

## Annex A

### Item 1 –

**From:** [Redacted]

**Sent:** 17 May 2022 11:03

**To:** [Redacted]

**Cc:** [Redacted] [Redacted] [Redacted] >

**Subject:** FW: Policy discussion with the First Minister - for the personal attention of Anton please

Dear [Redacted] ,

Thank you for getting in touch with the Principal- he has asked me to confirm his attendance at this meeting on Monday 30<sup>th</sup> May from 1-3pm.

I would be grateful if you could please let me know if there's anything he needs to bring and via which entrance he should arrive at Bute House.

With best wishes,

[Redacted]

[Redacted] **Government Relations Manager and Executive Officer to the Principal**

**Principal's Office**

University of Glasgow

Glasgow

G12 8QQ

Mobile: [Redacted]

Get in touch: [Redacted] | Follow us on Twitter: [@UofGGovRel](#)

Begin forwarded message:

**From:** [Redacted]

**Date:** 16 May 2022 at 17:36:45 BST

**To:** The Principal <[principal@glasgow.ac.uk](mailto:principal@glasgow.ac.uk)>

**Subject: Policy discussion with the First Minister - for the personal attention of Anton please**

Dear Anton

We caught up briefly last month at the – excellent – Economics Observatory session on the economics of independence at the university.

I am working in the team preparing the prospectus for independence. Later this month, we are running a policy deep dive session with the First Minister on monetary and fiscal matters in relation to the forthcoming prospectus. This will be an opportunity for the FM and some of her Cabinet colleagues to discuss and test key arguments and potential propositions in confidence with a small group. Also attending will be a small number of Scottish Government senior policy officials and special advisers. The meeting will be private.

This email is to ask if you would be able to join the discussion. We would very much value your input at this session, and would provide more information nearer the time on format etc. It is taking place on Monday 30 May from 1-3pm in Bute House, Edinburgh, and in person attendance would be required.

Very grateful if you could let me know your availability.

Regards,

[Redacted]

[Redacted]

**Constitution and Cabinet Directorate**

[Redacted]

## Item 2 –

**From:** [Redacted]

> **On Behalf Of** zzzCabinet Secretary for Constitution, External Affairs and Culture 2021 to 2023

**Sent:** Thursday, May 19, 2022 4:36 PM

**To:** principal@glasgow.ac.uk

**Cc:** zzzCabinet Secretary for Constitution, External Affairs and Culture 2021 to 2023  
<zzzCabSecCEAC@gov.scot>

**Subject:** Invitation to Policy Discussion

Dear Anton Muscatelli,

On behalf of the Cabinet Secretary for Constitution, External Affairs and Culture this is an invitation for you to attend a focused policy discussion about fiscal policy to test in detail the propositions in this area which are to be addressed in the updated prospectus for independence.

Your participation in this session is requested to provide background and views on fiscal policy to Ministers, alongside a small group of our internal senior policy officials and other external experts.

The session is proposed to take place on 30th May at 13:00 in Bute House. I would be grateful if you could confirm your availability to attend. Arrangements for reimbursement of travel or subsistence expenses can be made as required.

Should you have any questions please contact [Redacted]

Best wishes,

[Redacted]

[Redacted]

Assistant Private Secretary to Angus Robertson MSP, Cabinet Secretary for Constitution,  
External Affairs and Culture  
Ministerial Private Office  
St Andrews House  
Edinburgh

**Item 3 –**

**From:** Brian Dornan <Brian.Dornan@gov.scot>

**Sent:** Friday, May 27, 2022 4:07 PM

**To:** zzzFirst Minister 2021 to 2023 <zzzfirstminister@gov.scot>; zzzDeputy FM and CabSec for Covid Recovery 2021-2023 <zzzDFMCSCR@gov.scot>; zzzCabinet Secretary for Constitution, External Affairs and Culture 2021 to 2023 <zzzCabSecCEAC@gov.scot>; zzzCabinet Secretary for Finance and Economy 2021 to 2023 <zzzCabSecFE@gov.scot>; zzzzMinister for Culture, Europe and International Development and Minister with special responsibility for Refugees from Ukraine 2022 to 2023 <zzzzMinisterCEID@gov.scot>

**Cc:** Ewan Crawford <Ewan.Crawford@gov.scot>; Colin McAllister <Colin.McAllister@gov.scot>; Director of Fiscal Policy and Constitution <DirectorofFPC@gov.scot>; Matthew Elsby <Matthew.Elsby@gov.scot>; Gary Gillespie <Gary.Gillespie@gov.scot>; David Rogers <David.Rogers@gov.scot>; [Redacted]  
[Redacted]

**Subject:** OFFSEN - Prospectus Policy Session: currency and fiscal framework

PS/ First Minister

PS/ Deputy First Minister

PS/ Cabinet Secretary for Constitution, External Affairs and Culture

PS/ Cabinet Secretary for Finance and Economy

PS/ Minister for Culture, Europe and International Development and Minister with Special Responsibility for Refugees from Ukraine

Copy: as above

Please find attached briefing material for Monday's Prospectus Policy Session on currency and the fiscal framework.

Hard copies of this material will be available in Bute House on Monday and will be collected in at the end of the session. I would be grateful if colleagues did not retain or share these papers more widely as record management will be handled by CFD.

Many thanks,

Brian

**Brian Dornan** | Deputy Director Constitutional Futures | Directorate for Constitution and Cabinet | Scottish Government

**Mob:** [Redacted]

## Item 4 – Monetary policy papers from email in item 3

**This document is prepared for the purpose of formulating and developing government policy, and contains expressions of views and proposed policy positions and statements that are intended to inform deliberation.**

### **BRIEFING NOTE - CURRENCY**

#### **Purpose of the policy development session:**

- Offer expert advice and input to support Ministers' consideration of policy propositions;
- Present Ministers with the core propositions on each key area;
- Enable testing of the propositions;
- Identify actions for further development of the policy positions.

This section of the session considers issues around currency. The second part of the session will cover fiscal sustainability issues [Redacted]

The summary notes below have been prepared to guide the currency discussion. More detail can be provided in the discussion at the meeting.

#### **Context:**

[Redacted]

In 2014, the proposition was to retain Sterling in a formal currency union with the UK. The UK Government asserted at the time that it would not enter into such an arrangement, though the point was not of course tested in an actual negotiation.

The Sustainable Growth Commission report from 2018 recommended continued use of Sterling before moving to a new independent Scottish currency, once a set of tests had been met.

**The SG policy position is continued use of Sterling on independence, but with a commitment to establish a separate Scottish currency as soon as practicable.**

The SNP policy position is set out in more detail as follows:

*Among small successful independent countries there is no single approach to currency. Conference also notes the pound sterling is a shared currency across the UK and is available for Scotland to use, just as Ireland did for an extended period. However, conference believes it should be the policy of an SNP government in an independent Scotland to establish an independent currency, and agrees that the process and precise timetable for doing so should be subject to robust governance and guided by the six tests recommended by the SGC. During the period of transition to independence, work should begin on the establishment of an independent Scottish Central Bank with a Scottish Financial Authority, and the other steps required to support the establishment of a new currency. Until a new currency can be safely and securely established in the interests of the whole economy the currency of an independent Scotland should continue to be the pound sterling, ensuring continuity and stability for the Scottish people. Conference considers that an SNP Government should take the steps necessary to enable the Scottish Parliament to authorise the preparation of a Scottish currency as soon as practicable after a vote for independence with the aim that the currency be ready for introduction as soon as practicable after independence day.*

[Redacted]

[Redacted]

[Redacted]

[Redacted]

### Item 5 – Slides from the email in item 3

[Redacted]

### Item 6 - Slides from the email in item 3

[Redacted]

### Item 7 –

**From:** [Redacted] **On Behalf Of** Brian Dornan

**Sent:** Monday, October 17, 2022 12:12 PM

**To:** principal@glasgow.ac.uk

**Cc:** [Redacted]

**Subject:** Building a New Scotland - A stronger economy with independence

Dear Anton,

The third paper in the Independence Prospectus Series (*A stronger economy with independence*) has been launched today by the First Minister. The full paper and a summary are attached to this email, for your interests.

If you would like any further information, don't hesitate to get in contact.

Kind regards

Brian Dornan

**Brian Dornan** | Deputy Director Constitutional Futures | Directorate for Constitution and Cabinet | Scottish Government

### Item 8 - Full economy paper and summary relating to above email

[Building a New Scotland: A stronger economy with independence - gov.scot \(www.gov.scot\)](https://www.gov.scot/building-a-new-scotland-a-stronger-economy-with-independence)

[Building a New Scotland: A stronger economy with independence - summary - gov.scot \(www.gov.scot\)](https://www.gov.scot/building-a-new-scotland-a-stronger-economy-with-independence-summary)

**ATTACHMENTS REDACTED UNDER SECTION 25. COPIES OF PAPER 3 AND SUMMARY ARE AVAILABLE ONLINE**

**Item 9 –**

**From:** [Redacted] **On Behalf Of** Constitutional Futures

**Sent:** Thursday, July 13, 2023 9:29 AM

**To:** principal@glasgow.ac.uk

**Subject:** Freedom of Information request

Good morning,

I am writing to advise you that the Scottish Government has received a request under the Freedom of Information (Scotland) Act 2002 (FOISA) for a list of names of any external individuals or organisations that members of staff working within the Constitutional Futures Division have met with since March 2021.

You have an interest in the information which has been requested because you have attended a meeting which included staff within the Constitutional Futures Division.

Therefore, I am writing to advise you that your name will be included in the list within the response to the FOISA request. We expect this to be issued in the coming days.

I should also explain that we can withhold information only if an exemption under FOISA applies to that information and, where applicable, the public interest in disclosure is not outweighed by the public interest in upholding the exemption. You can find detailed information about FOISA on our website at: <https://www.gov.scot/about/contact-information/how-to-request-information/> or on the Scottish Information Commissioner's website at: <https://www.itspublicknowledge.info/>.

Kind regards

[Redacted]

Constitutional Futures Division

Directorate for Constitution

The Scottish Government

2W, St Andrew's House, Edinburgh, EH1 3DG

## **Annex B**

### **Section 29(1)(a) – Formulation or Development of Government Policy**

An exemption under Section 29(1)(a) of FOISA (Formulation or Development of Government Policy) applies to some of the information requested because it relates to the formulation of the Scottish Government's policy on future fiscal policy for an independent Scotland.

This exemption is subject to the 'public interest test'. Therefore, taking account of all the circumstances of this case, we have considered if the public interest in disclosing the information outweighs the public interest in applying the exemption. We have found that, on balance, the public interest lies in favour of upholding the exemption. We recognise that there is a public interest in disclosing information as part of open, transparent and accountable government, and to inform public debate. However, there is a greater public interest in high quality policy and decision-making, and in the properly considered implementation and development of policies and decisions. This means that Ministers and officials need to be able to consider all available options and to debate those rigorously, to fully understand their possible implications. Their candour in doing so will be affected by their assessment of whether the discussions on future fiscal policy for an independent Scotland will be disclosed in the near future, when it may undermine or constrain the Government's view on that policy while it is still under discussion and development.

### **Section 30(b)(i) – free and frank provision of advice**

An exemption under section 30(b)(i) of FOISA (free and frank provision of advice) applies to some of the information requested. This exemption applies because disclosure would, or would be likely to, inhibit substantially the free and frank provision of advice.

This exemption recognises the need to have a private space within which to provide free and frank advice to Ministers before the Scottish Government reaches a settled public view. Disclosing the content of free and frank advice will substantially inhibit the provision of such advice in the future.

This exemption is subject to the 'public interest test'. Therefore, taking account of all the circumstances of this case, we have considered if the public interest in disclosing the information outweighs the public interest in applying the exemption. We have found that, on balance, the public interest lies in favour of upholding the exemption. We recognise that there is a public interest in disclosing information as part of open, transparent and accountable government, and to inform public debate. However, there is a greater public interest in allowing a private space within which Scottish Government staff can provide full and frank advice to Ministers until the Government as a whole can adopt a policy that is sound and likely to be effective. This private thinking space is essential to enable all options to be properly considered, based on the best available advice, so that good policy decisions can be taken. Premature disclosure is likely to undermine the full and frank discussion of issues between Ministers and officials, which in turn will undermine the quality of the policy making process, which would not be in the public interest.

### **Section 30(c) (Prejudice to the Effective Conduct of Public Affairs)**

The reason why this exemption applies is because releasing draft plans for and content of Scottish Government publications, which do not reflect final decisions taken, would result in inaccurate information on the Scottish Government's proposals for an independent Scotland

being published, thereby undermining the Scottish Government's ability to effectively and accurately engage and communicate with the public.

This in turn would be likely to impair the Government's ability to take forward its work on policy development for an independent Scotland. This would constitute substantial prejudice to the effective conduct of public affairs in terms of the exemption.

This exemption is subject to the 'public interest test'. Therefore, taking account of all the circumstances of this case, we have considered if the public interest in disclosing the information outweighs the public interest in applying the exemption. We have found that, on balance, the public interest lies in favour of upholding the exemption. We recognise that there is a public interest in disclosing information as part of open, transparent and accountable government, and to inform public debate. However, there is a greater public interest in enabling the Scottish Government to effectively and accurately engage and communicate with the public on its proposals for an independent Scotland without the risk of these proposals being prejudiced by inaccurate information, which doesn't reflect final decisions taken, being released while the Scottish Government's work was still under development on a matter of significant political relevance and controversy.

### **Section 38(i)(b) - Personal Information**

An exemption under section s.38(1)(b) of FOISA (Personal Information) applies to a small amount of the information you have requested because it is the personal data of a third party, i.e. names and contact details of individuals (including civil servants below SCS), and disclosing it would contravene the data protection principles in Article 5(1) of the General Data Protection Regulation and in section 34(1) of the Data Protection Act 2018. This exemption is not subject to the 'public interest test', so we are not required to consider if the public interest in disclosing the information outweighs the public interest in applying the exemption.