

From: [Redacted]
To: [Redacted] RE: newsround
Subject: [REDACTED]primary school 10 June 2021
Date: 11:32:31
Attachments: [image001.png](#)
Importance: High

Hi Both

That looks good to me

How about we send on to [REDACTED] with the text below prefacing:

[REDACTED]

It was agreed at this meeting that a joint submission from SG and ES to the Cabinet Secretary around the events relating to the Israel/Palestine resources would be appropriate at this time, providing her with necessary background should she receive any correspondence on this matter – in particular the final pieces of correspondence from the DFM and CEO of Education Scotland indicating that they consider the matter of the Israel/Palestine resources closed.

It may of course be the case that you have this on your radar already

[REDACTED] (cc'd) will lead on this from ES liaising with you.

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

From: [Redacted]
To:
Subject: RE: Meeting invite - Discussion on Israel Palestine
Date: 03 June 2021 18:28:19

Hi [REDACTED]yeah

it is [REDACTED]

From: [Redacted] <[\[Redacted\]@educationscotland.gov.scot](mailto:[Redacted]@educationscotland.gov.scot)>
Sent: 03 June 2021 18:05
To: [Redacted] <[\[Redacted\]@educationscotland.gov.scot](mailto:[Redacted]@educationscotland.gov.scot)> **Subject:** RE: Meeting invite - Discussion on Israel Palestine

Hi [REDACTED],

Is this the meeting on 10 June?

Best,

[REDACTED]

From: [Redacted] <[\[Redacted\]@educationscotland.gov.scot](mailto:[Redacted]@educationscotland.gov.scot)>
Sent: 03 June 2021 17:04
To: [Redacted] <[\[Redacted\]@educationscotland.gov.scot](mailto:[Redacted]@educationscotland.gov.scot)>
Subject: Meeting invite - Discussion on Israel Palestine

Hi [REDACTED]

[REDACTED] asked that I invite you along to the above meeting. I have sent you a calendar invite separately and would be grateful if you could please let me know if you are free to attend.

Kind regards / Deagh dhurachdan

[REDACTED]
PA to Ollie Bray, Strategic Director
Education Scotland

Education Scotland – The Optima Building, 58 Robertson Street, Glasgow, G2 8DU
Foghlam Alba – Aitreabh Optima, 450 Sraid Earra-Ghaidheal, Glaschu G2 8DU

Tel / Fòn: [REDACTED]
Website / Làraich-lìn: www.educationscotland.gov.uk

From: [Redacted]
To: [Redacted] [Bray O \(Ollie\)](#) RE: newsround
Subject: [REDACTED]primary school
Date: 11 June 2021 07:52:34
Attachments: [image001.png](#)

Good call [REDACTED]. [REDACTED]

[REDACTED]
Senior Education Officer
Education Scotland

From: [Redacted] [@educationscotland.gov.scot](#)>
Sent: 11 June 2021 07:02
To: [Redacted] [@educationscotland.gov.scot](#)>; [REDACTED]
[Redacted] [@educationscotland.gov.scot](#)>; Bray O (Ollie)
<Ollie.Bray@educationscotland.gov.scot>
Subject: RE: newsround [REDACTED] primary school

Hi [REDACTED],

Happy to have a chat with [REDACTED] to discuss either a submission related to the current correspondence or simply about the wider context.

Alternatively, **Ollie**, is this something that could be raised less formally with Cab Sec in her next catch-up with Gayle? I would imagine they meet pretty regularly.

Best,

[REDACTED]

Sent with BlackBerry Work
(www.blackberry.com)

From: [Redacted] [@educationscotland.gov.scot](#)>
Date: Thursday, 10 Jun 2021, 5:36 pm
To: [Redacted] [@educationscotland.gov.scot](#)>, [REDACTED]
[Redacted] [@educationscotland.gov.scot](#)>, Bray O (Ollie)
<Ollie.Bray@educationscotland.gov.scot>
Subject: RE: newsround [REDACTED]primary school

Hi all

See email trail and most recent email below from [REDACTED]. I emailed him to ask if we could have a quick chat just now but he's pretty swamped I think. He suggested tomorrow morning.

[REDACTED] – could you give [REDACTED] a phone tomorrow just expressing our thinking at our meeting today that since the matter of Israel/ Palestine is in the news at the moment, [REDACTED]

It could even be something as simple as indicating to the Cab Sec that there was a long a complex history around these resources which concluded with DFM and Education Scotland indicating that the matter was closed.

If you can call [REDACTED], perhaps your offering to draft something in the first instance would take the pressure off him somewhat and expedite this a little.

Ollie, [REDACTED] doesn't seem to think this needs a submission to the Cab Sec at the moment, but I think it would be a sensible move – your call however of course.

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]
Senior Education Officer
Education Scotland

From: [Redacted] <[\[Redacted\]@gov.scot](mailto:[Redacted]@gov.scot)>
Sent: 10 June 2021 17:13
To: [Redacted] <[\[Redacted\]@educationscotland.gov.scot](mailto:[Redacted]@educationscotland.gov.scot)>; [REDACTED]
[Redacted] <[\[Redacted\]@educationscotland.gov.scot](mailto:[Redacted]@educationscotland.gov.scot)>; [REDACTED]
<[\[Redacted\]@educationscotland.gov.scot](mailto:[Redacted]@educationscotland.gov.scot)>
Cc: [REDACTED] <[\[Redacted\]@gov.scot](mailto:[Redacted]@gov.scot)>; [REDACTED] <[\[Redacted\]@gov.scot](mailto:[Redacted]@gov.scot)>
Subject: RE: newsround [REDACTED]primary school

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED] - as to wider submission on the previous Israel/Palestine resources, I'd struggle to help to frame anything this week. [REDACTED]

[REDACTED]
Team Leader, Curriculum, Parental Engagement and Pupil Participation
Mobile: [REDACTED]

From: [Redacted] <[\[Redacted\]@educationscotland.gov.scot](mailto:[Redacted]@educationscotland.gov.scot)>
Sent: 10 June 2021 13:24
To: [Redacted] <[\[Redacted\]@gov.scot](mailto:[Redacted]@gov.scot)>; [REDACTED]
[Redacted] <[\[Redacted\]@educationscotland.gov.scot](mailto:[Redacted]@educationscotland.gov.scot)>; [REDACTED]
[Redacted] <[\[Redacted\]@educationscotland.gov.scot](mailto:[Redacted]@educationscotland.gov.scot)>

From: [Redacted]
To: [Redacted]
Cc: [Redacted]
Subject: [REDACTED]primary school
Date: 11 June 2021 09:33:29
Attachments: [image001.png](#)

RE: newsround

[REDACTED]

From: [Redacted] @gov.scot>
Sent: 10 June 2021 18:14
To: [Redacted] @gov.scot>; [REDACTED]
[Redacted] @educationscotland.gov.scot>; [REDACTED]
[Redacted] @educationscotland.gov.scot>; [REDACTED]
[Redacted] @educationscotland.gov.scot>
Cc: [Redacted] @gov.scot>; [Redacted] @gov.scot> **Subject:** RE:
newsround [REDACTED] primary school

Thanks [REDACTED]. [REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

Thanks

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

Team Leader for Literacy & Numeracy; Expressive Arts; Social Studies | Curriculum Unit / Aonad a' Churraicealaim
Mob: [REDACTED] e-mail: [\[REDACTED\]@gov.scot](mailto:[REDACTED]@gov.scot)

From: [Redacted] [\[REDACTED\]@gov.scot](mailto:[REDACTED]@gov.scot)>
Sent: 10 June 2021 17:13
To: [Redacted] [\[REDACTED\]@educationscotland.gov.scot](mailto:[REDACTED]@educationscotland.gov.scot)>; [REDACTED]
[Redacted] [\[REDACTED\]@educationscotland.gov.scot](mailto:[REDACTED]@educationscotland.gov.scot)>; [REDACTED]
[Redacted] [\[REDACTED\]@educationscotland.gov.scot](mailto:[REDACTED]@educationscotland.gov.scot)>
Cc: [Redacted] [\[REDACTED\]@gov.scot](mailto:[REDACTED]@gov.scot)>; [REDACTED]<[Redacted]@gov.scot> **Subject:** RE:
newsround [REDACTED] primary school

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED] - as to wider submission on the previous Israel/Palestine resources, I'd struggle to help to frame anything this week. [REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

Team Leader, Curriculum, Parental Engagement and Pupil Participation

Mobile: [REDACTED]

From: [Redacted] <@educationscotland.gov.scot>

Sent: 10 June 2021 13:24

To: [Redacted] <@gov.scot>; [REDACTED]

[Redacted] <@educationscotland.gov.scot>; [REDACTED]

[Redacted] <@educationscotland.gov.scot>

Subject: RE: newsround [REDACTED] primary school

Importance: High

Hi [REDACTED]

[REDACTED] As you're aware, we had a meeting with Ollie Bray today to bring him up to speed on the background to the Israel/Palestine resources.

It was agreed at this meeting that a joint submission from SG and ES to the Cabinet Secretary around the events relating to the Israel/Palestine resources would be appropriate at this time, providing her with necessary background should she receive any correspondence on this matter – in particular the final pieces of correspondence from the DFM and CEO of Education Scotland indicating that they consider the matter of the Israel/Palestine resources closed.

It may of course be the case that you have this on your radar already

Grateful if you would discuss any background advice / submission to the Cabinet Secretary with [REDACTED](copied).

[REDACTED]

Senior Education Officer
Education Scotland

From: [Redacted] [\[REDACTED\]@gov.scot](mailto: [REDACTED]@gov.scot)>

Sent: 09 June 2021 19:31

To: [Redacted] [\[REDACTED\]@gov.scot](mailto: [REDACTED]@gov.scot)>; [REDACTED]

[Redacted] [\[REDACTED\]@educationscotland.gov.scot](mailto: [REDACTED]@educationscotland.gov.scot)>; [REDACTED]

[Redacted] [\[REDACTED\]@educationscotland.gov.scot](mailto: [REDACTED]@educationscotland.gov.scot)>

Cc: [Redacted] [\[REDACTED\]@gov.scot](mailto: [REDACTED]@gov.scot)>; [REDACTED]<[Redacted] [\[REDACTED\]@gov.scot](mailto: [REDACTED]@gov.scot)>>;

[Redacted] [\[REDACTED\]@gov.scot](mailto: [REDACTED]@gov.scot)>; [Redacted] [\[REDACTED\]@gov.scot](mailto: [REDACTED]@gov.scot)> **Subject:** RE:

newsround [REDACTED] primary school

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

From: [Bray O \(Ollie\)](#)
To: [Redacted]
Subject: RE: Discussion on Israel Palestine
Date: 14 June 2021 11:40:49

Hi [REDACTED]

Thanks for all your work on this.

Happy for my name to go on this.

OB

From: [Redacted] <[Redacted]@educationscotland.gov.scot>
Sent: 14 June 2021 10:38
To: [Redacted] <[Redacted]@educationscotland.gov.scot>; [REDACTED]
[Redacted] <[Redacted]@educationscotland.gov.scot>; [REDACTED]
[Redacted] <[Redacted]@educationscotland.gov.scot>; Bray O (Ollie)
<Ollie.Bray@educationscotland.gov.scot>
Subject: RE: Discussion on Israel Palestine

Morning all,

Following last week's discussion, please find attached a starter for ten on advice to the Cab Sec on this matter.

A couple of outstanding points:

1. [REDACTED] grateful for lines on the publication guidance (i.e. what changes have been made since the original Glow Blog to reduce the chance of a repeat).
2. [REDACTED] I've deliberately minimised contextual / non-recent information to keep the focus on the matter being closed and ES's firm position on this. However, I appreciate the baby might have been chucked out with the bath water; any additions welcome.
3. Ollie, I've left the submission nameless for now; grateful if you could confirm who's name you want the submission issued in (I had my name down initially, but that might just leave others wondering why the Indy Schools guy is working on this).

Grateful for any other additions / thoughts by close 15 June 2021 if possible please.

Best,

[REDACTED]

From:
June 2021

CABINET SECRETARY FOR EDUCATION AND SKILLS

CORRESPONDENCE ON ISRAEL PALESTINE RESOURCE

Purpose

- 1. [REDACTED]

Priority

- 2. Routine

Background

- 3. [REDACTED]

- 4. [REDACTED]

- 5. [REDACTED]

Since publication of resource

- 6. [REDACTED]

Commented [[REDACTED](1): Crucial amendment. SCoJeC and SFI ceased to make any representation to ES/SG after the resources were published by EIS. [REDACTED]

7. [REDACTED]

Publication Guidance (Glow)

[REDACTED]

Commented [[REDACTED](2): [REDACTED]]

8.

9. Conclusion

10. [REDACTED]

11. [REDACTED]

12. [REDACTED]

Recommendation

13. The Cabinet Secretary is invited to note the contents of this submission.

**NAME
TITLE
NUMBER**

Copy List:	For Action	For Comments	For Information		
			Portfolio Interest	Constit Interest	General Awareness
Cabinet Secretary for Education and Skills	Y				
Minister for Higher and Further Education, Youth Employment and Training					Y
Minister for Children and Young People					Y

DG Education Communities and Justice
 [REDACTED]
 [REDACTED]
 Gayle Goman
 Ollie Bray
 Director of Learning
 [REDACTED]

ANNEX A: Reply from the Deputy First Minister to Colin Beattie, MSP, August 2020

Thank you for your letter, dated 19 August 2020, on behalf of your constituent who wrote to you regarding teaching resources related to Palestine and Israel, specifically, *Palestine and Israel, Understanding the Conflict* which is hosted by the EIS.

That particular resource, which is available to all who may wish to use it, is the result of stakeholder engagement and input. As with any resource, it is for individual schools and local authorities to determine how and if they wish to use them. There was discussion around whether the resource should be made available on GLOW by Education Scotland. However, no agreement could be reached across the stakeholders as to the suitability of that resource; as such, Education Scotland considered that they could not endorse it.

I appreciate your constituent's frustration that the resource is not available on GLOW via Education Scotland; however, it would not be appropriate for me to speak on behalf of any of the stakeholder groups involved in the meeting of stakeholders in February 2019.

I would again highlight that the resource in question remains available online to all practitioners at: <https://www.eis.org.uk/Policy-And-Publications/Palestineisrael>. As the EIS is now responsible for the resource, the Scottish Government's involvement in this matter has come to an end.

From: [Redacted]
To: [Redacted] [Bray O \(Ollie\)](#) RE: Discussion
Subject: on Israel Palestine
Date: 15 June 2021 17:04:24

[REDACTED], r.e. what changes have been made since the original Glow Blog to reduce the chance of a repeat).

1. Publication guidance for the creation of online content has been developed. It lays out a process that all content owners must follow in developing their offer, including robust quality assurance.
2. The guidance is regularly updated and awareness raising sessions are offered to all ES colleagues, including support from the web services team.

Let me know if you need any further details.

Thanks

[REDACTED]

From: [Redacted] @educationscotland.gov.scot>
Sent: 14 June 2021 10:38
To: [Redacted] @educationscotland.gov.scot>; [REDACTED]
[Redacted] @educationscotland.gov.scot>; [REDACTED]
[Redacted] @educationscotland.gov.scot>; Bray O (Ollie)
<Ollie.Bray@educationscotland.gov.scot>
Subject: RE: Discussion on Israel Palestine

Morning all,

Following last week's discussion, please find attached a starter for ten on advice to the Cab Sec on this matter.

A couple of outstanding points:

1. **[REDACTED]**, grateful for lines on the publication guidance (i.e. what changes have been made since the original Glow Blog to reduce the chance of a repeat).
2. **[REDACTED]**, I've deliberately minimised contextual / non-recent information to keep the focus on the matter being closed and ES's firm position on this. However, I appreciate the baby might have been chucked out with the bath water; any additions welcome.
3. **Ollie**, I've left the submission nameless for now; grateful if you could confirm who's name you want the submission issued in ([REDACTED]).

Grateful for any other additions / thoughts by close 15 June 2021 if possible please.

Best,

[REDACTED]

From: [Redacted]
To: [Redacted] [Bray O \(Ollie\)](#)
Cc: [Redacted]; [Redacted]
Subject: RE: Discussion on Israel Palestine
Date: 16 June 2021 12:46:23
Attachments: [2021_06_16 - SUBMISSION TO MINISTERS - ISRAEL PALESTINE RESOURCE +JW 16-06-21.doc](#)
Importance: High

Hi All

Ollie, I have made one further suggested change to the document which picks up the language used throughout the communications [REDACTED]

Others – see what you think.

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

Senior Education Officer
Education Scotland

From: [Redacted] @educationscotland.gov.scot>
Sent: 16 June 2021 12:25
To: Bray O (Ollie) <Ollie.Bray@educationscotland.gov.scot>
Cc: [Redacted] @educationscotland.gov.scot>; [REDACTED]
[Redacted] @educationscotland.gov.scot>; [REDACTED]
[Redacted] @educationscotland.gov.scot>
Subject: RE: Discussion on Israel Palestine

Hi Ollie,

With thanks to colleagues for their contributions, please find attached a draft advice note to the Cabinet Secretary on the Israel / Palestine resource for your approval.

[REDACTED]

Regards,

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED] | [REDACTED]

Mobile: [REDACTED]
Address: Optima Building, Glasgow

From: Ollie Bray
Strategic Director
June 2021

CABINET SECRETARY FOR EDUCATION AND SKILLS

CORRESPONDENCE ON ISRAEL PALESTINE RESOURCE

Purpose

1. To provide the Cabinet Secretary with information around a resource developed by the Glasgow and Clyde Rights-Based Learning Group, with initial involvement by Education Scotland and a number of stakeholders; eventually entitled *Palestine and Israel, Understanding the Conflict*, and to outline the current position of Education Scotland on such resources.

Priority

2. **Routine**

Background

3. In 2017, the Deputy First Minister and, then, Cabinet Secretary for Education and Skills met with representatives of the Scottish Council of Jewish Communities (SCoJeC) and the Scottish Friends of Israel (SFI) regarding a resource which had been uploaded to the Glasgow and Clyde Rights-Based Learning Group blog on Glow.
4. The resource proved to be controversial and was removed from Glow. The Deputy First Minister agreed that Education Scotland, after inviting appropriate stakeholders for consultation and input, would explore the development of an alternative resource. Work continued through to mid-2018. However, there continued to be disagreement between stakeholders as to the content of the resource.
5. Given the absence of agreement between stakeholders, Education Scotland concluded that it would not be appropriate to publish the original resource developed by the Glasgow and Clyde Rights-Based Learning Group. As an alternative, the Educational Institute of Scotland (EIS), involved in a consultative capacity throughout the process, offered to publish the resource. This was agreed to in June 2018 and the resource has remained on the EIS website since ([Palestine and Israel, Understanding the Conflict \(eis.org.uk\)](https://www.eis.org.uk/Palestine-and-Israel-Understanding-the-Conflict)).

Since publication of the resource

6. The Scottish Friends of Palestine and other stakeholders continued to write to Education Scotland, the Scottish Government, and Scottish Ministers regarding the resource – both in terms of content and enquiring why Education Scotland did not elect to make the resource available to educators through Glow or provide a link from Glow to the published resource on the EIS website.

7. Ultimately, the Deputy First Minister replied stating that Education Scotland could not publish the resource or provide a link to it on Glow while key stakeholders were unable to reach consensus around the resource and, since the resource was available elsewhere, the Deputy First Minister and Chief Executive of Education Scotland stated that the matter was considered to be closed (**Annex A** includes one such response from the Deputy First Minister for reference).

Publication Guidance (Glow)

8. Since the earlier publication of the resource by the Glasgow and Clyde Rights-Based Learning Group, changes have been made to assist Glow users. These changes include the publication of guidance for the creation of online content which all content owners must follow. This guidance includes robust quality assurance.
9. This guidance is regularly updated and awareness raising sessions are offered to all Education Scotland colleagues and support is available from the web services team.

Conclusion

10. Education Scotland appreciates the importance of ensuring that educators have access to high quality and relevant resources to deliver learning experiences on complex and on-going issues. Educators should be empowered to explore such issues with learners in a balanced, informed and sensitive manner.
11. Education Scotland worked closely with a number of stakeholders to develop an appropriate and robust resource concerning Israel and Palestine; however, the disagreement between stakeholders was such that it was not considered appropriate for Education Scotland to publish, or to apparently endorse through providing links, the resource. The EIS, who also worked on the resource, was content to publish the resource and so it is available to the public through their website.
12. The matter has now been considered closed for some time; however, as the Cabinet Secretary may expect, there continues to be occasional correspondence on the matter and further correspondence or other communication on this matter may be brought to the Cabinet Secretary's attention. It was, therefore, considered appropriate to provide the new Cabinet Secretary with this information in advance of any issues arising.

Recommendation

13. The Cabinet Secretary is invited to note the contents of this submission.

OLLIE BRAY
Strategic Director
Education Scotland

Copy List:	For Action	For Comments	For Information		
			Portfolio Interest	Constit Interest	General Awareness
Cabinet Secretary for Education and Skills	Y				
Minister for Higher and Further Education, Youth Employment and Training					Y
Minister for Children and Young People					Y

DG Education Communities and Justice
 [REDACTED]
 [REDACTED]
 Gayle Gorman
 Ollie Bray
 Director of Learning
 [REDACTED]
 [REDACTED]
 [REDACTED]
 [REDACTED]

ANNEX A: Reply from the Deputy First Minister to Colin Beattie, MSP, August 2020

Thank you for your letter, dated 19 August 2020, on behalf of your constituent who wrote to you regarding teaching resources related to Palestine and Israel, specifically, *Palestine and Israel, Understanding the Conflict* which is hosted by the EIS.

That particular resource, which is available to all who may wish to use it, is the result of stakeholder engagement and input. As with any resource, it is for individual schools and local authorities to determine how and if they wish to use them. There was discussion around whether the resource should be made available on GLOW by Education Scotland. However, no agreement could be reached across the stakeholders as to the suitability of that resource; as such, Education Scotland considered that they could not endorse it.

I appreciate your constituent's frustration that the resource is not available on GLOW via Education Scotland; however, it would not be appropriate for me to speak on behalf of any of the stakeholder groups involved in the meeting of stakeholders in February 2019.

I would again highlight that the resource in question remains available online to all practitioners at: <https://www.eis.org.uk/Policy-And-Publications/Palestineisrael>. As the EIS is now responsible for the resource, the Scottish Government's involvement in this matter has come to an end.

From: [Redacted] on behalf of [OCEX Hub](#)
To: [Cabinet Secretary for Education and Skills; Minister for HE, FE, Youth Employment and Training; Minister for Children & Young People](#)
Cc: [DG Education & Justice](#); [Redacted]; [REDACTED] [Gorman G \(Gayle\); Bray O \(Ollie\); Director of Learning](#); [Redacted]; [Redacted]; [Redacted]; [Redacted]
Subject: Submission to Ministers - Israel Palestine Resource - 17 June 2021 - Routine
Date: 17 June 2021 16:23:00
Attachments: [2021 06 17 - SUBMISSION TO MINISTERS - ISRAEL PALESTINE RESOURCE.doc](#)

Cabinet Secretary for Education and Skills
Minister for Higher and Further Education, Youth Employment and Training
Minister for Children and Young People

Please find attached submission from Education Scotland on the resources developed, namely *Palestine and Israel, Understanding the Conflict* and the current position of Education Scotland on such resources.

Kind Regards

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED] | Executive Assistant to Gayle Gorman, HM Chief Inspector of Education/Chief Executive | Education Scotland | Foghlam Alba

Mobile: [REDACTED]
Address: Optima, 58 Robertson Street, Glasgow G2 8DU
Web: www.education.gov.scot

From: Ollie Bray
Strategic Director
June 2021

CABINET SECRETARY FOR EDUCATION AND SKILLS

CORRESPONDENCE ON ISRAEL PALESTINE RESOURCE

Purpose

1. To provide the Cabinet Secretary with information around a resource developed by the Glasgow and Clyde Rights-Based Learning Group, with initial involvement by Education Scotland and a number of stakeholders; eventually entitled *Palestine and Israel, Understanding the Conflict*, and to outline the current position of Education Scotland on such resources.

Priority

2. **Routine**

Background

3. In 2017, the Deputy First Minister and, then, Cabinet Secretary for Education and Skills met with representatives of the Scottish Council of Jewish Communities (SCoJeC) and the Scottish Friends of Israel (SFI) regarding a resource which had been uploaded to the Glasgow and Clyde Rights-Based Learning Group blog on Glow.
4. The resource proved to be controversial and was removed from Glow. The Deputy First Minister agreed that Education Scotland, after inviting appropriate stakeholders for consultation and input, would explore the development of an alternative resource. Work continued through to mid-2018. However, there continued to be disagreement between stakeholders as to the content of the resource.
5. Given the absence of agreement between stakeholders, Education Scotland concluded that it would not be appropriate to publish the original resource developed by the Glasgow and Clyde Rights-Based Learning Group. As an alternative, the Educational Institute of Scotland (EIS), involved in a consultative capacity throughout the process, offered to publish the resource. This was agreed to in June 2018 and the resource has remained on the EIS website since ([Palestine and Israel, Understanding the Conflict \(eis.org.uk\)](https://www.eis.org.uk/Palestine-and-Israel-Understanding-the-Conflict)).

Since publication of the resource

6. The Scottish Friends of Palestine and other stakeholders continued to write to Education Scotland, the Scottish Government, and Scottish Ministers regarding the resource – both in terms of content and enquiring why Education Scotland did not elect to make the resource available to educators through Glow or provide a link from Glow to the published resource on the EIS website.

7. Ultimately, the Deputy First Minister replied stating that Education Scotland could not publish the resource or provide a link to it on Glow while key stakeholders were unable to reach consensus around the resource and, since the resource was available elsewhere, the Deputy First Minister and Chief Executive of Education Scotland stated that the matter was considered to be closed (**Annex A** includes one such response from the Deputy First Minister for reference).

Publication Guidance (Glow)

8. Since the earlier publication of the resource by the Glasgow and Clyde Rights-Based Learning Group, changes have been made to assist Glow users. These changes include the publication of guidance for the creation of online content which all content owners must follow. This guidance includes robust quality assurance.
9. This guidance is regularly updated and awareness raising sessions are offered to all Education Scotland colleagues and support is available from the web services team.

Conclusion

10. Education Scotland appreciates the importance of ensuring that educators have access to high quality and relevant resources to deliver learning experiences on complex and on-going issues. Educators should be empowered to explore such issues with learners in a balanced, informed and sensitive manner.
11. Education Scotland worked closely with a number of stakeholders to develop an appropriate and robust resource concerning Israel and Palestine; however, the disagreement between stakeholders was such that it was not considered appropriate for Education Scotland to publish, or to apparently endorse through providing links, the resource. The EIS, who also worked on the resource, was content to publish the resource and so it is available to the public through their website.
12. The matter has now been considered closed for some time; however, as the Cabinet Secretary may expect, there continues to be occasional correspondence on the matter and further correspondence or other communication on this matter may be brought to the Cabinet Secretary's attention. It was, therefore, considered appropriate to provide the new Cabinet Secretary with this information in advance of any issues arising.

Recommendation

13. The Cabinet Secretary is invited to note the contents of this submission.

OLLIE BRAY
Strategic Director
Education Scotland

Copy List:	For Action	For Comments	For Information		
			Portfolio Interest	Constit Interest	General Awareness
Cabinet Secretary for Education and Skills	Y				
Minister for Higher and Further Education, Youth Employment and Training					Y
Minister for Children and Young People					Y

DG Education Communities and Justice
 [REDACTED]
 [REDACTED]
 Gayle Gorman
 Ollie Bray
 Director of Learning
 [REDACTED]
 [REDACTED]
 [REDACTED]
 [REDACTED]

ANNEX A: Reply from the Deputy First Minister to Colin Beattie, MSP, August 2020

Thank you for your letter, dated 19 August 2020, on behalf of your constituent who wrote to you regarding teaching resources related to Palestine and Israel, specifically, *Palestine and Israel, Understanding the Conflict* which is hosted by the EIS.

That particular resource, which is available to all who may wish to use it, is the result of stakeholder engagement and input. As with any resource, it is for individual schools and local authorities to determine how and if they wish to use them. There was discussion around whether the resource should be made available on GLOW by Education Scotland. However, no agreement could be reached across the stakeholders as to the suitability of that resource; as such, Education Scotland considered that they could not endorse it.

I appreciate your constituent's frustration that the resource is not available on GLOW via Education Scotland; however, it would not be appropriate for me to speak on behalf of any of the stakeholder groups involved in the meeting of stakeholders in February 2019.

I would again highlight that the resource in question remains available online to all practitioners at: <https://www.eis.org.uk/Policy-And-Publications/PalestineIsrael>. As the EIS is now responsible for the resource, the Scottish Government's involvement in this matter has come to an end.