

Item 1 (Please note this concerns the meeting which took place on 30 May 2022):

From: [Redacted] On Behalf Of zzzCabinet Secretary for Constitution, External Affairs and Culture 2021 to 2023

Sent: Friday, April 29, 2022 11:11 AM

To: [Redacted]

Cc: zzzCabinet Secretary for Constitution, External Affairs and Culture 2021 to 2023 <zzzCabSecCEAC@gov.scot>; [Redacted]

Subject: Invitation - Policy Session

Dear Gregor Irwin,

On behalf of the Cabinet Secretary for Constitution, External Affairs and Culture this is an invitation for you to attend a focused policy discussion about currency to test in detail the propositions in this area which are to be addressed in the updated prospectus for independence.

Your participation in this session is requested to provide background and views on currency to Ministers, alongside a small group of our internal senior policy officials and other external experts.

The session is proposed to take place on May 9th at 14:00 in Bute House. I would be grateful if you could confirm your availability to attend. Arrangements for reimbursement of travel or subsistence expenses can be made as required.

Should you have any questions please contact [Redacted]

Best wishes,

[Redacted]

Assistant Private Secretary to Angus Robertson MSP, Cabinet Secretary for Constitution, External Affairs and Culture
Ministerial Private Office
St Andrews House
Edinburgh

cabsecCEAC@gov.scot | www.gov.scot |

Scottish Ministers, Special Advisers and the Permanent Secretary are covered by the terms of the Lobbying (Scotland) Act 2016. See www.lobbying.scot.

Item 2:

From: Brian Dornan [Redacted]

Sent: Friday, May 27, 2022 4:07 PM

To: zzzFirst Minister 2021 to 2023 <zzzfirstminister@gov.scot>; zzzDeputy FM and CabSec for Covid Recovery 2021-2023 <zzzDFMCSCR@gov.scot>; zzzCabinet Secretary for Constitution, External Affairs and Culture 2021 to 2023 <zzzCabSecCEAC@gov.scot>; zzzCabinet Secretary for Finance and Economy 2021 to 2023 <zzzCabSecFE@gov.scot>; zzzMinister for Culture, Europe and International Development and Minister with special

responsibility for Refugees from Ukraine 2022 to 2023 <zzzzMinisterCEID@gov.scot>
Cc: Ewan Crawford [Redacted]; Colin McAllister [Redacted]; Director of Fiscal Policy and
Constitution [Redacted]; Matthew Elsby [Redacted]; Gary Gillespie [Redacted]; David
Rogers [Redacted]; [Redacted]
Subject: OFFSEN - Prospectus Policy Session: currency and fiscal framework

PS/ First Minister
PS/ Deputy First Minister
PS/ Cabinet Secretary for Constitution, External Affairs and Culture
PS/ Cabinet Secretary for Finance and Economy
PS/ Minister for Culture, Europe and International Development and Minister with Special
Responsibility for Refugees from Ukraine

Copy: as above

Please find attached briefing material for Monday's Prospectus Policy Session on currency
and the fiscal framework.

Hard copies of this material will be available in Bute House on Monday and will be collected
in at the end of the session. I would be grateful if colleagues did not retain or share these
papers more widely as record management will be handled by CFD.

Many thanks,

Brian

Brian Dornan | Deputy Director Constitutional Futures | Directorate for Constitution and
Cabinet | Scottish Government

Mob: [Redacted]



Item 2, attachment 1:

This document is prepared for the purpose of formulating and developing government policy, and contains expressions of views and proposed policy positions and statements that are intended to inform deliberation.

BRIEFING NOTE - CURRENCY

Purpose of the policy development session:

- Offer expert advice and input to support Ministers' consideration of policy propositions;
- Present Ministers with the core propositions on each key area;
- Enable testing of the propositions;
- Identify actions for further development of the policy positions.

This section of the session considers issues around currency. The second part of the session will cover fiscal sustainability issues [Redacted]

The summary notes below have been prepared to guide the currency discussion. More detail can be provided in the discussion at the meeting.

Context:

[Redacted]

In 2014, the proposition was to retain Sterling in a formal currency union with the UK. The UK Government asserted at the time that it would not enter into such an arrangement, though the point was not of course tested in an actual negotiation.

The Sustainable Growth Commission report from 2018 recommended continued use of Sterling before moving to a new independent Scottish currency, once a set of tests had been met.

The SG policy position is continued use of Sterling on independence, but with a commitment to establish a separate Scottish currency as soon as practicable.

The SNP policy position is set out in more detail as follows:

Among small successful independent countries there is no single approach to currency. Conference also notes the pound sterling is a shared currency across the UK and is available for Scotland to use, just as Ireland did for an extended period. However, conference believes it should be the policy of an SNP government in an independent Scotland to establish an independent currency, and agrees that the process and precise timetable for doing so should be subject to robust governance and guided by the six tests recommended by the SGC. During the period of transition to independence, work should begin on the establishment of an independent Scottish Central Bank with a Scottish Financial Authority, and the other steps required to support the establishment of a new currency. Until a new currency can be safely and securely established in the interests of the whole economy the currency of an independent Scotland should continue to be the pound sterling, ensuring continuity and stability for the Scottish people. Conference considers that an SNP Government should take the steps necessary to enable the Scottish Parliament to authorise the preparation of a Scottish currency as soon as practicable after a vote for independence with the aim that the currency be ready for introduction as soon as practicable after independence day.

[Redacted]

Item 2, Attachment 2:

Fiscal Policy –Prospectus Session

30 May 2022

DRAFT

This document is prepared for the purpose of formulating and developing government policy, and contains expressions of views and proposed policy positions and statements that are intended to inform deliberation.

[Redacted]

Item 2, Attachment 3:

Monetary Policy –Prospectus Session
Office of the Chief Economic Adviser
23 May 2022

This document is prepared for the purpose of formulating and developing government policy, and contains expressions of views and proposed policy positions and statements that are intended to inform deliberation.

2014

- Continued use of Sterling in a Formal Currency Union with the rest of the UK. Recommended by the Fiscal Commission Working Group in 2013.

2018 Sustainable Growth Commission

- Continued use of the pound in a Informal Currency Union with the rest of the UK (also known as Sterlingisation) with a move to an independent Scottish currency at such a time as considered appropriate for the Scottish economy.

[Redacted]

Item 1:

From: [Redacted]
Sent: Thursday, February 3, 2022 4:43 PM
To: 'Gregor Irwin' [Redacted]
Subject: RE: Scottish Government - economics of independence

Great – thanks Gregor

From: Gregor Irwin [Redacted]
Sent: 03 February 2022 16:25
To: [Redacted]
Subject: RE: Scottish Government - economics of independence

Perfect. Have sent you a zoom link. Just let me know if that is not suitable for any reason.

From: [Redacted]
Sent: 03 February 2022 16:20
To: Gregor Irwin [Redacted]
Subject: RE: Scottish Government - economics of independence

Thanks Gregor – I could do 11.00 -11.30 tomorrow?
[Redacted]

From: Gregor Irwin [Redacted]
Sent: 03 February 2022 16:02
To: [Redacted]
Subject: RE: Scottish Government - economics of independence

[Redacted]

Very happy to help. Tomorrow is quite clear for me. Next week is looking quite tricky, at least Monday to Wednesday, but I can always find time for a call. Just let me know when suits.

Best regards,

Gregor.

From: [Redacted]
Sent: 03 February 2022 15:15
To: Gregor Irwin [Redacted]
Subject: Scottish Government - economics of independence

Dear Gregor,

Ewan Crawford, Special Advisor, Scottish Government gave me your contact details and suggested you would be comfortable with me getting in touch.

I recently started a new post in Constitutional Futures Division, SG, helping to write/coordinate [Redacted]

Would you be available for a brief chat sometime soon? It would be really helpful to get your perspective and to discuss ways in which you might be able to engage with this work.

Look forward to hearing from you.

Best wishes,

[Redacted]

[Redacted]/ Constitutional Futures Division / Scottish Government / [Redacted]

This e-mail (and any files or other attachments transmitted with it) is intended solely for the attention of the addressee(s). Unauthorised use, disclosure, storage, copying or distribution of any part of this e-mail is not permitted. If you are not the intended recipient please destroy the email, remove any copies from your system and inform the sender immediately by return.

Communications with the Scottish Government may be monitored or recorded in order to secure the effective operation of the system and for other lawful purposes. The views or opinions contained within this e-mail may not necessarily reflect those of the Scottish Government.

Disclaimer. This email and any attachments to it may be confidential and are intended solely for the use of the individual to whom it is addressed. Any views or opinions expressed are solely those of the author and do not necessarily represent those of Global Counsel. If you are not the intended recipient of this email, you must neither take any action based upon its contents, nor copy or show it to anyone. Please contact the sender if you believe you have received this email in error. This email and its content are copyright © of Global Counsel and protected under UK and international law. All rights reserved. For the definition of Global Counsel please visit: <https://www.global-counsel.com/disclaimer>

Disclaimer. This email and any attachments to it may be confidential and are intended solely for the use of the individual to whom it is addressed. Any views or opinions expressed are solely those of the author and do not necessarily represent those of Global Counsel. If you are not the intended recipient of this email, you must neither take any action based upon its contents, nor copy or show it to anyone. Please contact the sender if you believe you have received this email in error. This email and its content are copyright © of Global Counsel and protected under UK and international law. All rights reserved. For the definition of Global Counsel please visit: <https://www.global-counsel.com/disclaimer>

Item 2 (Please note this concerns the meeting which took place on 30 May 2022):

From: Gregor Irwin [Redacted]

Sent: Wednesday, May 4, 2022 3:40 PM

To: [Redacted]

Subject: RE: Currency discussion with Ministers - 9 May

[Redacted]

That date works fine. Many thanks,

Gregor.

From: [Redacted]
Sent: 04 May 2022 15:37
To: Gregor Irwin [Redacted]
Subject: Currency discussion with Ministers - 9 May

Good afternoon,

As you will be aware, you have been invited to attend a session with Ministers at 2pm on Monday, 9 May. Due to unexpected demands on the First Minister's time, we are now required to reschedule the session for a later date. Please accept our apologies for this.

We are hoping to reschedule the session for 2-4pm on Monday, 23 May. As before, the location is Bute House.

I would be grateful if you could confirm whether this alternative date is suitable at your earliest convenience.

Kind regards,
[Redacted]

[Redacted]
Constitutional Futures Division
Constitution and Cabinet Directorate
The Scottish Government
2W, St Andrew's House, Edinburgh, EH1 3DG

This e-mail (and any files or other attachments transmitted with it) is intended solely for the attention of the addressee(s). Unauthorised use, disclosure, storage, copying or distribution of any part of this e-mail is not permitted. If you are not the intended recipient please destroy the email, remove any copies from your system and inform the sender immediately by return.

Communications with the Scottish Government may be monitored or recorded in order to secure the effective operation of the system and for other lawful purposes. The views or opinions contained within this e-mail may not necessarily reflect those of the Scottish Government.

Disclaimer. This email and any attachments to it may be confidential and are intended solely for the use of the individual to whom it is addressed. Any views or opinions expressed are solely those of the author and do not necessarily represent those of Global Counsel. If you are not the intended recipient of this email, you must neither take any action based upon its contents, nor copy or show it to anyone. Please contact the sender if you believe you have received this email in error. This email and its content are copyright © of Global Counsel and protected under UK and international law. All rights reserved. For the definition of Global Counsel please visit: <https://www.global-counsel.com/disclaimer>

Item 3:

From: [Redacted]
Sent: Tuesday, July 12, 2022 9:36 AM
To: Gregor Irwin [Redacted]
Cc: [Redacted]
Subject: RE: catch-up

Thanks Gregor – I'll send you a Teams invite for 3 - 3.30 pm on Thursday?
[Redacted]

From: Gregor Irwin [Redacted]
Sent: 12 July 2022 09:28
To: [Redacted]
Cc: [Redacted]
Subject: RE: catch-up

[Redacted]

I'd be very happy to help on this. Probably best if I take a day to mull it over. Would Thursday afternoon suit you? Any time except 2:30-3pm works for me.

Gregor.

From: [Redacted]
Sent: 12 July 2022 09:20
To: Gregor Irwin [Redacted]
Cc: [Redacted]
Subject: catch-up

Hi Gregor,

We spoke some months ago about the work I'm co-ordinating to develop the Scottish Government's economic case for independence.

[Redacted]

It would be fantastic if you could find a few minutes so I can pick your brains about this?

I'm around all this week before heading off on a fortnight's leave.

Best wishes,

[Redacted]
[Redacted] / Constitutional Futures Division / Scottish Government / [Redacted]

This e-mail (and any files or other attachments transmitted with it) is intended solely for the attention of the addressee(s). Unauthorised use, disclosure, storage, copying or distribution of any part of this e-mail is not permitted. If you are not the intended recipient please destroy the email, remove any copies from your system and inform the sender immediately by return.

Communications with the Scottish Government may be monitored or recorded in order to secure the effective operation of the system and for other lawful purposes. The views or opinions contained within this e-mail may not necessarily reflect those of the Scottish Government.

Disclaimer. This email and any attachments to it may be confidential and are intended solely for the use of the individual to whom it is addressed. Any views or opinions expressed are solely those of the author and do not necessarily represent those of Global Counsel. If you are not the intended recipient of this email, you must neither take any action based upon its contents, nor copy or show it to anyone. Please contact the sender if you believe you have received this email in error. This email and its content are copyright © of Global Counsel and protected under UK and international law. All rights reserved. For the definition of Global Counsel please visit: <https://www.global-counsel.com/disclaimer>

Item 4:

From: [Redacted]
Sent: Thursday, July 14, 2022 1:17 PM
To: Gregor Irwin [Redacted]
Cc: [Redacted]
Subject: RE: catch-up

Thanks Gregor – look forward to discussing at 3.

Cheers

[Redacted]

From: Gregor Irwin [Redacted]
Sent: 14 July 2022 11:45
To: [Redacted]
Cc: [Redacted]
Subject: RE: catch-up

[Redacted]

[Redacted]

Looking forward to speaking at 3pm. [Redacted]

Gregor.

Item 5:

From: [Redacted]
Sent: Monday, August 1, 2022 11:48 AM
To: 'Gregor Irwin' [Redacted]
Subject: RE: In confidence

Hi Gregor,

Sorry, neglected to tell you that I was away for the last fortnight in August! Back in the office today and, as you can imagine, dealing with a very full inbox.

Huge thanks for taking the time to respond so comprehensively – your comments are very fair and helpful.

Might get back to you on some specifics **[Redacted]**. Hopefully some of these will be covered in the meeting that I see has been arranged for this afternoon.

Thanks again,

[Redacted]
[Redacted]/ Constitutional Futures Division / Scottish Government / **[Redacted]**

From: Gregor Irwin **[Redacted]**
Sent: 31 July 2022 14:01
To: **[Redacted]**
Cc: Crawford E (Ewan) **[Redacted]**; **[Redacted]**
Subject: RE: In confidence

A few additional thoughts on **[Redacted]** below, with a consolidated set of comments on the full paper in the attachment.

[Redacted]

From: Gregor Irwin
Sent: 25 July 2022 07:39
To: **[Redacted]**
Cc: **[Redacted]**; **[Redacted]**
Subject: RE: In confidence

Thanks for the opportunity to comment on this. I've been on leave, so it has taken me a little longer to get back to you, but I've now been through **[Redacted]**

[Redacted]

Best,

Gregor.

From: **[Redacted]**
Sent: 15 July 2022 16:26
To: Gregor Irwin **[Redacted]**
Cc: **[Redacted]**; **[Redacted]**
Subject: In confidence

Hi Gregor,

Thanks again for taking the time to chat yesterday.

[Redacted]

Very interested in your views if you manage to find time to have a look.

Best wishes,

[Redacted]
[Redacted] / Constitutional Futures Division / Scottish Government / [Redacted]

This e-mail (and any files or other attachments transmitted with it) is intended solely for the attention of the addressee(s). Unauthorised use, disclosure, storage, copying or distribution of any part of this e-mail is not permitted. If you are not the intended recipient please destroy the email, remove any copies from your system and inform the sender immediately by return.

Communications with the Scottish Government may be monitored or recorded in order to secure the effective operation of the system and for other lawful purposes. The views or opinions contained within this e-mail may not necessarily reflect those of the Scottish Government.

Disclaimer. This email and any attachments to it may be confidential and are intended solely for the use of the individual to whom it is addressed. Any views or opinions expressed are solely those of the author and do not necessarily represent those of Global Counsel. If you are not the intended recipient of this email, you must neither take any action based upon its contents, nor copy or show it to anyone. Please contact the sender if you believe you have received this email in error. This email and its content are copyright © of Global Counsel and protected under UK and international law. All rights reserved. For the definition of Global Counsel please visit: <https://www.global-counsel.com/disclaimer>

Item 6:

From: [Redacted]
Sent: Wednesday, August 17, 2022 8:25 AM
To: 'Gregor Irwin' [Redacted]
Subject: RE: Revised draft

Tremendously helpful – thanks again Gregor!

Will keep you in touch with developments.

Best wishes,

[Redacted]

From: Gregor Irwin [Redacted]
Sent: 16 August 2022 19:32
To: [Redacted]
Cc: Crawford E (Ewan) [Redacted]; Gillespie G (Gary) [Redacted]; O'Carroll L (Lucy)

[Redacted]
Subject: RE: Revised draft

Thank you for the opportunity to comment once more. **[Redacted]**

[Redacted]

Hope this helps!

From: **[Redacted]**
Sent: 15 August 2022 11:20
To: Gregor Irwin **[Redacted]**
Cc: **[Redacted]**
Subject: Revised draft

Hi Gregor,

[Redacted]

Best wishes,

[Redacted]
[Redacted] / Constitutional Futures Division / Scottish Government / **[Redacted]**

This e-mail (and any files or other attachments transmitted with it) is intended solely for the attention of the addressee(s). Unauthorised use, disclosure, storage, copying or distribution of any part of this e-mail is not permitted. If you are not the intended recipient please destroy the email, remove any copies from your system and inform the sender immediately by return.

Communications with the Scottish Government may be monitored or recorded in order to secure the effective operation of the system and for other lawful purposes. The views or opinions contained within this e-mail may not necessarily reflect those of the Scottish Government.

Disclaimer. This email and any attachments to it may be confidential and are intended solely for the use of the individual to whom it is addressed. Any views or opinions expressed are solely those of the author and do not necessarily represent those of Global Counsel. If you are not the intended recipient of this email, you must neither take any action based upon its contents, nor copy or show it to anyone. Please contact the sender if you believe you have received this email in error. This email and its content are copyright © of Global Counsel and protected under UK and international law. All rights reserved. For the definition of Global Counsel please visit: <https://www.global-counsel.com/disclaimer>

Item 7 - (Please note the attachments being referred to can be found at www.gov.scot/newscotland):

From: **[Redacted]** On Behalf Of Brian Dornan
Sent: Monday, October 17, 2022 12:12 PM
To: **[Redacted]**

St Andrew's House, Regent Road, Edinburgh EH1 3DG
www.gov.scot



Cc: [Redacted]

Subject: Building a New Scotland - A stronger economy with independence

Dear Gregor,

The third paper in the Independence Prospectus Series (*A stronger economy with independence*) has been launched today by the First Minister. The full paper and a summary are attached to this email, for your interests.

If you would like any further information, don't hesitate to get in contact.

Kind regards

Brian Dornan

Brian Dornan | Deputy Director Constitutional Futures | Directorate for Constitution and Cabinet | Scottish Government

[Redacted]



Item 8:

From: [Redacted]

Sent: Monday, June 12, 2023 4:34 PM

To: DG Economy <DGEconomy@gov.scot>; Gary Gillespie [Redacted]

Cc: Brian Dornan [Redacted]; Dominic Munro [Redacted]; Ewan Crawford [Redacted]; [Redacted]; [Redacted]

Subject: Building a New Scotland: [Redacted]

Gregor, Gary,

In advance of our discussion (hopefully tomorrow but, as things stand we might be looking for another time), thought it might be helpful to share this [Redacted]

More than happy to talk this through when we meet.

Best wishes,

[Redacted]

[Redacted] / Constitutional Futures Division / Scottish Government / [Redacted]

Item 9:

From: Gregor Irwin [Redacted]

Sent: Wednesday, June 21, 2023 11:08 AM

To: [Redacted]

Cc: Brian Dornan [Redacted]; Kathy Johnston [Redacted]; [Redacted]; [Redacted]; Gary

Gillespie [Redacted]
Subject: RE: Independence prospectus [Redacted]

Ok, got it. No problem. Let's do that.

From: [Redacted]
Sent: Wednesday, June 21, 2023 10:26 AM
To: Gregor Irwin [Redacted]
Cc: Brian Dornan [Redacted]; Kathy Johnston [Redacted]; [Redacted] ; [Redacted]; Gary Gillespie [Redacted]
Subject: RE: Independence prospectus [Redacted]

Thanks Gregor,

[Redacted]

Thanks again for your support on this.

[Redacted]
[Redacted]/ Constitutional Futures Division / Scottish Government / [Redacted]

From: Gregor Irwin [Redacted]
Sent: Tuesday, June 20, 2023 5:31 PM
To: [Redacted]
Cc: Brian Dornan [Redacted]; Kathy Johnston [Redacted]; [Redacted]; [Redacted]; Gary Gillespie [Redacted]
Subject: RE: Independence prospectus [Redacted]

This looks good. Happy to support.

[Redacted]

From: [Redacted]
Sent: Monday, June 19, 2023 2:53 PM
To: Gregor Irwin [Redacted]
Cc: Brian Dornan [Redacted]; Kathy Johnston [Redacted]; [Redacted]; [Redacted]
Subject: Independence prospectus - [Redacted]

Hi Gregor,

Thanks for taking the time to discuss our proposals last week.

[Redacted]

Happy to discuss as always.

Best wishes,

[Redacted]
[Redacted]/ Constitutional Futures Division / Scottish Government / [Redacted]

Item 10:

St Andrew's House, Regent Road, Edinburgh EH1 3DG
www.gov.scot



From: [Redacted] On Behalf Of Constitutional Futures
Sent: Thursday, July 13, 2023 9:25 AM
To: [Redacted]
Subject: Freedom of Information request

Good morning,

I am writing to advise you that the Scottish Government has received a request under the Freedom of Information (Scotland) Act 2002 (FOISA) for a list of names of any external individuals or organisations that members of staff working within the Constitutional Futures Division have met with since March 2021.

You have an interest in the information which has been requested because you have attended a meeting which included staff within the Constitutional Futures Division.

Therefore, I am writing to advise you that your name will be included in the list within the response to the FOISA request. We expect this to be issued in the coming days.

I should also explain that we can withhold information only if an exemption under FOISA applies to that information and, where applicable, the public interest in disclosure is not outweighed by the public interest in upholding the exemption. You can find detailed information about FOISA on our website at: <https://www.gov.scot/about/contact-information/how-to-request-information/> or on the Scottish Information Commissioner's website at: <https://www.itspublicknowledge.info/>.

Kind regards

[Redacted]
Constitutional Futures Division
Directorate for Constitution
The Scottish Government
2W, St Andrew's House, Edinburgh, EH1 3DG

REASONS FOR NOT PROVIDING INFORMATION

Section 29(1)(a) – Formulation or Development of Government Policy

An exemption under Section 29(1)(a) of FOISA (Formulation or Development of Government Policy) applies to some of the information requested because it relates to the formulation of the Scottish Government’s policy on independence.

This exemption is subject to the ‘public interest test’. Therefore, taking account of all the circumstances of this case, we have considered if the public interest in disclosing the information outweighs the public interest in applying the exemption. We have found that, on balance, the public interest lies in favour of upholding the exemption. We recognise that there is a public interest in disclosing information as part of open, transparent and accountable government, and to inform public debate. However, there is a greater public interest in high quality policy and decision-making, and in the properly considered implementation and development of policies and decisions. This means that Ministers and officials need to be able to consider all available options and to debate those rigorously, to fully understand their possible implications. Their candour in doing so will be affected by their assessment of whether the discussions on policy development for an independent Scotland will be disclosed in the near future, when it may undermine or constrain the Government’s view on that policy while it is still under discussion and development.

Section 30(b)(i) – free and frank provision of advice

An exemption under section 30(b)(i) of FOISA (free and frank provision of advice) applies to some of the information requested. This exemption applies because disclosure would, or would be likely to, inhibit substantially the free and frank provision of advice.

This exemption recognises the need to have a private space within which to provide free and frank advice to Ministers before the Scottish Government reaches a settled public view. Disclosing the content of free and frank advice will substantially inhibit the provision of such advice in the future.

This exemption is subject to the ‘public interest test’. Therefore, taking account of all the circumstances of this case, we have considered if the public interest in disclosing the information outweighs the public interest in applying the exemption. We have found that, on balance, the public interest lies in favour of upholding the exemption. We recognise that there is a public interest in disclosing information as part of open, transparent and accountable government, and to inform public debate. However, there is a greater public interest in allowing a private space within which Scottish Government staff can provide full and frank advice to Ministers until the Government as a whole can adopt a policy that is sound and likely to be effective. This private thinking space is essential to enable all options to be properly considered, based on the best available advice, so that good policy decisions can be taken. Premature disclosure is likely to undermine the full and frank discussion of issues between Ministers and officials, which in turn will undermine the quality of the policy making process, which would not be in the public interest.

Section 30(b)(ii) – Free and Frank Exchange of Views for the Purposes of Deliberation

An exemption under section 30(b)(ii) of FOISA (Free and Frank Exchange of Views) applies to some of the amount of the information requested. This exemption applies because

disclosure would, or would be likely to, inhibit substantially the free and frank exchange of views for the purposes of deliberation. This exemption recognises the need for a private space to discuss and explore options with stakeholders. Disclosing the content of free and frank discussions will substantially inhibit such discussions in the future and may deter stakeholders from entering into discussions with the Scottish Government if they believe their comments will be published.

This exemption is subject to the 'public interest test'. Therefore, taking account of all the circumstances of this case, we have considered if the public interest in disclosing the information outweighs the public interest in applying the exemption. We have found that, on balance, the public interest lies in favour of upholding the exemption. We recognise that there is a public interest in disclosing information as part of open, transparent and accountable government, and to inform public debate. However, there is a greater public interest in allowing a private space within which to engage with stakeholders and external experts. This private thinking space is essential to enable all options to be properly considered, so that good policy decisions can be taken. Premature disclosure is likely to undermine the full and frank discussion of issues, which in turn will undermine the quality of the policy making process, which would not be in the public interest.

Section 30(c) (Prejudice to the Effective Conduct of Public Affairs)

The reason why this exemption applies is because releasing draft plans for and content of Scottish Government publications, which do not reflect final decisions taken, would result in inaccurate information on the Scottish Government's proposals for an independent Scotland being published, thereby undermining the Scottish Government's ability to effectively and accurately engage and communicate with the public.

This in turn would be likely to impair the Government's ability to take forward its work on policy development for an independent Scotland. This would constitute substantial prejudice to the effective conduct of public affairs in terms of the exemption.

This exemption is subject to the 'public interest test'. Therefore, taking account of all the circumstances of this case, we have considered if the public interest in disclosing the information outweighs the public interest in applying the exemption. We have found that, on balance, the public interest lies in favour of upholding the exemption. We recognise that there is a public interest in disclosing information as part of open, transparent and accountable government, and to inform public debate. However, there is a greater public interest in enabling the Scottish Government to effectively and accurately engage and communicate with the public on its proposals for an independent Scotland without the risk of these proposals being prejudiced by inaccurate information, which doesn't reflect final decisions taken, being released while the Scottish Government's work was still under development on a matter of significant political relevance and controversy.

Section 38(i)(b) - Personal Information

An exemption under section s.38(1)(b) of FOISA (Personal Information) applies to a small amount of the information you have requested because it is the personal data of a third party, i.e. names and contact details of individuals (including civil servants below SCS), and disclosing it would contravene the data protection principles in Article 5(1) of the General Data Protection Regulation and in section 34(1) of the Data Protection Act 2018. This exemption is not subject to the 'public interest test', so we are not required to consider if the public interest in disclosing the information outweighs the public interest in applying the exemption.