

OFFICIAL - SENSITIVE

FOI Reference: 20200120882

List of Enclosures

Enclosure No	Description	Date	Explanation of redactions	Clause
Enclosure 1	Extract from submission to Deputy First Minister	24 November 2020	Personal data  Publicly Available information but have included link  Information not in scope	38 (1)((b)  25 (1)
Enclosure 2	Extract from submission to Deputy First Minister	3 November 2020	Personal data  Information not in scope	38 (1)((b)
Enclosure 3	Extract from Agenda for Scottish Practitioner Forum	8 October 2020	Personal data  Information not in scope	38 (1)((b)
Enclosure 4	Extract from Internal Scottish Government Core Brief	18 August 2020	Information not in scope	
Enclosure 5	Extract from Briefing to Deputy First Minister.	21 July 2020	Personal data  Information not in scope	38 (1)((b)

OFFICIAL - SENSITIVE

Enclosure 6	Extract from note of CfE Review Multi Agency Team Meeting	13 May 2020	Personal data Information not in scope	38 (1)(b)
Enclosure 7	Extract from note of CfE Review Multi Agency Team Meeting	29 April 2020	Personal data Information not in scope	38 (1)(b)
Enclosure 8	Extract from Submission to Deputy First Minister	7 April 2020	Personal data Information not in scope	38 (1)(b)
Enclosure 9	Extract of email from SG to Multi Agency Team	26 March 2020	Personal data Information not in scope	38 (1)(b)
Enclosure 10	Terms of Reference for CfE Review	26 February 2020	Publicly Available information but have included link	25 (1)

**List of enclosures**

Enclosure 1 Extract from submission to Deputy First Minister 24 November 2020

OFFICIAL - SENSITIVE

From: [Redact38(1)(b)]  
Learning Directorate  
24 November 2020

**To: PS/Deputy First Minister**

**OECD INDEPENDENT REVIEW OF CURRICULUM FOR EXCELLENCE REVIEW EXTENDED REMIT  
GOVERNMENT INITIATED QUESTION AND LETTER TO EDUCATION AND SKILLS COMMITTEE**

**Purpose**

1. To seek the Deputy First Minister's approval for a Government Initiated Question (GIQ) and letter to the Education & Skills Committee to inform Parliament that the extended remit for the OECD Curriculum for Excellence Review has now been agreed.

[Redacted - not in scope]

[Redact38(1)(b)]

**ANNEX A**

**GOVERNMENT INITIATED QUESTION: OECD CURRICULUM FOR EXCELLENCE REVIEW – EXTENDED REMIT**

[Redact 25(1)]

OFFICIAL - SENSITIVE

<https://www.parliament.scot/parliamentarybusiness/28877.aspx?SearchType=Advance&ReferenceNumbers=S5W-33557&ResultsPerPage=10>

**ANNEX B**

Deputy First Minister and Cabinet Secretary for Education and Skills  
John Swinney MSP



Scottish Government  
Riaghaltas na h-Alba  
gov.scot

F/T: 0300 244 4000  
E: [dfmcse@gov.scot](mailto:dfmcse@gov.scot)

Clare Adamson MSP  
Convener, Education and Skills Committee

By Email: [es.committee@parliament.scot](mailto:es.committee@parliament.scot)

## **OECD INDEPENDENT REVIEW OF CURRICULUM FOR EXCELLENCE: UPDATE**

I am writing to update the Committee on progress with OECD engagement on the Independent Review of Curriculum for Excellence and on plans for additional work on qualifications and assessment.

### **CfE Review Engagement**

## OFFICIAL - SENSITIVE

As you are aware, the first round of national stakeholder interviews took place from 28<sup>th</sup> September - 2<sup>nd</sup> October. During this visit the OECD met virtually with: myself; the Scottish Parliament's Education & Skills Committee; Scottish Government officials; the Scottish Practitioner Forum; national agencies; local government representatives; college bodies; DYW regional employer groups; university bodies; academics/ researchers; organisations responsible for teacher professional learning & leadership; teacher and headteacher professional associations; parent organisations; young people organisations; Gaelic education groups; subject specific interest groups; members of the Curriculum & Assessment Board; and members of the Scottish Education Council.

The schedule for this first round of national stakeholder interviews was agreed in discussion with the Scottish Practitioner Forum and with the OECD, based on guidelines from the OECD.

The second week of engagement with schools, learners and parents ran from 2<sup>nd</sup> - 5<sup>th</sup> November. As part of this engagement, the OECD held in-depth virtual visits with 4 schools (Forehill Primary School, Tiree & Oban High School Partnership, Castlemilk High School and Aberdeen Grammar School), as well as a number of focus group sessions with headteachers, teachers, partners, learners and parents.

The approach to this week was also agreed with the Scottish Practitioner Forum and officials worked closely with ADES and individual schools to make the necessary arrangements.

Between virtual school visits and focus group sessions, the OECD engaged with (approximately):

- 9 Headteachers
- 36 teachers
- 21 parents
- 60 learners (primary, secondary and post-school)
- 2 College Principals
- 2 employer reps
- A CLD provider

The feedback from those who participated in the OECD engagement activities has been very positive, with schools welcoming the opportunity to be involved and to contribute despite the wider challenges they are facing. This shows once again the commitment and professionalism of our education practitioners in Scotland.

## OFFICIAL - SENSITIVE

Whilst my preference would have been for the OECD Team to have been able to visit Scotland in person, undertaking the engagement virtually has allowed them to meet with a wide range of education bodies and cover a wide geographical spread of schools in a short period of time.

### **Next steps**

The OECD will now focus on the drafting process and officials will work with them to organise a further engagement event in February 2021, so that draft recommendations can be shared and discussed with stakeholders, providing a further opportunity for key partners and practitioners in Scotland to inform the final report.

### **Additional Work on Assessment & Qualifications**

As part of the suite of work I commissioned in response to the 2020 SQA exam results, I asked the OECD to expand the work on the CfE Review to also include a deeper focus on the future of assessment and qualifications approaches in the Senior Phase curriculum in Scotland. The aim of this work is to analyse Scotland's approach to assessment and qualifications and produce options for how we could enhance our approach, informed by international good practice.

Officials have been working with the OECD to scope the additional work on assessment and qualifications, and we have agreed with the OECD that this will involve:

- Employing an additional international expert to undertake a desk-based analysis of Scotland's approaches to student assessment in relation to National Qualifications in the Senior Phase in comparison with approaches in other education systems. The comparative analysis will consider education systems that are relevant to Scotland's experience and objectives in education.
- A second seminar with stakeholders (in addition to that planned for the wider Review) to present and discuss the preliminary findings from the desk-based analysis and to gather stakeholders' feedback and suggestions on how to move forward.

OFFICIAL - SENSITIVE

- The production of a comparative paper building on the desk-based analysis and stakeholder engagement seminar and provides a set of options for Scotland to consider.

This work will be aligned with the current OECD Review of the implementation of Curriculum for Excellence and the final comparative paper will be published later in the summer 2021, following the publication of the CfE Review Report in June 2021.

I hope this update is helpful to the Committee.

**JOHN SWINNEY**

Enclosure 2. Extract from submission to Deputy First Minister 3 November 2020

**To: Deputy First Minister**

**OECD REVIEW OF CURRICULUM FOR EXCELLENCE: UPDATE**

**Purpose**

1. To update the Deputy First Minister on:
  - Progress with OECD engagement on the Review of CfE

[Redacted - not in scope]

**Next steps**

A wider stakeholder session will also be held in early February 2021 to discuss preliminary findings. We will also get sight of a first draft of the report in January 2021. A detailed time line up until June 2021 is provided at Annex A.

[Redacted - not in scope]

[Redact 38(1)(b)] **National Co-ordinator for the OECD Review**  
**Learning Directorate**  
**3 November 2020**

## ANNEX A

### OECD REVIEW OF CURRICULUM FOR EXCELLENCE REVIEW TIMELINE

[Redacted - not in scope]

Milestone	Who	End date
<b>Scottish Practitioner Forum (SPF)</b>		
Meeting to consider 1st draft report (2hr)	SCOT	15.02.21
Involvement in stakeholder consultation seminar	SCOT	1.02.21
<b>Stakeholder consultation seminar</b>		
Organise seminar (agenda, participants, logistics)	SCOT	30.1.21
Help organise seminar (instructions, feedback, slides)	OECD	30.1.21
Co-ordinate seminar logistics	SCOT	1.2.21
Present findings and moderate seminar	OECD	1.2.21
<b>Report</b>		
Deliver 1st draft report	OECD	20.1.21
Provide comments on 1st draft report	SCOT w/SPF	15.2.21
Deliver complete draft report	OECD	3.3.21
Provide comments on complete draft report	SCOT w/SPF	15.3.21
Co-ordinate report publication	OECD	31.5.21
Organise report launch	SCOT w/OECD	1.6.21
Launch Report	OECD	30.06.21

[Redacted - not in scope]

Enclosure 3. Extract from Agenda for Scottish Practitioner Forum 8 October 2020

[Redacted - not in scope]

<i>Meeting to consider 1<sup>st</sup> draft report (2hr)</i>	<i>SCOT</i>	<i>15.02.21</i>
<i>Involvement in stakeholder consultation seminar</i>	<i>SCOT</i>	<i>1.02.21</i>

Enclosure 4. Extract from Internal Scottish Government Core Brief 18 August 2020

[Redacted - not in scope]

## **REVIEW OF CURRICULUM FOR EXCELLENCE BRIEFING PAPER**

### **NEXT STEPS**

#### **Stakeholder engagement visits**

We have also started mapping stakeholder engagement which will require agreement from the OECD and Scottish Practitioner Forum

The key milestones for this are:

- Visit 1: National Stakeholders - 28 September - 2 October 2020

OFFICIAL - SENSITIVE

- Visit 2: Schools, practitioners and learners - 2-6 November 2020
  - Visit 3: Engagement on preliminary findings – early March 2021
  - Publication of final report – June 2021
- [Redacted - not in scope]

Enclosure 5 Extract from Briefing to Deputy First Minister 21 July 2020

**TO: DEPUTY FIRST MINISTER**

**OECD REVIEW OF CURRICULUM FOR EXCELLENCE: UPDATE**

**Purpose**

1. To provide the Deputy First Minister with an update on progress with the OECD Review of Curriculum for Excellence.

[Redacted - not in scope]

[Redact38(b)(1)]

**Learning Directorate**  
**21 July 2020**

[Redacted - not in scope]

**ANNEX B: CURRENT TIMELINE FOR THE REVIEW**

OFFICIAL - SENSITIVE

<b>November 2020 – January 2021</b> OECD drafting process.
<b>Early March 2021</b> Visit 3 - Stakeholder event to engage on draft report.
<b>April/May 2021</b> OECD do further drafting.
<b>June 2021</b> Final report published.

[Redacted - not in scope]

Enclosure 6. Extract from note of CfE Review Multi Agency Team Meeting 13 May 2020

**From:** [Redact38(1)(b)]@gov.scot

**To:** 'tony.mcdaid@southlanarkshire.gov.uk' <tony.mcdaid@southlanarkshire.gov.uk>; [Redacted38(1)(b)]@sqa.org.uk  
'petermcnaughton.ades@gmail.com'  
<petermcnaughton.ades@gmail.com[Redacted38(1)(b)]@educationscotland.gov.scot[Redacted38(1)(b)]@gov.scot[Redacted38(1)(b)]@gov.scot[Redacted(38(1)(b)]@gov.scot[Redacted38(1)(b)]@gov.scot>; Pentland MK (Malcolm)  
<Malcolm.Pentland@gov.scotgov.uk

**Subject:** Note of multi agency conference call 13 May 2020

Dear all

Here is a quick recap from our call this morning.

[Redacted - not in scope]

4. We agreed to share the latest timeline for the review which has been produced after discussion with OECD. This will be kept under review to take account of changing developments around Covid-19, however at present it looks like this:-

<b>November 2020 – January 2021</b> OECD drafting process.
<b>Early March 2021</b> Visit 3 - Stakeholder event to engage on draft report.
<b>April/May 2021</b> OECD do further drafting.
<b>June 2021</b> Final report published.

[Redacted - not in scope]

Best wishes

[Redact 38(1)(b)]

OFFICIAL - SENSITIVE

**Scottish Government**  
**North, Victoria Quay**  
**Edinburgh**  
**EH6 6QQ**

Enclosure 7 Extract from note of CfE Review Multi Agency Team Meeting 29 April 2020

**From:** [Redacted38(1)(b)] @gov.scot

**Sent:** 29 April 2020 12:51

**To:** 'petermcnaughton.ades@gmail.com' <petermcnaughton.ades@gmail.com>; 'tony.mcdaid@southlanarkshire.gov.uk' <tony.mcdaid@southlanarkshire.gov.uk>; Armstrong A (Alan) <Alan.Armstrong@educationscotland.gov.scot>; [Redacted38(1)(b)] @educationscotland.gov.scot>; [Redacted38(1)(b)] @gov.scot>; [Redacted38(1)(b)] @gov.scot>; [Redacted38(1)(b)] @gov.scot>; [Redacted38(1)(b)] @sqa.org.uk [Redacted38(1)(b)] @educationscotland.gov.scot>; [Redacted38(1)(b)] @gov.scot>

**Subject:** Multi-agency team catch up 29 April Notes and action points

Dear all

Please see note of our conference call this morning.

[Redacted - not in scope]

Update from SG

OFFICIAL - SENSITIVE

DFM has announced the revised timescale for the review, agreeing option a that was developed with this group and the OECD. This now means we have until end June to submit the initial evidence pack to the OECD, with engagement in the Autumn, a draft report early in 2021 (for engagement in advance of the pre-election period) and a final report in June 2021.

[Redacted - not in scope]

Best wishes

[Redact 38(1)(b)]

Enclosure 8. Extract from Submission to Deputy First Minister 7 April 2020

Options Paper

**TO: DEPUTY FIRST MINISTER**

**OECD REVIEW OF CURRICULUM FOR EXCELLENCE: ALTERNATIVE APPROACHES TO THE REVIEW**

[Redacted - not in scope]

**Options for taking forward the Review**

The proposed timelines for Options A and B would allow for sharing of the OECD's preliminary findings with Scottish Government in December 2020, following which public debate could take place around those in the New Year 2021 allowing for engagement of teachers, learners and stakeholders through events hosted by the OECD during their spring 2021 visit

[Redacted - not in scope]

[Redact 38 (1)(b)]  
**Learning Directorate**  
**7 April 2020**

**ANNEX A: OPTIONS FOR PROGRESSING THE REVIEW**

[Redacted - not in scope]

The following table sets out a number of possible approaches for taking forward the Review:

[Redacted - not in scope]

<b>Approach</b>	<b>Timeline</b>
<b>Option A: Autumn Engagement</b> Postpone engagement with policy stakeholders until September and engagement with practitioners and learners until October 2020.	June - Evidence pack submitted  September - engagement with policy stakeholders. If schools are back and travel bans lifted, these would be physical meetings. If not, these would involve one hour zoom interviews, with the OECD sending a preparatory document in advance. They could be for individuals or small groups and could be

OFFICIAL - SENSITIVE

	<p>held over two weeks of mornings or one week of full days.</p> <p>October - focus groups to gather evidence on implementation of CfE in schools with schools, learners, parents.</p> <p>November-January – OECD drafting process.</p> <p>December – 15-20 page preliminary findings report. shared with the Scottish Government.</p> <p>Early March – stakeholder event to engage on draft report.</p> <p>April/May - further drafting.</p> <p>June 21 – final report published.</p>
--	--

[Redacted - not in scope]

Enclosure 9. Extract of email from SG to Multi Agency Team 26 March 2020

**From:** @gov.scot[Redact 38(1)(b)]

**Sent:** 26 March 2020 18:29

**To:** Peter McNaughton <[petermcnaughton.ades@gmail.com](mailto:petermcnaughton.ades@gmail.com)>;@gov.scot [Redact 38(1)(b)];@gov.scot [Redact 38(1)(b)] @educationscotland.gov.scot[Redact 38(1)(b)]

Armstrong A (Alan) <[Alan.Armstrong@educationscotland.gov.scot](mailto:Alan.Armstrong@educationscotland.gov.scot)>;

[Redact38(1)(b)]@gov.scot[Redact 38(1)(b)] @gov.scot [Redact 38(1)(b)] Cc: McDaid, Tony <[tony.mcdaid@southlanarkshire.gov.uk](mailto:tony.mcdaid@southlanarkshire.gov.uk)>

**Subject:** RE: OECD Curriculum Review: multi-agency co-ordination team - weekly update meeting

Colleagues,

Redact 38 (1)(b) and I have just come off a call with the OECD in which we discussed potential options for taking forward the review. I have set these out in the attached paper, which I am intending to use as the basis for advice to DFM on this.

From our conversation with the OECD it seems to be like Option A is looking most realistic. The main gist of this approach is that we would engage with national bodies on-line in June, but postpone the practitioner/ learner work until October, when this would be done face to face or, if need be, on-line. We would have a draft report for further engagement by January/ February 2021 So a delay to the overall timescale, but I think this is inevitable unless we push on with earlier engagement. Of course we will need to seek the views of Ministers on this.

Many thanks

[Redact 38(1)(b)]

Enclosure 10 Curriculum for Excellence Review Terms of Reference Published 26 February 2020

[Redact 25(1)]

[Terms of Reference - Curriculum for Excellence Review.](#)