first step will be for businesses involved to agree the approach.
- The knowledge and expertise of our businesses, large and small, will be critical to Scotland achieving its aim of transitioning to a wellbeing economy.
- I look forward to our discussion.

LINES TO TAKE FOR DISCUSSION

WELLBEING ECONOMY

- As we transition to a **Wellbeing Economy**, we will use the powers we currently have to build a fair, green, and growing economy, which meets the needs and aspirations of people, and where businesses across Scotland thrive and prosper.
- Our leadership in forming the **Wellbeing Economy Governments (WEGo)** group and delivering the National Strategy for Economic Transformation – harnessing the opportunities of the net zero transition and tackling structural inequalities – sets us on a path to a fairer, greener, more prosperous country.
- Our **Wellbeing Economy Monitor tracks** broader economic outcomes beyond GDP on issues such as health, equality, fair work, and the environment and helps us assess Scotland's progress in building a wellbeing economy.
- Our **Wellbeing Economy Toolkit** provides a guide for local authorities to view the wellbeing economy as a system and to develop local strategies focused on wellbeing outcomes, based on Scotland's National Outcomes.
- We have established a new **Centre of Expertise in Equality and Human Rights** within the Scottish Government, which aims to embed equality and human rights in economic policymaking.
- **Examples** of our Wellbeing Economy transition in practice include the Scottish National Investment Bank, the Scottish Child Payment, our Fair Work and Just Transition plans, and our planned legislation on Community Wealth Building, Land Reform, and the Circular Economy.
- **Independence** would allow Scotland to make greater progress, but, until then, we call for the devolution of additional powers – in relation to energy, the economy and employment law – to the Scottish Parliament to support Scotland's transition to a Wellbeing Economy.
- The First Minister has set out **three interlinked missions** as we transition to a Wellbeing Economy: to tackle poverty and inequality; to prioritise public services, creating better communities; and to seize the opportunities of meeting our net zero targets. In doing so we will embed equality and human rights in everything we do.

NEW DEAL FOR BUSINESS

- A high-quality functioning relationship between government, business and other partners is key to ensure we have an economy that is fair, green, and growing.
- In his Policy Prospectus, the first Minister committed to creating a fair, green, and growing economy, using all the powers we have available to support economic growth for a purpose and to help business and trade to thrive.
- A New Deal for Business Group was established to deliver a closer working relationship with business to achieve an economy which prospers while caring for people and planet. The Group reported on 29 June and the First Ministers has accepted all recommendations in full.
- I believe that the implementation of the recommendations in this report will go a long way to achieving that commitment.
- The hard work on implementation begins now. In this next phase of work, it will be important to prioritise among the recommendations and to ensure that the initial focus is on those that are the most important and urgent.

INDEPENDENCE

- It is the Scottish Government's view that people who live in Scotland have the right to choose how they should be governed and to decide if Scotland should become an independent country.
- The Building a New Scotland series seeks to provide the people of Scotland with the information they require to make an informed choice about Scotland's future. Four papers have been published to date and have focused on.

- Independence in the Modern World (analysis of the UK's performance across a range of economic and social indicators relative to that of ten European countries)
- Democracy and Democratic Renewal
- The economy
- Creating a Modern Constitution

Key points from published Building a New Scotland papers, relevant to this audience include:

- Scotland is tied to a low-growth, low-productivity UK economy that is starting to feel the full effects of Brexit. The full powers of independence, combined with existing strengths, could help to build a stronger, more inclusive Wellbeing Economy.
- Scotland has the skilled people, the dynamic businesses, and the natural resources to be just as successful as comparable European countries.
- The government of an independent Scotland would have full powers to take decisions over tax, spending and borrowing.
- Scotland would continue to use the pound sterling for a period before moving to our policy of adopting a Scottish pound. The change would take place as soon as practicable through a careful, managed, and responsible transition, guided by criteria and economic conditions rather than a fixed timetable.
- The proposed Building a New Scotland Fund would invest up to £20bn to boost growth, accelerate the transition away from fossil fuels and deliver long-term benefits to the economy. This would include projects to tackle climate change and to help the economy grow in a more inclusive way.
- Brexit has been hugely damaging to Scotland's economy. An independent Scotland would have the opportunity to apply to re-join the European Union which would restore free movement of goods and people between Scotland and the 27 other EU member states, giving employers access to skills and talent. It would give businesses access to the European Single Market, a market seven times bigger than the UK.

BACKGROUND AND KEY BIOGRAPHIES

Background On Business for Scotland (BfS)

With over 4,000 members, BfS campaigns for business and economic policies that “will allow its members’ businesses to thrive and bring greater prosperity to Scotland”. It has 3 key projects:

- Scotianomics - Setting the agenda for economic and business policies. BfS publish research reports on the Scottish economy.
- Scotland the Brief – publish weekly infographics detailing Scotland’s economic strengths.
- Clarity – Annual conference bringing together economists, policy makers and influencer.

Saltire membership of Business for Scotland is a premium membership costing £1,500 a year. We hold 10 lunches a year for the 60 or so members who are all pro-independence businesspeople.

Recent Ministerial Engagements with Business for Scotland:

Date	Event	Minister
22/6/23	Wellbeing Economy discussion	Cabinet Secretary Wellbeing Economy, Fair Work and Energy
19/1/23	Annual Dinner	First Minister Keynote speech
28/2/20	Saltire Club Lunch	Kate Forbes, Cabinet Secretary for Finance and Economy
13/9/19	Annual Dinner	First Minister Keynote speech

Key Speaker Biographies

Gordon MacIntyre-Kemp, Founder and Chief Executive of Business for Scotland. Before joining Business for Scotland as its MD and CEO Gordon ran a social media and sales & marketing consultancy. He worked as an economic development planning professional, and in marketing roles specialising in pricing modelling and promotional evaluation for global companies. He is a proponent of the emerging New Economics School.



[Redacted S.38(1)(b)]

Progress On the Wellbeing Economy: June 2023

Summary of progress

For the 14 indicators included in the national Wellbeing Economy Monitor, performance has been improving for six of the indicators, maintaining for six and worsening for two.

Improving indicators: greenhouse gas emissions; the percentage of employees earning below the real living wage; active travel (which includes walking and cycling); the percentage of adults with low or no qualifications; community ownership of assets; and income inequality. **[NOTE - This assessment of income inequality has not yet been made public].**

Maintaining indicators: biodiversity; people's participation in education, employment; relative poverty; child gender pay gap; and investment as a GDP.

Worsening indicators: wealth and preventable deaths. Wealth increased between 2016-18 and however it has been broadly stable 2008 (when data collection began). preventable deaths, if COVID-19 excluded, the rate has remained stable over the last few years.

Worsening	Maintaining	Improving
Wealth inequality	Biodiversity	Greenhouse gas emissions
Preventable deaths	Young people's participation	Employees earning below the real living wage
	Relative poverty	Active travel
	Gender pay gap	Low educational attainment
	Child poverty	Income inequality
	Investment	Community ownership

young training, or poverty; the share of

inequality inequality 2018-20, since 2006- For deaths are broadly

New data which we can use to make updated performance assessments has become available for several indicators since the publication of the December 2022 national WEM update. An updated performance assessment has not been provided in the table above for the active travel indicator due to the incomparability of recent annual data, nor for the biodiversity indicator because data for only 2 of the 3 elements of the composite indicator have been updated.

- **Relative poverty** after housing costs affected 21% of the population in 2019-2022. It has been stable since 2015-18.
- **Child poverty** (or the proportion of children living in combined low income and material deprivation after housing costs) was 11% in 2019-22. The long-term trend has been broadly stable.
- **Income inequality** has been decreasing since the most recent high in 2015-18. In 2019-22, the top ten percent of the population had 18% more income (before housing costs) than the bottom forty.
- **The gender pay gap** in weekly earnings slightly increased from 10.3% in 2021 to 10.9% in 2022. The gender pay gap in 2020 of 10.0% was the lowest reported since data collection began in 1997.
- **Investment as a share of GDP** slightly decreased from 18.6% in 2021 to 18.4% in 2022. The rate in 2021 was the highest since 2007. Investment as a share of GDP has been persistently lower in Scotland than in most of our comparator countries.
- **Biodiversity** in terms of terrestrial species abundance increased by 2% in 2019, however marine species abundance declined by 8%. The most recent available data for terrestrial occupancy is for 2016. Since 1994, terrestrial occupancy has increased (+24%), terrestrial abundance has been broadly stable (up 1%), and marine abundance has fallen by 41%.
- **Active travel** – In 2021, 56.2% of journeys under two miles were on foot and 2.8% of journeys under five miles were by bicycle.

Note of Engagement: Cabinet Secretary for Wellbeing Economy, Fair Work and Energy

Lunch meeting with Business for Scotland Saltire Club members

28 July 2023, Cannonball Restaurant, Edinburgh

In attendance:

Around 15-20 business people, members of BfS.

Key speakers:

Neil Gray MSP, Cabinet Secretary for Wellbeing Economy, Fair Work and Energy

Gordon McIntyre-Kemp, Founder and Chief Executive, BfS

[Redacted S.38(1)(b)]

Official support: [Redacted S.38(1)(b)], Wellbeing Economy policy lead

1. GMK welcomed guests and said a few words of introduction, outlining BfS long-held focus on the transition to a **Wellbeing Economy** in Scotland. He emphasised the desire for BfS to work closely with SG towards realising that vision.
2. NG made some opening remarks emphasising SG's strategic priority of building a Wellbeing Economy, one whereby a strong economy serves a strong society, referencing his recent visit to Iceland for the international Wellbeing Economy Forum conference. He highlighted SG's mission of creating a fair, green and growing economy in that transition. He talked about the importance of the economy operating in a way which improves mental health outcomes. He explained the important role of business in contributing towards that transition, and the work SG has been doing to reset the business relationship, led by the New Deal for Business Group.
3. [Redacted S.38(1)(b)] also made some opening remarks to give the perspective from the Westminster system on reserved matters, touching on foreign policy, immigration law, making connections to questions related to independence. She talked about her experience of discrimination and the lack of representation, particularly in relation to being a woman of colour in politics, but also reflected on her family's experiences as businesspeople.
4. An open conversation then followed, with attendees raising and discussing a number of issues including:
 - a. Relative importance of **investment** in universities and investment in supporting business start-ups
 - b. Public **procurement**, where it was felt there was opportunity to go further in supporting the Wellbeing Economy transition.
 - c. **Childcare** policy, highlighting its fundamental importance to the economy in terms of ability to work and quality of life for both women and men, and the pros and cons of localised systems for accessing support.
 - d. How a Wellbeing Economy can/will be financed, including the role of **land taxation** and the role of purpose-led economic growth in broadening the revenue base.
 - e. The importance of **saving public money** through economic policy that supports more businesses to have **purposeful business** models and

practices (e.g. fair work, decarbonisation etc), which would lead to improved social and environmental outcomes.

- f. Potential future opportunities for **corporation tax** models, citing examples from Ireland, such as offering purposeful businesses (putting the Wellbeing Economy approach into practice) lower corporation tax rates.
 - g. The strengths in SG's social/ welfare policies, and opportunities to go further on economic policy to transition to a Wellbeing Economy.
5. The meeting drew to a close and GMK thanked all guests for their attendance and contributions to the discussion.

FIRST MINISTER

What	Business For Scotland – 8th Annual Dinner
Where	Hilton Hotel Glasgow 1 William Street G3 8HT
When	Friday 15 September 2023 <i>Ops Note to follow separately – FMPO to include timings</i>
Key message(s)	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • For Scotland, economic success means making the most of the incredibly rich resources we have and using that to build an economy that works for people and planet. • Economic activity should serve a purpose. It should be a sustainable means to improved health and wellbeing, rather than simply an end in itself. • In the Programme for Government I have pledged to play to Scotland’s strengths while also seizing the new economic opportunities of a just transition by launching a Green Industrial Strategy and speeding up renewable energy projects with a new deal for the onshore wind industry. • Progress will also be made on the implementation of the New Deal for Business Group recommendations, particularly on regulation. • Innovation and entrepreneurship will be boosted by helping start-ups to scale up and building clusters of innovative businesses in growth sectors. • It is the Scottish Government’s view that people who live in Scotland have the right to choose how they should be governed and to decide if Scotland should become an independent country.
Who	Up to 350 Business for Scotland (BfS) members and their guests who are pro-independence
Why	You agreed to deliver the keynote address in the Business for Scotland 8 th annual Dinner and this offers an opportunity to talk about the priorities for Government as set out in PfG, and the shared ambition on how those priorities can make Scotland fairer and more prosperous.
Supporting official	Jack Middleton , Special Advisor to the First Minister You will be greeted by [Redacted S.38(1)(b)], Operations & Events Manager of Business for Scotland, T: [Redacted S.38(1)(b)]

Briefing contents	Annex A: Purpose, Agenda Annex B: Background Lines Annex C: Background and Key Biographies
--------------------------	---

ANNEX A

PURPOSE, AGENDA, VIP GUESTS AND LINES TO TAKE

PURPOSE

You have agreed to deliver the keynote address at the 8th Annual Business for Scotland Dinner. The event, usually attended by a business audience of around 350 guests, offers attendees the opportunity to network over dinner and enjoy speeches in the company of some of Scotland's politicians and business people. Guests will mainly be from SMEs, 70% of which are from across central Scotland and largely supporters of Scottish independence.

AGENDA

6:15pm: Guest arrival and drinks reception.

6:55pm: Guests called into the ballroom.

7:00pm: Top table piped into the room followed by performance by [Redacted S.38(1)(b)].

7:10pm: Welcome and toast by [Redacted S.38(1)(b)].

7:20pm: Full Dinner service starts.

9:00pm: Heads or Tails (fundraising game).

9:15pm: Full Dinner service ends.

9:20pm: FM Key note address (Attached separately)

9:40pm Annual address by CEO, Gordon MacIntyre-Kemp.

9:55pm: Fundraising auction.

10:10pm: Host brings proceedings to a close and proposes a vote of thanks. **FM**

FREE TO LEAVE

10:30pm: Official event finish time. However, the event continues till late and the bar will remain open.

VIP GUESTS THE FM WILL BE INTRODUCED TO – PRE DRINKS RECEPTION

TOP TABLE

- **Gordon MacIntyre-Kemp**, Chief Executive, Business for Scotland.
- [Redacted S.38(1)(b)]

As well as the top table guests, Gordon will introduce the FM to the following people at the reception:

[Redacted S.38(1)(b)]

BACKGROUND LINES TO TAKE

WELLBEING ECONOMY

- [Redacted S.30(c)]
- We recognise and welcome the important work and leadership of Business for Scotland in promoting the Wellbeing Economy approach, and the broad reach of the organisation's membership which will be crucial in driving forward the transition to a Wellbeing Economy.
- The New Deal for Business Group recognised the need for better and wider engagement with the business community around the Wellbeing Economy in its report published on 29 June 2023.
- One of its recommendations is for the Scottish Government, trade bodies and businesses to work together to better establish the business case for supporting a Wellbeing Economy and find ways to showcase the benefits and share good practice to all parts of the business community in Scotland. This should be led by business.
- [Redacted S.30(c)]

PROGRAMME FOR GOVERNMENT

- The package of measures aims to help build a more equal society through concerted efforts to eradicate poverty, tackle the cost of living crisis, and create opportunities for businesses.
- This includes expanding childcare provision to increase access for more families across Scotland as part of a new package of measures to offer practical help and support.
- On the economy, the First Minister has pledged to play to Scotland's strengths while also seizing the new economic opportunities of a just transition by launching a Green Industrial Strategy and speeding up renewable energy projects with a new deal for the onshore wind industry.
- Progress will also be made on the implementation of the New Deal for Business Group recommendations, particularly on regulation.
- Innovation and entrepreneurship will be boosted by helping start-ups to scale up and building clusters of innovative businesses in growth sectors.
- There will be support for small businesses and work will continue to launch a Talent Attraction and Migration Service to help address skills shortages. Mobilising private investment will be a priority and a dedicated Investment Unit will be established to take forward the forthcoming recommendations of the First Minister's Investor Panel.

NEW DEAL FOR BUSINESS

- the New Deal for Business Group was set up, to reset that relationship between government and business, building trust and driving meaningful, tangible change - focusing on co-designing policies that affect the business community to achieve good, mutually beneficial outcomes.

- The Group has already submitted its recommendations, and last week's Programme for Government sets out the steps we will take to deliver on them.
- There were important messages from the Group about the cumulative impact of regulations on businesses, and the Programme for Government commits us to working with business to improve the way we develop, review and implement regulations. This includes relaunching the Regulatory Review Group and improving the Business and Regulatory Impact Assessment toolkit and process.
- The New Deal for Business Group is just the start of a process to ensure we create the conditions together to support business, which in turn will drive the economic growth that feeds into strong and sustainable finances to tackle poverty and support our public services and communities.

INDEPENDENCE

- The Building a New Scotland series seeks to provide the people of Scotland with the information they require to make an informed choice about Scotland's future. Five papers have been published to date and have focused on.
 - Independence in the Modern World (analysis of the UK's performance across a range of economic and social indicators relative to that of ten European countries)
 - Democracy and Democratic Renewal
 - The economy
 - Creating a Modern Constitution
 - Citizenship
- **Key points from published Building a New Scotland papers, relevant to this audience include:**
- Scotland is tied to a low-growth, low-productivity UK economy that is starting to feel the full effects of Brexit. The full powers of independence, combined with existing strengths, could help to build a stronger, more inclusive Wellbeing Economy.
- The government of an independent Scotland would have full powers to take decisions over tax, spending and borrowing.
- Scotland would continue to use the pound sterling for a period before moving to our policy of adopting a Scottish pound. The change would take place as soon as practicable through a careful, managed, and responsible transition, guided by criteria and economic conditions rather than a fixed timetable.
- The proposed Building a New Scotland Fund would invest up to £20bn to boost growth, accelerate the transition away from fossil fuels and deliver long-term benefits to the economy. This would include projects to tackle climate change and to help the economy grow in a more inclusive way.
- Brexit has been hugely damaging to Scotland's economy. An independent Scotland would have the opportunity to apply to re-join the European Union which would restore free movement of goods and people between Scotland and the 27 other EU member states, giving employers access to skills and talent. It

would give businesses access to the European Single Market, a market seven times bigger than the UK.

ANNEX C

BACKGROUND AND KEY BIOGRAPHIES

Background On Business for Scotland (BfS)

With over 4,000 members, BfS campaigns for business and economic policies that “will allow its members’ businesses to thrive and bring greater prosperity to Scotland”. It has 3 key projects:

- *Scotianomics* - Setting the agenda for economic and business policies. BfS publish research reports on the Scottish economy.
- *Scotland the Brief* – publish weekly infographics detailing Scotland’s economic strengths.
- *Clarity* – Annual conference bringing together economists, policy makers and influencer.

Saltire membership of Business for Scotland is a premium membership costing £1,500 a year. We hold 10 lunches a year for the 60 or so members who are all pro-independence businesspeople.

Recent Ministerial Engagements with Business for Scotland:

Date	Event	Minister
28/7/23	Saltire Lunch	Cabinet Secretary for Wellbeing Economy, Fair Work and Energy
22/6/23	Wellbeing Economy discussion	Cabinet Secretary Wellbeing Economy, Fair Work and Energy
19/1/23	Annual Dinner	First Minister Keynote speech
28/2/20	Saltire Club Lunch	Kate Forbes, Cabinet Secretary for Finance and Economy
13/9/19	Annual Dinner	First Minister Keynote speech

Key Speaker Biographies

Gordon MacIntyre-Kemp, Founder and Chief Executive of Business for Scotland.



Before joining Business for Scotland as its MD and CEO Gordon ran a social media and sales & marketing consultancy. He worked as an economic development planning professional, and in marketing roles specialising in pricing modelling and promotional evaluation for global companies. He is a proponent of the emerging New Economics School.

Cabinet Secretary for Wellbeing Economy, Fair Work
and Energy

Rùnaire a' Chaibineit airson Eaconamaidh do Mhath

Dhaoine, Obair Chothromach is Cumhachd

Neil Gray MSP

Niall Gray BPA

T: 0300 244 4000

E: scottish.ministers@gov.scot

Gordon MacIntyre-Kemp

Business for Scotland

[Redacted S.38(1)(b)]@businessforscotland.co.uk

5 February 2024

Dear Gordon,

Building a New Scotland: Culture in an Independent Scotland

On 2 February, the Scottish Government published 'Culture in an Independent Scotland', the tenth in our 'Building a New Scotland' series of independence prospectus papers, a copy of which is attached.

Scotland has a deep and rich culture that is world renowned. The Scottish Government is determined to protect and enhance it, putting it at the heart of our communities for the benefit of everyone. This paper sets out proposals on how independence would: further support the creative economy and realise the potential of our culture and creative sectors on the international stage and how it would build on the strength of our screen sector. It sets out how independence would build on the progress that has been made under devolution, creating new opportunities to support access to culture and to provide future Scottish Governments with powers to ensure our culture, heritage and creative sectors have adequate and appropriate support to develop and thrive.

By joining the EU as an independent nation, Scotland's creative industries would also have unrestricted access to the EU market and freedom of movement, and access to EU programmes which would provide an important source of funding, projects and collaboration. Freedom of movement would make activities such as touring, collaborating with artists in other countries, and taking part in cultural productions and festivals, much smoother and less expensive.

The paper also outlines how we would protect public service broadcasting with independence. This Scottish Government would establish a new Scottish public service broadcaster; to reflect the specific needs, interests and values of Scottish audiences and creative industries. Independence would provide the powers to develop a broadcasting strategy to meet the requirements of audiences in Scotland, improve authentic representation of people here, and engage with partners around the UK and beyond to explore continued access to the programming and services that matter to Scottish audiences, while keeping editorial and creative independence from government.

As our culture and creative sectors navigate the impacts of Brexit, the aftermath of the COVID-19 pandemic, and the increased cost of living, it is therefore more important than ever that Scotland has the full powers of independence to support and develop them.

The paper is available in a number of translations and accessible formats, at www.gov.scot/newscotland. If you have any questions on this paper or other papers in the Building a New Scotland series, please contact constitutionalfutures@gov.scot.

Yours sincerely,

NEIL GRAY

**CABINET SECRETARY FOR WELLBEING ECONOMY, NET ZERO AND ENERGY
BRIEFING FOR MEETING WITH GORDON MACINTYRE-KEMP**

What	Meeting with Gordon MacIntyre-Kemp, Business for Scotland
When	Tuesday 26 March 2024, 16:15 - 17:00
Where	Parliament – Room T4.22B
Who	Gordon MacIntyre-Kemp, founder and CEO, Business for Scotland
Why	<p>MiCase Reference: 202400398552.</p> <p>Mr MacIntyre-Kemp requested a meeting to provide an update on Business for Scotland’s Wellbeing Economy projects and [Redacted S.30(c)].</p> <p>For awareness:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Mr Hepburn and Kevin Pringle met with Gordon MacIntyre-Kemp on 21 March. • [Redacted S.30(c)]
Key messages	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • A fair, green, and growing economy, which benefits all of Scotland’s communities and people, is critical to our three interconnected missions of Equality, Opportunity, and Community. • Economic success means making the most of Scotland’s incredibly rich resources to build an economy that works for people, not the other way around. • A strong partnership between government, business and all sectors is essential if we are to build an economy that is fair, green, and growing. • We want to work with business as we transform our economy, drawing on the knowledge and expertise of businesses of all different sizes in different sectors and across business models. • This includes working with business to deliver on the recommendations of the New Deal for Business Group report, which includes recommendations on businesses’ role in the Wellbeing Economy transition.
Official support	[Redacted S.38(1)(b)], Wellbeing Economy Team Leader, [Redacted S.38(1)(b)]
Briefing contents	<p>Annex A Biography and Background</p> <p>Annex B Hot Topics and Sensitivities</p> <p>Annex C Top Lines</p>

BIOGRAPHY AND BACKGROUND



Gordon MacIntyre-Kemp is founder and Chief Executive of Business for Scotland. Previously he managed a social media and sales & marketing consultancy. He has also worked as an economic development planning professional, and in marketing roles specialising in pricing modelling and promotional evaluation for global companies.

Business for Scotland Background and Key Projects

Business for Scotland (BfS) is a business network, lobbying and consulting company that runs social policy and political campaigns; publishes articles and research reports; and organises networking events, conferences, and dinners. It has over 4,000 associate and stakeholder members, comprising business owners and senior managers.

Scotland the Brief: A 200-page book, which investigates the breadth, structure, and quality of Scotland's economy. A second edition was published in November 2022 and the book has sold over 60,000 copies in total.

Believe in Scotland: A national campaigning organisation for Scottish independence, managed by Business for Scotland. Believe in Scotland is advised by a Steering Group consisting of elected representatives from 17 regions across Scotland and representatives from 9 national campaigns.

Clarity – Rethinking Economics: A newly proposed annual conference to bring together leading economists, policymakers, business people and influencers to create a new economic approach that focuses on fairness, the environment and people to deliver a fairer, more prosperous society.

Scotianomics: Publishes research reports that aim to educate and inform on the Scottish economy, its strengths, threats, and opportunities. They have also given evidence and policy advice to organisations such as the Scottish Government, UK Government, and the OECD. They champion the Wellbeing Economic Approach, which is broadly in line with the Scottish Government's approach to the wellbeing economy.

HOT TOPICS AND SENSITIVITIES

[Redacted S.33(1)(b)]

Lines to take:

- Businesses have a critical role in our just transition to a net zero, Wellbeing Economy.
- The New Deal for Business Group report includes recommendations on businesses' role in the Wellbeing Economy transition. It concluded that the greatest effect could be had in encouraging and supporting previously unengaged businesses to take their first steps.
- The report also includes a recommendation on identifying ways for business-led activity to better showcase the benefits of contributing to the Wellbeing Economy transition and share good practice to all parts of the business community in Scotland.
- [Redacted 30(b)(i)]

SCOTIANOMICS – WELLBEING PENSION - BACKGROUND

The Scotianomics report, 'Investigation into the requirement for and optimum level of a Wellbeing Pension' (April 2023), presents the concept of a Wellbeing Pension, calculating the amount required to act as a starting point (as base level of public pension) to ensure that all pensioners receive an adequate income throughout retirement to live with dignity and end the pensioner poverty levels caused by the inadequacies of the current UK pension system. The report called for the introduction of a "wellbeing pension" of £225 per person, per week. It proposes that this should replace current state pension provision. In response to rising inflation, Scotianomics updated the analysis in April and revised the call to £235 per person per week from 2023/24.

Recent correspondence suggests that the Scotianomics recommended level for a Wellbeing Pension would increase to £241.50 from April 2024.

Key Points:

- The report makes well-observed comments around the causes of pensioner poverty, the gender pensions gap, and widening financial inequalities among older people.
- It aims to make the case for a flat-rate state pension as a tool for improving the incomes of those with small or no occupational pensions provision, and making sure that all pensioners have an adequate income to live a dignified life.
- The report provides analysis of the levels of both the new state pension (introduced 2016) and the basic state pension rates (in place before that date). The analysis doesn't include the various additional elements of the basic state pension or the passported elements of the pensions credit, which means that many of the income calculations and comparisons are not robust.
- The report also uses forecast UK level National Insurance Contributions to demonstrate the "affordability" of the wellbeing pension. Again this analysis over simplifies the use of forecasting and the demand-led nature of pensions spending and funding.
- The report makes reference to the Minimum Income Standard, developed by Loughborough University, in setting the rate of the Wellbeing pension. The MIS is also being used by the Living Wage Foundation to encourage employers to offer a "Living Pension" to encourage better occupational pensions savings.
- At the SNP party conference in October 2022, it was agreed that, in an independent Scotland, a "real living pension" would be set at £220 a week, based on 2022-23 levels.

- The current full UK state pension is £203.85 per week and will rise to £221.20 from April 2024.
- Initial analysis of the Scotianomics recommendations suggested that raising the state pension to a flat rate of £235 in 2023-24 would have added £1.8 billion to the state pensions bill in Scotland – an increase of around 17%.
- By 2028/29, the cost would increase to £2.3 billion – 18% more than the current system and costs will continue to grow thereafter.

Engagement on this issue:

- Mr Hepburn and Kevin Pringle met with Gordon MacIntyre-Kemp on 21 March.
- [Redacted S.30(c)]

Lines to Take:

- The position on pensions is the same as was set out [p429] in the 2013 White Paper.
- *“For those people living and working in Scotland at the time of independence, the UK pension entitlement they have accrued prior to independence will become their Scottish State Pension entitlement. Any pension entitlement accrued in Scotland after independence will also form part of that Scottish State Pension; and on retirement, the Scottish State Pension will be paid by the Scottish Government.”*
- Clearly, following a vote for independence, the Scottish and UK Governments would open negotiations on a range of issues. This would cover distribution of existing UK liabilities and assets, including those relating to pensions.
- After independence, pensions policy, as well as responsibility for payments, will be decided by governments the people of Scotland vote for.
- An independent Scotland will also have full powers to protect and improve both state and occupational pensions, encourage saving for secure retirement, and set the State Pension Age at a level appropriate to Scottish circumstances.

WASPI WOMEN CAMPAIGN

Issue: The Parliamentary and Health Service Ombudsman (PHSO) has published its final report on State Pension age changes for women born in the 1950s, the subjects of the WASPI campaign. The report finds that the **women were subject to maladministration** by the DWP, due to their failure to properly communicate the changes.

Background:

- The PHSO has a range of compensation levels that can be recommended in cases of maladministration – the highest of which is £10,000 or more for the most serious cases. The PHSO has recommended that the women should receive compensation of between £1,000 and £2,950. This is less than the £10,000 or more called for by the WASPI campaign.
- The PHSO estimate that it would cost between £3.5bn and £10.5bn to compensate the women who were affected at the recommended level. However, they have not made a specific recommendation as to whether compensation should be targeted at those women who can demonstrate that they lost out financially, or whether it should be paid to all women within scope, who amount to 3.6m.
- The report also called on the DWP to admit to the maladministration and apologise to the women affected. The DWP have said that they will consider and respond to the report in due course.

- Prior to the report today, Alan Brown, SNP MP for Kilmarnock and Loudon tabled a State Pension Age (Compensation) Bill on 7 February with cross party support, calling on the UK Government to publish a compensation framework for WASPI women set at £3,000 to £10,000 or more. The Bill is due to be read a second time on 19 April.

[Redacted S.30(b)(i)]

Lines to take:

- The Scottish Government has always supported the WASPI campaign, and would urge the UK Government to support the Bill which was recently introduced by Alan Brown MP to compensate them for the poor way the UK Government has continued to handle their case.
- It is for the UK Government to take responsibility for the hardship caused by their failure to properly communicate the changes to the State Pension age which affected these women.

CONSTITUTION

Issue: In a recent opinion piece in The National, Gordon MacIntyre-Kemp advocates for ‘a new national conversation on how independence with a wellbeing economic approach will enrich the lives of the people of Scotland.’

Lines to take:

- Whilst we are bound to a failed UK economic model and do not hold all financial levers needed, we will use all the powers we do have to build a fair, green and growing economy which meets people’s needs, where there are opportunities for all, and where businesses thrive and their success benefits all of society.
- We have been clear that our ambition to make Scotland fairer goes hand in hand with making Scotland more prosperous.
- Independence would allow Scotland to make greater progress but, until then, we call for the devolution of additional powers - in relation to energy, the economy and employment law - to the Scottish Parliament to support Scotland's transition to a Wellbeing Economy.
- The Scottish Government committed in its 2022 Programme for Government to providing the people of Scotland with the information they need to make a choice about Scotland’s future.
- The ‘Building a New Scotland’ series is designed to give people the information they need to make an informed choice about their future and to stimulate debate over what that future should be.
- This month we published the latest (eleventh) Building a New Scotland paper, ‘An independent Scotland’s place in the world.’

Background on Building a New Scotland Economy Speech Series

[Redacted S.30(c)]

The First Minister launched the speech series with a first speech on Industrial Policy in an Independent Scotland at the University of Glasgow on Monday, 8 January 2024.

The speech was designed to: promote the economic opportunities available to an independent Scotland in the EU; answer the question: Why industrial policy and why now?; highlight the UK’s current economic under performance (stagnating productivity leading to flatlining wages), the UK’s increasing isolation and failure to develop an effective response to the ‘new industrial policy’ being pursued by the US and the EU (and not so new strategy in China); the Scottish economy under devolution vs. the Scottish economy with independence and with the benefits of EU membership,

how Scotland can complement EU and global industrial strategy initiatives. The speech proposed three key measures: 1. join the EU as an independent country, 2. establish a dynamic government ministry and consensus-building institutions to drive the policy and 3. undertake large-scale public investment in key areas of comparative advantage.

[Redacted S.30(c)]

MEASURING A WELLBEING ECONOMY

Issue: The Business for Scotland Think Tank, Scotianomics, published the *Defining and Quantifying the Wellbeing Economics Approach* paper in October 2023. The report provides a model for measuring the success of a country's wellbeing economy through the Scotianomics Wellbeing Index. This Index provides a measurement of the wellbeing of 33 OECD nations across five wellbeing dimensions.

To Note: **Scotland is not included** in the Scotianomics Wellbeing Economic Index 2023 due to **an inability to gather sufficient data** on Scotland that corresponds with similar data from the other countries included.

Lines to take:

- To help assess Scotland's progress in creating a Wellbeing Economy, we have published a Wellbeing Economy Monitor – which tracks broader outcomes of economic activity using indicators relating to health, equality, fair work, and the environment, among others.
- The Monitor has been developed to complement and look beyond GDP to measure other indicators of economic success that relate to the wellbeing of people and the natural environment, based on Scotland's National Outcomes and the UN Sustainable Development Goals.
- Traditional economic metrics like GDP will remain an important measure but cannot be viewed in isolation.

TOP LINES

WELLBEING ECONOMY

Our vision is for a Wellbeing Economy, which meets the needs and aspirations of people and provides opportunities for all.

- The just transition to a net zero, nature positive, Wellbeing Economy is an opportunity to create new, good jobs and businesses and support the transition of existing sectors in a way that has fairness and equality built in.
- This is how we will protect the planet, improve living standards, create good and sustainable jobs, increase wages, build economic resilience, and attract investment.
- Our approach will be informed by our Wellbeing Economy Expert Advisory Group and through our international engagement with the Wellbeing Economy Governments (WEGo) network.
- We will work closely with private and public sectors – locally, nationally and UK wide – and engage directly with communities and partners in the third sector.

NEW DEAL FOR BUSINESS GROUP

A strong partnership between government, business and all sectors are essential if we are to build an economy that is fair, green, and growing.

- Economic activity should serve a purpose. Business is a force for good and has a pivotal role in our just transition to a net zero, nature positive Wellbeing Economy.
- The New Deal for Business group report includes recommendations on businesses' role in the Wellbeing Economy transition. For example, we are engaging with businesses on health and work, flexible working, and to inform the development of Just Transition Plans.
- The NDB Wellbeing Economy sub-group presented five recommendations, which build upon the Business Purpose Commission report, and focus on creating conditions for transformative change through partnership working.
- The recommendations include developing a simple description of the Wellbeing Economy that is meaningful to business; identifying key metrics to help businesses understand the impact of their actions; and identifying ways for business-led activity to better showcase the benefits of contributing to the Wellbeing Economy transition.

NATIONAL STRATEGY FOR ECONOMIC TRANSFORMATION - REFRESH

The National Strategy for Economic Transformation (NSET) set out our bold aims to deliver fairer, greener prosperity for all Scotland's people and places.

- While we have made significant progress to date, we recognise that two years on from NSET's publication, much has changed – fiscally, politically, and internationally.
- We therefore intend to refresh our economic strategy to ensure that it remains fit for purpose to deliver in a changing landscape whilst maintaining our central objective – to build a fair, green and growing economy.
- The refresh will be focused, with an emphasis on prioritising the interventions through which we can achieve the greatest impact.
- We expect that key themes will include innovation and entrepreneurship, investment, people, new market opportunities and the business environment.
- We are engaging with delivery partners and a range of key stakeholders as we progress work on the refresh in the coming months.

GREEN INDUSTRIAL STRATEGY

The global transition to net zero offers enormous economic opportunities for Scotland. We have strengths and potential in sectors ranging from offshore wind, hydrogen, and advanced manufacturing to data and finance.

- Across the country, Scottish firms have the chance to sell to the world and create good, well-paid jobs as part of a fair, green and growing economy.
- The Green Industrial Strategy (GIS) will offer a clear view of the economic sectors and industries in which we have greatest strength and most potential and set out what government [and partners] will do to support growth and investment in those areas.
- It will help give the private sector confidence to make decisions and invest in Scotland.
- The GIS will sit alongside and support the development of our sectoral Just Transition Plans.

Meeting between Cabinet Secretary for Wellbeing Economy, Net Zero and Energy and Business for Scotland

Meeting note - 26 March 2024

In attendance: Emilie-Louise Purdie (SpAd); [Redacted S.38(1)(b)] (official support); PS.

Actions

- Cab Sec to aim to join the upcoming meeting on GERS between DFM and Gordon MacIntyre-Kemp (GMK) on 16 April. **PO to make arrangements.**
- [Redacted S.30(c)]

Key points raised in meeting

1. Discussion on GDP being no more important than equality as a measure of prosperity and that making progress on a range of social, environmental and economic measures is the only way to achieve sustainable growth.
2. Noted the international interest and momentum in the Wellbeing Economy (WE) approach as well as a tendency for 'tick boxing' by some nations. GMK advocated including a broader set of metrics in SG socio-economic planning and getting businesses on board with the National Performance Framework.
3. GMK advocated extensive engagement with businesses, including PLCs and SMEs, so they feel a sense of ownership and understanding of the economic benefits of the approach.
4. [Redacted S.33(1)(b)]
5. [Redacted S.30(c)]
6. GMK highlighted that gender equality in the private sector is included in the Scotianomics metrics report and noted a lack of Scotland-level data. He highlighted challenges of accessing data, e.g. on exports, within Scotland, and the risks of under and over reporting (e.g. of exports, costs) in Scottish GDP figures.
7. Cab Sec said she was keen to hear views on the metrics side, for example avoiding tick-boxing and availability of good data.

**DEPUTY FIRST MINISTER
BRIEFING FOR MEETING WITH GORDON MACINTYRE-KEMP**

What	Meeting with Gordon MacIntyre-Kemp, Business for Scotland
When	Thursday 18 April 2024, 15:30 - 16:15
Where	Parliament – DFM’s Office, T4.23
Who	Gordon MacIntyre-Kemp, founder and CEO, Business for Scotland
Why	<p>MiCase Reference: 202400402120.</p> <p>Mr MacIntyre-Kemp requested a meeting to discuss alternatives to the Scottish Government’s GERS publication and provide an update on Business for Scotland’s Wellbeing Pension campaign.</p>
Key messages	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • GERS is a National Statistics publication, which uses methodologies developed in consultation with users. We are always open to feedback on how it could be improved. • Information on Scotland’s public finances under independence is being set out as part of the Building a New Scotland series. • We are committed to a wellbeing economy in Scotland, and delivering this through our National Strategy for Economic Transformation and our Green Industrial Strategy. However, pensions are a reserved issue. • More broadly, we are continuing our work with the Minimum Income Guarantee Expert Group to consider feasible steps towards delivering a Minimum Income Guarantee in Scotland.
Official support	Gary Gillespie, Chief Economist, OCEA [Redacted S.38(1)(b)] Macroeconomic and Fiscal Analysis Unit Head, OCEA, [Redacted S.38(1)(b)]
Briefing contents	<p>Annex A Biography and Background</p> <p>Annex B Hot Topics and Sensitivities</p> <p>Annex C Top Lines on GERS and Economy</p>

ANNEX A

BIOGRAPHY AND BACKGROUND



Gordon MacIntyre-Kemp is founder and Chief Executive of Business for Scotland. Previously he managed a social media and sales & marketing consultancy. He has also worked as an economic development planning professional, and in marketing roles specialising in pricing modelling and promotional evaluation for global companies.

Business for Scotland Background and Key Projects

Business for Scotland (BfS) is a business network, lobbying and consulting company that runs social policy and political campaigns; publishes articles and research reports; and organises networking events, conferences, and dinners. It has over 4,000 associate and stakeholder members, comprising business owners and senior managers.

Scotland the Brief: A 200-page book, which investigates the breadth, structure, and quality of Scotland's economy. A second edition was published in November 2022 and the book has sold over 60,000 copies in total.

Believe in Scotland: A national campaigning organisation for Scottish independence, managed by Business for Scotland. Believe in Scotland is advised by a Steering Group consisting of elected representatives from 17 regions across Scotland and representatives from 9 national campaigns.

Clarity – Rethinking Economics: A newly proposed annual conference to bring together leading economists, policymakers, business people and influencers to create a new economic approach that focuses on fairness, the environment and people to deliver a fairer, more prosperous society.

Scotianomics: Publishes research reports that aim to educate and inform on the Scottish economy, its strengths, threats, and opportunities. They have also given evidence and policy advice to organisations such as the Scottish Government, UK Government, and the OECD. They champion the Wellbeing Economic Approach, which is broadly in line with the Scottish Government's approach to the wellbeing economy.

ANNEX B

HOT TOPICS AND SENSITIVITIES

[Redacted S.33(1)(b)]

Lines to take:

- Businesses have a critical role in our just transition to a net zero, Wellbeing Economy.
- The New Deal for Business Group report includes recommendations on businesses' role in the Wellbeing Economy transition. It concluded that the greatest effect could be had in encouraging and supporting previously unengaged businesses to take their first steps.

- The report also includes a recommendation on identifying ways for business-led activity to better showcase the benefits of contributing to the Wellbeing Economy transition and share good practice to all parts of the business community in Scotland.
- [Redacted S.30(b)(i)]

SCOTIANOMICS – WELLBEING PENSION - BACKGROUND

The Scotianomics report, 'Investigation into the requirement for and optimum level of a Wellbeing Pension' (April 2023), presents the concept of a Wellbeing Pension, calculating the amount required to act as a starting point (as base level of public pension) to ensure that all pensioners receive an adequate income throughout retirement to live with dignity and end the pensioner poverty levels caused by the inadequacies of the current UK pension system. The report called for the introduction of a "wellbeing pension" of £225 per person, per week. It proposes that this should replace current state pension provision. In response to rising inflation, Scotianomics updated the analysis in April and revised the call to £235 per person per week from 2023/24.

Recent correspondence suggests that the Scotanomics recommended level for a Wellbeing Pension would increase to £241.50 from April 2024.

Key Points:

- The report makes well-observed comments around the causes of pensioner poverty, the gender pensions gap, and widening financial inequalities among older people.
- It aims to make the case for a flat-rate state pension as a tool for improving the incomes of those with small or no occupational pensions provision, and making sure that all pensioners have an adequate income to live a dignified life.
- The report provides analysis of the levels of both the new state pension (introduced 2016) and the basic state pension rates (in place before that date). The analysis doesn't include the various additional elements of the basic state pension or the passported elements of the pensions credit, which means that many of the income calculations and comparisons are not robust.
- The report also uses forecast UK level National Insurance Contributions to demonstrate the "affordability" of the wellbeing pension. Again this analysis over simplifies the use of forecasting and the demand-led nature of pensions spending and funding.
- The report makes reference to the Minimum Income Standard, developed by Loughborough University, in setting the rate of the Wellbeing pension. The MIS is also being used by the Living Wage Foundation to encourage employers to offer a "Living Pension" to encourage better occupational pensions savings.
- At the SNP party conference in October 2022, it was agreed that, in an independent Scotland, a "real living pension" would be set at £220 a week, based on 2022-23 levels.
- The current full UK state pension is £203.85 per week and will rise to £221.20 from April 2024.
- Initial analysis of the Scotianomics recommendations suggested that raising the state pension to a flat rate of £235 in 2023-24 would have added £1.8 billion to the state pensions bill in Scotland – an increase of around 17%.
- By 2028/29, the cost would increase to £2.3 billion – 18% more than the current system and costs will continue to grow thereafter.

Engagement on this issue:

- Mr Hepburn and Kevin Pringle met with Gordon MacIntyre-Kemp on 21 March.
- [Redacted S.30(c)]

Lines to Take:

- The position on pensions is the same as was set out [p429] in the 2013 White Paper.
- *“For those people living and working in Scotland at the time of independence, the UK pension entitlement they have accrued prior to independence will become their Scottish State Pension entitlement. Any pension entitlement accrued in Scotland after independence will also form part of that Scottish State Pension; and on retirement, the Scottish State Pension will be paid by the Scottish Government.”*
- Clearly, following a vote for independence, the Scottish and UK Governments would open negotiations on a range of issues. This would cover distribution of existing UK liabilities and assets, including those relating to pensions.
- After independence, pensions policy, as well as responsibility for payments, will be decided by governments the people of Scotland vote for.
- An independent Scotland will also have full powers to protect and improve both state and occupational pensions, encourage saving for secure retirement, and set the State Pension Age at a level appropriate to Scottish circumstances.

WASPI WOMEN CAMPAIGN

Issue: The Parliamentary and Health Service Ombudsman (PHSO) has published its final report on State Pension age changes for women born in the 1950s, the subjects of the WASPI campaign. The report finds that the **women were subject to maladministration** by the DWP, due to their failure to properly communicate the changes.

Background:

- The PHSO has a range of compensation levels that can be recommended in cases of maladministration – the highest of which is £10,000 or more for the most serious cases. The PHSO has recommended that the women should receive compensation of between £1,000 and £2,950. This is less than the £10,000 or more called for by the WASPI campaign.
- The PHSO estimate that it would cost between £3.5bn and £10.5bn to compensate the women who were affected at the recommended level. However, they have not made a specific recommendation as to whether compensation should be targeted at those women who can demonstrate that they lost out financially, or whether it should be paid to all women within scope, who amount to 3.6m.
- The report also called on the DWP to admit to the maladministration and apologise to the women affected. The DWP have said that they will consider and respond to the report in due course.
- Prior to the report today, Alan Brown, SNP MP for Kilmarnock and Loudon tabled a State Pension Age (Compensation) Bill on 7 February with cross party support, calling on the UK Government to publish a compensation framework for WASPI women set at £3,000 to £10,000 or more. The Bill is due to be read a second time on 19 April.

[Redacted S.30(b)(i)]

Lines to take:

- The Scottish Government has always supported the WASPI campaign, and would urge the UK Government to support the Bill which was recently introduced by Alan Brown MP to compensate them for the poor way the UK Government has continued to handle their case.
- It is for the UK Government to take responsibility for the hardship caused by their failure to properly communicate the changes to the State Pension age which affected these women.

CONSTITUTION

Issue: In a recent opinion piece in The National, Gordon MacIntyre-Kemp advocates for ‘a new national conversation on how independence with a wellbeing economic approach will enrich the lives of the people of Scotland.’

Lines to take:

- Whilst we are bound to a failed UK economic model and do not hold all financial levers needed, we will use all the powers we do have to build a fair, green and growing economy which meets people’s needs, where there are opportunities for all, and where businesses thrive and their success benefits all of society.
- We have been clear that our ambition to make Scotland fairer goes hand in hand with making Scotland more prosperous.
- Independence would allow Scotland to make greater progress but, until then, we call for the devolution of additional powers - in relation to energy, the economy and employment law - to the Scottish Parliament to support Scotland's transition to a Wellbeing Economy.
- The Scottish Government committed in its 2022 Programme for Government to providing the people of Scotland with the information they need to make a choice about Scotland’s future.
- The ‘Building a New Scotland’ series is designed to give people the information they need to make an informed choice about their future and to stimulate debate over what that future should be.
- This month we published the latest (eleventh) Building a New Scotland paper, ‘An independent Scotland’s place in the world.’

Background on Building a New Scotland Economy Speech Series

[Redacted S.30(c)]

The First Minister launched the speech series with a first speech on Industrial Policy in an Independent Scotland at the University of Glasgow on Monday, 8 January 2024.

The speech was designed to: promote the economic opportunities available to an independent Scotland in the EU; answer the question: Why industrial policy and why now?; highlight the UK’s current economic under performance (stagnating productivity leading to flatlining wages), the UK’s increasing isolation and failure to develop an effective response to the ‘new industrial policy’ being pursued by the US and the EU (and not so new strategy in China); the Scottish economy under devolution vs. the Scottish economy with independence and with the benefits of EU membership, how Scotland can complement EU and global industrial strategy initiatives. The speech proposed three key measures: 1. join the EU as an independent country, 2. establish a dynamic government ministry and consensus-building institutions to drive the policy and 3. undertake large-scale public investment in key areas of comparative advantage.

[Redacted S.30(c)]

MEASURING A WELLBEING ECONOMY

Issue: The Business for Scotland Think Tank, Scotianomics, published the *Defining and Quantifying the Wellbeing Economics Approach* paper in October 2023. The report provides a model for measuring the success of a country's wellbeing economy through the Scotianomics Wellbeing Index. This Index provides a measurement of the wellbeing of 33 OECD nations across five wellbeing dimensions.

To Note: **Scotland is not included** in the Scotianomics Wellbeing Economic Index 2023 due to **an inability to gather sufficient data** on Scotland that corresponds with similar data from the other countries included.

Lines to take:

- To help assess Scotland's progress in creating a Wellbeing Economy, we have published a Wellbeing Economy Monitor – which tracks broader outcomes of economic activity using indicators relating to health, equality, fair work, and the environment, among others.
- The Monitor has been developed to complement and look beyond GDP to measure other indicators of economic success that relate to the wellbeing of people and the natural environment, based on Scotland's National Outcomes and the UN Sustainable Development Goals.
- Traditional economic metrics like GDP will remain an important measure but cannot be viewed in isolation.

ANNEX C

TOP LINES ON GERS AND THE ECONOMY

GERS represents Scotland's fiscal position under current constitutional arrangements.

- We have always been clear that the GERS figures show Scotland's finances as part of the UK, not as an independent country.
- A significant amount of the GERS spending (41%) and revenue (64%) is reserved and outside of the control of the Scottish Government.
- GERS 2022-23 assigns Scotland a population share of UK reserved debt interest (£9.2 billion) and defence spending (£4.5 billion).
- This takes no account of the £429 billion in revenue the UK Government has received from North Sea production in real terms over the past sixty years.

We have now published twelve papers in the Building a New Scotland series.

- These prospectus papers, covering topics including migration, citizenship, the macro-economic framework, social security, the EU and Scotland's place in the world are providing people with information about what independence would mean for them.
- They evidence that comparable nations have higher income per head than the UK, with higher productivity, lower inequality, and lower poverty. And make proposals for how independence would create opportunities for a fairer, wealthier Scotland
- Further material is in development.

WELLBEING ECONOMY

Our vision is for a Wellbeing Economy, which meets the needs and aspirations of people and provides opportunities for all.

- The just transition to a net zero, nature positive, Wellbeing Economy is an opportunity to create new, good jobs and businesses and support the transition of existing sectors in a way that has fairness and equality built in.
- This is how we will protect the planet, improve living standards, create good and sustainable jobs, increase wages, build economic resilience, and attract investment.
- Our approach will be informed by our Wellbeing Economy Expert Advisory Group and through our international engagement with the Wellbeing Economy Governments (WEGo) network.
- We will work closely with private and public sectors – locally, nationally and UK wide – and engage directly with communities and partners in the third sector.

NEW DEAL FOR BUSINESS GROUP

A strong partnership between government, business and all sectors are essential if we are to build an economy that is fair, green, and growing.

- Economic activity should serve a purpose. Business is a force for good and has a pivotal role in our just transition to a net zero, nature positive Wellbeing Economy.
- The New Deal for Business group report includes recommendations on businesses' role in the Wellbeing Economy transition. For example, we are engaging with businesses on health and work, flexible working, and to inform the development of Just Transition Plans.
- The NDB Wellbeing Economy sub-group presented five recommendations, which build upon the Business Purpose Commission report, and focus on creating conditions for transformative change through partnership working.
- The recommendations include developing a simple description of the Wellbeing Economy that is meaningful to business; identifying key metrics to help businesses understand the impact of

their actions; and identifying ways for business-led activity to better showcase the benefits of contributing to the Wellbeing Economy transition.

NATIONAL STRATEGY FOR ECONOMIC TRANSFORMATION - REFRESH

The National Strategy for Economic Transformation (NSET) set out our bold aims to deliver fairer, greener prosperity for all Scotland's people and places.

- While we have made significant progress to date, we recognise that two years on from NSET's publication, much has changed – fiscally, politically, and internationally.
- We therefore intend to refresh our economic strategy to ensure that it remains fit for purpose to deliver in a changing landscape whilst maintaining our central objective – to build a fair, green and growing economy.
- The refresh will be focused, with an emphasis on prioritising the interventions through which we can achieve the greatest impact.
- Key themes will include innovation and entrepreneurship, investment, people, new market opportunities and the business environment.
- We are engaging with delivery partners and a range of key stakeholders as we progress work on the refresh in the coming months.

GREEN INDUSTRIAL STRATEGY

The global transition to net zero offers enormous economic opportunities for Scotland. We have strengths and potential in sectors ranging from offshore wind, hydrogen, and advanced manufacturing to data and finance.

- Across the country, Scottish firms have the chance to sell to the world and create good, well-paid jobs as part of a fair, green and growing economy.
- The Green Industrial Strategy (GIS) will offer a clear view of the economic sectors and industries in which we have greatest strength and most potential and set out what government [and partners] will do to support growth and investment in those areas.
- It will help give the private sector confidence to make decisions and invest in Scotland.
- The GIS will sit alongside and support the development of our sectoral Just Transition Plans.

Minutes of Meeting between Deputy First Minister and Gordon McIntyre-Kemp

Thursday 18 April 2024

Present:

Deputy First Minister and Cabinet Secretary for Finance, Shona Robison

Minister for Independence, Jamie Hepburn

Gary Gillespie, Chief Economist

[Redacted S.38(1)(b)], OCEA

[Redacted S.38(1)(b)], Private Office

Externals:

Gordon MacIntyre-Kemp, CEO Business for Scotland

Introductory Remarks

1. The Deputy First Minister (DFM) welcomed everyone to the meeting, and noted that she was keen to hear about Business for Scotland and Gordon's work on wellbeing economy and wellbeing pension and also how Scottish Government present its budget.

Discussion

2. [Redacted S.30(b)(ii)]

Next Steps

3. [Redacted S.30(b)(ii)]

[Redacted S.38(1)(b)], OCEA

3 May 2024

**KATE FORBES, DEPUTY FIRST MINISTER AND CABINET SECRETARY FOR ECONOMY
AND GAELIC**

Briefing for meeting with Gordon MacIntyre-Kemp, Business for Scotland

What	Meeting with Gordon MacIntyre-Kemp, Business for Scotland.
Where	Virtual - Join the meeting now
When	Monday 15 July, 13:00 – 13:45
Key message(s)	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Our goal is to help people live happier and healthier lives with higher living standards, to help businesses boost profitability, and build a more resilient Scottish economy that promotes the wellbeing of all our people. • Our four interconnected priorities – eradicating child poverty, growing the economy, tackling the climate emergency, and delivering sustainable public services - will support our transition to a Wellbeing Economy. • Purposeful economic growth creates opportunities for people to participate in our economy and valuable, skilled employment that brings fulfilment to individuals and those they support. Tackling structural inequalities goes hand in hand with a more productive and resilient economy in the long term.
Who	Gordon MacIntyre Kemp , CEO of Business for Scotland [Redacted S.38(1)(b)] BfS Director [Redacted S.38(1)(b)] BfS Director
Why	MiCase: 202400415962 - Mr. MacIntyre-Kemp asked to discuss the SG's economic direction and his concerns at the perceived move away from Wellbeing Economy; [Redacted S.33(1)(b)]. Mr MacIntyre-Kemp has also written to request meetings with the FM and the Cabinet Secretary for Finance, and has also invited you to attend a Saltire Club lunch. [Redacted S.30(c)]
Supporting official	[Redacted S.38(1)(b)], Wellbeing Economy ([Redacted S.38(1)(b)]) [Redacted S.38(1)(b)], Constitutional Futures Division
Briefing contents	Annex A Biography and Background Annex B Hot Topics and Sensitivities Annex C Additional background briefing Annex D Note of meeting between Gordon MacIntyre-Kemp and (then) Cabinet Secretary for WENZE (26 March 2024)

BIOGRAPHY AND BACKGROUND



Gordon MacIntyre-Kemp is founder and Chief Executive of Business for Scotland. Previously he managed a social media and sales & marketing consultancy. He has also worked as an economic development planning professional, and in marketing roles specialising in pricing modelling and promotional evaluation for global companies.

Business for Scotland Background and Key Projects

Business for Scotland (BfS) is a business network, lobbying and consulting company that runs social policy and political campaigns; publishes articles and research reports; and organises networking events, conferences, and dinners. It has over 4,000 associate and stakeholder members, comprising business owners and senior managers.

Scotland the Brief: A 200-page book, which investigates the breadth, structure, and quality of Scotland's economy. A second edition was published in November 2022 and the book has sold over 60,000 copies in total.

Believe in Scotland: A national campaigning organisation for Scottish independence, managed by Business for Scotland. Believe in Scotland is advised by a Steering Group consisting of elected representatives from 17 regions across Scotland and representatives from 9 national campaigns.

Clarity – Rethinking Economics: A newly proposed annual conference to bring together leading economists, policymakers, business people and influencers to create a new economic approach that focuses on fairness, the environment, and people to deliver a fairer, more prosperous society.

Scotianomics: Publishes research reports that aim to educate and inform on the Scottish economy, its strengths, threats, and opportunities. They have also given evidence and policy advice to organisations such as the Scottish Government, UK Government, and the OECD. They champion the Wellbeing Economic Approach, which is broadly in line with the Scottish Government's approach to Wellbeing Economy.

HOT TOPICS AND SENSITIVITIES

[Redacted S.33(1)(b)]

Lines to take:

- Businesses have a critical role in our just transition to a net zero, Wellbeing Economy.
- [Redacted S.30(b)(i)]
- The New Deal for Business Group report includes recommendations on businesses' role in the Wellbeing Economy transition. It concluded that the greatest effect could be had in encouraging and supporting previously unengaged businesses to take their first steps.

- The report also includes a recommendation on identifying ways for business-led activity to better showcase the benefits of contributing to the Wellbeing Economy transition and share good practice to all parts of the business community in Scotland.
- [Redacted S.30(b)(i)]

CONSTITUTIONAL FRAMEWORK

Issue: In an opinion piece in The National, Gordon MacIntyre-Kemp has advocated for ‘a new national conversation on how independence with a wellbeing economic approach will enrich the lives of the people of Scotland.’

Lines to take:

- Whilst we are bound to a failed UK economic model and do not hold all financial levers needed, we will use all the powers we do have to build a fair, green, and growing economy which meets people’s needs, where there are opportunities for all, and where businesses thrive and their success benefits all of society.
- We have been clear that our ambition to make Scotland fairer goes hand in hand with making Scotland more prosperous.
- Independence would allow Scotland to make greater progress but, until then, we call for the devolution of additional powers - in relation to energy, the economy and employment law - to the Scottish Parliament to support Scotland's transition to a Wellbeing Economy.
- In September 2023, The Programme for Government made the commitment that the Scottish Government will continue to build the case for an independent Scotland within the EU, including through the Building a New Scotland prospectus series.
- The prospectus series is intended to inform public debate about devolution and Scotland’s constitutional future, including independence, and to enable the people of Scotland to make informed choices.
- In April, we published the latest (thirteenth) Building a New Scotland paper, ‘Justice in an independent Scotland.’

MEASURING A WELLBEING ECONOMY

Issue: The Business for Scotland Think Tank, Scotianomics, published the *Defining and Quantifying the Wellbeing Economics Approach* paper in October 2023. The report provides a model for measuring the success of a country’s wellbeing economy through the Scotianomics Wellbeing Index. This Index provides a measurement of the wellbeing of 33 OECD nations across five wellbeing dimensions.

To Note: **Scotland is not included** in the Scotianomics Wellbeing Economic Index 2023 due to an **inability to gather sufficient data** on Scotland that corresponds with similar data from the other countries included.

Lines to take:

- To help assess Scotland’s progress in creating a Wellbeing Economy, we have published a Wellbeing Economy Monitor – which tracks broader outcomes of economic activity using indicators relating to health, equality, fair work, and the environment, among others.
- The Monitor has been developed to complement and look beyond GDP to measure other indicators of economic success that relate to the wellbeing of people and the natural environment, based on Scotland’s National Outcomes and the UN Sustainable Development Goals.
- Traditional economic metrics like GDP will remain an important measure but cannot be viewed in isolation.

WELLBEING PENSION

Issue: The Scotianomics report, ‘Investigation into the requirement for and optimum level of a Wellbeing Pension’ (April 2023), presents the concept of a Wellbeing Pension, calculating the amount required to act as a starting point (as base level of public pension) to ensure that all pensioners receive an adequate income throughout retirement to live with dignity and end the pensioner poverty levels caused by the inadequacies of the current UK pension system. The report called for the introduction of a “wellbeing pension” of £225 per person, per week. It proposes that this should replace current state pension provision. Recent correspondence suggests that the Scotianomics recommended level for a Wellbeing Pension would increase to £241.50 from April 2024.

At the SNP conference in October 2022, it was agreed that, in an independent Scotland, a “real living pension” would be set at £220 a week, based on 2022-23 levels. Initial analysis of the Scotianomics recommendations suggested that raising the state pension to a flat rate of £235 in 2023-24 would have added £1.8 billion to the state pensions bill in Scotland – an increase of around 17%. By 2028/29, the cost would increase to £2.3 billion – 18% more than the current system and costs would continue to grow thereafter.

Lines to Take:

- The position on pensions is the same as was set out [p429] in the 2013 White Paper: *“For those people living and working in Scotland at the time of independence, the UK pension entitlement they have accrued prior to independence will become their Scottish State Pension entitlement. Any pension entitlement accrued in Scotland after independence will also form part of that Scottish State Pension; and on retirement, the Scottish State Pension will be paid by the Scottish Government.”*
 - Following a vote for independence, the Scottish and UK Governments would open negotiations on a range of issues. This would cover distribution of existing UK liabilities and assets, including those relating to pensions.
 - After independence, pensions policy, as well as responsibility for payments, would be decided by governments the people of Scotland vote for.
 - An independent Scotland will also have full powers to protect and improve both state and occupational pensions, encourage saving for secure retirement, and set the State Pension Age at a level appropriate to Scottish circumstances.

ANNEX C

ADDITIONAL BACKGROUND BRIEFING

SCOTTISH GOVERNMENT ECONOMIC APPROACH

The Scottish Government is a pro-business administration, that is committed to boosting growth and investment, and intends to collaborate with businesses, unions and communities right across the country to develop and implement policy.

- The New Deal for Business aims to amplify the voice of business particularly in the policy development process.
- This reflects the need for a strong government and business relationship to help create a mutually beneficial environment that supports a fair, green, and growing economy, improves business confidence and investment and in turn, supports sustainable finances to tackle poverty and support our communities.
- While faced with one of the most difficult financial settlements since devolution, we are making the most of every resource available in the Scottish Budget 2024/2025 to continue to grow and transform the economy through investment of more than £5 billion across government.

- We are pushing forward with the transition to net zero to create growth, opportunity, and jobs; we are kick-starting our commitment of up to £500m to anchor our offshore wind supply-chain in Scotland with investment of £66.9m; and increasing investment in digital connectivity by more than 50% to £140m.
- We will continue to do all we can to support businesses. In 2024-25, the Basic Property Rate (properties with a rateable value up to and including £51,000) will be frozen, delivering the lowest such rate in the UK for the sixth year in a row, and we will provide a package of reliefs worth an estimated £685m.

WELLBEING ECONOMY

Our goal is to help people live happier and healthier lives with higher living standards, to help businesses boost profitability, and build a more resilient Scottish economy that promotes the wellbeing of all of our people.

- The principles of a fair, green, and growing Wellbeing Economy will underpin our central mission to eradicate child poverty.
- Our four interconnected priorities – eradicating child poverty, growing the economy, tackling the climate emergency, and delivering sustainable public services - will support our transition to a Wellbeing Economy.
- Purposeful action to confront these challenges is a vital investment in the future health, equality, and prosperity of all Scotland's people.
- For Scotland, economic success means making the most of the incredibly rich resources we have and using them to build an economy that works for people, not the other way around.
- We support fair, green economic growth for a purpose: to create good jobs and promote fair work, to reduce poverty and improve living standards, and to boost tax revenues and sustain high-quality public services.
- The just transition to a dynamic, inclusive, net zero, nature positive, Wellbeing Economy is an opportunity to create good jobs and purposeful businesses and support the transition of existing sectors in a way that has fairness and equality built in.
- This is how we will protect the planet, improve living standards, create good and sustainable jobs, increase wages, build economic resilience, and attract investment.

NEW DEAL FOR BUSINESS GROUP - WELLBEING ECONOMY

We want to work in partnership with business as we transform our economy, drawing on the knowledge and expertise of businesses of all different sizes in different sectors and across business models.

- Building on the Business Purpose Commission report, the NDBG Wellbeing Economy recommendations include developing a description of Wellbeing Economy that is meaningful to business; identifying key metrics to help businesses understand the impact of their actions; and identifying ways for business-led activity to better showcase the benefits of contributing to the Wellbeing Economy transition.
- Progress to date:
 - The Wellbeing Economy subgroup has drafted a description that aims to help businesses understand what the term means for them, and this has been shared with the main NDBG and the Wellbeing Economy Expert Advisory Group for feedback before it is finalised.
 - Together with metrics that businesses can use to evaluate the impact of their actions, this description will underpin a focussed plan of engagement to communicate the business case for supporting a Wellbeing Economy and to share good practice.
 - We have held a series of meetings with business organisations, enterprise agencies and employers to inform ongoing policy work in relation to health and work and flexible working, and in the development of sectoral just transition plans.
 - New guidance has been published to help small businesses and third sector organisations better engage with and bid for public procurement, and an SME and Third Sector Action Plan was published on 29 April.

NATIONAL STRATEGY FOR ECONOMIC TRANSFORMATION

NSET and the outcomes it seeks to achieve remain valid and at this point we want to prioritise actions that will have the greatest impact and accelerate their delivery, as opposed to a refresh of the strategy.

- In recognition of the need for flexibility, we are currently seeking to prioritise actions that will have the greatest impact on Scotland's economy and will accelerate delivery of NSET through the Programme for Government to meet our central objective – to build a fair, green, and growing economy.
- Our efforts will support and drive our principal mission to eradicate child poverty, as well as our other priorities of tackling the climate emergency and delivering stronger public services.
- Prioritisation of actions within NSET offers the opportunity to turn important reviews, such as Ana Stewart's on Women in Enterprise and the First Minister Investor Panel, into firm updated Delivery Plans.
- Our future plans to shift the dial on the economy will focus on actions that are deliverable, affordable, and impactful, making a real difference to the lives of the people of Scotland.

INDEPENDENCE – BUILDING A NEW SCOTLAND SERIES

People in Scotland have given a clear mandate for a referendum on independence.

- In May 2021, 72 of the 129 MSPs were elected on manifestos that commit them to a referendum on Scottish independence during this Parliament.
- The Scottish Government stand ready to engage at any point with the UK Government to begin talks about the change to the Scottish Parliament's powers to allow the Scottish people to choose their future.
- In fact, polling also shows considerably more people believe that we should not need permission from the UK Government to hold a referendum at all, than think that we should need to (Source: YouGov, June 2023 – 50% say should not need permission; 40% say should; 10% don't know).

We have now published thirteen papers in the Building a New Scotland series.

- These prospectus papers, covering topics including migration, citizenship, the macro-economic framework, social security, the EU, and Scotland's place in the world are providing people with information about what independence would mean for them.
- They evidence that comparable nations have higher income per head than the UK, with higher productivity, lower inequality, and lower poverty.
- They also make proposals for how independence would create opportunities for a fairer, wealthier Scotland.
- Further material is in development.

WELLBEING AND SUSTAINABLE DEVELOPMENT BILL

- Responses to the consultation have been independently analysed and the analysis report has now been published, along with the individual/organisation responses (where permission was granted).
- These responses have been carefully considered as part of further policy development and advice to Scottish Ministers, and Ministers will take these views and considerations into account in their decision-making on how to progress.

NOTE OF MEETING – CAB SEC WENZE AND GORDON MacINTYRE-KEMP (26 MARCH 2024)

In attendance: Emilie-Louise Purdie (SpAd); [Redacted S.38(1)(b)] (official support); PS.

Actions

- Cab Sec to aim to join the upcoming meeting on GERS between DFM and Gordon MacIntyre-Kemp (GMK) on 16 April. **PO to make arrangements.**
- [Redacted S.30(c)]

Key points raised in meeting

1. Discussion on GDP being no more important than equality as a measure of prosperity and that making progress on a range of social, environmental and economic measures is the only way to achieve sustainable growth.
2. Noted the international interest and momentum in the Wellbeing Economy (WE) approach as well as a tendency for 'tick boxing' by some nations. GMK advocated including a broader set of metrics in SG socio-economic planning and getting businesses on board with the National Performance Framework.
3. GMK advocated extensive engagement with businesses, including PLCs and SMEs, so they feel a sense of ownership and understanding of the economic benefits of the approach.
4. [Redacted S.33(1)(b)]
5. [Redacted S.30(c)]
6. GMK highlighted that gender equality in the private sector is included in the Scotianomics metrics report and noted a lack of Scotland-level data. He highlighted challenges of accessing data, e.g. on exports, within Scotland, and the risks of under and over reporting (e.g. of exports, costs) in Scottish GDP figures.
7. Cab Sec said she was keen to hear views on the metrics side, for example avoiding tick-boxing and availability of good data.

Meeting between DFM and Cabinet Secretary for Economy and Gaelic and Business for Scotland (15 July 2024)

Note of meeting

Attendees

Kate Forbes, DFM and Cabinet Secretary for Economy and Gaelic (DFM)

Gordon MacIntyre-Kemp, CEO, Business for Scotland (GMK)

[Redacted S.38(1)(b)] Director of Business for Scotland ([Redacted S.38(1)(b)])

[Redacted S.38(1)(b)], Great North Lodges and Director of Business for Scotland ([Redacted S.38(1)(b)])

Scottish Government officials: [Redacted S.38(1)(b)] (Constitutional Futures), [Redacted S.38(1)(b)] (Wellbeing Economy), [Redacted S.38(1)(b)] (Private Office)

Actions

[Redacted S.30(b)(ii)]

Key points raised in meeting

1. DFM reaffirmed her desire to work with all business organisations and considers the relationship with Business for Scotland (BfS) important.
2. GMK asked about his main contact point in SG now there is no longer a Minister for Independence. DFM confirmed that this would depend on the issue, though in relation to the Economy portfolio it would be DFM and the Minister for Employment and Investment. DFM added that every Minister has an interest in independence, though constitutional matters come specifically within the portfolio of the Cabinet Secretary for Constitution, External Affairs and Culture. GMK said he would contact Mr Robertson to request a meeting.
3. GMK noted that wellbeing is no longer included in the DFM's Cabinet Secretary title and asked whether it is still core to the Scottish Government's economic strategy, highlighting potential perceptions that wellbeing had been deprioritised alongside the removal of the post of Minister for Independence.
4. DFM responded that wellbeing is central to everything the Scottish Government is doing and this must be seen in its actions, with government putting resources into priority economic measures to deliver better outcomes. She stated that all economic policies should link to the NPF and UN Sustainable Development Goals and achieve outcomes beyond GDP alone, highlighting as an example the role of employability services in eradicating child poverty.
5. DFM confirmed that a Programme for Government is planned for early September.
6. GMK commented that the idea of a wellbeing pension was included in the SNP manifesto and asked whether there is an intention to take this forward or seek action from the UK Government, given that pensions are a reserved matter. DFM responded that it had been agreed at SNP conference and was the Scottish Government's position, however it is unlikely to be contained in PfG. In relation to the UK Government, DFM suggested that GMK speak to Stephen Flynn MP and offered to make introductions if needed.
7. [Redacted S.30(b)(ii)]
8. [Redacted S.33(1)(b)]
9. [Redacted S.30(b)(ii)]

BRIEFING FOR THE FIRST MINISTER

Meeting with Gordon MacIntyre-Kemp, Business for Scotland

Thursday 8 August 2024, 14.00-14.30

Key message	<p>We are committed to providing the people of Scotland with the information they need to make an informed choice about Scotland's future. We continue to do this through the Building a New Scotland series.</p> <p>Our goal is to help people live happier and healthier lives with higher living standards, to help businesses boost profitability, and build a more resilient Scottish economy that promotes the wellbeing of all our people.</p>
What	Meeting
Why	Request for meeting by Gordon MacIntyre-Kemp to discuss plans to deliver independence and the Scottish Government's economic approach.
Who	Gordon MacIntyre-Kemp, CEO of Business for Scotland [Redacted S.38(1)(b)] member of Believe in Scotland's National Steering Group
Where	Bute House
When	14.00-14.30
Likely themes	Summary of topics likely to be discussed (wider briefing to be included in supporting annexes)
Media	Non media
Supporting official	Ewan Crawford
Attached documents	Annex A - Biography and Background Annex B - Hot Topics and Sensitivities Annex C - Additional background briefing Annex D – Overview of BaNS papers

	Annex E - Minutes of previous meetings with SG and BfS DFM on 24 July DFM on 18 April Cab Sec WENZE on 26 March
--	--

Summary and agenda

Gordon MacIntyre-Kemp requested a meeting with FM to discuss plans to deliver independence and the Scottish Government's economic approach. He said he would like to brief the First Minister on Business for Scotland and Believe in Scotland's campaign plans for the next two years.

This meeting was accepted by private office on the advice of special advisers.

Business for Scotland met with Ms Forbes in July. A note of this meeting and previous meetings with Ms Robison (then DFM and Cabinet Secretary for Finance) and Ms McAllan (then Cabinet Secretary for Wellbeing Economy, Net Zero and Energy) can be found at Annex E.

Mr MacIntyre-Kemp has suggested the following **agenda** items for the meeting:

- The relationship between the Scottish Government and Business for Scotland/Believe in Scotland
- The plan for an alternative fiscal publication
- The route to independence

Hot topics and sensitive issues

The Scottish Citizens' Convention proposals

Believe in Scotland published proposals on 17 July for the Scottish Government to create a Scottish Citizens' Convention. It believes its proposals to be the 'best solution to unblock the constitutional logjam and also to co-create an inspiring vision for an independent Scotland'. It estimates that the Convention would cost between £2.5m and £3.5m. More details and lines are in Annex B.

[Note: FM is meeting officials following this meeting (16.15) to discuss the future of the BaNS series. A list of published BaNS papers can be found at Annex D]

[Redacted S.30(c)]

[Redacted S.30(b)(i)]

[Redacted S.33(1)(b)]

BIOGRAPHIES AND BACKGROUND



Gordon MacIntyre-Kemp is founder and Chief Executive of Business for Scotland. Previously he managed a social media and sales & marketing consultancy. He has worked as an economic development planning professional, and in marketing roles specialising in pricing modelling and promotional evaluation for global companies.

[Redacted S.38(1)(b)]

Business for Scotland background and projects

Business for Scotland (BfS) is a business network, lobbying and consulting company that runs social policy and political campaigns; publishes articles and research reports; and organises networking events, conferences, and dinners. It has over 4,000 associate and stakeholder members, comprising business owners and senior managers.

Believe in Scotland: A campaigning organisation for Scottish independence, managed by Business for Scotland. It is advised by a Steering Group consisting of elected representatives from 17 regions across Scotland and representatives from nine national campaigns.

Clarity – Rethinking Economics: A newly proposed annual conference to bring together leading economists, policymakers, business people and influencers to create a new economic approach that focuses on fairness, the environment, and people to deliver a fairer, more prosperous society.

Scotianomics: Publishes research reports that aim to educate and inform on the Scottish economy, its strengths, threats, and opportunities. They champion the Wellbeing Economic Approach, which is broadly in line with the Scottish Government's approach to Wellbeing Economy.

HOT TOPICS AND SENSITIVITIES

[Redacted S33(1)(b)]

Lines to take:

- Businesses have a critical role in our just transition to a net zero, Wellbeing Economy.
- [Redacted S.30(b)(i)]
- The New Deal for Business Group report includes recommendations on businesses' role in the Wellbeing Economy transition. It concluded that the greatest effect could be had in encouraging and supporting previously unengaged businesses to take their first steps.
- The report also includes a recommendation on identifying ways for business-led activity to better showcase the benefits of contributing to the Wellbeing Economy transition and share good practice to all parts of the business community in Scotland.
- [Redacted S.30(b)(i)]

CITIZENS' CONVENTION ON INDEPENDENCE

Issue: Believe in Scotland published proposals on 17 July for the Scottish Government to create a Scottish Citizens' Convention. It believes its proposals to be the 'best solution to unblock the constitutional logjam and also to co-create an inspiring vision for an independent Scotland'.

The proposals state the Convention would engage with people and civil Scotland, think tanks and more, to co-create a plan for a better Scotland. The convention would seek to understand:

- The hopes and dreams of the Scottish people and their frustrations
- Global best practices from national governments
- Evidence from knowledge leaders and academics
- Scottish regional and sectoral opinions via a national roadshow
- The mood of the nation via polling and engagement

It estimates the work would cost between £2.5m and £3.5m, based on the Irish Citizens Assemblies and the recent Independent Commission on the Constitutional Future of Wales.

Lines to take:

- In September 2023, the Programme for Government made the commitment that the Scottish Government will continue to build the case for an independent

Scotland within the EU, including through the Building a New Scotland prospectus series.

- The prospectus series is intended to inform public debate about devolution and Scotland's constitutional future, including independence, and to enable the people of Scotland to make informed choices.
- 13 BANS papers have now been being published. The first BANS paper, a comparative analysis of similar countries' economic performance, was published in June 2022. Twelve further papers have since been published, most recently the Justice paper on 25 April 2024.

MEASURING A WELLBEING ECONOMY

Issue: The Business for Scotland Think Tank, Scotianomics, published the *Defining and Quantifying the Wellbeing Economics Approach* paper in October 2023. The report provides a model for measuring the success of a country's wellbeing economy through the Scotianomics Wellbeing Index. This Index provides a measurement of the wellbeing of 33 OECD nations across five wellbeing dimensions.

To Note: **Scotland is not included** in the Scotianomics Wellbeing Economic Index 2023 due to **an inability to gather sufficient data** on Scotland that corresponds with similar data from the other countries included.

Lines to take:

- To help assess Scotland's progress in creating a Wellbeing Economy, we have published a Wellbeing Economy Monitor – which tracks broader outcomes of economic activity using indicators relating to health, equality, fair work, and the environment, among others.
- The Monitor has been developed to complement and look beyond GDP to measure other indicators of economic success that relate to the wellbeing of people and the natural environment, based on Scotland's National Outcomes and the UN Sustainable Development Goals.
- Traditional economic metrics like GDP will remain an important measure but cannot be viewed in isolation.

WELLBEING PENSION

Issue: The Scotianomics report, 'Investigation into the requirement for and optimum level of a Wellbeing Pension' (April 2023), presented the concept of a "**wellbeing pension**", a flat rate pension entitlement, available to all, that would ensure that all pensioners received an adequate income and 'ended pensioner poverty'. The report proposed that this new pension model should replace current state pension provision, which is based on a contributory approach via National Insurance contributions.

- At the SNP party conference in October 2022, it was agreed that, in an independent Scotland, a “real living pension” (with very similar principles to the wellbeing pension) would be set at £220 a week, based on 2022-23 levels.
- The wellbeing pension website now sets its recommended level for 2024-25 at £241.50.
- For comparison, the full rate of the new State Pension for 2024-25 is £221.20 a week, so around £20 per week lower than the wellbeing pension.

A more generous approach to state pensions – by the UK Government or in an independent Scotland - would bring **additional costs**. Initial analysis of the Scotianomics recommendations suggested that raising the state pension to the level of the wellbeing pension in 2023-24 would have added £1.8 billion to the state pensions bill in Scotland – an increase of around 17%. By 2028-29, the cost would increase further to £2.3 billion – 18% more than the current system and costs would continue to grow thereafter.

[Redacted S.30(c)]

Lines to Take:

- The position on pensions is the same as was set out [p429] in the 2013 White Paper: *“For those people living and working in Scotland at the time of independence, the UK pension entitlement they have accrued prior to independence will become their Scottish State Pension entitlement. Any pension entitlement accrued in Scotland after independence will also form part of that Scottish State Pension; and on retirement, the Scottish State Pension will be paid by the Scottish Government.”*
- Following a vote for independence, the Scottish and UK Governments would open negotiations on a range of issues. This would cover distribution of existing UK liabilities and assets, including those relating to pensions.
- After independence, pensions policy, as well as responsibility for payments, would be decided by governments the people of Scotland vote for.
- An independent Scotland will also have full powers to protect and improve both state and occupational pensions, encourage saving for secure retirement, and set the State Pension Age at a level appropriate to Scottish circumstances.
- UK Pensions Review: We know that there are huge gaps in retirement income, both private and state, between different population groups, and welcome the review as an opportunity to increase pension savings especially for those groups who are currently largely under-pensioned. We will look at its remit and emerging findings with interest.

ADDITIONAL BACKGROUND BRIEFING

SCOTTISH GOVERNMENT ECONOMIC APPROACH

The Scottish Government is a pro-business administration, that is committed to boosting growth and investment, and intends to collaborate with businesses, unions and communities right across the country to develop and implement policy.

- The New Deal for Business aims to amplify the voice of business particularly in the policy development process.
- This reflects the need for a strong government and business relationship to help create a mutually beneficial environment that supports a fair, green, and growing economy, improves business confidence and investment and in turn, supports sustainable finances to tackle poverty and support our communities.
- While faced with one of the most difficult financial settlements since devolution, we are making the most of every resource available in the Scottish Budget 2024/2025 to continue to grow and transform the economy through investment of more than £5 billion across government.
- We are pushing forward with the transition to net zero to create growth, opportunity, and jobs; we are kick-starting our commitment of up to £500m to anchor our offshore wind supply-chain in Scotland with investment of £66.9m; and increasing investment in digital connectivity by more than 50% to £140m.
- We will continue to do all we can to support businesses. In 2024-25, the Basic Property Rate (properties with a rateable value up to and including £51,000) will be frozen, delivering the lowest such rate in the UK for the sixth year in a row, and we will provide a package of reliefs worth an estimated £685m.
 - NSET and the outcomes it seeks to achieve remain valid and at this point we want to prioritise actions that will have the greatest impact and accelerate their delivery as opposed to a refresh of the strategy
 - In recognition of the need for flexibility, we are seeking to prioritise actions that will have the greatest impact on Scotland's economy and will accelerate delivery of the National Strategy for Economic Transformation to meet our central objective – to build a fair, green and growing economy. Our future plans to shift the dial on the economy will focus on actions that are deliverable, affordable and impactful, making a real difference to the lives of the people of Scotland.

WELLBEING ECONOMY

Our goal is to help people live happier and healthier lives with higher living standards, to help businesses boost profitability, and build a more resilient Scottish economy that promotes the wellbeing of all of our people.

- The principles of a fair, green, and growing Wellbeing Economy will underpin our central mission to eradicate child poverty.

- Our four interconnected priorities – eradicating child poverty, growing the economy, tackling the climate emergency, and delivering sustainable public services - will support our transition to a Wellbeing Economy.
- Purposeful action to confront these challenges is a vital investment in the future health, equality, and prosperity of all Scotland's people.
- For Scotland, economic success means making the most of the incredibly rich resources we have and using them to build an economy that works for people, not the other way around.
- We support fair, green economic growth for a purpose: to create good jobs and promote fair work, to reduce poverty and improve living standards, and to boost tax revenues and sustain high-quality public services.
- The just transition to a dynamic, inclusive, net zero, nature positive, Wellbeing Economy is an opportunity to create good jobs and purposeful businesses and support the transition of existing sectors in a way that has fairness and equality built in.
- This is how we will protect the planet, improve living standards, create good and sustainable jobs, increase wages, build economic resilience, and attract investment.

Overview of BaNS papers

13 BANS papers have now been being published for over two years. The first BANS paper, a comparative analysis of similar countries' economic performance, was published in June 2022. Twelve further papers have since been published, most recently the Justice paper on 25 April 2024:

- Independence in the modern world
- Renewing democracy through independence
- A stronger economy with independence
- Creating a modern constitution for an independence Scotland
- Citizenship in an independent Scotland
- Migration to Scotland after independence
- An independent Scotland in the EU
- Our Marine sector in an independent Scotland
- Social security in an independent Scotland
- Culture in an independent Scotland
- An independent Scotland's place in the world
- Education and lifelong learning in an independent Scotland
- Justice in an independent Scotland

[Redacted S.30(c)]

Speeches

The first in a proposed sequence of economy speeches was delivered at Glasgow University by the then First Minister on 8 January 2024. It covered industrial policy in an independent Scotland. [Redacted S.30(c)]

FM will meet officials from Constitutional Futures Division on Thursday at 16.15 to discuss the publication of future papers.

Minutes of previous meetings between SG and BfS

Deputy First Minister and Cabinet Secretary for Economy and Gaelic Meeting with Gordon MacIntyre-Kemp (Business for Scotland) - 15 July 2024

Attendees

Kate Forbes, DFM and Cabinet Secretary for Economy and Gaelic (DFM)

Gordon MacIntyre-Kemp, CEO, Business for Scotland (GMK)

[Redacted S.38(1)(b)] Director of Business for Scotland ([Redacted S.38(1)(b)])

[Redacted S.38(1)(b)], Great North Lodges and Director of Business for Scotland ([Redacted S.38(1)(b)])

Scottish Government officials: [Redacted S.38(1)(b)] (Constitutional Futures), [Redacted S.38(1)(b)] (Wellbeing Economy), [Redacted S.38(1)(b)] (Private Office)

Actions

[Redacted S.30(b)(ii)]

Key points raised in meeting

1. DFM reaffirmed her desire to work with all business organisations and considers the relationship with Business for Scotland (BfS) important.
2. GMK asked about his main contact point in SG now there is no longer a Minister for Independence. DFM confirmed that this would depend on the issue, though in relation to the Economy portfolio it would be DFM and the Minister for Employment and Investment. DFM added that every Minister has an interest in independence, though constitutional matters come specifically within the portfolio of the Cabinet Secretary for Constitution, External Affairs and Culture. GMK said he would contact Mr Robertson to request a meeting.
3. GMK noted that wellbeing is no longer included in the DFM's Cabinet Secretary title and asked whether it is still core to the Scottish Government's economic strategy, highlighting potential perceptions that wellbeing had been deprioritised alongside the removal of the post of Minister for Independence.
4. DFM responded that wellbeing is central to everything the Scottish Government is doing and this must be seen in its actions, with government putting resources into priority economic measures to deliver better outcomes. She stated that all economic policies should link to the NPF and UN Sustainable Development Goals and achieve outcomes beyond GDP alone, highlighting as an example the role of employability services in eradicating child poverty.
5. DFM confirmed that a Programme for Government is planned for early September.
6. GMK commented that the idea of a wellbeing pension was included in the SNP manifesto and asked whether there is an intention to take this forward or seek action from the UK Government, given that pensions are a reserved matter. DFM responded that it had been agreed at SNP conference and was the Scottish Government's position, however it is unlikely to be contained in PfG. In relation to the UK Government, DFM suggested that GMK speak to Stephen Flynn MP and offered to make introductions if needed.

7. [Redacted S.30(b)(ii)]
8. [Redacted S.33(1)(b)]
9. [Redacted S.30(b)(ii)]

Minutes of Meeting between DFM and Gordon McIntyre-Kemp - Thursday 18 April 2024

Present:

Deputy First Minister and Cabinet Secretary for Finance, Shona Robison
Minister for Independence, Jamie Hepburn
Gary Gillespie, Chief Economist
[Redacted S.38(1)(b)], OCEA
[Redacted S.38(1)(b)], Private Office

Externals:

Gordon MacIntyre-Kemp, CEO Business for Scotland

Introductory Remarks

1. The Deputy First Minister (DFM) welcomed everyone to the meeting, and noted that she was keen to hear about Business for Scotland and Gordon's work on wellbeing economy and wellbeing pension and also how Scottish Government present its budget.

Discussion

2. [Redacted S.30(b)(ii)]

Next Steps

3. [Redacted S.30(b)(ii)]

[Redacted S.38(1)(b)], OCEA

3 May 2024

NOTE OF MEETING – CAB SEC WENZE AND GORDON MacINTYRE-KEMP - 26 MARCH 2024

In attendance: Emilie-Louise Purdie (SpAd); [Redacted S.38(1)(b)] (official support); PS.

Actions

- Cab Sec to aim to join the upcoming meeting on GERS between DFM and Gordon MacIntyre-Kemp (GMK) on 16 April. **PO to make arrangements.**
- [Redacted S.30(c)]

Key points raised in meeting

10. Discussion on GDP being no more important than equality as a measure of prosperity and that making progress on a range of social, environmental and economic measures is the only way to achieve sustainable growth.
11. Noted the international interest and momentum in the Wellbeing Economy (WE) approach as well as a tendency for 'tick boxing' by some nations. GMK advocated including a broader set of metrics in SG socio-economic planning and getting businesses on board with the National Performance Framework.
12. GMK advocated extensive engagement with businesses, including PLCs and SMEs, so they feel a sense of ownership and understanding of the economic benefits of the approach.
13. [Redacted S.33(1)(b)]
14. [Redacted S.30(c)]
15. GMK highlighted that gender equality in the private sector is included in the Scotianomics metrics report and noted a lack of Scotland-level data. He highlighted challenges of accessing data, e.g. on exports, within Scotland, and the risks of under and over reporting (e.g. of exports, costs) in Scottish GDP figures.
16. Cab Sec said she was keen to hear views on the metrics side, for example avoiding tick-boxing and availability of good data.

ITEM 17 - Additional correspondence between Scottish Government and Business for Scotland or Believe in Scotland between 1 January 2023 and date of Fol request

Emails between Constitutional Futures Division and Business for Scotland (September 2023)

From: [Redacted S.38(1)(b)]@gov.scot
Sent: Thursday, September 14, 2023 4:15 PM
To: [Redacted S.38(1)(b)]@businessforscotland.co.uk
Cc: info@businessforscotland.co.uk
Subject: Freedom of Information Request

Dear Mr MacIntyre-Kemp,

I am writing to advise you that the Scottish Government has received a request under the Freedom of Information (Scotland) Act 2002 (FOISA) for:

Please provide copies of all email correspondence between the Scottish Government (including Ministers, Civil servants, and Special Advisers) and Gordon MacIntyre-Kemp, CEO of Business for Scotland and Believe in Scotland, 1st May 2021 - date.

We are currently processing the request, which we are required to respond to by **Friday 22 September**.

I should also explain that we can withhold information only if an exemption under FOISA applies to that information and, where applicable, the public interest in disclosure is not outweighed by the public interest in upholding the exemption. You can find detailed information about FOISA on our website at: <https://www.gov.scot/about/contact-information/how-to-request-information/> or on the Scottish Information Commissioner's website at: <https://www.itspublicknowledge.info/>.

After conducting searches of our records, I have identified a number of emails in scope of this request. Most of this appears to be on the topic of either invitations or logistics for meetings, and I believe we'd only need to withhold information concerning personal details where applicable. I have however, also identified an email with attachments where you state that it contains commercially sensitive information. For this reason, I suggest it would be helpful if we could arrange to have a quick chat about this information, and I can also let you see the rest of what we propose to release. I need to get finished up sharp today and will be logging off very soon, but I'll be around tomorrow between 8-12, and then it's a bank holiday and I won't be back at work till Tuesday 19 September. I would be grateful if you could let me know if you are available to speak tomorrow morning please or otherwise, we will arrange to speak as early as possible next week. I can also be contacted on the number below.

Regards,

[Redacted S.38(1)(b)] Constitutional Futures Division
Directorate for Constitution
[Redacted S.38(1)(b)]

From: Gordon MacIntyre-Kemp <[Redacted S.38(1)(b)]@businessforscotland.co.uk>
Sent: Thursday, September 14, 2023 4:56 PM
To: [Redacted S.38(1)(b)]@gov.scot>
Cc: info@businessforscotland.co.uk
Subject: Re: Freedom of Information Request

Hi [Redacted S.38(1)(b)]

That's fine, I am aware that this happens. However I have the Business for Scotland Annual dinner with the FM speaking tomorrow night and will not be able to speak to you till next week.

In my view the email detailing the names and commercial interests of the private individuals attending the top table of the dinner and also the people I intend to introduce to the FM are not to be released as its not in the public interest nor do we have permission to publish their names publicly.

[Redacted S.33(1)(b)]

Let's talk on Tuesday - I will call you.

Yours for Scotland

Gordon

Gordon MacIntyre-Kemp
Founder and Chief Executive

The Campaigning Business Network

M: [Redacted S.38(1)(b)]

Twitter: @BizforScotland

Facebook: www.facebook.com/BusinessforScotland

Web: www.businessforscotland.com



From: [Redacted S.38(1)(b)]@gov.scot

Sent: Tuesday, September 19, 2023 9:51 AM

To: Gordon MacIntyre-Kemp <[Redacted S.38(1)(b)]@businessforscotland.co.uk>

Cc: info@businessforscotland.co.uk

Subject: RE: Freedom of Information Request

Morning Gordon,

In advance of us speaking later on today, I attach a doc giving details of the information for release as it currently stands. So far, I have redacted the personal details of Scottish Government staff who are below SCS grade and I have also removed your email address as I don't believe it is publicly available. I have also removed the details of someone called [Redacted S.38(1)(b)] who works for you as I don't believe he is a publicly known figure for BfS? I haven't made any redactions to Item 12 in this doc yet which is the email you mention below giving details of both public and private individuals, and we'll also need to discuss the material regarding [Redacted S.33(1)(b)].

In terms of my availability today, I have one meeting between 10:30-11:30 which I can drop out of if need be and I usually take lunch between 12-1 but I'm working at home today so can be flexible and I will have my phone beside me.

Thanks,

[Redacted S.38(1)(b)]**Constitutional Futures Division**
Directorate for Constitution
[Redacted S.38(1)(b)]

From: [Redacted S.38(1)(b)]@gov.scot
Sent: Tuesday, September 19, 2023 5:12 PM
To: Gordon MacIntyre-Kemp <[Redacted S.38(1)(b)]@businessforscotland.co.uk>
Cc: info@businessforscotland.co.uk; [Redacted S.38(1)(b)]@gov.scot>
Subject: RE: Freedom of Information Request

Dear Gordon,

Further to our discussion this morning, I attach for your reference, a copy of the information we intend to release, which applies exemptions as the legislation allows for personal details.

Regards,

[Redacted S.38(1)(b)]**Constitutional Futures Division**
Directorate for Constitution
[Redacted S.38(1)(b)]

Emails between Business for Scotland and Cabinet Secretary for Wellbeing Economy, Fair Work and Energy (August-September 2023)

From: Gordon MacIntyre-Kemp <[Redacted S.38(1)(b)]@businessforscotland.co.uk>
Sent: Thursday, August 17, 2023 4:23 PM
To: Cabinet Secretary for Wellbeing Economy, Fair Work & Energy <CabSecWEFWE@gov.scot>
Subject: [Redacted S.33(1)(b)].

Dear Neil

[Redacted S.33(1)(b)]

In order to encourage them to buy into the concept, we need to explain to the Scottish business community how the Wellbeing Economy works and the benefits and competitive advantages their businesses can take advantage of as Scotland adopts this approach.

[Redacted S.33(1)(b)]

From: [Redacted S.38(1)(b)]@gov.scot> **On Behalf Of** Cabinet Secretary for Wellbeing Economy, Fair Work & Energy
Sent: Tuesday, September 12, 2023 11:53 AM
To: [Redacted S.38(1)(b)]@businessforscotland.co.uk
Cc: [Redacted S.38(1)(b)]@gov.scot>; Cabinet Secretary for Wellbeing Economy, Fair Work & Energy <CabSecWEFWE@gov.scot>
Subject: Email from Neil Gray MSP Cabinet Secretary for Wellbeing Economy Fair Work and Energy to Gordon MacIntyre-Kemp Founder and Chief Executive of Business for Scotland

Gordon,

[Redacted S.33(1)(b)]

I agree with your assessment that there is a need for better and wider engagement with business around Wellbeing Economy. Some of the recommendations of the New Deal for Business Group are particularly relevant to this, specifically to work together to create a simple description of what the Wellbeing Economy is and how business can contribute; and to better establish the business case for supporting a Wellbeing Economy and find ways to showcase the benefits and share good practice to all parts of the business community in Scotland. Crucially, this needs to be led by business.

I think Business for Scotland can make a valuable contribution to this work and I appreciate that you are already active in this space. Can I suggest that my officials who lead on Wellbeing Economy talk further with you about the plans for taking this forward?

NG

Kind regards,

[Redacted S.38(1)(b)]

Assistant Private Secretary | Office of the Cabinet Secretary for Wellbeing Economy, Fair Work and Energy – Neil Gray MSP

Scottish Government | St Andrew's House | Regent Road | Edinburgh | EH1 3DG | Email: CabSecWEFWE@gov.scot

All e-mails and attachments sent by a Ministerial Private Office to any other official on behalf of a Minister relating to a decision, request or comment made by a Minister, or a note of a Ministerial meeting, must be filed appropriately by the recipient. Private Offices do not keep official records of such e-mails or attachments.

Emails between Scottish Government Wellbeing Economy Team and Business for Scotland (September 2023)

From: [Redacted S.38(1)(b)]@gov.scot

Sent: Wednesday, September 13, 2023 9:12 AM

To: [Redacted S.38(1)(b)]@businessforscotland.co.uk

Subject: Re: Email from Neil Gray MSP Cabinet Secretary for Wellbeing Economy Fair Work and Energy to Gordon MacIntyre-Kemp Founder and Chief Executive of Business for Scotland

Dear Mr MacIntyre-Kemp,

I am Head of the Wellbeing Economy and Capability Unit in the Scottish Government. Can I please ask whether it would be possible to arrange a call or meeting to continue the discussion regarding business engagement around the Wellbeing Economy, as indicated in the Cabinet Secretary's email? I am keen to find out more about Business for Scotland's existing activity and would like to speak about the recommendations in the report of the New Deal for Business Group, which was published on 29 June.

If you are willing to meet, please could you let me know your availability in the coming weeks?

Please call me if you would like to make arrangements over the phone.

Thank you

[Redacted S.38(1)(b)] Head of Wellbeing Economy and Capability
Strategic Business and Economic Engagement Division
Directorate for Economic Strategy and Fair Work
[Redacted S.38(1)(b)]

From: Gordon MacIntyre-Kemp <[Redacted S.38(1)(b)]@businessforscotland.co.uk>

Sent: Wednesday, September 13, 2023 11:03 AM

To: [Redacted S.38(1)(b)]@gov.scot

Subject: Re: Email from Neil Gray MSP Cabinet Secretary for Wellbeing Economy Fair Work and Energy to Gordon MacIntyre-Kemp Founder and Chief Executive of Business for Scotland

Hi [Redacted S.38(1)(b)].

Thanks for getting in touch. I would be happy to meet, hopefully we can arrange that for next week.

[Redacted S.33(1)(b)]

As you suggest we can also discuss the New Deal for Business Group report which I read with interest when it came out.

Would either Tuesday 19th, Friday 22nd or Wednesday 27th of September work best for you? Where are you based? I am Glasgow but would be happy to travel to Edinburgh if that helps.

Yours for Scotland

Gordon

Gordon MacIntyre-Kemp
Founder and Chief Executive

Business for Scotland

The Campaigning Business Network

M: [Redacted S.38(1)(b)]

Twitter: @BizforScotland

Facebook: www.facebook.com/BusinessforScotland

Web: www.businessforscotland.com



From: [Redacted S.38(1)(b)]@gov.scot

Sent: Wednesday, September 13, 2023 1:52 PM

To: Gordon MacIntyre-Kemp <[Redacted S.38(1)(b)]@businessforscotland.co.uk>

Subject: RE: Email from Neil Gray MSP Cabinet Secretary for Wellbeing Economy Fair Work and Energy to Gordon MacIntyre-Kemp Founder and Chief Executive of Business for Scotland

Gordon,

Next week would be fine for me, though I will not be working on Friday. Tuesday 19th might be possible depending on the times you are available, and Wednesday 27th looks much freer for me.

I am based in Glasgow and will be in the office on both of those days so we could meet in person or through Teams.

Thank you

[Redacted S.38(1)(b)]

From: Gordon MacIntyre-Kemp <[Redacted S.38(1)(b)]@businessforscotland.co.uk>

Sent: Wednesday, September 13, 2023 2:08 PM

To: [Redacted S.38(1)(b)]@gov.scot>

Subject: Re: Email from Neil Gray MSP Cabinet Secretary for Wellbeing Economy Fair Work and Energy to Gordon MacIntyre-Kemp Founder and Chief Executive of Business for Scotland

Hi [Redacted S.38(1)(b)]

I am completely free on Tuesday 19th and our offices are at Charring Cross so I can pop down to the Sco Gov building it's a 10 min walk max.

Just say when works best for you

Gordon

Yours for Scotland

Gordon

Gordon MacIntyre-Kemp
Founder and Chief Executive

The Campaigning Business Network

M: [Redacted S.38(1)(b)]

Twitter: @BizforScotland

Facebook: www.facebook.com/BusinessforScotland

Web: www.businessforscotland.com

On 14 Sep 2023, at 18:09, <[Redacted S.38(1)(b)]@gov.scot> wrote:

Gordon,

I now might need to be in Edinburgh on 19 September. Can I please confirm early next week whether Tuesday is a possibility or whether 27 September is the best option? I am sorry for any difficulties this causes you.

Thanks

[Redacted S.38(1)(b)]

From: Gordon MacIntyre-Kemp <[Redacted S.38(1)(b)]@businessforscotland.co.uk>

Sent: Monday, September 18, 2023 1:47 PM

To: [Redacted S.38(1)(b)]@gov.scot>

Subject: Re: Email from Neil Gray MSP Cabinet Secretary for Wellbeing Economy Fair Work and Energy to Gordon MacIntyre-Kemp Founder and Chief Executive of Business for Scotland

Are we meeting in Edinburgh Tomorrow as suggested?

Can you let me know as I need to arrange my other Edinburgh meetings.

GMK

On Thu, 14 Sept 2023 at 18:11, Gordon MacIntyre-Kemp <[Redacted S.38(1)(b)]@businessforscotland.co.uk> wrote:

Yes that's fine - I also have reason to go to Edinburgh next week so would be happy to move the meeting the Edinburgh if that works for you.

Yours for Scotland

Gordon

Gordon MacIntyre-Kemp
Founder and Chief Executive

The Campaigning Business Network

M: [Redacted S.38(1)(b)]

Twitter: @BizforScotland

Facebook: www.facebook.com/BusinessforScotland

Web: www.businessforscotland.com

From: [Redacted S.38(1)(b)]@gov.scot

Date: 18/09/2023 1:59 pm (GMT+00:00)

To: [Redacted S.38(1)(b)]@businessforscotland.co.uk

Subject: RE: Email from Neil Gray MSP Cabinet Secretary for Wellbeing Economy Fair Work and Energy to Gordon MacIntyre-Kemp Founder and Chief Executive of Business for Scotland

Gordon,

I am available tomorrow in central Edinburgh between 11:00 and 12:15 if that would be convenient for you. Please let me know if that is possible.

Thank you

[Redacted S.38(1)(b)]

From: <[Redacted S.38(1)(b)]@businessforscotland.co.uk>

Sent: Monday, September 18, 2023 2:27 PM

To: [Redacted S.38(1)(b)]@gov.scot>

Subject: RE: Email from Neil Gray MSP Cabinet Secretary for Wellbeing Economy Fair Work and Energy to Gordon MacIntyre-Kemp Founder and Chief Executive of Business for Scotland

11.15am works for me. What building will you be based at?

Sent from my Galaxy

From: [Redacted S.38(1)(b)]@gov.scot

Date: 18/09/2023 2:36 pm (GMT+00:00)

To: [Redacted S.38(1)(b)]@businessforscotland.co.uk

Subject: RE: Email from Neil Gray MSP Cabinet Secretary for Wellbeing Economy Fair Work and Energy to Gordon MacIntyre-Kemp Founder and Chief Executive of Business for Scotland

Gordon,

I will be in St Andrews House and have booked a room for 11:30-12:15 if you are happy to meet in the SG building. Please let me know if you would prefer an alternative location.

If we are going to meet in St Andrews House can you please bring photographic ID for the staff at reception?

Thank you

[Redacted S.38(1)(b)]

From: [Redacted S.38(1)(b)]@businessforscotland.co.uk>

Sent: Monday, September 18, 2023 3:36 PM

To: [Redacted S.38(1)(b)]@gov.scot>

Subject: RE: Email from Neil Gray MSP Cabinet Secretary for Wellbeing Economy Fair Work and Energy to Gordon MacIntyre-Kemp Founder and Chief Executive of Business for Scotland

Ok see you then at St Andrews house.

Sent from my Galaxy

Emails between Scottish Government Wellbeing Economy Team and Business for Scotland (November 2023)

On 24 Nov 2023, at 10:02, <[Redacted S.38(1)(b)]@gov.scot> wrote:

Gordon,

I am sorry I have not been in touch in a while. How are you? Can I please ask whether you have some time next week to speak about [Redacted S.33(1)(b)]?

I would be happy to arrange a call though, if we will both be in the same place one day next week, in person would be better. I intend to be in Glasgow on Tuesday 28th, Edinburgh on Wednesday 29th, and Glasgow again on Thursday 30th. I would be happy to come to your office in Charing Cross on Tuesday or Thursday, or we could meet in Atlantic Quay on either of those days. If Wednesday is better I will look for a room in St Andrews House.

Please let me know if any of the above options fit in with your plans for next week.

Thank you

[Redacted S.38(1)(b)] Head of Wellbeing Economy and Capability
Fair Work Division
Jobs and Wellbeing Economy Directorate
[Redacted S.38(1)(b)]
BESTCovidHub@gov.scot

From: Gordon MacIntyre-Kemp <[Redacted S.38(1)(b)]@businessforscotland.co.uk>
Sent: Friday, November 24, 2023 10:38 AM
To: [Redacted S.38(1)(b)]@gov.scot>
Cc: [Redacted S.38(1)(b)]@gov.scot>
Subject: Re: Business for Scotland [Redacted S.33(1)(b)]

Hi [Redacted S.38(1)(b)]

Good to hear from you, next Thursday in Glasgow would be good for us. What time would suit you to come to our offices? We can be fairly flexible that day and most of the team will be in the office.

Business for Scotland Ltd - Sycamore House, 290 Bath Street, 3rd floor, Suite 1A, Glasgow, G2 4JR - We are located in the west of the city centre, a two minute walk from Charing Cross Station. C

Yours for Scotland

Gordon

Gordon MacIntyre-Kemp
Founder and Chief Executive

The Campaigning Business Network

M: [Redacted S.38(1)(b)]
Twitter: @BizforScotland
Facebook: www.facebook.com/BusinessforScotland
Web: www.businessforscotland.com

On 24 Nov 2023, at 11:02, [Redacted S.38(1)(b)]@gov.scot> wrote:

Gordon,

Thursday it is. I could be at your office for 12:15 or later in the day from 14:30. I'll come for 12:15 unless you would prefer the afternoon.

Thank you

[Redacted S.38(1)(b)]

From: Gordon MacIntyre-Kemp <[Redacted S.38(1)(b)]@businessforscotland.co.uk>

Sent: Friday, November 24, 2023 11:06 AM

To: [Redacted S.38(1)(b)]@gov.scot>

Cc: [Redacted S.38(1)(b)]@gov.scot>

Subject: Re: Business for Scotland [Redacted S.33(1)(b)]

12.15 works for us.

We will look forward to seeing you then.

Yours for Scotland

Gordon

Gordon MacIntyre-Kemp
Founder and Chief Executive

The Campaigning Business Network

M: [Redacted S.38(1)(b)]

Twitter: @BizforScotland

Facebook: www.facebook.com/BusinessforScotland

Web: www.businessforscotland.com

Business
for
Scotland

Emails between Scottish Government Wellbeing Economy Team and Business for Scotland (March 2024)

From: [Redacted S.38(1)(b)]@gov.scot
Sent: Tuesday, March 12, 2024 12:31 PM
To: Gordon MacIntyre-Kemp <[Redacted S.38(1)(b)]@businessforscotland.co.uk>
Cc: [Redacted S.38(1)(b)]@gov.scot>
Subject: Wellbeing Economy - meeting with the Cabinet Secretary

Gordon,

How are you? I realise it has been a while since we last spoke about [Redacted S.33(1)(b)] and I would like to see if we can arrange a call or meeting in the next few weeks to catch up on this if possible.

I am also aware that you have a meeting with the new Cabinet Secretary for Wellbeing Economy, Net Zero and Energy planned for 26 March. To help us prepare for that meeting, can I please ask whether there are any particular items you would like to discuss so that we can put together an agenda to support your discussion with Ms McAllan?

Please let me know if you would like to speak about this and we can arrange a call.

Thank you for your help

[Redacted S.38(1)(b)]
Head of Wellbeing Economy and Capability
Fair Work Division
Jobs and Wellbeing Economy Directorate
[Redacted S.38(1)(b)] BESTCovidHub@gov.scot

Hi [Redacted S.38(1)(b)]

Apologies for not responding to this email sooner, I honestly thought I had.

I see this as an initial contact meeting. [Redacted S.33(1)(b)]

I will also brief her on the Wellbeing Pensions plan and how our overall development of the Wellbeing Economy Approach is progressing.

Will I be seeing you at the meeting?

Yours for Scotland

Gordon

Gordon MacIntyre-Kemp
Founder and Chief Executive

The Campaigning Business Network

M: [Redacted S.38(1)(b)]
Twitter: @BizforScotland
Facebook: www.facebook.com/BusinessforScotland
Web: www.businessforscotland.com

Emails between Scottish Government Wellbeing Economy Team and Business for Scotland (July 2024)

From: Gordon MacIntyre-Kemp <[Redacted S.38(1)(b)]@businessforscotland.co.uk>
Sent: Wednesday, July 10, 2024 11:40 AM
To: [Redacted S.38(1)(b)]@gov.scot>
Subject: Re: Wellbeing Economy

Hi [Redacted S.38(1)(b)]

Thanks for the call today. On Monday I will be joined by two Business for Scotland directors both are well know the the DFM.

[Redacted S.38(1)(b)] will join me to represent the board of Business for Scotland at the meeting.

Yours for Scotland

Gordon

Gordon MacIntyre-Kemp
Founder and Chief Executive

The Campaigning Business Network

M: [Redacted S.38(1)(b)]
Twitter: @BizforScotland
Facebook: www.facebook.com/BusinessforScotland
Web: www.businessforscotland.com



On 9 Jul 2024, at 10:46, [Redacted S.38(1)(b)]@gov.scot wrote:

Gordon,

Thank you for replying so quickly. I would suggest tomorrow at 10:30. I will call you on the number in your email signature unless there is a better number to use. I don't think our systems support Zoom; we use Microsoft Teams.

In case I can't get through for some reason, my number is [Redacted S.38(1)(b)].

Thank you

[Redacted S.38(1)(b)]

From: Gordon MacIntyre-Kemp <[Redacted S.38(1)(b)]@businessforscotland.co.uk>
Sent: Tuesday, July 9, 2024 10:13 AM
To: [Redacted S.38(1)(b)]@gov.scot>
Subject: Re: Wellbeing Economy

Hi [Redacted S.38(1)(b)]

That would be very helpful thanks.

I can do tomorrow or Thursday, between 10am and 3pm, just say when and we can zoom or chat on phone.

Yours for Scotland

Gordon

Gordon MacIntyre-Kemp
Founder and Chief Executive

The Campaigning Business Network

M: [Redacted S.38(1)(b)]

Twitter: @BizforScotland

Facebook: www.facebook.com/BusinessforScotland

Web: www.businessforscotland.com

On 9 Jul 2024, at 09:09, <[Redacted S.38(1)(b)]@gov.scot> wrote:

Gordon,

How are you? I contacted you in March to suggest that we arrange a call or meeting and I am sorry we weren't able to get together at that point. I know that you have a meeting with the Deputy First Minister planned for next Monday and it would be useful if we could catch up this week if you have any time available. Your letter indicates that you would like to speak to Ms Forbes about [Redacted S.33(1)(b)] and to find out more about the Scottish Government's economic direction, and if there is anything else you would like to cover in the meeting please let me know.

Please suggest a day and time that would suit you best this week and I can arrange a call or meeting.

Thank you

[Redacted S.38(1)(b)]

Head of Wellbeing Economy and Capability

Fair Work Division

Jobs and Wellbeing Economy Directorate

[Redacted S.38(1)(b)]

BESTCovidHub@gov.scot

Email from ministerial private office in relation to item 9 (February 2024)

From: [Redacted S.38(1)(b)]@gov.scot> On Behalf Of Cabinet Secretary for Wellbeing Economy, Fair Work & Energy
Sent: Monday, February 5, 2024 5:46 PM
To: [Redacted S.38(1)(b)]@businessforScotland.co.uk
Cc: Cabinet Secretary for Wellbeing Economy, Fair Work & Energy <CabSecWEFWE@gov.scot>
Subject: Letter to Gordon MacIntyre-Kemp from Neil Gray MSP Cabinet Secretary for Wellbeing Economy Fair Work and Energy

Good afternoon,

Please find attached a letter from Neil Gray MSP, Cabinet Secretary for Wellbeing Economy, Fair Work and Energy.

Kind regards,

[Redacted S.38(1)(b)]

Assistant Private Secretary | Office of the Cabinet Secretary for Wellbeing Economy, Fair Work and Energy – Neil Gray MSP

Scottish Government | St Andrew's House | Regent Road | Edinburgh | EH1 3DG | Email: CabSecWEFWE@gov.scot

All e-mails and attachments sent by a Ministerial Private Office to any other official on behalf of a Minister relating to a decision, request or comment made by a Minister, or a note of a Ministerial meeting, must be filed appropriately by the recipient. Private Offices do not keep official records of such e-mails or attachments.

Emails relating to First Minister attendance at Business for Scotland annual dinner (15 September 2023)

From: Gordon MacIntyre-Kemp <[Redacted S.38(1)(b)]@businessforscotland.co.uk>

Sent: Tuesday, September 12, 2023 12:26 PM

To: [Redacted S.38(1)(b)]@gov.scot>

Cc: [Redacted S.38(1)(b)]@businessforscotland.co.uk; Visits and Events <VisitsandEvents@gov.scot>; [Redacted S.38(1)(b)]@gov.scot>; [Redacted S.38(1)(b)]@gov.scot>; Emily Mackintosh <[Redacted S.38(1)(b)]@gov.scot>

Subject: Re: [Redacted S.39(1)] - FM - BfS Annual Dinner - Hilton Glasgow

[Redacted S.38(1)(b)] will meet the FM and take him into the drinks reception via the conference suite stairs. I will wait at the top of the stairs in the reception area with a few VIP guests that I wish to introduce him to.

I will send through a list of the VIPs and Top Table guests tomorrow AM.

As for the adjusted running order, I am requesting a review of the request to change the planned after-dinner speech into a pre-dinner speech. It would not add value to the event.

Yours for Scotland

Gordon

Gordon MacIntyre-Kemp
Founder and Chief Executive

The Campaigning Business Network

M: [Redacted S.38(1)(b)]

Twitter: @BizforScotland

Facebook: www.facebook.com/BusinessforScotland

Web: www.businessforscotland.com



On 12 Sep 2023, at 11:49, <[Redacted S.38(1)(b)]@gov.scot> wrote:

Good Morning [Redacted S.38(1)(b)]/Gordon,

With regards to the below, I really need confirmation of both the adjusted running order and a clear steer on who FM will be meeting at the drinks reception. Grateful for urgent advice this afternoon on both these areas. I am on [Redacted S.38(1)(b)] if that's easier – happy to chat

Thanks

**[Redacted S.38(1)(b)] Business Organisations Strategic Engagement Manager | Strategic Business Engagement Team
Economic Strategy and Fair Work Directorate | Scottish Government**

I am sending this e-mail at a time that suits my working arrangements and, if this is at a time outwith your own normal working hours, I do not expect you to respond until you are next at work

From: [Redacted S.38(1)(b)]@gov.scot

Sent: 11 September 2023 10:47

To: [Redacted S.38(1)(b)]@businessforscotland.co.uk>

Cc: Visits and Events <VisitsandEvents@gov.scot>; [Redacted S.38(1)(b)]@gov.scot>; [Redacted S.38(1)(b)]@gov.scot>

Subject: RE: [Redacted S.39(1)] - FM - BfS Annual Dinner - Hilton Glasgow

Good Morning [Redacted S.38(1)(b)],

I hope you are well – I am working with [Redacted S.38(1)(b)] on arrangements for FM, and I wondered if you had an updated running order available? And any steer on who Gordon would like FM to meet at the reception would be great

Happy to chat

Thanks

[Redacted S.38(1)(b)] **Business Organisations Strategic Engagement Manager | Strategic Business Engagement Team**

Economic Strategy and Fair Work Directorate | Scottish Government

I am sending this e-mail at a time that suits my working arrangements and, if this is at a time outwith your own normal working hours, I do not expect you to respond until you are next at work

From: [Redacted S.38(1)(b)]@businessforscotland.co.uk>

Sent: 07 September 2023 11:39

To: [Redacted S.38(1)(b)]@gov.scot>

Cc: Visits and Events <VisitsandEvents@gov.scot>; [Redacted S.38(1)(b)]@gov.scot>; [Redacted S.38(1)(b)]@gov.scot>

Subject: Re: [Redacted S.39(1)] - FM - BfS Annual Dinner - Hilton Glasgow

Hi [Redacted S.38(1)(b)],

That is extremely disappointing. I will inform Gordon and make the adjustments to the running order.

I will get back to you with the other information next week.

Thanks,

[Redacted S.38(1)(b)]

On 7 Sep 2023, at 11:07, <[Redacted S.38(1)(b)]@gov.scot> wrote:

Hi [Redacted S.38(1)(b)]

Unfortunately the First Minister now has further engagements to carry out later in the evening on the 15th, so he will need to leave around 19:30/19:45. Due to this, we are hoping to follow the same structure that former FM done at the last BfS Dinner in January this year – giving his key note speech after the opening from [Redacted S.38(1)(b)] and then departing before the dinner service commences? I understand that this might mean that the programme will need adjusted, so please accept our apologies for this.

FM will now be able to arrive earlier, at 18:15, so grateful if you can let me know if Gordon has anyone specific he would like to introduce to FM during the pre-drinks reception.

Thanks

[Redacted S.38(1)(b)]

Visits & Events Manager

Office of the First Minister of Scotland | Scottish Government
5th floor - St Andrew's House | Regent Road | Edinburgh | EH1 3DG
[Redacted S.38(1)(b)]@gov.scot

From: [Redacted S.38(1)(b)]@gov.scot

Sent: Tuesday, September 5, 2023 2:58 PM

To: [Redacted S.38(1)(b)]@businessforscotland.co.uk>

Cc: Visits and Events <VisitsandEvents@gov.scot>

Subject: RE: [Redacted S.39(1)] - FM - BfS Annual Dinner - Hilton Glasgow

Hi [Redacted S.38(1)(b)]

Thanks for meeting with us this morning and sending on the running order.

Grateful if you could send on the table plan for FM's table once you have it and the order they will be piped into the room. It would also be good to know if there is anyone specific that Gordon will introduce FM to during the reception?

Thanks

[Redacted S.38(1)(b)]

Visits & Events Manager

Office of the First Minister of Scotland | Scottish Government
5th floor - St Andrew's House | Regent Road | Edinburgh | EH1 3DG
[Redacted S.38(1)(b)]@gov.scot

From: [Redacted S.38(1)(b)]@businessforscotland.co.uk>

Sent: Tuesday, September 5, 2023 11:15 AM

To: [Redacted S.38(1)(b)]@gov.scot>

Cc: Visits and Events <VisitsandEvents@gov.scot>

Subject: Re: [Redacted S.39(1)] - FM - BfS Annual Dinner - Hilton Glasgow

Hi [Redacted S.38(1)(b)]

Please find a draft running order below - this is subject to change but if any change does occur it will likely be an adjustment of timings by 5 minutes etc.

It would be great if the First Minister could stay till the auction has concluded. Traditionally, having the First Minister in the room for the auction has made it go a lot more smoothly.

Thanks,

[Redacted S.38(1)(b)]

I can confirm that [Redacted S.38(1)(b)] will join the Top table from the Scottish Green Party

As always when it comes to events like this the top table guests and VIP lists are provided for security and briefing purposes only. Such data is private, includes personal information and we do not have the top table or VIP guests permission to announce who they are publicly. Therefore that information is confidential and commercially sensitive. As in all past annual dinners this information is not subject to release under terms of FOI requests.

thanks

GMK

On 14 Sep 2023, at 11:08, Gordon MacIntyre-Kemp <[Redacted S.38(1)(b)]@businessforscotland.co.uk> wrote:

Please see below the attendees for the top table at the Business for Scotland annual dinner tomorrow night.

I have also attached a list of the people that I would like to introduce the FM to at the reception.

Top Table

- 1) Gordon MacIntyre-Kemp, Chief Executive, Business for Scotland.
- 2) [Redacted S.38(1)(b)]
- 10) The FM.

As well as the top table guests, I intend to introduce the FM to the following people at the reception:

[Redacted S.38(1)(b)]

There will also be a table from [Redacted S.38(1)(b)].

Yours for Scotland

Gordon

Gordon MacIntyre-Kemp
Founder and Chief Executive

The Campaigning Business Network

M: [Redacted S.38(1)(b)]

Twitter: @BizforScotland

Facebook: www.facebook.com/BusinessforScotland

Web: www.businessforscotland.com

**Businessfor
Scotland**

From: [Redacted S.38(1)(b)]@gov.scot

Sent: Thursday, August 31, 2023 6:21 PM

To: [Redacted S.38(1)(b)]@businessforscotland.co.uk>; Gordon MacIntyre-Kemp <[Redacted S.38(1)(b)]@businessforscotland.co.uk>

Cc: [Redacted S.38(1)(b)]@gov.scot>; [Redacted S.38(1)(b)]@gov.scot>; [Redacted S.38(1)(b)]@gov.scot>

Subject: RE: Key-Note Speaker Invitation for the Business for Scotland Annual Dinner - 15/09/23 - SEEKING ADDITIONAL INFO BY 4/9

Hi Gordon and [Redacted S.38(1)(b)]

We are finalising arrangements with the First Minister's office for his keynote speech at the Business for Scotland dinner on 15 September.

[Redacted S.39(1)]

My other colleague [Redacted S.38(1)(b)] will be picking up again lead for final arrangements when she returns from leave on Tuesday, however, in the meantime, please may I ask for the following as early as possible next week, preferably **by close Monday 4 September**:

1. Running order – please can you provide that as soon as possible, in particular, we're keen to understand at what point during the proceedings you are hoping for the First Minister to speak and who other speakers will be.
2. Speech Content – are there any particular topics you would like the First Minister to include?
3. Top Table – confirmation of who will be at the First Minister's table
4. Welcome – confirmation of who will greet the First Minister on arrival.
5. Ministers – confirmation of which other Ministers if any have been invited and whether you intend to ask Special Advisers (or if you need us to pass on that request). I would like to advise that Jack Middleton, Special Adviser has confirmed he will support the First Minister on the night. He advises that he has been speaking with party colleagues but will attend formally as a Special Adviser rather than in a party space if you are in agreement.
6. Press – my colleague, [Redacted S.38(1)(b)] is keen to understand your plans for media coverage and may be in touch shortly (again if not already) to discuss.

I look forward to hearing from you by Monday.

Many thanks

[Redacted S.38(1)(b)] **Strategic Business Engagement Team Lead**
Scottish Government | Strategic Business Engagement and Events | Economic Strategy
Directorate | 3rd Floor | 5 Atlantic Quay | 150 Broomielaw | Glasgow | G2 8LU

Mob: [Redacted S.38(1)(b)] email: [Redacted S.38(1)(b)]@gov.scot

I am working remotely and am available by email or MS Teams

[Please note: I am sending this email at a time convenient for me. Even if I've emailed you at an odd time, I don't expect a response outside of your working hours; when you are caring for others; on a non-work day or at the weekend.]

From: Gordon MacIntyre-Kemp <[Redacted S.38(1)(b)]@businessforscotland.co.uk>

Sent: Tuesday, April 4, 2023 3:46 PM

To: [Redacted S.38(1)(b)]@gov.scot>

Cc: [Redacted S.38(1)(b)]@gov.scot>; [Redacted S.38(1)(b)]@gov.scot>; [Redacted S.38(1)(b)]@gov.scot>

Subject: Invitation for FM to speak at the 2023 BfS Annual Dinner

Hi [Redacted S.38(1)(b)]

As previously discussed via email on the 6th of March.

Business for Scotland will be holding our 2023 Annual Dinner on Friday, 15th September this year. The event will be held at the Hilton Hotel in Glasgow.

As has been a tradition every year since our first event in 2014, we would like to invite the First Minister to be the keynote speaker at the event. This would also involve the First Minister attending the event as a top-table guest.

We anticipate between 300 and 400 attendees from across the business community. Guests will arrive from 6.15 pm for a 6.45 pm sit down. We would expect the First Minister to speak for approximately 15 minutes - After the dinner.

I would be grateful for a swift (provisional) confirmation of the First Minister's attendance.

Yours for Scotland

Gordon MacIntyre-Kemp
Chief Executive, Business for Scotland Ltd.
[Redacted S.38(1)(b)]

From: [Redacted S.38(1)(b)]@businessforscotland.co.uk>

Sent: Friday, May 19, 2023 9:49 AM

To: First Minister <FirstMinister@gov.scot>

Cc: Hepburn J (Jamie), MSP <Jamie.Hepburn.msp@parliament.scot>; Gordon MacIntyre-Kemp <[Redacted S.38(1)(b)]@businessforscotland.co.uk>

Subject: Key-Note Speaker Invitation for the Business for Scotland Annual Dinner - 15/09/23

Dear First Minister,

We would like to formally invite you to be the key-note speaker at the Business for Scotland Annual Dinner on Friday, 15th September 2023. The event will be held at the Hilton Glasgow, 1 William St, G3 8HT.

As has been a tradition every year since our first event in 2014, we would like to invite you to attend the event as a top-table guest and to deliver the after dinner speech as the key-note speaker.

We anticipate between 300 and 400 attendees from across the business community. Guests will arrive from 6.15 pm for a 6.45 pm sit down. We would expect the key note address to last approximately 15 minutes.

I have been informed that this date has already been provisionally added to your diary but it was recommend that we send a formal invitation for confirmation of your attendance.

Kind regards,

[Redacted S.38(1)(b)]

Operations Manager, Business for Scotland Ltd

Emails relating to attendance of the Cabinet Secretary for Wellbeing Economy, Fair Work and Energy at the Saltire Club lunch in July 2023

From: Gordon MacIntyre-Kemp <[Redacted S.38(1)(b)]@businessforscotland.co.uk>
Sent: Tuesday, July 25, 2023 11:21 AM
To: [Redacted S.38(1)(b)]@gov.scot>
Cc: [Redacted S.38(1)(b)]@gov.scot>; [Redacted S.38(1)(b)]@businessforscotland.co.uk; [Redacted S.38(1)(b)]@gov.scot>
Subject: Re: Saltire Lunch - 28 July - Ministerial attendance

Neil and [Redacted S.38(1)(b)] will have 4 mins to set the conversation and they can speak about any issue they want.

We have said what Neils Cab Sec Position is and our organisation is one of the key orgs championing wellbeing economics so that will be part of the conversation. However, its flows and my criteria for deciding scope is not fixed.

Can I suggest the Cabinet Secretaries people speak to Jamie Hepburn MSP, who was the speaker at the last Edinburgh Saltire lunch.

thanks

GMK

On 25 Jul 2023, at 11:15, <[Redacted S.38(1)(b)]@gov.scot> wrote:

Hi Gordon

Thanks so much for coming back to us. Has the conversation been framed in anyway when the event was promoted eg Minister responsible for Wellbeing Economy/ Fair Work or is it up to Mr Gray to frame that during his speech? I realise you can't control topics but what are your parameters for suggesting something is in scope or not?

Happy to chat by phone if easier. I'm free until 11:30. We are being chased by Mr Gray's office for this information.

Many thanks

[Redacted S.38(1)(b)] **Strategic Business Engagement Team Lead**
Scottish Government | Strategic Business Engagement and Events | Economic Strategy Directorate | 3rd Floor | 5 Atlantic Quay | 150 Broomielaw | Glasgow | G2 8LU
Mob: [Redacted S.38(1)(b)]| email: [Redacted S.38(1)(b)]@gov.scot
I am working remotely and am available by email or MS Teams

[Please note: I'm sending this email at a time convenient for me. Even if I've emailed you at an odd time, I don't expect a response outside of your working hours; when you are caring for others; on a non-work day or at the weekend]

From: Gordon MacIntyre-Kemp <[Redacted S.38(1)(b)]@businessforscotland.co.uk>
Sent: Tuesday, July 25, 2023 11:00 AM
To: [Redacted S.38(1)(b)]@gov.scot>
Cc: [Redacted S.38(1)(b)]@businessforscotland.co.uk; [Redacted S.38(1)(b)]@gov.scot>; [Redacted S.38(1)(b)]@gov.scot>
Subject: Re: Saltire Lunch - 28 July - Ministerial attendance

Neil will have 4 mins to set the discussion up - however, it's a free flow of questions so we can't control what topics are covered.

I do sometimes call some topics as not relevant when facilitating the conversation and steer it back to the opening comments.

Neil will be seated next to me on one side and [Redacted S.38(1)(b)].

If Neil just comes down the stairs into the private dining room I will meet him. Please let me reiterate it's an informal and private lunch and discussion.

There will be members of the Green party and Alba present as well as SNP members and people of no political allegiance but all are aware we operate under strict Chatham House rules.

Yours for Scotland

Gordon

Gordon MacIntyre-Kemp
Founder and Chief Executive

The Campaigning Business Network

M: [Redacted S.38(1)(b)]

Twitter: @BizforScotland

Facebook: www.facebook.com/BusinessforScotland

Web: www.businessforscotland.com

On 24 Jul 2023, at 12:04, <[Redacted S.38(1)(b)]@gov.scot> wrote:

Thanks Gordon,

Can I ask what the focus of the discussion will be? And also who will greet him outside (assume it will be yourself?). And lastly, appreciate you won't have the full attendees list but we need to share the briefing with the Cabinet Secretary today, could we include who he will be seated next to for now?

Happy to chat – I am on [Redacted S.38(1)(b)]

Thanks

[Redacted S.38(1)(b)] **Business Organisations Strategic Engagement Manager | Strategic Business Engagement Team**

Economic Strategy Directorate | Scottish Government

Mob: [Redacted S.38(1)(b)] email: [Redacted S.38(1)(b)]@gov.scot

I am sending this e-mail at a time that suits my working arrangements and, if this is at a time outwith your own normal working hours, I do not expect you to respond until you are next at work

From: gordon <[Redacted S.38(1)(b)]@businessforscotland.co.uk>

Sent: 20 July 2023 12:53

To: [Redacted S.38(1)(b)]@gov.scot>; Believe in Scotland - [Redacted S.38(1)(b)]@businessforscotland.co.uk>

Subject: RE: FW: Saltire Lunch - 28 July - Ministerial attendance

We won't have the final list till Wed next week. [Redacted S.38(1)(b)] will deal with that thanks.

GMK

Sent from my Galaxy

----- Original message -----

From: [Redacted S.38(1)(b)]@gov.scot
Date: 20/07/2023 12:52 pm (GMT+01:00)
To: [Redacted S.38(1)(b)]@businessforScotland.co.uk
Subject: FW: Saltire Lunch - 28 July - Ministerial attendance

Hi Gordon

Hope you are well! just wanted to check in with you about a list of attendees, grateful if you could advise? Thank you!

[Redacted S.38(1)(b)] | **Business Organisations Strategic Engagement Manager | Strategic Business Engagement Team**
Economic Strategy Directorate | Scottish Government
Mob: [Redacted S.38(1)(b)] | email: [Redacted S.38(1)(b)]@gov.scot

From: [Redacted S.38(1)(b)]@gov.scot>
Sent: Thursday, July 13, 2023 2:06 PM
To: Gordon MacIntyre-Kemp <[Redacted S.38(1)(b)]@businessforScotland.co.uk>
Cc: [Redacted S.38(1)(b)]@gov.scot>; [Redacted S.38(1)(b)]@gov.scot>
Subject: RE: Saltire Lunch - 28 July - Ministerial attendance

Thank you Gordon that is really helpful. I will be going on leave after today so please keep my colleagues [Redacted S.38(1)(b)] up-dated with any further information.

Enjoy the rest of your holiday.

Regards

[Redacted S.38(1)(b)] Senior Policy Executive | Strategic Business Engagement and Events Division | Economic Strategy Directorate | Scottish Government | Mobile: [Redacted S.38(1)(b)]
|email: [Redacted S.38(1)(b)]@gov.scot

From: Gordon MacIntyre-Kemp <[Redacted S.38(1)(b)]@businessforScotland.co.uk>
Sent: Thursday, July 13, 2023 1:37 PM
To: [Redacted S.38(1)(b)]@gov.scot>
Cc: [Redacted S.38(1)(b)]@gov.scot>
Subject: Re: Saltire Lunch - 28 July - Ministerial attendance
Importance: High

Hi [Redacted S.38(1)(b)]

I am on holiday at the moment so a brief synopsis.

The lunch will be at the Cannonball Restaurant at the top of the Royal Mile in Edinburgh. <https://www.contini.com/cannonball>

The Other speaker will be [Redacted S.38(1)(b)] whose Neil will know well.

Itinerary

Drinks from noon, sit down 12.30pm for 5 min welcome from myself. We then network over the starter and when that is cleared both speakers have 4 mins each to set the scene - then the main course arrives and I facilitate a Q&A throughout the lunch ending around 2.30pm. Sounds like a long Q&A but we end up arguing amongst ourselves and the second speaker format allows the speaker to have a break and eat-:) Saltire meetings are always in private dining rooms and everyone knows never to attribute what was said.

It can be a tough gig but for the right reasons, lots of searching questions and ideas.

We will send you a list of attendees beforehand and joining instructions. Saltire membership of Business for Scotland is a premium membership costing £1,500 a year. We hold 10 lunches a year for the 60 or so members who are all pro-independence business people.

Yours for Scotland

Gordon

Gordon MacIntyre-Kemp
Founder and Chief Executive

The Campaigning Business Network

M: [Redacted S.38(1)(b)]

Twitter: @BizforScotland

Facebook: www.facebook.com/BusinessforScotland

Web: www.businessforscotland.com

On 13 Jul 2023, at 11:21, <[Redacted S.38(1)(b)]@gov.scot> wrote:

Good morning

Further to your invitation to the Cabinet Secretary for Wellbeing Economy, Fair Work and Energy, Neil Gray, MSP, to attend the Saltire Lunch on 28 July, I should be very grateful if you could provide details of the venue and time please.

Kind regards

[Redacted S.38(1)(b)]

Senior Policy Executive | Strategic Business Engagement and Events Division | Economic Strategy Directorate | Scottish Government | Mobile: [Redacted S.38(1)(b)] | email: [Redacted S.38(1)(b)]@gov.scot

Email from Business for Scotland to the Scottish Government (4 April 2023)

From: Gordon MacIntyre-Kemp <[Redacted S.38(1)(b)]@businessforscotland.co.uk>

Sent: Tuesday, April 4, 2023 4:06 PM

To: [Redacted S.38(1)(b)]@gov.scot>

Subject: Re: Meeting with Minister for Independence.

Hi Karen

On behalf of Business for Scotland, I would like to request a meeting with Jamie Hepburn MSP in his new role as Minister for Independence.

Our attendees will include representatives of the Board of Business for Scotland Ltd.

The agenda will include independence strategy and communication with businesses and other organisations regarding devolution, independence and Scotland's constitutional future.

We can be flexible on dates; the only ones we cannot make in April are from the 25th to the 28th.

Yours for Scotland

Gordon MacIntyre-Kemp
Chief Executive, Business for Scotland Ltd.
[Redacted S.38(1)(b)]

Additional emails relating to the Business for Scotland annual dinner on 13 January 2023

From: Gordon MacIntyre-Kemp <[Redacted S.38(1)(b)]@businessforscotland.co.uk>
Sent: 13 January 2023 16:26
To: [Redacted S.38(1)(b)]@gov.scot>
Cc: [Redacted S.38(1)(b)]@gov.scot>
Subject: Re: Revised BfS Annual Dinner running order

Hi [Redacted S.38(1)(b)]

Yes, I am glad we managed to get a workable running order agreed thanks.

We have fewer Ministers for this reorganised event than we did for the original one, Lorna Slater, Mairi McAllan and we think Patrick Harvey are attending, in total, we think ten MPs/MSPs but we do not have the full lists for table guests yet and there may be a few we don't yet know about.

We have not invited any Special Advisors, I mistakenly thought we were not allowed to invite them and we would be delighted if any of them would wish to attend as our guests. If any special advisors were able to attend we could either sit them together or mix them in with the guests on VIP tables. Just drop [Redacted S.38(1)(b)] an email if anyone and their plus one would like to attend.

The more the merrier.

thanks

GMK

On 12 Jan 2023, at 17:57, [Redacted S.38(1)(b)]@gov.scot> wrote:

Hi Gordon

Many thanks for your time earlier and for sharing this revised running order. The First Minister thanks you for adapting the programme and is content with the revised plan. I just wanted to note that it's likely to be closer to 18:30 before she arrives depending on traffic.

In terms of who from SG will be accompanying the First Minister, Special Adviser Emily Mackintosh and First Minister's private secretary, [Redacted S.38(1)(b)], will be there on the night. Emily thinks that not many Special Advisors have been invited and wonders if that is correct/ could be updated? Emily is comfortable with either a seat at a table or not, whichever you can accommodate.

Also, have many Ministers been invited and accepted?

I know you mentioned on Monday about not sharing the full guest list for GDPR reasons, however, [Redacted S.39(1)] we would need to receive details of who will be at the VIP reception and who will be at the First Minister's table. As you suggested, in the format of CEO of X company is fine, but we need to be aware of who is in the room for security and audience purposes. Please can you share those **by close Monday** at the latest?

Finally, thank you for sharing your request to meet. I have shared with the First Minister's office and we will come back to you as soon as possible with a response.

Many thanks again for your cooperation, Gordon.

Kind regards

[Redacted S.38(1)(b)] | **Strategic Business Engagement Team Lead**
Scottish Government | Strategic Business Engagement and Events | Economic Strategy
Directorate | 3rd Floor | 5 Atlantic Quay | 150 Broomielaw | Glasgow | G2 8LU
Mob: [Redacted S.38(1)(b)] | email: [Redacted S.38(1)(b)]@gov.scot
I am working remotely and am available by email or I am working remotely and am available by email or MS Teams

[Please note: I'm sending this email at a time convenient for me. Even if I've emailed you at an odd time, I don't expect a response outside of your working hours; when you are caring for others; on a non-work day or at the weekend]

From: Gordon MacIntyre-Kemp <[Redacted S.38(1)(b)]@businessforscotland.co.uk>
Sent: 12 January 2023 13:52
To: [Redacted S.38(1)(b)]@gov.scot
Cc: [Redacted S.38(1)(b)]@gov.scot>
Subject: Revised BfS Annual Dinner running order

Hi [Redacted S.38(1)(b)]

Following on from our conversation this morning I have attached the reworked the running order that will enable the FM to leave at 8 pm, having rejoined the top table after her talk. This will also allow for an earlier dinner service.

I hope this meets with your approval and seems to me the best way to handle the the situation.

Yours for Scotland

Gordon MacIntyre-Kemp

From: [Redacted S.38(1)(b)]@gov.scot
Sent: Wednesday, January 18, 2023 3:42 PM
To: 'Gordon MacIntyre-Kemp' <[Redacted S.38(1)(b)]@businessforscotland.co.uk>
Cc: [Redacted S.38(1)(b)]@gov.scot>; Mackintosh E (Emily) <[Redacted S.38(1)(b)]@gov.scot>; Visits and Events <VisitsandEvents@gov.scot>; [Redacted S.38(1)(b)]@gov.scot>; [Redacted S.38(1)(b)]@gov.scot>
Subject: RE: This is how the top table will be led in to the BFS dinner

Gordon

Many thanks for sharing. Adding relevant colleagues for info.

Emily – are you able to confirm whether you are leaving with the First Minister or planning to stay? If memory serves me correctly (not always reliable!) we'd asked whether any Special Advisers coming would have a seat at a table, although Emily indicated she is conformable not being at a table.

Many thanks

[Redacted S.38(1)(b)]
Strategic Business Engagement Team Lead
Scottish Government | Strategic Business Engagement and Events | Economic Strategy
Directorate | 3rd Floor | 5 Atlantic Quay | 150 Broomielaw | Glasgow | G2 8LU

Mob: [Redacted S.38(1)(b)] email: [Redacted S.38(1)(b)]@gov.scot

I am working remotely and am available by email or MS Teams

[Please note: I'm sending this email at a time convenient for me. Even if I've emailed you at an odd time, I don't expect a response outside of your working hours; when you are caring for others; on a non-work day or at the weekend]

From: Gordon MacIntyre-Kemp <[Redacted S.38(1)(b)]@businessforscotland.co.uk>

Sent: 18 January 2023 15:34

To: [Redacted S.38(1)(b)]@gov.scot>

Subject: This is how the top table will be led in to the BFS dinner

We will walk round the table once and I will stop and everyone can sit where they stand.

Piper

Gordon MacIntyre-Kemp

Nicola Sturgeon MSP

[Redacted S.38(1)(b)]

Are the Spads that are coming with her leaving at 8pm or staying for dinner? Happy for them to stay but I don't want to create gaps on tables if they are just there for the talk and leave before dinner.

Thanks

GMK

From: Gordon MacIntyre-Kemp <[Redacted S.38(1)(b)]@businessforscotland.co.uk>

Sent: 12 January 2023 13:52

To: [Redacted S.38(1)(b)]@gov.scot>

Cc: [Redacted S.38(1)(b)]@gov.scot>

Subject: Revised BfS Annual Dinner running order

Hi [Redacted S.38(1)(b)]

Following on from our conversation this morning I have attached the reworked the running order that will enable the FM to leave at 8 pm, having rejoined the top table after her talk. This will also allow for an earlier dinner service.

I hope this meets with your approval and seems to me the best way to handle the the situation.

Yours for Scotland

Gordon MacIntyre-Kemp

Annual Dinner 2022 (19/01/23) Internal Running Order (Attachment)

6:15pm: Guest arrival and VIP drinks reception with FM

7:00pm: Guests called into the main hall Bar closes at 7pm

7:05pm - 7:17pm: Top Table (inc FM) piped in followed by performance by VIP [Redacted S.38(1)(b)]

7:17pm - 7:25pm: Host welcome and introduction to the FM- [Redacted S.38(1)(b)] - Comedian and YouTuber

7:25pm – 7:45pm: Keynote speech by Nicola Sturgeon MSP, First Minister of Scotland

7:45pm FM re-joins Top Table after speech leaving at 8pm.

7.45pm: Full dinner service, bar re-opens, background music Scottish Spotify list, raffle ticket reminder push + heads and tails collection.
9:05pm: [Redacted S.38(1)(b)] Heads & Tails (fundraising game)
9:20pm: - [Redacted S.38(1)(b)] introduces BfS CEO, Gordon MacIntyre-Kemp Bar closes
9:25pm: Annual address by Gordon MacIntyre-Kemp and introduction to Keynote Speaker
9:40pm: Keynote speech by Nicola Sturgeon MSP, First Minister of Scotland Raffle takes place behind the scenes
10:00pm: Gordon thanks the FM and is joined by [Redacted S.38(1)(b)] for the fundraising auction
10:15pm: [Redacted S.38(1)(b)] sums up event
10:20pm: Vote of thanks by Director of BfS Distribute raffle prizes where possible Bar re-opens
10:25pm: Official proceedings end – event continues till 11:30pm
11:45pm: Clean up begins, table runners and sashes off chairs, pick up all BfS material, pens left on tables plus stands and unclaimed prizes

From: [Redacted S.38(1)(b)]@gov.scot
Sent: Tuesday, January 17, 2023 4:12 PM
To: 'Gordon MacIntyre-Kemp' <[Redacted S.38(1)(b)]@businessforscotland.co.uk>; [Redacted S.38(1)(b)]@gov.scot>
Cc: [Redacted S.38(1)(b)]@businessforscotland.co.uk>; Visits and Events <VisitsandEvents@gov.scot>; [Redacted S.38(1)(b)]@gov.scot>
Subject: RE: VIP Reception and Top Table guests for Business for Scotland Annual Dinner

Hi Gordon

Many thanks for this. On this point I thought it was worth mentioning that this is all we use guest names for.

Thanks once again for sharing.

[Redacted S.38(1)(b)] | **Strategic Business Engagement Team Lead**
Scottish Government | Strategic Business Engagement and Events | Economic Strategy Directorate | 3rd Floor | 5 Atlantic Quay | 150 Broomielaw | Glasgow | G2 8LU

Mob: [Redacted S.38(1)(b)] | email: [Redacted S.38(1)(b)]@gov.scot

I am working remotely and am available by email or MS Teams

[Please note: I'm sending this email at a time convenient for me. Even if I've emailed you at an odd time, I don't expect a response outside of your working hours; when you are caring for others; on a non-work day or at the weekend]

From: Gordon MacIntyre-Kemp <[Redacted S.38(1)(b)]@businessforscotland.co.uk>
Sent: 17 January 2023 14:42
To: [Redacted S.38(1)(b)]@gov.scot>; [Redacted S.38(1)(b)]@gov.scot>
Cc: [Redacted S.38(1)(b)]@businessforscotland.co.uk>; Visits and Events <VisitsandEvents@gov.scot>; [Redacted S.38(1)(b)]@gov.scot>
Subject: VIP Reception and Top Table guests for Business for Scotland Annual Dinner

Please find attached the list of **VIP reception and top table guests for the Business for Scotland Annual Dinner on Thursday evening.**

Please Note: Information on the attendees of the BfS Annual Dinner qualifies as commercially sensitive and therefore is submitted under the understanding that the information cannot be disclosed in response to any FOI request. The information should be used only for security vetting purposes and for briefing the First Minister.

On the evening we will be auctioning several fronts from the artist [Redacted S.38(1)(b)] and as mentioned we would like the FM to sign them on the back to note the occasion. We have a game of heads and tails and the price will be £100.00 and a sketch of The FM in her tartan mask, we would also appreciate it if she would sign that.

And finally, traditional the guest of honour traditionally adds something to the raffle - it has almost always been a signed bottle of Scottish Parliament whisky, to do that again would be a nice touch for the FM.

Yours for Scotland

Gordon MacIntyre-Kemp.

From: [Redacted S.38(1)(b)]@gov.scot

Sent: 05 January 2023 16:42

To: [Redacted S.38(1)(b)]@businessforscotland.co.uk>

Cc: [Redacted S.38(1)(b)]@businessforscotland.co.uk; [Redacted S.38(1)(b)]@gov.scot>

Subject: RE: Rescheduling the FM address to the BfS Annual Dinner - CONFIRMED DATE AS THURSDAY 19 JANUARY 2023

Hi [Redacted S.38(1)(b)]

Happy New Year to you, too.

Thanks for that prompt confirmation. [Redacted S.38(1)(b)] will be in touch to arrange a suitable time with you and [Redacted S.38(1)(b)].

Thanks for confirmation that you are keen for the First Minister to arrive in time for the reception. From memory (not always reliable!) this wasn't part of the original discussion and I'm unable to confirm at this stage whether there is scope in First Minister's calendar to arrive by that time. We will pursue with her office and see what we can do.

If you can provide the final programme, as soon as possible that may help us achieve that. In addition, if you can offer an indication of anyone in particular that you would wish the First Minister to meet at the reception that may also be useful. I can't see a programme on your website.

I've just issued a calendar invite for 14:00 on Monday to have a quick chat with Gordon – and you if you are available [Redacted S.38(1)(b)].

Look forward to receiving further info from you as early as possible and to speaking with you on Monday.

Many thanks

[Redacted S.38(1)(b)] | **Strategic Business Engagement Team Lead**
Scottish Government | Strategic Business Engagement and Events | Economic Strategy
Directorate | 3rd Floor | 5 Atlantic Quay | 150 Broomielaw | Glasgow | G2 8LU

Mob: [Redacted S.38(1)(b)]| email: [Redacted S.38(1)(b)]@gov.scot

I am working remotely and am available by email or MS Teams

[Please note: I'm sending this email at a time convenient for me. Even if I've emailed you at an odd time, I don't expect a response outside of your working hours; when you are caring for others; on a non-work day or at the weekend]

From: [Redacted S.38(1)(b)]@businessforscotland.co.uk>

Sent: 05 January 2023 15:28

To: [Redacted S.38(1)(b)]@gov.scot>

Cc: [Redacted S.38(1)(b)]@businessforscotland.co.uk; [Redacted S.38(1)(b)]@gov.scot>

Subject: Re: Rescheduling the FM address to the BfS Annual Dinner - CONFIRMED DATE AS THURSDAY 19 JANUARY 2023

Hi [Redacted S.38(1)(b)],

Happy New Year!

[Redacted S.39(1)]

We will get everything we can to you for Wednesday 11th and Gordon will be available on Monday anytime after 2pm for a chat about the FM's speech.

Only thing to urgently note is that the VIP reception starts at 6:15pm and runs until 7pm when guest will be seated so we would like the FM to be there for 6:15 to allow enough time for everyone to say hello.

Many thanks,

[Redacted S.38(1)(b)]

On 5 Jan 2023, at 14:01, <[Redacted S.38(1)(b)]@gov.scot> wrote:

Hi Gordon

Happy New Year! Hope all is well with you.

[Redacted S.39(1)] They want to check if [Redacted S.38(1)(b)] in your team and [Redacted S.38(1)(b)] in Crown Plaza remain the key contacts.

Also, from our perspective it would be good to have a chat as early as possible next week so we can have all the information we need to offer appropriate preparation to First Minister. Please can you provide the following info **by close Wed 11 January 2023**:

- Final detailed programme – currently FM has scheduled to arrive around 19:00 but early confirmation of the programme would allow us to confirm that;
- Who will greet First Minister on arrival (including any contact details);
- Confirmation of any other Scottish Government Ministers or officials invited and attending;
- Other guest speakers;
- Confirmation of guests (preferably with photos/ bios if you have them) of those at First Minister's table;
- Full guest list – as many of those attending as you will have by close 11 Jan (recognising people still accept right up to the wire!);

Finally, ahead of 11 January it would be good for us to have a quick chat to ensure the First Minister covers off in her speech anything in particular you would like her to mention. Would you be free on Monday afternoon, any time between 14:00 and 16:00?

Many thanks in advance.

[Redacted S.38(1)(b)] | **Strategic Business Engagement Team Lead**
Scottish Government | Strategic Business Engagement and Events | Economic Strategy
Directorate | 3rd Floor | 5 Atlantic Quay | 150 Broomielaw | Glasgow | G2 8LU
Mob: [Redacted S.38(1)(b)] | email: [Redacted S.38(1)(b)]@gov.scot
I am working remotely and am available by email or MS Teams

[Please note: I'm sending this email at a time convenient for me. Even if I've emailed you at an odd time, I don't expect a response outside of your working hours; when you are caring for others; on a non-work day or at the weekend]

From: [Redacted S.38(1)(b)]@gov.scot
Sent: Wednesday, January 11, 2023 3:11 PM
To: 'Gordon MacIntyre-Kemp' <[Redacted S.38(1)(b)]@businessforscotland.co.uk>
Cc: [Redacted S.38(1)(b)]@businessforscotland.co.uk>; [Redacted S.38(1)(b)]@gov.scot>
Subject: RE: Business for Scotland Annual Address - Thursday 19 January

Hi Gordon

Many thanks for sharing these helpful links and addition information which I have passed on to colleagues.

Your email is timely as we've just heard from the First Minister's office who advise that an unexpected and unavoidable matter has arisen which will require First Minister's attention next Thursday. The First Minister is still keen to participate and deliver the keynote address, however, has suggested alternative timings that she hopes will allow her to meet some guest and deliver her speech but leave by 20:00.

What we'd like to propose is the First Minister arrives around 18:30 to join your VIP reception and speak with guests. We suggest the next stage of the programme runs according to your plan, however, instead of serving dinner immediately after [Redacted S.38(1)(b)] opening at 19:40, the First Minister speaks and then leaves just as dinner is served at 20:00.

The suggested changes look like this, which still allows 20 minutes for the First Minister's speech:

6:15pm: Guest arrival and VIP drinks reception with FM (Raffle ticket sales)
7:05pm: Guests called into the main hall
7:05pm - 7:25pm: Top table piped in followed by performance by VIP [Redacted S.38(1)(b)]
7:25pm - 7:30pm: Welcome and toast by [Redacted S.38(1)(b)], Director of Business for Scotland
7:30pm - 7:40pm: Host welcome - [Redacted S.38(1)(b)] - Comedian and YouTuber
7:40pm – 8.00pm: Keynote speech by Nicola Sturgeon MSP, First Minister of Scotland
8.00pm: Full dinner service Background music Scottish Spotify list Raffle ticket reminder push + heads and tails collection

I will call you shortly but wanted the opportunity to share this with you first.

My sincere apologies for the need to offer this amendment, however, matters outside of our control are often sent to try us!

Many thanks for your understanding and speak shortly.

[Redacted S.38(1)(b)] | **Strategic Business Engagement Team Lead**
Scottish Government | Strategic Business Engagement and Events | Economic Strategy
Directorate | 3rd Floor | 5 Atlantic Quay | 150 Broomielaw | Glasgow | G2 8LU
Mob: [Redacted S.38(1)(b)] | email: [Redacted S.38(1)(b)]@gov.scot
I am working remotely and am available by email or MS Teams

[Please note: I'm sending this email at a time convenient for me. Even if I've emailed you at an odd time, I don't expect a response outside of your working hours; when you are caring for others; on a non-work day or at the weekend]

From: Gordon MacIntyre-Kemp <[Redacted S.38(1)(b)]@businessforscotland.co.uk>
Sent: 11 January 2023 13:10
To: [Redacted S.38(1)(b)]@gov.scot>
Subject: Links to info promised during our meeting yesterday.

Hi [Redacted S.38(1)(b)]

Following up on our conversation yesterday, here are some links to information that may be of use to your colleagues working on the FMs address to the Annual Dinner.

[Here is the Frequently Asked Questions page](#) from our site which will explain the relationship between Business for Scotland and Believe in Scotland, and the size, scale and goals of our organisation and campaigns.

Wellbeing

Key to all of our policy work is our support for and leading role in defining the wellbeing economics agenda - please note that the wellbeing economy is often a term for the voluntary sector's economic impact. Wellbeing economics is a new economic approach and so not the same. our Wellbeing Economics Manifesto is [explained in brief here](#)

We are also about to launch a new [campaign for a Wellbeing pension](#) - Not all of our campaigns are directly independence related but we would like to see the Wellbeing Pension proposal adopted by the Scottish Government as part of its independence plans.

Affiliated Yes Groups

The size of the organisation is explained in the FAQs but it may also be of use to see the growing [list of our affiliated organisations here](#)

Our New Mobile App

Also in the night, we will be announcing the launch of our Believe in Scotland mobile app - instructions for download here. The app will focus on Scotland the Brief at the moment but the focus of the app content will change as the campaign progresses.

Should anyone want to look at the app - it is in beta testing mode right now with a selection of our Stakeholder members. See below.

We are developing a series of mobile phone apps - from key issue apps to canvassing and surveying apps and apps for affiliated national campaign groups.

Our first is a Believe in Scotland app, the main feature of which is access to Scotland the Brief. All the great info from the StB Mini book in your pocket along with access to the StB quiz, latest news, and blogs - basically, it's the economic argument for independence at your fingertips.

Go on to your mobile device and click the link to download the app here:

<https://believeinscotland.beezer.com/>

The app will open in your mobile phone's default web browser, but you can copy and paste this link into a supporting browser if you have any issues.

On Android (using Chrome browser)

1.) You will be prompted to Allow or Block Push Notifications then you will be asked to install the app by clicking the banner popup at the bottom of the screen.

- 2.) After clicking the 'Add to Home screen' link you then press add. (If you have dismissed the prompt, you can add manually by choosing 'Add to Home Screen' from the Settings menu of the browser).
- 3.) You did it! The app is installed on the Home Screen and a dot will appear showing new notifications have been sent.

On iPhone (using Safari browser)

- 1.) You will see the app in the browser and a popup to Install the app and 'ADD TO HOME SCREEN' will appear at the bottom of the screen.
- 2.) When you click the blue "ADD TO HOME SCREEN" button you will then see instructions for how to add to the home screen on iOS
- 3.) Tap the relevant icon then press the Add to Home Screen icon (note you may need to scroll down to see the + Icon).
Next click 'Add to Home Screen'
- 4.) You can then click 'Add' at the top of the screen to complete the Install process. Your Progressive Web App will now be accessible from the home screen of your iOS device. You did it! Once launched from your home screen you will see your app in 'full screen' mode without any navigation bar or browser options.

If you require any further information please do not hesitate to call.

GMK

Annual Dinner 2022 (19/01/23) Internal Running Order (Attachment)

- 6:15pm: Guest arrival and VIP drinks reception with FM
- 7:00pm: Guests called into the main hall Bar closes at 7pm
- 7:05pm - 7:17pm: Top Table (inc FM) piped in followed by performance by VIP [Redacted S.38(1)(b)]
- 7:17pm - 7:25pm: Host welcome and introduction to the FM- [Redacted S.38(1)(b)]- Comedian and YouTuber
- 7:25pm – 7:45pm: Keynote speech by Nicola Sturgeon MSP, First Minister of Scotland
- 7:45pm FM re-joins Top Table after speech leaving at 8pm.
- 7:45pm: Full dinner service, bar re-opens, background music Scottish Spotify list, raffle ticket reminder push + heads and tails collection.
- 9:05pm: [Redacted S.38(1)(b)]Heads & Tails (fundraising game)
- 9:20pm: - [Redacted S.38(1)(b)] introduces BfS CEO, Gordon MacIntyre-Kemp Bar closes
- 9:25pm: Annual address by Gordon MacIntyre-Kemp and introduction to Keynote Speaker
- 9:40pm: Keynote speech by Nicola Sturgeon MSP, First Minister of Scotland Raffle takes place behind the scenes
- 10:00pm: Gordon thanks the FM and is joined by [Redacted S.38(1)(b)] for the fundraising auction
- 10:15pm: [Redacted S.38(1)(b)] sums up event
- 10:20pm: Vote of thanks by Director of BfS Distribute raffle prizes where possible Bar re-opens
- 10:25pm: Official proceedings end – event continues till 11:30pm
- 11:45pm: Clean up begins, table runners and sashes off chairs, pick up all BfS material, pens left on tables plus stands and unclaimed prizes

Email from Business for Scotland to the Scottish Government (12 January 2023)

From: Gordon MacIntyre-Kemp <[Redacted S.38(1)(b)]@businessforscotland.co.uk>
Sent: Thursday, January 12, 2023 1:57 PM
To: [Redacted S.38(1)(b)]@gov.scot>
Cc: [Redacted S.38(1)(b)]@gov.scot>
Subject: Meeting with the First Minister

Hi [Redacted S.38(1)(b)]

As discussed I would like to request a meeting with the First Minister on behalf of Business for Scotland and Believe in Scotland.

The meeting would be to discuss positive ideas on how to progress the Scottish Government's key policy of gaining independence for Scotland and how Business for Scotland's Wellbeing Economics approach can facilitate that progress.

I would invite a representative from the Board of Business for Scotland and one from our Believe in Scotland Campaign Steering Group to join us.

I would suggest the best time for this meeting would be in mid-March and that the duration would be about an hour.

Yours for Scotland

Gordon MacIntyre-Kemp.

Email from Business for Scotland to the Scottish Government (4 April 2023)

Hi [Redacted S.38(1)(b)]

On behalf of Business for Scotland, I would like to request a meeting with Jamie Hepburn MSP in his new role as Minister for Independence. Our attendees will include representatives of the Board of Business for Scotland Ltd. The agenda will include independence strategy and communication with businesses and other organisations regarding devolution, independence and Scotland's constitutional future. We can be flexible on dates; the only ones we cannot make in April are from the 25th to the 28th.

Yours for Scotland z

Gordon MacIntyre-Kemp Chief Executive, Business for Scotland Ltd. [Redacted S.38(1)(b)]

Reply from the Scottish Government

Gordon MacIntyre-Kemp [Redacted S.38(1)(b)]@businessforscotland.co.uk

Our Reference: 202300350324

Your Reference: Request for a meeting with the Minister for Independence 20 April 2023

Dear Gordon,

Thank you for your email of 4 April 2023, inviting the Minister for Independence, Jamie Hepburn MSP, to a meeting. Mr Hepburn would be delighted to accept your invitation, I would be grateful if you could contact me at MinisterforIndy@gov.scot to discuss arrangements.

Yours sincerely [Redacted S.38(1)(b)] PRIVATE SECRETARY

Email from Business for Scotland (5 June 2023)

From: Gordon MacIntyre-Kemp <[Redacted S.38(1)(b)]@businessforscotland.co.uk>
Sent: 05 June 2023 14:18
To: GRAY, Neil <neil.gray.mp@parliament.uk>
Cc: Hepburn J (Jamie), MSP <Jamie.Hepburn.msp@parliament.scot>
Subject: Meeting to Discuss Wellbeing Economics Project

Hi Neil

I had hoped that we would be able to meet up by now and discuss the Wellbeing economic project and the business events we touched on during the meeting in the First Minister's office.

I still have not heard back from your office on our meeting that we discussed having quickly after the leadership contest. Can we arrange for some time in the next two weeks?

I have also texted to ask if you can speak at the Saltire Lunch in Edinburgh on Friday, June 28th. You suggested you would be able to be more flexible with your diary then.

Yours for Scotland
Gordon

Gordon MacIntyre-Kemp
Founder and Chief Executive Business for Scotland
The Campaigning Business Network
M: [Redacted S.38(1)(b)]
Twitter: @BizforScotland
Facebook: www.facebook.com/BusinessforScotland
Web: www.businessforscotland.com



Scottish Government letter to Business for Scotland (June 2023)

MINISTERIAL PORTFOLIOS
Public Engagement Unit
PORTFOLIOS MINISTERIAL
Aonad Ceangal Poblach

Gordon MacIntyre-Kemp
[Redacted S.38(1)(b)]@businessforscotland.co.uk
Our Reference: 202300362143

Dear Gordon MacIntyre-Kemp,

Thank you for your correspondence received on 06/06/2023. Your query will be passed to the relevant area for consideration and has been given a reference number of 202300362143. Please quote this number in all correspondence. The Scottish Government aim to respond, where necessary, as quickly as possible and within the stated timescale as indicated on our website (<http://www.gov.scot/Contacts/>).

Yours sincerely
MiCase
Correspondence system for SG and partner agencies

The Scottish Government takes your privacy seriously. You may have written to us because you have a question or want to make a complaint. Our privacy notice (<https://beta.gov.scot/publications/contacting-the-scottish-government-handling-your-data>), available on our website, sets out how we use your personal data, and your rights when communicating with us. It is made under Article 13 of the General Data Protection Regulation (GDPR).

Reply from the Scottish Government (23 June 2023)

Cabinet Secretary for Wellbeing Economy, Fair Work and Energy
Rùnaire a' Chaibineit airson Eaconamaidh do Mhath Dhaoine, Obair Choithromach is Cumhachd
Neil Gray MSP/BPA
T : 0300 2444000
E : scottish.ministers@gov.scot

Gordon MacIntyre-Kemp
[Redacted S.38(1)(b)]@businessforscotland.co.uk
Our Reference: 202300362143 23 June 2023

Dear Mr MacIntyre-Kemp,

Thank you for your invitation to Neil Gray MSP, Cabinet Secretary for Wellbeing Economy, Fair Work and Energy on 5 June to speak at the Saltire Lunch on 30 June. The Cabinet Secretary would be delighted to attend and I would be grateful if you could please contact us at CabSecWEFWE@gov.scot to make the necessary arrangements.

Yours sincerely
[Redacted S.38(1)(b)]Private Secretary

Letter from the Scottish Government to Business for Scotland (August 2023)

MINISTERIAL PORTFOLIOS
Public Engagement Unit
PORTFOLIOS MINISTERIAL
Aonad Ceangal Poblach

Gordon MacIntyre-Kemp
[Redacted S.38(1)(b)]@businessforscotland.co.uk
Our Reference: 202300373159

Dear Gordon MacIntyre-Kemp,

Thank you for your correspondence received on 22/08/2023. Your query will be passed to the relevant area for consideration and has been given a reference number of 202300373159. Please quote this number in all correspondence. The Scottish Government aim to respond, where necessary, as quickly as possible and within the stated timescale as indicated on our website (<http://www.gov.scot/Contacts/>).

Yours sincerely
MiCase Correspondence system for SG and partner agencies

The Scottish Government takes your privacy seriously. You may have written to us because you have a question or want to make a complaint. Our privacy notice (<https://beta.gov.scot/publications/contacting-the-scottish-government-handling-your-data>), available on our website, sets out how we use your personal data, and your rights when communicating with us. It is made under Article 13 of the General Data Protection Regulation (GDPR).

Email from the Scottish Government to Business for Scotland (7 September 2023)

Minister for Culture, Europe and International Development
Christina McKelvie MSP/BPA
T : 0300 244 4000
E : scottish.ministers@gov.scot

Gordon MacIntyre-Kemp
[Redacted S.38(1)(b)]@businessforscotland.co.uk
Our Reference: 202300373159
Your Reference: Invite to attend the 2023 Business for Scotland Annual Dinner in Glasgow (15/09/23) 7 September 2023

Dear Gordon,

Thank you for inviting Christina McKelvie MSP, Minister for Culture, Europe and International Development to attend the 8th annual Business for Scotland Dinner in Glasgow on the 15 September 2023. Unfortunately, due to a prior commitment, the Minister is unable to attend on this occasion. The Minister has asked me to pass on her best wishes for a successful evening.

Yours sincerely,
[Redacted S.38(1)(b)]
PRIVATE SECRETARY

Email from Business for Scotland to the Scottish Government (9 February 2024)

From: Gordon MacIntyre-Kemp <[Redacted S.38(1)(b)]@businessforscotland.co.uk>
Sent: Friday, February 9, 2024 11:09 AM
To: Cabinet Secretary for Wellbeing Economy, Fair Work & Energy <CabSecWEFWE@gov.scot>
Cc: Mairi.McAllan.msp@parliament.scot; Hepburn Msp <jamie.hepburn.msp@parliament.scot>
Subject: Business for Scotland / Scotianomics Meeting on Wellbeing Economy

Mairi

Congratulations on the new position.

As you know Business for Scotland is one of the largest, most active and influential business networks in Scotland. We are however the only business network that is closely aligned with the Scottish Government on the transition to a Wellbeing Economy and also on the constitutional issue.

Our research arm, the Wellbeing Economy Think Tank, Scotianomics (<https://www.scotianomics.org/analysis/>) leads the way in researching and measuring the Wellbeing Economy and creating policies such as Wellbeing Economy Tax Credits and the Wellbeing Pension (<https://wellbeingpension.org/>).

We had an excellent relationship with Neil and hope that we can replicate that with you. There are several major Wellbeing Economy projects that we are progressing and [Redacted S.33(1)(b)].

I hope that a swift meeting will be to the advantage of all. I am in Edinburgh next Thursday afternoon, if indeed that is helpful to you but can make myself available any day till the end of the month except Friday 23rd in the afternoon.

I have copied Jamie into this email as he is our main point of contact with the Scottish Government.

Yours for Scotland

Gordon

Gordon MacIntyre-Kemp
Founder and Chief Executive

The Campaigning Business Network

M: [Redacted S.38(1)(b)]
Twitter: @BizforScotland
Facebook: www.facebook.com/BusinessforScotland
Web: www.businessforscotland.com

Reply from the Scottish Government (27 February 2024)

Gordon MacIntyre-Kemp [Redacted S.38(1)(b)]@businessforscotland.co.uk
Our Reference: 202400398552
Your Reference: Business for Scotland / Scotianomics Meeting on Wellbeing Economy
27 February 2024

Dear Mr MacIntyre-Kemp,

Thank you for your letter of 9 February 2024 requesting a meeting with Màiri McAllan MSP, Cabinet Secretary for Wellbeing Economy, Net Zero and Energy. Ms McAllan would be delighted to meet with you, subject to parliamentary business. I would be grateful if you could please contact us at cabsecwenz@gov.scot to make the necessary arrangements.

Yours sincerely [Redacted S.38(1)(b)]
Private Secretary

Email from Business for Scotland to the Scottish Government (28 February 2024)

From: Gordon MacIntyre-Kemp <[Redacted S.38(1)(b)]@businessforscotland.co.uk>
Sent: Wednesday, February 28, 2024 2:46 PM
To: Deputy First Minister and Cabinet Secretary for Finance <dfmcsf@gov.scot>
Cc: [Redacted S.38(1)(b)]@parliament.scot
Subject: Meeting With The Deputy First Minister

I would like to request a meeting with Shona Robison MSP in her role as the Cabinet Secretary for Finance.

Specifically, I would like to talk about Business for Scotland's suggestions for creating an alternative GERS and The Wellbeing Pension.

When we shared a platform at an event last year we agreed to meet so the DFM knows who I am and understand the goals of my organisation.

Yours for Scotland

Gordon

Gordon MacIntyre-Kemp
Founder and Chief Executive

The Campaigning Business Network

M: [Redacted S.38(1)(b)]
Twitter: @BizforScotland
Facebook: www.facebook.com/BusinessforScotland
Web: www.businessforscotland.com

Reply from the Scottish Government (20 March 2024)

Gordon MacIntyre-Kemp [Redacted S.38(1)(b)]@businessforscotland.co.uk
Our Reference: 202400402120
20 March 2024

Dear Gordon,

Thank you for your invitation to Shona Robison, Deputy First Minister and Cabinet Secretary for Finance, to meet to discuss creating alternatives to the GERS publication and the Wellbeing Pension.

Ms Robison would be happy to accept your invitation. I would be grateful if you could contact the Deputy First Minister's Diary Secretary, at dfmcsf@gov.scot to make the necessary arrangements.

Yours sincerely [Redacted S.38(1)(b)] Private Secretary

Email from Business for Scotland to the Scottish Government (15 May 2024)

From: [Redacted S.38(1)(b)]@btinternet.com>
Sent: 15 May 2024 11:20
To: Forbes K (Kate), MSP <Kate.Forbes.msp@parliament.scot>
Cc: Business for Scotland <[Redacted S.38(1)(b)]@businessforScotland.co.uk>
Subject: Fwd: Edinburgh Saltire Lunch, 31st of May

Hi Kate, I hope you're settling into new role just fine, Gordon MacIntyre-Kemp has asked me to forward on the attachment and to invite you to the Salter lunch on Friday 31st of May In Edinburgh. At Business for Scotland would like to re establish contact with you on a more regular basis. Can you please either directly reply to Gordon or myself, thanks. I hope to see you very soon. Best wishes [Redacted S.38(1)(b)].
Sent from my iPhone

Begin forwarded message:

From: Believe in Scotland <info@believeinScotland.org>
Date: 10 May 2024 at 15:57:37 BST
To: [Redacted S.38(1)(b)]@btinternet.com>
Subject: **Edinburgh Saltire Lunch, 31st of May**

Book your place for May Saltire Lunch in Edinburgh
Edinburgh Saltire Lunch on Friday 31st of May

Hi [Redacted S.38(1)(b)]
The next Saltire Lunch will be in **Edinburgh on Friday the 31st of May at the Cannonball restaurant.**
Our first confirmed speaker for this event will be [Redacted S.38(1)(b)]

Event Details

Time: Please arrive at the venue at 12:15pm for a 12:30pm sit down.
Location: 356 Castlehill, Edinburgh EH1 2NF
Website: <https://www.contini.com/cannonball>
To book your place at this event please email [Redacted S.38(1)(b)]@businessforScotland.co.uk

Yours for Scotland,
Gordon

Email from the Scottish Government to Business for Scotland (May 2024)

MINISTERIAL PORTFOLIOS
Public Engagement Unit
PORTFOLIOS MINISTERIAL
Aonad Ceangal Poblach

Gordon MacIntyre-Kemp
[Redacted S.38(1)(b)]@btinternet.com
Our Reference: 202400414525

Dear Gordon MacIntyre-Kemp ,

Thank you for your correspondence sent on 15/05/2024. Your query will be passed to the relevant area for consideration and has been given a reference number of 202400414525. Please quote this number in all correspondence. The Scottish Government aim to respond, where necessary, as

quickly as possible and within the stated timescale as indicated on our website (<http://www.gov.scot/Contacts/>).

Yours sincerely
MiCase Correspondence system for SG and partner agencies

The Scottish Government takes your privacy seriously. You may have written to us because you have a question or want to make a complaint. Our privacy notice (<https://beta.gov.scot/publications/contacting-the-scottish-government-handling-your-data>), available on our website, sets out how we use your personal data, and your rights when communicating with us. It is made under Article 13 of the General Data Protection Regulation (GDPR).

Reply from the Scottish Government (3 June 2024)

Deputy First Minister and Cabinet Secretary for Economy and Gaelic
Leas Phrìomh Mhinistear agus Rùnaire a' Chaibineit airson Eaconamaidh agus Gàidhlig
Kate Forbes MSP/BPA
T : 0300 244 4000
E : scottish.ministers@gov.scot

Gordon MacIntyre-Kemp
[Redacted S.38(1)(b)]@btinternet.com
Our Reference: 202400414525
Your Reference: Edinburgh Saltire Lunch, 31st of May 3 June 2024

Dear Gordon,

Thank you for your invitation to the Saltire lunch on 31 May in Edinburgh. I regret to inform you that, due to the short notice and my commitments on Friday as a constituency day, I will be unable to attend. I appreciate your understanding and look forward to opportunities to participate in future events.

Yours sincerely,
KATE FORBES

Email from Business for Scotland to the Scottish Government (23 May 2024)

From: Gordon MacIntyre-Kemp <[Redacted S.38(1)(b)]@businessforscotland.co.uk>
Sent: Thursday, May 23, 2024 2:24 PM
To: First Minister <FirstMinister@gov.scot>
Cc: Ewan Crawford <[Redacted S.38(1)(b)]@gov.scot>
Subject: Request for meeting with First Minister

I would like to request a meeting with John Swinney MSP in his capacity as First Minister.

John has spoken at two past Business for Scotland events and will be aware that Business for Scotland is the only business network in Scotland that is fully aligned with the Scottish Government's policies on both the constitution and the transition to a wellbeing economy in order to deliver sustainable growth.

We would like to discuss the Scottish Government's plans to deliver independence and to better understand its economic approach. We are also keen to brief the First Minister on both Business for Scotland's and Believe in Scotland's campaigning plans for the next two years.

One of my fellow directors of Business for Scotland will accompany me to the meeting and we will be as flexible as possible on timing and location to help accommodate as swift a meeting as possible under the circumstances.

Yours for Scotland

Gordon

Gordon MacIntyre-Kemp
Founder and Chief Executive

The Campaigning Business Network

M: [Redacted S.38(1)(b)]
Twitter: @BizforScotland
Facebook: www.facebook.com/BusinessforScotland
Web: www.businessforscotland.com

Reply from the Scottish Government (3 July 2024)

Gordon MacIntyre-Kemp [Redacted S.38(1)(b)]@businessforscotland.co.uk
Our Reference: 202400416043

3 July 2024

Dear Gordon MacIntyre-Kemp,

Thank you for your email on 23 May inviting the First Minister, Mr John Swinney MSP, to attend a meeting with Business for Scotland. We apologise for the length of time it has taken us to respond. The First Minister would be delighted to accept your invitation subject to parliamentary and ministerial business. I would be grateful if you could please contact the First Minister's Diary Secretary to make the necessary arrangements at firstminister@gov.scot

Yours sincerely [Redacted S.38(1)(b)] Diary Manager

Email from Business for Scotland to the Scottish Government (23 May 2024)

From: Gordon MacIntyre-Kemp <[Redacted S.38(1)(b)]@businessforscotland.co.uk>

Sent: Thursday, May 23, 2024 1:58 PM

To: Deputy First Minister and Cabinet Secretary for Economy & Gaelic <DFMCSEG@gov.scot>

Subject: Request for meeting with Cabinet Secretary for Economy

I would like to request a meeting with Kate Forbes MSP in her Capacity as Cabinet Secretary Economy.

Kate has spoken at two past Business for Scotland events and will be aware that Business for Scotland is the only business network in Scotland that is fully aligned with the Scottish Government's policies on both the constitution and the transition to a wellbeing economy in order to deliver sustainable growth.

We are of course open to discussing anything of interest to the Cab Sec that she feels would benefit Scotland's economy and business community. I would however, like to suggest two issues for the agenda which are:

1. [Redacted S.33(1)(b)]
2. The Wellbeing Economic Approach - This is a key driver of support for independence and one of the main planks of Business for Scotland's and Believe in Scotland's independence campaigning. We are keen to understand the economic direction of the Scottish Government under its new leadership.

I will be accompanied by one of my fellow directors of Business for Scotland to the meeting and will be as flexible as possible on timing and location to help accommodate a swift meeting.

Yours for Scotland

Gordon

Gordon MacIntyre-Kemp
Founder and Chief Executive

The Campaigning Business Network

M: [Redacted S.38(1)(b)]

Twitter: @BizforScotland

Facebook: www.facebook.com/BusinessforScotland

Web: www.businessforscotland.com

Reply from the Scottish Government (10 June 2024)

Gordon MacIntyre-Kemp [Redacted S.38(1)(b)]@businessforscotland.co.uk

Our Reference: 202400415962

10 June 2024

Dear Gordon,

Thank you for your letter of 23 May 2024 requesting a meeting with Kate Forbes MSP, Deputy First Minister and Cabinet Secretary for Economy and Gaelic, to discuss opportunities for Business for Scotland to work with the Scottish Government towards our aim of building a Wellbeing Economy.

Ms Forbes would be delighted to meet you, subject to parliamentary business. I would be grateful if you could contact the Deputy First Minister's Diary Secretary, [Redacted S.38(1)(b)], via email at DFMCSEG@gov.scot to arrange a mutually convenient date.

Yours sincerely, [Redacted S.38(1)(b)] Private Secretary

Email from Business for Scotland to the Scottish Government (23 May 2024)

From: Gordon MacIntyre-Kemp <[Redacted S.38(1)(b)]@businessforscotland.co.uk>
Sent: Thursday, May 23, 2024 2:01 PM
To: Deputy First Minister and Cabinet Secretary for Economy & Gaelic <DFMCSEG@gov.scot>
Subject: Invitation for Kate Forbes to speak at the Saltire Club

I would like to extend an invitation to Kate Forbes MSP in her capacity as Cabinet Secretary Economy to address a meeting of the Business for Scotland Saltire Club.

The Cabinet Secretary has previously been a Saltire Club guest speaker on two previous occasions and we would like to welcome her in her new role.

Business for Scotland runs a series of private lunches across Scotland for leading pro-independence business people called Saltire Lunches. The Lunches are held on the last Friday of the month and we have available slots in July, August and September, we will choose a location that suits the Cab Sec.

Ideally, assuming Kate is willing to speak again, we would like to be able to announce the date at our next lunch in Edinburgh on the 31st of May.

More details on the Saltire Club can be found here:
<https://www.businessforscotland.com/saltireclub>

Yours for Scotland

Gordon

Gordon MacIntyre-Kemp
Founder and Chief Executive

The Campaigning Business Network

M: [Redacted S.38(1)(b)]
Twitter: @BizforScotland
Facebook: www.facebook.com/BusinessforScotland
Web: www.businessforscotland.com

Reply from the Scottish Government (17 June 2024)

Gordon MacIntyre-Kemp [Redacted S.38(1)(b)]@businessforscotland.co.uk
Our Reference: 202400415959

17 June 2024

Dear Gordon MacIntyre-Kemp,

Thank you for your letter of 23 May inviting Kate Forbes MSP, Deputy First Minister and Cabinet Secretary for Economy and Gaelic, to address an upcoming meeting of the Business for Scotland Saltire Club. Ms Forbes would be delighted to accept your invitation subject to Parliamentary business. I would be grateful if you could contact the Deputy First Minister's Diary Secretary, [Redacted S.38(1)(b)], via email at DFMCSEG@gov.scot to make the necessary arrangements.

Yours sincerely, [Redacted S.38(1)(b)] Private Secretary

Email from the Scottish Government to Business for Scotland (15 July 2024)

Gordon MacIntyre-Kemp [Redacted S.38(1)(b)]@businessforscotland.co.uk
Our Reference: 202400420245

15 July 2024

Dear Gordon,

Thank you for your request for a meeting with the Cabinet Secretary for Finance and Local Government, Shona Robison MSP, following on from your previous meeting on 18 April 2024.

Due to considerable diary pressures, Ms Robison is unable to accept your kind invitation. Please accept Ms Robison's apologies on this occasion. I understand however, you will be meeting with the Deputy First Minister and Cabinet Secretary for Economy and Gaelic, Kate Forbes MSP, who will be best placed to cover the matters you wish to discuss, and will pass on any comments relating to Ms Robison's portfolio.

Yours Sincerely, [Redacted S.38(1)(b)]
Deputy Private Secretary

Email from Business for Scotland to the Scottish Government (25 July 2024)

From: Gordon MacIntyre-Kemp <[Redacted S.38(1)(b)]@businessforscotland.co.uk>
Sent: Thursday, July 25, 2024 4:23 PM
To: Forbes K (Kate), MSP <Kate.Forbes.msp@parliament.scot>
Cc: [Redacted S.38(1)(b)]@gmail.com>
Subject: Independence GERS discussion follow up from our meeting

Once again thanks for your time in meeting with BfS last week.

One final follow up point is the response I received to my request for a meeting with the Cab Sec Finance. [Redacted S.30(c)]

I haven't heard anything but received a letter from the her Deputy Private Secretary saying that (for some reason) you would be best placed to cover the matters I wished to discuss. You kindly offered to look into the issue and I would very much appreciate an update. It's the view of the board of Business for Scotland and indeed the National Campaign Steering Group of Believe in Scotland that the Independence GERS project is absolutely essential to delivering independence.

Thank you once again for offering to assist.

Correspondence attached below.

Yours for Scotland

Gordon

Gordon MacIntyre-Kemp
Founder and Chief Executive

The Campaigning Business Network

M: [Redacted S.38(1)(b)]

Twitter: @BizforScotland

Facebook: www.facebook.com/BusinessforScotland

Web: www.businessforscotland.com