

Low Emission Zone Leadership Group Meeting 17 Minutes

29 February 2024 10:00 am – 11:00 am

Attendees: -

Cabinet Secretary for Transport	Fiona Hyslop MSP (FH)	Cabinet Secretary for Transport
	Craig Peaston (CP)	Private Secretary to Cabinet Secretary for Transport
	Scott Lees (SL)	Roads Directorate - Head of Environment
	Vincent McInally (VM)	Roads Directorate - Environment and Air Quality Manager
	Euan Gavigan (EG)	Roads Directorate - Air Quality and Environment Policy Lead
	Shivani Kirpal (SK)	Graduate Development Programme
Aberdeen City Council	Councillor Alexander McLellan (AMc)	
	David Dunne (DD)	
	Will Hekelaar (WH)	
Dundee City Council	Councillor Heather Anderson (HA)	
	Councillor Steven Rome (SR)	
	Ewan Macnaughton (EM)	
City of Edinburgh Council	Councillor Scott Arthur (SA)	
	Ruth White (RW)	
	George King (GK)	
Glasgow City Council	Councillor Angus Millar (AM)	
	Gavin Slater (GS)	
Public Health Scotland	Dr Jessica Baker (JB)	

Apologies

Councillor Ian Yuill unavailable – Councillor Alexander McLellan representing.

Agenda

1. Welcome and review of previous meeting actions (Chair)
 2. LEZ National progress and risk update (lead official: Scott Lees)
 3. City specific progress (each authority to give update)
 4. LEZ funding update (lead official: Vincent McInally)
 5. Summary and way forward (Chair)
 6. AOB/Date of next meeting
-

1. Welcome and review of previous meeting actions (Chair: Fiona Hyslop)

The Cabinet Secretary welcomed all and offered thanks to previous Cabinet Secretary, Màiri McAllan, for her efforts. The Cabinet Secretary explained she would now take lead on Low Emission Zones (LEZs).

Previous Meeting Actions		
Reference	Description	Status
M16_A1	<ul style="list-style-type: none">• GCC to give figures on the number of repeat offenders and successful PCN appeals.	Closed
M16_A2	<ul style="list-style-type: none">• Under 'Just Transition,' TS to provide feedback from lower-income households over the level of support offered in Glasgow	Ongoing
M16_A3	<ul style="list-style-type: none">• TS to determine if older commercial buses should be exempt, as they undermine the purpose of LEZs.	Closed
M16_A4	<ul style="list-style-type: none">• TS to determine if there is going to be a Blue Badge exemption for carers.	Closed
M16_A5	<ul style="list-style-type: none">• TS to give an indication of the amount of future funding to be given to LAs for LEZs	Closed

Updates: -

M16_A1 – Glasgow City Council (GCC) have provided the relevant data which is currently being analysed.

M16_A2 – High satisfaction rate is seen across the feedback received from those who responded. TS will provide a note covering feedback from lower-income households over the level of support offered in Glasgow in due course.

M16_A3 – Historic Buses which do not meet standards and undermine the purpose of LEZ have negative impact on optics. A number of cases are being reviewed and will be discussed further. GCC have made the decision to only allow exemption to buses in transit to education events, not for buses acting solely in a commercial capacity.

M16_A4 – A specific exemption for carers is not seen as a significant issue given the low number of related enquiries. Since 1 June 2023 only one email received by Transport Scotland's LEZ Enquiries Inbox made reference to a specific exemption for a "carer", the sender of which uses a vehicle already recognised as exempt through their vehicle's registered tax class. These levels of enquiries suggest there is not a significant requirement for further exemption specific to carers.

M16_A5 – Indicative costs provided by LAs is expected to be covered by future funding. All grant requests for 2024/2025 have been received and are currently under review.

2. LEZ National progress and risk update (lead official: Scott Lees)

The LEZ Consistency Group met yesterday and displayed an impressive level of knowledge transfer amongst the four local authorities (LAs) with lessons learned shared by Glasgow. Progress looks positive from three LAs to go live this year.

Through LEZ schemes:

- 3,300 non-compliant vehicles disposed of through Support Fund;
- 400 non-compliant taxis retrofitted; and
- Over 1,100 buses retrofitted through BEAR.

Transport Scotland's online LEZ Vehicle Checker has passed 1 million queries from members of the public. Stress testing is to be conducted on system prior to other LA enforcement dates.

Over 15,000 Blue Badges have been registered with the exemption system since its launch in April 2023. It is expect these numbers will rise in the lead up to the other LEZ enforcement dates.

As of October 2023, GCC have 787 licensed euro 6/retrofitted taxis. A further 93 taxis in the Glasgow region have been issued with a grant offer to retrofit and meet Euro 6 compliance standards. The £2M LEZ Retrofit Fund is fully allocated for 2023-24.

The Judicial Review (JR) appeal against LEZ regulations regarding PCN surcharge has been dropped.

Current risks to LEZ delivery include: further JRs, for which strong arguments for justification are prepared; taxi readiness, which Ts are working with GCC to mitigate; and LA enforcement system readiness, for which TS are supporting LAs who are on track to launch on expected dates.

3. City Specific Progress

Glasgow: - Councillor Angus Millar

GCC has received media interest regarding all aspects of LEZ scheme. GCC aim to highlight the public health messages and believe it is important to raise this narrative in public domain.

The number of LEZ PCNs issued per month by GCC is still higher than expected but is now displaying a downward trend.

Air quality monitoring data is showing improvements are being made. It is expected the full effect of LEZ will be visible in the data once time limited exemptions have expired.

Currently 470 taxis are non-compliant. 120 of these will receive an extension to their current exemption due to awaiting retrofit. The remaining 350 could receive an

extension upon providing proof that they are awaiting a compliant vehicle which is on order.

PCNs are currently being sent via recorded delivery instead of normal post due to LEZ regulations being silent on subject. These alternative arrangements are not legally tested and currently cost £25k/month. GCC are looking to engage with TS to amend regulations and bring these into line with parking charges regulations.

The excess revenue from LEZs PCNs must be spent aiding the objectives of scheme. These spendings should be intuitive for public to see funds coming in and how they benefit from these.

Edinburgh: - Councillor Scott Arthur

CEC will not be providing any exemptions for taxis. It is expect that all affected taxis will be compliant before e.

The council are looking to reduce through traffic in city centre . These plans will line up with LEZ boundary and each should help achieve aims of both.

Dundee: - Councillor Stephen Rome

Preparation for the LEZ enforcement launch is on schedule. Gateway signage and ANPR cameras are now in place with testing and staff training ongoing.

At time of the meeting no vandalism to LEZ infrastructure has been reported.

Currently estimated non-compliance rate of vehicles is 12%. DCC have granted three local exemptions.

The council are taking focus on ensuring public awareness of scheme.

There have been reports of economic damage caused by the LEZ but no official challenge relating to this has been launched.

The Cabinet Secretary recommends that messaging should focus on the health benefits relating to LEZs. University of Dundee Professor Jill Belch recently reported on this and is positive promotion of this.

Aberdeen: - Councillor Alexander McLellan

Signage, ANPR cameras and road markings are currently being installed. This has raised number of queries and exemption requests to the council.

Messaging to public will boost focus on public health benefits.

Enforcement team currently have no significant red flags to report.

ACC are aware that Glasgow is seeing reports claiming LEZ has damaged hospitality industry. Data shows that evening and weekend footfall has risen to above pre-pandemic levels and that most people traveling into the city centre do not use private vehicles and those who do own compliant vehicles. It is recommended that all cities monitor and use footfall data to combat stories of "LEZ Ghost Town" narrative.

4. LEZ Communications Update (Vincent McInally)

TS will be running national communications for the next year with plans to cease after that time.

It is recommended that all LAs have individual communication plans to run alongside this and target local businesses for awareness. TS request that costing for this be provided by each LA to TS.

National communications will cover a mix of traditional marketing (TV, radio, billboards) and social media.

Data shows 86% of people have taken action after seeing campaign. This covers both traditional and social media marketing.

Current messaging focuses on dates, locations and taking action, such as using the vehicle checker. This messaging will run up to and including the first month of enforcement. Blogs and news articles will continue to be posted on LEZ website following this.

The Cabinet Secretary notes that marketing is very strong and focus should also be given to reactive lines.

AMc – When bus gates were installed in Aberdeen negative feedback was received from Chamber of Commerce and businesses stating people will avoid Aberdeen and go to other cities because of this. The same is now happening for LEZs. Aiming to highlight benefits and that not just Aberdeen is being affected by this. Footfall figures before and after will be helpful. Taking into consideration cost of living, a small dip is to be expected. Focus to ensure all public are aware of the reasons for implementation.

VM – National communications will highlight that LEZs are implemented in all four cities.

5. Summary and Way Forward (Chair – Fiona Hyslop)

The Cabinet Secretary notes that issues relating to PCN delivery will be followed up and considerations made to potentially conducting cost benefit analysis.

The Leadership Group will reconvene prior to enforcement of the remaining LEZs starting. 22 May 2024 set as suggested meeting date to address any outstanding issues prior to enforcement.

Following enforcement of all LEZs, a “Lessons Learned” meeting will be held. September 2024 is suggested with the exact date to be confirmed.

The Cabinet Secretary thanks all for attending and reminds all LAs to focus on benefits to public health and promoting this message.

6. Summary of Actions from Meeting

Outstanding Meeting Actions		
Reference	Description	Status
M16_A2	Under 'Just Transition,' TS to provide note to Cabinet Secretary on feedback from lower-income households over the level of support offered in Glasgow.	Ongoing.
M17_A1	Cabinet Secretary to contact Cllr Angus Millar regarding issuing of PCNs.	Ongoing.
M17_A2	LAs to maintain reports on footfall within respective city centres to report on LEZs affect.	Ongoing.
M17_A3	Costing for LA communication campaigns to be provided to TS.	Ongoing.
M17_A4	TS to provide update on JR with all LAs once available.	Closed.
M17_A5	TS to confirm grant funding with all LAs.	Ongoing.
M17_A6	Each LA to provide narrative of position on taxis with Cabinet Secretary.	Ongoing.
M17_A7	LEZ Vehicle Checker to be promoted in future communication works.	Ongoing.

LEZ Leadership Meeting 15 Minutes (draft) – 21st September 2022

Attendees

Minister For Transport - Ms Jenny Gilruth (JG)
Deputy private secretary - Thomas Meikle (TM)
Transport Scotland - Director of Roads-Stewart Leggett (SL)
Transport Scotland - Head of environment & Sustainability-Trevor McIlhatton (TMc)
Transport Scotland - Air Quality Branch – LEZ - Vincent McNally (VM)
Transport Scotland - Air Quality project staff & Comms
City of Edinburgh Council - Councillor Scott Arthur (SA) & Ruth White (RW) & George King (GK)
Dundee City Council - Councillor Mark Flynn (MF), Councillor Lynne Short (LS) & Euan McNaughton (EM)
Glasgow City Council - Councillor Angus Millar (AM) & Gavin Slater (GS)
Public Health Scotland Dr Jessica Baker (JB)
SEPA – Janice Milne (JM)

Apologies:

Minister for Environment & Land Reform - Ms Mairi McAllan

Agenda

1. Welcome and review of previous meeting actions (Chair)
2. LEZ National progress and risk update (lead official: Trevor McIlhatton)
3. City specific progress (each authority to give update)
4. LEZ funding update (lead official: Vincent McNally)
5. LEZ communications (lead official: Vincent McNally)
6. Frequency of LEZ meetings (lead official: Vincent McNally)
7. Summary and way forward (Chair)
8. AOB/Date of next meeting

1. Welcome and review of previous meeting actions (Chair).

- JG congratulated everyone involved in the introduction of Low Emission Zones (LEZs) in each of the four cities.
- Review of outstanding actions from the previous meeting - All actions from meeting 14 (9 March 2022) noted as completed.
- JG outlined the structure of the meeting, with focus on the current key issues surrounding LEZs, such as communications, funding and potential risks for the next 12 months.
- JG stated that discussions should be framed in light of the current cost of living crisis and the impact of LEZs (noting Glasgow LEZ, the first to be enforced).

Ongoing actions:

- M13_A2 TS to update the Leadership Group on progress and arrange a presentation of the Blue Badge exemption website and how it will work. – **Ongoing action:** Web portal procurement process now completed (Sept 2022). Briefing and presentation to be given later in the year.
- M13_A10 TS to revisit the communications strategy and formalise the national communications plan. TS to lead and to consult on timing at a local level with LA partners and support LAs to deliver in a joined-up, consistent way. Reaffirmed importance of championing health benefits locally and nationally. – **Ongoing action:** LA partners to identify links with local campaigns until enforcement. To champion the importance of LEZ health benefits, work to create guest blogs from health/charity organisations (such as Alzheimer Scotland and Living Streets) is being compiled by our communications consultant (Big Partnership).
- M13_A11 Scottish Government will work with partners to find a reasonable future funding solution that works. – **Ongoing action:** Discussions with LAs to ascertain the level of funding they are seeking have been taking place, this was discussed again at the LEZ Enforcement Group on 31/08/22. However, more detailed substantiation is required from LAs before any recommendation can be made to the Minister on what an appropriate future funding profile may look like.

- Blue Badge exemption system - this is on course for launch early in the new year. A presentation to test amongst stakeholders from disability groups will happen soon to determine any issues before live launch in January 2023.

2. LEZ National progress and risk update (lead official: Trevor McIlhatton)

- TMc:-Lots of activity since the last meeting in march;- submissions, scheme approvals. Resulting in the official launch on the 31st May 2022.
- LEZ Support Fund - designed to aid lower income households and micro businesses.
- LEZ Retrofit fund – grant cap increased for taxis.
- BEAR 5 funding – This year’s scheme launched in June, with £5 million initially made available to bus and coach operators. Bids totalling £2.6 million were received, which are currently under review by TS.
(**Post meeting note** – Successful applicants have now been notified and awards totalling £2.6 million have been issued. A further round of the scheme is currently under consideration, subject to prioritisation of current budgetary pressures.)

- The tender process for procurement of a Blue Badge exemption registration system has been completed, and a successful bidder identified - contract award is in progress.
- Enforcement data access through DVLA - Vehicle checker will be live early in the new year.
- SA queried the taxi retrofitting scheme and access to LPG. He advised that taxis in Edinburgh were finding it difficult to source LPG. JG acknowledged that she was aware of the issue. TS colleagues advised there are currently no issues in terms of availability. It was acknowledged that supply was at the discretion of private operators of LPG forecourts and that CEC was in the process of engagement with potential providers seeking new sites for fuelling stations.
- TMc outlined some of the potential risks to LEZs – The taxi industry (specifically Glasgow based) have voiced their concerns on the upcoming LEZ enforcement dates. TMc explained that meetings have taken place between the MfT and Unite the Union, to address the industry's concerns. As a result the scheme cap for taxi operators within the support fund has been increased. It was noted that GCC was also heavily engaged with the taxi industry to provide reassurance, and promote the uptake in grants before the end of October 2022. In addition, GCC is considering time limited exemptions for taxis unable to retrofit in time for enforcement. AM reiterated and acknowledged these concerns had been compounded further by the cost of living crisis.
- TMc explained that there was also a risk regarding access to DVLA/JAQU data with UKG having yet to confirm access. The delay in official clearance has been the result of a recent change in UKG Ministers and the recent national mourning period. JG offered to write to UKG to stress the urgency in the matter. **ACTION:- TS to provide submission to JG outlining the S104 agreement and letter recommendation. (Post meeting note – access to the DVLA/JAQU data has now been granted subject to S104 UK Parliamentary approval in January 2023)**

3. City specific progress

Edinburgh:- Scott Arthur (Councillor)

Points discussed

- Current status – Now in the grace period. LEZ was launched by the MfT in Edinburgh in May 2022.
- Working on raising awareness to encourage switch to compliant vehicles and cleaner modes.
- Local buses are already fully compliant.
- It is estimated that LEZs will require around £400,000 per year in resource funding. Working with Transport Scotland to identify accurate forecast evidence.
- ANPR back office currently in planning.

- Congratulating Ruth White, George King and the rest of the LEZ team for their nomination in the CiTTi awards.
- Working closely with active travel colleagues. JG welcomed this and highlighted the opportunity to link LEZs across different policy areas.

Dundee:- Mark Flynn (Councillor)

Points discussed

- Current position: Now in the grace period. Dundee's LEZ was launched in May 2024.
- The purchase of ANPR cameras and back office systems will be completed in this financial year.
- LEZ signage - on course for July 2023.
- Issues with revenue cost - application is with TS.
- Taxis - keeping a close eye on the uptake of grants and any issues raised by the industry. Dundee's taxi industry already has a high number of EVs.
- Small Businesses - MF is looking for advice from TS (VMc) on the uptake of support funding in each local authority area **ACTION - TS to provide LAs with figures on LEZ support funding uptake.**
- Bus compliance- uptake on funding going very well.
- Links with active travel policy.
- Cost of Living crisis - impact of this is very concerning – Dundee City Council are monitoring the unfolding situation.

Glasgow:- Angus Miller (Councillor)

Points discussed

- Current status - preparing for enforcement date: June 2023.
- GCC working group and TS Air quality team are engaging closely.
- Camera and back office solutions - currently progressing well.
- Signage - completed end of year.
- Comms - crucial to success of launch. Currently planning various media campaigns, also focusing on the residents within the LEZ.
- Taxi Industry - as stated previously, is the biggest challenge. GCC continue to try alleviate pressures as much as possible.
- Parallel policy development - adopting a wider campaign combining with active travel - planning to launch in 2024/25 post LEZ enforcement date, to be used as a catalyst to promote cleaner transport.
- LS (DCC councillor) - extended the importance of engaging with local residents and particular highlighting showing dignity and inclusion to blue badge holders

4. Funding (lead official – Vincent McNally)

- Substantial funding has been giving to all four cities.

- BEAR funding – a further £5 million was made available for this financial year. £2.6 million was bid for, and a further round may be run later in the year, subject to competing pressures.
- LEZ support fund-designed to benefit small business and low income households to alleviate cost of non-compliance vehicles.
- LEZ support fund is in its 3rd year. £5 million has been made available this financial year.
- Currently the fund has disposed of 2000 of non-compliant vehicles through this scheme.
- Support funding split explained due to border size, population and launch dates.
- Enforcement systems – Contractors have largely been chosen – Therefore looking for clearer picture of future funding requirements from each LEZ city
ACTION: LAs - crystallised LA LEZ costs to be provided to TS.
- MF expressed concern about funding discrepancies between cities. He explained that he was aware that Glasgow funding uptake will be higher. However, there were concerns regarding funding out with the central belt. He acknowledged future budget constraints in the current economic climate. AM expressed the importance of encouraging awareness in order to promote the uptake of the retrofit grant.

5. LEZ communications (lead official: Vincent McInally)

- Minister expressed the LEZ process is at a critical point - Awareness is vital.
- VM - TS and LAs continue to promote awareness and further communications activities will be ramped up in preparation of Glasgow enforcement date.
- LEZ Communications meetings are taking place monthly.
- LEZ market research continues to demonstrate the effectiveness of awareness raising campaign.
- LEZ comms;- awareness has seen a definite increase in the last 3 years
ACTION- TS - figures from the recent LEZ survey to be published on the LEZ website.
- A further communications push is need from all LA's. TS has provided funding to cover local LEZ campaigns.
- Various blogs on national website;-vital for awareness
- Ramping up of campaigns in the new year - Billboards and TV
- VM - Confirmed to JG that Matt Miller (TS Comms for LEZ) is leaving. JG expressed her sadness and advised that someone of similar calibre in Comms will be required.
LS (DCC):- last mile logistics question, are Hermes and Amazon (large operators) on board? VM confirmed that these major freight and logistics operators had been engaged throughout the LEZ process. VM explained that these larger company vehicles were largely expected to be compliant however smaller independent business vehicles had lower levels of LEZ compliance and there was still much to be done.
- JG added that small traders would need to be recognised as a target audience in forthcoming campaigns.

6. Frequency of LEZ meetings (lead official TS:- Vincent McInally)

- Proposal to reduce the frequency of meetings as follows:
- LEZ Leadership - every 6 months
- LEZ Four Cities Consistency Group - quarterly
- LEZ Communications Group - monthly
- LEZ enforcement Group - monthly
- All agreed to the proposed meeting frequency changes

7. Summary of main discussion points/further queries

- LS (DCC) - queried social security changes affecting mobility part. She asked if these vehicles would be LEZ compliant? VM explained that these vehicles would generally be new and compliant with LEZs. VM added that Blue Badge holders would also qualify for an exemption.
- RW (CEC) explained that changes to the road traffic regulation orders had come into effect, resulting in a tight timescale; was there any scope to reduce the required timescales as associated with LEZs – VM advised this had been looked into previously and was not possible, LEZs and TROs are separate procedures.
- JG once again congratulated members on a job well done, at both national and local level
- Future funding revenue – JG stated that there would be challenges ahead due to COL crisis.
- Budget clarity – VM reiterated that more evidence was needed in planning for future funding.
- Comms:- JG explained that it was vital that all members continue to engage, work together to spread awareness.
- LS (DCC) - suggested that advertising at football matches could be used for targeted awareness, as a vast amount of tradespeople would be in the audience.
- The meeting finished with Councillor Short from Dundee City Council thanking TS for their input and assistance in delivering a successful introduction of LEZs

8. Date of Next Meeting

- To be arranged.

-----End Of Meeting Note-----

Low Emission Zone (LEZ) Leadership Group Meeting 16th Minutes – 25th October 2023

Attendees:

Cabinet Secretary for Transport, Net Zero & Just Transition – Ms Mairi McAllan (MM)
Minister for Transport - Ms Fiona Hyslop (FH)
Deputy Private Secretary for the Cabinet Secretary for Net Zero and Just Transition – Ellie Fairgrieve (EF)
Deputy Private Secretary for the Minister for Transport - Eleanor Munro (EM)
Transport Scotland - Director of Roads - Hugh Gillies (HG)
Transport Scotland - Head of Environment - Scott Lees (SL)
Transport Scotland - Air Quality Branch - Vincent McNally (VM), Katrina Farquharson (KF) & Shivani Kirpal (SK)
City of Edinburgh Council - Councillor Scott Arthur (SA) & Ruth White (RW) & George King (GK)
Dundee City Council - Councillor Steve Rome (SR), Councillor Heather Anderson (HA), Ewan Gourlay (EG) & Ewan Macnaughton (EM)
Glasgow City Council - Councillor Angus Millar (AM) & Gavin Slater (GS)
Aberdeen City Council - Councillor Ian Yuill (IY), David Dunne (DD)

Apologies:

Public Health Scotland - Carole McRae (CM)
SEPA – David Pirie (DP) & Carolyn Vannan (CV)

Agenda

1. Welcome and review of previous meeting actions (Chair)
2. LEZ National progress and risk update (lead official: Scott Lees)
3. City specific progress (each authority to give update)
4. LEZ funding update (lead official: Vincent McNally)
5. Summary and way forward (Chair)
6. AOB/Date of next meeting

1. Welcome and review of previous meeting actions (Chair)

- MM welcomed everyone and noted the delays since the last leadership meeting but confirmed that the meeting will reconvene on a bi-annual basis.
- MM recognised the challenges of LEZs, and while the four-city project is ambitious in its pursuit against climate mitigation and the protection of public health, MM has faith in the schemes.
- Review of outstanding actions from the previous meeting – three out of four actions from meeting 15 (21 September 2022) noted as completed.

Ongoing actions:

M13_A2	TS to update the Leadership Group on progress and arrange a presentation of the Blue Badge exemption website and how it will work – Ongoing action: As of April 2023, the website is operational, and stakeholders have praised it for its ease of use. A presentation of how it works will be circulated by VM along with an offer to meet any group members to discuss the scheme if required – once issued the action will close.
M13_A11	Scottish Government will work with partners to find a reasonable future funding solution that works. – Ongoing action: VM noted that there will be more detailed substantiation before bringing to Ministers. The funding will be impacted by PCNs, and there is uncertainty over running costs.
M15_A3	LAs to provide TS LEZ costs. – Ongoing action: similarly, to action M13_A11, this is currently unknown. For the 1 st year of enforcement, TS has fully funded GCC's temporary LEZ staff. Funding for GCC will likely be a benchmark for the other LAs.

2. LEZ National progress and risk update (lead official: Scott Lees)

- Glasgow's LEZ enforcement has gone live (1 June 2023) since the last meeting.
- The number of PCNs issued are higher than expected, in June nearly 3,000 PCNs were issued, and nearly 6,000 in July. Awaiting further updates for the months of August and September. In addition to the number of PCNs being higher than expected, the number is not yet going down as expected. However, we understand that there are a lower number of repeat offenders, but require continued messaging to get the message across to members of the public.
- Support for readiness - TS continues to offer a considerable amount of funding to support LEZ readiness; over 3,000 non-compliant vehicles disposed of through the LEZ Support Fund which helps low-income households and local businesses. The LEZ Retrofit Fund has helped over 340 taxis to be retrofitted – there is still high demand for this, but the latest round has closed due to high uptake. In addition, the Bus Emission Abatement Retrofit (BEAR) programme has supported the retrofitting of over 1,100 mid-

life buses and coaches – there have been a good number of bids this year and SL hopes awards will be made soon. [post meeting note grants totalling £3.0m now offered to 18 operators to retrofit 68 buses/coaches].

- All 4 cities have received grant to fully fund the installation of LEZ enforcement systems prior to enforcement.
- The Vehicle checker website went live in April 2023, allowing drivers to enter their registration details and receive confirmation of vehicle compliance with the LEZ standards– some DVLA emission records require updating, however any issues identified can be resolved between TS and DVLA.
- The Blue Badge exemption website went live in April 2023, and the associated call centre was live from May 2023. The phone service has been welcomed by stakeholders and is working well. This service means that Blue Badge holders can register their exemption and avoid receiving a PCN even if their vehicle is non-compliant, providing they register in advance, or on the day. To date, there have been over 8,000 Blue Badge exemptions registered.
- Taxi readiness- while taxis were given an additional year's exemption (until 1 June 2024), 500 taxis in Glasgow's fleet are still non-compliant. As the date gets closer, there may be pushback from the taxi companies, unions, and potentially press issues regarding this. TS have the funding available and continue to work with supply chains to ensure there the capability to retrofit the majority of non-compliant taxis before the deadline.
- Judicial Review - the Judicial Review was brought forward by a garage business owner, John Paton & Sons Ltd, in Glasgow's Townhead area. A permission hearing was held on 27 July 2023 before Lady Poole, and the substantive hearings were held on 17 and 18 October 2023.
- At the permission hearing senior counsel for the petitioner intimated to the court that the focus of the challenge has changed to the penalty charge scheme (as opposed to the LEZ Scheme itself). The penalty charge scheme is a matter in which the respondent local authority has no discretion, therefore, SGLD expected any such challenge to be directed towards the legislation and / or the Scottish Ministers' decision making.
- The petition also challenged the penalty charge scheme which is provided for in the Low Emission Zones (Emission Standards, Exemptions and Enforcement) (Scotland) Regulations 2021 made by the Scottish Ministers. The petitioner seeks declarator that "Regulation 4 and Schedule 1 of the "2021 Regulations" are unlawful". This challenge to the 2021 Regulations raises a devolution issue.
- Risks to LEZ delivery: firstly, the Judicial Review - if an unfavourable outcome, there will be actions to take forward and alternatives to consider. The second risk is taxi readiness – the 1 June 2024 deadline is getting closer, and there remains a large number of non-compliant taxi vehicles, particularly in Glasgow. TS are actively working with stakeholders to monitor the situation and garner feedback.

- MM thanked SL for the update and acknowledged that to mitigate risks, TS need to continue to work together with the local authorities.
- MM mentioned that we await the decision of the Judicial Review and that we need to determine the likelihood of further Judicial Reviews.
- MM touched on the risk of taxi readiness, and that as part of just transition, there needs to be continued support by TS to taxi companies.

3. City specific progress

Edinburgh:- Scott Arthur (Councillor)

Points discussed:

- CEC can learn from GCC and noted that the Judicial Review is welcomed as it helps to ensure LEZ integrity.
- **ACTION:-GCC to give figures on the number of repeat offenders and successful PCN appeals.**
- **ACTION:- Under 'Just Transition,' GCC to provide feedback from lower-income households over the level of support offered in Glasgow.**
- **ACTION:- TS to determine if older commercial buses should be exempt, as they undermine the purpose of LEZs.**
- MM thanked SA for his remarks- SL will take this away and get back to CEC about these issues.
- Regarding LEZ implementation- CEC will have signage in place by the end of the year. Some existing bus lane/gate cameras have suffered vandalism and CEC are working with Police Scotland about how to avoid this in the future.
- Questions over costs- SA wondered if capital funding can be moved to resource funding to support staffing costs associated with raising awareness of the scheme by using the LEZ technology to potentially issue warning letters before enforcement begins. VM stated this is not possible. SA questioned ongoing costs and the funding for this in the future – CEC will need around £1million until 2026.
- There are campaigns against LEZs, but CEC will work with NHS Lothian to communicate the health benefits of LEZs with the public.
- Overall, residents in Edinburgh are less reactive, and want to know how LEZs will affect them. SA hopes closer to the go live date, more people will understand the purpose of LEZs. It is hoped that a favourable outcome in the Judicial Review will help this.

Dundee:- Steve Rome (Councillor)

Points discussed:

- Dundee is on track to go live on 31 May 2024, and that the infrastructure should be in place before then.
- With regards to exemptions, there have been 20 applications and a handful granted an exemption.
- Dundee is awaiting funding revenue from TS.
- SR stated most taxis in Dundee are already LEZ compliant – EM states that a small proportion of taxis are not compliant- 17% of 650 taxis not compliant. Dundee will continue to support taxi companies.
- Dundee welcomes lessons learned from GCC.
- DCC are also interested to hear from GCC about PCN appeal figures.
- Small number of LEZ opposers, but these are active on social media (“No to LEZ” campaign) asks that there could be a national campaign to help spread the LEZ message/benefits. MM agrees and states that the Leadership Group is good forum to discuss this and we can help keep the narrative on track. However, amid the Judicial Review, there is a limit on what can be said, but after, can continue a national campaign to spread a clear message about positive messaging and the proportionality of the LEZ.

Glasgow:- Angus Millar (Councillor)

Points discussed:

- Judicial Review is a challenge - GCC has taken a lot of heat for LEZ and having to justify the air quality benefits.
- Glasgow’s LEZ went live on 1 June 2023 - there were operational difficulties, such as camera enforcement, but GCC happy to share lessons learned with other local authorities.
- GCC had extensive comms plans with TS/Scottish Government, but AM stated that despite this, some people didn’t take notice until the month leading up to go live – this meant some members of the public were not ready come 1 June.
- Blue Badge exemption- GCC had difficulties handling the Blue Badge data from TS, but this has since been sorted. **ACTION:- TS to determine if there is going to be a Blue Badge exemption for carers.**
- Taxi exemption- GCC remain closely engaged with the taxi industry and have given taxis an extra year to get LEZ compliant provided that they access the funding available. However, GCC suspect that the taxi industry may ask for an

additional year's exemption – this would be a challenge to extend and would have financial implications. GCC continue to engage with taxi companies and the number of compliant taxi vehicles continues to grow.

- The number of PCNs that have been issued have been higher than anticipated, however, the majority are not repeat offenders. As such, the effect of the surcharge cannot be seen yet and may take a few months.
- Judicial Review- while a legal challenge is a difficulty, the main issue is regarding misinformation. As it is an ongoing legal battle, GCC have been advised to not engage with the misinformation outside of the court. GCC hopes for a favourable outcome, and they can then mitigate the misinformation that has been spreading e.g., explain the true benefits of the LEZs.
- MM stated that GCC going live first can mean other local authorities can benefit from lessons learned - AM happy to share learning with the other councils.
- Cllr Heather Anderson questioned GCC's rate of payment for PCNs – GCC does not have this yet, still awaiting confirmed PCN figures for August and September, but stated that a small number of repeat offenders have not paid their PCNs.

Aberdeen:- Ian Yuill (Councillor)

Points discussed:

- Enforcement cameras, signage etc should be in place by the end of this year/beginning of 2024 – Aberdeen on track to go live 1 June 2024.
- Aberdeen requires continued financial support from TS.
- Lessons learned from GCC would be welcomed.
- ACC to install signage just outside Aberdeen's LEZs to give the public advance warnings of the areas affected and alternative routes.
- Risk - as bus gates have recently been introduced in Aberdeen, there is a risk that the public may confuse the LEZ with bus lanes- communication to increase by the end of the year.
- Exemptions – an additional year's exemption for taxis, as Covid-19 impacted the taxi industry and taxi companies have financial struggles.
- The benefits of LEZs in Aberdeen already visible – First Bus and Stagecoach have already invested in their fleet to be LEZ compliant.
- MM thanked IY and stated that GCC have allowed lessons to be learned about the preparation needed for LEZ delivery.

4. Funding (lead official – Vincent McInally)

- VM stated that the Scottish government has given £6.5 million to local authorities for LEZ implementation.
- Further LEZ grant funding was awarded to Aberdeen City Council, City of Edinburgh Council and Glasgow City Council for 2023/24.
- Staffing – VM said there was no grant funding given to GCC before they went live in June for LEZ staffing costs, only after the go live date. This will be the same for the other local authorities.
- To SA's funding query – capital funding cannot be used for resource funding. **ACTION:-TS to give an indication of the amount of future funding to be given to LAs for LEZs.**
- VM noted future uncertainty over the revenue generated from PCNs – need to benchmark this against the funding.
- VM emphasised that the LEZs are different to the Clean Air Zones (CAZs) and Ultra Low Emission Zones (ULEZ) in England where people pay a fee to enter – Scottish LEZs prohibit polluting vehicles and a PCN is issued when this is breached. For this reason, penalty charge income is expected to fall after initial enforcement period.
- The BEAR fund, the Support Fund, and the Retrofit fund have made good progress and offered financial support to help prepare for LEZs.

5. Summary and way forward (Chair)

- MM thanked everyone for their time, and congratulated GCC on their LEZ, and mentioned that the Blue Badge and vehicle checker websites have been a success.
- MM recognised that the next few months will be intense- the other cities will be going live shortly, GCC are in the middle of a Judicial Review, and the taxi exemption deadline is approaching.

6. Summary of actions from meeting

M16_A1	<ul style="list-style-type: none">• GCC to give figures on the number of repeat offenders and successful PCN appeals.
M16_A2	<ul style="list-style-type: none">• Under 'Just Transition,' TS to provide feedback from lower-income households over the level of support offered in Glasgow

M16_A3	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • TS to determine if older commercial buses should be exempt, as they undermine the purpose of LEZs.
M16_A4	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • TS to determine if there is going to be a Blue Badge exemption for carers.
M16_A5	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • TS to give an indication of the amount of future funding to be given to LAs for LEZs

7. Date of Next Meeting

- To be arranged, likely to be January or February 2024.

-----End Of Meeting Note-----

**LEZ Leadership Group Meeting
Wednesday 13 December 2017
Scottish Parliament**

Attendees

Roseanna Cunningham	David Gellatly
Humza Yousaf	Mark Flynn
David Miller	Alan Ross
Hugh Gillies	Eric Owens
Janice Milne	Lesley McInnes
Stephen Thomson	Michael Thain
Colin Ramsay	Anna Richardson
Ross Grant	George Gillespie

Subject	Discussion and actions
Agree Terms of Reference	The Terms of Reference were reviewed, and alterations suggested by the Group
	Action: Change the purpose statement to: 'The purpose of the Leadership Group will be to support the implementation of low emission zones, ensuring that they are evidence based, robust, delivery air quality improvements and consequential wider benefits and that stakeholders and the public are both engaged and involved.'
	Action: 'Standing Members' section of Terms of Reference to be updated as follows: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ Change Cllr Yvonne Allan to Cllr. Ross Grant. Cllr Grant is the Spokesman for Transport ○ Change Cllr Mark Flynn role to 'Deputy Convenor of City Development' ○ Change George Gillespie role to 'Executive Director (Acting) Land and Environmental Services ○ Change Dr Colin Ramsey to Dr Colin Ramsay
	Action: Key Deliverables section of the Terms of Reference to be updated as follows: Bullet point #5 to be amended to read: 'Ensure that a positive legacy is created from the delivery of the first four LEZs'
	Action: 'Working Arrangement' section of Terms of Reference to be updated as follows: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ Change the Leadership group meeting schedule from 6 months to quarterly ○ Leadership group members to be notified of any agenda item 2 weeks before the scheduled meetings ○ Add a new line related to the publication of the LEZ Delivery Group meeting minutes
Remit of LEZ Leadership Group	The following points were noted as the remit of the LEZ Leadership Group <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Objectives of LEZs – alignment of national and city specific objectives 2. Individual city approaches to considering LEZs 3. Areas where national consistency of LEZ standards is required 4. Funding and resources required to deliver LEZs 5. Knowledge sharing 6. Enforcement 7. Mode hierarchy and bus provision 8. Potential economic benefits 9. Oversee evaluation of LEZ objectives 10. Potential consequences, mitigation and inter-dependencies 11. Public engagement

	<p>12. Legislation and/or regulatory framework</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The remit of the LEZ Leadership Group will remain live • Not all of the remit topics have to be covered at every LEZ Leadership Group meeting
	<p>Action: The Remit of LEZ Leadership Group should be recorded in the Terms of Reference and the minutes of the meeting.</p>
Meeting arrangement	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The Cabinet Secretary for Environment, Climate Change and Land Reform or the Minister for Transport and the Islands will chair the meeting • Cllr Ross Grant will replace Cllr Yvonne Allen • LEZ Leadership chair (RC) confirmed the names of the standing members • There should be a capacity to co-opt stakeholders into the Group as required on very specific issues • A 6 monthly meeting schedule was deemed to be too long between meetings. A quarterly meeting schedule was felt to be more appropriate, given the ground that has to be covered in 2018 in particular. • Bi-lateral meetings can take place outwith the LEZ Leadership Group, as agreed by group members. • Agenda's and meeting papers to be issued 2 weeks before each meeting • Minutes will be made public and must be agreed before publication • The location of the meetings will typically be in Edinburgh, at either the Scottish Parliament or St. Andrews House. There is an option to hold at least one meeting in Glasgow Chambers. • Date of the next meeting to be confirmed, with the next meeting in mid-March being preferred. • Dates of the summer and winter 2018 meeting may be difficult to agree upon, so a degree of flexibility is required • Meeting dates on Mondays should be avoided is possible. • LEZ Delivery group does not expect a briefing from the LEZ Delivery Groups, but the Leadership Group may ask for a presentation from the LEZ Delivery Groups as required • The purpose and Terms of Reference should be published from today's meeting, with the remit to be published in due course within the meeting minutes. <p>Action: Transport Scotland to issue a Doodle poll to identify dates, times for the quarterly 2018 meetings starting in March 2018.</p> <p>Action: Transport Scotland to provide secretariat at the meetings and provide communications support</p> <p>Action: Minister for Transport and the Islands to tweet picture from the 1st LEZ Leadership Group meeting.</p>
Additional comments and observations	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • LEZ Leadership Group members were encouraged to review the official Environment, Climate Change and Land Reform (ECCLR) committee reports, to be familiar with the questions asked by MSPs, as these are the types of questions that local elected members can be expected to answer too in the future. • In terms of public communications, the LEZ Leadership Group should be coming from the same place. <p>Action: TS to record all of the questions asked at ECCLR committee Air Quality meetings in 2017. These should be grouped into themes and questions, and the report circulated to the LEZ Leadership Group</p>