

To: First Minister Nicola Sturgeon, SNP
Bute House
No 6 Charlotte Square
Edinburgh

From:

Subject: No response from the Gender Recognition Review Panel re. Concerns and criticism 20 February, 2018.

Date: 13/05/2018

Dear Ms Sturgeon,

With reference to my letter of 20 February, 2018 documenting high level criticisms of the Consultation on changes to the GRA (2004) to which I neither received acknowledgement or response from the Gender Recognition Panel, and with reference to my letter of 28 March, 2018 asking you to personally expedite the matter and ensure I received a full and well considered response in good time.

██████████ acknowledged my letter some weeks later on the 17 April, 2018 stating I would "receive a response shortly". It is now the 13th of May, 2018, three months have passed, and to my dismay I still have not received a response. My concerns re. Annex K and the consultants used and contacted for this consultation were serious and significant including but not limited to;

1. The underrepresentation of women, of parents, and of expert bodies most particularly those with medical, psychiatric and legal expertise; important sections of society were not consulted either directly, or via Annex K. On such significant changes I would have thought relevant, independent and expert input should have been of primary import, and particularly input from those not reliant on government funding (unlike the 'T' groups, associates and affiliates) and not those potentially motivated by private profit (for example, foundations associated with medical research, supply and provision, banks, Big Four; corporations and organisations).
2. Recommendations on much needed enhancements to Annex K including the full listing of all consulted and all contacted, stating their purpose, status, their input (when and where involved), and their major funding sources.
3. Data Quality and integrity - to which I would like to make a clear and strongly emphasised addition; the studies referenced in the consultation documents were all of inadequate quality and relevance. To develop good policy and law the Scottish Government must require empirical evidence of the highest standard and it does not do so. I believe this lack of appropriate empirical research must be taken very seriously at the highest level of government, and immediately with respect to the Gender Recognition Act.
4. The proliferation and promulgation in Scotland and the UK of 'gender' as a replacement for sex. This is foolish and must be reversed. I should not have to detail why biological sex is needed and gender an imprecise and illogical substitute. Any intelligent person knows the importance of biological sex in life, in medicine, in law, in scientific studies and for statistics.

I am sincerely worried by the lack of acknowledgements and the complete lack of proper responses from my representatives and ask again that you expedite this, immediately.

However, I expect you as leader of the Scottish Government to make appropriate moves to enhance the consultation process, its integrity and transparency and involve more experts and garner far more expertise. In service to the Scottish people and the better use of public monies this is desperately required. I hope adequate consideration will be given to all the points I raised in my original letter when considering the responses received on the GRA. Thank you for your attention.

Yours sincerely,

██████████
██████████
13 MAY 2018
Received

From: First Minister
Sent: 28 June 2018 16:07:50
To: Public Engagement Unit
Subject: FW: GRA reform process - Important issues for SNP and First Minister to consider:

Attachments: Critical Sisters GRA-BriefingV1 (3) June 2018.pdf

MACCS case please for OR

██████████
Office of the First Minister
Scottish Government
5TH floor/St Andrews House/Regent Road
Edinburgh EH1 3DG
Tel ██████████

First Minister's preferences can be found at:
<http://intranet/InExec/AboutUs/Ministers/MinisterialPrivateOffices/OfficeOfTheFM>

All e-mails and attachments sent by a Ministerial Private Office to another official on behalf of a Minister relating to a decision, request or comment made by a Minister, or a note of a Ministerial meeting, must be filed appropriately by the primary recipient. Private Offices do not keep official records of such e-mails or attachments.

From: Sturgeon N (Nicola), MSP [mailto:Nicola.Sturgeon.msp@parliament.scot]
Sent: 28 June 2018 15:42
To: First Minister
Subject: Fwd: GRA reform process - Important issues for SNP and First Minister to consider:

Nicola Sturgeon MSP
Glasgow Southside
Constituency Office (constituent enquiries only)
Govanhill Workspace
Unit 3, 69 Dixon Road
G42 8AT
Tel: 0141 424 1174
nicola.sturgeon.msp@parliament.scot<mailto:nicola.sturgeon.msp@parliament.scot>

All other enquiries to nicola.sturgeon@snp.org<mailto:nicola.sturgeon@snp.org>

Nicola Sturgeon MSP is registered as a data controller with the UK Information Commissioner. Any personal data you provide will be handled under the requirements of the EU General Data Protection Regulation (GDPR) and the Data Protection Act 2018. If you would like to find out how your data is collected and used or what your

rights are in relation to this data, please reply to this email requesting a copy of the office privacy notice. If you would like more information on GDPR please visit <https://ico.org.uk/>

From: [REDACTED]
[REDACTED]@gmail.com<mailto:[REDACTED]@gmail.com>>
Sent: Thursday, June 28, 2018 2:34:23 PM
To: tommy.sheppard.mp@parliament.uk<mailto:tommy.sheppard.mp@parliament.uk>;
Sturgeon N (Nicola), MSP
Subject: GRA reform process - Important issues for SNP and First Minister to consider:

Dear Tommy/Nicola,

Thank you very much for your welcome letter to the constituency after my recent move to [REDACTED], I see the area as an ideal place from which to forward my own art practice and my two daughters schooling and higher education.

On that note - and as a matter of some national urgency I wish to write to you about a big problem which is viral on social media and in political debate right now; this is because of the potential massive loss of rights to one group of the population (natal women) which could lead (and has already lead) to greater levels of intimidation, censorship and many unforeseen negative legislative results in both Scotland and England to follow.

This frequent intimidation is taking the form of a modern (1,2 & 3) witch-hunt that too often involves silencing and violently intimidating women by branding them erroneously as TERFS (trans-exclusionary radical feminists) as a device for censorship of any gender-critical woman wishing to have an important coherent debate. The branding is brutal, derisive and flawed because most of these women seek only to ensure proper (4) debate and consultation in order to (mainly) protect crucial safe spaces for women and girls under the Equality Act 2010 (where the special characteristic of 'SEX' (i.e. biological) not 'GENDER' (socially constructed) is at threat and by it's nature SEX is a protected characteristic that therefore enshrines the protection of natal women-only safe spaces within it).[1]

I believe that the Scottish Government has recently consulted the public and is currently correlating and discussing the subsequent proposed amendments to the Gender Recognition Act. I have also read on the consultation pages, that the outcome will greatly affect the way other areas of the UK act on these proposed legislative changes which could significantly turn back the political clock in terms of women's rights.

So I would like to discuss this matter with you in person since I am in touch with a large body of politically active women in Scotland and the UK all fighting for the retention and improvement of women's rights regarding safety and the flippant nature of 'self-declaration' and how we can work together to avoid it's abuse.

I have attached also on the email a very well put together Executive Summary and further explanation of what's at stake about the GRA Reform Process by Critical Sisters.

Yours sincerely,

[REDACTED] (registered as [REDACTED] on electoral role, about to deedpoll)

[1] <https://womansplaceuk.org/conviction-of-trans-activist-for-assault-at-hyde-park/>

2/. <https://womansplaceuk.org/the-silencing-of-feminists-silences-survivors/>

3/. <https://fairplayforwomen.com/tag/magdalen-berns/>

4/. <https://womansplaceuk.org/our-demands-2/>

*

The Scottish Parliament: Making a positive difference to the lives of the people of
Scotland
Pàrlamaid na h-Alba: A' toirt deagh bhuidh air beatha sluagh na h-Alba

www.parliament.scot<<http://www.parliament.scot>> :
facebook.com/scottishparliament<<http://facebook.com/scottishparliament>> :
[twitter.com/scotparl](http://twitter.com/ScotParl)<<http://twitter.com/ScotParl>>

The information in this email may be confidential. If you think you have received this
email in error please delete it and do not share its contents.

*

This email has been scanned by the Symantec Email Security.cloud service.
For more information please visit <http://www.symanteccloud.com>

From: First Minister
Sent: 09 August 2018 10:31:55
To: Public Engagement Unit
Subject: FW: Children and gender

MACCS case please for OR


Office of the First Minister
Scottish Government
5TH floor/St Andrews House/Regent Road
Edinburgh EH1 3DG
Tel 

All e-mails and attachments sent by a Ministerial Private Office to any other official on behalf of a Minister relating to a decision, request or comment made by a Minister, or a note of a Ministerial meeting, must be filed appropriately by the recipient. Private Offices do not keep official records of such e-mails or attachments.

Scottish Ministers, Special advisers and the Permanent Secretary are covered by the terms of the Lobbying (Scotland) Act 2016. See www.lobbying.scot

From: Sturgeon N (Nicola), MSP [mailto:Nicola.Sturgeon.msp@parliament.scot]
Sent: 09 August 2018 10:26
To: First Minister
Subject: Fwd: Children and gender

Nicola Sturgeon MSP
Glasgow Southside
Constituency Office (constituent enquiries only)
Govanhill Workspace
Unit 3, 69 Dixon Road
G42 8AT
Tel: 0141 424 1174
nicola.sturgeon.msp@parliament.scot<<mailto:nicola.sturgeon.msp@parliament.scot>>

All other enquiries to nicola.sturgeon@snp.org<<mailto:nicola.sturgeon@snp.org>>

Nicola Sturgeon MSP is registered as a data controller with the UK Information Commissioner. Any personal data you provide will be handled under the requirements of the EU General Data Protection Regulation (GDPR) and the Data Protection Act 2018. If you would like to find out how your data is collected and used or what your rights are in relation to this data, please reply to this email requesting a copy of the office privacy notice. If you would like more information on GDPR please visit <https://ico.org.uk/>

From: [REDACTED]
[REDACTED]@blueyonder.co.uk<mailto:[REDACTED]@blueyonder.co.uk>>
Sent: Wednesday, August 8, 2018 2:22:46 PM
To: Sturgeon N (Nicola), MSP
Subject: Children and gender

Hello, I read in the Scotsman about a draft Bill to allow children as young as 5 to chose their gender. Please let me know when this will be discussed in Parliament.
Thanks. [REDACTED]

Sent from my Sony Xperia(tm) smartphone

*

The Scottish Parliament: Making a positive difference to the lives of the people of
Scotland
Pàrlamaid na h-Alba: A' toirt deagh bhuaidh air beatha sluagh na h-Alba

www.parliament.scot<<http://www.parliament.scot>> :
facebook.com/scottishparliament<<http://facebook.com/scottishparliament>> :
twitter.com/scotparl<<http://twitter.com/ScotParl>>

The information in this email may be confidential. If you think you have received this
email in error please delete it and do not share its contents.

*

This email has been scanned by the Symantec Email Security.cloud service.
For more information please visit <http://www.symanteccloud.com>

—

From: [REDACTED]
Sent: 14 August 2018 10:06:07
To: Public Engagement Unit
Subject: FW: Message from Scottish Parliament website

Please add to MACCS (OR)

Thanks

[REDACTED]
DPS/First Minister of Scotland

All e-mails and attachments sent by a Ministerial Private Office to any other official on behalf of a Minister relating to a decision, request or comment made by a Minister, or a note of a Ministerial meeting, must be filed appropriately by the recipient. Private Offices do not keep official records of such e-mails or attachments.

Scottish Ministers, Special advisers and the Permanent Secretary are covered by the terms of the Lobbying (Scotland) Act 2016. See www.lobbying.scot<<http://www.lobbying.scot>>

From: noreply@parliament.scot<mailto:noreply@parliament.scot>
<noreply@parliament.scot<mailto:noreply@parliament.scot>>
Sent: Monday, August 13, 2018 2:05:51 PM
To: Sturgeon N (Nicola), MSP
Subject: Message from Scottish Parliament website

name:

[REDACTED]

address:

[REDACTED]

postcode:

[REDACTED]

email:

[REDACTED]@gmail.com<mailto:[REDACTED]@gmail.com>

telephone:

[REDACTED]

message:

Dear First Minister
My name is [REDACTED], I am transgender (male to female) I have attended the Sandyford clinic in Glasgow for the past two years & recently approached the clinic regarding medical reports to submit along with an application for a gender recognition certificate. [REDACTED] of the Sandyford clinic advised me that the SNP are at present trying to have a bill passed that every transgender person in Scotland should automatically receive a gender recognition certificate without having to approach a panel who have never met me & never will & to pay a sum of money with no guarantee of gaining a certificate. Could you please let me know when

this bill will be submitted by the SNP.

Many thanks

[REDACTED]

*

The Scottish Parliament: Making a positive difference to the lives of the people of Scotland

Pàrlamaid na h-Alba: A' toirt deagh bhuidh air beatha sluagh na h-Alba

www.parliament.scot<<http://www.parliament.scot>> :

facebook.com/scottishparliament<<http://facebook.com/scottishparliament>> :

[twitter.com/scotparl](http://twitter.com/ScotParl)<<http://twitter.com/ScotParl>>

The information in this email may be confidential. If you think you have received this email in error please delete it and do not share its contents.

*

This email has been scanned by the Symantec Email Security.cloud service.

For more information please visit <http://www.symanteccloud.com>

—

From: [REDACTED]
 Sent: 26 November 2018 09:29:11
 To: Public Engagement Unit
 Subject: FW: Message from Scottish Parliament website

Ao - [REDACTED]

MACCS case please for OR

[REDACTED]
 Office of the First Minister
 Scottish Government
 5TH floor/St Andrews House/Regent Road
 Edinburgh EH1 3DG
 Tel [REDACTED]

All e-mails and attachments sent by a Ministerial Private Office to any other official on behalf of a Minister relating to a decision, request or comment made by a Minister, or a note of a Ministerial meeting, must be filed appropriately by the recipient. Private Offices do not keep official records of such e-mails or attachments.

Scottish Ministers, Special advisers and the Permanent Secretary are covered by the terms of the Lobbying (Scotland) Act 2016. See www.lobbying.scot<<http://www.lobbying.scot/>>

From: Sturgeon N (Nicola), MSP
 <Nicola.Sturgeon.msp@parliament.scot<<mailto:Nicola.Sturgeon.msp@parliament.scot>>>
 Sent: 26 November 2018 08:07
 To: First Minister <firstminister@gov.scot<<mailto:firstminister@gov.scot>>>
 Subject: Fwd: Message from Scottish Parliament website

Nicola Sturgeon MSP
 Glasgow Southside
 Constituency Office (constituent enquiries only)
 Govanhill Workspace
 Unit 3, 69 Dixon Road
 G42 8AT
 Tel: 0141 424 1174
nicola.sturgeon.msp@parliament.scot<<mailto:nicola.sturgeon.msp@parliament.scot>>

All other enquiries to nicola.sturgeon@snp.org<<mailto:nicola.sturgeon@snp.org>>

Nicola Sturgeon MSP is registered as a data controller with the UK Information Commissioner. Any personal data you provide will be handled under the requirements of the EU General Data Protection Regulation (GDPR) and the Data Protection Act 2018. If you would like to find out how your data is collected and used or what your rights are in relation to this data, please reply to this email requesting a copy of the office privacy notice. If you would like more information on GDPR please visit <https://ico.org.uk/>

From: noreply@parliament.scot<mailto:noreply@parliament.scot>
<noreply@parliament.scot<mailto:noreply@parliament.scot>>
Sent: Sunday, November 25, 2018 7:14:00 PM
To: Sturgeon N (Nicola), MSP
Subject: Message from Scottish Parliament website

name:

[REDACTED]

address:

[REDACTED]

postcode:

[REDACTED]

email:

[REDACTED]@hotmail.com<mailto:[REDACTED]@hotmail.com>

telephone:

message:

I have sent this complaint to the Herald and a copy to your good self.

To: editor@heraldandtimes.co.uk<mailto:editor@heraldandtimes.co.uk>
Subject: COMPLAINT

THE HERALD

Article: Scots back new laws to allow people to self declare gender.
Saturday 24/11/2018
Front page.

To the Government and the Herald,

How can this duplicitous Government claim that 60% off 15,000 people who actually knew about this survey and are almost certainly Trans Activists, is representative of Scottish Public Opinion.?

Why, with the state of the NHS and education, is the SNP Government, wasting time and money on this nonsense?

Men and Women!

Unless a doctor states otherwise, get on with the job of .governing.Yours sincerely

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]@hotmail.com<mailto:[REDACTED]@hotmail.com>

*

The Scottish Parliament: Making a positive difference to the lives of the people of
Scotland
Pàrlamaid na h-Alba: A' toirt deagh bhuidh air beatha sluagh na h-Alba

www.parliament.scot<<http://www.parliament.scot>> :
facebook.com/scottishparliament<<http://facebook.com/scottishparliament>> :
[twitter.com/scotparl](http://twitter.com/ScotParl)<<http://twitter.com/ScotParl>>

The information in this email may be confidential. If you think you have received this
email in error please delete it and do not share its contents.

*

—
This email has been scanned by the Symantec Email Security.cloud service.
For more information please visit <http://www.symanteccloud.com>

—

From: [REDACTED]
 Sent: 03 December 2018 12:07:55
 To: Public Engagement Unit
 Subject: FW: Complaint - Press Release - Consultation on reform of the Gender Recognition Act

AO - [REDACTED] - OR

MACCS case please for OR

[REDACTED]
 Office of the First Minister
 Scottish Government
 5TH floor/St Andrews House/Regent Road
 Edinburgh EH1 3DG
 Tel [REDACTED]

All e-mails and attachments sent by a Ministerial Private Office to any other official on behalf of a Minister relating to a decision, request or comment made by a Minister, or a note of a Ministerial meeting, must be filed appropriately by the recipient. Private Offices do not keep official records of such e-mails or attachments.

Scottish Ministers, Special advisers and the Permanent Secretary are covered by the terms of the Lobbying (Scotland) Act 2016. See www.lobbying.scot<<http://www.lobbying.scot/>>

From: Sturgeon N (Nicola), MSP
 <Nicola.Sturgeon.msp@parliament.scot<mailto:Nicola.Sturgeon.msp@parliament.scot>>
 Sent: 01 December 2018 10:49
 To: First Minister <firstminister@gov.scot<mailto:firstminister@gov.scot>>
 Subject: Fwd: Complaint - Press Release - Consultation on reform of the Gender Recognition Act

Nicola Sturgeon MSP
 Glasgow Southside
 Constituency Office (constituent enquiries only)
 Govanhill Workspace
 Unit 3, 69 Dixon Road
 G42 8AT
 Tel: 0141 424 1174
 nicola.sturgeon.msp@parliament.scot<mailto:nicola.sturgeon.msp@parliament.scot>

All other enquiries to nicola.sturgeon@snp.org<<mailto:nicola.sturgeon@snp.org>>

Nicola Sturgeon MSP is registered as a data controller with the UK Information Commissioner. Any personal data you provide will be handled under the requirements of the EU General Data Protection Regulation (GDPR) and the Data Protection Act 2018. If you would like to find out how your data is collected and used or what your rights are in relation to this data, please reply to this email requesting a copy of the

office privacy notice. If you would like more information on GDPR please visit <https://ico.org.uk/>

From: [REDACTED] talk21.com<mailto:[REDACTED]@talk21.com>>
Sent: Friday, November 30, 2018 12:33:45 PM
To: Statistics.enquiries@scotland.gsi.gov.uk<mailto:Statistics.enquiries@scotland.gsi.gov.uk>
Cc: Sturgeon N (Nicola), MSP; Leonard R (Richard), MSP; Smith EA (Elaine), MSP
Subject: Complaint - Press Release - Consultation on reform of the Gender Recognition Act

To Chief Statistician & Data Officer

Reading the recent widespread press headlines regarding the above consultation it would appear that 60% of people support the proposals to introduce a self-declaratory system for legal gender recognition. Only when you read the articles you may ascertain it was only 60% of respondents (15,697) to the consultation. But as the [REDACTED] pointed out this week most people in Scotland - [REDACTED] included - were unaware that a consultation exercise had been taking place at all. As [REDACTED] stated activist groups were involved in the consultation process at an early stage and had been advising the Government on its legislation. They were well equipped to ensure that their constituency was mobilised.

So the press release is arithmetically correct, however my understanding of statistical information is that factors that significantly affect the result should be stated. This was not provided. I also understand that a YouGov poll in July indicated that only one in five UK voters support self identification. In my view, the press release figure is not only statistically invalid but also misleading.

As a comparison, I remembered the Same Sex Marriage consultation in 2012. The Executive Summary stated that 77,508 responses were received, but no percentage for or against the proposals was given. Only an anodyne statement that the majority of the individuals and groups that responded were very firmly on one side of the debate or another. I understand that a large number of responses were removed from the analysis because they were similar responses on postcards, mainly from faith groups, against the proposals. And that left a majority in favour.

That consultation exercise undermined for me and many others the credibility of what should be a valuable information gathering process. The same mistake has been made again with the highlighting of one figure. As Chief Statistician to the Scottish Government, should professional integrity not require that a revised press release be issued with caveats for the 60% figure and indeed a revised figure be published with the removal of all Trans activist groups responses from the analysis.

The reason I have also copied in the politicians is the closing down and shaming of opponents on this matter.

The [REDACTED] article also stated that the [REDACTED], has been accused of transphobia for tweeting a parliamentary meeting attended by feminist groups who are opposed to self-identification.

The Scottish Government's own Twitter feed heading states:

'Dear transphobes, we have a phobia of your hatred. Yours Scotland.

There you have it a fair, balanced debate - I think not.

Yours

[REDACTED]

ps Elaine it was good meeting you at the Red Wednesday Event at the Scottish Parliament this week and it was heartening to speak to [REDACTED] and [REDACTED] young committed Christians on this matter and others. I'm ok if you wish to forward this email.

*

The Scottish Parliament: Making a positive difference to the lives of the people of Scotland

Pàrlamaid na h-Alba: A' toirt deagh bhuidh air beatha sluagh na h-Alba

www.parliament.scot<<http://www.parliament.scot>> :

facebook.com/scottishparliament<<http://facebook.com/scottishparliament>> :

[twitter.com/scotparl](http://twitter.com/ScotParl)<<http://twitter.com/ScotParl>>

The information in this email may be confidential. If you think you have received this email in error please delete it and do not share its contents.

*

This email has been scanned by the Symantec Email Security.cloud service.
For more information please visit <http://www.symanteccloud.com>

—

From: [REDACTED]
 Sent: 20 December 2018 11:33:15
 To: Public Engagement Unit
 Subject: FW: Transgender Acceptance and an Inclusive Scotland

AO ? [REDACTED]

MACCS case please for OR

[REDACTED]
 Office of the First Minister
 Scottish Government
 5TH floor/St Andrews House/Regent Road
 Edinburgh EH1 3DG
 Tel [REDACTED]

All e-mails and attachments sent by a Ministerial Private Office to any other official on behalf of a Minister relating to a decision, request or comment made by a Minister, or a note of a Ministerial meeting, must be filed appropriately by the recipient. Private Offices do not keep official records of such e-mails or attachments.

Scottish Ministers, Special advisers and the Permanent Secretary are covered by the terms of the Lobbying (Scotland) Act 2016. See www.lobbying.scot<<http://www.lobbying.scot/>>

From: [REDACTED] <[REDACTED]@gmail.com>
 Sent: 20 December 2018 11:14
 To: First Minister <firstminister@gov.scot>
 Subject: Transgender Acceptance and an Inclusive Scotland

Dear Nicola,

I write to you with sadness and from a position of frustration with our governments glacial approach to the inclusion of transgender and gender non-conforming people. I am a transgender woman [REDACTED]

I am comfortable in my identity as a woman and I am fortunate that I exhibit a substantial amount of passing privilege. I welcomed the announcement of the Scottish Governments consultation to reform the Gender Recognition Act and the subsequent analysis which showed a clear majority of Scots agreed with the Scottish Governments position of self-identification of gender and look forward to when the Government will bring forward this legislation.

The reality today however is much sadder. As you will be aware, there has been an enormous backlash regarding anything to do with transgender people in some of the media, internet forums and through various thinly disguised protest groups. While the Scottish Government has made clear through its excellent 'not welcome here' campaign that transphobia is a crime, the sad result is, that I no longer feel safe living here.

I understand that the Government has significant legislative challenges this year and will get to reform of the Gender Recognition Act in due course although likely not until 2020. I wanted to take this opportunity to highlight that the narrative that all transgender women are dangerous and should be feared or otherwise treated as a

blanket group is poisonous. Despite holding an enormously privileged position, my quality of life has drastically decreased since I transitioned. I am no longer comfortable in public situations where I fear being able to freely use the bathroom, go shopping, eat at a restaurant or go for cocktails with my friends.

While I don't subscribe to the biological essentialism portrayed by a significant portion of the anti-transgender lobby, I can't help but see that the public do not understand transgender people and I fear every day I live my life here. Politics ultimately represents the public view and while the narrative is as toxic as it is, I have little confidence of our ability to push forward with changes to support this community.

[REDACTED] I wanted to share legislation[3] that was passed in [REDACTED] with you which unequivocally gives transgender women the right to use female bathrooms and changing facilities. It is not as bold as the legislation the Scottish Government is proposing but it actually solves the day to day issues of transgender women by making it very clear that transgender women should use female facilities and preventing this use is not permitted. This explicit clarity provides the simple reassurance that I can live my life without fear of being challenged for using the bathroom.

I am sad to be leaving Scotland. I grew up in [REDACTED] before completing my undergraduate studies at the [REDACTED] with Government provided financial support. My first significant political experience was when the SNP abolished the graduate endowment and ensured that I had the best possible start to my career. I am thankful for the opportunities, experience and memories I have been gifted. No matter where I end up in this world, I will always consider Scotland home and hope to return in the future.

I implore you to continue the fight to build an inclusive society and to seek understanding where there is none but also to stand firm that the demonization of a minority population is unacceptable and serves only to divide us when together we can do so much more.

Kind Regards,

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

This email has been scanned by the Symantec Email Security.cloud service.
For more information please visit <http://www.symanteccloud.com>

-

From: [REDACTED]
 Sent: 11 February 2019 09:18:55
 To: Public Engagement Unit
 Subject: FW: Consultation worries

AO - [REDACTED]

MACCS case please for OR

[REDACTED]
 Office of the First Minister
 Scottish Government
 5TH floor/St Andrews House/Regent Road
 Edinburgh EH1 3DG
 Tel [REDACTED]

All e-mails and attachments sent by a Ministerial Private Office to any other official on behalf of a Minister relating to a decision, request or comment made by a Minister, or a note of a Ministerial meeting, must be filed appropriately by the recipient. Private Offices do not keep official records of such e-mails or attachments.

Scottish Ministers, Special advisers and the Permanent Secretary are covered by the terms of the Lobbying (Scotland) Act 2016. See www.lobbying.scot<<http://www.lobbying.scot/>>

From: Sturgeon N (Nicola), MSP
 <Nicola.Sturgeon.msp@parliament.scot<mailto:Nicola.Sturgeon.msp@parliament.scot>>
 Sent: 11 February 2019 06:37
 To: First Minister <firstminister@gov.scot<mailto:firstminister@gov.scot>>
 Subject: Fwd: Consultation worries

Nicola Sturgeon MSP
 Glasgow Southside
 Constituency Office (constituent enquiries only)
 Unit 3
 Govanhill Workspace
 69 Dixon Road
 G42 8AT
 Tel: 0141 424 1174
 nicola.sturgeon.msp@parliament.scot<mailto:nicola.sturgeon.msp@parliament.scot>

From: [REDACTED]
 [REDACTED]@outlook.com<mailto:[REDACTED]@outlook.com>>
 Sent: Thursday, February 7, 2019 5:13:46 PM
 To: Sturgeon N (Nicola), MSP
 Subject: Consultation worries

Hello Nicola,

I have wanted to write to you for a while, to thank you for standing up for the LGBT community and in particular leading the pride march last year. I have faith in you as a

minister, which is unfortunately why I have to write to you today.

As a trans* person, the GRA reforms worry me horribly - they have dragged up awful, awful people who have been allowed to target and attack people with national newspapers printing endless biased stories - my friends and I fear every Sunday when they print another attack. So it is why I was so worried to see the tweets from the CTEEA Committee, that speak of reopening the consultation period specifically to hear these complaints!

I am shaking. Please, Nicola do not let these monsters into Scotland. I am proud of the diversity and drive of my government and I have tears in my eyes as I see them infiltrating and forcing discussions that do not involve them back open. I was proud to see how the Scottish government had seen through their attempts to swing surveys and now I see the Scottish government smiling as they tell me they want to reopen an incredibly stressful report and drag me through further abuse and attack to satisfy some bigots.

You cannot expect the patience of the abused to last forever while you make sure that these people are pleased - mainly because they have no real arguments, and by making this concession happen they have already achieved victory -they have made my life worse simply by the worried tears I am shedding for the younger trans* people in this country, as well as holding up this process further. It's not about presenting information, it's about delaying further and further while their allies [redacted] swing public perception.

You have always impressed me with your strength and drive and you need to show it now, for those whose strength is running out after two straight years of online and print abuse. These groups must be named and their input rejected - publicly. I can quite confidently say they have no evidence for any objections and the Scottish people need to see their government identifying this.

Yours faithfully,
[redacted]

*

The Scottish Parliament: Making a positive difference to the lives of the people of Scotland
Pàrlamaid na h-Alba: A' toirt deagh bhuaidh air beatha sluagh na h-Alba

www.parliament.scot<http://www.parliament.scot> :
facebook.com/scottishparliament<http://facebook.com/scottishparliament> :
twitter.com/scotparl<http://twitter.com/ScotParl>

The information in this email may be confidential. If you think you have received this email in error please delete it and do not share its contents.

*

This email has been scanned by the Symantec Email Security.cloud service.
For more information please visit <http://www.symanteccloud.com>

-

From: [REDACTED]
 Sent: 19 March 2019 16:02:14
 To: Public Engagement Unit
 Subject: FW: Gender issues

AO ? [REDACTED]

MACCS case please for OR

[REDACTED]
 Office of the First Minister
 Scottish Government
 5TH floor/St Andrews House/Regent Road
 Edinburgh EH1 3DG
 Tel [REDACTED]

All e-mails and attachments sent by a Ministerial Private Office to any other official on behalf of a Minister relating to a decision, request or comment made by a Minister, or a note of a Ministerial meeting, must be filed appropriately by the recipient. Private Offices do not keep official records of such e-mails or attachments.

Scottish Ministers, Special advisers and the Permanent Secretary are covered by the terms of the Lobbying (Scotland) Act 2016. See www.lobbying.scot<<http://www.lobbying.scot/>>

From: [REDACTED]@gmail.com<mailto:[REDACTED]@gmail.com>>
 Sent: 19 March 2019 15:45
 To: First Minister <firstminister@gov.scot<mailto:firstminister@gov.scot>>
 Subject: Gender issues

Dear Nicola,

I am writing to you regarding the issue of gender recognition in Scotland. I appreciate that you have rather a lot on your plate with the infernal mess that is Brexit. As an SNP supporter, I thank you for your efforts to protect our future, and to eventually bring Scotland her independence. All the same, I would like to convey to you my views on the gender issue, which I believe reflect the feelings of a great many voters throughout Scotland.

Since 2004, the Scottish government has allowed people to legally change their gender, providing those people met certain criteria. A diagnosis of gender dysphoria and ?that they have lived in their acquired gender for at least two years? are among the existing requirements.

Before the Gender Recognition Act 2004 has any modifications applied to it, the Scottish Government owes people an apology. Here?s why. People who wish to change their gender must live as their acquired gender for two years. I wonder what that means. Should I wish to change my gender from my birth sex (male) to female,

should I live as a woman who drives a digger, or as a ballerina? Should I wear dresses or trouser suits? Dungarees? Cat boots? Stilettos? Perhaps the Scottish Government could advise me on whether to live as a woman who prefers the company of women, or as one who wishes to find a male partner. You see the issue ? the Scottish government describes the GRA2004 as ?groundbreaking? at the time of its publication. It was, and remains, a tool for reinforcing gender stereotypes in Scottish society, instead of breaking them down. The government should apologise for not just embedding gender stereotypes, but for actually legislating them.

Not content with encouraging (and requiring) people to live by stereotype to be comfortable with their lifestyles, we go one further. If you're a woman who doesn't meet the traditional definition, we're so content that you're wrong in your portrayal of a woman, we will help you change your body, so that you'll look more like you're ?supposed to?. The same applies to men. If you're a bit too effeminate, we'll help you remove or add on body parts until you feel ok. You would find more long term success in telling people that they're ok to be whoever they want to be in the body they are already in than by helping them to mutilate that body.

All these years telling our young ones ?it's what inside that counts?, only to have the government (whose duty it is to protect the young) tell them that changing what's on the outside is the solution.

Gender is a construct, and as highlighted above, it is only traditional prejudices that make people feel like they were born ?in the wrong body?. This slide toward the ridiculous must be stopped before we end up in the mess that our American cousins are in, with pre-pubescent children being given puberty blockers to give them time to consider their options with regard to gender, and doctors and teachers forbidden from involving the families of children struggling with gender issues.

Instead, we must immediately say what is obvious to most rational thinking people. Men cannot become women and women cannot become men. What should change is the outdated belief that your birth sex must determine what you wear, how you talk, what occupation you pursue, your sexual orientation, etc.

There is also the issue that some devious people are using the hot potato of gender issues to try to gain access to previously safe places. In particular, women's changing rooms, toilets, etc. Please take time to consider the example of

 The outcome? My friend was blocked by Twitter for 24 hours for being transphobic. By being tolerant of extreme views, and intolerant of more moderate views, we are leaving our children in a particularly dangerous situation, easy prey to phony ?trans women? who cannot be challenged without repercussions for those who dare to speak out against them.

There will be some who will see this letter as transphobic. I assure you it is quite the opposite. I support the rights of anyone to live as they wish. What I do not support is the view that people should try to change their bodies to fit in with what they have been told is 'the norm'.

I am not alone in being exhausted with a very small minority of society dictating how issues like this will be dealt with, and as someone who supports the SNP, the party of independence for Scotland, I beg you to see common sense before your support begins to deteriorate due to increasingly radical policies. It is our children who are being impacted the most. The SNP's failure will be secondary to the disaster of our children's bodies and minds being irreparably damaged.

Best regards,

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

This email has been scanned by the Symantec Email Security.cloud service.
For more information please visit <http://www.symanteccloud.com>

-

From: [REDACTED]
 Sent: 23 April 2019 09:34:57
 To: Public Engagement Unit
 Subject: FW: Light rather than heat on SNP policy

MACCS case please for OR

[REDACTED]
 Office of the First Minister
 Scottish Government
 5TH floor/St Andrews House/Regent Road
 Edinburgh EH1 3DG
 Tel [REDACTED]

All e-mails and attachments sent by a Ministerial Private Office to any other official on behalf of a Minister relating to a decision, request or comment made by a Minister, or a note of a Ministerial meeting, must be filed appropriately by the recipient. Private Offices do not keep official records of such e-mails or attachments.

Scottish Ministers, Special advisers and the Permanent Secretary are covered by the terms of the Lobbying (Scotland) Act 2016. See www.lobbying.scot<<http://www.lobbying.scot/>>

From: Sturgeon N (Nicola), MSP <Nicola.Sturgeon.msp@parliament.scot>
 Sent: 22 April 2019 08:53
 To: First Minister <firstminister@gov.scot>
 Subject: Fwd: Light rather than heat on SNP policy

Nicola Sturgeon MSP
 Glasgow Southside
 Constituency Office (constituent enquiries only)
 Govanhill Workspace
 Unit 3, 69 Dixon Road
 G42 8AT
 Tel: 0141 424 1174
nicola.sturgeon.msp@parliament.scot<<mailto:nicola.sturgeon.msp@parliament.scot>>

All other enquiries to nicola.sturgeon@snp.org<<mailto:nicola.sturgeon@snp.org>>

Nicola Sturgeon MSP is registered as a data controller with the UK Information Commissioner. Any personal data you provide will be handled under the requirements of the EU General Data Protection Regulation (GDRP) and the Data Protection Act 2018. If you would like to find out how your data is collected and used or what your rights are in relation to this data, please reply to this email requesting a copy of the office privacy notice. If you would like more information on GDPR please visit <https://ico.org.uk/>

From: [REDACTED]
<mailto:[REDACTED]>>
Sent: Sunday, April 21, 2019 7:58:23 AM
To: Sturgeon N (Nicola), MSP
Subject: Light rather than heat on SNP policy

Dear Ms Sturgeon,

I write as a long time LGBTI+ activist and [REDACTED]
[REDACTED] from a pro-feminist position on both domestic abuse and trans issues.

I note the recent publicity about different opinions within the SNP on policy on recognition of self-declaration for trans people. The organisations which know most about working with vulnerable women in women-only services all work on a self-declaration basis, they have done for years, and they support reform of the GRA to introduce self-declaration.

Given that Scottish Women's Aid, Engender, Zero Tolerance, Scottish Rape Crisis and others all support self-declaration and have experience of adopting a self-declaration approach in their women-only work I do wonder on what basis this evidence base is considered faulty by those opposing progress on trans rights.

Best wishes

[REDACTED]
[REDACTED]
[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

*

The Scottish Parliament: Making a positive difference to the lives of the people of Scotland
Pàrlamaid na h-Alba: A' toirt deagh bhuidh air beatha sluagh na h-Alba

www.parliament.scot<http://www.parliament.scot> :
facebook.com/scottishparliament<http://facebook.com/scottishparliament> :
twitter.com/scotparl<http://twitter.com/ScotParl>

The information in this email may be confidential. If you think you have received this email in error please delete it and do not share its contents.

*

This email has been scanned by the Symantec Email Security.cloud service.
For more information please visit <http://www.symanteccloud.com>

From: [REDACTED]
Sent: 23 April 2019 10:10:56
To: Public Engagement Unit
Subject: FW: Trans Debate

MACCS case please for OR

[REDACTED]
Office of the First Minister
Scottish Government
5TH floor/St Andrews House/Regent Road
Edinburgh EH1 3DG
Tel [REDACTED]

All e-mails and attachments sent by a Ministerial Private Office to any other official on behalf of a Minister relating to a decision, request or comment made by a Minister, or a note of a Ministerial meeting, must be filed appropriately by the recipient. Private Offices do not keep official records of such e-mails or attachments.

Scottish Ministers, Special advisers and the Permanent Secretary are covered by the terms of the Lobbying (Scotland) Act 2016. See www.lobbying.scot<<http://www.lobbying.scot/>>

From: [REDACTED]@gmail.com>
Sent: 22 April 2019 17:44
To: First Minister <firstminister@gov.scot>
Subject: Trans Debate

Ms Sturgeon was recently quoted as saying she did not feel threatened either as a woman or a feminist by transgender rights. Surely as a First Minister this is a pretty narrow reference point for developing policies and laws or indeed making public statements - regardless of which side of the fence she is on. She surely has a duty to investigate and listen to all sides of any argument before making public statements or forming policies.

Personal prejudice or experience is really not the best reference point for leadership - first time I have put her in the same camp as Trump.

Scary stuff.

[REDACTED]

This email has been scanned by the Symantec Email Security.cloud service.
For more information please visit <http://www.symanteccloud.com>

-

From: [REDACTED] 13:26:00
 To: Public Engagement Unit
 Subject: FW: Request for meeting

Diary case for Maccs please, signature by [REDACTED] Deputy Private Secretary

[REDACTED]
 Assistant Diary Secretary to the First Minister
 5th Floor | St Andrew's House | Regent Road | Edinburgh | EH1 3DG
 [cid:image002.png@01D466EB.75B8A590]<https://na01.safelinks.protection.outlook.com/?url=https%3A%2F%2Ffirstminister.gov.scot%2F&data=02%7C01 [REDACTED]
 [REDACTED] 40quintiles.com%7Cb1121ac57c904459408d08d6344fee61%7C5989ec
 e0f90e40bf9c791a7becdb861%7C1%7C0%7C636753915241584098&sdata=r9WV
 O%2Fg%2BbqyQGqyx2ZYBS9VsNfev11DEkAADhwvGcFI%3D&reserved=0>
 All e-mails and attachments sent by a Ministerial Private Office to any other official
 on behalf of a Minister relating to a decision, request or comment made by a Minister,
 or a note of a Ministerial meeting, must be filed appropriately by the recipient.
 Private Offices do not keep official records of such e-mails or attachments.

Scottish Ministers, Special advisers and the Permanent Secretary are covered by the
 terms of the Lobbying (Scotland) Act 2016. See
www.lobbying.scot<<http://www.lobbying.scot/>>

From: Info forwomen.scot <info@forwomen.scot>
 Sent: 12 February 2019 12:35
 To: First Minister <firstminister@gov.scot>
 Subject: Request for meeting

Dear Ms Sturgeon,

In light of your comments at the UN regarding the concerns of feminist women and
 your acknowledgement that both sides need to be heard, we should like to meet with
 you and present our concerns.

Far from being "misplaced", we have a great deal of evidence to suggest that there are
 significant human rights issues for women and girls and that self ID policies represent
 a substantial roll back of our rights.

We look forward to hearing from you.

[REDACTED]
 on behalf of forwomen.scot

This email has been scanned by the Symantec Email Security.cloud service.
 For more information please visit <http://www.symanteccloud.com>

This email has been received from an external party and has been swept for the
presence of computer viruses.

From: [REDACTED]
 Sent: 07 February 2019 14:44:42
 To: Public Engagement Unit
 Subject: FW: Worries about women's sex based rights

AO - [REDACTED]

MACCS case please for OR

[REDACTED]
 Office of the First Minister
 Scottish Government
 5TH floor/St Andrews House/Regent Road
 Edinburgh EH1 3DG
 Tel [REDACTED]

All e-mails and attachments sent by a Ministerial Private Office to any other official on behalf of a Minister relating to a decision, request or comment made by a Minister, or a note of a Ministerial meeting, must be filed appropriately by the recipient. Private Offices do not keep official records of such e-mails or attachments.

Scottish Ministers, Special advisers and the Permanent Secretary are covered by the terms of the Lobbying (Scotland) Act 2016. See www.lobbying.scot<<http://www.lobbying.scot>>

From: Sturgeon N (Nicola), MSP
 <Nicola.Sturgeon.msp@parliament.scot<mailto:Nicola.Sturgeon.msp@parliament.scot>>
 Sent: 07 February 2019 14:43
 To: First Minister <firstminister@gov.scot<mailto:firstminister@gov.scot>>
 Subject: Fwd: Worries about women's sex based rights

Nicola Sturgeon MSP
 Glasgow Southside
 Constituency Office (constituent enquiries only)
 Unit 3
 Govanhill Workspace
 69 Dixon Road
 G42 8AT
 Tel: 0141 424 1174
 nicola.sturgeon.msp@parliament.scot<mailto:nicola.sturgeon.msp@parliament.scot>

From: [REDACTED] icloud.com<mailto:[REDACTED]@icloud.com>>
 Sent: Thursday, February 7, 2019 8:59:48 AM
 To: Sturgeon N (Nicola), MSP
 Subject: Worries about women's sex based rights

Dear Ms Sturgeon

As an SNP supporter and great advocate for an independent Scotland I am extremely happy to have you at the helm. However I am somewhat confused as to why you are

championing transgender rights over and above women's and children's rights. The whole argument for men wanting to be women and girls wanting to become boys needs far more attention, knowledge and understanding before any more time is given up to change in law the provision of sex-based rights and safe spaces for females.

Yours sincerely



*

The Scottish Parliament: Making a positive difference to the lives of the people of Scotland
Pàrlamaid na h-Alba: A' toirt deagh bhuidh air beatha sluagh na h-Alba

www.parliament.scot<<http://www.parliament.scot>> :
facebook.com/scottishparliament<<http://facebook.com/scottishparliament>> :
[twitter.com/scotparl](http://twitter.com/ScotParl)<<http://twitter.com/ScotParl>>

The information in this email may be confidential. If you think you have received this email in error please delete it and do not share its contents.

*

This email has been scanned by the Symantec Email Security.cloud service.
For more information please visit <http://www.symanteccloud.com>

—

From: [REDACTED]
 Sent: 11 February 2019 12:09:05
 To: Public Engagement Unit
 Subject: FW: response to Nicola Sturgeon's "misplaced" feminism comment

AO - [REDACTED]

MACCS case please for OR

[REDACTED]
 Office of the First Minister
 Scottish Government
 5TH floor/St Andrews House/Regent Road
 Edinburgh EH1 3DG
 Tel [REDACTED]

All e-mails and attachments sent by a Ministerial Private Office to any other official on behalf of a Minister relating to a decision, request or comment made by a Minister, or a note of a Ministerial meeting, must be filed appropriately by the recipient. Private Offices do not keep official records of such e-mails or attachments.

Scottish Ministers, Special advisers and the Permanent Secretary are covered by the terms of the Lobbying (Scotland) Act 2016. See www.lobbying.scot<<http://www.lobbying.scot/>>

From: [REDACTED] >>
 Sent: 11 February 2019 11:02
 To: Scottish Ministers
 <Scottish_Ministers@gov.scot<mailto:Scottish_Ministers@gov.scot>>; First Minister <firstminister@gov.scot<<mailto:firstminister@gov.scot>>>
 Cc: Human Rights Leadership
 <humanrightsleadership@gov.scot<<mailto:humanrightsleadership@gov.scot>>>; [REDACTED]
 Subject: response to Nicola Sturgeon's "misplaced" feminism comment

Dear Nicola Sturgeon,

This February you addressed the United Nation on the subject of Human rights. In response to a question raised by a Scottish woman about the impacts of the proposed reform to the GRA on women's safety, privacy and dignity, you said these concerns were misplaced. As a long time feminist and a SNP member for several years now, I wanted to tell you how much this statement shocks and saddens me. I refuse to believe that anyone who is concerned with women well fare and equality and is truly aware of the implications of gender identity ideology could brush aside the perfectly valid concerns of women rights activists in such a flippant way.

First I would like to remind you that women did not object to the GRA when it was first introduced in 2004, because women in their vast majority are not bigots, and do feel kinship of sorts with transsexuals (see link [1] below). We have welcomed male transsexuals in our toilets for a long time without complaints. So what has changed since 2004? Have women rights' activists, left-wing trade unionists and mothers suddenly become intolerant and transphobic? Or have the demands of the transgender lobby groups become unreasonable? Let's examine these demands:

Self-ID implies that any biological male who identifies as a woman can legally become a woman by simple declaration, and their legal sex will become female,

irrespective of whether this person undergoes any physical transition or life style change. Indeed over 80% of transgender male retain their male anatomy (penis). The recent Scottish consultation on the change to the GRA further alluded to the possibility that one could change one's gender as many time as desired. Such a system poses obvious safeguarding issues and is wide open to abuse. Yet we are told our fears that Self-ID could be abused by predatory male to access women in vulnerable situations is misplaced or even hysterical. Why would men go to such length to abuse women? It is simple, men will not automatically need to go to such length (obtaining a GRC by filling a simple form is not strictly speaking prohibitive, but let's put that aside): misgendering someone is considered hate speech and therefore questioning the presence of a male-bodied individual, in possession of a GRC or not, in a women's safe space is strongly discouraged (a lactating mother has just been thrown in jail for misgendering someone). How are we supposed to teach girls about boundaries when all boundaries disappear from public space, when we actively discourage girls and women to trust the gut feeling that would keep them safe from a potential aggressor in favour of being kind? One would think that in the wake of the #metoo movement and the (long awaited) recognition that women face widespread abuse from men at home, in the street and at work, one would not need to reassert or defend the right of women to say No and to determine our own boundaries. Single-sex spaces exist for a reason, because men as a class abuse women as a class [3] and this abuse results in women's misrepresentation in public life. There are, as we speak, campaigns being fought in Asia and Africa, in refugee camps and schools around the world to provide single-sex toilets to women and girls to keep them safe from harm and allow them to attend to their most basic needs [2]. Yet, in the West we have progressive politicians working actively to destroy the single-sex provisions that feminist of the previous generations have fought so hard to obtain and that are so clearly needed in places where they are not widely accessible.

Self-ID has implications for the existing legal framework too. Self-ID in effect substitutes someone's legal sex with their gender identity, hence conflating two very different things. While sex is a protected characteristic defined in the Equality Act 2010, gender identity is not. Therefore, self-ID in its proposed form constitutes an important legal loophole: no other law relies on a purely subjective criterion (self-declared gender identity) rather than objective criteria defined in law. This precedent can have widespread implications for transgender people already in possession a GRC and vulnerable women who have previously benefited from single-sex provisions and services. Yet no impact assessment has been carried out.

But these are not the only consequences of Self-ID and the transgender ideology. The philosophical implication goes deeper and robs women of the words that define us , and changes the meaning of the words we use to explain why we are wounded and oppressed in this world (Womxn, menstruator, cis, front-hole to name a few). Transgender ideology forces us to consider again, or for some, for the first time, what is a woman. How can a person born male, socialised as male, who has learnt from birth to navigate society as a boy, whose brain has plastically developed in response to his experience of the world as a male, who has sometimes fathered children, lived his all adult life as a man, be considered to be a woman because of a vague (but strong) feeling? How does that person know what it feels like to be a woman? I am a natal woman. Yet I don't know what it feels or should feel like to be a woman. I simply am a woman, whether I like it or not. We are told transwomen are women and natal women are ciswomen, i.e., a subset of what should be our own ontological category! Womanhood is not a mere feeling and womanhood is not a collection of stereotypes. Women are oppressed and exploited all around the world for their reproductive and sexual labour, because of their sex. The gender pay gap is a reproductive (sex) pay gap [4]: it arises when women have children. Gender is not the cause of our oppression but a tool to oppress us: it constrains what is allowed, encouraged or prohibited for a woman to do, to wear, to say, to have and to reach. Gender is a set of limits. And feminists over the last century (and beyond) have

rejected the gender stereotypes that have imprisoned us. You personally owe these feminists the opportunity to be our First Minister.

The gender identity ideology demands that gender stereotypes become the essence of what is male or female and that these allegedly defining stereotypes be taught at school [you can listen to a truly horrifying training session by Mermaids in link 5]. From an early age in Scottish schools, girls will be told that if they like truck and blue things and climbing they might very well be boys trapped in the wrong body -despite it being biologically and physically impossible. This teaching is highly regressive and harmful for reasons that should be obvious to you, yet it is dressed in the progressive sheep's clothing of gender non-conformity in order to appeal to liberals. In fact, it naturalises and reifies gender conformity.

It is not too late to admit that, like many other progressive politicians before you, you have been conned. There is still time to design policies that will help the transgender population live fulfilling and dignified lives without rolling back decades of gains and progress for women and girls. Promoting the rights of the LGBT population is progressive and laudable but so is understanding and combating the very real oppression that women face at home, at work and in the public space because they are female. Erasing women's reality in favour of a fuzzy, hard to pin down and undefined gender identity, compromising women's safety and representation in favour of validating the sense of identity and the feelings of men (however they identify) will do none of that.

With best wishes, [REDACTED]

[1] <https://www.counterfire.org/articles/opinion/19538-as-a-trans-woman-this-is-the-unity-i-want-to-see>

[2] <https://www.independent.co.uk/news/world/single-sex-toilets-unesco-un-international-womens-day-period-a8244776.html>

[3] https://mobile.twitter.com/WG_Scotland/status/1091030967647719424?fbclid=IwAR0H6vSnhJAhrPlctSaQ63omjPFLp3TUIJ5DF-SKq_So454OFw8_n28t9G4k

[4] https://www.henrikkleven.com/uploads/3/7/3/1/37310663/kleven-landais-sogaard_nber-w24219_jan2018.pdf?fbclid=IwAR1f9el574DMwGs5CGHBeqIgrCcGQxyhbHMqQnS0IIUEpqQHWOVYMX10Ink

[5] <https://soundcloud.com/user-407799333/mermaids-barbie-gijoe-jelly-babies-and-other-nonsense-part-1>

[REDACTED]

This email has been scanned by the Symantec Email Security.cloud service.
For more information please visit <http://www.symanteccloud.com>

This email has been received from an external party and has been swept for the presence of computer viruses.

From: [REDACTED]
Sent: 23 April 2019 09:03:52
To: Public Engagement Unit
Subject: FW: Being Trans in Scotland 2019

MACCS case please for OR

[REDACTED]
Office of the First Minister
Scottish Government
5TH floor/St Andrews House/Regent Road
Edinburgh EH1 3DG
Tel [REDACTED]

All e-mails and attachments sent by a Ministerial Private Office to any other official on behalf of a Minister relating to a decision, request or comment made by a Minister, or a note of a Ministerial meeting, must be filed appropriately by the recipient. Private Offices do not keep official records of such e-mails or attachments.

Scottish Ministers, Special advisers and the Permanent Secretary are covered by the terms of the Lobbying (Scotland) Act 2016. See www.lobbying.scot<<http://www.lobbying.scot/>>

From: Sturgeon N (Nicola), MSP <Nicola.Sturgeon.msp@parliament.scot>
Sent: 22 April 2019 08:53
To: First Minister <firstminister@gov.scot>
Subject: Fwd: Being Trans in Scotland 2019

Nicola Sturgeon MSP
Glasgow Southside
Constituency Office (constituent enquiries only)
Govanhill Workspace
Unit 3, 69 Dixon Road
G42 8AT
Tel: 0141 424 1174
nicola.sturgeon.msp@parliament.scot<<mailto:nicola.sturgeon.msp@parliament.scot>>

All other enquiries to nicola.sturgeon@snp.org<<mailto:nicola.sturgeon@snp.org>>

Nicola Sturgeon MSP is registered as a data controller with the UK Information Commissioner. Any personal data you provide will be handled under the requirements of the EU General Data Protection Regulation (GDPR) and the Data Protection Act 2018. If you would like to find out how your data is collected and used or what your rights are in relation to this data, please reply to this email requesting a copy of the office privacy notice. If you would like more information on GDPR please visit <https://ico.org.uk/>

From: [REDACTED] >
Sent: Sunday, April 21, 2019 10:48:05 AM
To: [REDACTED]
Subject: Being Trans in Scotland 2019

Dear MSP

We understand you have been invited this week to "Being Trans in Scotland 2019", a meeting in parliament to discuss trans rights. We are all transsexual people and we wish to point out that the organisations speaking at this meeting do not reflect our views or experiences.

We are deeply concerned about naïve proposals to weaken safeguarding protections in a misguided attempt to support a simplistic notion of inclusion. The debate that was opened up by the consultation on changes to the Gender Recognition Act - both in Scotland and at Westminster - has exposed wider concerns over the position taken by several high profile transgender advocacy groups.

For example:

- * the principle that gender identity is more fundamental to human society than biological sex;
- * the idea that trans people really are the opposite sex; and
- * the claim that transwomen and "ciswomen" are two equivalent types of women.

While these statements may have limited impact among more privileged groups, they can have a devastating impact in wider society and especially on the poorest and most vulnerable women.

As transsexual people we are horrified by the impact on women: their right to organise as a biological sex and their ability to protect their own boundaries. When women do protest they are accused of bigotry and transphobia, and dehumanised as TERFs. We therefore understand why many women choose to remain silent despite their discomfort and outrage when biological males:

- * claim they are entitled to the rights and protections granted to women;
- * take places reserved for women in politics and wider society;
- * compete in female sport despite ongoing physical advantage; and
- * put their needs above the needs of women.

We are writing to you to express our solidarity with women who have aired reasonable concerns and then been attacked for doing so. But we also fear a backlash that will threaten the rights we cherish:

- * the right to access medical treatment to alleviate the debilitating effects of gender dysphoria;
- * the right to express ourselves in ways more typical of the opposite sex or of neither sex;
- * the right to be protected from discrimination, harassment and abuse

These are rights based in concrete reality, and we believe they can be protected without affecting the rights of women. But to do that we need to engage in meaningful and constructive dialogue with women's groups such as forwomen.scot<<https://eur03.safelinks.protection.outlook.com/?url=https%3A%2F%2Fforwomen.scot%2F&data=01%7C01%7CNicola.Sturgeon.msp%40parliament.scot%7C9936db6387dc4361ae4508d6c63e79f2%7Cd603c99ccfdd4292926800db0d0cf081%7C1&sdata=l6ZX4%2B6HREB%2BZb36YQLq2tDEfnRIJWKXml%2Fig7PW31k%3D&reserved=0>> to rebuild mutual trust and understanding.

[Redacted]

*

The Scottish Parliament: Making a positive difference to the lives of the people of Scotland

Pàrlamaid na h-Alba: A' toirt deagh bhuaidh air beatha sluagh na h-Alba

www.parliament.scot<<http://www.parliament.scot>> :

facebook.com/scottishparliament<<http://facebook.com/scottishparliament>> :

[twitter.com/scotparl](http://twitter.com/ScotParl)<<http://twitter.com/ScotParl>>

The information in this email may be confidential. If you think you have received this email in error please delete it and do not share its contents.

*

This email has been scanned by the Symantec Email Security.cloud service.
For more information please visit <http://www.symanteccloud.com>

—

From: [REDACTED]
 Sent: 28 September 2018 11:13:00
 To: Public Engagement Unit
 Subject: FW: Transgender issues

MACCS case please for OR

[REDACTED]
 Office of the First Minister
 Scottish Government
 5TH floor/St Andrews House/Regent Road
 Edinburgh EH1 3DG
 Tel [REDACTED]

All e-mails and attachments sent by a Ministerial Private Office to any other official on behalf of a Minister relating to a decision, request or comment made by a Minister, or a note of a Ministerial meeting, must be filed appropriately by the recipient. Private Offices do not keep official records of such e-mails or attachments.

Scottish Ministers, Special advisers and the Permanent Secretary are covered by the terms of the Lobbying (Scotland) Act 2016. See www.lobbying.scot

-----Original Message-----

From: [REDACTED] <[REDACTED]@icloud.com>
 Sent: 28 September 2018 11:05
 To: First Minister <firstminister@gov.scot>
 Subject: Transgender issues

Two articles accompany this note.

The first you will familiar with

I must confess I had no idea this was going on until I chanced on a couple of Internet articles My position is that members of LGBT groupings should enjoy the same rights as anyone else so the legislation in place is OK The second is an article I came across. When it dawned on me what it meant I was upset.

Think of the LGBT folk as refugees leaving a war zone and going towards acceptance. Think that amongst these refugees hide a small number of enemy troops. The enemy are those who hide behind the legislation to pander to their various depravities.

Any personal criticism of them is bundled with an attack on the trans community and results in critics being for example taken off Twitter. Paedophiles are very cunning and the key issue that they exploit is apparently enshrined in your new legislation. A man can say he is a woman and without surgical intervention become one. There may be genuine people who have gone through agonies for years and their legal declaration will doubtless help them. But there will be those who pretend to have changed sex psychologically and emotionally to gain access and authority in a position of trust.

It's OK to be different.

It's not OK to manipulate young minds.

All the best in Holyrood

[REDACTED]

<https://www.byline.com/column/85/article/2300>

<https://consult.gov.scot/family-law/review-of-the-gender-recognition-act-2004/>

Sent from my iPad

This email has been scanned by the Symantec Email Security.cloud service.
For more information please visit <http://www.symanteccloud.com>

—

From: [REDACTED]
Sent: 01 May 2019 08:51:48
To: Public Engagement Unit
Subject: FW: Important words from a trans woman

MACCS case please for OR

[REDACTED]
Office of the First Minister
Scottish Government
5TH floor/St Andrews House/Regent Road
Edinburgh EH1 3DG
Tel [REDACTED]

All e-mails and attachments sent by a Ministerial Private Office to any other official on behalf of a Minister relating to a decision, request or comment made by a Minister, or a note of a Ministerial meeting, must be filed appropriately by the recipient. Private Offices do not keep official records of such e-mails or attachments.

Scottish Ministers, Special advisers and the Permanent Secretary are covered by the terms of the Lobbying (Scotland) Act 2016. See www.lobbying.scot<<http://www.lobbying.scot/>>

From: [REDACTED]@btinternet.com <[REDACTED]@btinternet.com>
Sent: 01 May 2019 07:07
To: First Minister <firstminister@gov.scot>
Subject: Important words from a trans woman

Dear First Minister,

I'm a post operative transsexual female, I've been told numerous times by trans rights advocates not to use TS because it creates a hierarchy of transwomen, which is true, it does and that's why I use it. I'm not trans gender, I didn't just wake up on morning and think " today I'm a woman" and then be able to access female spaces with a male body.

I understand the need for equality, I remember the days when I was part of the transsexual fight we waged for the freedom to pee but post operatively with a GRC I have rights in law and I'm surgically constructed female. I still feel awkward in female spaces. I admire what you're trying to achieve but I feel that you're advancing in the wrong direction.

According to Stonewall transvestites are under the trans umbrella, transvestites in the dictionary are men who fetishistically dress in womens clothing then you have cross dressers, these dress without the sexual fetish and are just non cis males with a female fashion sense.

Which transwomen are you letting into womens space, you need to be more nuanced in your approach. It's great that people can self identify, having a sense of self gives people a person comfort in their being but this being should not be allowed to over ride evolutionary biology.

For decades women have had freedom to wear pretty much whatever they choose, men haven't and that's the issue. Men reject anything that's not seen as 100% man and

other them, so in these days instead of challenging men and the wider society to give males freedom of expression the argument is that these TVs and CDs are women. I believe it would be better for society and for mens mental health if we challenged men and society to evolve their thinking so that males in dresses don't feel threatened in male spaces, when I say male I mean anyone with a penis.

Transwomen talk about the threat of male violence against transwomen, and that's a real thing I suppose, I've never experienced it but feminist have been calling to and end of male violence forever and that's never been challenged fully and nows the time, Please consider the things you do because all it takes is for one person to get hurt, and that will happen, and this situation will blow up.

I'm available if you'd like a face to face chat about it, I'll buy the coffee, throw in a slice of carrot cake ecause it's easier to have these conversations face to face, I doubt I'll ever meet you though you seem crazy busy.

It's not transphobic to ask questions and use the terms that make the trans community feel uncomfortable, I have lesbian feminist friends who tell me to my face I'm not a woman, I'm cool with that because very one has the right to be offended but I don't see that comment as transphobic because biologically they are right, but they are also happy that I found peace and comfort in my own skin.

I'm sure that you'll be rolling your eyes in the way politicians do when they hear things that they don't agree with but I do hopw you'll give the argument a more intelligent approach.

Thanks



This email has been scanned by the Symantec Email Security.cloud service.
For more information please visit <http://www.symanteccloud.com>

-

From: [REDACTED]
 Sent: 01 May 2019 17:24:54
 To: Public Engagement Unit
 Subject: FW: [REDACTED]

MACCS case please for OR

[REDACTED]
 Office of the First Minister
 Scottish Government
 5TH floor/St Andrews House/Regent Road
 Edinburgh EH1 3DG
 Tel [REDACTED]

All e-mails and attachments sent by a Ministerial Private Office to any other official on behalf of a Minister relating to a decision, request or comment made by a Minister, or a note of a Ministerial meeting, must be filed appropriately by the recipient. Private Offices do not keep official records of such e-mails or attachments.

Scottish Ministers, Special advisers and the Permanent Secretary are covered by the terms of the Lobbying (Scotland) Act 2016. See www.lobbying.scot<<http://www.lobbying.scot/>>

From: Sturgeon N (Nicola), MSP <Nicola.Sturgeon.msp@parliament.scot>
 Sent: 01 May 2019 15:21
 To: First Minister <firstminister@gov.scot>
 Subject: Fwd: [REDACTED]

Nicola Sturgeon MSP
 Glasgow Southside
 Constituency Office (constituent enquiries only)
 Govanhill Workspace
 Unit 3, 69 Dixon Road
 G42 8AT
 Tel: 0141 424 1174
nicola.sturgeon.msp@parliament.scot<<mailto:nicola.sturgeon.msp@parliament.scot>>

All other enquiries to nicola.sturgeon@snp.org<<mailto:nicola.sturgeon@snp.org>>

Nicola Sturgeon MSP is registered as a data controller with the UK Information Commissioner. Any personal data you provide will be handled under the requirements of the EU General Data Protection Regulation (GDRP) and the Data Protection Act 2018. If you would like to find out how your data is collected and used or what your rights are in relation to this data, please reply to this email requesting a copy of the office privacy notice. If you would like more information on GDPR please visit <https://ico.org.uk/>

From: [REDACTED]
[REDACTED]@outlook.com<mailto:[REDACTED]@outlook.com>>
Sent: Wednesday, May 1, 2019 11:51:12 AM
To: Sturgeon N (Nicola), MSP
Subject: [REDACTED]

Dear Nicola,
Thank you for your reply committing the SNP's values on equality, but I am afraid I cannot accept the parties stance when so many are allowed to openly mock it -

[REDACTED]
The SNP have done very little for trans acceptance in Scotland, apart from a single advert and a manifesto pledge that you apparently had no interest in actually following through on. To rely on your 'record' when your party matches UKIP with it's insulting and patronising language is insulting to trans people who are genuinely suffering. Your party has issued stock printed replies and automated emails with no actual answers while your own MSP's are actually attacking a minority and misrepresenting charities. The disgust I feel is shared by my voting friends. You are risking independence with this lack of backbone.

Scotland is for all or none, and the constant defence of actual transphobia as 'genuine concerns' while trans people are harrassed to death for simply existing is something that has shamed me to my core.

[REDACTED]
I will not live in your nasty little Scotland, where minorities are driven to suicide because of 'genuine concerns'. I will not vote for a Scotland that divides and hurts its citizens on the whims of misguided MSP's.

I am not unreasonable in expecting Scotland to be what you say it is - understanding, accepting and open to all.

I have given up hope of your party rectifying this - it's actually too late. You allowed transphobia to grow because it was convenient and you decided to justify it rather than fight it.

[REDACTED]
Yours faithfully,
[REDACTED]

*

The Scottish Parliament: Making a positive difference to the lives of the people of Scotland

Pàrlamaid na h-Alba: A' toirt deagh bhuaidh air beatha sluagh na h-Alba

www.parliament.scot<http://www.parliament.scot> :

facebook.com/scottishparliament<http://facebook.com/scottishparliament> :

twitter.com/scotparl<http://twitter.com/ScotParl>

The information in this email may be confidential. If you think you have received this email in error please delete it and do not share its contents.

*

This email has been scanned by the Symantec Email Security.cloud service.
For more information please visit <http://www.symanteccloud.com>

From: [REDACTED]
 Sent: 08 May 2019 08:55:35
 To: Public Engagement Unit
 Subject: FW: Transgender debate

AO ? [REDACTED]

MACCS case please for OR

[REDACTED]
 Office of the First Minister
 Scottish Government
 5TH floor/St Andrews House/Regent Road
 Edinburgh EH1 3DG
 Tel [REDACTED]

All e-mails and attachments sent by a Ministerial Private Office to any other official on behalf of a Minister relating to a decision, request or comment made by a Minister, or a note of a Ministerial meeting, must be filed appropriately by the recipient. Private Offices do not keep official records of such e-mails or attachments.

Scottish Ministers, Special advisers and the Permanent Secretary are covered by the terms of the Lobbying (Scotland) Act 2016. See www.lobbying.scot<<http://www.lobbying.scot/>>

From: [REDACTED]@gmail.com<mailto:[REDACTED]@gmail.com>>
 Sent: 07 May 2019 20:50
 To: First Minister <firstminister@gov.scot<mailto:firstminister@gov.scot>>
 Subject: Transgender debate

Dear Ms. Sturgeon,

I have been thinking of writing to you for sometime now to express my growing concern re the lack of public debate over the transgender issue.

Your party is split on this issue which is not surprising as it has been an incredibly divisive topic. Joan Mcalpine has been very brave to speak out on such a difficult subject and should be supported not vilified.

And now one of your MP's, Joanna Cherry has had death threats and had to have a police escort to attend her surgery because she dared to question the misogynistic abuse directed at MP's from trans rights activists on Twitter.

The time to have a proper open debate is now. People have real concerns about this and deserve to be heard without accusations of transphobia which is designed to close all debate down.

I urge you to bring this out into the open. I want an independent Scotland but not at any cost.

I look forward to receiving a reply from you soon.

Regards



This email has been scanned by the Symantec Email Security.cloud service.
For more information please visit <http://www.symanteccloud.com>

-

From: [REDACTED]
 Sent: 08 May 2019 14:10:18
 To: Public Engagement Unit
 Subject: FW: Transgender Rights

AO ? [REDACTED]

MACCS case please for OR

[REDACTED]
 Office of the First Minister
 Scottish Government
 5TH floor/St Andrews House/Regent Road
 Edinburgh EH1 3DG
 Tel [REDACTED]

All e-mails and attachments sent by a Ministerial Private Office to any other official on behalf of a Minister relating to a decision, request or comment made by a Minister, or a note of a Ministerial meeting, must be filed appropriately by the recipient. Private Offices do not keep official records of such e-mails or attachments.

Scottish Ministers, Special advisers and the Permanent Secretary are covered by the terms of the Lobbying (Scotland) Act 2016. See www.lobbying.scot<<http://www.lobbying.scot>>

From: [REDACTED]
 [REDACTED]@protonmail.com<[mailto:\[REDACTED\]@protonmail.com](mailto:[REDACTED]@protonmail.com)>>
 Sent: 08 May 2019 12:44
 To: First Minister <firstminister@gov.scot<<mailto:firstminister@gov.scot>>>
 Subject: Transgender Rights

Dear Nicola,

Firstly, let me congratulate you on doing a stellar job. Truly inspirational and probably the only politician making sense these days.

I am writing to you because of some disturbing newspaper reports,
<https://www.theguardian.com/politics/2019/apr/17/sturgeon-asked-to-clarify-stance-on-transgender-rights><<https://eur03.safelinks.protection.outlook.com/?url=https%3A%2F%2Fwww.theguardian.com%2Fpolitics%2F2019%2Fapr%2F17%2Fsturgeon-asked-to-clarify-stance-on-transgender-rights&data=01%7C01%7Cnicolas.sturgeon.msp%40parliament.scot%7C0a40657c5fc34fa3d15f08d6d3a979ce%7Cd603c99ccfdd4292926800db0d0cf081%7C1&sdata=y0HVDcx7tou8UuxlESxttd32ifp1%2F0KJZw1oVw3zfvo%3D&reserved=0>>

https://www.thetimes.co.uk/article/men-should-accept-trans-women-in-changing-rooms-mg2b8vnd3?utm_medium=Social&utm_source=Facebook#Echobox=1557216448<https://eur03.safelinks.protection.outlook.com/?url=https%3A%2F%2Fwww.thetimes.co.uk%2Farticle%2Fmen-should-accept-trans-women-in-changing-rooms-mg2b8vnd3%3Futm_medium%3DSocial%26utm_source%3DFacebook%23Echobox%3D1557216448&data=01%7C01%7Cnicolas.sturgeon.msp%40parliament.scot%7C0a40657c5fc34fa3d15f08d6d3a979ce%7Cd603c99ccfdd4292926800db0d0cf081%7C1&sdata=

%2BMDdb3zCWFAvQ85ZNR7QlAzcFuHMskG9a%2BffH%2BciN3s%3D&reserved=0>

It is a shame that extremist reactionaries should be invited to trample over transwomen rights; the word, 'debate' is often used by hateful people to hide their prejudice.

But in the interests of debate, could you please ensure that someone happy sharing a changing room with a transman because that is the logical conclusion of her argument... will be forced to share showers with hairy men who were assigned female at birth.

Can you also make sure that someone asks to provide evidence of transwomen being a threat to cis gendered women in female changing rooms. AND more importantly, provide evidence of transwomen being a threat to children. implications that transwomen are potential peadophiles is disgusting.

I am surmising that she will quote (but that needs to be verified because of conflicting news stories). In response to this one possible example, ask concerning women like Rosemary West and Myra Hindley who were a very real threat to women and children (supported with evidence)... and just those two examples doubles the number of women who are a threat compared to the possibility of using as an example.

The reality is that because of the hate spread by transwomen are at a much greater risk using a woman's changing room than women or children. <https://www.nbcnews.com/feature/nbc-out/two-women-sexually-assaulted-trans-woman-north-carolina-bathroom-police-n956671><<https://eur03.safelinks.protection.outlook.com/?url=https%3A%2F%2Fwww.nbcnews.com%2Ffeature%2Fnbc-out%2Ftwo-women-sexually-assaulted-trans-woman-north-carolina-bathroom-police-n956671&data=01%7C01%7Cnicolas.sturgeon.msp%40parliament.scot%7C0a40657c5fc34fa3d15f08d6d3a979ce%7Cd603c99ccfdd4292926800db0d0cf081%7C1&sdata=IYtPUiNBhvFKfts3NeTnfl6%2FMMLgi0%2BLQArL%2F4KYV6w%3D&reserved=0>>

Ultimately, this is just a hate campaign against transwomen that cannot be supported with evidence. It is based on maybes, perhaps, and what ifs to deliberately spread misinformation and hate under the dubious veil of 'debate'.

I do trust that in the interests of debate, you have a prominent trans spokesperson at this invite to raise these points and provide evidence contrary or it simply isn't a debate.

Best of luck with getting a new independence referendum and thank you for reading my mail when I know that you are busy. Keep up the outstanding work!

Sent with ProtonMail<<https://protonmail.com>> Secure Email.

This email has been scanned by the Symantec Email Security.cloud service.
For more information please visit <http://www.symanteccloud.com>

-

From: [REDACTED]
 Sent: 13 May 2019 13:46:17
 To: Public Engagement Unit
 Subject: FW: Trans Rights vs Women's Rights.

[REDACTED]

MACCS case please for OR

[REDACTED]
 Office of the First Minister
 Scottish Government
 5TH floor/St Andrews House/Regent Road
 Edinburgh EH1 3DG
 Tel [REDACTED]

All e-mails and attachments sent by a Ministerial Private Office to any other official on behalf of a Minister relating to a decision, request or comment made by a Minister, or a note of a Ministerial meeting, must be filed appropriately by the recipient. Private Offices do not keep official records of such e-mails or attachments.

Scottish Ministers, Special advisers and the Permanent Secretary are covered by the terms of the Lobbying (Scotland) Act 2016. See www.lobbying.scot<<http://www.lobbying.scot>>

From: [REDACTED] >
 Sent: 13 May 2019 13:09
 To: joanna.cherry.mp@parliament.uk<<mailto:joanna.cherry.mp@parliament.uk>>;
 Ash.Denham.msp@parliament.scot<<mailto:Ash.Denham.msp@parliament.scot>>;
 First Minister <firstminister@gov.scot<<mailto:firstminister@gov.scot>>>;
 Joan.McAlpine.msp@parliament.scot<<mailto:Joan.McAlpine.msp@parliament.scot>>
 Subject: Fwd: Trans Rights vs Women's Rights.

Dear Joanna Cherry, Ash Denham, Nicola Sturgeon and Joan McAlpine,

I feel compelled to write as I have been watching the current debate on the reform of the GRA. I am writing to support Joan McAlpine's recent stance, as her concerns echo my own. I also have great thanks and admiration for Joanna's Cherry's recent intervention in this area, and am dismayed at the campaign now against her.

Despite my desire to see Scotland protect everybody's rights and provide an environment that ensures minorities feel safe, I find it very difficult to accept that this means accepting a fundamental untruth, that human beings can change sex and that human biology does not matter. It also seems that it is necessary to accept this without the ability to debate this and consider what this fundamental change means to the rights of others in society, namely women.

I do not believe that whether you are a man or a woman only exists in our heads. I think that this is a sexist attitude that limits men and women to gender stereotypes and is retrogressive. I cannot see how science backs up this view. I do not believe that biology is not important as it is female and male biology that keeps women in fear of male violence and subject to sexism in public life and the workplace. I do not believe

that people with fully male bodies can be entirely female if they say that they are, including in sexual, medical, correctional and sex-segregated contexts. I do not believe children aren't born a sex, but have one "assigned", which can be wrong; and that the correct one must in that scenario be imposed through medical and surgical intervention. And I do not think that it is beneficial to our society that if you disagree with any of this , then you are a transphobe, a terf and shouldn't be listened to or debated with and can be hounded out of your position.

I thank Joan and Joanna for standing up for the views of women such as myself, despite the personal and professional danger they put themselves in for doing so.

I think it is horrendous that the concerns and fears women such as myself Joanna and Joan are labelled as "transphobic", abused as TERFS and we are not allowed to talk openly about them. The abuse that Joan and Joanna have been subjected to has been horrific. (Not least from other MSP's [REDACTED])

In the last few weeks [REDACTED] Simply for having a differing opinion. This is ridiculous and frightening and is not a fringe,unusual, extreme occurrence. It is happening everyday. I have no doubt that if I was to publicly express the views I have expressed here in this private email then my career would be in jeopardy also. For expressing disagreement with a fundamental untruth (that transwomen are women) This cannot allowed to continue. Transwomen should obviously be protected by law in order to to live the peaceful lives they want to live, just like everyone else. But this cannot be at the expense of the truth and of other's in a society .

I have been proud to vote SNP over the last decade. I voted for Ash in the last election. I have been proud to see Nicola Sturgeon represent me and this country on a world stage. I campaigned long and hard against fracking in scotland and was proud to see the SNP listen to my views. I would hope that the SNP will be able to steer a way through this debate that respects the transgender communities rights whilst allowing women to express concern about their own rights without abuse and without denying the fundamentals of reality,

Best

[REDACTED]

--

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

--

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]



This email has been scanned by the Symantec Email Security.cloud service.
For more information please visit <http://www.symanteccloud.com>

This email has been received from an external party and has been swept for the
presence of computer viruses.

