

FERRY MEETINGS SINCE MR WHEELHOUSE TOOK OWNERSHIP AS FERRIES MINISTER

DATE	VENUE	PURPOSE OF MEETING	ATTENDEES
Wednesday 1 August 2018 14:00hrs	St Andrew's House	Introduction to David McGibbon, Non-Executive Chariman, Caledonian MacBrayne	Frances Pacitti, Director, Aviation, Maritime, Freight and Canals [Redacted]
Wednesday 1 August 13:00hrs	St Andrew's House	Introductory Call with Cllr Davidson (Highland Council) which included a discussion on ferries.	[Redacted]
Tuesday, 7 August 2018 12:30hrs	Harbour Offices, Wester Isles	Visit and meeting with Stornoway Port Authority to discuss development of Harbour	SG Location Director
Wednesday, 8 August 2018 14:15hrs	Comhairle nan Eilean Siar at Council Headquarters, Stornoway	Introductory meeting with Council leader, Cllr Roddy Mackay and Officers which included a discussion on ferries	SG Location Director
Tuesday, 28 th August 2018 14:00hrs	St Andrew's House	Introductory Call with Cllr Morton (Arygll & Bute Council) which included a discussion on ferries	[Redacted]
Wednesday, 29 th August 2018 14:30hrs	St Andrew's House	Introductory Call with Cllr Cullinane (North Ayrshire Council) which included a discussion on ferries	[Redacted]
Thursday 30 August 2018 12:00hrs	St Andrew's House	Meeting with Danish Parliament's Committee for Rural Affairs and the Islands	[Redacted]
Wednesday 19 September 2018 15:10hrs	Parliament	Detailed Briefing on Ferries Services with Officials from the Ferries Unit	Frances Pacitti, Director, Aviation, Maritime, Freight and Canals

			[Redacted]
Tuesday 25 September 2018 10:00hrs	Parliament	Meeting with Councillor Robertson regarding transportation in the Western Isles with a focus on Ferry issues.	Frances Pacitti, Director, Aviation, Maritime, Freight and Canals [Redacted]
Thursday 27 September 2018 10:00hrs	Parliament	Meeting with representatives of Arran and Islay Ferry Committee and Constituency members of the Scottish Parliament to discuss current Ferry Problems on Arran and Islay	Michael Russell MSP [Redacted] – support to Michael Russell MSP Kenny Gibson MSP [Redacted] – representative of Islay Ferry Committee [Redacted] – representative of Islay Ferry Committee [Redacted] – representative of Islay Ferry Committee [Redacted] – representative of Arran Ferry Committee [Redacted] – representative of Arran Ferry Committee Frances Pacitti, Director, Aviation, Maritime, Freight and Canals [Redacted] – SG Official
Wednesday 3 October 2018 10:15hrs	Parliament	Meeting with Chair and Chief Executive of Highlands and Islands Enterprise, Professor Lorne Crerar and Charlotte Wright (2018/0025801) including discussion on ferries issues.	[Redacted] Charlotte Wright
Wednesday 3 October 2018 14:00hrs	Parliament	Meeting with Ferries unit officials to discuss Ferry Fares Review	[Redacted]
Wednesday 3 October 2018 15:00hrs	Parliament	Meeting with Officials to discuss Expert Ferry Group and wider engagement with Ferry Committees.	Frances Pacitti, Director, Aviation, Maritime, Freight and Canals [Redacted]

Wednesday 24 October 2018 10:00hrs	Parliament	Meeting Chair of CalMac Community Board (2018/0026045)	[Redacted]
Thursday 25 October 2018 10:00hrs	St Andrew's House	Islands Transport Forum	[Redacted] Shetland Islands Council Orkney Islands Council CnES Argyll & Bute Council Highland Council North Ayrshire Council HITRANS ZETRANS
Thursday 25 October 2018 15:30hrs	Parliament	Monthly Ferries meeting with officials	Frances Pacitti, Director, Aviation, Maritime, Freight and Canals [Redacted]

[Redacted]

From: [Redacted] Date: Saturday, 22 September 2018 at 10:10 To: "Russell MW (Michael), MSP" <Michael.Russell.msp@parliament.scot<mailto:Michael.Russell.msp@parliament.scot>, "com [Redacted]

Subject: Woken up to another three cancellations this morning all due to Calmac how much more can we all take?

THIS IS A HOTEL COLLECT BOOKING - THE CUSTOMER HAS NOT BEEN CHARGED BY EXPEDIA.

[Redacted]

THIS IS A BOOKING FROM EXPEDIA. THE CUSTOMER WILL MANAGE THIS BOOKING THROUGH THEIR SYSTEM. ALL DETAILS ARE AS OF TIME OF BOOKING. ANY MODIFICATIONS MADE ON FREETOBOOK WILL NOT BE SHOWN.

Customer Requests: 1 King Bed. Non-smoking room required.
Cancellation Details: [image removed by sender.] 1 x DOUBLE ROOM, COURTYARD

VIEW - BREAKFAST INCLUDED CANCELLED Arrive 29 Sep 2018 for 3 nights Guests: 2 adults Names: None entered £0.00
Total Cancellation Charge: £0.00

Powered by [image removed by sender. fretobook]

THIS IS A HOTEL COLLECT BOOKING - THE CUSTOMER HAS NOT BEEN CHARGED BY EXPEDIA.

[Redacted]

Customer Requests: 1 King Bed. Non-smoking room required.
Cancellation Details: [image removed by sender.] 1 x DOUBLE ROOM, COURTYARD
VIEW - BREAKFAST INCLUDED CANCELLED Arrive 23 Sep 2018 for 1 night Guests: 2 adults Names: None entered £190.00
Total Cancellation Charge: £190.00
Powered by [image removed by sender. fretobook]
Begin forwarded message:

[Redacted]

THIS IS AN EXPEDIA COLLECT BOOKING - EXPEDIA HAVE TAKEN PAYMENT FROM THE CUSTOMER.

[Redacted]

THIS IS A BOOKING FROM EXPEDIA. THE CUSTOMER WILL MANAGE THIS BOOKING THROUGH THEIR SYSTEM. ALL DETAILS ARE AS OF TIME OF BOOKING. ANY MODIFICATIONS MADE ON FREETOBOOK WILL NOT BE SHOWN.
Customer Requests: 1 King Bed. Non-smoking room required.

Cancellation Details: [mage removed by sender.] 1 x DOUBLE ROOM, SEA VIEW - BREAKFAST INCLUDED - CANCELLED Arrive 22 Sep 2018 for 1 night Guests: 1 adult Names: None entered
Powered by [mage removed by sender. freetobook]

From: [Redacted] Sent: 01 October 2018 15:45:44 To: Public Engagement Unit Subject: MACCS

Attachments: u441999_01-10-2018_15-43-07.pdf

AO - [Redacted]

Hi

For MACCS Please- MR

Thanks [Redacted]

[Redacted]

From: [Redacted] Sent: 14 September 2018 10:09:52 To: Scottish Ministers Cc: [Redacted], Cllr. Roddy MacKay Uist, alasdair.allan.msp@scottish.parliament.uk, [Redacted]

Subject: Ferries Disruption, Uists

AO [Redacted]

Fao Paul Wheelhouse, MSP, Minister for Energy, Connectivity and the Islands, and Michael Matheson, MSP, Cabinet Secretary for Transport, Infrastructure and Connectivity.

Good morning Minister and Cabinet Secretary

I am writing to you as the Clerk, Benbecula Community Council, on the above subject which was discussed at our last meeting on the 6th September. I am also aware that this issue was raised recently in Holyrood at FMQ's, and that you are well briefed about concerns of all ferry users - foot passengers, private vehicles and commercial users.

We have now experienced serious disruption to scheduled timetable sailings on two recent occasions, on the Lochmaddy/Uig/Tarbert crossings and also the Lochboisdale/Mallaig Service in particular. These were occasioned by breakdowns to existing, aged, ferries (MV Clansman and MV Hebrides), with no suitable back-up ferry available to cope with capacity demands, at peak tourist period in our calendar. The consequences to Island businesses has been catastrophic. Benbecula Community Council has requested that I raise the following concerns with you:

1. Tourists planning an islands' holiday have cancelled planned bookings to hotels and guest houses, these operators losing much needed revenue during peak season, in a short tourist season;

2. Temporary sailings put in place have had insufficient capacity and connectivity for onward journeys for foot passengers not joined up in any meaningful way;
3. Lorry drivers were given instructions to drive to different departure mainland terminals (to Armadale), and on arrival found that the ferry had departed;
4. Live seafood delivery to the mainland has been seriously jeopardised, with possible loss of contracts;
5. Sailings from Lochboisdale to Mallaig were cancelled for nearly two weeks on first disruption when the MV Clansman was taken to dry dock for repair (propeller damaged);
6. Replacement ferries delay ... it seems almost beyond belief that the delivery dates for two new ferries have been put back by at least two years. The yard commissioned to build, Ferguson's of Greenock, are blaming lack of detailed specification at time of order for the contract being submitted;
7. The First Minister's response, that over £1bn has been allocated to ferry subsidy and new build ferries, and the introduction of RET, is acknowledged with thanks, but this does not detract from present-day difficulties and significant disruptions, with such disastrous consequences for so many ferry users. The knock on effect, particularly for tourism and contractual business has yet to be calculated;
8. Ferry connectivity to the mainland is categorised as a 'Lifeline Service', with so many islanders dependent on these links. This assurance may soon require revision in light of recent experiences.
9. It is the view of many island ferry users groups and businesses that some urgency should be given to acquiring/leasing a temporary replacement ferry, until such time as the new ferry is delivered to operate on the Uig triangular route. Perhaps also this triangular route should receive priority for delivery of the first new ferry, as the Ardrossan/Brodick (Isle of Arran), crossing is not so critical in terms of securing alternative ferry replacement cover. New infrastructure is already in place at Brodick. I look forward to receiving an early response from you to the above points. Benbecula Community Council meets again on the 11th October.

(copied also to our MSP Alastair Allan and Ward 2 Councillors)

Regards [Redacted], Benbecula Community Council

Sent from my iPad [Redacted]

From: [Redacted]

Sent: 03 September 2018 15:40:15

To: Public Engagement Unit

Cc: Minister for Energy, Connectivity and the Islands

Subject: FW: Argyll & Bute Ferry Services

Please place on MACCS for a ministerial response,

Thanks

[Redacted]

Deputy Private Secretary

Cabinet Secretary for Transport, Infrastructure and Connectivity
[Redacted]

From: Michael Russell [mailto:feorlean@mac.com]
Sent: 03 September 2018 14:52
To: Minister for Energy, Connectivity and the Islands <MinisterECI@gov.scot>
Cc: [Redacted]

Subject: Argyll & Bute Ferry Services

Dear Paul

During my recent quarterly meeting with [Redacted], the Chief Executive of Argyll & Bute Council, we touched on the issue of the ferry services still operated by Argyll & Bute Council.

[Redacted] rightly pointed out that the policy of the Scottish Government remains to absorb all such services into a single national ferry operator and I would be keen to know when that will take place with regard to the Argyll & Bute services and what process will be followed to ensure a seamless transfer to Cal Mac.

Clearly at a time of pressure on public finances this would have to be done in a prudent and careful way, but [Redacted] also rightly pointed out the extra help to Orkney islands Council in the 2018 budget for ferries and the fact that no such help has been offered to Argyll & Bute Council which does sustain a number of lifeline routes. I look forward to hearing from you regarding this matter.

Yours aye

Michael

From: [Redacted]
Sent: 27 August 2018 20:11:33
To: scottish.ministers@gov.scot, info@transport.gov.scot
Subject: Cumbrae Ferry Committee formal response to Calmac Impact statement on Cumbrae Route requests

Attachments: (Attach 1) Largs-Cumbrae Summer 2019 Calmac Impact Assessment.pdf,
(Attach 2) CFC formal response to Calmac Summer 2019 Impact Assessment.pdf

Dear Mr Wheelhouse, Mr Matheson and Mr Nicholls

Let me introduce myself, my name is [Redacted] and I am the current chair of the Cumbrae Ferry Committee.

As you may be aware, Cumbrae have been requesting a minimal timetable addition / changes for some time. We understand that Calmac have now submitted the assessment (attachment 1) for Summer 2019 and we would like to submit our formal

response (attachment 2) to this assessment, as we believe some of the information provided to be lacking in detail and misleading.

We respectfully request that our response to the assessment is reviewed in line with the Calmac assessment and should a negative decision be reached, the details and impact of this decision be confirmed in writing, as per the recent Islands Bill legislation, to the Cumbrae Ferry Committee. We would appreciate if you could acknowledge receipt of this email by return. If you would like to discuss this matter at all, I can be reached on [Redacted].

Yours hopefully

[Redacted] On behalf of the Cumbrae Ferry Committee

1 Largs-Cumbræ

1.1 Overview:

1.2 The Cumbræ Ferry Committee has submitted the following three requests for the summer 2019 timetable:

- An additional 0630 sailing from Cumbræ Mon-Fri (re-submitted from summer 2017)
- Change of morning break in timetable from 0845 to 0945
- Change operating date band of two vessel timetable

Impacts

Additional 0630 sailing from Cumbræ Mon-Fri

- 1.3 The community has submitted a business case for their requests which is attached in Appendix A. The main rationale behind the request is that a 0630 sailing would enable commuters to travel onwards for work to Glasgow and the outskirts for 0800. The community believes having the ability to do this would attract young families to move to the island thus reversing de-population.
- 1.4 At present, the crew commences work at 0530. Start-up takes one hour, which allows them to commence first service at 0645. Crew representatives have stated that it is possible to start 30 minutes earlier however this will result in early shift finishing at 16:45 as opposed to 17:15. Due to this, the vessel's Passenger Certificate will subsequently drop from 250 to 150.
- 1.5 Currently from the beginning of this summer's timetable until the end of June, the PC has exceeded 150 on 16 occasions between 16:45 – 17:15:

Scheduled Departure Date	Leg Name	Sum of Shipped	
		Scheduled	Passengers
19/05/2018	Cumbræ Slip - Largs	17:00	250
12/05/2018	Cumbræ Slip - Largs	17:00	249
26/05/2018	Cumbræ Slip - Largs	17:00	249
28/05/2018	Cumbræ Slip - Largs	17:00	249
09/06/2018	Cumbræ Slip - Largs	17:00	244
30/06/2018	Cumbræ Slip - Largs	17:00	229
21/04/2018	Cumbræ Slip - Largs	17:00	228
10/06/2018	Cumbræ Slip - Largs	17:00	217
26/05/2018	Cumbræ Slip - Largs	16:50	200
28/05/2018	Cumbræ Slip - Largs	17:11	198
25/05/2018	Cumbræ Slip - Largs	17:00	174
30/06/2018	Cumbræ Slip - Largs	17:15	172
07/05/2018	Cumbræ Slip - Largs	17:00	165
27/05/2018	Cumbræ Slip - Largs	17:00	160
06/05/2018	Cumbræ Slip - Largs	17:00	159
02/06/2018	Cumbræ Slip - Largs	17:00	156

- 1.6 Of these 16 occasions, the average number of passengers carried was 207. This is 38% more passengers than could be accommodated with a PC of 150.
- 1.7 From the above data it is evident that on some days passenger demand is high during this time and operating the vessel with a lower PC for this period will cause short shipping resulting in a build-up of queues and delays, both of which are already prominent issues on the route.
- 1.8 By the crew starting 30 minutes earlier each day, the accumulative time accrued over the week is two hours. Due to the volume of passengers on the route, the crew is often required to stay

on shift after 1715 to allow the PC to be maintained at its upper level. By bringing forward the operating day as proposed, would remove the float within the crew's working arrangement.

- 1.9 This request would require 15 minutes additional time for a Senior Port Assistant Mon-Fri.
- 1.10 A 0630 sailing is predominantly to aid commuters with access to a private vehicle to travel to work earlier. Having a 0630 sailing does not create any new public transport connections. However, residents are currently able to travel to central Glasgow via public transport for 0830.
- 1.11 These requests would also require union agreement via the Small Ferry Committee.
- 1.12 Cost breakdown:

Removed.

Change of morning break in timetable from 0845 to 0945

- 1.13 Full details regarding the rationale behind the request can be found within the business case in Appendix A. However to summarise, the ferry committee has received feedback from residents and the care home that a 0900 sailing would be ideal for travelling on to attend hospital and clinic visits, which they undertake regularly.
- 1.14 Due to bunkering requirements, if the break in the timetable was changed to 0945, CFL would be unable to operate a sailing during this time on a Tuesday. This has been discussed with CFL's fuel supplier however there would not be an appropriate alternative time to move this to. As a result of this CFL would have to operate a reduction in sailings.
- 1.15 The crew and port staff perceived the current time for the break to be the most suitable and advised that passenger traffic usually picks up after 1000 on the route. In order to confirm this, statistics were analysed from the hour before the break and the hour after to ascertain which seems the busier period. The findings are as follows:

Based on Summer 2017 and Summer 2018 (to June-end)
Additional Sailings removed

Period	Scheduled Depart	Leg Name	Sum of Shipped PCU
- hour before	- 07:30	Cumrae Slip - Largs	1420
hour before	07:45	Largs - Cumrae Slip	1435
hour before	- 08:00	Cumrae Slip - Largs	1705
hour before	08:15	Largs - Cumrae Slip	2091
hour before	- 08:30	Cumrae Slip - Largs	2913
hour before Total			9564
- hour after	- 09:45	Cumrae Slip - Largs	291
hour after	09:45	Largs - Cumrae Slip	2457
hour after	- 10:00	Cumrae Slip - Largs	2538
hour after	10:00	Largs - Cumrae Slip	486
hour after	- 10:15	Cumrae Slip - Largs	477
hour after	10:15	Largs - Cumrae Slip	3395
hour after	- 10:30	Cumrae Slip - Largs	3183
hour after	10:30	Largs - Cumrae Slip	532
hour after	- 10:45	Cumrae Slip - Largs	504
hour after	10:45	Largs - Cumrae Slip	3660
hour after Total			17532
Grand Total			27096

- 1.16 If the timetable was changed as per the request the timetable would break between 0945-1015 as opposed to 0845- 0915. We can assume that during this time that passenger queues could build at either port as there is a surge in demand after 1000.
- 1.17 The first service after the current break from Cumbrae has the lowest utilisation of all the sailings shown. The next sailing however is far busier so we would either need to assume that the passengers who would use a 0900 service have either travelled previously on the 0830 or they are content to wait until 1000.
- 1.18 From the data it appears that the current break is at a more suitable time to cope with demand.

Change operating date band of two vessel timetable

- 1.19 Currently the service operates a two vessel timetable for a period of 85 days from 18 June-08 September. The proposal from the community would see the two vessel timetable scheduled predominately during weekends within May, June and September however operating the all week in July and the majority of August. This would also be for 82 days as opposed to the current 85.
- 1.20 The rationale behind the request is to ensure a two vessel service is timetable during the peak periods for the route. The second vessel will be available at Largs for most of the summer timetable however out with these days would only operate subject to excess demand.
- 1.21 The local bus provider has also advised that they are withdrawing a number of week day bus services due to lack of demand. They also advised that should the two vessel timetable be changed to the suggested dates, they would ensure a bus connection was available for each sailing. This is also in an attempt for the community to try and encourage customers to travel using public transport as opposed to taking their own car.
- 1.22 Detailed analysis was performed to verify if the proposed dates would be suitable and can be found in Appendix B. CFL's analysis largely agrees with the dates proposed by the ferry committee. Although the busiest 85 days were analysed and highlighted, they occurred during sporadic times so a pattern was established using the proposed 82 days. The data showed that the dates proposed by the ferry committee are 13% busier than the current two vessel timetable dates.
- 1.23 Although minor and cosmetic, it may be difficult to show the new date bands on the timetables in a concise manner. This has potential to cause increased confusion for customers.

Cumbræ Ferry Committee formal response to Calmac Summer 2019 Impact Assessment.

Overview:

The Cumbræ Ferry Committee have submitted the following three requests for the summer 2019 timetable:

- An additional 0630 sailing from Cumbræ Mon-Fri (re-submitted from summer 2017)
- Change of morning break in timetable from 0845 to 0945
- Change operating date band of two vessel timetable

Impacts

Additional 0630 sailing from Cumbræ Mon-Fri

- 1.3 Agree with statement
- 1.4 Agree with statement
- 1.5 Disagree – we believe the data to be misleading and lacking the relevant detail information. The submission is for an additional sailing Monday to Friday, however the data provided is for 16 occasions where PC has exceeded 150 between 1645 and 1715 and all of these occasions fall on a Saturday, Sunday or Public Holiday (breakdown provided below). It should be noted that Calmac would expect increased visitor numbers to the island and they would prepare accordingly (as per Calmac timetable notes – extract below) – ie 2 vessels in operation and forward planning for crewing (as would be expected of any transport provider in times of expected increases in demand)

Scheduled Departure date	Day of week	Leg Name	Schedule	Sum of passengers shipped	Comments
19/05/2018	Saturday	Cumbræ Slip - Largs	17:00	250	Good weather - expected increase in visitor numbers
12/05/2018	Saturday	Cumbræ Slip - Largs	17:00	249	Good weather - expected increase in visitor numbers
26/05/2018	Saturday	Cumbræ Slip - Largs	17:00	249	Public holiday weekend & good weather - expected increase in visitor numbers
28/05/2018	Monday	Cumbræ Slip - Largs	17:00	249	Public holiday weekend & good weather - expected increase in visitor numbers
09/06/2018	Saturday	Cumbræ Slip - Largs	17:00	244	Good weather - expected increase in visitor numbers
30/06/2018	Saturday	Cumbræ Slip - Largs	17:00	229	Good weather - expected increase in visitor numbers
21/04/2018	Saturday	Cumbræ Slip - Largs	17:00	228	Easter weekend - expected increase in visitor numbers
10/06/2018	Sunday	Cumbræ Slip - Largs	17:00	217	Good weather - expected increase in visitor numbers
26/05/2018	Saturday	Cumbræ Slip - Largs	16:50	200	Public holiday weekend & good weather - expected increase in visitor numbers
28/05/2018	Monday	Cumbræ Slip - Largs	17:11	198	Public holiday weekend & good weather - expected increase in visitor numbers
25/05/2018	Friday	Cumbræ Slip - Largs	17:00	174	Public holiday weekend & good weather - expected increase in visitor numbers
30/06/2018	Saturday	Cumbræ Slip - Largs	17:15	172	Good weather - expected increase in visitor numbers
07/05/2018	Monday	Cumbræ Slip - Largs	17:00	165	Public holiday weekend & good weather - expected increase in visitor numbers
27/07/2018	Sunday	Cumbræ Slip - Largs	17:00	160	Public holiday weekend & good weather - expected increase in visitor numbers
06/05/2018	Sunday	Cumbræ Slip - Largs	17:00	159	Public holiday weekend & good weather - expected increase in visitor numbers
02/06/2018	Saturday	Cumbræ Slip - Largs	17:00	156	Good weather - expected increase in visitor numbers

Extract from Largs / Cumbrae Slip as per Calmac website.

NOTE

Check-in closes for vehicles and passengers 10 minutes prior to departure
Monday - Friday passenger numbers may be restricted on the 0945 sailings from Largs and 1400 sailing from Cumbrae Slip
Additional sailings may be undertaken on occasion should demand exceed the capacity of the timetable
Combined Rail and Sail tickets, which allow you to buy train and ferry tickets in one transaction, are available for this route. For details visit www.calmac.co.uk/railandsail
For information on bus services in this area, contact Traveline on 0871 200 2233 or visit www.traveline.info

1.6 Disagree – the statement is misleading as Calmac provide additional sailings as per their own commitments during times of expected increases in visitor numbers

1.7 Disagree – statement is misleading as, again, Calmac provide additional support during times of increased demand and short shipping is a natural result of the increased number visitors since the introduction of RET and in favourable summer weather conditions.

There are approx. **1488 sailings** 30th March to end of June that depart after 1630 with a 150 PC. **16** of these have exceeded the PC equating to just **1%** of the reduced capacity sailings. This is not deemed as a justifiable reason to reject the 0630 request which is for the benefit of the current & potential future resident community.

1.8 Disagree – crew would only have to start 15 minutes earlier each day to accommodate 0630 sailing request as the request is from the Cumbrae side, the 30 minute earlier starting time suggests a 0615 sailing from Largs which is not requested. This would reduce accumulative time accrued to just 1 hour. This can easily be mitigated by Calmac by reducing start up time to 45 minutes as has been indicated by Calmac previously or can be easily managed by Calmac with the 2nd vessel in operation during times where demand would exceed capacity.

1.9 Agree

1.10 Agree, however the vast majority of commuters' travel by private vehicle as they would otherwise be unable to access their place of work by public transport without increasing their day by a considerable amount of time if public transport is even available. The request is also to encourage younger families to the island to boost population and the economy as well as provide both current residents and potential future residents with expanded employment opportunities.

1.11 Agree

1.12 The Ferry Committee cannot comment on this as the information has been redacted. This is an area of contention as this is public money. Calmac advise

the information is commercially sensitive, however with no competition on the route we do not believe redacting costs is justifiable.

Change of morning break in timetable from 0845 to 0945

- 1.13 Agree
- 1.14 Agree, however there is no reason that the request could not be approved with the exception of a Tuesday which can be highlighted in the timetable.
- 1.15 Agree?
- 1.16 Agree
- 1.17 Agree
- 1.18 Agree?

Change operating date band of two vessel timetable

- 1.19 Agree
- 1.20 Agree
- 1.21 Agree
- 1.22 Agree
- 1.23 Disagree – timetable can be made clear as to what days the 15 minute service is in operation while providing the caveat that additional services will be provided during periods of excess demand.

From: Minister for Energy, Connectivity and the Islands
Sent: 20 August 2018 09:09:32
To: Public Engagement Unit
Cc: Minister for Energy, Connectivity and the Islands
Subject: FW: Isle of Mull winter ferry service - help please.

MACCS case as a Ministerial Response please.

Thanks

[Redacted]

[Redacted] Private Secretary to Paul Wheelhouse MSP, Minister for Energy, Connectivity and the Islands
The Scottish Government | Web: www.gov.scot<<http://www.gov.scot/>>
Tel: [Redacted] | Mobile: [Redacted] | Email:
MinisterECI@gov.scot<<mailto:MinisterECI@gov.scot>>

From: Russell MW (Michael), MSP [<mailto:Michael.Russell.msp@parliament.scot>]
Sent: 19 August 2018 10:49
To: Minister for Energy, Connectivity and the Islands <MinisterECI@gov.scot>
Cc: [Redacted]; Cabinet Secretary for Transport, Infrastructure and Connectivity <CabSecTIC@gov.scot>
Subject: FW: Isle of Mull winter ferry service - help please.

Dear Paul

I append an email from the Chair of the Mull and Iona Ferry Committee. The ferry committees on various islands are very active and are the main conduit for negotiation between Cal Mac and the community.

The issue of a timetable that allows a full day on the mainland has been discussed for several years. Mull is, as you will know, only 45 minutes from Oban and the economy of the island would be greatly assisted by the ability to live there but work in either Oban or nearby. This is particularly true for contractors who can compete for work from an island base if such a facility is available. It also helps those who need to travel to Mull for work .

I am very supportive of this plan and very concerned that despite considerable discussion over a long period Cal Mac and Transport Scotland still haven't agreed to it. They also don't seem to be taking seriously the proposals from the island, instead preferring to stick to their views and costings. We need some imagination and new thinking in the provision of ferry services and it needs to be demonstrated in cases like this if the provisions of the islands bill are to mean anything.

I intend to meet with the committee shortly and I am sure they would welcome a discussion with you. In the meantime I would ask you to inquire into this and to see what can be done to meet the island's needs.

Regards as ever
Michael

Dear Mr Russell,

Mull and Iona Ferry Committee.(MIFC)

I've recently taken the Chair of MIFC and I am writing for your help.

We have been working tirelessly for the last five years to get an early/late ferry service to the mainland during the winter as this is acknowledged as essential for our economic prosperity, an anecdote to depopulation, and a necessity to enable islanders to access basic services including healthcare and exist in the 21st century.

We have held countless meetings with the stakeholders, Calmac, Cmal, Argyll and Bute Council, Transport Scotland; each time we have overcome a hurdle, the stakeholders put another in our way, and now we are stuck.

I won't bore you with all the detail at this stage, but we are now in a position where we understand that £650,000 a year from TS budgets is what is needed to enable us to have this essential early/late boat during the winter. (Calmac have informally confirmed this figure, TS have refused their request for the spend). We do have a zero cost solution which Calmac cannot accept.

Mull is a 40 min ferry crossing from the mainland in sheltered waters. We understand we are now the only near island in the UK not to have a year round public transport service which allows a full day on the mainland. Our winter timetable means we cannot get to Oban before 10am and the last boat back to Mull departs at 4pm, so if travelling with a car, check in is 3.30pm.

This restricted service means islanders can't work on the mainland, get to medical and other vital appointments beyond Oban without at least one overnight stay, usually 2 nights. It also means that trades people, services etc coming to Mull have very short working days but quite fairly charge for a full days? work ? so we are caught every way and ?residents? and local businesses are now voting with their feet and either not moving here, or worse, moving away.

There is a lot of background information (and many red herrings!) which I can fill you in on, but I wanted to give you the essentials here.

Many thanks

[Redacted]Chair, Mull and Iona Ferry Committee
[Redacted]

From: Minister for Energy, Connectivity and the Islands
Sent: 14 August 2018 16:06:07
To: Public Engagement Unit
Cc: Minister for Energy, Connectivity and the Islands
Subject: FW: Kerrera

For MACCS please as an MR.

[Redacted]

[Redacted]] Private Secretary to Paul Wheelhouse MSP, Minister for Energy,

Connectivity and the Islands
The Scottish Government | Web: www.gov.scot<<http://www.gov.scot>>
Tel: [Redacted] | Mobile: [Redacted] | Email:
MinisterECI@gov.scot<<mailto:MinisterECI@gov.scot>>

From: [Redacted]
Sent: 14 August 2018 14:57
To: Minister for Energy, Connectivity and the Islands
Cc: [Redacted]
Subject: Kerrera

Good afternoon

Mr Yousaf met with Mr Russell and residents of Kerrera on the 6th June. At this meeting Mr Yousaf made a commitment to come out to Kerrera to discuss various issues on the island especially the lack of a road connecting the north and south of the island.

Mr Russell would be happy to arrange a visit to Kerrera for Mr Wheelhouse to help take this forward. We look forward to hearing from you.

Kind regards

[Redacted]

[Redacted] | Parliamentary Assistant to Michael Russell MSP
M4.16, The Scottish Parliament, Edinburgh, EH99 1SP
Telephone: [Redacted] | Email: [Redacted]
michaelrussellmsp.scot | @Feorlean | FB: Michael Russell-Argyll & Bute SNP

From: [Redacted]
Sent: 13 August 2018 11:50:01
To: Public Engagement Unit
Cc: Cabinet Secretary for Transport, Infrastructure and Connectivity
Subject: FW: Heavy Goods service to Kerrera

Please place on MACCS for a Ministerial response,
Thanks

[Redacted]
Deputy Private Secretary
Cabinet Secretary for Transport, Infrastructure and Connectivity
[Redacted]

From: Russell MW (Michael), MSP [<mailto:Michael.Russell.msp@parliament.scot>]
Sent: 13 August 2018 11:48
To: Cabinet Secretary for Transport, Infrastructure and Connectivity
Cc: Minister for Energy, Connectivity and the Islands; [Redacted]
Subject: Heavy Goods service to Kerrera

Dear Michael

Earlier this year Humza Yousaf met with a group of my constituents on Kerrera, which has a range of particularly difficult problems including the lack of a road between the north and south. The Government funded a new ferry and slips at the south end some years ago having reached an understanding with Argyll & Bute Council that they would fund the road, but unfortunately that has not come to fruition. Humza agreed to a number of useful actions to support Kerrera including writing to the Council to protest at the imposition of new parking charges in Oban which has further disadvantaged the residents as they no longer have anywhere to leave their cars on the mainland.

Humza also agreed that there should be a regular heavy goods service for the north of the island. Heavy goods cannot come to the north from the ferry at the south given that there is no road.

There has been some difficulty this summer in getting that service into place, with a particular problem over the movement of a cow to the island. I was on Kerrera a couple of weeks ago and was asked to remind you about this matter and to ask that the service be put on the footing promised as soon as possible..

Regards and good wishes
Michael

Michael Russell MSP for Argyll and Bute

From: [Redacted]
Sent: 18 July 2018 16:26:00
To: Public Engagement Unit
Cc: Minister for Energy, Connectivity and the Islands
Subject: FW: Highlands and Islands Enterprise (HIE) - Meeting with HIE CEO

For MACCS please - MR to be allocated to Mr Wheelhouse.

Thanks

[Redacted]

[Redacted] Private Secretary to Paul Wheelhouse MSP, Minister for Energy, Connectivity and the Islands
The Scottish Government | Web: www.gov.scot
Tel: [Redacted] | Email: MinisterECI@gov.scot

From: [Redacted]
Sent: 18 July 2018 16:10
To: Minister for Energy, Connectivity and the Islands
Subject: Highlands and Islands Enterprise (HIE) - Meeting with HIE CEO

Dear Minister

I am contacting on behalf of [Redacted], Chief Executive of Highlands and Islands Enterprise.

On the 20 June [Redacted] had a call with the Minister for Transport and the Islands, Mr Yousaf, and it was agreed that a follow up face-to-face meeting should be arranged to discuss islands issues and transport. [Redacted] would be very pleased to now have that meeting with you following your recent appointment as Minister for Energy, Connectivity and Islands.

I would be happy to liaise direct with your office to discuss potential dates and times for a meeting in Edinburgh. Of course, if preferable, we would be very happy to host a visit to the Highlands and Islands at any time.

I look forward to your earliest reply regarding the possibility of a meeting in the near future.

Yours sincerely

[Redacted]
[Redacted]
Strategic Engagement Manager
DD: [Redacted]

From: Minister for Energy, Connectivity and the Islands
Sent: 25 October 2018 16:05:36
To: Public Engagement Unit
Cc: Minister for Energy, Connectivity and the Islands
Subject: FW: National Islands Transport Forum [OFFICIAL]

For MACCS please as an MR.

Thanks

[Redacted]

[Redacted] Private Secretary to Paul Wheelhouse MSP, Minister for Energy, Connectivity and the Islands
The Scottish Government | Web: www.gov.scot
Tel: [Redacted] Email: MinisterECl@gov.scot

From: Morton, Aileen <Aileen.Morton@argyll-bute.gcsx.gov.uk>
Sent: 25 October 2018 15:52
To: Minister for Energy, Connectivity and the Islands <MinisterECl@gov.scot>
Subject: National Islands Transport Forum [OFFICIAL]
Classification: OFFICIAL

Dear Paul

Apologies for writing to you on the back of this morning's meeting but unfortunately the technical problems did impact on some items of the agenda more than others (as well as creating a bit of a time pressure following the initial delay).

In relation to item 6 and the Ferry Service Investment Planning I would just have wanted to highlight that our Islands Policy Lead, [Redacted], has raised

concerns about the timescales for commissioning a new vessel for the Islay service. While it is welcome to see new vessels being built, the 801 and 802 don't necessarily aid our local resilience as they won't fit our infrastructure but there will still be a risk that "our" vessels could be diverted to support other routes - as happened recently with MV Hebridean Isles.

In terms of delivering the resilience we desperately need, we would welcome the decision to order an additional vessel being taken now rather than once the 801 and 802 are completed. I appreciate this isn't a commitment that could be made lightly, particularly considering your comments at the start of the meeting around the focus on meeting existing financial commitments, but considering the wider issues around our fragile transport infrastructure I feel this request does need to be considered. Can I say that in terms of item 10 I was slightly surprised to see this paper on the agenda without any reflection of the wider requirements for investment in air transport. The 2013 HITRANS report identified the Oban to Glasgow and Oban to Barra routes as being the most economically viable but no progress has been made on this. We have included an ask in relation to this in our Rural Growth Deal, reflecting the economic potential but also the parity of providing central belt access to the islands of Coll and Colonsay. I'm also aware that HIAL are struggling to meet demand at Islay airport due to increased demand, particularly from the commercial sector, and there is now a need for capital investment to ensure the terminal can cope. Item 11 is clearly focused on the Northern Isles internal ferry services but I found it very concerning to see a report on the National Islands Transport Forum that doesn't reflect our position. As you are aware (and was picked up in the letter I received yesterday from Jeanne Freeman) we also have internal ferry services that are not fully funded by the Scottish Government. So to see the third paragraph of this report state that "For the Clyde and Hebrides network... this challenge is met directly through Scottish Government funding" is not acceptable as this is not the case for 4 of our ferry services. Considering that Jura also faces the challenge of being two ferry journeys away from the mainland we would appreciate substantial progress on this issue ASAP. I first wrote to Humza Yousaf regarding this on December 12th 2017 and discussions between our officers and Transport Scotland are now concluded until ministerial direction is given.

I will do my best to attend the teleconference mentioned to pick up outstanding items but if not will ensure that officers/a deputy are available as clearly transport issues are a substantial challenge for our 23 inhabited islands.

It was good to meet you properly at COHI on Monday - I hope you enjoyed the day.

Best wishes

Aileen

Cllr Aileen Morton
Leader of Argyll & Bute Council

From: [Redacted]
Sent: 23 October 2018 14:31:38
To: Public Engagement Unit
Subject: FW: Isle of Mull winter ferry service

PEU,

For MACCS please - Diary Meeting -please assign to [Redacted].

Thanks,

[Redacted] Assistant Private Secretary to Minister for Energy, Connectivity and Islands

The Scottish Government | Web: www.gov.scot<<http://www.gov.scot/>>

Tel: [Redacted] Email: MinisterECI@gov.scot

From: [Redacted]

Sent: 23 October 2018 13:59

To: Minister for Energy, Connectivity and the Islands <MinisterECI@gov.scot>

Cc: [Redacted]

Subject: RE: Isle of Mull winter ferry service

[Redacted]

Yes.

If the MACCS system allows you, can you please assign it to my colleague [Redacted]

I have related e-mails from [Redacted], that I am also about to forward to Paul. It is best if we take an overview of all the correspondence to ensure a consistent message.

Thanks

[Redacted]

From: Minister for Energy, Connectivity and the Islands

Sent: 23 October 2018 13:48

To: [Redacted]

Cc: Minister for Energy, Connectivity and the Islands
<MinisterECI@gov.scot<<mailto:MinisterECI@gov.scot>>>

Subject: FW: Isle of Mull winter ferry service

[Redacted]

Another email from Mr Russell.
Should I put this on MACCS?

Thanks

[Redacted]

[Redacted] Private Secretary to Paul Wheelhouse MSP, Minister for Energy, Connectivity and the Islands

The Scottish Government | Web: www.gov.scot<<http://www.gov.scot/>>

Tel: [Redacted] Email:

MinisterECI@gov.scot<<mailto:MinisterECI@gov.scot>>

From: Russell MW (Michael), MSP
<Michael.Russell.msp@parliament.scot<mailto:Michael.Russell.msp@parliament.scot>>
Sent: 23 October 2018 13:18
To: [Redacted]
Minister for Energy, Connectivity and the Islands
<MinisterECI@gov.scot<mailto:MinisterECI@gov.scot>>
Cc: Cabinet Secretary for Transport, Infrastructure and Connectivity
<CabSecTIC@gov.scot<mailto:CabSecTIC@gov.scot>> [Redacted]
Subject: RE: Isle of Mull winter ferry service

Dear [Redacted]

Thanks for copying me into this.

You know I support a better winter timetable that would allow daily access and I look forward to getting a reply from the Minister about the matter.

Regards

Michael

From: [Redacted]
Sent: 16 October 2018 13:56
To: Minister for Energy, Connectivity and the Islands
<MinisterECI@gov.scot<mailto:MinisterECI@gov.scot>>
Cc: Cabinet Secretary for Transport, Infrastructure and Connectivity
<CabSecTIC@gov.scot<mailto:CabSecTIC@gov.scot>>; Russell MW (Michael),
MSP
<Michael.Russell.msp@parliament.scot<mailto:Michael.Russell.msp@parliament.scot>>
Subject: Isle of Mull winter ferry service

Dear Mr Wheelhouse,

I write further to Michael Russell's emails to you on August 19th and September 27th. You will also be aware of the National media coverage we have attracted over the last few days.

The situation here is now desperate; families making conscious decisions not to move to the island, local employers seriously considering moving their offices to the mainland, self-employed being forced by economics to live away from their families 4 nights a week, individuals with medical appointments having to incur the cost of staying away on the mainland because they can't get back to their own home after treatment and consultations....shall I go on?

When the winter timetable comes in next week we will only be able get to Oban just before 10am and have to be back in the ferry queue at 3.30pm - that is simply not acceptable in today's world.

Our ferry crossing is only 45 minutes, we can see Oban from the shore. Over the last 8 years the Committee has worked hard to find pragmatic, intelligent

solutions to all the obstacles put in our way. We have redesigned the timetable so that we can have a full day on the mainland with no additional sailings. Calmac has agreed it can run the timetable. The pier needs some work to make it suitable for the operator (notwithstanding the operator uses the pier now), so for £600,000 pa we estimate, Mull could have a fit for purpose winter service whilst the work is done on the pier - but Transport Scotland have said no.

Given the sums of public money spent on nearby piers, on RET subsidies for tourists to Mull, on new boats for the islands, £600,000 is a drop in the ocean (excuse the pun!) and I simply do not know how to explain this lack of support to the community. So, please accept our invitation to attend the STAG interim report presentation of November 1st, or November 2nd in Craignure, where you will be able to hear the islanders concerns, see what Argyll and Bute are offering as interim solutions to our problem, and put your weight and Government spend behind one of those solutions so that we can start moving forwards.

Warm wishes

[Redacted]

[Redacted]

Chair, Mull and Iona Ferry Committee

From: Minister for Energy, Connectivity and the Islands
Sent: 16 October 2018 14:06:10
To: Public Engagement Unit
Cc: Minister for Energy, Connectivity and the Islands
Subject: FW: Isle of Mull winter ferry service

AO - [Redacted]

For MACCS please as a diary case.

Thanks

[Redacted]

[Redacted] Private Secretary to Paul Wheelhouse MSP, Minister for Energy, Connectivity and the Islands
The Scottish Government | Web: www.gov.scot
Tel: [Redacted] Email: MinisterECI@gov.scot

From: [Redacted]
Sent: 16 October 2018 13:56
To: Minister for Energy, Connectivity and the Islands
<MinisterECI@gov.scot>
Cc: Cabinet Secretary for Transport, Infrastructure and Connectivity
<CabSecTIC@gov.scot>; michael.russell.msp@scottish.parliament.uk
Subject: Isle of Mull winter ferry service

Dear Mr Wheelhouse,

I write further to Michael Russell's emails to you on August 19th and September 27th. You will also be aware of the National media coverage we have attracted over the last few days.

The situation here is now desperate; families making conscious decisions not to move to the island, local employers seriously considering moving their offices to the mainland, self-employed being forced by economics to live away from their families 4 nights a week, individuals with medical appointments having to incur the cost of staying away on the mainland because they can't get back to their own home after treatment and consultations.....shall I go on?

When the winter timetable comes in next week we will only be able get to Oban just before 10am and have to be back in the ferry queue at 3.30pm - that is simply not acceptable in today's world.

Our ferry crossing is only 45 minutes, we can see Oban from the shore.

Over the last 8 years the Committee has worked hard to find pragmatic, intelligent solutions to all the obstacles put in our way. We have redesigned the timetable so that we can have a full day on the mainland with no additional sailings. Calmac has agreed it can run the timetable. The pier needs some work to make it suitable for the operator (notwithstanding the operator uses the pier now), so for £600,000 pa we estimate, Mull could have a fit for purpose winter service whilst the work is done on the pier - but Transport Scotland have said no.

Given the sums of public money spent on nearby piers, on RET subsidies for tourists to Mull, on new boats for the islands, £600.000 is a drop in the ocean (excuse the pun!) and I simply do not know how to explain this lack of support to the community.

So, please accept our invitation to attend the STAG interim report presentation of November 1st, or November 2nd in Craignure, where you will be able to hear the islanders concerns, see what Argyll and Bute are offering as interim solutions to our problem, and put your weight and Government spend behind one of those solutions so that we can start moving forwards.

Warm wishes

[Redacted]

[Redacted]

Chair, Mull and Iona Ferry Committee

From: Minister for Energy, Connectivity and the Islands

Sent: 06 September 2018 17:39:16

To: Public Engagement Unit

Cc: Minister for Energy, Connectivity and the Islands

Subject: FW: RET on Coll

For MACCS please. This required an MR response.

Thanks

[Redacted]

[Redacted] Private Secretary to Paul Wheelhouse MSP, Minister for Energy, Connectivity and the Islands
The Scottish Government | Web: www.gov.scot<<http://www.gov.scot/>>
Tel: [Redacted] Email:
MinisterECI@gov.scot<<mailto:MinisterECI@gov.scot>>

From: [Redacted]
Sent: 06 September 2018 17:12
To: Minister for Energy, Connectivity and the Islands <MinisterECI@gov.scot>
Cc: [Redacted]
Subject: RET on Coll

Dear Mr Wheelhouse

Your office will have vast correspondence on the subject of revising the RET for Coll. It has been promised since 2013 and has still not happened. The Coll Community Council have been pushing the subject for over a year and Transport Scotland have now stopped responding to their emails.

Mr Russell feels they deserve an answer and would be grateful if you can look in to the matter. We look forward to hearing from you.

Kind regards

[Redacted]

[Redacted] Parliamentary Assistant to Michael Russell MSP
M4.16, The Scottish Parliament, Edinburgh, EH99 1SP
Telephone: 0131 348 5738<tel: [Redacted]
Email: [Redacted]
[@Feorlean](mailto:michaelrussellmsp.scot) | FB: Michael Russell-Argyll & Bute SNP

From: Minister for Energy, Connectivity and the Islands
Sent: 25 September 2018 12:02:58
To: Public Engagement Unit
Cc: Minister for Energy, Connectivity and the Islands
Subject: FW: Commercial v campervan rates

AO [Redacted]

For MACCS please. MR required for this one.

Thanks

[Redacted]

[Redacted] Private Secretary to Paul Wheelhouse MSP, Minister for Energy, Connectivity and the Islands

The Scottish Government | Web: www.gov.scot<<http://www.gov.scot/>>
Tel: [Redacted] Email:
MinisterECI@gov.scot<<mailto:MinisterECI@gov.scot>>

From: Russell MW (Michael), MSP
<Michael.Russell.msp@parliament.scot<<mailto:Michael.Russell.msp@parliament.scot>>>
Sent: 25 September 2018 11:56
To: Minister for Energy, Connectivity and the Islands
<MinisterECI@gov.scot<<mailto:MinisterECI@gov.scot>>>
Cc: [Redacted]
Subject: FW: Commercial v campervan rates

Dear Paul

I had a Skype meeting with the Mull Ferry Group yesterday and will be approaching you about a key issue that needs resolved.
However at the end of the meeting [Redacted] who runs a very successful island business raised the issue of the costs for commercial freight vehicles as opposed to camper vans, which are often the same length .
He provided the useful summary given below and I was very struck by it.
I would be grateful for your thoughts on it and, if it is not too late, an indication that this anomaly will be considered during the ongoing review of fares. Some indication on what that will report would also be helpful.

Michael

From: [Redacted]
Sent: 24 September 2018 16:28
To: Russell MW (Michael), MSP
<Michael.Russell.msp@parliament.scot<<mailto:Michael.Russell.msp@parliament.scot>>>
Cc: [Redacted]
Subject: Commercial v campervan rates

Dear Mike

Good to (virtually) meet you today. As much to clarify my own memory as much as anything, I thought I would just check the commercial v campervan rates on the Oban-Craignure route.:

OBAN-CRAIGNURE RETURN

6 Metres
8 Metres
10 Metres
Campervan
?26.80
?40.20
?53.60
Commercial
?165.84
?221.12

?276.40

And to compare the volume of each carried in metres (summer 2017):

Summer ?17 carryings

Commercial Metres

45510

Campervan / Caravan Metres

25544

The disparity between commercial and campervan rates is huge, and directly inverse (I would argue) to their economic importance to the island. It seems perverse to be subsidising holiday makers that contribute little to the local economy, and penalising commercial traffic which impacts on all activity here.

If we wished as a committee to put together a proposal for re-balancing the fare structure, to whom should we make the appeal? Is there a mechanism? Transport Scotland, or the Transport Minister? Or perhaps both?

With best regards and thanks for your help,

[Redacted]

Director

[Redacted]

From: [Redacted]

Sent: 23 September 2018 18:35

michaelrussellmsp.scot/privacypolicy/