

Meeting, Israel/Palestine Education Resources

Tuesday 5 February 2019

14:45 - 15:30

Scottish Parliament

Note of Meeting

Attendees

- John Swinney, Deputy First Minister and Cabinet Secretary for Education and Skills (DFM)
- Hugh Humphries (HH), Secretary, Scottish Friends of Palestine
- Wael Shawish (WS), Association of Palestinian Communities Scotland
- Levette Callander (LC), Scottish Palestinian Forum
- Vicky McGraw (VM), project leader of the Israel-Palestine Learning & Teaching Resource initiative
- Alan Armstrong (AA), Strategic Director, Education Scotland
- [Redacted] Assistant Director, Education Scotland
- [Redacted] Scottish Government Learning Directorate

Apologies

- John Mitchell (JM), Scottish Friends of Palestine

Welcome and Introductions

The Deputy First Minister (DFM) welcomed everyone to the meeting and introductions were made. Mr Swinney confirmed that he was happy to host the discussion which would focus on the recent developments in relation to Israel/Palestine education resources.

Discussion

Development of the educational resources

Wael Shawish (WS) confirmed that the Association of Palestinian Communities represents the Palestinian Community. He thanked the Deputy First Minister for the opportunity to meet with him. WS stated his support for the development of government-endorsed education resources that would minimise the risk that teachers pick and choose from unreliable or biased resources. WS stated his view that it was wrong to place a requirement for there to be a consensus across all stakeholder groups about the resources when it was clear that no such consensus could in fact be achieved.

Vicky McGraw (VM) said that she is aware that Education Scotland has now handed over the resources to the Educational Institute for Scotland (EIS) and is content with the progress that the EIS is making in its work to take the resources to publication.

VM confirmed that the EIS has signalled that it wishes to make progress; has contacted local authorities; has spoken to the Association of Directors of Education; and has set up a review group to update the resources. VM confirmed that it appears that the resources will be available for use in academic year 2019/20.

VM expressed a difficulty with the way the decision that EIS would assume ownership was arrived at. VM expressed frustration that the group that was intended to take the resource to the next stage was never able to complete its work. VM stated that there were some technical difficulties in that elements within the resources need to link to the Glow system. VM pointed out that now that the resources have been removed from Glow, those links are inactive.

The DFM said that the key question of whether young people should have an understanding of the Israel Palestinian situation is beyond dispute. He stated that it was also important that these materials should not be called into question if they are to be placed on Glow. He stated that he is satisfied that Education Scotland officials made every effort to achieve consensus.

WS said that it is important to note that those who objected to the resources were pro-Israel groups and not Jewish groups. LC commented that the Scottish Palestinian Forum is a broad church which includes Scottish Jews for a Just Peace.

LC posed a question about the extent to which pro-Israeli groups had commented from an educationalist perspective as opposed to a political perspective. LC asked about the decision to remove the resources from Glow. In addition, she asked what educational criteria were applied in that decision. DFM stated that the educational and political boundaries are debatable in relation to this particular subject, and that it is difficult to separate the educational merits from debates about political perspectives.

Ownership and publication of the resources

Discussion returned to the decision that EIS would assume ownership of the resources.

DFM stated that in summer 2018 it appeared possible that Education Scotland would assume ownership and would amend the resources and publish them on Glow. However it was clear from its letter of June 2018 that EIS, as joint owner of the resources, was unwilling to agree to that arrangement. DFM confirmed that he would be happy to share the letter from the EIS which would confirm this position. The DFM stated that he would not have been happy for Education Scotland to make changes to the resources and to publish them when a potential owner of the resources was not in agreement.

WS asked if there is any prospect that the materials can be published again on the Glow system. AA said that where there are contentious issues Education Scotland has to weigh up the various issues based on the strength of concern.

WS stated that it appears that unless a pro-Israeli group provides its agreement it is impossible to teach about Palestine. The DFM stated that teachers are able to teach about the Israel/Palestine situation, and that it is important that we expect teachers to take a balanced and dispassionate view. HH raised the issue of teachers referring to Palestinians as terrorists. WS reiterated the need to develop fair, impartial materials which are government endorsed.

VM stated that had the review group been reconvened it would have been possible to have reached a consensus. She asked what would happen if the EIS decided not to proceed with the publication of the resources. DFM stated that he hadn't seen any indication from EIS which would suggest that this was the case, but that he would be happy to ask EIS to confirm what they plan to do next and when.

LC asked if it would be possible to create a hyperlink from the Education Scotland Glow system to the EIS-hosted resources. The DFM confirmed that he would ask officials in Education Scotland to explore this possibility.

Concluding remarks

WS concluded by saying that the next steps agreed at the meeting are not what he would have desired but he thanked the Deputy First Minister for arranging the discussion.

DFM concluded the meeting by thanking attendees for their contributions and noting that a number of next steps would now be taken forward.

Actions

- Education Scotland to explore the possibility of introducing a link from the Glow system to the EIS-hosted resources.
- DFM to ask EIS to confirm its next steps following Education Scotland's November 2018 letter to the EIS.
- A note of the meeting to be shared with attendees for their information.

Curriculum Unit
Scottish Government Learning Directorate
February 2019

From: Andy Bruce
Learning Directorate
22 May 2017

PS/Deputy First Minister

SCHOOL MATERIAL ON ISRAEL AND PALESTINE

Purpose

1. To provide advice to the Deputy First Minister on proposed actions in relation to the draft school material prepared on Israel and Palestine and to provide draft responses to various correspondence addressed to the Deputy First Minister on issues relating to the material.

Priority

2. **URGENT.** The Deputy First Minister met with the Scottish Council of Jewish Communities (SCoJeC) and the Scottish Friends of Israel (SFI) recently. Given the sensitivities involved there is merit in him writing to relevant stakeholders, a number of which have already written to him and/or to Education Scotland, to clarify the measures being taken.

Detail

Review of Draft Material

3. In his recent meetings with representatives of SCoJeC and SFI, the Deputy First Minister agreed to consider how best to ensure the teaching materials prepared on Israel and Palestine represented a fair and balanced package. He stated that he would consider with Education Scotland how best to ensure this and agreed that, in the meantime, the resources would be held in a password protected area of Glow and would not be made available publicly.
4. The intention is that Education Scotland will now work with the partners involved in the development of the draft materials to review them, taking into account the responses received to the consultation in late 2016. Any additional related material placed on Glow since the consultation will be identified and also reviewed as part of this task. Following this work, Education Scotland will make arrangements to pilot the material with partners proposing schools for this exercise. Feedback on the material will be collated and assessed and, should there be requirement for further change, refinements can be made in discussion with partners prior to making the material available more widely.
5. The objective of this work is to reach a point where Education Scotland can confirm that partners assess the resources to be appropriate and balanced, with the best possible support from those partners having been secured. Given the point in the school session, further consultation and preparation for piloting would take place over the summer with a view to pilots running in the autumn. Piloting may need to take place over a few months to enable teachers to fit in these materials to their normal cycle of class topics and activities. Subject to his agreement of this approach, we will

keep the Deputy First Minister informed of progress and likely timing for finalising the materials following the outcomes of the pilot exercise.

6. Subject to the Deputy First Minister being content with the proposed arrangements for reviewing and developing the draft material, Education Scotland will write to all partners to invite them to participate in the process. The Deputy First Minister should be aware, however, that this process may result in some frustration being expressed by organisations representing the Palestinian community. These stakeholders consider the materials to have already been through an appropriate consultation and quality assurance process.

7. [Out of Scope]

Recommendations

20. That the Deputy First Minister:

- agrees to the proposed arrangements for Education Scotland to lead the partners in a review and piloting of the draft material on Israel and Palestine and, subject to that agreement, notes that Education Scotland will write to partners inviting them to participate;
- agrees that while this process of further review is taking place, the draft material should be placed on the Glow Blog with password protection (**option 3**), which will enable access to the material to be limited, but granted specifically to the partners involved in their development and to anyone involved in a piloting process;
- notes the Fol request received by Education Scotland (attached at **Annex A**) and that he will get the opportunity to see and clear a draft response to this; and
- considers the draft responses in his name to various correspondents on this issue attached at **Annex B**.

Andy Bruce
Deputy Director, Curriculum, Qualifications & Gaelic
22 May 2017

FREEDOM OF INFORMATION REQUEST TO EDUCATION SCOTLAND FROM THE SCOTTISH FRIENDS OF PALESTINE

Education Scotland has received the following request under the Freedom of Information (Scotland) Act 2002 from Hugh Humphries, Secretary of the Scottish Friends of Palestine.

In relation to the development of the Israel-Palestine Learning and Teaching Resource, I request the following information dating from April 2015:

- 1. On how many occasions have the representatives of Scottish Council for Jewish Communities, Scottish Friends of Israel, Glasgow Jewish Representative Council and other related bodies such as the Israeli Embassy met with John Swinney MSP and /or officers from Education Scotland?*
- 2. What were the dates of the meetings and which organisations were represented?*
- 3. On how many occasions have the representatives of the Association of Palestinian Communities, Scottish Friends of Palestine, Scottish Palestinian Forum and other related bodies such as the Palestine Alliance met with John Swinney MSP and /or officers from Education Scotland?*
- 4. What were the dates of the meetings and which organisations were represented?*

In relation to the development of the Israel-Palestine Learning and Teaching Resource, I request the following information dating from April 2015:

- 1. How many FOI requests have been received (not including this one)?*
- 2. Of these requests how many were received from the Scottish Council for Jewish Communities, Scottish Friends of Israel, Glasgow Jewish Representative Council and other related bodies such as the Israeli Embassy?*
- 3. How many were received from the Association of Palestinian Communities, Scottish Friends of Palestine, Scottish Palestinian Forum and other related bodies such as the Palestine Alliance?*

Please provide copies of all correspondence dating from April 2015 in relation to the development and "signing off" of the Israel-Palestine Learning and Teaching Resource. These should include correspondence with Education Scotland, other members of education staff, local authorities, head teachers and the various organisations mentioned above.

Deputy First Minister and Cabinet Secretary for
Education and Skills
John Swinney MSP



F/T: 0300 244 4000
E: dfmcse@gov.scot

Mrs Levette Callander
Chair
Scottish Palestinian Forum

Email: levettejc@gmail.com

09 June 2017

Dear Mrs Callander

I am writing in response to your email of 26 April regarding accessing the draft Israel and Palestine school material.

I have given consideration as to how best to proceed to ensure that fair and balanced material is available to schools. Given the sensitivity of the issues, I have asked Education Scotland to work with partners in leading a review of all the draft material. This will involve taking account of the consultation responses and will include a piloting exercise in a number of schools with feedback being used to develop the material further.

With regard to matter you raise of access to the material, it is appropriate that the material remains accessible on a restricted basis with password protection during this phase of development. Such an approach ensures access to the material can be granted to all of the partners involved in its development and to anyone involved in a piloting process.

Education Scotland will be in touch about arrangements for reviewing the material but, in the meantime, I want to say how much I and my colleagues in both Scottish Government and Education Scotland welcome the willingness of the Scottish Palestinian Forum and other organisations to be involved and engaged in educational developments.

I thank you for your contributions and I look forward to this valued relationship continuing into the future.

[Redacted]

JOHN SWINNEY

Deputy First Minister and Cabinet Secretary for
Education and Skills
John Swinney MSP



F/T: 0300 244 4000
E: dfmcse@gov.scot

Mr Hugh Humphries
Secretary
Scottish Friends of Palestine

Email: info@scottish-friends-of-palestine.org

09 June 2017

Dear Mr Humphries

Thank you for copying me into your letter of 7 April and email of 14 May to Education Scotland regarding the draft Israel and Palestine school material. I am writing in response to this.

I have given consideration as to how best to proceed to ensure that fair and balanced material is available to schools. Given the sensitivity of the issues, I have asked Education Scotland to work with partners in leading a review of all the draft material. This will involve taking account of the consultation responses and will include a piloting exercise in a number of schools with feedback being used to develop the material further.

With regard to matter you raise of access to the material, it is appropriate that the material remains accessible on a restricted basis with password protection during this phase of development. Such an approach ensures access to the material can be granted to all of the partners involved in its development and to anyone involved in a piloting process.

Education Scotland will be in touch about arrangements for reviewing the material but I do want to take this opportunity to say how much I and my colleagues in both Scottish Government and Education Scotland welcome the willingness of the Scottish Friends of Palestine and other organisations to be involved and engaged in educational developments.

I thank you for your contributions and I look forward to this valued relationship continuing into the future.

[Redacted]

JOHN SWINNEY

Deputy First Minister and Cabinet Secretary for
Education and Skills
John Swinney MSP



F/T: 0300 244 4000
E: dfmcse@gov.scot

Ms Micheline Brannan
Chair
Scottish Council of Jewish Communities
222 Fenwick Road
Giffnock
Glasgow
G46 6UE

09 June 2017

Dear Mr Brannan

I am writing in response to your correspondence of 7 December and 9 February and following our meeting of 11 May.

I valued the discussion we had at our meeting regarding the draft school material on Israel and Palestine and acknowledge the significance of the points raised by you and your colleagues. I have considered how best to proceed in relation to this matter in order to ensure that fair and balanced material is available to schools. Given the sensitivity of the issues, I have asked Education Scotland to work with partners in leading a review of all the draft material. This will involve taking account of the consultation responses and will include a piloting exercise in a number of schools with feedback being used to develop the material further. Through this review and development work, and with effective collaborative working between the partners, I am confident that we can arrive at an appropriate and balanced package of material.

You will also wish to be aware that while this process of further review is taking place, the draft material will be placed on the Glow Blog with password protection which will enable access to the material to be limited but granted specifically to the partners involved in its development and to anyone involved in a piloting process.

Education Scotland will be in touch about arrangements for reviewing the material but, in the meantime, I want to take this opportunity to say how much I and my colleagues in both Scottish Government and Education Scotland welcome the willingness of SCoJeC and other organisations to be involved and engaged in educational developments.

I thank you for your contributions and I look forward to this valued relationship continuing into the future.

[Redacted]

JOHN SWINNEY

Deputy First Minister and Cabinet Secretary for
Education and Skills
John Swinney MSP



F/T: 0300 244 4000
E: dfmcse@gov.scot

Ms Carol McPherson
Education Support Officer
North Lanarkshire Council

Email: McPhersonC@northlan.gov.uk

09 June 2017


Dear Ms McPherson

I am writing in response to your email of 3 May concerning the draft school material on Israel and Palestine.

I have given consideration as to how best to proceed to ensure that fair and balanced material is available to schools. Given the sensitivity of the issues, I have asked Education Scotland to work with partners in leading a review of all the draft material. This will involve taking account of the consultation responses and will include a piloting exercise in a number of schools with feedback being used to develop the material further.

With regard to matter you raise of access to the material, it is appropriate that the material remains accessible on a restricted basis with password protection during this phase of development. Such an approach ensures access to the material can be granted to all of the partners involved in its development and to anyone involved in a piloting process.

Education Scotland will be in touch about arrangements for reviewing the material but, in the meantime, can I thank you for your contributions to date.


[Redacted]

JOHN SWINNEY

F/T: 0300 244 4000
E: dfmcse@gov.scot

Mr John Mitchell
Executive
Scottish Friends of Palestine

Email: telljm@yahoo.co.uk

09 June 2017

Dear Mr Mitchell

I am writing in response to your email of 14 April regarding accessing the draft Israel and Palestine school material.

I have given consideration as to how best to proceed to ensure that fair and balanced material is available to schools. Given the sensitivity of the issues, I have asked Education Scotland to work with partners in leading a review of all the draft material. This will involve taking account of the consultation responses and will include a piloting exercise in a number of schools with feedback being used to develop the material further.

With regard to the matter you raise of access to the material, it is appropriate that the material remains accessible on a restricted basis with password protection during this phase of development. Such an approach ensures access to the material can be granted to all of the partners involved in its development and to anyone involved in a piloting process.

Education Scotland will be in touch about arrangements for reviewing the material but, in the meantime, I want to say how much I and my colleagues in both Scottish Government and Education Scotland welcome the willingness of the Scottish Friends of Palestine and other organisations to be involved and engaged in educational developments.

I thank you for your contributions and I look forward to this valued relationship continuing into the future.

[Redacted]

JOHN SWINNEY

Deputy First Minister and Cabinet Secretary for
Education and Skills
John Swinney MSP



F/T: 0300 244 4000
E: dfmcse@gov.scot

Mr Arthur West
Chair
Scottish Friends of Palestine
16 Annandale Way
Irvine
KA1 11RA

09 June 2017

Dear Mr West

I am writing in response to your email of 26 April regarding accessing the draft Israel and Palestine school material.

I have given consideration as to how best to proceed to ensure that fair and balanced material is available to schools. Given the sensitivity of the issues, I have asked Education Scotland to work with partners in leading a review of all the draft material. This will involve taking account of the consultation responses and will include a piloting exercise in a number of schools with feedback being used to develop the material further.

With regard to matter you raise of access to the material, it is appropriate that the material remains accessible on a restricted basis with password protection during this phase of development. Such an approach ensures access to the material can be granted to all of the partners involved in its development and to anyone involved in a piloting process.

Education Scotland will be in touch about arrangements for reviewing the material but, in the meantime, I want to say how much I and my colleagues in both Scottish Government and Education Scotland welcome the willingness of the Scottish Friends of Palestine and other organisations to be involved and engaged in educational developments.

I thank you for your contributions and I look forward to this valued relationship continuing into the future.

[Redacted]

JOHN SWINNEY

**NOTE: Meeting with Association of Palestinian Communities in Scotland;
Palestine Alliance**

Tuesday 16 June 2015

Attendees:

Dr. Allan, Minister for Learning, Science and Scotland's Languages

Dr. Issam Hijjawi, Association of Palestinian Communities in Scotland; Palestine Alliance

Vicky McGraw, Glasgow and Clyde Valley Rights Based Learning Management Group

Albie O'Neill, Association of Palestinian Communities

[Redacted] Scottish Government

[Redacted] Education Scotland

SUMMARY OF DISCUSSION POINTS

Association of Palestinian Communities	<ul style="list-style-type: none">• Outline of background incident pertaining to inappropriate teaching and learning material about Palestine in a North Lanarkshire school• Indication of positive engagement with North Lanarkshire Council personnel about this matter• Seeking assurance that this kind of material is not used in Scottish schools• Clear affirmation of a desire to move forward to ensure that this is not repeated; desire to seek opportunities to work in partnership to explore possibilities of how Palestinians in Scotland can support learners to understand the story of Palestine• Outline of recent engagement with British Council's Connecting Classrooms programme to develop partnerships between schools/local authorities in Scotland and Palestine• Outline of work with representatives from numerous local authorities in response to the North Lanarkshire incident to develop appropriate teaching and learning materials• Enquiry if financial support would be available from Scottish Government for the current initiatives (to develop teaching and learning materials, and partnerships between schools in Palestine and Scotland)• Clarification of need for funding to support this development: for example, to release teachers from school to write the material; for design and reproduction of materials; for production of audio-visual resources from partnership visits• Glasgow City Council's Lord Provost has offered £2000 to enable Glasgow teachers to support this development• Requested to meet again with Dr. Allan to discuss progress
Dr. Allan	<ul style="list-style-type: none">• Acknowledgement of offence caused in this situation and affirmation that this is not indicative of Scottish Government's position• Commitment to support high quality education that appreciates equality and diversity within Scotland

	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Agreed to meet again with the group in September • Agreed to explore if funding was available within Scottish Government and Education Scotland to support this development
Education Scotland	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Currently engaged in supporting the cross-authority working group in scoping out the development of appropriate learning and teaching materials • New materials should not be seen as a 'stand-alone' resource, but must be located within the context of Curriculum for Excellence • Suggested support: engage colleagues from across the organisation who have expertise in developing such curricular resources • Suggested support: engage with representatives of APC to review progress and content of this development

ACTIONS

	Action	Comments
Scottish Government / Education Scotland	Dr Allan's Office to arrange ministerial meeting with APC for September	Suggest that this should be rearranged for a time when progress has been made and can be reviewed; this can be monitored through PMcW's engagement with Vicky McGraw. This amendment would need to be included in feedback to Dr Hijjawi
	PMcW to explore possibility of funding of this development within Scottish Government and Education Scotland	Ms White MSP has previously engaged with Vicky McGraw around this development work through the cross-party Palestine group; Vicky reports that Ms White thought that funding may be available from Scottish Government. Suggest enquiring if this is an intention of the group. Suggest making enquiries with relevant teams in Scottish Government and Education Scotland (PMcW): [Redacted] APC would need to be informed of the outcome of these enquiries
	PMcW to engage colleagues across Education Scotland to offer support and advice on the development of this resource in line with current standards and practice	Meeting has been scheduled for 12 th August in Education Scotland's office in Glasgow
	PMcW to meet with representatives of APC to review progress and content of development.	Details to be agreed with Vicky McGraw once development has progressed
APC	To convene a reference group to review progress and content of the development	
	If funding is identified, further details about requirements and costs would need to be provided	

GG/26.11.18

Ms McGraw
Project Co-ordinator

(via email)

26 November 2018

Dear Ms McGraw

Thank you for your letter of 14 November 2018.

I have been fully briefed by my staff around all aspects of the development of the learning and teaching resources on Israel/Palestine and am confident that I am in possession of all of the facts.

The resources were made available through Glow in early 2017. The purpose was to allow teachers to post comments as part of a piloting exercise. In response to concerns about some of the materials included in the resources, Education Scotland then made the resources password-protected on Glow. In May 2017, and following concerns expressed by stakeholders, the Deputy First Minister asked Education Scotland to remove a specific animation from the resources.

Earlier this year, Education Scotland explored the possibility of taking ownership of the resources. All eight local authorities involved in the initial development of the resources were content for ownership to be assumed by Education Scotland. However, the EIS wrote to me in June to indicate that they would not be content to assign ownership to Education Scotland. I understand that you, as former Chair of the Glasgow and Clyde Rights Based Learning Group, also claim ownership of the resources. I also know that the Children and Young People's Commissioner was considering his position with regard to ownership, but am not aware of what was decided.

The purpose of Education Scotland taking ownership of the resources was to enable us to revise and develop them further in line with Curriculum for Excellence, and make them available on the Glow as an Education Scotland-endorsed package. Given that the EIS as joint owners of the resources do not agree to the sort of revision to the resources which Education Scotland was proposing, we are unable to proceed as planned. I therefore do not envisage Education Scotland having any further involvement in the project.

Education Scotland is unable to endorse the resources in their current format and for that reason I do not intend to make them available on Glow. I agreed to the EIS offer to publish the resources on their website as that will enable them to be available to those teachers and local authorities who wish to use them.

Yours sincerely

[Redacted]

Gayle Gorman
HM Chief Inspector of Education/Chief Executive

GG/JBR

Larry Flanagan

(via Email)

*** November 2018

Dear Larry

Learning and Teaching Resources on Israel/Palestine

Thank you for your letter dated 14 June 2018.

I am conscious that work to produce a set of learning and teaching resources on Israel/Palestine has been ongoing for some considerable time. We have worked hard with a range of groups and individuals to try to make available to teachers a set of resources which are appropriately balanced, and which have the best possible levels of consensus and support from all stakeholders.

Given the challenges involved, I have taken some time to consider the EIS's offer to publish the resources and to agree the best way forward.

In May 2017, the Deputy First Minister (DFM) asked Education Scotland to carry out a review of the resources involving all stakeholders and to try to achieve consensus before they were piloted in schools. A series of meetings with stakeholder groups then took place in autumn 2017. It proved impossible to achieve a consensus.

DFM then asked Education Scotland to continue to try to find a solution, and this involved trying to get agreement to Education Scotland leading work on revision of the resources. The eight local authorities previously involved in the Glasgow and Clyde Rights-Based Learning Group agreed to this. However, I note from your letter of 14 June that the EIS, as joint owner of the resources, does not agree to the sort of revision which Education Scotland was envisaging.

Taking all of the above into account, and following discussions with key parties, including local authorities and the DFM, I consider that the best way forward is for you as joint owner of the resources to publish them, as you offered to do in your letter of 14 June. This will mean that the resources will be removed from GLOW, but may be made available by the EIS via its own website.

I shall be writing to all key stakeholders to advise them of this decision and to thank them for their contributions.

Kind regards

[Redacted]

Gayle Gorman
HM Chief Inspector of Education/Chief Executive

ENGAGEMENT TITLE: MEETING WITH MICHELINE BRANNAN – SCOTTISH COUNCIL OF JEWISH COMMUNITIES (SCoJeC)

<i>Date and Time of Engagement</i>	Thursday, 11 May 2017 10.00 – 10.45
<i>Where</i>	T4.23, Parliament
<i>Who</i>	Micheline Brannan, Chair, SCoJeC Mr Ephraim Borowski, Director, SCoJeC Mrs Nicola Livingston, co-President, Glasgow Jewish Representative Council Ms Danielle Bett, member of SCoJeC Council
<i>Key Purpose / Message</i>	Meeting to discuss SCoJeC concerns over the development of a teaching resource on Israel and Palestine.
<i>Official Support</i>	Andy Bruce, Head of Qualifications, Curriculum and Gaelic Division [Redacted] Alan Armstrong, Strategic Director, Education Scotland [Redacted] [Redacted] Learning Directorate [Redacted]

Key points

1. In a telephone discussion with Andy Bruce on 28 April, Micheline Brannan indicated 3 main concerns with the development of the Israel/Palestine teaching resource:

- Concern that the impetus for developing the resource had arisen from the Cross Party Group on Palestine
- Doubts over the impartiality of the Chair of the development group, [Redacted], who SCoJeC believe to be pro-Palestinian;
- Dissatisfaction over the consultation process for the resource.

2. Whilst SCoJeC have doubts over the appropriateness of developing such a resource at all, they now believe this project to be so flawed that it should not proceed any further. SCoJeC concerns have been exacerbated by an administrative error that led to correspondence from Ms Brannan being wrongly withdrawn from the MACCS system. Whilst appreciative of the apologies for this received from both DFM and officials, Ms Brannan remains keen to receive a written response to her concerns. Advice and a draft response was provided to DFM on 10 April.

3. Ms Brannan also attended the Cross Party Group on Palestine on 25 April at which the proposed teaching resource was discussed, primarily in relation to the fact that the resource is no longer openly available on GLOW. Following discussions with Education Scotland colleagues, the resource is available on a password-protected part of GLOW, which is appropriate given that the resource is still under development. However, this move has led to the Scottish Friends of Palestine writing to Education Scotland, copied to DFM, expressing concern over the availability of the resources and seeking a meeting with DFM.

Education Scotland advice

4. The resources have not been developed by Education Scotland but by a local authority group of officers based in the central belt: the Glasgow and Clyde Rights-Based Learning Group (GCRBL). Education Scotland officers have supported the group by providing accommodation and hosting meetings. As part of the consultation process, Education Scotland reviewed the resource and requested a number of changes to be made which were incorporated into the materials by the group.

5. Education Scotland has maintained a clear position throughout the consultation that the resources have not been endorsed or approved by them. There has been no reference to the resources on Education Scotland's web estate or social media.

6. The resources have now been through several iterations and Education Scotland considers that they are able to provide learners with a balanced but sensitive learning experience. The consultation to date has provided partners with opportunities to comment on the resources and has been professionally planned and delivered. However, only by trialing the resources in class will it be known if they successfully engage learners. The feedback from the piloting needs to be accessible to all practitioners on GLOW with the facility for further amendments in a safe and secure environment.

7. Education Scotland have recently spoken to [Redacted] at GCRBL who own the resource to ascertain if she is willing to work with all partners to produce an introduction statement from each perspective. However, given the concerns about [Redacted] impartiality, it is possible that SCoJeC will not wish to engage any further. As a compromise position, this task could be overseen by Education Scotland.

Background Briefing

Background and Publication of Resources

8. In March 2015, it came to light that a homework worksheet was issued to P7 children at North Lanarkshire school which portrayed Palestinians as terrorists/suicide bombers and required pupils to provide examples of 'Palestinian terrorist activity'. A similar worksheet was discovered in use in a Glasgow secondary school in December 2015.

9. The incident was covered in the national press and, among a number of actions that followed, Dr Allan met with the Association of Palestinian Communities (APC) in Scotland. Following this Education Scotland has supported the Glasgow and Clyde Rights-Based Learning Group (GCRBL), a collaborative group of representatives from eight local authorities, to develop more appropriate teaching and learning resources. GCRBL is chaired by [Redacted], formerly a Quality Improvement Officer at West Dunbartonshire Council, in a voluntary capacity.

10. GCRBL's work began in April 2015 with the aim of developing balanced advice and resources which supports good teaching and learning of this sensitive and complex topic that:

- develops learners' knowledge and understanding of human rights and how this relates to life locally, nationally and internationally (including details of specific entitlements, and their universal and unconditional application);
- explores the background to the Israeli-Palestinian situation;
- explores the challenges to peace in these countries;
- allows learners to consider and be able to demonstrate their role as local and global citizens in promoting justice and peace.

11. Concerns have been expressed by others, including the Scottish Friends of Israel (SFI), over the new teaching and learning resources. These partners have been invited to contribute their views on the development of the resources but it is not clear to us at this stage the extent to which these organisations, including SCOJEC, engaged. We are seeking this more information now.

The consultation process

12. During November and December 2016, there was a three day consultation. This included: one day for the Jewish/Israeli community, including the Scottish Council of Jewish Communities; Scottish Friends of Israel; and Scottish Jews for a Just Peace. There was one day for the Palestinian community, including: Association for Palestinian Communities; Scottish Friends of Palestine; and Palestine Alliance. There was a third day for parent and student representatives. Generally, the resources were well received except for the groups representing the Israeli/Jewish communities who remain strongly opposed. There were opportunities for all groups to submit further comments after the initial consultation day. The group did ask for the comments to be returned within a three day window but those that arrived late were acted upon where possible. A fuller note on the consultation events can be found at **Annex A**. The last column on the table shows what the group did in response to the requests for changes.

13. Education Scotland's Senior Education Officer for Religious and Moral Education has well established links with the Israeli/Jewish group and he attended the consultation events to provide a professional overview and to reassure partners. Cathie Begley, Children and Young People's Commissioner, joined the meeting of the Jewish communities in the afternoon

14. Education Scotland understands that all parties involved in the consultation were informed that resources would be piloted in a few schools, and the feedback from teachers used to inform further improvements. GCRBL group agreed with Education Scotland that the resources would need to be moved from their current position on a GLOW blog (managed by the group) to an area relating to global citizenship to allow staff to access the materials and to have a facility to share the findings from pilots with teaching professionals. The password was removed from the blog on 23 March 2017 ready for the next stage of the consultation but the move to a new area of Glow was temporarily halted following discussions with Scottish Government senior staff. The resources have now been moved back to an area which can only be accessed by teaching professionals issued with passwords. The removal of the resources, albeit temporarily from the blog, has not been greeted with approval by some of the Palestinian groups. Education Scotland's practice is not to expect practitioners to post comments arising from a pilot on an outward facing website especially with an issue as sensitive as this one.

15. Education Scotland has not been able to issue access right to partners to view the resources on Glow as safeguarding procedures require all adults to have undergone Disclosure checks and a few of the individuals have been cleared. Education Scotland, therefore, has had to copy the extensive range of resources back onto the blog (27 April 2017) but with a clear statement that the materials are still undergoing consultation. Access to the materials is restricted by password to partners involved in the consultation.

16. The piloting of resources is an important development in the production of any new learning and teaching materials. Learners invariably find glitches or areas that need to be clarified further in new materials and these need to be addressed before publication. This approach is especially important due to the number of videos, presentations and other resources incorporated into what is in effect a library of resources. The impact of these materials will vary across schools which all have their own unique context.

17. The Association of Palestinian Communities requested Scottish Government funding to support this development but no resource was available from Scottish Government or Education Scotland. Education Scotland has, however, provided support to the Chair of GCRBL in holding several consultation sessions with interested partners on both side of the issue.

Correspondence from SCoJeC

18. Micheline Brannan, the Chair of SCoJeC (Scottish Council of Jewish Communities) wrote to you, copying Education Scotland, on 7 December. She raised a number of issues in relation to the teaching resources, including:

- the manner in which the resource has been prepared;
- the appropriateness of the resource at all for use in P6-S2;
- the potential for the topic to be divisive and raise inclusion issues; and
- a perceived lack of inclusion of the Israeli and Jewish perspectives.

19. Learning Directorate officials withdrew this letter from the MACCS system on 4 January. This was done in error following your meeting of 14 December with Dr Issam Hijjawi of the Association of Palestinian Communities in Scotland (a member of the Palestine Alliance) and Vicky McGraw of GCRBL.

20. This error was established following a recent exchange between Paul Johnston and Ms Brannan. Immediately upon realising the error that had been made, officials contacted Ms Brannan's office on 27 March to explain that the case had been mistakenly withdrawn from the correspondence system and to convey apologies for this.

Notes on the consultation events

Israel/Palestine Teaching Resource Community Consultation

Following wide consultation with education professionals and subsequent adaptations to the resource, three days of community consultation have been arranged as follows.

Israeli community consultation day 29 November 2016 (Optima)

Scottish Council of Jewish Communities

Micheline Brannan

Margalit Borowski

Itamar Nitzan

Scottish Friends of Israel

Stanley Grossman

Raymond Mann

Claire Singerman

Scottish Jews for a Just Peace

Henry Maitles

Glasgow Jewish Representative Council

Frank Angell and Pauli Morron

Palestinian community consultation day 6 December 2016 (Optima)

Association of Palestinian Communities

Issam Hajjawi

Wael Shawadish

Scottish Friends of Palestine

Hugh Humphries

John Mitchell

Ross Campbell

Scottish Palestinian Forum

Levette Callander and one other

Parent/Student consultation day 7 December 2016 (North Lanarkshire)

North Lanarkshire have undertaken arrangement of the parent/student consultation event.

Commissioners/developers will be represented by:

Glasgow and Clyde Local Authority Officers: [Redacted] Glasgow City Council

EIS: [Redacted]

Children and Young Person's Commissioner for Scotland: Cathy Begley

Education Scotland: [Redacted]

Project Coordinator [Redacted]

Teacher involved in development is [Redacted]

Israel and Palestine Learning and Teaching Resource
Collation of Consultation Responses

Consultation partner	You said	We Did
Scottish Council for Jewish Communities February 2016	There was a rise in anti-Semitic incidents following the Gaza war in 2014 and such incidents have no place in modern Scottish society, any classroom materials produced should challenge such attitudes and behaviour.	Lesson added on anti-Semitism and Islamophobia Lesson added where children compile ground rules to promote respectful language and attitudes.
Education Professionals June 2016 Statement of ongoing support for further development of the resource and/or detailed responses to consultation received from teachers and education officers from Glasgow, Renfrewshire, Inverclyde, North Lanarkshire, West Dunbartonshire, Education Scotland and EIS.	Material is quite powerful and rich for classroom use.	No action
	Very applicable to classes and curriculum	No action
	Consistency of levels, need for greater progression in knowledge and skills	Levels re-examined and changes made.
	As it stands, there is too much detail and the amount of time it would take could hinder uptake. Should be a mandatory core element that is brief enough to be covered in a few lessons with the possibility of moving onto greater depth or other areas of the curriculum.	Exemplar 'units' for Level 2/3 and Level 3/4, Introduction to Israel and Palestine, along with teacher guides have been produced to give an example of how material could be drawn from the library of resources.
	More information from Palestinian perspective than Israeli perspective	After further research, more information was added from an Israeli perspective. Engagement was sought from the Israel/Jewish community to help identify authoritative information that accurately reflects the Israeli perspective. Every attempt has been made to accurately reflect different voices and truthfully present authoritative information. In the context of this resource, balance should be an objective test - what an objective third party might consider balanced and accurate.
	Need introduction to outline background, purpose, guiding principles and aim of materials.	Rationale and teacher guidance produced.
	Possibility of IDL opportunity to bring in Geography – land use, water, counties etc	Further information added on water and land use. Teachers will develop their own approach to how they use the material. Key questions

		have been added to ensure balance is maintained.
	Most of human rights section is fine as it stands but presentation is a bit wordy.	Presentation replaced by film clip.
Stakeholders from Israeli/Jewish community in Scotland 29 November 2016 – Scottish Council for Jewish Communities, Scottish Friends of Israel, Scottish Jews for a Just Peace and Glasgow Representative Jewish Council	<p>No need for such a resource in schools as:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • It would give rise to anti-Semitism • There is no way of teaching this topic well or right • There can be no balance when children feel threatened by a topic they are taught • The topic is too complicated to be understood by school children • The Jewish community, especially children, would be threatened <p>The content of the resource is flawed by:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • ‘omission after omission’ • Bias towards Palestinian perspective • Sources such as the UN are not reliable • Lack of robust quality assurance • The definition of Islamophobia refers to terrorist/Muslim conflation but has no reference to Israel/Jewish conflation 	Bearing in mind that this resource has been approved by educators and any decision about its introduction to schools will be made on the basis of its educational value, consideration will be given to points made.
¹ Further comments following 29 November 2016	<p>Scottish Jews for a Just Peace</p> <p><i>Although there are claims that this resource will fuel anti-Semitism, all evidence from virtually all research groups is that anti-Semitism is fuelled by the events in Israel/Palestine. Therefore, a balance pack such as this can only help.</i></p>	No action
	<p>Scottish Council for Jewish Communities, Scottish Friends of Israel, Glasgow Representative Jewish Council, Scottish Association of Jewish Teachers responded–</p> <p><i>...the project is compromised beyond redemption by its failure to provide a fair and objective presentation of a very complex</i></p>	No action

¹ At the request of the Israeli/Jewish community representatives, home access to the resource was provided to allow more time for further comment

	<i>conflict. ... the subject is fundamentally divisive, potentially harmful not only to community and school relations but also potentially to individual pupils... We remain strongly of the opinion that this project should under no circumstances be made available as a resource to schools.</i>	
	Personal comment provided by one individual who attended the consultation event but did not wish to represent any organisation- <i>I don't have any suggestions for improvements simply because I found the material we were given very biased. Any comment on this material might be used as an attempt to legitimise this imbalanced teaching resource.</i>	No action
Stakeholders from the Palestinian community in Scotland 6 December 2016 – Association of Palestinian Communities, Scottish Friends of Palestine, Scottish Palestinian Forum	The resource is more favourable to Israel than to Palestine.	When amendments have been made, further checks will be done to ensure as much balance as possible.
	Need for the resource to be more accessible and child-friendly.	Will seek more visual materials and teachers will adapt to suit needs of learners.
	Description of 2014 incursion into Gaza was too bland and did not show human rights abuses.	Consideration will be made to adding visual material relating to Gaza such as the BBC documentary <i>Children of the Gaza War</i>
	Teacher notes from 'One Voice' biased in favour of Israel.	Material will be reviewed.
	It is not a 'Jewish/Muslim' conflict but an Israeli/Arab one	Material will be reviewed.
	One map wrongly showed Jerusalem as the capital of Israel.	Map will be changed.
	An important strength is that the resource tries to find common ground and looks at how people are trying to work together to move forward rather than always looking back.	
	This is a useful step in providing an opportunity for children to learn about this issue.	
	Omissions: house demolitions, two systems of law in West Bank, effects of wall, land ownership, media bias, future of Gaza, British Mandate, world-wide Palestinian refugees with no right of return, international law eg UN resolutions and Geneva Convention, important omission in Balfour Declaration statement - 'no prejudice to the indigenous peoples', settler violence, blockade of	Within the constraints of appropriate age and stage and time restrictions, consideration will be given to points made.

	<p>Gaza, peaceful, non-violent protests such as BDS (especially as violent protest is prominent), economic and social effects of separation barrier</p> <p>The description of the climate (quite warm) could include that there is no rainfall throughout the summer, making access to water an issue.</p> <p>The card recalling the Kibbutz movement should make clear that it now has a minor role, if any.</p> <p>The card referring to the 2nd Intifada mentions casualty figures. It would be interesting to have the same information on the 1st Intifada card.</p> <p>Teachers and pupils may not understand how to fill in the Venn diagram as no longer taught in maths.</p> <p>There are different narratives of immigration quotas. The British introduced strict quotas just before WWII to end the rebellion that had broken out in 1936.</p>	<p>Within the constraints of appropriate age and stage and time restrictions, consideration will be given to points made.</p>
<p>¹Further comments following 6 December 2016</p>	<p>The card referring to the 2nd Intifada mentions casualty figures. It would be interesting to have the same information on the 1st Intifada card.</p> <p>The heading "Bombing by Palestinians" out-of-date and not balanced.</p> <p>'invading Arab armies' presents an inaccurate picture</p> <p>Land ownership relative to the UN Partition Plan is complicated.</p> <p>The 1943 '<u>A Survey of Palestine</u>', produced for the Anglo-American Committee of Enquiry by the <u>British Mandatory</u> authorities, 34% of land Jewish owned with 32% of the population Jewish – <u>The Jewish Virtual Library</u> gives the percentage of the Jewish population as 30%.</p>	<p>Within the constraints of appropriate age and stage and time restrictions, consideration will be given to points made.</p>
<p>Students 2 December 2016</p>	<p><i>Too much information at the beginning before getting to the actual topic.</i></p> <p><i>Level fine for most but some pupils may find it difficult</i></p> <p><i>Welcome thought provoking aspect and that questions must be</i></p>	<p>These points will be considered in a review of the material.</p>

North Lanarkshire arranged a consultation meeting with six secondary students.	<i>grappled with - no easy answers.</i>	
	<i>Important to study this topic in school.</i>	
Parents 7 December 2016	<i>Well thought out with lots of information from different viewpoints.</i>	No action
North Lanarkshire arranged a consultation meeting with parents representing 4 primary and 3 secondary schools from both the denominational and non-denominational sectors	<i>There is a lot of written material, children are expecting more interactive and visual stimulus especially in primary. A child with dyslexia would find the text difficult. Although teachers will take what is there and make sure the activities suit the needs of the children in their class. There is enough there to make teachers feel confident about the content and they would just have to add activities.</i>	Consider adding more visual and interactive material. Teachers will make adaptations to meet the needs of learners.
	<i>Children should learn about real situations in the world and be aware that the media might not always show full, unbiased facts. Comes across as truthful, it is important for children to learn that the truth will not always be evenly balanced.</i>	No action
	<i>Would like to see more on media bias.</i>	Consider enhancing section on media.
	<i>Anti-Semitism cards too difficult for younger pupils. Case studies too long, should be reduced.</i>	Consider reducing content of both.
	<i>This is a topic I would like my child to learn in school.</i>	No action
	<i>I would not have any worries about my child studying this topic. Care has been taken to ensure children respect the views of others. It doesn't ask children to take sides but to learn that different people see things differently.</i>	No action

Chain 1

From: [Redacted]

Sent: 13 February 2019 13:55

To: Deputy First Minister and Cabinet Secretary for Education and Skills

<DFMCSE@gov.scot>

Cc: Armstrong A (Alan) <[Redacted]@educationscotland.gsi.gov.uk>; Renton JB

(Jane) <[Redacted]@educationscotland.gsi.gov.uk>; Sheppard L (Lesley)

<[Redacted]@gov.scot>; Robertson FMG (Fiona) (Director of Learning)

<[Redacted]@gov.scot>; Pentland MK (Malcolm) <[Redacted]@gov.scot>; Gorman

G (Gayle) <[Redacted]@educationscotland.gsi.gov.uk>

Subject: RE: SFoP: minute of meeting 5.2.19

[Redacted]

Please find attached a draft note from the meeting held on 5th February, for inclusion in DFM's box this evening.

[Redacted]

[Redacted]

Team Leader, Curriculum, Parental Engagement and Pupil Participation

0131 244 0970

-----Original Message-----

From: [Redacted]@gov.scot> On Behalf Of Deputy First Minister and Cabinet Secretary for Education and Skills

Sent: 12 February 2019 13:06

To [Redacted]@gov.scot>

Cc: Deputy First Minister and Cabinet Secretary for Education and Skills

<DFMCSE@gov.scot>; Armstrong A (Alan)

<[Redacted]@educationscotland.gsi.gov.uk>; Renton JB (Jane)

<[Redacted]@educationscotland.gsi.gov.uk>

Subject: FW: SFoP: minute of meeting 5.2.19

Hi [Redacted]

Please see email below from Hugh Humphries.

When can we expect to receive the draft minute for the DFM to approve?

Thanks very much in advance.

[Redacted]

[Redacted] Deputy Private Secretary to John Swinney MSP | Deputy First Minister of Scotland and Cabinet Secretary for Education & Skills | Scottish Government | St Andrew's House | Edinburgh | EH1 3DG ||Tel: 0131 244 3650 | E: DFMCSE@gov.scot

-----Original Message-----

From: Scottish Friends of Palestine <info@scottish-friends-of-palestine.org>

Sent: 12 February 2019 12:50

To: Deputy First Minister and Cabinet Secretary for Education and Skills
<DFMCSE@gov.scot>

Cc: Levette Callander <levettejc@gmail.com>; Vicky McGraw
<vmcgraw7@gmail.com>; Wael Shawish <wael@shawish.net>

Subject: SFoP: minute of meeting 5.2.19

Dear Mr Swinney,

Further to our meeting last Tuesday I am enquiring with regard to receiving a copy of the minute taken of the meeting.

These things, I know, can take time. However, I look forward to receiving a copy at your earliest convenience.

Regards

Hugh Humphries

Sec

Scottish Friends of Palestine

cc Levette Callander, Vicky McGraw, Wael Shawish

Chain 2

From: Bruce A (Andrew) <[Redacted]@gov.scot>

Sent: 22 May 2017 12:47

To: Deputy First Minister and Cabinet Secretary for Education and Skills
<DFMCSE@gov.scot>

Cc: DG Learning & Justice <DGLJ@gov.scot>; Robertson FMG (Fiona)
<[Redacted]@gov.scot>; Pentland MK (Malcolm) <[Redacted]@gov.scot>;
[Redacted]@gov.scot>; [Redacted]@gov.scot>;

[Redacted]@educationscotland.gsi.gov.uk>; Armstrong A (Alan)
<Alan.Armstrong@educationscotland.gsi.gov.uk>;

[Redacted]@educationscotland.gsi.gov.uk>; Berrill M (Mary)

[Redacted]@educationscotland.gsi.gov.uk>; Reilly G (Gayle)

<[Redacted]@educationscotland.gsi.gov.uk>;

[Redacted]@educationscotland.gsi.gov.uk>; [Redacted]
@gov.scot

Subject: religious and moral education - submission on Israel/Palestine teaching resource next steps - 22 may 2017

Please find attached a submission providing advice for DFM on next steps in relation to the Israel/Palestine teaching resource, along with an annex providing draft responses to the range of correspondence received on this matter.

Thanks

Andy

Andy Bruce
Deputy Director, Curriculum, Qualifications and Gaelic
Scottish Government

[Redacted]@gov.scot

Chain 3

From: [Redacted]@gov.scot> **On Behalf Of** Deputy First Minister and Cabinet Secretary for Education and Skills

Sent: 09 June 2017 16:00

To: Bruce A (Andrew) <[Redacted]@gov.scot>; Deputy First Minister and Cabinet Secretary for Education and Skills <DFMCSE@gov.scot>

Cc: DG Learning & Justice <DGLJ@gov.scot>; Robertson FMG (Fiona)

[Redacted]@gov.scot>; Pentland MK (Malcolm)

<[Redacted]@gov.scot> [Redacted]@gov.scot>; McKechnie CHM (Catherine)

<[Redacted]@gov.scot>; [Redacted]@educationscotland.gsi.gov.uk>; Armstrong A (Alan) <Alan.Armstrong@educationscotland.gsi.gov.uk>;

[Redacted]@educationscotland.gsi.gov.uk>;

[Redacted]@educationscotland.gsi.gov.uk [Redacted]@educationscotland.gsi.gov.uk >; [Redacted]Lynch@educationscotland.gsi.gov.uk>; [Redacted]@gov.scot>

Subject: religious and moral education - Israel/Palestine teaching resource - letters to interested parties re the resource from DFM - june 2017

Please see attached the response issued to in relation to the Israel/Palestine teaching resource.

Kind Regards

[Redacted] | Assistant Private Secretary to John Swinney MSP | Deputy First Minister and Cabinet Secretary Education and Skills | Scottish Government | St Andrew's House | Edinburgh | EH1 3DG | Ext 0131 244 7050

Chain 4

From: [Redacted]@educationscotland.gsi.gov.uk> **On Behalf Of** Gorman G (Gayle)

Sent: 26 November 2018 09:44

To: vmcgraw7@gmail.com

Cc: Andrea Bradley <abradley@eis.org.uk>; lflanagan@eis.org.uk;
nfisher@eis.org.uk; bruce.adamson@cypcs.org.uk; cathy.begley@cypcs.org.uk;
craigd@northlan.gov.uk; mcphersonc@northlan.gov.uk; seamuss@ssta.org.uk;
[Redacted]@educationscotland.gsi.gov.uk>;
[Redacted]@educationscotland.gsi.gov.uk>; Gorman G (Gayle)
[Redacted]@educationscotland.gsi.gov.uk>; PS/Education Scotland
<ps/educationscotland@educationscotland.gsi.gov.uk>; Armstrong A (Alan)
<Alan.Armstrong@educationscotland.gsi.gov.uk>

Subject: Israel/Palestine Learning and Teaching Resource

Dear Ms McGraw

Please find attached my response to your letter of 14 November 2018.

Kind regards / [Deagh dhurachdan](#)

Gayle Gorman

Gayle Gorman
Chief Inspector of Education/Chief Executive

Chain 5

From: [Redacted]@gov.scot>

Sent: 02 November 2018 16:56

To: Pentland MK (Malcolm) [Redacted]@gov.scot>

Cc: [Redacted]@gov.scot>; Sheppard L (Lesley) [Redacted] @gov.scot>;
[Redacted])(Communications) <[Redacted]@gov.scot>; Deputy First Minister and
Cabinet Secretary for Education and Skills <DFMCSE@gov.scot>;
[Redacted]n@educationscotland.gov.scot>

Subject: Israel/Palestine Education Resources

Malcolm,

[Out of Scope]

[Redacted]

Team Leader, Curriculum, Parental Engagement and Pupil Participation
0131 244 0970

Chain 6

From: [Redacted]

Sent: 14 November 2018 13:10

To: Freedom of Information <foi@gov.scot>; Deputy First Minister and Cabinet Secretary for Education and Skills <DFMCSE@gov.scot>

Cc: Fol SpAds PO <Fol.SpAdsPO@gov.scot>; DG Education, Communities & Justice <DGECJ@gov.scot>; Robertson FMG (Fiona) (Director of Learning) <[Redacted]@gov.scot>; Sheppard L (Lesley) <[Redacted]@gov.scot>; Pentland MK (Malcolm) <[Redacted]@gov.scot>; [Redacted]@educationscotland.gsi.gov.uk>; [Redacted]@gov.scot>; [Redacted @gov.scot>; Communications DFM & Education <CommunicationsDFM&Education@gov.scot>; McAllister C (Colin) <[Redacted]@gov.scot>; Gorman G (Gayle) <[Redacted]@educationscotland.gsi.gov.uk>; Minister for Parliamentary Business and Veterans MinisterPBV@gov.scot

Subject: FOI/18/03044 - URGENT - ISRAEL/PALESTINE EDUCATION RESOURCES, MEETING, MAY 2017

[Redacted] and Team,

Please find an updated submission.

Please delete my email and submission from 14 Nov and replace with this one.

I've updated the covering submission, the schedule of documents and one of the annexes for release but I've attached the entire submission in order to make things more straightforward.

Thanks.

[Redacted]

Team Leader, Curriculum, Parental Engagement and Pupil Participation
0131 244 0970