

From: Redacted@gov.scot
Sent: 22 July 2019 11:55
To: Redacted@gov.scot>
Subject: RE: Legislation - Compulsory CCTV (001) - Instructions to SGLD –
Redacted - 21 June 2019 (A24837781)

Redacted

Redacted has been nominated as the solicitor for the purposes of drafting legislation to introduce CCTV into slaughterhouses. SGLD have not yet provided a timetable for taking this work forward.

Hoping for it to be introduced to Parliament by the end of 2019 or very early 2020. That is likely, however, to depend on Brexit demands made of SGLD in the coming months.

Best wishes

Redacted

-----Original Message-----

From: Redacted@gov.scot
Sent: 22 July 2019 11:38
To: Redacted@gov.scot
Subject: Legislation - Compulsory CCTV (001) - Instructions to SGLD - Redacted -
21 June 2019 (A24837781)

Hi Redacted,

I'm just typing up some information on the Compulsory CCTV legislation as part of the paper for the Animal Health and Wellbeing Strategy 2016-2021 and used your attached document to form the basis. I was wondering if there was any update to the timeline for the legislative changes going through?

Thanks

Redacted

=====

From: Redacted@gov.scot;
Sent: 30 April 2020 17:08
To: Redacted@gov.scot
Cc: Redacted@gov.scot; Redacted@gov.scot
Subject: FW: Briefing request - Ms Gougeon meeting with the British Veterinary Association - deadline Wednesday 6 May

Redacted

Please provide briefing on CCTV, the mobile abattoir research <https://www.gov.scot/publications/assessing-viability-sustainability-mobile-abattoirs-scotland> and the Redacted that has been issued.

Thanks

Redacted

From: Redacted@gov.scot
Sent: 30 April 2020 16:44
To: Redacted@gov.scot; Redacted@gov.scot; Redacted@gov.scot;
Redacted@gov.scot; Redacted@gov.scot; Redacted@gov.scot;
Redacted@gov.scot; Redacted@gov.scot; Redacted@gov.scot;
Redacted@gov.scot; Redacted@gov.scot; Redacted@gov.scot;
Cc: Voas S (Sheila); Redacted@gov.scot;
Subject: Briefing request - Ms Gougeon meeting with the British Veterinary Association - deadline Wednesday 6 May

Hi all

Ms Gougeon is meeting with representatives from the British Veterinary Association (BVA) on Thursday 14 May. The BVA have provided the following agenda:

- Redacted
- Redacted
- Redacted
- Redacted
- Welfare at slaughter
- Redacted
- Redacted
- Redacted

Can I please request briefing from your policy area to address these agenda points. Deadline for briefing is close of play on **Wednesday 6 May**.

Please forward on to those I may have missed on the copy list.

Thanks

Redacted

*Animal Health - Disease Prevention Team | Animal Health & Welfare Division |
Directorate for Agriculture & Rural Delivery | Scottish Government*

=====

From: Redacted@gov.scot
Sent: 24 September 2020 09:50
To: Redacted@gov.scot
Subject: RE: Andrew's attendance at the Environment Committee - Briefing - noon
24 September

Redacted

Short brief on CCTV in slaughterhouses. Sorry but I don't know enough to provide similar on the Redacted regs.

Best wishes

Redacted

From: Redacted@gov.scot
Sent: 23 September 2020 09:59
To: Redacted@gov.scot; Redacted@gov.scot; Redacted@gov.scot;
Redacted@gov.scot; Redacted@gov.scot; Redacted@gov.scot;
Redacted@gov.scot; Redacted@gov.scot; Redacted@gov.scot;
Redacted@gov.scot; Redacted@gov.scot; Redacted@gov.scot;
Redacted@gov.scot; Redacted@gov.scot; Redacted@gov.scot;
Redacted@gov.scot; Redacted@gov.scot;
Cc: Director of Sustainable Land Use and Rural Policy ; Redacted@gov.scot
Subject: RE: Andrew's attendance at the Environment Committee - Briefing - noon
24 September
Importance: High

Please see Sheila's comments below re Tuesday's Environment Committee. However, Sheila will no longer be attending as Redacted. I see briefing has already been sent to her from Redacted and Redacted and I'd be grateful if any outstanding items could be sent to Sheila's mailbox by **11am tomorrow** please. I'll then collate and forward onto Andrew Scott. Thank you.

Best Wishes.

Redacted
Animal Health and Welfare Division
The Scottish Government
P Spur – Saughton House
Broomhouse Drive
EDINBURGH
EH11 3XD

THE MANDATORY USE OF CLOSED CIRCUIT TELEVISION IN SLAUGHTERHOUSES (SCOTLAND) REGULATIONS 2020

Regulations introducing mandatory CCTV coverage in all areas of Scottish slaughterhouses will be laid before Parliament on 29 September 2020 – affirmative procedure.

Regulations will protect animal welfare by requiring CCTV images of all areas in Scottish slaughterhouses where live animals are recorded and kept for a 90 day period.

The Regulations should come into force on 1 July 2020, allowing slaughterhouses time, owing to Covid-19 and increased throughput over the festive period, to install compliant CCTV equipment.

Draft Regulations were consulted upon in August 2020 with stakeholder organisations from the slaughter industry and Food Standards Scotland as the enforcement agent for animal welfare at time of slaughter.

Comments received related to either the future operation of the Regulations and for the Scottish Government to reflect on support available to meet the capital cost of updating or installing CCTV provision to enable industry compliance with the Regulations. Minister RANE confirmed, on 5 February 2020, that support up to a maximum of £5,000 per establishment to assist with the installation/equipment costs is to be offered to the 6 smaller island slaughterhouses only. **Note – the offer of assistance has not yet been announced.**

=====

From: Redacted@gov.scot

Sent: 06 October 2020 08:51

To: AHW Business Management Unit

Cc: Redacted@gov.scot;

Subject: RE: Convention of the Highlands and Islands (CoHI) - Hot Topics Request
- Response Required - Deadline 12 October 2020

Redacted

Please find attached short brief on the issue of mandatory CCTV in slaughterhouses which will impact on premises in H&I

Best wishes

Redacted

THE MANDATORY USE OF CLOSED CIRCUIT TELEVISION IN SLAUGHTERHOUSES (SCOTLAND) REGULATIONS 2020

Lines to take:

- **Commitment in PfG 2019-20 to “support the industry to introduce CCTV in abattoirs before it becomes compulsory”.**
- **SG is considering support for the 6 small island slaughterhouses. This is expected to be in the region of a maximum £5,000 for each.**
- **Slaughterhouses on the mainland are not expected to be offered financial assistance. All of these have already installed some configuration of CCTV on a voluntary basis.**
- **Current advice is that CCTV does not, by itself, prevent welfare failures or secure welfare compliance. We will continue to monitor animal welfare at time of slaughter through the presence of Food Standards Scotland veterinary and inspection staff in all approved slaughterhouses.**

Background:

Regulations introducing mandatory CCTV coverage in all areas of Scottish slaughterhouses was laid before Parliament on 29 September 2020 – affirmative procedure.

Regulations will protect animal welfare by requiring CCTV images of all areas in Scottish slaughterhouses where live animals are recorded and kept for a 90 day period.

The Regulations should come into force on 1 July 2021, allowing slaughterhouses sufficient time to install compliant CCTV equipment.

Draft Regulations were consulted upon in August 2020 with stakeholder organisations from the slaughter industry and Food Standards Scotland as the enforcement agent for animal welfare at time of slaughter.

Comments received related to either the future operation of the Regulations and for the Scottish Government to reflect on support available to meet the capital cost of updating or installing CCTV provision to enable industry compliance with the Regulations. Minister RANE had previously confirmed, on 5 February 2020, that support up to a maximum of £5,000 per establishment to assist with the installation/equipment costs is to be offered to the 6 smaller island slaughterhouses only. **Note – the offer of assistance has not yet been announced. The Minister intends to contact the island slaughterhouses individually to announce assistance.**

The 6 small island slaughterhouses are:

Stornoway Abattoir, Comhairle nan Eilean Siar, Rigs Rod, Stornoway, Lewis HS1 2RF
Redacted, Gearadhmor, Craigston, Castlebay, Barra HS9 5XS
Mull Slaughterhouse Ltd, Callachary, Aros, Mull PA72 6JN
Redacted, Lochmaddy Slaughterhouse, North Uist HS6 5AH
Avonvogie Enterprises, Dunlossit Estate, Ballygrant, Islay PA45 7QL
Shetland Livestock Marketing Group, Shetland Rural Centre, Staneyhill ZE1 0NA

Redacted
6 October 2020

From: Redacted **On Behalf Of** AHW Business Management Unit
Sent: 05 October 2020 09:28
To: ARD : Animal Health and Welfare
Subject: FW: Convention of the Highlands and Islands (CoHI) - Hot Topics Request - Response Required - Deadline 12 October 2020

Good morning

Could you please let me know by **noon on 12 October** if you have anything to contribute for the Convention of the Highlands and Islands.

Many thanks

Redacted

Redacted

Animal Health & Welfare Division | Agriculture and Rural Delivery Directorate | P
Spur, Saughton House | Edinburgh | EH11 3XD

Mobile: Redacted

From: Redacted **On Behalf Of** Director of Sustainable Land Use and Rural Policy

Sent: 02 October 2020 16:38

To: Redacted@gov.scot; Redacted@gov.scot; ISD Business Support;

Redacted@gov.scot; Redacted@gov.scot; Redacted@gov.scot;

Redacted@gov.scot; Redacted@gov.scot; Redacted@gov.scot;

Redacted@gov.scot

Cc: Redacted@gov.scot; Redacted@gov.scot; Harrison F (Fiona); Saddler G

(Gerry); Voas S (Sheila); Deputy Director of RPID; Turnbull E (Eddie);

Redacted@gov.scot; Director of Sustainable Land Use and Rural Policy;

Redacted@gov.scot; Redacted@gov.scot;

Subject: Convention of the Highlands and Islands (CoHI) - Hot Topics Request - Response Required - Deadline 13 October 2020

Good afternoon Business Managers (cc'd Deputy Directors to note),

The below ask has come in with a deadline date of 13 October. I would be grateful if you could consider the below request and let me know by **COP 12 October** if you have anything to add including a short note of the details. I will then pull together an ARE wide response.

Nil returns are also required.

Many thanks,

Redacted

Director Business Support | Directorate for ARE | Saughton House | The Scottish Government

T: Redacted

From: Redacted@gov.scot

Sent: 02 October 2020 16:33

To: Directors (SST)

Subject: Convention of the Highlands and Islands (CoHI) - Hot Topics Request - Response Required - Deadline 13 October 2020

Hi All

The Convention of the Highlands and Islands (CoHI) will next meet on a virtual basis on **Monday 26 October 2020**. This meeting will be chaired by the Deputy First Minister and Cabinet Secretary for Education and Skills. CoHI will also be attended by Mr Ewing and Ms Hyslop and Mr Wheelhouse. Your assistance (by close on **13 October**) is sought in relation to briefing for this meeting.

For information, the agreed substantive agenda items are:

- Redacted

As part of the overall Ministerial briefing pack we have been asked to provide details of any relevant **hot topics/issues** for the Highlands and Islands area, as this is a virtual meeting and not specific to one local authority area this request is to cover the wider geographical area of the Highlands and Islands we would emphasise the need to keep the contributions as short as possible . These are only topics which Ministers **will need** to be aware of for the Highlands and Islands area. CoHI membership can be found [here](#).

As the policy lead in your area, if there is a topic the Ministers must be aware of, can you please provide:

- a short note (a **maximum of 1 paragraph**) on **significant hot topics/issues** which are relevant only to the Highlands and Islands
- **line(s) to take**

Ministers have been critical in the past of the amount of information provided, so I must stress that you should limit notes to those topics which you perceive to be of the highest importance, which Ministers will absolutely need to be aware of.

Please also advise/respond if you have a **Nil** return.

Please feel free to contact me if you have any queries about this, or would like to discuss what constitutes a hot topic.

The deadline for responses is **c.o.p 13 October 2020**.

Many thanks

Redacted

Strategic Engagement and Co-ordination Team

Economic Development Directorate | Scottish Government

3rd Floor, 5 Atlantic Quay, 150 Broomielaw, Glasgow, G2 8LU | T: Redacted

=====

From: Redacted@gov.scot
Sent: 16 March 2021 15:50
To: Redacted@gov.scot
Subject: RE: Compulsory CCTV in abattoirs

Hi Redacted

Drowning, not waving. Hope you are better.

Briefing attached. Redacted.

Best wishes

Redacted

From: Redacted@gov.scot
Sent: 16 March 2021 14:03
To: Redacted@gov.scot
Subject: Compulsory CCTV in abattoirs

Hi Redacted

Hope your well, Mr Ewing has a meeting on Thursday with SAMW and one of the agenda items they want to bring up is compulsory CCTV can you send me some briefing on it please.

Ta

Redacted|Livestock Policy|B1-1 Saughton House, Broomhouse
Drive,Edinburgh,EH11SXD| T Redacted

THE MANDATORY USE OF CLOSED CIRCUIT TELEVISION IN SLAUGHTERHOUSES (SCOTLAND) REGULATIONS 2020

(SAMW and the Scottish Islands Abattoir Association have a current meeting request with Minister RANE. That is likely to be accepted and it is suggested to be best forum to discuss financial assistance)

- The Mandatory Use of Closed Circuit Television in Slaughterhouses (Scotland) Regulations 2020 were approved in November 2020 and will take effect on 1 July 2021.
- The Regulations mandate the use of CCTV in all areas where live animals are present in Scottish slaughterhouses.
- Minister for Rural Affairs and the Natural Environment wrote to the 6 small island slaughterhouses on 23 October offering assistance.
- Mainland slaughterhouses have presented information to Minister but no decision made on them receiving financial assistance.

Top Lines

- The welfare of animals at time of slaughter is a matter of importance to all.
- CCTV offers benefits in increasing public trust that processes are carried out properly in accordance with legal requirements;
- Can help identifying animal welfare issues or incidents that might be missed by physical observation and provide evidence of wrong-doing
- Ministers offered financial assistance up to a maximum of £5,000 to the 6 small island slaughterhouses to install compliant equipment.
- Ministers hosted a meeting with the slaughter industry and Food Standards Scotland to determine appropriate, but least restrictive, operation of the regulations.
- Food Standards Scotland will be the only body given powers to enforce the legislation.

Background on Mandatory Use of Closed Circuit Television in Slaughterhouses (Scotland) Regulations 2020

- The legislation will ensure full coverage of all slaughtering operations in areas in which live animals are present to fully achieve the welfare benefits associated with CCTV monitoring.
- Industry required to store CCTV footage for 90 days – proportionate time to allow footage to be reviewed or for unreported incidents to come to light.
- Food Standards Scotland to be given unrestricted access to CCTV output for purposes of animal welfare at slaughter.
- Legislation introduced following public consultation in 2018 and consultation of main stakeholders on draft legislation in August 2020.

The Benefits of Mandatory CCTV

- Increased public trust that processes are carried out properly in accordance with legal requirements; as a means of identifying animal welfare issues or incidents that might be missed by physical observation; as a source of

evidence in cases of reported wrong-doing; as a management tool to assess and evaluate slaughterhouse operations; and as a valuable tool in staff training in the handling and welfare of animals.

- Observation and recording of real-time slaughter processes and individual events will contribute information to the auditing of animal welfare.
- Detection of animal welfare breaches can result in a) consequences that act as a deterrent to future poor practice; and/or b) feedback and continuous improvement to slaughterhouse practices.
- Recordings can also aid the verification of slaughterhouse compliance with legislative requirements, by providing official veterinarians with the information they need more readily and conveniently.
- CCTV footage can also be used as evidence in court proceedings and can be retained for long periods. It can also enable official veterinarians to observe animals in high welfare risk areas as well as those that are dangerous or inaccessible to people; and identify animal behaviours that might be hidden from human observers.
- Consequently, and resulting from an enhanced supervisory role and any behavioural change within slaughterhouses, compulsory CCTV will lead to improved welfare compliance within the sector.

Redacted, Animal Welfare

=====

From: Redacted@gov.scot;
Sent: 22 June 2020 14:30
To: Redacted@gov.scot; Redacted@gov.scot; Voas S (Sheila);
Redacted@gov.scot; Redacted@gov.scot; Redacted@gov.scot;
Redacted@gov.scot; Redacted@gov.scot; Redacted@gov.scot;
Redacted@gov.scot; Redacted@gov.scot; Redacted@gov.scot;
Redacted@gov.scot; Redacted@gov.scot;
Cc: Redacted@gov.scot; Redacted@gov.scot; Redacted@gov.scot
Subject: RE: PfG

Sheila

On the animal welfare side, as well as the CCTV commitment Redacted mentions we will have Redacted.

Redacted

Animal Welfare / Spur P / Saughton House / Broomhouse Drive / Edinburgh / EH11 3XD / Tel: Redacted

From: Redacted@gov.scot
Sent: 22 June 2020 08:32
To: Voas S (Sheila); Redacted@gov.scot; Redacted@gov.scot;
Redacted@gov.scot; Redacted@gov.scot; Redacted@gov.scot;
Redacted@gov.scot; Redacted@gov.scot; Redacted@gov.scot;
Redacted@gov.scot; Redacted@gov.scot; Redacted@gov.scot;
Redacted@gov.scot; Redacted@gov.scot;
Cc: Redacted@gov.scot; Redacted@gov.scot; Redacted@gov.scot
Subject: RE: PfG

Sheila

The Mandatory Use of Closed Circuit Television in Slaughterhouses (Scotland) Regulations 2020 are scheduled to be laid before the Scottish Parliament by the end of this year. These regulations will make it mandatory for Food Business Operators to capture and retain, for a 90 day period, data images of their employees' interactions with live animals in slaughterhouses in Scotland.

Redacted, Animal Welfare Branch

=====

From: Redacted@gov.scot
Sent: 19 February 2021 12:19
To: Redacted@gov.scot
Subject: RE: Contribution Request - REC Committee

Redacted

Please find attached on Redacted and CCTV at Slaughter.

My name is also against Redacted. I know nothing on this but Animal Health colleagues will provide a contribution.

Best wishes

Redacted

From: Redacted@gov.scot
Sent: 17 February 2021 14:11
To: Redacted@gov.scot; Redacted@gov.scot; Redacted@gov.scot;
Redacted@gov.scot; Redacted@gov.scot; Redacted@gov.scot;
Redacted@gov.scot ; Redacted@gov.scot; Redacted@gov.scot;
Redacted@gov.scot; Redacted@gov.scot; Redacted@gov.scot;
Redacted@gov.scot; Redacted@gov.scot; Redacted@gov.scot;
Redacted@gov.scot; Redacted@gov.scot; Redacted@gov.scot;
Redacted@gov.scot; Redacted@gov.scot; Redacted@gov.scot;
Redacted@gov.scot; Redacted@gov.scot; Redacted@gov.scot;
Redacted@gov.scot ; Redacted@gov.scot; Rural Economy Policy Mailbox
Cc: Redacted@gov.scot
Subject: Contribution Request - REC Committee
Importance: High

Good Afternoon,

Cab Sec has been invited to provide an end of session update on the rural economy. We know you have provided briefings recently for NFUS AGM and RECC budget session so we are looking for updates to be provided. Frameworks will form a separate briefing and will be coordinated by Redacted.

With this in mind I'm looking for contributions that consist of Top Lines, Key Issues and any potential Q&A's, on the following areas:

- Redacted
- The Mandatory Use of Closed Circuit Television in Slaughterhouses (Scotland) Regulations 2020 – Redacted
- Redacted

Could you please send contributions to me by close of play Tuesday 23rd February.

Thanks,

Redacted

Redacted - Common Agricultural Policy Replacement & Scottish Rural Development Programme - Agriculture Policy Development - D Spur - Saughton House – Broomhouse Drive – Edinburgh EH11 3XD

THE MANDATORY USE OF CLOSED CIRCUIT TELEVISION IN SLAUGHTERHOUSES (SCOTLAND) REGULATIONS 2020

Top Lines

- **All animals should be offered the same level of protection at the time of killing.**
- **CCTV use offers numerous benefits in animal welfare, public trust, evidence of wrongdoing or of good practice, and a management tool for the industry.**
- **Sensible, proportionate approach to enforcement is being sought for Scotland and operational details will be contained in Guidance which FSS and the industry will help to finalise.**
- **Draft guidance is being prepared for discussion with the industry.**
- **Scottish Ministers have decided to assist island slaughterhouses with up to £5,000 each, but to not assist those on the mainland.**
- **Equipment needed in island abattoirs should be proportionate and affordable for the individual establishments.**

Key Issues

- Scotland has high welfare standards for animals whether at slaughter, in transit or on farms, with strict legal requirements to be adhered to.
- All animal welfare breaches that occur within approved slaughterhouses in Scotland are investigated as a priority and action is taken by qualified official veterinary personnel working on behalf of Food Standards Scotland, who are on site during slaughter.
- Food Standards Scotland takes proportionate action in relation to animal welfare breaches, which range from verbal advice, enforcement letters, welfare enforcement notices to investigations with a view to providing reports to the Procurator Fiscal and if required the suspension or revocation of slaughterer's Certificate of Competence.

Q&A

Q. What do the Regulations require?

A. The Regulations require that Food Business Operators install CCTV system is installed that provides a complete and clear image of operations in all areas of the slaughterhouse where live animals are present. Food Business Operators must make arrangements for images from these cameras to be recorded and retained for a period of 90 days.

Q. Why is there a need to make CCTV provision mandatory in slaughterhouses?

A. Voluntary introduction has benefitted animal welfare at time of slaughter but such coverage does not cover all areas of a slaughterhouse where live animals are present and, in which, official observation may not be present.

Mandating such coverage will enable official observation and verification of any animal welfare incident, and can contribute towards the auditing of animal welfare and the verification of slaughterhouse compliance with legislation.

Q. Why will the Regulations not come into effect earlier than 1 July 2021?

A. The Scottish Government has listened to comments from the industry in setting the effective date for the draft Regulations.

A coming into force date of 1 July 2021 was considered reasonable owing to the current situation with Covid-19 and the increased throughput over the festive period which could impinge on the installation of compliant CCTV equipment.

Q. Will there be a minimum resolution be set for any images captured?

A. There is no intention for the Scottish Government to set a minimum resolution for the images produced by the CCTV system; and there are a number of reasons for this, including:

- CCTV technology is improved on a regular basis and minimum resolutions used by the CCTV industry are subject to change.
- Abattoir operators on mainland Scotland have been using CCTV for a number of years on a voluntary basis and the images they currently produce may have been used in prosecution cases already.
- Scottish Courts Service does not define a minimum resolution for use in court; and current and future minimum resolutions used by the CCTV industry are considered sufficient for evidential purposes.

Q. Is the recording of sound required by the Regulations?

A. No. Owing to the ambient noise levels in most abattoirs, the Scottish Government does not consider that there should be a requirement for CCTV systems to be able to record audio information.

Q. Who will have access to the CCTV equipment and stored CCTV footage?

A. The enforcement agency for the Regulations will be Food Standards Scotland who currently carry out the monitoring of animals at time of slaughter. The industry and FSS official veterinarians currently enjoy good working relations.

FSS will be given powers to seize, view and make copies of images captured by the compliant CCTV systems placed in Scottish slaughterhouses. FSS will also have powers to determine whether the CCTV equipment is compliant with the Regulations and require such equipment to be compliant.

Q. Will the Regulations not prove an imposition on the slaughter industry?

A. The Scottish Government does not consider that the Regulations will place an unreasonable burden on the industry.

Mainland slaughterhouses have voluntarily operated CCTV coverage in many, but not all, areas of their slaughterhouses for a number of years. In addition, financial assistance is being offered to the small island slaughterhouses.

Q. The Scottish Ministers have previously noted they were considering financial assistance to industry?

A. Minister for Rural Affairs and the Natural Environment (Mairi Gougeon) wrote to each of the small island slaughterhouses that have premises approved by Food Standards Scotland on 23 October 2020 to offer them each a maximum of £5,000 towards the purchase and installation of the necessary equipment.

It is hoped that this will cover the start-up costs for the smaller premises, and greatly help towards the start-up costs for the larger premises.

Q. How will the Regulations be put into practice? Does the slaughter industry have any concerns?

A. Redacted.

It is also intended that many of the issues that may arise will be covered in Guidance Documents which will be discussed with Food Standards Scotland and the industry before they are finalised.

=====

From: Redacted **On Behalf Of** Cabinet Secretary for Rural Economy and Tourism
Sent: 15 September 2020 16:46
To: Redacted@gov.scot; Cabinet Secretary for Rural Economy and Tourism;
Minister for Rural Affairs and the Natural Environment
Cc: DG Economy; Director of Sustainable Land Use and Rural Policy; Voas S
(Sheila); Redacted@gov.scot; Redacted@gov.scot; Redacted@gov.scot;
redacted@gov.scot; redacted@gov.scot; Redacted@gov.scot; News Desk;
Communications Rural Economy & Environment
Subject: RE: Submission - Mandatory Use of CCTV in Slaughterhouses (Scotland)
Regulations 2020

Redacted

Mr Ewing has noted.

Kind regards

Redacted

Cabinet Secretary for Rural Economy and Tourism
2N.08
St Andrews House
T: Redacted

From: Redacted@gov.scot
Sent: 15 September 2020 10:50
To: Cabinet Secretary for Rural Economy and Tourism ; Minister for Rural Affairs
and the Natural Environment
Cc: DG Economy ; Director of Sustainable Land Use and Rural Policy ; Voas S
(Sheila) ; Redacted@gov.scot; Redacted@gov.scot; Redacted@gov.scot;
Redacted@gov.scot; Redacted@gov.scot; Redacted@gov.scot;
Redacted@gov.scot; News Desk ; Communications Rural Economy & Environment
Subject: RE: Submission - Mandatory Use of CCTV in Slaughterhouses (Scotland)
Regulations 2020

Redacted

Thanks for your e-mail. DEFRA provided no financial support for the installation of
CCTV in abattoirs.

CCTV has not yet been made compulsory in Wales. The Welsh Government noted
(BBC 23 January 2020) that 14 of Wales' 24 slaughterhouses have no CCTV
cameras. The Welsh Government had offered funding to small and medium
slaughterhouses in the past, some of which could have been used for
CCTV. Uptake on the scheme by small/medium slaughterhouses was low and there
was some resistance as it was seen as a precursor to mandatory CCTV.

Best wishes

Redacted, Animal Welfare Branch

From: Redacted **On Behalf Of** Cabinet Secretary for Rural Economy and Tourism

Sent: 15 September 2020 10:06

To: Redacted@gov.scot; Cabinet Secretary for Rural Economy and Tourism;
Minister for Rural Affairs and the Natural Environment

Cc: DG Economy; Director of Sustainable Land Use and Rural Policy; Voas S
(Sheila); Redacted@gov.scot; Redacted@gov.scot; Redacted@gov.scot;

Redacted@gov.scot; Redacted@gov.scot; Redacted@gov.scot;

Redacted@gov.scot; News Desk; Communications Rural Economy & Environment

Subject: RE: Submission - Mandatory Use of CCTV in Slaughterhouses (Scotland)
Regulations 2020

Redacted

Mr Ewing has noted for his interest.

Can he be advised whether in England Defra have provided any financial support for
abattoirs to install CCTV?

Kind regards

Redacted

Cabinet Secretary for Rural Economy and Tourism

2N.08

St Andrews House

(T: Redacted)

=====

From: Redacted@gov.scot

Sent: 09 November 2020 09:17

To: Minister for Rural Affairs and the Natural Environment;

Cc: Redacted@gov.scot; Redacted@FSS.scot; Redacted@gov.scot;
Redacted@gov.scot; Communications Rural Economy & Environment;

Subject: Compulsory CCTV - Briefing for Meeting with SAMW & SIAA - 11
November 2020

Redacted, Redacted

Please find attached briefing for the Minister's meeting this Wednesday with the Scottish Association of Meat Wholesalers and the Scottish Islands Abattoir Association.

Best wishes

Redacted, Animal Welfare Branch

What	Meeting with slaughter industry representatives to discuss the mandatory use of CCTV in Scottish slaughterhouses
Where	Remote meeting by WebEx Meeting number (access code): Redacted Meeting password: Redacted
When	Wednesday 11 November 2020 – 15.30 – 16.20
Key Message(s)	Animal welfare is a high priority. The introduction of mandatory CCTV supports our commitment to animal welfare. Pleased to have been able to support the island abattoirs with installation costs. Sensible, proportionate approach to enforcement is being sought for Scotland, similar to current operation in England, and operational details will be contained in Guidance which FSS and the industry will help to finalise.
Who	Scottish Association of Meat Wholesalers: Redacted Scottish Islands Abattoir Association Redacted
Why	To discuss the implementation, and future operation, of mandatory CCTV in Scottish slaughterhouses with representatives from the slaughter industry. The REC Committee agreed on 28 October 2020 to recommend to the Parliament that it approve the Regulations.
Supporting official	Redacted, Animal Welfare Branch Redacted, Animal Welfare Branch Redacted, Food Standards Scotland
Briefing contents	Annex A: Redacted Annex B: Top Lines and Background Briefing Annex C: Redacted
Media Handling	No communications planned for this event.

MINISTER FOR RURAL AFFAIRS AND THE ENVIRONMENT

Meeting with SAMW and SIAA – 11 November 2020

ANNEX A

Redacted

ANNEX B

TOP LINES

- **All animals should be offered the same level of protection at the time of killing.**
- **CCTV use offers numerous benefits in animal welfare, public trust, evidence of wrongdoing or of good practice, and a management tool for the industry.**
- **Sensible, proportionate approach to enforcement is being sought for Scotland and operational details will be contained in Guidance which FSS and the industry will help to finalise.**
- **Draft guidance is being prepared for early discussion with the industry.**
- **Scottish Ministers have decided to assist island slaughterhouses with up to £5,000 each, but to not assist those on the mainland.**
- **Equipment needed in island abattoirs should be proportionate and affordable for the individual establishments.**

BACKGROUND BRIEFING

Current Position

1. At present, the installation of CCTV recording in abattoirs in Scotland is encouraged, on a voluntary basis, by the Scottish Government. There is no current European legislation requiring CCTV recording for monitoring or verification of animal welfare in abattoirs and the Regulations approved by the Rural Economy and Connectivity Committee on 28 October 2020 will become the only domestic legislation when approved by the Scottish Parliament.
2. The Programme for Government 2017-18 committed the Scottish Government to consult (but not legislate) on the introduction of compulsory video recording of slaughter at abattoirs in Scotland to aid enforcement of welfare requirements by abattoir management and Food Standards Scotland. That consultation took place between 28 March and 20 June 2018.
- 3.
4. Following full public consultation in 2018, the Programme for Government 2019/2020 changed the commitment to the Scottish Government bringing forward secondary legislation to make CCTV recording of slaughter compulsory in Scottish slaughterhouses; and to support the industry to introduce CCTV before it becomes compulsory.
5. The UK Government introduced regulations, effective 4 May 2018, requiring operators of slaughterhouses in England to install and operate CCTV and to make

arrangements for the retention of images for a statutory period of 90 days. Powers of inspection and enforcement came into effect on 5 November 2018, allowing businesses 6 months to comply with the new requirements.

Purpose of the Regulations

6. The proposed legislation will introduce mandatory CCTV coverage and recording of slaughtering operations in all areas of Scottish slaughterhouses in which live animals are present.

The Benefits of Mandatory CCTV

7. CCTV offers benefits in increasing public trust that processes are carried out properly in accordance with legal requirements; as a means of identifying animal welfare issues or incidents that might be missed by physical observation; as a source of evidence in cases of reported wrong-doing; as a management tool to assess and evaluate slaughterhouse operations; and as a valuable tool in staff training in the handling and welfare of animals.

8. The observation and recording of real-time slaughter processes and individual events will contribute information to the auditing of animal welfare. Detection of animal welfare breaches can result in a) consequences that act as a deterrent to future poor practice; and/or b) feedback and continuous improvement to slaughterhouse practices. Recordings can also aid the verification of slaughterhouse compliance with legislative requirements, by providing official veterinarians with the information they need more readily and conveniently.

9. CCTV footage can also be used as evidence in court proceedings and can be retained for long periods. It can also enable official veterinarians to observe animals in high welfare risk areas as well as those that are dangerous or inaccessible to people; and identify animal behaviours that might be hidden from human observers.

10. Consequently, and resulting from an enhanced supervisory role and any behavioural change within slaughterhouses, compulsory CCTV will lead to improved welfare compliance within the sector.

Public Consultation Process

11. The Scottish Ministers are obliged under section 26(5) of the Animal Health and Welfare (Scotland) Act 2006 (“the 2006 Act”) to consult persons with a relevant interest and other appropriate persons before introducing new regulations to improve or secure the welfare of animals.

12. The public consultation held between 28 March and 20 June 2018 sought views on whether the compulsory use of CCTV in all areas of abattoirs where live animals are present would enhance the welfare of animals at slaughter and increase the efficiency of enforcing and monitoring the welfare provisions by requiring food business operators to retain footage for a minimum time period. The consultation also sought views on the costs of the installation of, and storing data from,

compulsory CCTV; and whether there should be assistance with installation offered to small abattoirs.

13. A total of 245 responses were received with these coming from stakeholders in the livestock industry, the veterinary profession, animal welfare enforcement agencies and animal welfare NGOs. As with most public consultations on animal welfare topics the largest percentage (67.3%) of responses came from members of the general public.

14. The headline results found on analysis of the responses, with each grouping in broad agreement, were that:

- 94.9% of respondents favoured the compulsory installation of CCTV in all areas of approved slaughterhouses where live animals are present;
- 82.3% of those self-identifying as part of the livestock industry favoured the compulsory installation of compulsory CCTV;
- 79.0% of respondents considered the costs to business of installing CCTV equipment to be reasonable and proportionate;
- 92.2% of respondents considered it reasonable to require CCTV footage to be retained for 90 days; including 82.3% of those self-identifying as part of the livestock industry;
- 95.9% of respondents supported unrestricted access to CCTV footage by persons authorised by the Scottish Ministers;
- 2.5% of respondents opposed unrestricted access to CCTV footage but these expressed concern over who should have unrestricted access rights rather than denying access and
- 63.8% of respondents considered that the Scottish Government should provide assistance for smaller business to install CCTV should it become compulsory.

Further Stakeholder Engagement

15. The draft Regulations were consulted upon in August 2020 with stakeholder organisations from the slaughter industry and Food Standards Scotland as the enforcement agent for animal welfare at time of slaughter. That consultation suggested that an extension be granted to the proposed date of 1 February 2021 on which the Regulations would come into force.

16. Other comments related to either the future operation of the Regulations and for the Scottish Government to reflect on support available to meet the capital cost of updating or installing CCTV provision to enable industry compliance with the Regulations.

17. The Small Island Abattoirs Association offered no substantive comment on the draft Regulations, instead reiterating their view that mandatory CCTV is unnecessary in their establishments where an Official veterinarian is present at all times live animals are present

18. Redacted.

Assistance to Small Slaughterhouses

19. The public consultation responses noted that 63.8% of respondents considered that the Scottish Government should provide assistance for smaller business to install CCTV should it become compulsory.

20. In August 2018, following the publication of the analysis of the consultation responses, the Scottish Ministers considered options in relation to the way forward. The option chosen by Ministers was for CCTV recording to be required in all slaughterhouses and for financial support to be given to small slaughterhouses.

21. That decision was made in recognition that all animals should be offered the same level of protection at the time of killing and that low throughput slaughterhouses operating on a part-time basis might face financial challenges to afford the necessary equipment.

22. The Minister wrote on 23 October 2020 to the 6 small island slaughterhouses (listed below) to offer assistance up to a maximum of £5,000 for the purchase and installation of compliant CCTV equipment.

23. The assistance will be paid on the basis of receipts for the purchase and installation of CCTV equipment which will cover all areas of the slaughterhouse premises where live animals are present.

Small Slaughterhouses being Assisted

- Stornoway Abattoir, Comhairle nan Eilean Siar, Rigs Rod, Stornoway, Lewis HS1 2RF
- Redacted, Gearadhmor, Craigston, Castlebay, Barra HS9 5XS
- Mull Slaughterhouse Ltd, Callachary, Aros, Mull PA72 6JN
- Redacted, Lochmaddy Slaughterhouse, North Uist HS6 5AH
- Avonvogie Enterprises, Dunlossit Estate, Ballygrant, Islay PA45 7QL
- Shetland Livestock Marketing Group, Shetland Rural Centre, Staneyhill ZE1 0NA

Future Operation of the Draft Regulations (Once Approved)

24. The Scottish Association of Meat Wholesalers (SAMW), in their responses to consultation of draft Regulations, raised concerns that the legislation would provide the enforcement body for animal welfare at slaughter, Food Standards Scotland (FSS), with excessive powers. SAMW voiced fears that the enforcement may be over-zealous and detrimental to the industry.

25. The Scottish Government does not intend that the operation of the Regulations should have any undue impact on the slaughter industry and SAMW's concerns are considered to be overstated. In general, SAMW and FSS have good working relations and both have also been involved in UK-wide discussions on the operation of animal

welfare at slaughter which recognised the needs of both parties and discussed proportionate enforcement of the slaughter regulations.

26. The Minister wrote on 23 October 2020 to SAMW to invite them to a meeting with her and Food Standards Scotland to discuss the practical application of the Regulations.

27. SAMW has also suggested that the Regulations could be operated alongside Guidance similar to that used in England for the management of mandatory CCTV in English slaughterhouses. It is intended that would be the case, and the appropriate Guidance will be prepared in consultation with FSS and SAMW.

ANNEX C

Redacted

=====