

Annex A

Item 1 – Email trail between Graeme Roy and [Redacted]

From: Graeme Roy <Graeme.Roy@glasgow.ac.uk>
Sent: Friday, February 11, 2022 5:37 PM
To: [Redacted]
Subject: RE: Paper

Great, thanks [Redacted]

I've got a chat with the Economic Observatory team on Monday so will share these ideas. And then get back to you on timings for the 25th.

Have a good weekend.

Best wishes,

Graeme

From: [Redacted]**Sent:** 11 February 2022 08:44
To: Graeme Roy <Graeme.Roy@glasgow.ac.uk>
Subject: RE: Paper

Thanks Graeme,

Will read with interest and, yep, let's keep in touch re. 25/4 – looking forward to it.

Will have a think over the weekend re. questions for the EO series but off the top of my head:

[Redacted]

Cheers

[Redacted]
From: Graeme Roy <Graeme.Roy@glasgow.ac.uk>
Sent: 10 February 2022 18:26
To: [Redacted]
Subject: Paper

[Redacted]
Good to catch-up earlier.

Here's the paper that I mentioned:
https://papers.ssrn.com/sol3/papers.cfm?abstract_id=4009410.

I'll liaise with the Obs about the 25th and get back to you.

Best wishes,

Graeme

Graeme Roy
Dean of External Engagement
College of Social Sciences
Email: graeme.roy@glasgow.ac.uk

Item 2 – Email trail between [Redacted] and Graeme Roy regarding the upcoming event on 25th April 2022

From: [Redacted]
Sent: Monday, March 14, 2022 8:30 AM
To: 'Graeme Roy' <Graeme.Roy@glasgow.ac.uk>
Subject: RE: 25th April

Hi Graeme,

Sorry for the delay in getting back to you – last week was completely lost to paper writing...

Thanks again for clearing this space in the day for us – hugely appreciated.

I'll speak to colleagues today re. roundtable or one-to-ones and get back to you asap.

Cheers,

[Redacted]
From: Graeme Roy <Graeme.Roy@glasgow.ac.uk>
Sent: 08 March 2022 13:11
To: [Redacted]
Subject: 25th April

Hi [Redacted]

Good to chat yesterday.

This is the round timeline for the event on the 25th. It's still subject to change.

As I mentioned the plan is to have lunch and then free up some time for a private conversation between academics and civil servants if helpful. In addition to these speakers we'll have the other Scottish-based participants in the series, e.g. Brad Mackay and Ewan Gibbs etc.

Happy to keep the format for that session up to you – either one-to-one chats or a roundtable with all/selection of participants.

Timetable:

09.30-10.00	Tea and coffee
10.00-10.10	Welcome Professor Anton Muscatelli (University of Glasgow)
10.10-11.00	Institutions, politics and borders Chair: TBC Professor Nicola McEwen (Centre on Constitutional Change) Dr Gemma Tetlow (The Institute for Government)
11.00-11.50	Monetary and fiscal issues Chair: Professor David Bell (University of Stirling) Professor Ronald MacDonald (University of Glasgow) Dr Eoin McLaughlin (University College Cork) David Phillips (Institute for Fiscal Studies)
11.50-12.00	Concluding remarks Professor Graeme Roy

Best wishes,

Graeme

Graeme Roy
Dean of External Engagement
College of Social Sciences
Email: graeme.roy@glasgow.ac.uk

Item 3 – Email trail between [Redacted] and Graeme Roy regarding the upcoming event on 25th April 2022

From: [Redacted]
Sent: Tuesday, April 19, 2022 7:48 AM
To: 'Graeme Roy' <Graeme.Roy@glasgow.ac.uk>
Subject: RE: Event on 25th April

Hi Graeme – yes, no problem at all – happy to do so.

Cheers

[Redacted]

From: Graeme Roy <Graeme.Roy@glasgow.ac.uk>

Sent: 18 April 2022 20:26

To: [Redacted]
Subject: RE: Event on 25th April

Hi [Redacted],

Hope that you had a good Easter.

A quick thing, I'll get the team to send you the final details of the event on the 25th (where to go, times etc.). Are you able to share that around the colleagues that you have indicated will be able to attend? (We probably don't have all their email addresses).

Best wishes,

Graeme

From: [Redacted]
Sent: 13 April 2022 15:39
To: Graeme Roy <Graeme.Roy@glasgow.ac.uk>
Subject: RE: Event on 25th April

☺ thanks!

From: Graeme Roy <Graeme.Roy@glasgow.ac.uk>
Sent: 13 April 2022 15:37
To: [Redacted]>
Subject: RE: Event on 25th April

[Redacted]
No problem.

Graeme

From: [Redacted]
Sent: 13 April 2022 15:06
To: Graeme Roy <Graeme.Roy@glasgow.ac.uk>
Subject: RE: Event on 25th April

[Redacted]
[Redacted]
From: Graeme Roy <Graeme.Roy@glasgow.ac.uk>
Sent: 13 April 2022 14:33
To: [Redacted]
Subject: RE: Event on 25th April

Hi [Redacted]

No worries at all. Will add him to the list.

Best wishes,

Graeme

From: [Redacted]
Sent: 13 April 2022 12:51
To: Graeme Roy <Graeme.Roy@glasgow.ac.uk>
Subject: RE: Event on 25th April

Hi Graeme,

Sorry for the late notice but could we possibly add [Redacted], OCEA to the list? Would be very useful for us to have someone else from OCEA at the discussion.

Cheers

[Redacted]

From: [Redacted]
Sent: 07 April 2022 08:01
To: Graeme Roy <Graeme.Roy@glasgow.ac.uk>
Subject: RE: Event on 25th April

Yep, sounds like a plan – thanks again for organising!

From: Graeme Roy <Graeme.Roy@glasgow.ac.uk>
Sent: 07 April 2022 08:00
To: [Redacted]
Subject: RE: Event on 25th April

Ok, sounds good.

7 is not a problem at all. We can keep the afternoon session very informal, chat over lunch etc. And see how it goes from there?

Graeme

From: [Redacted]
Sent: 07 April 2022 07:58
To: Graeme Roy <Graeme.Roy@glasgow.ac.uk>
Subject: RE: Event on 25th April

Hi Graeme,

At the moment I have 7 names including myself – are you able to accommodate that many?

- Myself and Brian Dornan – Constitutional Futures Division
- [Redacted] and Matt Elsby – Fiscal Policy and the Constitution
- Kathy Johnston – OCEA
- [Redacted] – Social Research

I've struggled to engage colleagues on their preferences re. roundtable or one-to-ones. In the circumstances I think a roundtable might be more useful?

Cheers,

[Redacted]

From: Graeme Roy <Graeme.Roy@glasgow.ac.uk>
Sent: 07 April 2022 07:50
To: [Redacted]
Subject: Event on 25th April

Hi [Redacted],

Hope you're well.

Here are the details for the public part of the event on the 25th April with the Economics Observatory. We're limiting places to 25.

Could you let me know how many people you think my attend? (I can add the names later, but just want to make sure that we have enough space for you and your colleagues). We'll then have a lunch with the smaller group afterwards.

Thanks,

Graeme

Graeme Roy
Dean of External Engagement
College of Social Sciences
Email: graeme.roy@glasgow.ac.uk

Item 4 – Email trail between [Redacted] and Graeme Roy regarding the upcoming event on 25th April 2022

From: Graeme Roy <Graeme.Roy@glasgow.ac.uk>
Sent: Thursday, April 21, 2022 8:15 AM

To: [Redacted]
Subject: RE: Monday details

Ok that sounds fine.

From our end, there will probably be around 8 academic participants. Plus [Redacted] from Eco Obs.

For lunch, I'll aim for it to be delivered by around 12.30 to give some time for a comfort break.

We can be flexible in how long we use it.

If we go for a roundtable might someone from SG want to just say a few words at the start about the work that's being done? I don't mean anything beyond what is in the public domain, but that might kick things off?

Best wishes,

Graeme

From: [Redacted]
Sent: 21 April 2022 07:59
To: Graeme Roy <Graeme.Roy@glasgow.ac.uk>
Subject: RE: Monday details

Thanks Graeme,

[Redacted]

So, can we plan for a roundtable but maybe revisit on the day depending on turnout? Hopefully discussion over lunch will provoke thoughts and questions for the roundtable. I haven't suggested precise times for lunch and roundtable but have indicated that we'll finish by 2.30pm. Does that sound ok?

Thanks again for organising – much appreciated,

[Redacted]

[Redacted]

/ Constitutional Futures Division / Scottish Government [Redacted]

From: Graeme Roy <Graeme.Roy@glasgow.ac.uk>
Sent: 20 April 2022 18:17
To: [Redacted]

Subject: Monday details

Hi [Redacted]

[Redacted] in the team will shortly be sending you over details (or already may have done so) of Monday's event.

We have tea and coffee from 9.30. Kick off at 10 with some remarks from Anton. And then we'll go straight through to 12.

That'll be the end of the public session and we'll have a short break. Plan would then be for SG folk and people from Eco Obs to meet back in the room for 12.15 or so for lunch.

How would you like that discussion to go? Would you like it to be an open roundtable for a bit or more informal 1-1 over lunch (or we could do both?) I think we can be relatively flexible with time too, so let me know when would be a good time for you to finish.

Best wishes,

Graeme

Graeme Roy
Dean of External Engagement
College of Social Sciences
Email: graeme.roy@glasgow.ac.uk

Item 6 – Email trail between [Redacted] and Graeme Roy regarding the upcoming event on 25th April 2022

From: Graeme Roy <Graeme.Roy@glasgow.ac.uk>
Sent: Thursday, April 21, 2022 3:29 PM
To: [Redacted] [Redacted]
Subject: RE: Constitutional Change in Scotland Roundtable joining instructions

Hi [Redacted]

Brian can use my room. It's in the same building and he'll not be disturbed.

No problem about the others, I'm sure we have them on the list. So if you could just share the joining details that would be great.

Best wishes,

Graeme

From: [Redacted]
Sent: 21 April 2022 15:17
To: [Redacted]
Cc: Graeme Roy <Graeme.Roy@glasgow.ac.uk>
Subject: RE: Constitutional Change in Scotland Roundtable joining instructions

Hi [Redacted] ,

Thanks for this – very helpful indeed. I'll forward to colleagues.

I think we had also indicated that Kathy Johnson and [Redacted] (both Office of the Chief Economic Adviser) would attend? If at all possible could we also add [Redacted] (both Constitutional Futures Division) to the list? Please let me know if this is ok.

Only one question to ask: Brian Dornan is still hoping to join us but now has to chair a 2 pm online meeting. Is there a quiet space he might be able to use between 2-3 pm?

Thanks again and look forward to meeting you on Monday,

[Redacted] [Redacted] **Constitutional Futures Division / Scottish Government**
/[Redacted]

From: [Redacted]
Sent: 21 April 2022 13:22
To: [Redacted]
Cc: Graeme Roy <Graeme.Roy@glasgow.ac.uk>
Subject: Constitutional Change in Scotland Roundtable joining instructions

Dear [Redacted]

We look forward to you and your colleagues joining us for our roundtable 'Constitutional Change in Scotland' taking place this Monday, 25th April from 10am – 12noon. Tea and coffee will be available at from 9.30am and as discussed with Graeme lunch will follow at 12.30pm.

The event is taking place in **lecture theatre 206, Adam Smith Business School**, in the University of Glasgow's main building. The attached map shows the room location. Most direct access is via the University Gatehouse entrance on University Avenue. Use the lift or stairs located to the right of the Gilchrist Café to reach level 2 and follow the signs for Room 206. If you have any problems finding the room please contact me on [Redacted] .

Along with yourself, we have a note that the following colleagues from your team are attending:-

- Brian Dornan
- [Redacted]

- [Redacted]
- Matt Elsby
- [Redacted]
- [Redacted]

Please can you forward this email to these colleagues and also **ask anyone with special dietary requirements to let me know by return.** Many thanks.

Covid 19 Guidelines for University buildings

In line with the Scottish government's announcement that there is no longer a requirement to wear face coverings in public places, face-coverings are not be required on University of Glasgow campuses. However the university encourages those on campus to wear face-coverings in indoor communal areas during times when they are particularly busy, for examples lecture change-over times or in café and hospitality settings during peak times. Face coverings are not be required to be worn during the roundtable event or within any of the adjoining rooms. We would also ask everyone to be sensitive to the needs of others who prefer to continue wearing face-coverings.

We look forward to meeting you on Monday!

Best wishes,

- [Redacted]

- [Redacted]

College of Social Sciences

- **Email:** [Redacted]

- [Redacted]

- **Item 7 – Email trail between [Redacted] and Graeme Roy regarding the upcoming event on 25th April 2022**

- **From:** [Redacted]

-

Sent: Tuesday, April 26, 2022 10:34 AM

To: Graeme Roy <Graeme.Roy@glasgow.ac.uk>; Elsby M (Matthew) <Matthew.Elsby@gov.scot>; [Redacted]

Subject: RE: Contact details

Hi Graeme,

Huge thanks for this and for arranging yesterday's session which everyone found tremendously useful.

I certainly intend chasing up a few issues and guessing others will do likewise.

Hope to catch up soon.

Thanks again,

[Redacted]

From: Graeme Roy <Graeme.Roy@glasgow.ac.uk>

Sent: 26 April 2022 09:07

To: [Redacted] >; Elsby M (Matthew) <Matthew.Elsby@gov.scot>; [Redacted] >

Subject: Contact details

Hi folks,

Thanks again for participating in the event yesterday. I hope that you found it useful, we certainly enjoyed the day.

I've attached the contact details of all who attended. As I mentioned they are happy for you to get in touch.

[Redacted]

Happy to pick up any of these discussions.

Best wishes,
Graeme

Professor Graeme Roy
Dean of External Engagement
College of Social Sciences
Email: graeme.roy@glasgow.ac.uk

**Item 8 – Email advising Mr Roy has been named in an FOI response –
November 2022**

From: [Redacted]

On Behalf Of Constitutional Futures

Sent: Thursday, November 17, 2022 2:53 PM

To: Graeme.Roy@glasgow.ac.uk

Subject: Freedom of Information request

Dear Professor Roy,

I am writing to advise you that the Scottish Government has received a request under the Freedom of Information (Scotland) Act 2002 (FOISA) for confirmation of any external engagement in relation to the Building a New Scotland paper, A stronger economy with independence.

You have an interest in the information which has been requested because you engaged with Scottish Government officials while policy development and paper drafting was underway.

Therefore, I am writing to advise you that your name has been included in the response to the FOISA request. We expect this to be issued in the coming days.

I should also explain that we can withhold information only if an exemption under FOISA applies to that information and, where applicable, the public interest in disclosure is not outweighed by the public interest in upholding the exemption. You can find detailed information about FOISA on our website at: <https://www.gov.scot/about/contact-information/how-to-request-information/> or on the Scottish Information Commissioner's website at: <https://www.itspublicknowledge.info/>.

Kind regards

[Redacted] Constitutional Futures Division
Constitution and Cabinet Directorate
The Scottish Government

Item 9 – Email advising Mr Roy has been named in an FOI response – July 2023

From: [Redacted] **On Behalf Of** Constitutional Futures
Sent: Thursday, July 13, 2023 9:40 AM
To: Graeme.roy@glasgow.ac.uk
Subject: Freedom of Information request

Good morning,

I am writing to advise you that the Scottish Government has received a request under the Freedom of Information (Scotland) Act 2002 (FOISA) for a list of names of any external individuals or organisations that members of staff working within the Constitutional Futures Division have met with since March 2021.

You have an interest in the information which has been requested because you have attended a meeting which included staff within the Constitutional Futures Division.

Therefore, I am writing to advise you that your name will be included in the list within the response to the FOISA request. We expect this to be issued in the coming days.

I should also explain that we can withhold information only if an exemption under FOISA applies to that information and, where applicable, the public interest in disclosure is not outweighed by the public interest in upholding the exemption. You can find detailed information about FOISA on our website at: <https://www.gov.scot/about/contact-information/how-to-request-information/> or on the Scottish Information Commissioner's website at: <https://www.itspublicknowledge.info/>.

Kind regards

[Redacted] Constitutional Futures Division
Directorate for Constitution
The Scottish Government
2W, St Andrew's House, Edinburgh, EH1 3DG

Annex B

Section 30(b)(ii) – Free and Frank Exchange of Views for the Purposes of Deliberation

An exemption under section 30(b)(ii) of FOISA (Free and Frank Exchange of Views) applies to some of the amount of the information requested. This exemption applies because disclosure would, or would be likely to, inhibit substantially the free and frank exchange of views for the purposes of deliberation. This exemption recognises the need for a private space to discuss and explore options with stakeholders. Disclosing the content of free and frank discussions will substantially inhibit such discussions in the future and may deter stakeholders from entering into discussions with the Scottish Government if they believe their comments will be published.

This exemption is subject to the 'public interest test'. Therefore, taking account of all the circumstances of this case, we have considered if the public interest in disclosing the information outweighs the public interest in applying the exemption. We have found that, on balance, the public interest lies in favour of upholding the exemption. We recognise that there is a public interest in disclosing information as part of open, transparent and accountable government, and to inform public debate. However, there is a greater public interest in allowing a private space within which to engage with stakeholders and external experts. This private thinking space is essential to enable all options to be properly considered, so that good policy decisions can be taken. Premature disclosure is likely to undermine the full and frank discussion of issues,

which in turn will undermine the quality of the policy making process, which would not be in the public interest.