

## Annex A

### Item 1

#### MINUTE OF MEETING BETWEEN MINISTER FOR INDEPENDENCE AND IPPR 5<sup>th</sup> July 2023

##### Attendees

Jamie Hepburn Minister for Independence; Marley Morris, Director, IPPR Scotland; Brian Dornan, CFD, David Rogers, CFD, [REDACTED] Scotland House London

##### Discussion

The conversation reflected on the proposals set out within BANS paper 4. IPPR explained they are taking forward a project to explore an improved approach to democratising law making and enabling the public to better engage with policy formulation. The discussion considered the merits of citizens' assemblies as a route to engage the population on specific issues.

The conversation considered different international migration models, including how different Government's have attracted people effectively without restricting movement or career movements for a considerable period of time.

**Action** – CFD colleagues to follow up with IPPR on the literature base around Citizens' Assemblies as a civic engagement tool.

**Action** – CFD to remain in contact with IPPR about its Democratising the Legislative Process project

**Action** - CFD/ DEXA colleagues to engage with IPPR on the propositions in relevant future BANS publications.

### Item 2

#### MINUTE OF MEETING BETWEEN MINISTER FOR INDEPENDENCE AND UK IN A CHANGING EUROPE (UKICE) - 5<sup>th</sup> July 2023

##### Attendees

Jamie Hepburn Minister for Independence; Anand Menon, Director UKICE, Joelle Grogan UKICE, Brian Dornan, CFD, David Rogers, CFD, [REDACTED] Scotland House London

##### Discussion

The conversation reflected on the impact of the UK Internal Market Act and the constraints it has placed on devolution. [REDACTED]. BANS paper 4 was discussed, as was the content and sequencing of future publications in the series.

**Action** – CFD/DEXA to consider opportunities to engage UKICE on future BANS publications

### Item 3

## MINUTE OF MEETING BETWEEN MINISTER FOR INDEPENDENCE AND THE INSTITUTE FOR GOVERNMENT- 5<sup>th</sup> July 2023

### Attendees

Jamie Hepburn Minister for Independence; Hannah White Director of IfG, Akash Paun, Devolution Lead IfG, Jack Pannell, Senior Researcher, [REDACTED], Researcher, [REDACTED], Researcher, Brian Dornan, CFD, David Rogers, CFD, [REDACTED] Scotland House London

### Discussion

IfG provided an overview of the IFG and Bennett Institute Review of the UK Constitution and confirmed a paper with recommendations is scheduled be published on 19 September. The conversation reflected on the impact of the UK Internal Market Act and the constraints it places on devolution. The discussion also considered the proposals set out in BANS paper 4.

### Item 4

## MINUTE OF MEETING BETWEEN MINISTER FOR INDEPENDENCE AND UCL CONSTITUTION UNIT - 6<sup>th</sup> July 2023

### Attendees

Jamie Hepburn Minister for Independence; Professor Meg Russell, Professor Alan Renwick, Professor Robert Hazell, Brian Dornan, CFD, David Rogers, CFD, [REDACTED] Scotland House London

### Discussion

The discussion reflected on the proposals set out with BANS paper 4. Including how best to engage the population in the development of a written constitution and the route to establish a sound democratic ratification process. The conversation reflected on the pros and cons of unicameral or bicameral parliamentary structures. UCL summarised their project on the process of agreeing reforms to the law on the head of state across the 14 Commonwealth Realms.

**Action** – CFD to continue the conversation with the Constitution Unit on the approach to engagement on the written constitution and on the design of constitutional conventions.

### Item 5

## MINUTE OF MEETING BETWEEN MINISTER FOR INDEPENDENCE AND THE BENNETT INSTITUTE - 6<sup>th</sup> July 2023

### Attendees

Jamie Hepburn Minister for Independence; Professor Meg Russell, Professor Mike Kenny, Steph Coulter, senior researcher, Brian Dornan, CFD, David Rogers, CFD, [REDACTED] Scotland House London

### Discussion

The discussion centred around the development of the IFG and Bennett Institute Review of the UK Constitution. The impact of the UK Internal Market Act and the constraints it places on devolution was discussed. [REDACTED]

**Action – SHL to remain in touch with the Bennett Institute to consider SG participation in the launch event for the publication emerging from the review of the UK Constitution.**

## Item 6

### **MEETING OF MINISTER FOR INDEPENDENCE AND CFD DMT, 18 JULY 2023**

#### Attendees:

Minister for Independence, Brian Dornan, [REDACTED], [REDACTED], [REDACTED], [REDACTED], [REDACTED], [REDACTED], [REDACTED], [REDACTED], [REDACTED]

#### Discussion:

The meeting discussed the next two proposed BANS papers; planned post-recess publications; briefings/bilaterals and IMG; engagement including Parliamentary debates and visits; and an analytical update.

#### Actions:

- Additional note to go to the FM on citizenship (**Action:** [REDACTED])
- Advice on citizenship engagement to go to Mr Hepburn (**Action:** [REDACTED])
- Response to points raised by the Minister on the BANS schedule and a draft note to go to the FM to be sent to Mr Hepburn (**Action:** [REDACTED])
- Parliamentary debates to be pursued on: threats to devolution (**Action:** [REDACTED]); [REDACTED] (**Action:** [REDACTED])

## Item 7

### **Meeting between Minister for Independence and Ross Greer MSP – 18 July 2023 – file note**

Attendees: Jamie Hepburn MSP (Minister for Independence), Ross Greer MSP, Harry Huyton (SG), [REDACTED] (SG), Brian Dornan (SG)

Mr Hepburn provided an update on plans for publishing the next paper in the Building a New Scotland series on citizenship, intended for launch in late July. Mr Hepburn outlined progress on publishing further BANS material and noted that papers on [REDACTED] are planned for over the next few months subject to further discussion and agreement with the First Minister.

#### Actions:

[REDACTED]

### **Constitutional Futures Division, 25 July 2023**

## Item 8

### Meeting on 18/07/23 on Building a New Scotland: Citizenship Paper

#### Attendees:

Minister for Independence, Scott Wightman, Claire McPherson, [REDACTED], Brian Dornan, [REDACTED], [REDACTED], Ewan Crawford

#### Discussion:

The meeting discussed the proposals in the forthcoming Citizenship paper. The Minister raised a range of issues and asked the team to update the briefing material ahead of the launch to reflect his points of interest. This included consideration of the Irish model of citizenship.

#### Actions:

- Update briefing material based on discussions (**Action: Claire and [REDACTED]**)
- Consider detail of Irish model re inheritability (**Action: Scott**)

## Item 9

### File Note: Briefing Session: New Scotland Papers : 25 July 2023

#### **Attendees:**

Ministers: Shona Robison MSP, DFM and Cabinet Secretary for Finance; Siobhian Brown MSP, Minister for Victims and Community Safety; Jamie Hepburn MSP, Minister for Independence; Jenni Minto MSP, Minister for Public Health and Women's Health; Angus Robertson MSP, Cabinet Secretary for Constitution, External Affairs and Culture; Lorna Slater MSP, Minister for Green Skills, Circular Economy and Biodiversity; Maree Todd MSP, Minister for Social Care, Mental Wellbeing and Sport

Special Advisers: Ewan Crawford

Officials: Claire McPherson; [REDACTED]; [REDACTED]; [REDACTED]; [REDACTED]; [REDACTED]; [REDACTED]; [REDACTED]; [REDACTED]; [REDACTED]

#### **Discussion:**

Claire McPherson presented the main themes of the Citizenship Paper and outlined plans for the launch of the paper on Thursday.

Ministers considered the key proposals from the paper that should be emphasised to the media and the importance of speaking to stakeholders about this publication as well as previous Building a New Scotland papers.

## Item 10

### **MINUTE OF MEETING BETWEEN MINISTER FOR INDEPENDENCE AND SCOTTISH REFUGEE COUNCIL TUES 25 JULY 2023 1000-1045 – SRC, RENFIELD ST, GLASGOW**

#### Attendees

Jamie Hepburn, Minister for Independence (JH); Sabir Zazi, CEO SRC (SZ); Graham O'Neill, Policy Manager SRC (GO); [REDACTED] Private Secretary; [REDACTED] CFD ; [REDACTED], CFD.

#### Discussion

JH provided a brief summary of the citizenship prospectus paper and proposals set out in the paper were discussed. SZ highlighted the importance of dignity and respect for the most vulnerable in society, as well as the variety of people's backgrounds that SRC works with. SZ highlighted the experience that SRC has working with communities across Scotland and the proposals made in their paper in the run up to the 2014 referendum. SRC reiterated their support for a written constitution and highlighted damage to devolution over the past 15-years, offering to provide examples of what is happening to asylum seekers and refugees as a result of the UKG's approach. The Illegal Migration Bill was also discussed. GO said there was a need for a written constitution to have positive duties on public bodies.

**Action:** GO to share: SRC paper from 2014; examples on how UKG decisions are impacting on devolved services; and SRC's recent letter to Ms Somerville.

## Item 11

### **MINUTE OF MEETING BETWEEN MINISTER FOR INDEPENDENCE AND BEMIS TUES 25 JULY 2023 1100-1200 – BEMIS, 30 GEORGE SQ, GLASGOW**

#### Attendees

Jamie Hepburn, Minister for Independence (JH); Dr Rami Ousta, CEO (RO); Danny Boyle (DB), Senior Parliamentary and Policy Officer BEMIS; and Tanveer Parnez (TP), Director of National Development BEMIS; [REDACTED] Private Secretary; [REDACTED] [REDACTED]

#### Discussion

JH provided a brief overview of the Building a New Scotland series and the recently published constitution prospectus paper. There was a discussion on the proposals set out in the paper and RO welcomed the opportunity to discuss the papers with the Minister. [REDACTED]. RO highlighted the importance of active citizenship and belonging. There was a discussion on the work BEMIS undertook in the run up to 2014, which included them working with the First Minister and said they would like to share a proposal with SG on ideas for engagement with the communities they work with on the Building a New Scotland series. BEMIS also spoke about a programme of work funded through (what was previously known

as) culture, major events and tourism directorate. DB said he would share RO's paper on intangible cultural heritage. RO offered a meeting with the Ethnic Minority Network. DB highlighted that he would like to see action from SG, to mitigate child poverty, on financial support for the children of parents with no recourse to public funds through their asylum status.

**Actions:** BEMIS to share proposals for engagement and RO's paper on intangible cultural heritage.

## Item 12

### **MINUTE OF MEETING BETWEEN MINISTER FOR INDEPENDENCE AND DISABILITY EQUALITY SCOTLAND TUES 25 JULY 2023 1330-1430 – VIA TEAMS**

#### Attendees

Jamie Hepburn, Minister for Independence (JH); Lyn Pornaro, CEO DSE (LP); [REDACTED] CFD.

JH provided a brief overview of the Building a New Scotland series and the recently published constitution prospectus paper. JH also acknowledged LP's letter to JH and that Douglas Bryce (Deputy CEO) attended the stakeholder engagement event at the end of June because LP was unable to attend the event and it was not possible to join the event remotely. JH also noted that, at the event, Douglas Bryce highlighted the need to publish all versions of the prospectus papers at the same time as the main paper (including the translations and the Easy Read, audio, BSL versions). LP stressed that culture change has to happen now. She said that the pandemic was terrible but also opened up some engagement for disabled people, as more events became hybrid. LP also agreed with the points Douglas Bryce had raised at the event. She said it would be good to have more advance notice of meetings and to ensure that there are more hybrid meetings and/or to ensure that there are other opportunities for engagement. LP said she is happy to think about and get back to SG officials if there is more that SG can do or what SG can do differently in this space.

## Item 13

### **MINUTE OF MEETING BETWEEN MINISTER FOR INDEPENDENCE AND GLASGOW DISABILITY ALLIANCE TUES 25 JULY 2023 1400-1500 – TEMPLETON BUSINESS CENTRE, GLASGOW**

#### Attendees

Jamie Hepburn, Minister for Independence (JH); Tressa Burke (TB), CEO GDA; Sophie Lawson (SL), Policy and Participation Manager GDA; Kevin Johnston (KJ), Welfare Rights Officer GDA; Hannah Reynolds (HR), Digital Inclusion Manager GDA; Karen Wylie, Learning Manager GDA; [REDACTED] [REDACTED] CFD.

JH provided a brief overview of the Building a New Scotland series and the recently published constitution prospectus paper. There was a discussion on the content of the constitution paper and TB welcomed the importance of human rights featuring so prominently in the paper. TB asked that JH raised the issue of disabled people as a priority and cited the range of issues that disabled people are currently facing, particularly given the

cost-of-living crisis. There was a discussion on barriers to participation including digital inclusion and the need for that to be factored into any engagement planning. TB highlighted the intersectional groups that exist within GDA and that we may want to consider consulting with them on future work.

## Item 14

**Minister for Independence**  
**Meeting with Professor Alan Miller to discuss Building a New Scotland: Creating a modern constitution for an independent Scotland**  
**St Andrew's House**  
**Thursday 27 July, 13:00-14:00**

Attendees: Jamie Hepburn MSP, Professor Alan Miller, [REDACTED] (CFD), [REDACTED] (CFD)

### **Note of meeting**

Mr Hepburn introduced the paper and sought Professor Miller's insights on its reception as well as any suggestions for ongoing engagement with the human rights sector.

Professor Miller talked through his recent blog post on the prospectus paper and the Scottish Government's draft Human Rights Bill. He noted that the post had been positively received by international and civil society colleagues and that there was scope to engage with a wide range of stakeholders through the commemorations planned for the 75<sup>th</sup> anniversary of the Universal Declaration of Human Rights on 10 December 2023.

Professor Miller also discussed the work of the Centre for the Study of Human Rights Law at the University of Strathclyde, which was planning its own series of commemorative events in December 2023.

### **Actions:**

- CFD to consider options for engagement around 75<sup>th</sup> anniversary events in December 2023.

Constitutional Futures Division, 31 July 2023

## Item 15

**CALL BETWEEN MINISTER FOR INDEPENDENCE AND PROFESSOR REBECCA KAY – 1430, 27 July 2023**

### Attendees:

Jamie Hepburn MSP, Minister for Independence; Professor Rebecca Kay; [REDACTED] CFD.

### Discussion:

Mr Hepburn advised that the fifth Building a New Scotland paper, Citizenship in an independent Scotland, had been published today, 27 July 2023. There was a discussion of areas of interest in the paper, and Mr Hepburn and Professor Kay agreed to speak again in advance of the publication of the paper on migration proposals.

## Item 16

### **CALL BETWEEN MINISTER FOR INDEPENDENCE AND PROFESSOR JO SHAW, UNIVERSITY OF EDINBURGH– 1445, 27 July 2023**

#### Attendees:

Jamie Hepburn MSP, Minister for Independence; Professor Jo Shaw; [REDACTED], CFD.

#### Discussion:

Mr Hepburn advised that the fourth Building a New Scotland paper, Citizenship in an independent Scotland, had been published today, 27 July 2023. There was a discussion of areas of interest in the paper and Professor Shaw highlighted that she would be happy to offer further thoughts as this work developed.

## Item 17

### **CALL BETWEEN MINISTER FOR INDEPENDENCE AND EMMA HUTTON AND JEN ANG, JUSTRIGHT SCOTLAND– 1500, 27 July 2023**

#### Attendees:

Jamie Hepburn MSP, Minister for Independence; Emma Hutton; Jen Ang; [REDACTED], CFD.

#### Discussion:

Mr Hepburn advised that the fourth Building a New Scotland paper, Citizenship in an independent Scotland, had been published today, 27 July 2023. There was a discussion of areas of interest in the paper and all agreed that a further, more detailed conversation on the policy proposals would be beneficial. Mr Hepburn confirmed that his Private Office would be in touch to make arrangements for that to take place.

## Item 18 –

### **MINUTE OF FIRST MINISTER'S STAKEHOLDER ROUNDTABLE TO LAUNCH THE CITIZENSHIP PAPER 9.30-10.15 - 27 JULY 2023**

**Attendees:** First Minister, Minister for Independence, Minister for Green Skills, Circular Economy and Biodiversity, [REDACTED], [REDACTED], [REDACTED], [REDACTED], [REDACTED], [REDACTED], [REDACTED], [REDACTED], [REDACTED], [REDACTED], [REDACTED] (supporting official)

#### **Key points**

1. The First Minister (FM) introduced himself and asked participants to introduce themselves. He then made opening remarks about the discussion, noting that it would be based on 'Chatham House Rules', where comments could be recorded but no name would be attributed to them.
2. The FM outlined key themes from the Citizenship paper, including demographic challenges facing Scotland, the rights of citizens and non-citizens, and the need to reduce fees for citizen services,.
3. The FM also set out that the Scottish Government is currently working on a [REDACTED] that would be progressive, noting that today's discussion would likely focus also on [REDACTED] as there is a considerable overlap with citizenship.
4. The following points were made by participants:
  - There was a general welcome for the paper and its inclusive and welcoming approach. It was seen to be a very different policy to the perceived 'hostile environment' of the UK Government on these issues.
  - There was support for reduced fees for citizenship services. Several participants mentioned the difficulty of affording UK citizenship fees, which could be in 'the tens of thousands of pounds' for large families. The proposal to reduce fees was contrasted with the UK Government's fee structures, which were seen to be 'out of step' with international examples.
  - The issue of 'belonging' was frequently mentioned by participants as hugely important in creating a successful country for everyone who lives there. A 'warm welcome and a warm future' is important if people are going to play an active role in society. Once people feel safe, it's easier to feel that they belong. The FM pointed to the future rights of citizens but also of non-citizens – that the majority of rights in Scotland would be based on residency, not citizenship, so it would be easier for people to feel that sense of belonging in an independent Scotland.
  - One participant said that the present UK system seemed to have designed its systems to fail people applying for citizenship. Moving away from that to support people to apply and help them to succeed would be welcome. There was a welcome for the removal of intentional barriers to citizenship, which was contrasted with the expected impacts of the Illegal Migration Bill in denying people the right to apply for citizenship or settled status.
  - The FM agreed, and noted that the aim of the Scottish Government's proposals was not to be simply 'better than the UK' but rather to be the best in terms of belonging and inclusivity.
  - The 'expansive view of citizenship' was welcomed by one participant as consistent with the Scottish Government's other policy aspirations, e.g. around growing the population. There was seen to be a need to move beyond knee jerk responses to migration. It was seen as appropriate and helpful to attempt to simplify migration and

citizenship processes, because current UK systems were 'byzantine' in their complexity.

- One participant suggested that the Scottish Government could consider how to make its proposals still more progressive - lowering the number of years living here to be able to qualify and reducing fees further so that all families, including lone parents, could afford them.
- A point was made that the aim of these proposals to grow the working age population of an independent Scotland was very important. The FM agreed, noting that there is still a need to take the population with us, highlighting valid concerns in his own constituency about pressure on housing and public services.
- The right to work was mentioned as a key issue for those coming to Scotland, with one stakeholder pointing out that it took them 10 years living in the UK before they could legally work. The FM agreed with points made and pointed to what he saw as the 'bewildering complexity' of the current system and the 'cruelty' of preventing people from working who want to work, pay tax and contribute to society.
- The issue of the length of time needed to be living in Scotland before citizenship could be claimed was highlighted. FM responded that any time spent living in Scotland pre-independence would count towards eligibility, the clock would not need to start again.
- A participant mentioned the perceived unfairness of the UK's naturalisation process and costs, specifically pointing to the 'Life in the UK' Test, which they said was 'quite infamous'. They asked whether there would be a life in Scotland test and if there was one, would it be fair? The FM said in response that the UK test was not credible, with UK citizens born and raised here also unable to answer the questions in it. He said that in an independent Scotland there would not be a test like that.
- One participant asked 'what kind of independence we would get' in relation to rights of naturalised Scottish citizens re employment and higher education. The FM pointed to the rights given in the common travel area.
- Issues around asylum seekers and education were also highlighted.
- Multiple identities was mentioned, with the FM offering reassurance that dual citizenship was entirely possible in the Scottish Government's proposals, and would be an individual choice. For example, people could choose to be Scottish or British or both – the key responsibility for the Scottish Government here was to ensure that people weren't left stateless by any decisions they made to renounce citizenship.
- [REDACTED]

5. The First Minister closed the roundtable by thanking participants for coming and for contributing to the discussion. He mentioned that if they needed anything else or had follow up questions about the proposals, they should speak [REDACTED], his supporting official, after the meeting.

6. The meeting then closed.

## SCOTTISH GOVERNMENT

## Item 19

### Meeting to discuss draft prospectus paper – [REDACTED] Friday 28 July, 11.30 – 12.30

**Attendees:** Cabinet Secretary for the Constitution, External Affairs and Culture, Minister for Independence, Brian Dornan, [REDACTED], [REDACTED], [REDACTED], Ewan Crawford

#### Note of meeting

Sectoral context: [REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

Constitutional Futures Division, 31 July 2023

## Item 20 –

### INDEPENDENCE MINISTERIAL GROUP NOTE OF MEETING 11 – 31<sup>st</sup> July 2023

#### Attendees

Jamie Hepburn MSP, Minister for Independence (Chair)  
Angus Robertson MSP, Cabinet Secretary for the Constitution, External Affairs and Culture  
Shona Robison MSP, Deputy First Minister and Cabinet Secretary for Finance  
Neil Gray Cabinet Secretary for Wellbeing Economy, Fair Work and Energy  
Patrick Harvie MSP, Minister for Zero Carbon Buildings, Active Travel and Tenants' Rights

#### Apologies

Shirley-Anne Somerville MSP Cabinet Secretary for Social Justice  
Màiri McAllan MSP Cabinet Secretary for Net Zero and Just Transition  
Christina McKelvie MSP, Minister for Culture, Europe and International Development  
Lorna Slater MSP, Minister for Green Skills, Circular Economy and Biodiversity

#### Chair

The meeting was chaired by Jamie Hepburn, Minister for Independence, (JH); key points and actions are below.

#### Welcome & Update

1. Members agreed the minutes of the last IMG without amendment.

2. JH updated members on actions.

## Update

3. Officials updated the group on the Building a New Scotland (BANS) independence prospectus series, including reflections on the publication of the Citizenship paper on 27th July.
4. Officials gave a brief overview of the digital evaluation of the launch of the Constitution paper.
5. Members reflected on the positive launch and reception of the Citizenship paper and noted plans to have a fuller discussion on communication and engagement relating to BANS publications at the next IMG meeting.

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

## Date of Next Meeting

6. The next meeting is provisionally scheduled for 30<sup>th</sup> August.

## Actions

- Paper drafters to incorporate Ministerial Group comments into paper drafting.
- Substantive item on communication and engagement to be added to the next IMG agenda.

## Item 21

### Meeting of Minister for Independence and CFD SMT, 1 August 2023

Attendees: Jamie Hepburn, Minister for Independence, [REDACTED], [REDACTED], [REDACTED], [REDACTED]

Officials updated Mr H on the work plan and discussed a range of current issues.

Actions:

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

- Provide further advice on potential Wales visit.

## Item 22

### File Note: Briefing Session: New Scotland Papers : 1 August 2023

#### Attendees:

Ministers: Neil Gray MSP, Cabinet Secretary for Wellbeing Economy, Fair Work and Energy; Jamie Hepburn MSP, Minister for Independence; Jenni Minto MSP, Minister for Public Health and Women's Health; Joe Fitzpatrick MSP, Minister for Local Government Empowerment and Planning.

Officials: Claire McPherson; Tulani Sakala; Erin Hall; [REDACTED]; [REDACTED]; [REDACTED]; [REDACTED]

#### Discussion:

Claire McPherson presented the main themes of the Citizenship Paper and Ministers reviewed the coverage of the launch.

**Action:** Migration officials to provide a draft minute for the Minister for Independence to consider sending other Ministers to reiterate availability of briefing on citizenship proposals and opportunities for engagement.

Constitutional Futures Division, 1 August 2023

## Item 23

### Minister for Independence

#### Meeting with Dr Elliot Bulmer to discuss "Building a New Scotland: Creating a modern constitution for an independent Scotland"

via Teams

Tuesday 1 August 2023, 12:15-13:00

Attendees: Jamie Hepburn MSP, Dr Elliot Bulmer (in a personal capacity), Dominic Munro (DC), [REDACTED] (CFD), [REDACTED] (CFD)

#### Note of meeting

Mr Hepburn introduced the paper and sought Dr Bulmer's thoughts on the proposals in the paper and its reception.

Dr Bulmer, speaking in a personal capacity, welcomed the publication of the paper and the commitments in it.

He agreed with the two-step process of an interim and then permanent constitution, as set out in the paper. He recommended that consideration be given to the production of a draft

interim constitution, to ensure public understanding of the what could be on offer with independence. He noted that it is vital that there is something in place on day one of independence, with the interim constitution focusing on what is central for a well-functioning democracy. He also stressed the importance of adequate consultation processes, as well as education and awareness-raising campaigns in relation to the interim constitution, the Constitutional Convention and the drafting and implementation of the permanent constitution.

In terms of its reception, he thought the paper gave the right signals to the international audience.

Constitutional Futures Division, 8 August 2023

## **Item 24**

### **CALL BETWEEN MINISTER FOR INDEPENDENCE AND PROFESSOR ALAN RENWICK – 9:45, 16 August 2023**

#### Attendees:

Jamie Hepburn MSP, Minister for Independence; Professor Alan Renwick; [REDACTED], CFD.

#### Discussion:

Mr Hepburn advised that the fifth Building a New Scotland paper, Citizenship in an independent Scotland, had been published last month. There was brief discussion around how to approach incorporating citizenship proposals into a written constitution.

Constitutional Futures Division 16 August 2023.

## **Item 25**

### **Ministerial Meeting – [REDACTED] 16 August 2023**

#### Attendees:

Minister for Independence, [REDACTED], [REDACTED], [REDACTED]

#### Discussion:

[REDACTED]  
[REDACTED]

#### Actions:

[REDACTED]

## **Item 26**

## MEETING OF MINISTER FOR INDEPENDENCE AND CFD DMT, 15 AUGUST 2023

### Attendees:

Minister for Independence, Dominic Munro, [REDACTED], [REDACTED], [REDACTED], [REDACTED], [REDACTED], [REDACTED], [REDACTED], [REDACTED], [REDACTED], [REDACTED], [REDACTED]

### Discussion:

- [REDACTED]
- Officials provided an update on potential next steps for publications, speeches and engagement events.
- The Minister agreed that updated advice should be put to the First Minister following discussion at the next IMG meeting.
- The Minister recommended that officials engage with colleagues supporting the First Minister's attendance at the Business for Scotland event to ensure coordinated presentation of material.

### 2. Engagement - overview of what's coming up

- Official set out plans for the Citizenship round table planned for 17 August and noted that options were being considered for engagement with colleagues in Wales in October.
- The Minister noted that engagement thus far had been very useful and officials should continue to develop his visits and engagement programme.

### 3. FOIs, correspondence, PQs – update

- Officials updated the Minister on the range and volume of FOIs, correspondence and PQs received and under consideration

### 4. Independence Ministerial Group - plan for meeting on 31st August

- Officials outlined the proposed agenda for the next meeting

### 5. AOB

- None

### Actions:

- [REDACTED]
- [REDACTED]
- [REDACTED]
- [REDACTED]

### Item 27

## **Meeting between Minister for Independence and Ross Greer MSP – 17 August 2023 – file note**

Attendees: Jamie Hepburn MSP (Minister for Independence), Ross Greer MSP, Harry Huyton (SG), [REDACTED] (SG), Jack Middleton (SG) [REDACTED]. Mr Hepburn and Mr Greer reflected on the response to the Citizenship paper published last month, and on opportunities for ongoing engagement around this and other prospectus material. [REDACTED]

Actions:  
[REDACTED]

### **Constitutional Futures Division, 17 August 2023**

#### **Item 28**

#### **CALL BETWEEN MINISTER FOR INDEPENDENCE AND PROFESSOR NICOLA MCEWAN – 10:45, 17 August 2023**

##### Attendees:

Jamie Hepburn MSP, Minister for Independence; Professor Nicola McEwan; [REDACTED], CFD.

##### Discussion:

Mr Hepburn advised that the fifth Building a New Scotland paper, Citizenship in an independent Scotland, had been published last month. There was discussion about where these papers fit in relation to the wider constitutional issues around referendum process.

Constitutional Futures Division  
23 August 2023

#### **Item 29**

#### **CALL BETWEEN MINISTER FOR INDEPENDENCE AND PROFESSOR MICHAEL KEATING – 11:15, 17 August 2023**

##### Attendees:

Jamie Hepburn MSP, Minister for Independence; Professor Michael Keating; [REDACTED], CFD.

##### Discussion:

Mr Hepburn advised that the fifth Building a New Scotland paper, Citizenship in an independent Scotland, had been published last month. There was a discussion of areas of interest in the paper and Mr Hepburn advised that [REDACTED].

Professor Keating recommended a recent blog post on the Royal Society of Edinburgh website by Professor Katy Hayward, who he also suggested Mr Hepburn meet.

Constitutional Futures Division 23 August 2023.

## Item 30

### **BUILDING A NEW SCOTLAND CITIZENSHIP IN AN INDEPENDENT SCOTLAND**

#### **ROUNDTABLE DISCUSSION**

**CHAIR: JAMIE HEPBURN, MSP, MINISTER FOR INDEPENDENCE / SHIRLEY-ANNE SOMERVILLE MSP, CABINET SECRETARY FOR SOCIAL JUSTICE**

**17 AUGUST 2023; 14:45 – 16:00; ONLINE**

#### Attendees:

- Jamie Hepburn MSP, Minister for Independence
- Shirley-Anne Somerville MSP, Cabinet Secretary for Social Justice
- Emma Roddick MSP, Minister for Equalities, Migration and Refugees
- Jack Middleton, Special Adviser
  
- Andreea Dumitrache, Interim Co-CEO, The3Million
- Professor Rebecca Kay, Chair of the Expert Advisory Group on Migration and Population
- Professor Philomena de Lima - Applied Sociology and Rural Studies, University of the Highlands and Islands
- Grace McGill, Partner/Solicitor, Burness Paull
- Professor Sergi Pardos-Prado, Migration Advisory Committee, University of Glasgow
- Professor Murray Pittock, University of Glasgow
- Professor Jo Shaw, Citizenship Law, University of Edinburgh
- Philip Whyte, Director, IPPR Scotland
  
- [REDACTED], Citizens' Rights, Scottish Government
- [REDACTED], Constitutional Futures Divisions, Scottish Government
- [REDACTED], Constitutional Futures Division, Scottish Government

#### Discussion:

Mr Hepburn introduced the fifth Building a New Scotland paper, Citizenship in an independent Scotland. He opened the discussion seeking stakeholders' feedback on the paper. During the discussion the links between citizenship and migration policy were highlighted; [REDACTED]

The following points were raised in discussion:

- The paper and its proposals were broadly welcomed by stakeholders.
- The pros and cons of determining citizenship by descent versus residence.
- There is good evidence available to show that migrants who become citizens have greater social and cultural integration.
- When residence offers wide ranging rights, what is the added value of citizenship? It was suggested that in the context of the paper it was symbolic.
- There is a rationale, then, for the benefits of citizenship being attractive.
- Regarding transition, it was emphasised that it is important not to reset qualifying time periods for people applying for citizenship. There is a need to make provision for people who have lived in different parts of the UK (particularly young people in temporary addresses) during qualifying time periods. There should be clear immigration rules and pathways to citizenship during any transition period.
- It is important that people can opt out of Scottish citizenship e.g. because of rules around holding dual nationality.
- The inclusive nature of the policy was welcomed.
- There is a balance to be found between removing obstacles such as tests and supporting language learning and integration.

### Next Steps

The Cabinet Secretary was grateful to participants for the helpful feedback and challenge raised in the context of citizenship, but also in relation to migration and integration and that further engagement on these issues would be taken forward over coming months

## **CONSTITUTIONAL FUTURES DIVISION**

**23 July 2023**

### **Item 31**

#### **Discussion with Mr Hepburn on [REDACTED] - 21 August 2023 – file note**

Attendees: Jamie Hepburn MSP, [REDACTED], [REDACTED], [REDACTED]

Discussion:  
[REDACTED]

ACTION: [REDACTED]

Constitutional Futures Division, 21 August 2023

### **Item 32**

#### **Meeting with Roz Foyer - STUC**

##### Attendees:

Jamie Hepburn MSP, Minister for Independence; Roz Foyer, STUC General Secretary;  
[REDACTED]

## Discussion:

Mr Hepburn apologised for the meeting having to be rescheduled previously. He then advised that the fourth Building a New Scotland paper, Creating a modern constitution for an independent Scotland, had been published on 19 June 2023. The fifth publication of the series, 'Building a New Scotland: Citizenship in an independent Scotland', has since also been published (on 27 July 2023). Ms Foyer thanked the Minister for the call. Ms Foyer had noted the publication of the constitution paper with interest and STUC had comment on the publication. There was a discussion around workers' rights and in particular the right to strike, which Mr Hepburn noted had been included in the proposals for a constitution for an independent Scotland. STUC believes that there should be a constitutional guarantee for sectoral bargaining and greater worker input into economic decision-making. She stressed that any constitutional change must benefit ordinary working people. Mr Hepburn said he hoped to engage with trade unions further on these issues.

## **CONSTITUTIONAL FUTURES DIVISION 22 August 2023**

### **Item 33**

#### **MEETING OF MINISTER FOR INDEPENDENCE AND CFD SMT, 29 AUGUST 2023**

Attendees: Minister for Independence, Dominic Munro, [REDACTED], [REDACTED], [REDACTED], [REDACTED], Ewan Crawford

[REDACTED]

Action:

[REDACTED]

### **Item 34 –**

#### **INDEPENDENCE MINISTERIAL GROUP NOTE OF MEETING 12 – 30<sup>th</sup> August 2023**

#### **Attendees**

Jamie Hepburn MSP, Minister for Independence (Chair)  
Angus Robertson MSP, Cabinet Secretary for the Constitution, External Affairs and Culture  
Neil Gray Cabinet Secretary for Wellbeing Economy, Fair Work and Energy  
Patrick Harvie MSP, Minister for Zero Carbon Buildings, Active Travel and Tenants' Rights  
Christina McKelvie MSP, Minister for Culture, Europe and International Development  
Lorna Slater MSP, Minister for Green Skills, Circular Economy and Biodiversity  
Emma Roddick MSP, Minister for Equalities, Migration and Refugees  
Maree Todd MSP, Minister for Social Care, Mental Wellbeing and Sport

#### **Apologies**

Shona Robison MSP, Deputy First Minister and Cabinet Secretary for Finance  
Shirley-Anne Somerville MSP Cabinet Secretary for Social Justice  
Màiri McAllan MSP Cabinet Secretary for Net Zero and Just Transition

## Chair

The meeting was chaired by Jamie Hepburn, Minister for Independence, (JH); key points and actions are below.

## Welcome & Update

7. Members agreed the minutes of the last IMG without amendment. (Paper 1)
8. There were no outstanding actions.

## Prospectus: Next Steps Update (Paper 2)

9. JH gave an outline of the [REDACTED] and associated communications and engagement work.

[REDACTED]  
[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

## Communications & Engagement

10. Officials gave members an outline of what the communications and engagement approach to papers has been so far. This included details of what the evaluations of publications have shown and the approach for future publications.

## Date of Next Meeting

11. The next meeting is provisionally scheduled for 27<sup>th</sup> September.

## Actions

[REDACTED]

## Item 35

## Discussion with Mr Hepburn on [REDACTED] 7 September 2023 – file note

Attendees: Jamie Hepburn MSP, [REDACTED], [REDACTED], [REDACTED], Ewan Crawford

Officials set out planned discussion points for the bilateral meeting with the Cabinet Secretary for Social Justice planned on 19<sup>th</sup> September, which were agreed with the Minister. Feedback from the Social Protection Director Cluster earlier in the week was also provided.

Constitutional Futures Division, 8 September 2023

## Item 36

### **Note of meeting with Minister for Independence and CUKR officials – 7 September 2023**

Attendees: Jamie Hepburn MP, [REDACTED], [REDACTED], [REDACTED] [REDACTED].

Introductions from CUKR unit heads and a description of their roles.

[REDACTED] discussed the IGR Review and the three-tier structure that supports IGR. She also spoke about recent engagement with the UKG and the last meeting of the British-Irish Council.

[REDACTED] discussed the work of his team on common frameworks and the IMA. He also spoke about recent examples of tensions with the UKG, including the Deposit Return Scheme.

[REDACTED] provided an overview of the broader constitutional context and the paper published on the summer on threats to devolution following Brexit. He also discussed work in relation to the Deposit Return Scheme, Gender Recognition Reform and the Section 35 order.

## Item 37

File note - Seminar on IPPR Report 'The Ambivalent Union' - Professor Ailsa Henderson, University of Edinburgh  
12 September 2023 (St Andrew's House and online)

### **Attendees**

- Angus Robertson MSP, Jamie Hepburn MSP (online)
- Professor Ailsa Henderson, University of Edinburgh (online)
- Officials: Chair: Brian Dornan, Constitutional Futures Division. Organiser: [REDACTED], SG Central Analysis Division. Attendees: a range of officials from Constitution Directorate and the SG Central Analysis Division attended in person and online
- Ewan Crawford, Special Adviser

### **Background**

Ailsa Henderson, Professor of Political Science at the University of Edinburgh has agreed to deliver a number of presentations to the Scottish Government on topics relating to her

academic work on the Scottish Election Study, and with academics at the University of Cardiff, including on the State of the Union Survey. This hybrid seminar was the first of these and covered findings from the 2021 State of the Union Survey, as reported in the IPPR report 'The Ambivalent Union'.

### **IPPR 'The Ambivalent Union' report**

Professor Henderson set out the background to the report, co-authored with Professor Richard Wyn Jones from Cardiff University, which presents findings from the Cardiff–Edinburgh State of the Union Survey, which comprises parallel representative surveys of around 1,600 voters in each of Scotland, England, Wales and Northern Ireland. Professor Henderson then set out its main findings, including:

- While support was high for economic solidarity in principle across the UK, support dropped considerably when questions explored what this meant in practice between UK nations
- Similarly social solidarity, measured as support for policy uniformity across the UK, was high across the UK, but Professor Henderson noted the point made in the report that it should not be assumed that to support uniformity is to support following an English / UKG lead (particularly if that would mean universalising less generous approaches). Ailsa further noted their finding from 2018 that support in the UK for policy uniformity between the EU and post-Brexit UK was similarly high even among leave voters. And that when policy uniformity is contextualised with examples, support for it drops, e.g. there was strong support for policy divergence on Covid travel restrictions between different parts of the state.
- Around 3 in 10 respondents in England felt that no Scottish, Welsh or Northern Irish MPs should ever be a member of the UK government
- There was a rising presence of 'ambivalent unionism' (not necessarily in favour of independence for their part of the UK, but relaxed about any other part choosing to become independent)
- Variations in support for and meaning of British identity make it hard to identify a unifying concept of Britishness
- There was a tension between more radical, muscular unionism from UK parties vs more ambivalent attitudes among electorates

The presentation was followed by Q&A facilitated by Brian Dornan.

[REDACTED], Central Analysis Division, 15 September 2023

### **Item 38**

## **Meeting of CFD DMT and Minister for Independence – 12 September 2023**

### Attendees (via teams)

Minister for Independence, [REDACTED]

### Discussion

[REDACTED]

A general update on engagement plans around the BANS series and wider constitutional work was provided with further advice on specific academic engagement to be provided in due course.

AOB covered off plans for up-coming Independence Ministerial Group meetings during September and October.

### Actions

- 1 - Officials to provide advice on BANS series launch arrangements – [REDACTED]
- 2 – Officials to liaise with the Ministers Private Office regarding future engagement meetings – [REDACTED] / [REDACTED] (completed)

### **Item 39**

#### **Building a New Scotland – Citizenship paper briefing – 20 September 23 – file note**

Attendees: Jamie Hepburn MSP, Fiona Hyslop MSP, George Adam MSP, [REDACTED], [REDACTED], [REDACTED] [REDACTED]

Officials set out the main themes in the paper titled *Citizenship in an independent Scotland*, and Ministers discussed the context of the paper and the coverage of the launch.

[REDACTED]

Ms Hyslop also provided feedback on the Net Zero draft paper, specifically the sections on transport policy.

Constitutional Futures Division, 20 September 2023

### **Item 40**

#### **Minister for Independence: Discussion on [REDACTED] 23.09.23– File note**

Attendees: Jamie Hepburn MSP, Mairi McAllan MSP, Neil Gray MSP, Ewan Crawford, Kersti Berge, [REDACTED], Brian Dornan, [REDACTED], [REDACTED], [REDACTED],

The meeting had been called to discuss the timing of publication of the [REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

#### **Actions:**

[REDACTED]

**Constitutional Futures Division, 13 September 2023**

## Item 41

### MINISTERIAL BILATERAL MEETING – BUILDING A NEW SCOTLAND SERIES – [REDACTED] MEETING HELD IN SCOTTISH PARLIAMENT/ ONLINE ON 19 SEPTEMBER 2023

#### Attendees

##### *In person:*

Minister for Independence, Stephen Kerr, Ruth Steele, Lucy O’Carroll, [REDACTED],  
[REDACTED], [REDACTED], Emilie-Louise Purdie, Ewan Crawford

##### *Online:*

Cabinet Secretary for Social Justice, Ian Davidson

#### Introduction

Mr Hepburn indicated that all the papers would seek a balanced coverage of:  
[REDACTED]

Discussion: [REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

Also discussed were:

[REDACTED]

Discussion: [REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

#### Actions:

[REDACTED]

## Annex B

### Item 1 - Extract from Defence policy briefing note

#### NATO

**The Scottish Government firmly believe that NATO membership would be not only in Scotland's interests, but every country in the alliance as it underpins an effective conventional defence and security co-operation agreement, which remains the cornerstone of security for the North Atlantic area.**

- Coupled with a strong relationship with the UK, membership of the EU and of NATO will be the foundation of an independent Scotland's security policy.
- Scotland occupies a strategic position on the northern edge of Europe, close to the Arctic channels of the High North and with the Atlantic Ocean to its west.
- Membership of NATO and the EU would not only be vital to Scotland's security, it would also be the principal way in which an independent Scotland would contribute to the collective security of our neighbours and allies.

**The UK and US governments have welcomed bids for NATO membership by Sweden and Finland, despite both indicating they do not want to host or site nuclear weapons on their territory as part of their application.**

- The UK Prime Minister said [QUOTE]: "I look forward to welcoming Finland and Sweden into the NATO family very soon." (PM on Twitter, 18 May)
- President Biden said [QUOTE]: "They meet every NATO requirement and then some. Having two new NATO members in the high north will enhance the security of our alliances and deepen our security cooperation across the board." (Aljazeera.com, 19 May)
- Support from the UK and US comes despite the Sweden's governing party stating [QUOTE]: "if the application is approved by NATO, expresses unilateral reservations against the deployment of nuclear weapons and permanent bases on Swedish territory". (Social Dem. Party release, quoted EURACTIV, 16 May)
- The Finnish Prime Minister has made the point that [QUOTE]: "These are national decisions. Nobody will come to us to impose nuclear weapons or permanent bases if we don't want them" (Business Insider India, 19 May)

**Item 2 – Extract from correspondence lines**

The current Scottish Government has been clear that, under independence, it would build a defence system that has the ability and capabilities to respond to threats at both home and abroad. An independent Scotland would be committed to working with those who share our ideals and values, whilst aligning our defence requirements with the collective needs and priorities of allies and partners. It would seek to be a part of key defence and security alliances, such as NATO and the EU.

**Item 3 – Extract of document regarding an independent Scotland joining NATO**

[REDACTED]

## Annex C

**The following items of information are extracts. It is provided as an extract because it comes from a document or email containing other information outwith the scope of your request.**

### Item 1 –

**From:** David Barnes <David.Barnes@gov.scot>  
**Sent:** Friday, July 28, 2023 3:11 PM  
**To:** Cabinet Secretary for Wellbeing Economy, Fair Work & Energy <CabSecWEFWE@gov.scot>  
**Cc:** DG Economy <DGEconomy@gov.scot>; DL for DG Economy Directors <DLDGED@gov.scot>; [REDACTED]  
**Subject:** RE: Independence Ministerial Group papers

Cabinet Secretary

Because the [REDACTED] is on the agenda, I have been invited to attend the meeting on Monday along with [REDACTED] (cc'd) who leads on borders.

David Barnes  
Deputy Director, Trade Policy  
Scottish Government  
Victoria Quay, Edinburgh EH6 6QQ  
Pronouns: he/him  
Tel (mobile) [REDACTED]

[REDACTED]  
NOTE FOR CABINET SECRETARY GRAY FOR INDEPENDENCE MINISTERIAL GROUP MEETING, 31 JULY 2023

### The land border

Last year's BANS paper on the economy acknowledged that border arrangements will be necessary, and that as an EU member state Scotland will need to comply with EU border requirements (while stressing that borders will be removed between Scotland and the member states of the EU). It also set out a number of ways in which the impact of these border requirements could potentially be mitigated, based on a desk study of examples from other countries.

In answer to questions at the press conference launching that paper, the former FM gave some further details (Eg that, based on precedents elsewhere, full land border infrastructure

might only be needed on the two or three biggest road crossings, with other roads monitored by camera). She said further details would be given in the [REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

David Barnes  
Deputy Director, Trade Policy  
[REDACTED]

## Item 2 -

**From:** David Barnes <David.Barnes@gov.scot>  
**Sent:** Thursday, August 24, 2023 11:31 AM  
**To:** [REDACTED]; [REDACTED] >; [REDACTED]; [REDACTED] [REDACTED]  
[REDACTED] [REDACTED]; [REDACTED]  
**Cc:** Richard Rollison <Richard.Rollison@gov.scot>  
**Subject:** FW: External Affairs Director Cluster

[REDACTED]

Happy to have any other comments.

David

David Barnes  
Deputy Director, Trade Policy  
Scottish Government  
Victoria Quay, Edinburgh EH6 6QQ  
Pronouns: he/him  
Tel (mobile) [REDACTED]

## Item 3 –

[REDACTED]

**From:** David Barnes <David.Barnes@gov.scot>  
**Sent:** Thursday, July 27, 2023 12:17 PM  
**To:** Richard Rollison <Richard.Rollison@gov.scot>; [REDACTED] >; [REDACTED] >;  
[REDACTED] >; [REDACTED] >  
**Subject:** Off sen: FW: Independence Ministerial Group papers

[REDACTED]

## Item 4 –

St Andrew's House, Regent Road, Edinburgh EH1 3DG  
www.gov.scot



[REDACTED]

## Item 5 –

[REDACTED]

## Item 6 –

**From:** [REDACTED]

**Sent:** Wednesday, July 19, 2023 2:36 PM

**To:** David Barnes <David.Barnes@gov.scot>; [REDACTED]; [REDACTED]

**Subject:** Off sens - [REDACTED]- text for review

Hi all,

[REDACTED]

Many thanks in advance,

[REDACTED]

Head of Policy Development, International Futures | Directorate for External Affairs | Scottish Government |

Mobile: [REDACTED]

## Item 7 –

**From:** David Barnes <David.Barnes@gov.scot>

**Sent:** Monday, August 28, 2023 4:03 PM

**To:** [REDACTED] >; [REDACTED] >; [REDACTED] >

**Cc:** [REDACTED] >; [REDACTED] >

**Subject:** FW: Royal Society of Edinburgh - Scotland-Europe Initiative articles/blogs and Brigid Laffan / Stefaan De Rynck event

To see re border – but some stuff of wider interest too.

David

David Barnes

Deputy Director, Trade Policy

Scottish Government

Victoria Quay, Edinburgh EH6 6QQ

Pronouns: he/him

Tel (mobile) [REDACTED]

**From:** [REDACTED] >

**Sent:** Monday, August 28, 2023 12:14 PM

**To:** Claire McPherson <Claire.McPherson@gov.scot>; [REDACTED]; [REDACTED] >; [REDACTED] >; [REDACTED] >; [REDACTED] >; [REDACTED]; [REDACTED] >; [REDACTED] >; [REDACTED] >; [REDACTED]; [REDACTED] >; [REDACTED] >

**Cc:** Scott Wightman <Scott.Wightman@gov.scot>; Deputy Director European Relations <DeputyDirectorEuropeanRelations@gov.scot>; Dominic Munro <Dominic.Munro@gov.scot>; David Rogers <David.Rogers@gov.scot>; Constitutional Futures Division <ConstitutionalFuturesDivision@gov.scot>; Audrey MacDougall <Audrey.MacDougall@gov.scot>; [REDACTED] >; [REDACTED] >; [REDACTED] >; Gary Gillespie <Gary.Gillespie@gov.scot>; Kathy Johnston <Kathy.Johnston@gov.scot>; [REDACTED] >; Richard Rollison <Richard.Rollison@gov.scot>; [REDACTED] >; [REDACTED] Kersti Berge <Kersti.Berge@gov.scot>; David Barnes <David.Barnes@gov.scot>; Martin Johnson <Martin.Johnson@gov.scot>; Joni Smith <Joni.Smith@gov.scot>; John Webster <John.Webster@gov.scot>; [REDACTED]

**Subject:** Royal Society of Edinburgh - Scotland-Europe Initiative articles/blogs and Brigid Laffan / Stefaan De Rynck event

Hello,  
(copyees for interest / awareness plus event info)

## Articles / blogs related to RSE Scotland-Europe Initiative

You all have I think participated in one or other of the RSE Scotland-Europe roundtables running this year.

For information in case you have not seen, the RSE has updated their [Scotland-Europe initiative](#) webpage with a range of articles related to the topics of the workshops so far, including:

- Kirsty Hughes - [Free movement challenges at the Scotland-England border after independence](#)
- Katy Hayward - [GRACE: What an independent Scotland could learn from the Windsor Framework](#)

[REDACTED]

\*\*\*\*\*

[REDACTED]

Constitution, International and Migration Analysis | SG Central Analysis Division | Scottish Government | 2W St Andrew's House, Regent Road, Edinburgh, EH1 3DG | Tel[REDACTED]

## Item 8 –

**From:** [REDACTED]

**Sent:** Wednesday, September 6, 2023 2:15 PM

**To:** [REDACTED] >; [REDACTED] >; [REDACTED]; [REDACTED]; [REDACTED]

**Subject:** RE: Debate Closing Speech - Celebration of Food and Drink Sector's Resilience

Hi [REDACTED],

Here is the relevant section from paper 3 Q&A- colleagues might wish to condense/finesse?

Cheers

[REDACTED]

## **Borders**

### England is our biggest market; would independence damage our trading relationship?

The UK Government's decision to take Scotland out of the EU Single Market is damaging Scottish trade and the economy. The best thing for Scottish trade would independence and re-joining the EU. This will remove Brexit trade barriers with 27 countries and provide the ability to trade freely within a market seven times by population than the size of the UK.

For trade in Scottish manufactured goods, international markets are more significant than the UK. The most recent available data, for 2019, show that the value of Scotland's manufactured goods exports to the EU and the rest of the world was £19 billion, higher than the value of manufactured exports to the rest of the United Kingdom at £11 billion. This is why international markets are such critical trading relationships for Scotland.

Remember that Scotland is the rest of the UK's second biggest market. Exports from the rest of the UK to Scotland were worth £66bn in 2019. Of course, it would be in both sides' interests to make trade between Scotland and England as easy as possible, and the papers set out several pragmatic measures to facilitate trade between Scotland and the UK.

The paper also sets out that as Ireland diversified its trade into Europe its economy was transformed.

### Would we need to establish a hard border with England if we join the EU as you intend?

Under an arrangement called the Common Travel Area people would be able to move freely across the UK and Ireland as now. It is in all parties' interests for that to continue in the event of Scottish independence.

That also means businesses will have access to a talent pool drawn from 515 million people – the EU and UK. For a service-based economy, this is a major competitive advantage.

Depending on the relationship between the UK and EU, there would be checks on lorries – and the paper sets out the measures we would take to smooth that trade.

Fundamentally this comes down to whether or not we should remain tied to a poorly performing UK Brexit-based economic model or whether we should have control of economic powers inside the world's largest single market.

**From:** [REDACTED]

**Sent:** Wednesday, September 6, 2023 12:46 PM

**To:** [REDACTED] >; [REDACTED] [REDACTED] >

**Cc:** [REDACTED] >

**Subject:** RE: Debate Closing Speech - Celebration of Food and Drink Sector's Resilience

Hi [REDACTED],

No, I haven't seen any updates on paper 3 lines.

Cheers

[REDACTED]

**From:** [REDACTED],>  
**Sent:** Wednesday, September 6, 2023 12:13 PM  
**To:** [REDACTED],>; [REDACTED],>; [REDACTED],>  
**Cc:** [REDACTED],>  
**Subject:** FW: Debate Closing Speech - Celebration of Food and Drink Sector's Resilience

Hi [REDACTED],

I'm assuming that we don't have anything more recent on lines on borders checks than what was prepared for the economy paper. If that's the case, and [REDACTED],/ [REDACTED], please do jump in if you disagree and have more recent cleared lines, then please could you send some to Jamey as per the request below.

Many thanks,

[REDACTED],  
Head of Policy Development, International Futures | Directorate for External Affairs | Scottish Government |  
Mobile: [REDACTED],

**From:** Brian Dornan <Brian.Dornan@gov.scot>  
**Sent:** Wednesday, September 6, 2023 12:02 PM  
**To:** [REDACTED],>; [REDACTED],>  
**Cc:** [REDACTED],>  
**Subject:** RE: Debate Closing Speech - Celebration of Food and Drink Sector's Resilience

[REDACTED],,  
Might you be able to assist with some "if pressed" lines on border checks in the event of an independent Scotland in the EU?  
Many thanks,  
Brian

**From:** Kate Higgins <Kate.Higgins@gov.scot>  
**Sent:** Wednesday, September 6, 2023 11:45 AM  
**To:** [REDACTED]>  
**Cc:** [REDACTED]>  
**Subject:** RE: Debate Closing Speech - Celebration of Food and Drink Sector's Resilience

[REDACTED]

I think she might need lines in the speech on border controls if Scotland becomes independent – Brian Dornan and colleagues can probably help provide something she could say on that

**Item 9 –**

**From:** [REDACTED]  
**Sent:** Thursday, August 31, 2023 5:55 PM  
**To:** David Barnes <David.Barnes@gov.scot>; DG Economy <DGEconomy@gov.scot>;  
Richard Rollison <Richard.Rollison@gov.scot>

**Cc:** [REDACTED]>; [REDACTED]>  
**Subject:** RE: Building a New Scotland - [REDACTED]

Hi [REDACTED],

[REDACTED]

Kind Regards,

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

Head of International Trade Policy & Regulations  
**Directorate for International Trade and Investment**

M: [REDACTED]

I may respond at different times.

Don't feel obligated to read or respond to emails outside of your normal working hours.

**From:** David Barnes <David.Barnes@gov.scot>

**Sent:** Wednesday, August 30, 2023 4:51 PM

**To:** DG Economy <DGEconomy@gov.scot>; Richard Rollison <Richard.Rollison@gov.scot>

**Cc:** [REDACTED]>; [REDACTED]>; [REDACTED]>

**Subject:** RE: Building a New Scotland - [REDACTED]

Hi [REDACTED]

Fyi the reason Trade Policy is involved in this small (re)drafting group is that we own or have an interest in two of the three topics expected to attract most attention when this paper is published – border arrangements, and trade aspects of transitional arrangements.

David

David Barnes  
Deputy Director, Trade Policy  
Scottish Government  
Victoria Quay, Edinburgh EH6 6QQ  
Pronouns: he/him  
Tel (mobile) [REDACTED]