

## B Methodology

### Introduction

In this section we set out our detailed approach to randomly recruiting a 'mini public' of Scotland's adult population (16+) to the Citizen's Assembly of Scotland.

Before setting out our detailed approach, we can summarise our proposal as follows:

- **Sample design:** we think it is vital that the final participant list reflects all the demographic variables outlined in section 18 of the brief, as well as important political attitudes. We have provided the most up to date available data for these variables in the following sections,
- **Participant size:** in accordance with the brief, we will recruit 120 people for the Assembly. At this stage we have assumed that the full 120 will be based on the 'mini public' approach. We will also recruit a number of additional participants who will be replacements for those who change their minds or who are unable to attend at short notice,
- **Recruitment method:** there are a range of possible approaches to the recruitment, including a face-to-face, online or written approach. Given the profile of the Assembly, the need to ensure randomness and our ability to keep costs efficient, *we believe that a face-to-face method is most appropriate in this case,*
- **Randomness:** we believe that randomness is vital and that we should be able to demonstrate that, as far as possible, *every eligible adult has an equal chance of being recruited. We will do this by randomly selecting postcodes in the Postcode Address File.*
- **Data collection:** our strong recommendation is that recruitment is conducted face-to-face in the postcode areas that we have identified above, rather than by stopping people on street or in other locations.

### Sample Design

The brief clearly sets out that:

- the Assembly will have a minimum membership of 100, with 120 being recruited,
- an additional number of replacement members should be recruited to replace those who withdraw or are unable to attend at short notice.
- a further 10 may have to be recruited to complement the randomly recruited members,

- the participants must be chosen at random.

The brief recommends a number of socio-demographic variables that will form the strata by which to segment the population. We also believe that it is important to ensure that the political balance of the membership is measured and is transparent. So, we would recommend the following variables:

- Age (using Census and mid-year population estimates)<sup>3</sup>,
- Gender (as above),
- Socio economic group (as above),
- Ethnic group (as above),
- Geography (using Scottish Parliamentary Regions),
- Attitudes to the Scottish constitution (based on the most recent opinion polling and including undecided voters and non-voters),
- Attitudes to European Union membership (based on the most recent opinion polling and including undecided voters and non-voters),
- Voting intention for the Scottish Parliament (based on the most recent opinion polling and including undecided voters and non-voters).

This is a substantial list, but it is important to demonstrate all these factors. If appointed, we would spend considerable time, including at the inception meeting, discussing and agreeing these strata and the detailed strategy for implementing it; one approach would be to use the geographical strata first to establish the numbers required in each region, and then seek the same profile in each but we are happy to discuss different options.

---

<sup>3</sup> <https://www.scotlandscensus.gov.uk/parliamentary-profiles-scotland>

In the tables below, we estimate the numbers that we would recruit within each stratum based on current population estimates:

Table B1: Regional breakdown

| <b>Scotland</b>       | <b>5,295,403</b> | <b>100%</b> | <b>120 target</b> |
|-----------------------|------------------|-------------|-------------------|
| Central Scotland      | 658,769          | 12%         | 14                |
| Glasgow               | 669,157          | 13%         | 16                |
| Highlands and Islands | 445,177          | 8%          | 10                |
| Lothian               | 729,918          | 14%         | 17                |
| Mid Scotland and Fife | 653,539          | 12%         | 14                |
| North East Scotland   | 753,768          | 14%         | 17                |
| South of Scotland     | 678,356          | 13%         | 16                |
| West of Scotland      | 706,719          | 13%         | 16                |

Table B2: Socio-demographic breakdowns

| <b>Social Demographics</b>                                   | <b>5295403</b> | <b>100%</b> | <b>120 target</b> |
|--|----------------|-------------|-------------------|
| <b>Sex</b>   |                |             |                   |
| Males  | 2541793        | 48%         | 59                |
| Females  | 2753610        | 52%         | 62                |
| <b>Age</b>   |                |             |                   |
| 16 to 29 years old   | 1006127        | 19%         | 23                |
| 30 to 44 years old   | 1059081        | 20%         | 24                |
| 45 to 59 years old   | 1112035        | 21%         | 25                |
| 60 to 74 years old   | 847264         | 16%         | 19                |
| 75 years old and over  | 423632         | 8%          | 10                |
| <b>Ethnic Group</b>  |                |             |                   |
| White – Scottish   | 4448139        | 84%         | 101               |
| White - Other British  | 423632         | 8%          | 10                |
| White – Irish  | 52954          | 1%          | 1                 |
| White – Polish   | 52954          | 1%          | 1                 |
| White – Other  | 105908         | 2%          | 2                 |
| <b>% Asian, Asian Scottish or Asian British (All people)</b> |                |             |                   |
| Other ethnic groups  | 52954          | 1%          | 1                 |
|  | <b>2372777</b> |             |                   |

|  |                |     |    |
|--|----------------|-----|----|
| <b>Dependants</b>  |                |     |    |
| One family only: Lone parent: With dependent children                                  | 1660944        | 7%  | 8  |
| One family only: Married or same-sex civil partnership couple: With dependent children | 332189         | 13% | 17 |
| One family only: Cohabiting couple: With dependent children                            | 949111         | 4%  | 5  |
|  |                |     |    |
| <b>Economic Status - All persons 16 to 74</b>  | <b>3970530</b> |     |    |
| Economically active  | 2739666        | 70% | 83 |
| Employees - part-time  | 516169         | 13% | 16 |
| Employees - full-time  | 1588212        | 40% | 48 |
| Self-employed  | 317642         | 8%  | 10 |
| Unemployed   | 198527         | 5%  | 6  |
| Full-time student – employed   | 119116         | 3%  | 4  |
| Full-time student – unemployed   | 317642         | 1%  | 1  |
| Economically inactive  | 1230864        | 31% | 37 |
| Retired  | 595580         | 14% | 18 |
| Student  | 198527         | 6%  | 7  |
| Looking after home or family   | 1588212        | 4%  | 5  |
| Long-term sick or disabled   | 1985265        | 5%  | 5  |
| Other  | 794106         | 2%  | 2  |
|  |                |     |    |
| <b>Qualifications - All persons aged 16 and over</b>                                   | <b>4379072</b> |     |    |
| With no qualifications   | 1182349        | 27% | 32 |
| Highest qualification attained - Level 1   | 1007187        | 23% | 28 |
| Highest qualification attained - Level 2   | 613070         | 14% | 17 |
| Highest qualification attained - Level 3   | 437907         | 10% | 12 |
| Highest qualification attained - Level 4 and above                                     | 1138559        | 26% | 31 |

These tables give a clear indication of the numbers needed in each group and give a basis for targets for socio-demographic factors.

In terms of the political attitude variables mentioned above, we believe that the three we outline, views on Scottish independence, membership of the European Union and Holyrood voting intention, are the most important to use and will be closely scrutinised for balance and neutrality.

We could of course base our targets for these on the most recent election and referendum results, but we believe that it is important to base targets on the most up to date data available and, crucially, we want to make sure that those who did not vote, or might not vote in the future, or who are undecided on these issues, are included for recruitment. With all that in mind, we think that using the most recent opinion polling data is the most appropriate solution. If appointed, we will agree the strategy, perhaps drawing in the last six or 12 months of data

and creating averages. We would then produce tables, based on those above, for political attitudes and have included the production of such tables in our costs.

We will then have a full breakdown of the target number required for all socio-demographic and political attitude factors, which we will use as the basis for the recruitment.

Given the number of strata/variables of interest, we do not want to make the recruitment overly complex or instruct interviewers to be looking for 'needles in haystacks' during recruitment. Our solution would be to use the geography (Scottish Parliamentary Region) as the initial strata and then create a profile within each (based on equal proportions across the regions). So, the proportion of men and women in each region would be the same even though the numbers would be different. We would be happy to discuss this strategy if appointed.

In terms of final numbers, we have assumed, as set out in the brief, that 120 should be recruited based on the strata outlined above.

Our view is that *an additional 20 should be recruited* to act as replacements in the event of people changing their minds or being unable to attend. These additional participants will *not* be selected according to the main criteria for selecting the 120 but will be weighted towards groups who we know from experience and from other studies are most likely not to be able to attend at short notice. In our view this should include:

- those in remote rural areas, especially at winter meetings where weather and transport may disrupt travel to Glasgow,
- parents of young children who may struggle to find childcare at short notice if a child is unwell.

So, our costs are based on recruiting a total of 140 participants. If appointed, we recommend agreeing the exact profile of the additional sample during the set-up phase.

We have also provided a separate cost for the further 10 members outlined at section 23 of the brief.

## **Sample recruitment**

There are several ways in which the members of the Assembly could be recruited. The most common would be by face-to-face interviewing, online recruitment or by writing to members of the public.

Our proposal is that all members of the Assembly should be recruited **via face-to-face methods**. There are a number of reasons for this recommendation, including:

- **randomness** – the brief clearly states that there should be a random selection of members; using an online method, drawing members from an online panel compromises that randomness, and means that the majority of people in Scotland do not have an opportunity of being selected. We used online methods for recruiting to the agriculture forums, but these were not national forums and recruitment was done on the back of an online survey,
- **profile and transparency** – face-to-face recruitment, conducted randomly, is the highest quality approach and is likely to be the only method that will demonstrate that quality to the wide range of interested parties scrutinising the Assembly,
- **communication** – we think that it is vital for interviewers to be able to speak to potential members in detail, outlining what is expected and being able to answer questions. This cannot be done using alternative methods,
- **efficiency** – our fieldwork team is large and spread across Scotland (see the later section on Personnel), meaning that we can undertake the recruitment efficiently in terms of timings and costs.

In addition, we believe that the *face-to-face recruitment should take place in home*, working to the agreed targets, rather than being stopping people in the street and working to the targets. This is both because it is a preferable methodological approach and because the likelihood is that potential recruits will have more time to discuss, ask questions and be put at ease.

This will mean interviewers selecting participants at random, based on selecting areas at random, in line with the process outlined below.

## Ensuring a random approach

We recognise the strong steer from the brief that members of the Assembly be selected at random.

The first step to guaranteeing a random selection is by ensuring a geographic spread within each of the locations and by avoiding participants being clustered within one area within a location; to do this we will randomly sample postcodes using a cleaned version of the Postcode Address File (PAF) within each of the locations.

We will match the 6-fold SG urban rural classification as well as our desired location classification to the PAF. We will then stratify the PAF based on these variables. We will calculate the sampling fraction based on the desired number of participants within each of the location breaks based on our quotas derived from Scottish mid-population estimates. This will mean that we have a range of data points within each location from which in-home face to face

recruitment will take place. We will cluster the data points that have been randomly selected and our interviewer team will be allocated a cluster to conduct the recruitment of participants.

This will ensure that the Assembly is representative of Scotland's geography. The random sampling approach maximises the equal opportunity of Scottish citizens being selected to participate in the Citizens' Assembly.

## Process

Once we agree the profile and strategy for the sample to be recruited, we will do the following:

- **design and agree a recruitment questionnaire** – this will be used by interviewers in the field. It will begin by outlining eligibility criteria, ensuring that anyone not eligible to vote or anyone who works in any of the professions outlined in section 20 of the brief, are screened out. It will then set out the details of the Assembly and the commitment required, along with the payment to be made. Interviewers will then recruit to the profile agreed.
- **agree communications materials to be used** – we think that interviewers would benefit from having informational materials with them in the field, to show to and leave with potential recruits for the Assembly. We would recommend a discussion around this at the inception meeting,
- **briefing of interviews** – before the fieldwork begins, all interviewers will participate in a full briefing, led by the Project Director and Manager. This briefing will cover all elements of the recruitment and allow interviewers to clarify and ask any questions,
- **establish a helpline for interviewers** – although interviewers will be fully briefed, we think it is important for them to be able to call to clarify any points and we will set up a dedicated phone line to enable them to do so.

In line with the requirements of the brief and our own project management processes, we will ensure that all materials are signed-off by Scottish government before being finalised.

## Reporting

We note from the brief that a report outlining the recruitment process will be submitted by 2<sup>nd</sup> October. Our timetable (outlined later) confirms the timing of the report.

Although the report will need to be factual and process driven, we will want to make it as engaging and informative as possible. We pride ourselves in producing high quality and engaging reports which maximise the impact of the research and will draw on our rich experience of reporting for Scottish government and others clients.

## Relevant experience

We have a considerable track record of recruiting to large-scale and high-profile qualitative events, including:

- Citizens' Forums and Juries, for example the recent forums on the future of agriculture in Scotland,
- Deliberative Methods Trial in Regulated Industries, The Consumer Futures Unit (CFU)
- Consultation on Equality Outcomes, Glasgow City Council
- Local Authority Budget Workshops