

Item 1:

**From:** Mairi Spowage [Redacted]  
**Sent:** 17 October 2022 19:40  
**To:** Elsby M (Matthew) [Redacted]; David Eiser [Redacted]; Stuart McIntyre (Econ) [Redacted]  
**Cc:** [Redacted] Emma Congreve [Redacted]  
**Subject:** RE: Independence Prospectus - Economy Paper

Thanks Matthew –

[Redacted]

Mairi

**From:** Elsby M (Matthew) [Redacted]  
**Sent:** 17 October 2022 14:17  
**To:** Mairi Spowage [Redacted]; David Eiser [Redacted]; Stuart McIntyre (Econ) [Redacted]  
**Cc:** [Redacted]  
**Subject:** Independence Prospectus - Economy Paper

**CAUTION: This email originated outside the University. Check before clicking links or attachments.**

[Redacted]

As announced by the First Minister earlier today, the Scottish Government has published the third in the Building a New Scotland series of independence prospectus papers, [A stronger economy with independence](#). This paper covers economic, monetary, and fiscal policy issues. At some point over few weeks, it would be good discuss the paper, and get your reflections on its content. If this works for you, would you like to suggest a date you're available?

I am aware that the content of this paper is likely to be of interest to you, and you may be asked to comment on it. If it would be helpful to you, I would be very happy to discuss the contents with you today or tomorrow. If this is of interest, please get in touch and I'll be happy to have a quick conversation.

Kind regards,  
Matt Elsby

[Redacted]

Item 2:

**From:** David Phillips [Redacted]  
**Sent:** 17 October 2022 14:25  
**To:** Elsby M (Matthew) [Redacted]  
**Cc:** [Redacted]  
**Subject:** Re: [EXTERNAL] Independence Prospectus - Economy Paper

Hi Matt,

Thanks for the offer.

**[Redacted]**

cheers

David

On 17/10/2022 14:18, **[Redacted]** wrote:  
Hi David,

As announced by the First Minister earlier today, the Scottish Government has published the third in the Building a New Scotland series of independence prospectus papers, [A stronger economy with independence](#). This paper covers economic, monetary, and fiscal policy issues. At some point over few weeks, it would be good discuss the paper, and get your reflections on its content. If this works for you, would you like to suggest a date you're available?

I am aware that the content of this paper is likely to be of interest to you, and you may be asked to comment on it. If it would be helpful to you, I would be very happy to discuss the contents with you today or tomorrow. If this is of interest, please get in touch and I'll be happy to have a quick conversation.

**[Redacted]**

Kind regards,  
Matt Elsby

**Item 3:**

**From:** Stephen Millard **[Redacted]**  
**Sent:** 17 October 2022 19:24  
**To:** Elsby M (Matthew) **[Redacted]**  
**Cc:** **[Redacted]**; Jagjit Chadha**[Redacted]**; Adrian Pabst **[Redacted]**  
**Subject:** RE: Independence Prospectus - Economy Paper

Dear Matt,

Many thanks for sending me this.

**[Redacted]**

Best Regards,

Stephen

**From:** Elsby M (Matthew)  
**Sent:** 17 October 2022 14:15  
**To:** Stephen Millard **[Redacted]**

**Cc: [Redacted]**

**Subject:** Independence Prospectus - Economy Paper

Dear Prof. Millard,

As announced by the First Minister earlier today, the Scottish Government has published the third in the Building a New Scotland series of independence prospectus papers, [A stronger economy with independence](#). This paper covers economic, monetary, and fiscal policy issues. At some point over few weeks, it would be good discuss the paper, and get your reflections on its content. If this works for you, would you like to suggest a date you're available?

I am aware that the content of this paper is likely to be of interest to you, and you may be asked to comment on it. If it would be helpful to you, I would be very happy to discuss the contents with you today or tomorrow. If this is of interest, please get in touch and I'll be happy to have a quick conversation.

Kind regards,  
Matt Elsby

**[Redacted]**

**Item 4:**

**From:** Alfie Stirling **[Redacted]**

**Sent:** 26 October 2022 08:22

**To:** Elsby M (Matthew) **[Redacted]**

**Cc:** **[Redacted]**

**Subject:** RE: Independence Prospectus - Economy Paper

Hi Matt,

Many thanks for this.

**[Redacted]**

Very best,

Alfie

**From:** Elsby M (Matthew) **[Redacted]**

**Sent:** 17 October 2022 14:13

**To:** Alfie Stirling **[Redacted]**

**Cc:** **[Redacted]**

**Subject:** Independence Prospectus - Economy Paper

Dear Alfie,

As announced by the First Minister earlier today, the Scottish Government has published the third in the Building a New Scotland series of independence prospectus papers, [A stronger economy with independence](#). This paper covers economic, monetary, and fiscal policy

issues. At some point over few weeks, it would be good discuss the paper, and get your reflections on its content. If this works for you, would you like to suggest a date you're available?

I am aware that the content of this paper is likely to be of interest to you, and you may be asked to comment on it. If it would be helpful to you, I would be very happy to discuss the contents with you shortly after publication. If this is of interest, please get in touch and I'll be happy to have a quick conversation.

Kind regards,  
Matt Elsby

**[Redacted]**

**Item 5:**

**From:** Dornan B (Brian) **[Redacted]**

**Sent:** 19 October 2022 17:58

**To:** 'Laurie Macfarlane' **[Redacted]**

**Cc:** **[Redacted]**

**Subject:** RE: Building a New Scotland: A stronger economy with independence published 17 October 2022

Hi Laurie,

Thanks for these –

**[Redacted]**

Best wishes,

Brian

**From:** Laurie Macfarlane **[Redacted]**

**Sent:** 19 October 2022 10:39

**To:** Dornan B (Brian) **[Redacted]**

**Cc:** **[Redacted]**

**Subject:** Re: Building a New Scotland: A stronger economy with independence published 17 October 2022

Hi Brian and **[Redacted]**

Hope you are well.

Cheers!

Laurie

On Mon, 17 Oct 2022 at 18:27, Laurie Macfarlane **[Redacted]** wrote:

Hi Brian

Good to hear from you.

**[Redacted]**

Thanks again,

Laurie

On 14 Oct 2022, at 17:30 Dornan B (Brian) [Redacted] wrote:

Hi Laurie, [Redacted]

The Scottish Government will publish the third in the Building a New Scotland series of independence prospectus papers, *A stronger economy with independence* on Monday of next week. This paper will cover economic, monetary, and fiscal policy issues.

I'm sure that the paper will be of interest and I would be very happy to discuss the contents with you on Monday afternoon, or at some point in the first half of week, if that would suit you. If that is of interest please let me know your availability and we'll arrange a time. I'll be in Edinburgh on Monday afternoon and happy to meet in person, if that suits.

Kind regards

Brian Dornan  
[Redacted]

**Item 6:**

**From:** [Redacted]  
**Sent:** 01 August 2022 11:48  
**To:** 'Gregor Irwin' [Redacted]  
**Subject:** RE: In confidence

Hi Gregor,

[Redacted]

Thanks again,

[Redacted]

**From:** Gregor Irwin [Redacted]  
**Sent:** 31 July 2022 14:01  
**To:** [Redacted]  
**Cc:** Crawford E (Ewan) [Redacted]  
**Subject:** RE: In confidence

[Redacted]

**From:** Gregor Irwin [Redacted]  
**Sent:** 25 July 2022 07:39  
**To:** [Redacted]  
**Cc:** Crawford E (Ewan) [Redacted]  
**Subject:** RE: In confidence

[Redacted]

Best,

Gregor.

**From:** [Redacted]  
**Sent:** 15 July 2022 16:26  
**To:** Gregor Irwin [Redacted]  
**Cc:** Crawford E (Ewan) [Redacted]  
**Subject:** In confidence

Hi Gregor,

[Redacted]

**Item 7:**  
**From:** [Redacted]  
**Sent:** 17 August 2022 08:25  
**To:** 'Gregor Irwin' [Redacted]  
**Subject:** RE: Revised draft

Tremendously helpful – thanks again Gregor!

Will keep you in touch with developments.

Best wishes,

[Redacted]

**From:** Gregor Irwin [Redacted]  
**Sent:** 16 August 2022 19:32  
**To:** [Redacted]  
**Cc:** Crawford E (Ewan) [Redacted]; Gillespie G (Gary[Redacted]; O'Carroll L (Lucy) [Redacted]  
**Subject:** RE: Revised draft

[Redacted]

Hope this helps!

**From:** [Redacted]  
**Sent:** 15 August 2022 11:20  
**To:** Gregor Irwin [Redacted]  
**Cc:** Crawford E (Ewan) [Redacted]; Gillespie G (Gary[Redacted]; O'Carroll L (Lucy)  
**Subject:** Revised draft

Hi Gregor,

[Redacted]

**Item 8:**

**From:** Gregor Irwin [Redacted]  
**Sent:** 14 July 2022 11:45

**To:** [Redacted]  
**Cc:** [Redacted]  
**Subject:** RE: catch-up

[Redacted]

Gregor.

**From:** Gregor Irwin [Redacted]  
**Sent:** 12 July 2022 09:28  
**To:** [Redacted]  
**Cc:** [Redacted]  
**Subject:** RE: catch-up

[Redacted]

Gregor.

**From:** [Redacted]  
**Sent:** 12 July 2022 09:20  
**To:** Gregor Irwin [Redacted]  
**Cc:** [Redacted]  
**Subject:** catch-up

Hi Gregor,

[Redacted]

**Item 9:**

**From:** Mark Blyth [Redacted]  
**Sent:** 05 May 2022 13:53  
**To:** [Redacted]  
**Subject:** Re: SG meeting - Friday 6th May

Got it. Will read.

M

Mark Blyth

[Redacted]

On May 5, 2022, at 06:25, [Redacted] wrote:

Hi Mark,

[Redacted]

An exemption under section 38(1)(b) of FOISA (Personal Information) applies to some of the information requested because it is personal data of a third party and disclosing it would contravene the data protection principles in Article 5(1) of the General Data Protection Regulation and in section 34(1) of the Data Protection Act 2018. This exemption is not subject to the 'public interest test', so we are not required to consider if the public interest in disclosing the information outweighs the public interest in applying the exemption.

An exemption under section 30(b)(ii) of FOISA (Free and Frank Exchange of Views for the Purposes of Deliberation) applies to some of the information requested. This exemption applies because disclosure would, or would be likely to, inhibit substantially the free and frank exchange of views for the purposes of deliberation. This exemption recognises the need for Ministers and officials to have a private space within which to discuss issues and options with external stakeholders before the Scottish Government reaches a settled public view. Disclosing the content of these discussions will substantially inhibit such discussions in the future, because these stakeholders will be reluctant to provide their views fully and frankly if they believe that those views are likely to be made public. This would significantly harm the Scottish Government's ability to carry out many aspects of its work, and could adversely affect its ability to gather all of the evidence needed to make fully informed policies/decisions.

This exemption is subject to the 'public interest test'. Therefore, taking account of all the circumstances of this case, we have considered if the public interest in disclosing the information outweighs the public interest in applying the exemption. We have found that, on balance, the public interest lies in favour of upholding the exemption. We recognise that there is a public interest in disclosing information as part of open, transparent and accountable government, and to inform public debate. However, there is a greater public interest in allowing Ministers and officials a private space within which to communicate with appropriate external stakeholders as part of the process of exploring and refining the Government's policy position until the Government as a whole can adopt a policy that is sound and likely to be effective. This private space is essential to enable all options to be properly considered, so that good policy decisions can be taken based on fully informed advice and evidence. Premature disclosure is likely to undermine the full and frank discussion of issues between the Scottish Government and these stakeholders, which in turn will undermine the quality of the policy making process, which would not be in the public interest. There is also an important public interest in avoiding the loss of stakeholder confidence in cases where they thought they were providing comments in confidence, which would be inevitable if an individual's contribution was released against their wishes.