

1

[ redacted - out of scope ]

---

**From:** [redacted – out of scope]  
**Sent:**  
**To:**  
**Subject:**

---

**From:** [redacted – s.38 (1)(b)] **On Behalf Of** Deputy First Minister and Cabinet Secretary for Education and Skills  
**Sent:** 22 June 2018 14:44  
**To:** Armstrong A (Alan) <Alan.Armstrong@educationscotland.gsi.gov.uk>; Deputy First Minister and Cabinet Secretary for Education and Skills <DFMCSE@gov.scot>  
**Cc:** Minister for Further Education, Higher Education and Science <MinisterFEHES@gov.scot>; Minister for Childcare and Early Years <MinisterCEY@gov.scot>; DG Education, Communities & Justice <DGECJ@gov.scot>; Robertson FMG (Fiona) (Director of Learning) <Fiona.Robertson@gov.scot>; Hicks C (Clare) <Clare.Hicks@gov.scot>; [redacted – s.38 (1)(b)]; [redacted – s.38 (1)(b)]; Gorman G (Gayle) <Gayle.Gorman@educationscotland.gsi.gov.uk>; [redacted – s.38 (1)(b)]; Communications DFM & Education <CommunicationsDFM&Education@gov.scot>; PS/Education Scotland <ps/educationscotland@educationscotland.gsi.gov.uk>  
**Subject:** RE: GLOW YAMMER – REQUEST TO REACTIVATE YAMMER FOR STAFF ACCOUNTS ONLY

Alan,

DFM is content to agree re-activation of staff accounts only.

Thanks  
[redacted - s.38 (1)(b)]

[redacted – s.38 (1)(b)] | Deputy Private Secretary to John Swinney MSP | Deputy First Minister of Scotland and Cabinet Secretary for Education & Skills | Scottish Government | St Andrew's House | Edinburgh | EH1 3DG | [redacted – s.38 (1)(b)]

*All e-mails and attachments sent by a Ministerial Private Office to any other official on behalf of a Minister relating to a decision, request or comment made by a Minister, or a note of a Ministerial meeting, must be filed appropriately by the recipient. Private Offices do not keep official records of such e-mails or attachments.*

*Scottish Ministers, Special advisers and the Permanent Secretary are covered by the terms of the Lobbying (Scotland) Act 2016. See [www.lobbying.scot](http://www.lobbying.scot)*

---

**From:** [redacted – s.38 (1)(b)] **On Behalf Of** Armstrong A (Alan)  
**Sent:** 21 June 2018 14:54  
**To:** Deputy First Minister and Cabinet Secretary for Education and Skills  
**Cc:** Minister for Further Education, Higher Education and Science; Minister for Childcare and Early Years; DG Education, Communities & Justice; Robertson FMG (Fiona) (Director of Learning); Hicks C (Clare); [redacted – s.38 (1)(b)];

[redacted – s.38 (1)(b)]; Gorman G (Gayle); Armstrong A (Alan); [redacted – s.38 (1)(b)]; Communications DFM & Education;  
PS/Education Scotland

**Subject:** GLOW YAMMER – REQUEST TO REACTIVATE YAMMER FOR STAFF ACCOUNTS ONLY

Deputy First Minister,

Please find the attached, a ministerial submission with the request to reactivate yammer for staff accounts only.

Ministerial Submission	<< File: Ministerial submission - Mr Swinney - Yammer Reactivation for Staff - 21 June 2018.docx >>
------------------------	---

Kind regards

-----  
**Alan Armstrong** | Strategic Director | Education Scotland  
-----

PA Tel: [redacted - s.38 (1)(b)]

Address: Denholm House, Almondvale Way, Livingston, EH54 6GA

Web: [www.education.gov.scot](http://www.education.gov.scot)

**OFFICIAL-SENSITIVE: ADVICE TO MINISTERS**

From: Alan Armstrong  
Education Scotland  
21 June 2018

**Deputy First Minister and Cabinet Secretary for Education and Skills**

**GLOW YAMMER – REQUEST TO REACTIVATE YAMMER FOR STAFF ACCOUNTS ONLY**

**Purpose**

1. To request approval to reactivate Yammer for staff users only.

**Priority**

2. Immediate.

**Background**

3. As per previous submission dated 14 June, access to Glow Yammer remains suspended for all Glow users while Education Scotland undertakes a review. The review has included engagement with local authorities on a number of actions that require to be taken at a local level.

A letter from Education Scotland was sent to Directors of Education in local authorities on the 13th June outlining the Yammer suspension and review process, and requesting that they inform us of their local processes for ensuring teacher and parental awareness in the effective and safe use of Yammer. We have received a number of responses to date. We have also engaged with operational level contacts and urged them to liaise with their Directors of Education on a number of areas including: appropriate Glow account and password management; awareness of Glow and the services it provides; and Glow consent arrangements. As a precaution, we will also force a password reset for all pupil Glow accounts in accordance with cyber security best practice.

**Request to Reactivate to Staff Accounts Only**

4. Education Scotland and other education partners including local authorities currently use Yammer to support a wide range of Professional Learning activities. Yammer is used as the main communication and collaboration tool for a number of National Professional Learning Communities e.g. for Curriculum Areas, Scottish Attainment Challenge, STEM and Quality Assurance and Moderation Support Officers. Some of these groups have high membership and have been highlighted during engagement with local authorities, who have noted that these are normally heavily used at this time of year for planning for the next academic session after the summer.

Therefore, we seek your approval to restore this service to staff to allow them to continue to network on a national level and access professional learning opportunities. This will have no effect on the suspension of pupil Yammer accounts.

## OFFICIAL-SENSITIVE: ADVICE TO MINISTERS

The advantages and disadvantages of re-activating Yammer for staff accounts are as follows:

<b>Advantages</b>	<b>Disadvantages</b>
Pupil accounts will still not be able to access Yammer.	There is a small risk that remaining old, inappropriate content within Yammer that could be viewed by local authority and school staff if found.
Local authority and school staff can continue to engage in the wide range of professional learning activities.	We may receive some complaints from schools that use Yammer effectively with pupils that learner accounts remain blocked.
Local authority and school staff will be able to access learning and teaching materials that are currently stored in Yammer.	
Local authority and school staff can continue with planning for the next academic year.	

The advantages and disadvantages of **not** re-activating Yammer for staff accounts are as follows:

<b>Advantages</b>	<b>Disadvantages</b>
Pupil accounts will remain inaccessible Yammer.	Local authority and school staff will not be able to continue with planning for the next academic year.
Any old inappropriate content in Yammer will not be viewed by any Glow user.	Local authority and school staff will not be able to continue to engage in the wide range of professional learning activities.
	Local authority and school staff will not be able to access learning and teaching materials that are currently stored in Yammer.

### Conclusion

4. You are invited to consider the request to reactivate Yammer for staff accounts and provide feedback as appropriate.

**Alan Armstrong**  
**Strategic Director**  
Education Scotland  
Ext: [redacted -  
s.38 (1)(b)]

21 June 2018

**OFFICIAL-SENSITIVE: ADVICE TO MINISTERS**

Copy List:	For Action	For Comments	For Information		
			Portfolio Interest	Constit Interest	General Awareness
Deputy First Minister Minister for Further, Higher Education and Science Minister for Childcare and Early Years					X X X

DG Education Communities and Justice  
 Fiona Robertson  
 Clare Hicks  
 [redacted - s.38 (1)(b)]  
 Gayle Gorman  
 Alan Armstrong  
 [redacted - s.38 (1)(b)]  
 Communications DFM & Education

3

[redacted - out of scope]

---

**Subject:** FW: OFFICIAL SENSITIVE : ADVICE TO MINISTERS - GLOW – UPDATE ON YAMMER REVIEW

[redacted - out of scope]

**From:** [redacted - s.38 (1)(b)] **On Behalf Of** Deputy First Minister and Cabinet Secretary for Education and Skills  
**Sent:** 19 October 2018 12:46  
**To:** Armstrong A (Alan) <Alan.Armstrong@educationscotland.gsi.gov.uk>  
**Cc:** Minister for Further Education, Higher Education and Science <MinisterFEHES@gov.scot>; Minister for Children and Young People <MinisterCYP@gov.scot>; Minister for Business, Fair Work and Skills <MinisterBFWS@gov.scot>; DG Education, Communities & Justice <DGECJ@gov.scot>; Robertson FMG (Fiona) (Director of Learning) <Fiona.Robertson@gov.scot>; Director for Children and Families <DirectorforChildrenandFamilies@gov.scot>; Director of Advanced Learning and Science <DirectorofAdvancedLearningandScience@gov.scot>; Griffin J (Joe) <Joe.Griffin@gov.scot>; Hicks C (Clare) <Clare.Hicks@gov.scot>; Bruce A (Andrew) <Andrew.Bruce@gov.scot>; Wilson M (Mick) <Mick.Wilson@gov.scot>; [redacted - s.38 (1)(b)]; Gorman G (Gayle) <Gayle.Gorman@educationscotland.gsi.gov.uk>; Hamilton G (Gillian) <Gillian.Hamilton@educationscotland.gsi.gov.uk>; [redacted - s.38 (1)(b)]; Communications DFM & Education <CommunicationsDFM&Education@gov.scot>; EdS Communications mailbox <Communications@educationscotland.gsi.gov.uk>; PS/Education Scotland <ps/educationscotland@educationscotland.gsi.gov.uk>; Deputy First Minister and Cabinet Secretary for Education and Skills <DFMCSE@gov.scot>  
**Subject:** RE: OFFICIAL SENSITIVE : ADVICE TO MINISTERS - GLOW – UPDATE ON YAMMER REVIEW

Hello Alan,

DFM is available 10:45-11:30 on Thursday 25 October. Please let me know if this slot suits and if so, who will be attending the meeting.

Kind Regards,  
[redacted - s.38 (1)(b)]

[redacted - s.38 (1)(b)] | Assistant Private Secretary (Diary) to John Swinney MSP | Deputy First Minister of Scotland and Cabinet Secretary for Education & Skills | Scottish Government | St Andrew's House | Edinburgh | EH1 3DG | [redacted - s.38 (1)(b)] | E: DFMCSE@gov.scot

All e-mails and attachments sent by a Ministerial Private Office to any other official on behalf of a Minister relating to a decision, request or comment made by a Minister, or a note of a Ministerial meeting, must be filed appropriately by the recipient. Private Offices do not keep official records of such e-mails or attachments.

Scottish Ministers, Special advisers and the Permanent Secretary are covered by the terms of the Lobbying (Scotland) Act 2016. See [www.lobbying.scot](http://www.lobbying.scot)

**From:** [redacted - s.38 (1)(b)] **On Behalf Of** Deputy First Minister and Cabinet Secretary for Education and Skills

**Sent:** 17 October 2018 14:32

**To:** Armstrong A (Alan) <Alan.Armstrong@educationscotland.gsi.gov.uk>; Deputy First Minister and Cabinet Secretary for Education and Skills <DFMCSE@gov.scot>

**Cc:** Minister for Further Education, Higher Education and Science <MinisterFEHES@gov.scot>; Minister for Children and Young People <MinisterCYP@gov.scot>; Minister for Business, Fair Work and Skills <MinisterBFWS@gov.scot>; DG Education, Communities & Justice <DGEJ@gov.scot>; Robertson FMG (Fiona) (Director of Learning) <Fiona.Robertson@gov.scot>; Director for Children and Families <DirectorforChildrenandFamilies@gov.scot>; Director of Advanced Learning and Science <DirectorofAdvancedLearningandScience@gov.scot>; Griffin J (Joe) <Joe.Griffin@gov.scot>; Hicks C (Clare) <Clare.Hicks@gov.scot>; Bruce A (Andrew) <Andrew.Bruce@gov.scot>; Wilson M (Mick) <Mick.Wilson@gov.scot>; [redacted - s.38 (1)(b)]; Gorman G (Gayle) <Gayle.Gorman@educationscotland.gsi.gov.uk>; Hamilton G (Gillian) <Gillian.Hamilton@educationscotland.gsi.gov.uk>; [redacted - s.38 (1)(b)]; Communications DFM & Education <CommunicationsDFM&Education@gov.scot>; EdS Communications mailbox <Com munications@educationscotla nd .gsi.gov. uk>; PS/Education Scotland <ps/ ed ucati o nscotla nd@ed ucationscotl and .gsi .gov. u k>

**Subject:** RE: OFFICIAL SENSITIVE : ADVICE TO MINISTERS - GLOW – UPDATE ON YAMMER REVIEW

Hi Alan,

The DFM would welcome the opportunity to discuss the advice and recommendations further.

Courtney who manages the DFM diary will in touch with a suggested slot if you can consider who should attend.

Thanks

[redacted - s.38 (1)(b)]

[redacted - s.38 (1)(b)] | Deputy Private Secretary to John Swinney MSP, Deputy First Minister and Cabinet Secretary for Education and Skills | The Scottish Government | Web: [www.gov.scot](http://www.gov.scot) |[redacted - s.38 (1)(b)] | Email: [DFMCSE@gov.scot](mailto:DFMCSE@gov.scot)

**From:** Armstrong A (Alan)

**Sent:** 10 September 2018 18:04

**To:** Deputy First Minister and Cabinet Secretary for Education and Skills <DFMCSE@gov.scot>

**Cc:** Minister for Further Education, Higher Education and Science <MinisterFEHES@gov.scot>; Minister for Children and Young People <MinisterCYP@gov.scot>; Minister for Business, Fair Work and Skills <MinisterBFWS@gov.scot>; DG Education, Communities & Justice <DGEJ@gov.scot>; Robertson FMG (Fiona) (Director of Learning)

<Fiona.Robertson@gov.scot>; Director for Children and Families <DirectorforChildrenandFamilies@gov.scot>; Director of Advanced Learning and Science <DirectorofAdvancedLearningandScience@gov.scot>; Griffin J (Joe) <Joe.Griffin@gov.scot>; Hicks C (Clare) <Clare.Hicks@gov.scot>; Bruce A (Andrew) <Andrew.Bruce@gov.scot>; Wilson M (Mick) <Mick.Wilson@gov.scot>; [redacted - s.38 (1)(b)]; Gorman G (Gayle) <Gayle.Gorman@educationscotland.gsi.gov.uk>; Hamilton G (Gillian) <Gillian.Hamilton@educationscotland.gsi.gov.uk>; [redacted - s.38 (1)(b)]; Communications DFM & Education <CommunicationsDFM&Education@gov.scot>; EdS Communications mailbox <Communications@educationscotland.gsi.gov.uk>; PS/Education Scotland <ps/educationscotland@educationscotland.gsi.gov.uk>

**Subject:** RE: OFFICIAL SENSITIVE : ADVICE TO MINISTERS -GLOW –UPDATE ON YAMMER REVIEW

[redacted - s.38 (1)(b)]

I attach a submission for Mr Swinney setting out the draft review of Yammer that has taken place over the summer, advice on options for Yammer's continued use within Glow, and advice on the educational purpose of collaborative platforms such as Yammer, Microsoft Teams etc ..

Alan

**From:** [redacted - s.38 (1)(b)] **On Behalf Of** Deputy First Minister and Cabinet Secretary for Education and Skills

**Sent:** 22 August 2018 11:27

**To:** Armstrong A (Alan) <Alan.Armstrong@educationscotland.gsi.gov.uk>; Deputy First Minister and Cabinet Secretary for Education and Skills <DFMCSE@gov.scot>

**Cc:** zzzMinister for Further Education, Higher Education and Science 2016 to 2018 <zzzMinisterFEHES@gov.scot>;

Minister for Children and Young People <MinisterCYP@gov.scot>; Minister for Business, Fair Work and Skills

<MinisterBFWS@gov.scot>; DG Education, Communities & Justice <DGECJ@gov.scot>; Robertson FMG (Fiona)

(Director of Learning) <Fiona.Robertson@gov.scot>; Director for Children and Families

<DirectorforChildrenandFamilies@gov.scot>; Director of Advanced Learning and Science

<DirectorofAdvancedLearningandScience@gov.scot>; Griffin J (Joe) <Joe.Griffin@gov.scot>; Hicks C (Clare)

<Clare.Hicks@gov.scot>; Bruce A (Andrew) <Andrew.Bruce@gov.scot>; Wilson M (Mick) <Mick.Wilson@gov.scot>;

Logan G (Graeme) <Graeme.Logan@gov.scot>; [redacted - s.38 (1)(b)]; Gorman G (Gayle)

<Gayle.Gorman@educationscotland.gsi.gov.uk>; Hamilton G

(Gillian) <Gillian.Hamilton@educationscotland.gsi.gov.uk>; [redacted - s.38 (1)(b)]; Communications DFM &

Education

<CommunicationsDFM&Education@gov.scot>; EdS Communications mailbox

<Communications@educationscotland.gsi.gov.uk>; PS/Education Scotland

<ps/educationscotland@educationscotland.gsi.gov.uk>

**Subject:** RE: OFFICIAL SENSITIVE : ADVICE TO MINISTERS -GLOW –UPDATE ON YAMMER REVIEW

Hi Alan,

Thanks you for this.

The DFM has commented

That he is content with these recommendations at 22-25. However he is not prepared to consider re-establishing Yammer for any age group until we can have absolute confidence and are assured of safety protocols.

He would like further advice on this issue to address the central question - what educational purpose is satisfied/achieved by access to this type of technology and what is the best technological method of achieving these aims.

Please provide further advice.

Thanks

[redacted - s.38 (1)(b)]

[redacted - s.38 (1)(b)] | Deputy Private Secretary to John Swinney MSP, Deputy First Minister and Cabinet Secretary for Education and Skills | The Scottish Government | Web: [www.gov.scot](http://www.gov.scot) | Tel: [redacted - s.38 (1)(b)] | Email: [DFMCSE@gov.scot](mailto:DFMCSE@gov.scot)

**From:** [redacted - s.38 (1)(b)] **On Behalf Of** Armstrong A (Alan)

**Sent:** 20 August 2018 11:13

**To:** Deputy First Minister and Cabinet Secretary for Education and Skills <[DFMCSE@gov.scot](mailto:DFMCSE@gov.scot)>

**Cc:** zzzMinister for Further Education, Higher Education and Science 2016 to 2018 <[zzzMinisterFEHES@gov.scot](mailto:zzzMinisterFEHES@gov.scot)>; Minister for Children and Young People <[MinisterCYP@gov.scot](mailto:MinisterCYP@gov.scot)>; Minister for Business, Fair Work and Skills <[MinisterBFWS@gov.scot](mailto:MinisterBFWS@gov.scot)>; DG Education, Communities & Justice <[DGECJ@gov.scot](mailto:DGECJ@gov.scot)>; Robertson FMG (Fiona) (Director of Learning) <[Fiona.Robertson@gov.scot](mailto:Fiona.Robertson@gov.scot)>; Director for Children and Families <[DirectorforChildrenandFamilies@gov.scot](mailto:DirectorforChildrenandFamilies@gov.scot)>; Director of Advanced Learning and Science <[DirectorofAdvancedLearningandScience@gov.scot](mailto:DirectorofAdvancedLearningandScience@gov.scot)>; Griffin J (Joe) <[Joe.Griffin@gov.scot](mailto:Joe.Griffin@gov.scot)>; Hicks C (Clare) <[Clare.Hicks@gov.scot](mailto:Clare.Hicks@gov.scot)>; Bruce A (Andrew) <[Andrew.Bruce@gov.scot](mailto:Andrew.Bruce@gov.scot)>; Wilson M (Mick) <[Mick.Wilson@gov.scot](mailto:Mick.Wilson@gov.scot)>; Logan G (Graeme) <[Graeme.Logan@gov.scot](mailto:Graeme.Logan@gov.scot)>; [redacted - s.38 (1)(b)]; Gorman G (Gayle) <[Gayle.Gorman@educationscotland.gsi.gov.uk](mailto:Gayle.Gorman@educationscotland.gsi.gov.uk)>; Hamilton G (Gillian) <[Gillian.Hamilton@educationscotland.gsi.gov.uk](mailto:Gillian.Hamilton@educationscotland.gsi.gov.uk)>; [redacted - s.38 (1)(b)]; Communications DFM & Education <[CommunicationsDFM&Education@gov.scot](mailto:CommunicationsDFM&Education@gov.scot)>; EdS Communications mailbox <[Communications@educationscotland.gsi.gov.uk](mailto:Communications@educationscotland.gsi.gov.uk)>; PS/Education Scotland <[ps/educationscotland@educationscotland.gsi.gov.uk](mailto:ps/educationscotland@educationscotland.gsi.gov.uk)>

**Subject:** OFFICIAL SENSITIVE : ADVICE TO MINISTERS - GLOW – UPDATE ON YAMMER REVIEW

Deputy First Minister and Cabinet Secretary for Education and Skills,

Please see the attached submission 'GLOW – UPDATE ON YAMMER'

Thank you

---

**Alan Armstrong** | Strategic Director | Education Scotland

---

PA Tel: [redacted - s.38 (1)(b)]

Address: Denholm House, Almondvale Way, Livingston, EH54 6GA

Web: [www.education.gov.scot](http://www.education.gov.scot)

[redacted - out of scope]

**Subject:** RE: OFFICIAL SENSITIVE : ADVICE TO MINISTERS - GLOW – UPDATE ON YAMMER REVIEW

[redacted - out of scope]

**From:** P[redacted - s.38 (1)(b)] **On Behalf Of** Deputy First Minister and Cabinet Secretary for Education and Skills  
**Sent:** 28 August 2018 19:07  
**To:** Armstrong A (Alan) <Alan.Armstrong@educationscotland.gsi.gov.uk>; Deputy First Minister and Cabinet Secretary for Education and Skills <DFMCSE@gov.scot>  
**Cc:** zzzMinister for Further Education, Higher Education and Science 2016 to 2018 <zzzMinisterFEHES@gov.scot>; Minister for Children and Young People <MinisterCYP@gov.scot>; Minister for Business, Fair Work and Skills <MinisterBFWS@gov.scot>; DG Education, Communities & Justice <DGECJ@gov.scot>; Robertson FMG (Fiona) (Director of Learning) <Fiona.Robertson@gov.scot>; Director for Children and Families <DirectorforChildrenandFamilies@gov.scot>; Director of Advanced Learning and Science <DirectorofAdvancedLearningandScience@gov.scot>; Griffin J (Joe) <Joe.Griffin@gov.scot>; Hicks C (Clare) <Clare.Hicks@gov.scot>; Bruce A (Andrew) <Andrew.Bruce@gov.scot>; Wilson M (Mick) <Mick.Wilson@gov.scot>; Logan G (Graeme) <Graeme.Logan@gov.scot>; [redacted - s.38 (1)(b)]; Gorman G (Gayle) <Gayle.Gorman@educationscotland.gsi.gov.uk>; Hamilton G (Gillian) <Gillian.Hamilton@educationscotland.gsi.gov.uk>; [redacted - s.38 (1)(b)]; Communications DFM & Education <CommunicationsDFM&Education@gov.scot>; EdS Communications mailbox <Communications@educationscotland.gsi.gov.uk>; PS/Education Scotland <ps/educationscotland@educationscotland.gsi.gov.uk>; [redacted - s.38 (1)(b)]  
**Subject:** RE: OFFICIAL SENSITIVE : ADVICE TO MINISTERS - GLOW – UPDATE ON YAMMER REVIEW

Alan,

Thank you for the update which the DFM has noted.

Can you please keep us updated as this develops.

Kind regards

[redacted - s.38 (1)(b)]

**[redacted - s.38 (1)(b)]** | Deputy Private Secretary to John Swinney MSP, Deputy First Minister and Cabinet Secretary for Education and Skills | The Scottish Government | Web: www.gov.scot | Tel: [redacted - s.38 (1)(b)] | Email: DFMCSE@gov.scot

**From:** Armstrong A (Alan)

**Sent:** 24 August 2018 13:36

**To:** Deputy First Minister and Cabinet Secretary for Education and Skills <DFMCSE@gov.scot>

**Cc:** zzzMinister for Further Education, Higher Education and Science 2016 to 2018 <zzzMinisterFEHES@gov.scot>; Minister for Children and Young People <MinisterCYP@gov.scot>; Minister for Business, Fair Work and Skills <MinisterBFWS@gov.scot>; DG Education, Communities & Justice <DGECJ@gov.scot>; Robertson FMG (Fiona) (Director of Learning) <Fiona.Robertson@gov.scot>; Director for Children and Families <DirectorforChildrenandFamilies@gov.scot>; Director of Advanced Learning and Science <DirectorofAdvancedLearningandScience@gov.scot>; Griffin J (Joe) <Joe.Griffin@gov.scot>; Hicks C (Clare) <Clare.Hicks@gov.scot>; Bruce A (Andrew) <Andrew.Bruce@gov.scot>; Wilson M (Mick) <Mick.Wilson@gov.scot>; Logan G (Graeme) <Graeme.Logan@gov.scot>; [redacted - s.38 (1)(b)]; Gorman G (Gayle) <Gayle.Gorman@educationscotland.gsi.gov.uk>; Hamilton G (Gillian) <Gillian.Hamilton@educationscotland.gsi.gov.uk>; [redacted - s.38 (1)(b)]; Communications DFM & Education <CommunicationsDFM&Education@gov.scot>; EdS Communications mailbox <Communications@educationscotland.gsi.gov.uk>; PS/Education Scotland <ps/educationscotland@educationscotland.gsi.gov.uk>; [redacted - s.38 (1)(b)]

**Subject:** RE: OFFICIAL SENSITIVE : ADVICE TO MINISTERS - GLOW – UPDATE ON YAMMER REVIEW

Thanks Craig

To confirm for DFM that we should have further advice on the safety protocols that would be required for Yammer within the next two weeks. Meantime, schools have access to MS Teams to enable learners to share and collaborate in an environment where only teachers can create teams of users and can then monitor and moderate conversations.

Within our further advice on Yammer and any potential for future use, we will also provide information on the educational benefits of learners sharing and collaborating using IT platforms, together with suggested primary and secondary schools where DFM can see this in action and talk to learners.

Alan

[redacted - duplication of email chain in document 3]

[redacted - duplication of email chain in document 3]

[redacted - duplication of email chain in document 3]

---

---

5

## OFFICIAL-SENSITIVE: ADVICE TO MINISTERS

From: Alan Armstrong  
Education Scotland  
20 August 2018

Deputy First Minister and Cabinet Secretary for Education and Skills

### **GLOW - UPDATE ON YAMMER REVIEW**

#### **Purpose**

1. To provide an update on the Yammer review, including the options being investigated and an indication of possible timescales.

#### **Priority**

2. Routine.

#### **Background**

3. As per previous submissions dated 14 and 20 June, access to Glow Yammer remains suspended for all learners within Glow while Education Scotland undertakes a review.
4. The review focuses on the following areas:
  - consultation with and feedback from local authorities
  - moderation process and safeguarding
  - educational benefits and Yammer usage
  - technical options.

At the end of the review, a full report will be written with recommendations about the use of Yammer with pupils and submitted to the Deputy First Minister for his approval. If the recommendation is to allow access for all pupils or a subset of pupils then Education Scotland will also provide supporting documentation for local authorities.

#### **Current consultation with, and feedback from, local authorities**

5. A letter from Education Scotland was sent to Directors of Education in local authorities on 13 June outlining the Yammer suspension and review process, and requesting information about their local processes for ensuring teacher and parental awareness in the effective and safe use of Yammer. Responses have been received from all the local authorities. Responses ranged from a statement that they do not use Yammer and/or Glow to detailed information on the policies, approaches and support in place for teachers and parents.
6. On Tuesday 14 August 2018, Education Scotland held a workshop with the four local authorities that have the highest Yammer pupil usage ([redacted - s.38 (1)(b)]) to discuss the benefits and challenges of using Yammer and also the possibilities of using Microsoft Teams and other Glow services as an alternative for collaboration. Three of the authorities had been using Yammer mainly for class collaboration, e.g. issuing homework, though one had been using it for pupil to

## OFFICIAL-SENSITIVE: ADVICE TO MINISTERS

pupil collaboration between schools. Two of these authorities have already decided to move away from Yammer and started using Microsoft Teams and the other two are now planning to start using Teams and cease pupil use of Yammer.

7. As a result of the consultation with local authorities, Education Scotland plan to develop wider guidance on how to support Glow for all Glow customers, using the examples of best practice from all the local authority responses. This is likely to include advice on having a clear Acceptable Use Policy (AUP) including specific references to Yammer and Glow which can be available to all parents; promotion of the Glow Report a Concern functionality; support materials on the effective use of Glow with pupils including internet safety best practice; and detailed information for teachers on their responsibilities including support materials on moderation.

### **Moderation process and safeguarding for use of Yammer**

8. There are a number of challenges in moderating the use of Yammer: the inability to restrict posts to the All Company feed which can be viewed by all Yammer users; the ability of users to change profile information which adds complexity in identifying users; the lack of global search to easily find inappropriate content; and the inability to block inappropriate words proactively.

9. The majority of inappropriate content and behaviour in Yammer is generated by secondary age pupils with the exposure to and impact of the risk being of greater concern to primary age pupils. There is currently no way to have separate Yammer networks for primary and secondary schools within Glow, though the option of bringing a subset of pupils back into Yammer is under investigation.

10. The main existing risk mitigations are: the use of Yammer keyword monitoring whereby the Education Scotland Service Management Team receive an email when a Glow user has used an inappropriate word on the keyword monitoring list; the Glow Report a Concern process; and the availability of a complete audit history including both private and public content. The current moderation process has been reviewed and a number of improvements have been identified including expanding the amount of information captured through Report a Concern process and clarifying and emphasising the customer (e.g. local authorities) responsibilities regarding moderation.

11. In addition, to enhance the current monitoring and safeguarding processes, Education Scotland has issued a Prior Information Notice (PIN) on Public Contracts Scotland Portal about a requirement to place a contract with an external service provider for the provision of a Safeguarding product for the whole Glow environment. Such a safeguarding product will be used to monitor and alert on the activity, interaction and behaviour of users within this environment. Responses are expected by Friday 24 August 2018 and should give more information on what is available on the market and indicative costs.

### **Educational benefits and Yammer usage**

12. Yammer provides a platform similar to other social media products but within a closed environment that allows learners to become effective communicators and consumers of online services. Learning can be supported by using Yammer as a

## OFFICIAL-SENSITIVE: ADVICE TO MINISTERS

collaborative working space for posting homework and assignments, group discussions and queries and pupil-lead learning. However, there is a significant amount of 'off topic' conversations between learners not directly related to class-based learning. Some of this activity leads to moderation action being required due to inappropriate content being posted.

13. The usage of Yammer varies across the local authorities:

- thirteen (40%) local authorities have considerable pupil usage of Yammer, with five local authorities having substantial usage;
- eleven (35%) local authorities make moderate use of Yammer for pupils; and
- eight (25%) local authorities have little or no pupil usage of Yammer and therefore will not be greatly affected by the restriction of teachers only accessing Yammer.

14. There are many good examples of where Yammer has been used to great effect, particularly in primary schools, leading up to the transition to secondary school. Some examples have been published on the National Improvement Hub.

15. When Yammer was launched in February 2016 it provided the only option for collaborative group working within the Microsoft product suite. In August 2017 an education version of Microsoft Teams was launched, initially for staff and subsequently pupils. Teams allows conversation within groups and the sharing of resources. Teams have assignment functionality and Class Notebooks allowing teachers to use the product as a highly effective digital learning environment. Microsoft currently recommends using Teams for class and school collaboration for pupils and as stated above a number of local authorities have already started to use Teams.

16. Within Microsoft Teams, pupils cannot create a Team, only teachers can, therefore there will be a teacher in every Team. Keyword monitoring does not currently work with Teams however Education Scotland has made a request to Microsoft that it is implemented for Teams and we await a response. Education Scotland has also configured Teams within Glow to further mitigate the safeguarding risk. This included disabling pupil to pupil private messaging; disabling all 3rd party applications; removing Skype for Business licenses from pupils so they cannot use voice and video calling without supervision; and ensuring local authorities/schools opt-in to the automatic provisioning of Teams. Furthermore, the guidance for Teams will emphasise the responsibility of teachers to moderate the activities of their pupils within their Teams and take the appropriate action if there is inappropriate behaviour.

### Technical options

17. The DLT team is investigating a number of options for learner access to Yammer, considering all key aspects above:

- Option 1 - No Yammer access for all pupils (remains teachers only) and encourage the use of alternative services such as Microsoft Teams, Glow blogs and G Suite (if opted in).
- Option 2 - Yammer access for secondary pupils only.
- Option 3 - Yammer access for primary pupils only.

## OFFICIAL-SENSITIVE: ADVICE TO MINISTERS

- Option 4 - Yammer access for pupils based on specific year groups e.g. P4 - S1.

Note: (Options 2 - 4 would require Glow customers to opt in)

18. There have been in-depth discussions with the two main suppliers - Microsoft, the supplier of Yammer and RM Education who provide Glow O365 tenancy management and therefore manage Yammer on behalf of Education Scotland. With Microsoft, the technical discussion has focussed on the deletion of both content and Personally Identifiable Information (PII) from Yammer. If all pupils, or a subset of pupils are not given access to Yammer again then their content and their Yammer profile which contains Personally Identifiable Information (PII) has to be deleted from Yammer in order to comply with GDPR. With RM Education, the focus has been on how a subset of pupils could be given access to Yammer.

19. Currently, there is no method to programmatically delete tens of thousands of users - there is functionality to delete users manually one-by-one and to delete a whole Yammer network. This has been escalated within Microsoft to the Yammer Product Group and they are considering this requirement as a priority. A response is expected in the coming weeks.

### Conclusion

20. Initially, the preferred option was option 4 above - Yammer access for pupils based on specific year groups e.g. P4 - S1 because this would reduce the risk as the age range of the audience would be reduced. However there is a dependency on a response from Microsoft (as at paragraph 19) before this option could be implemented, so there will be no Yammer access for pupils when schools return. Schools will look for alternative tools. Therefore the current arrangement will continue whereby:

- Yammer access is restricted to teachers and staff accounts only; and
- encouragement to local authorities to use alternative Glow services such as Microsoft Teams, Glow blogs and G Suite (if opted in) for pupil collaboration.

21. The completion of the Yammer review is dependent on the response from Microsoft and therefore recommendations cannot be made to DFM at this time regarding learner access to Yammer. As schools are returning this week, communications will be issued to update them on the current position. Microsoft Teams for Education was launched in July 2017 and is already being used as an alternative to Yammer.

### Next steps

22. Issue communications to Glow Key Contacts and Directors of Education indicating that the current arrangements whereby Yammer access is restricted to teachers' and staff accounts will remain in place and encouraging local authorities to use alternative Glow services such as Microsoft Teams, Glow blogs and G Suite (if opted in) for pupil collaboration. **By 20 August.**

**OFFICIAL-SENSITIVE: ADVICE TO MINISTERS**

23. Develop guidance for the use of Microsoft Teams, Glow Blogs and G Suite with pupils as an alternative to Yammer, and clarify and emphasise teachers' responsibilities with regards to moderation in Glow. **Shared between 20 and 31 August.**

24. Implement the identified improvements to the current moderation and Report a Concern process. **By 17 August.**

25. Complete review and make final recommendation to DFM for student access to Yammer. **By end-September** (dependent on Microsoft response).

**Recommendation**

26. The Deputy First Minister is invited to consider the update and agree the next steps that ensure learners will have access to a safe platform for class and school collaboration from the start of the new session.

**Alan Armstrong**  
**Strategic Director**  
Education Scotland  
Ext [redacted]

20 August 2018

**OFFICIAL-SENSITIVE: ADVICE TO MINISTERS**

Copy List:	For Action	For Comments	For Information		
			Portfolio Interest	Constit Interest	General Awareness
Minister for Further, Higher Education and Science					X
Minister for Children and Young People					X
Minister for Business, Fair Work and Skills					X

DG Education, Communities and Justice  
 Fiona Robertson  
 Director for Children and Families  
 Director of Advanced Learning and Science  
 Joe Griffin, Director of Early Learning and Childcare  
 Clare Hicks  
 Andrew Bruce  
 Mick Wilson  
 Graeme Logan  
 [redacted - s.38 (1)(b)]  
 Gayle Gorman  
 Gillian Hamilton  
 [redacted - s.38 (1)(b)]  
 Communications DFM & Education  
 EdS Communications  
 PS/Education Scotland

6

«PROTECTIVE MARKING»

From: Alan Armstrong  
Education Scotland  
10 September 2018

Deputy First Minister and Cabinet Secretary for Education and Skills

**YAMMER REVIEW AND NEXT STEPS**

**Purpose**

1. To:
  - inform the Deputy First Minister of the outcome of the Yammer Review; and
  - recommend next steps.

**Priority**

2. Routine

**Background**

3. Yammer is a private social network which is available through Glow. After technical consideration and engagement with stakeholders through our Technical and Operational Advisory Group, the service was made available to all Glow users in February 2016.
4. External users and networks (i.e. non-Glow users) were disabled, so leaving the Glow Yammer as a closed network.
5. At that point in 2016 there were no alternative products within Glow which allowed this type of collaborative working.
6. A 2-year review of the Yammer service was planned for the first half of 2018. However, given the number of Yammer users (c.70k at that point) the decision was taken to delay the review until summer 2018 when schools would be closed for the holidays.
7. However, after a series of concerns were raised by a parent about inappropriate content in Yammer over May and June 2018, a further decision was taken to suspend access to the service in June 2018 whilst the review was undertaken. There has been regular negative press (Courier) about Yammer across the summer.
8. Issues relate primarily to age-inappropriate content for children and a subsequent decision was taken to restore access to Yammer for staff from the start of July. Yammer access for pupil users remains suspended. Teachers continue to have access for their collaborative work in developing learning and teaching and for their professional learning activities.

## Review

9. The review of Yammer commenced immediately after the service was suspended in June. It set out to:

- evaluate the use of Yammer as a tool for teaching and learning
- consider developments elsewhere within the O365 product offering which did not exist at Yammer launch e.g. Microsoft Teams
- review the data controls, moderation and technical details of Yammer, as well as the processes that are in place in local authorities and Education Scotland; and
- produce recommendations for the use of Yammer within Glow.

The current draft of the full review document is attached at Annex A for your consideration.

## Responsibilities

10. Respective responsibilities with regard to the use of Glow are captured in the legally binding Glow Agreement, which was developed in partnership with local authorities via SOLAR. It has been signed by Education Scotland (on behalf of Ministers) and all local authorities. The vast majority of Glow Customers are local authorities.

11. The Glow Agreement is clear that:

- Glow customers are the Data Controller (for all data produced by their users and establishments);
- The Customer is the data controller and the Service Provider (Education Scotland) is the processor meaning the Customer is responsible for assuring themselves that data provided by them is held/processed in accordance with legislation and good practice guidelines;
- The Customer is responsible for its own access to and use of the Glow Service;
- The Customer is responsible for ensuring local use is in adherence to the Glow Service Community Rules and any other guidance issued by the provider;
- The Customer is responsible for maintaining an adequate system of supervision, including control, operation and moderation of users of the Glow Service; and
- The Service Provider excludes any and all liability in respect of any loss, damage, offense, harm or otherwise which may arise in connection with content within the Glow Service which has not been produced and uploaded by the Service Provider.

12. At the point at which the Yammer service was suspended, The Chief Executive of Education Scotland wrote to all Glow Customers noting that they should remind teachers of their responsibilities in relation to use of Yammer; and seeking assurances about local processes for ensuring teacher and parental awareness in the effective use of Yammer.

13. From the responses obtained, it is clear that in a small number of local authorities, robust processes are in place. However, on the whole, we are not assured that local processes are sufficient, particularly in terms of moderation of content and adherence to the Glow Service Community Rules.

## Moderation and Safeguarding within Glow

### Report a Concern

14. Each service within Glow contains a 'Report a Concern' button. Any Glow user can use this feature to report a concern about content or behaviour they deem to be inappropriate. Concerns will then be followed up by Education Scotland, and if necessary, the relevant local authority.

15. This table show concerns reported in the 6 months to May 2018:

Dates	Dec-17	Jan-18	Feb-18	Mar-18	Apr-18	May-18
RAGC Requiring Action	19	9	14	24	7	20
RAGC NOT Requiring Action	2	3	2	0	7	4
<b>TOTAL Report a Concern Received</b>	<b>21</b>	<b>12</b>	<b>16</b>	<b>24</b>	<b>14</b>	<b>24</b>

### Keyword Monitoring

16. A list of regular expression key words are flagged for monitoring. Use of these words in any post will result in the post being flagged to Education Scotland by email, but does not prevent the content being posted. The word list is reviewed regularly and contains words that are offensive, racist or indicate a possible safeguarding concern e.g. self-harm, suicide or radicalisation. Management of the list is a manual process and not supplemented by any external feeds.

17. There is a high likelihood that posts are flagged as false positives. For example, a keyword trigger for "suicide" may flag posts relating to Romeo and Juliet. Although common variants are included within the keyword monitoring list, there is the possibility that letter substitution may be used to avoid content being flagged.

18. The table shows Yammer keyword alerts received in the 6 months to May 2018:

Dates	Dec-17	Jan-18	Feb-18	Mar-18	Apr-18	May-18
Yammer Alerts Requiring Action	13	28	43	38	27	51
Yammer Alerts NOT Requiring Action	128	143	153	256	181	280
<b>TOTAL Yammer Alerts Received</b>	<b>141</b>	<b>171</b>	<b>196</b>	<b>294</b>	<b>208</b>	<b>331</b>

### Moderation

19. Although there is no obligation in the Glow Agreement to do so, reactive moderation of posts is carried out by Education Scotland in response to alerts from keyword monitoring or 'report a concern'. These are responded to during office hours Monday to Friday and during office hours during weekends by a nominated on call staff member. There is no evening on-call provision. This work is carried out by the Glow Service Management Team at Education Scotland alongside their other duties.

20. There are currently no tools available within Yammer to moderate images or files for inappropriate content.

## «PROTECTIVE MARKING»

21. Through 'Protected Content Mode' Education Scotland administrators are able to view all reported content whether it is posted in public or private groups or in private messages. However they cannot search through all private content and must be directed to specific posts from a report or alert.

### Challenges

22. By default, Yammer includes an 'All Company' group. Any Glow user can post to this group and posts are visible to all users. There is currently no functionality to restrict who can post or view 'All Company'. This increases the risk that inappropriate content will be posted and viewed by a wide user base.

23. There is no way to restrict group creation to a particular user group, meaning that pupils are able to create their own groups with no adult present.

24. Only Education Scotland staff are enabled as Verified Network Admins which allows access to private content mode and visibility of material posted in private conversations and groups. Given the nature of the tenancy it would be difficult to devolve this role to LA level.

### Moderation Improvements for Glow

25. It is recommended that future moderation within Glow should:

- Capture and record evidence of the inappropriate content
- Immediately delete or quarantine inappropriate content – including any images which must be deleted separately to message content
- Log appropriate user information including Yammer ID, Glow e-mail address, name (as per Office 365, not Yammer), establishment
- If a user is to be suspended the date should be recorded and the status reviewed within 90 days.
- If the user is to be deleted previous messages and user data should also be deleted.

26. This level of reactive moderation is possible within the current Glow provision, albeit with significant human input. More effective and proactive moderation (i.e. stopping inappropriate content being published in the first place) would require the deployment of the additional technologies outlined in paragraphs 47-50 below.

### **User Figures for Yammer**

27. In May 2018 Yammer had 69 919 registered users. There has been a steady growth since adoption of on average 5000 users per month. This is against an MS Office 365 Tenancy enabled user count of 934 203 – a 7.5% adoption rate

28. Although users may have a current Yammer account, only 20% of Yammer users were active in May 2018, and the level of engagement within Yammer has remained largely consistent in the past year with on average 10 000 users active each month.

### **Educational Benefits of learners collaborating online**

28. Deputy First Minister requested further advice on what educational purpose is achieved by learners' access to online collaboration tools and what is the best technological method of achieving these aims. Annex B sets out advice on the benefits of learners collaborating through on line platforms. The recommendations at the end of this submission provide advice on the most suitable technology platform for this within Glow.

### **Yammer platform for learner collaboration**

29. Yammer provides students with the ability to post work within an online community to within either teacher-led or student-created groups. This provides a platform similar to other social media products but within the closed Glow environment allowing students to become effective communicators and consumers of online products. Learning can also be supported by using Yammer as a collaborative working space for posting homework and assignments, group discussions and queries and pupil lead learning.

30. Yammer provides a national collaborative platform for staff to engage with colleagues across Scotland. Yammer groups have been created which support the National Improvement Framework (NIF), Professional Learning Communities (PLCs) and provide support for Continuing Professional Learning and Development (CPLD).

31. Groups have been setup around technology e.g. O365 Teams, O365 Forms to allow for peer to peer support, product feature updates and access to resources. Use has been made of groups to consult with Glow users and to test new features and functionality to improve the services available.

32. Although there are no other Glow products with identical functionality to Yammer, there are alternatives which can provide a similar user experience but with more control, such as Microsoft Teams.

### **Alternative platforms for learner collaboration – Microsoft Teams**

#### Background

33. MS Teams was launched in July 2017 and allows public conversation within a group environment and the sharing of resources.

34. In addition to the default Teams format, Teams can be created (within educational tenancies such as Glow) with specific structures to help support Classes, Professional Learning Communities and Staff Members. Class Teams (i.e. those teams set up to support a specific school class) have Assignment functionality and Class Notebooks allowing teachers to use the product as a highly effective digital learning environment.

35. Class Teams are always set as private, however all other types of Teams can be set as public or private. Private Teams can only be joined if a user is added by a Team owner and only members of a Team can view content or contribute to it.

### School Data Sync

36. Class Teams may be automatically created and membership established using data provided by SEEMiS (SEEMiS is the primary source of personal information for the purposes of account creation in Glow). This is available at an opt-in at school level. There are currently over 100 schools in Scotland using School Data Sync to create Class Teams.

### Join Codes

37. Introduced in summer 2018, join codes give Team owners the ability to generate a code to be published to allow users to join any Team. This simplifies Team management as a code could be issued to a class to allow them to self-join a team. The code can be reset to prevent use beyond its required lifecycle.

### Safeguarding and Moderation

38. Only staff members within Glow may create a Team. It is, however, possible for a staff member to leave an existing Team, leaving only students within the Team. Education Scotland guidance on the use of Teams encourages the inclusion of a second teacher as a mitigation. Private chat for students is disabled.

39. There is an expectation that school staff should monitor student usage within their own Teams. There is no global monitoring possible although full audit logs are maintained and could be used retrospectively for investigation.

## **Yammer Access Options**

### Staff Access to Yammer

40. Yammer provides a valuable resource for national peer to peer collaborations amongst staff users of Glow. The risks around inappropriate use and content are significantly reduced within a professional community. There is no service available within Glow that offers a similar open dialogue platform and sharing of resources and information. Private groups allow closed working environments. Although Teams can reproduce the some elements of this in a more feature rich environment, Yammer allows open access to information and easy searching that Teams does not currently support.

### Student Access

41. Given developments in the product offering in Glow with Office 365 and G Suite there are now alternatives to Yammer for students which may offer a more suitable environment for learning and teaching, due to the limited technical controls available within Yammer.

#### Option A Enable Student Access for Yammer

42. Local authority feedback on Yammer has been considered and it is recommended that if Yammer is offered to students it should be on an opt-in basis by Glow parent establishment – for the vast majority of Glow users this would be the local authority. This would allow Glow customers to ensure they have appropriate guidance and procedures in place for introducing Yammer to their students.

43. The options for student access are:

- Option 1 – Yammer access for Secondary pupils
- Option 2 – Yammer access for Primary pupils
- Option 3 – Yammer access for pupils based on specific year groups

44. Education Scotland have considered all options for feasibility and whether technically achievable. For technical and cost reasons a mix of these options across local authorities is not possible. Options 1, 2 and 3 are all technically possible and indicative costs obtained. Option 3 is viewed to be the most flexible.

#### Option B No Yammer Access for Students

45. Although Yammer provides a platform for successful collaborative working and an introduction to online tools similar to public social networks it is recognised that inappropriate content may be posted and exposed to a wide subset of Yammer users. It is not possible to fully mitigate this risk.

46. Similar functionality can be delivered through MS Teams which also provides more control.

#### Advice on continuation of Yammer

46. Considering the points and inherent risks for learners above, Education Scotland advice is that Yammer access is not re-instated for learners. However, staff should remain able to access the service, given the advantages for their own work and collaborating with other professionals. We advise that MS Teams is promoted as a suitable, safe alternative for pupils

#### **Further Safeguarding work**

47. Education Scotland are currently seeking to procure a product that enhances our current safeguarding controls. The product will integrate with the Glow environment and will consist of the following capabilities:

- live key word searches;
- image recognition;
- alerting; and
- qualified human monitoring capabilities.

## «PROTECTIVE MARKING»

48. This tool would enable us to focus on the 'bad' behaviours and the 'sad' behaviours as we would be able to identify and react to self-harm/suicide/pro-anorexia type tendencies, potentially allowing early intervention with the individuals concerned.

49. Furthermore Education Scotland are seeking to capitalise on the fact that we have Microsoft's largest single tenancy in Europe, resulting in potentially the largest single source of data relating to online child interaction in Europe. As such we are investigating partnering with universities and organisations to create a bespoke product for Glow that combines the capabilities listed above with the following:

- Deep Learning;
- Natural Language Processing;
- Artificial Intelligence; and
- Behavioural analysis.

50. Whilst this option will be approx. two years in the making it will ultimately enable us to highlight/predict behaviours such as potential self-harm/bullying/pro-anorexia based on previous interactions at an earlier stage.

### **Handling/Presentation**

51. Given the press and opposition scrutiny around Yammer and concerns raised by parents, we suggest that we proactively publish the Yammer Review document.

52. Should the recommendation be approved, Education Scotland will publish a suite of supporting documentation, guidance and promotional materials which are being developed for use of Yammer and MS Teams as an alternative. These will include:

- A layman's version of the Yammer Review for parents, teachers and pupils, setting out why Yammer will not be re-instated for pupils;
- Support materials for teachers and pupils to ensure the safe and effective use of MS Teams, including text and video guides;
- A series of presentations from Education Scotland; and
- Potential events with senior leaders from local authorities to highlight the overall benefits delivered through Glow and ensure greater understanding and buy-in for their responsibilities under the Glow Agreement

### **Recommendation**

53. Based on the information provided above, it is recommended that:

- Yammer access is not re-instated for learners but staff remain able to access the service;
- MS Teams is promoted as a suitable, safer alternative for pupils;
- Education Scotland continue to explore the options for further safeguarding products;
- Education Scotland proactively publish the Yammer review; and
- Education Scotland provide support materials for teachers and pupils to ensure the effective use of MS Teams; and engagement with local authorities on the benefits of Glow and local responsibilities for Glow use.

«PROTECTIVE MARKING»

54. Education Scotland officials would be happy to have a face-to-face meeting with the Deputy First Minister to discuss further, if that is required.

**Alan Armstrong**  
**Strategic Director**  
Education Scotland  
Ext [redacted - s.38  
(1)(b)]

10 September 2018

**«PROTECTIVE MARKING»**

Copy List:	For Action	For Comments	For Information		
			Portfolio Interest	Constit Interest	General Awareness
Minister for Further, Higher Education and Science					X
Minister for Children and Young People					X
Minister for Business, Fair Work and Skills					X

DG Education, Communities and Justice  
 Fiona Robertson  
 Director for Children and Families  
 Director of Advanced Learning and Science  
 Joe Griffin, Director of Early Learning and Childcare  
 Clare Hicks  
 Andrew Bruce  
 Z^a&c^a^E^H^A^D^a  
 Gaye Gorman  
 Gilian Hamiton  
 Colin McAlister  
 [redacted - s.38 (1)(b)]  
 Communications DFM & Education  
 EdS Communications  
 PS/Education Scotland

«Officials Only»

«text»

**ANNEX A**

**DRAFT TECHNICAL REVIEW**

Attached separately

## ANNEX B

### Further advice on the benefits for learners from access to Online Collaboration tools

Collaboration with others online is the action of working with someone to discuss, develop and produce something like a document, presentation, spreadsheet of data or a rich media project using video and photographs. Collaboration is a sought-after skill for learning, life and work.

Glow gives users access to Microsoft Office 365 and G Suite tools that can be used for collaborating anytime and anywhere learners have an internet connection. As well as supporting learning and teaching these facilities enable teachers to set up, manage and moderate learners' activities in these online spaces.

#### Benefits to learning through online collaboration

**Pupil Voice:** Every learner can have a voice to express themselves, can contribute to online discussions, ask questions and offer peer support.

**Real time multi user editing:** Learners can collaborate on documents at the same time and see each other's changes happening in real time. These changes are also saved automatically as the user types. This allows users the ability to quickly create, share and edit documents with all changes saving in real time. Therefore, no requirement for email documents, saving changes and then emailing back.

**Feedback:** when a document is uploaded or shared in a collaborative space online there are opportunities for teacher and peer feedback. This can happen live via chat if the users have the document open at the same time. Alternatively, comments can be inserted later and responded to.

**Supporting all Learners:** All learners can collaborate online with access to built-in accessibility tools where teachers or learners themselves can customise the content to match individuals' needs and requirements – for example increasing the line spacing to prevent visual crowding; having the text read out loud; highlighting nouns, verbs and adjectives; changing the background page colour; and accessing the picture dictionary by clicking on a word they do not understand.

**Learning to work in the Social Media environment:** Newsfeeds and conversation areas on Glow look like a Blog or Facebook interface. This creates an ideal secure environment for children and young people to learn about Social Media. Teachers and learners can have discussions around online responsible use and online etiquette.

**Beyond the Classroom Walls:** Learning and collaboration can happen across Scotland, with all learners and educators having access to a Glow account. This opens up opportunities for joint projects between learners, classes and schools. For example, online collaboration can help learners undertake joint studies of local areas with learners in different parts of Scotland or beyond; sharing the results of investigations e.g. in science or STEM activities; and undertaking transition projects e.g. between primary and secondary schools.

## **Practical examples of Glow being used for collaboration**

### Kirkton of Largo Primary School

The school has achieved the:

- Scottish Education Awards 2017 – Learning Through Technology Award
- Digital Schools Award Scotland

The collaborative spaces within Glow have played an important role in the digital learning journey at Kirkton of Largo Primary School. These spaces have benefited staff and learners alike. Staff have been able to share resources easily, facilitate professional learning and collaborate with colleagues across the cluster without leaving the school. Learners have been able to collaborate on documents and share their learning. During an Enterprise project, they used Microsoft Teams to set tasks for their groups, share ideas and keep track of capital, sales and profit. The tools for collaboration in Glow are helping to develop their skills for life and work.

### Queen Anne High School

Microsoft Teams for a class includes a OneNote class notebook. It also has an area for files and conversations. This opens up discussion and has enabled senior pupils to discuss homework questions and help each other. The ability for senior pupils to discuss their learning as well as show it in OneNote or in the files area has added another dimension to lessons and tasks, whether they are in the classroom or not. Senior pupils found it useful, especially during extended periods of absence and during the 'snow days' last year when the school was closed. Learning continued. Pupils uploaded their work and teachers could give feedback so improvements could be made to a task.

### Other schools making good use of Glow for Collaboration and possibly worth visiting:

St Mungos High School - Microsoft Showcase School  
Mintlaw Academy

## **Current guidance for teachers on using online collaboration spaces in Glow**

Guidance has been made available on [Glow Connect](#) to provide educators with advice and support on the use of Glow tools to set up online collaboration spaces for learners as an alternative to Yammer. As well as providing an overview of how these tools can support learning and teaching it outlines the ability for teachers to set up, manage and moderate activity in these online spaces.

Examples of this guidance are outlined below (links have been removed from this section but are available on Glow Connect):

### Why would I use Teams?

Class Teams provides a collaborative space to help distribute tasks and resources to pupils. Pupils can then update and return these materials or upload other evidence of

learning to share with their teacher or fellow pupils. Teachers have a collated view of this evidence and can provide formative feedback from a single point.

Class Teams provide a Conversations area to support learning and a Files section to share materials. They also come with a OneNote Class notebook and the ability to add additional content.

Creating a Class Team; how teachers can create a Class Team for groups to collaborate on projects.

Class Team membership; how to add students and teachers to the team and monitor the membership and provide student access.

Managing a Class Team; guidance on customising a number of permission settings for students, including the ability to post messages and comment (or to mute these for learners at times when the teacher is not available to moderate) and setting up notifications to get alerts for activity (or to switch them off).

Hints and Tips; recommendations for staff when setting up, managing and monitoring activity within a Class Team.

#### Features of Teams in Glow

- Teachers **can** create Teams; pupils **cannot**
- Teachers **can** search for other users and engage in private messaging with other staff; pupils **cannot** search or private message
- Teachers **can** schedule or initiate ad-hoc web conferences; pupils cannot. Pupils can take part using the desktop or mobile app in meetings scheduled by teachers
- Teachers **can** edit and delete their own messages and delete messages in Teams they own; pupils **can only** edit or delete messages they create (this setting can be changed)
- Teachers **are** owners/admin of all Teams they create or are created via School Data Sync. Some guidance on moderation is outlined in the Hints & Tips section below.

#### Hints and Tips for managing Teams in Glow

- Add more than one staff member or a co-teacher to the team to ensure continuity if someone is off or leaves and other staff want to maintain ownership and change the settings in a team.
- You can provide read only access to files in Class Teams if you want to share files with pupils but don't want them to be able to edit those files.
- You can create a link to a Team or generate a Join Code to let them join directly without having to deal with join requests.
- Pupils can use the Join Code to become a member of a team. If you use a join code it's recommended you monitor the membership of the team to ensure only intended users join, and to reset the code regularly or remove the code when it's no longer required.

- Teachers are responsible for moderating content within the teams they own including dealing with any inappropriate posts by their pupils. You should always follow guidance about internet safety provided by your school or local authority in line with their acceptable use policy. See the [Glow Community Rules](#) for more information.
- Use the [Mute students](#) option if you want to stop pupil/s from posting or replying in the conversations area. This can be useful if you want to set up a team but are not ready for pupils to post to the conversations area.
- Pupil to pupil private messaging is [not enabled](#) in Class Teams in Glow.
- The general conversations stream can be used for a class to send messages that are visible to everyone in the Team (see Members Permission in [Managing a Class Team](#) to change these settings)
- Individual conversations and [conversation threads](#) can be deleted from the Team. It may be useful to take a screen shot as evidence of a conversation before deletion.
- Remember that the [Report a concern](#) function, available on all Glow core services, allows users to submit details of any concerns they have about content or activity in Glow
- Use [Immersive Reader](#) in Teams conversations. Click on the three dots ... next to a conversation and select Immersive Reader to provide the ability to have content read aloud, adjust text size and colour.
- You can [Archive](#) a team when it's no longer active. The conversations and files in the team become read-only once you archive it. All of the team activity will then be frozen and no one will be able to start new conversations or reply to posts in a channel.