

Document 1

From: [redacted]

Sent: 12 October 2022 18:46

To: First Minister <firstminister@gov.scot>

Cc: Deputy First Minister and Cabinet Secretary for Covid Recovery <DFMCSCR@gov.scot>; Cabinet Secretary for Constitution, External Affairs and Culture <CabSecCEAC@gov.scot>; Rogers D (David) (Constitution and Cabinet Director) <David.Rogers@gov.scot>; Dornan B (Brian) <Brian.Dornan@gov.scot>; [redacted] ; [redacted]; [redacted]; Crawford E (Ewan) <Ewan.Crawford@gov.scot>; Lloyd E (Elizabeth) <Elizabeth.Lloyd@gov.scot>; McCaig C (Callum) <Callum.Mccaig@gov.scot>; Hynd JS (James) <James.Hynd@gov.scot>

Subject: OFFICIAL SENSITIVE - A Stronger Economy with Independence: draft response to comments from Mr Harvie and Ms Slater and copy of latest version of paper

Importance: High

First Minister

Copy: Deputy First Minister, Cabinet Secretary for Constitution and External Affairs

A Stronger Economy with Independence: comments from Mr Harvie and Ms Slater

[redacted]

Constitution and Cabinet Directorate

[redacted]

Attachment to document 1

[redacted]

[redacted]- Private Secretary to the Minister for Green Skills, Circular Economy and Biodiversity - Lorna Slater MSP

Scottish Government | St Andrew's House, Regent Road, Edinburgh EH1 3DG | Mob: [redacted]

Email: MinisterGSCEB@gov.scot

All e-mails and attachments sent by a Ministerial Private Office to any other official on behalf of a Minister relating to a decision, request or comment made by a Minister, or a note of a Ministerial meeting, must be filed appropriately by the recipient. Private Offices do not keep official records of such e-mails or attachments.

Scottish Ministers, special advisers and the Permanent Secretary are covered by the terms of the Lobbying (Scotland) Act 2016. See www.lobbying.scot



From: Cabinet Secretariat inbox <CabinetSecretariat3@gov.scot>

Sent: 06 October 2022 19:22

To: DL Cabinet Secretaries <DLMPOPCABSEC@gov.scot>; Minister for Zero Carbon Buildings, Active Travel and Tenants' Rights <MinisterZCBATTR@gov.scot>; Minister for Green Skills, Circular Economy and Biodiversity <MinisterGSCEB@gov.scot>

Cc: Barnes D (David) <David.Barnes@gov.scot>; Bartlett J (Janet) <Janet.Bartlett@gov.scot>; [redacted]; [redacted]; Berge K (Kersti) <Kersti.Berge@gov.scot>; [redacted]; Brannen R (Roy) <Roy.Brannen@transport.gov.scot>; [redacted]; [redacted]; Cabinet Secretariat inbox <CabinetSecretariat3@gov.scot>; [redacted]

; Corbett GN (Gavin) <Gavin.Corbett@gov.scot>; [redacted]; Crawford E (Ewan) <Ewan.Crawford@gov.scot>; [redacted]; Curtis PS (Penelope) <Penelope.Curtis@gov.scot>; DG Communities <DGCommunities@gov.scot>; DG Corporate <dgcorporate@gov.scot>; DG Economy <DGEconomy@gov.scot>; DG Education & Justice <dgej@gov.scot>; DG Health & Social Care <DGHSC@gov.scot>; DG Net Zero <DGNetZero@gov.scot>; DG Scottish Exchequer Mailbox <DGScottishExchequer@gov.scot>; DG Strategy and External Affairs <DGSEA@gov.scot>; Director for Fair Work, Employability and Skills <DirectorFWES@gov.scot>; Director of Advanced Learning and Science <DirectorofAdvancedLearningandScience@gov.scot>; Director of Culture and Major Events <Directorofcultureandmajorevents@gov.scot>; Director of Economic Development <DirectorDED@gov.scot>; Director of Fiscal Policy and Constitution <DirectorofFFPC@gov.scot>; Director of Tax and Revenues <directoroftaxandrevenues@gov.scot>; Dornan B (Brian) <Brian.Dornan@gov.scot>; Elsby M (Matthew) <Matthew.Elsby@gov.scot>; [redacted]; Fisher G (Graham) <Graham.Fisher@gov.scot>; Fraser L (Lesley) <Lesley.Fraser@gov.scot>; Gillespie G (Gary) <Gary.Gillespie@gov.scot>; Gray H (Helena) <Helena.Gray@gov.scot>; Griffin J (Joe) <Joe.Griffin@gov.scot>; Grisewood A (Aidan) <Aidan.Grisewood@gov.scot>; [redacted]; Huyton H (Harry) <Harry.Huyton@gov.scot>; Hynd JS (James) <James.Hynd@gov.scot>; Irvine A (Alison) <Alison.Irvine@gov.scot>; John-Paul Marks <John-Paul.Marks@gov.scot>; Johnston K (Kathy) <Kathy.Johnston@gov.scot>; Johnston P (Paul) <Paul.Johnston@gov.scot>; Lamb C (Caroline) <Caroline.Lamb@gov.scot>; Lloyd E (Elizabeth) <Elizabeth.Lloyd@gov.scot>; [redacted]; MacBean C (Colin) <Colin.MacBean@gov.scot>; Macdonald L (Louise) <Louise.Macdonald@gov.scot>; MacDougall A (Audrey) <Audrey.MacDougall@gov.scot>; McAllister C (Colin) <Colin.McAllister@gov.scot>; [redacted]; [redacted]; Mcguinness L (Lisa) <Lisa.Mcguinness@gov.scot>; [redacted]; Neill S (Sean) <Sean.Neill@gov.scot>; [redacted]; O'Carroll L (Lucy) <Lucy.O'carroll@gov.scot>; [redacted]; Pathirana S (Stephen) (Dr) <Stephen.Pathirana@gov.scot>; Permanent Secretary <PermanentSecretary@gov.scot>; Rennick NS (Neil) <Neil.Rennick@gov.scot>; Rogers D (David) (Constitution and Cabinet Director) <David.Rogers@gov.scot>; Rollison R (Richard) <Richard.Rollison@gov.scot>; Scott A (Andrew) Dr <Andrew.Scott2@gov.scot>; [redacted]; Stafford A (Alyson) <Alyson.Stafford@gov.scot>; [redacted]; Sunderland RE (Rachel) <Rachel.Sunderland@gov.scot>; Thomson KAL (Ken) (Director-General) <Ken.Thomson@gov.scot>; [redacted]; Wightman S (Scott) <Scott.Wightman@gov.scot>

Subject: [redacted]

Importance: High

[redacted]



[redacted]

Document 2

From: [redacted] **On Behalf Of** First Minister

Sent: 13 October 2022 15:14

To: Minister for Zero Carbon Buildings, Active Travel and Tenants' Rights
<MinisterZCBATTR@gov.scot>; Minister for Green Skills, Circular Economy and Biodiversity
<MinisterGSCEB@gov.scot>

Cc: First Minister <firstminister@gov.scot>; McAllister C (Colin) <Colin.McAllister@gov.scot>; Huyton H (Harry) <Harry.Huyton@gov.scot>; Corbett GN (Gavin) <Gavin.Corbett@gov.scot>; Deputy First Minister and Cabinet Secretary for Covid Recovery <DFMCSCR@gov.scot>; Cabinet Secretary for Net Zero, Energy and Transport <CabSecNetZET@gov.scot>; Matheson C (Catriona) <Catriona.Matheson@gov.scot>; McFarlane J (John) (Special Adviser) <John.McFarlane@gov.scot>; [redacted]; McCaig C (Callum) <Callum.Mccaig@gov.scot>; [redacted]; Rogers D (David) (Constitution and Cabinet Director) <David.Rogers@gov.scot>; Dornan B (Brian) <Brian.Dornan@gov.scot>; Crawford E (Ewan) <Ewan.Crawford@gov.scot>

Subject: OFFICIAL SENSITIVE - A Stronger Economy with Independence

PS/Minister for Zero Carbon Buildings, Active Travel and Tenants' Rights
PS/Minister for Green Skills, Circular Economy and Biodiversity

[redacted]

[redacted]

Senior Private Secretary to the First Minister

5th Floor | St Andrew's House | Regent Road | Edinburgh | EH1 3DG | **T:** [redacted] | **M:** [redacted]

Annex B

Section 29(1)(a) – formulation or development of government policy

An exemption under section 29(1)(a) of FOISA (formulation or development of government policy) applies to some of the information requested because it relates to the formulation of the Scottish Government's policy on the currency of an independent Scotland.

This exemption is subject to the 'public interest test'. Therefore, taking account of all the circumstances of this case, we have considered if the public interest in disclosing the information outweighs the public interest in applying the exemption. We have found that, on balance, the public interest lies in favour of upholding the exemption. We recognise that there is a public interest in disclosing information as part of open, transparent and accountable government, and to inform public debate. However, there is a greater public interest in high quality policy and decision-making, and in the properly considered implementation and development of policies and decisions. This means that Ministers and officials

Scottish Ministers, special advisers and the Permanent Secretary are covered by the terms of the Lobbying (Scotland) Act 2016. See www.lobbying.scot

need to be able to consider all available options and to debate those rigorously, to fully understand their possible implications. Their candour in doing so will be affected by their assessment of whether the discussions on the future currency of an independent Scotland will be disclosed in the near future, when it may undermine or constrain the Government's view on that policy while it is still under discussion and development.

Section 30(b)(ii) – free and frank exchange of views for the purposes of deliberation

An exemption under section 30(b)(ii) of FOISA (free and frank exchange of views) applies to some of the information requested. This exemption applies because disclosure would, or would be likely to, inhibit substantially the free and frank exchange of views for the purposes of deliberation. This exemption recognises the need for Ministers and officials to have a private space within which to discuss and explore options before the Scottish Government reaches a settled public view. Disclosing the content of free and frank discussions on the future currency of an independent Scotland will substantially inhibit such discussions in the future, particularly because these discussions are still ongoing and final decisions have not been taken, and these discussions relate to a sensitive or controversial issue such as Scotland's constitutional future.

Yours sincerely

Craig Connolly
CFD : Programme and Briefing

Scottish Ministers, special advisers and the Permanent Secretary are covered by the terms of the Lobbying (Scotland) Act 2016. See www.lobbying.scot

St Andrew's House, Regent Road, Edinburgh EH1 3DG
www.gov.scot



INVESTORS
IN PEOPLE

Accredited
Until 2020

