

**From:** [REDACTED]

**Sent:** 16 October 2018 16:17

**To:** [REDACTED]

**Subject:** RE: Agriculture Bill - UK Agriculture Bill - proposed Scottish Government amendments - LCM issues - SGLD comments - legal rural

**[REDACTED]**

My comments on all except the PGI amendment – on which I will comment separately.

Producer organisations

Generally content. **[REDACTED]**

Fair Dealing

Content

WTO

Content. In relation to amendment 14, can I just check that the amendment leaves the word “support” in place, and removes everything thereafter?

I agree with your suggestion of a further consequential amendment to omit the definition of “devolved authority”.

Other points

**[REDACTED]**

I do not envisage any further instructions at this stage on taking into account historic domestic support in clause 26. I had a call with Defra policy officials last week, and the ball is in their court to come up with something that provides a guarantee of fairness.

**[REDACTED]**

**[REDACTED]**

16 October 2018

**From:** [REDACTED]

**Sent:** 16 October 2018 11:59

**To:** [REDACTED]

**Subject:** Agriculture Bill - UK Agriculture Bill - proposed Scottish Government amendments - LCM issues - SGLD comments - legal rural

Hi **[REDACTED]**

Grateful for any comments in relation to the draft amendments from PCO colleagues.

In relation to the LCM issues, I think these broadly do the trick. I have a few observations re those particular amendments:

**[REDACTED]**

Grateful for your comments on these as well as the amendments drafted re PFNs/GIs.

**[REDACTED]**

Many thanks

**[REDACTED]**

## **DEFRA AGRICULTURE BILL**

### **SG FACTUAL SUMMARY BASED ON THE BILL AS INTRODUCED ON 12 SEPTEMBER 2018**

#### **PURPOSE OF THE BILL**

The purpose of this Bill is as follows:

1. To give the Defra Secretary of State powers to modify, amend or repeal retained EU Law for England in order to accommodate the measures Defra plan to adopt for an agricultural transition period in England following exit from the EU and the CAP, such as phasing out and replacing direct payments.
2. To give the Defra Secretary of State powers to introduce new financial support schemes etc., in England to facilitate the delivery of a new long-term policy for England along the lines outlined in Defra's Health and Harmony consultation document.
3. Extend some of the powers to Wales and Northern Ireland as requested.
4. To grant the Secretary of State UK wide powers in areas that the UKG considers are reserved, such as the WTO Agreement on Agriculture, and Producer Organisations. SG does not agree with the UKG assertion that these are reserved issues, see separate note on the Lord Advocate's legal opinion in relation to these issues.
5. Although not a Brexit related issue, Defra are planning to include a clause on the Red Meat Levy in the Bill. This clause was not included in the Bill at introduction, but Defra have intimated that it will be included as an amendment during the Bill's progress.

## **PART 1 - NEW FINANCIAL SUPPORT POWERS**

### **Clauses 1 to 3:**

These clauses give the Secretary of State powers to make payments to farmers and other rural businesses in several areas, including:

- improving and supporting access to the environment;
- restoring and enhancing cultural and natural heritage;
- increasing productivity in agriculture, horticulture and forestry;
- improving or protecting animal health and welfare;
- improving or protecting plant health;
- mitigating and adapting to climate change;

These powers, which relate to England only, are intended to cover both the short-term transition period and long-term future policy, and include rules on the forms and conditions for granting support (including publication of specific information about the support), and on monitoring and enforcing compliance with these rules.

## **PART 2 - FINANCIAL SUPPORT UNDER COMMON AGRICULTURAL POLICY**

### **DIRECT PAYMENTS**

#### **Chapter 1 - clauses 4-8:**

This section relates to CAP Direct Payments (including Greening and the Young Farmers payment) for England, and includes powers for the Secretary of State to allow for the rolling over and continuation of the current basic payment scheme post Brexit, termination of the scheme at the end of its last full scheme year, and a transition period (lasting 7 years, from 2021 – 2028) during which direct payments would be phased out and replaced. Specific provision has been made for Greening payments in England to be terminated before the end of the transition period.

This fits with Defra's policy intention of rolling over the direct payment scheme on exit from the EU and phasing out and replacing direct payments during a transition period. These clauses allow the Secretary of State to amend or revoke any legislation relating to direct payments at the end of the transition period in order to facilitate a new policy. Future support payments beyond the end of the transition period would be covered under the Financial Assistance powers in Part 1.

### **OTHER FINANCIAL SUPPORT**

#### **Chapter 2 – Clauses 9-11: General provisions, abolition of aid for fruit and vegetable producer organisations in England, and Rural Development Programme.**

The general provisions in clause 9 allow the Secretary of State to amend retained EU law relating to the financing, management and monitoring of the CAP.

Clause 10 grants the Secretary of State the power to modify retained EU Law in relation to aid for fruit and vegetable producer organisations with the aim of ending of such financial aid in England. We understand that Defra plan to continue to provide support to fruit and veg producer organisations, but once the already-approved programmes have finished this will be done under the Financial Assistance powers in Part 1 of the Bill.

This clause only relates to financial support for POs, which under the CAP is limited to the fruit and vegetable sector. It does not cover other issues relating to POs, such as their status under competition law – this is dealt with elsewhere in the Bill.

Clause 11 allows the Secretary of State to modify retained EU law relating to support for Rural Development, to ensure it no longer has effect. Defra plan to provide support for Rural Development in future, and this will be done through the financial assistance powers in Part 1.

### **PART 3 - COLLECTION AND SHARING OF DATA**

#### **Clauses 12-16:**

These clauses give the Secretary of State power to ask for information connected to an agri-food supply chain, for such purposes as helping increase productivity, encouraging fairness and transparency, promoting plant and animal health, etc., and to impose penalties on those failing to provide such information. These powers relate to England only, and cover both the initial transition period and long term policy.

### **PART 4 – INTERVENTION IN AGRICULTURAL MARKETS**

#### **EXCEPTIONAL MARKET CONDITIONS, PUBLIC MARKET INTERVENTION AND PRIVATE STORAGE AID: MODIFICATION OF EU LEGISLATION**

#### **Clauses 17-19:**

These clauses allow the Secretary of State to make a declaration that there are exceptional market conditions (if there is a severe disturbance in agricultural markets, or a serious threat of disturbance), and to give financial assistance to agricultural producers in England should their incomes be affected. They also allow the Secretary of State to modify retained EU law for England in relation to public market intervention and private storage aid.

### **PART 5 – MARKETING STANDARDS AND CARCASS CLASSIFICATION**

#### **Clauses 20 – 21**

These clauses relate to England-only, and grant the Secretary of State the power to amend, or revoke, the retained EU law on marketing standards, and to introduce new marketing standards and tailor these to suit the domestic agricultural market. These powers are wider and more flexible than those currently in EU law, so that the Secretary of State can make changes either to keep pace with changes in EU standards made after Brexit, or for internal policy reasons.

**[REDACTED]**

## **PART 6 – PRODUCER ORGANISATIONS AND FAIRNESS IN THE SUPPLY CHAIN**

### **Clauses 22 - 24: official recognition of producer organisations etc. and associated exemptions from competition law**

The CAP currently makes provision for the official recognition of producer organisations and interbranch organisations, which gives them certain benefits, and the rules governing the operation of these organisations. An interbranch organisation is similar to a producer organisation but, in addition to farmers, it includes other parts of the supply chain (e.g. farmers plus abattoirs). The benefits of official recognition are: exemption from some elements of competition law; and the ability in certain circumstances to make rules which apply not just to their members but to other producers in the same sector.

These clauses give the Secretary of State power to amend or revoke retained EU law in relation to producer and interbranch organisations, and to introduce new legislation regarding the recognition of and rules governing such organisations, including exemption from competition law. Defra are taking the view that, as this relates to competition law, this is a reserved area. **[REDACTED]**

### **Clause 25: Fair dealing obligations of first purchasers of agricultural products ('Statutory Industry Codes')**

This clause gives the Secretary of State powers to promote fair contractual dealing by the first purchasers of agricultural products. It is intended for the whole of the UK, and covers both the transition period and longer term policy. It allows obligations to be imposed on the purchaser, including written contracts, which may relate to matters such as the quantity and quality of the product, pricing mechanisms and payment, and variation of the contract, as well as the enforcement of compliance with such obligations through a complaints procedure and/or imposition of penalties.

SG disagrees with Defra's assertion that this clause is entirely about competition law and is therefore wholly reserved.

## **PART 7 - WTO AGREEMENT ON AGRICULTURE**

### **Clause 26: WTO Agreement on Agriculture: regulations**

The clause grants the Secretary of State powers to gather information to allow for the classification and reporting of agricultural support to the WTO. The powers also allow the Secretary of State to set out the total amount of domestic support for agriculture for the whole of the UK, and for England, Scotland, Wales and NI separately. The powers allow the Secretary of State to define a process for how farm support should be classified for WTO purposes, including dispute resolution with the Secretary of State as final arbiter.

This is an area that Defra argue is reserved as it relates to international obligations. SG and Wales have contested this, and have also questioned the necessity for this clause given that the requirement to meet international obligations is already enshrined in the Devolution Acts. SG has also expressed concern that as drafted the clause is very broad, and would allow the Secretary of State unilaterally to set limits on all agricultural support, not just the classes which are limited by the WTO. Defra's response is that the wording of the clause limits the powers to only that which is necessary for WTO compliance.

## **PART 8 – WALES AND NORTHERN IRELAND**

### **Clauses 27 – 28**

These clauses specify that Schedule 3 makes provision in relation to Wales and Schedule 4 makes provision in relation to Northern Ireland.

Welsh ministers have chosen to take similar powers to England in terms of new financial assistance powers (but in addition make specific provision to support businesses and communities in rural areas), the agricultural transition period, and phasing out and termination of direct payments. They have also taken similar powers in terms of the collection and sharing of data, intervention in agricultural markets, and marketing standards and carcass classification. The Welsh Government is planning to introduce its own Bill at a future date to cover longer-term agricultural support, after which it will presumably stop relying on the powers in this Westminster Bill.

Northern Ireland does not have a functioning administration at the moment, therefore Northern Ireland officials have asked for the powers necessary to enable them to maintain the status quo until an administration is formed. This includes powers to modify the basic payment scheme in order to simplify or improve it, powers covering the collection and sharing of data, intervention in agricultural markets, and marketing standards and carcass classification.

## **PART 9 – FINAL PROVISIONS**

### **Clauses 29 – 36**

These are general clauses relating to the interpretation and legislative procedures of the Bill. They enable the powers to make regulations to be exercisable by statutory instrument, and set out negative and affirmative resolution procedures.

## **NOT PRESENT IN THE BILL AT INTRODUCTION, BUT EXPECTED TO BE INTRODUCED DURING PASSAGE OF THE BILL**

### **Red meat levy**

Defra propose to include provisions to resolve the long-standing red meat levy issue. **[REDACTED]** and form the legal basis for the levy money to be repatriated.

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

## UK AGRICULTURE BILL

**ISSUE: 12 Sept** - The UK Government introduced its Agriculture Bill. It:

- a) creates powers in England to create a new policy to replace the EU Common Agricultural Policy after Brexit, and to manage the transition from the CAP,
- b) creates similar powers, at their request, for Wales and Northern Ireland (in the case of Wales, as a stopgap till the Welsh Assembly legislates), and
- c) creates UK-wide powers in three policy areas which UKG asserts are reserved.

These three areas are:

- Rules on farm payments needed to comply with WTO obligations;
- Rules on giving special status to groups of farmers ('Producer Organisations') to exempt them from some parts of competition law;
- Powers to create statutory codes of fair conduct in agri-food supply chains.

**[REDACTED]**

Defra previously announced that in England all farm income support will be removed in favour of environmental payments, and the Bill confirms that income support in England will be phased out over 7 years starting 2021.

**12 Sep:** The National Audit Office published a report on "Progress in Implementing EU Exit" by Defra, which recognises progress made in preparing for EU Exit but is highly critical of Defra's readiness for a no-deal scenario.

**ISSUE: 10 Sept** - NFUS issued a press release calling for the Scottish Government to support the Chequers Agreement as a no-deal would be catastrophic for farmers. In response, the Scottish Government has made clear that 'Chequers or No Deal' is a false choice.

### Top Lines

- The UK Government's agriculture bill completely fails to deliver on promises made to Scotland during the EU referendum.
- The Tories claimed Scottish farmers would continue to receive at least the same level of funding as they currently do.
- The bill also rides roughshod over the devolved settlement.
- Until the attempts to grab key powers that impact on farming and food production are addressed we cannot and will not bring forward legislative consent motions for primary Brexit legislation like this.
- The UK Government might be content to leave farmers in England high and dry without the support they need to provide quality food, we are not.

### **We have serious concerns that this bill could impose unwanted policies and rules on Scottish farmers in areas of devolved competency**

- The UK Government is attempting to grab key powers on farming and food production.
- For example, as drafted, this bill could potentially affect the Scottish Parliament's ability to provide support for active beef and sheep farmers.
- It could also impact on Less Favoured Area Support for farmers working in the toughest areas.
- Defra asserts that the UK-wide powers in its Bill only affect reserved areas, but we refute this absolutely.

## UK AGRICULTURE BILL

- For example, Defra asserts that everything to do with World Trade Organisation rules is reserved.
- However, it has always been clear that implementing international obligations in devolved policy areas is a devolved matter.
- We will not be bringing forward legislative consent motions until this is resolved and the Sewell convention is made operable again.

### **We are considering options for future legislation against the background of this wider legislative consent issue**

- We are not opposed to UK-wide frameworks where these are in Scotland's interests detailed discussions around these in good faith.
- However, frameworks must be agreed, not imposed and must happen in a manner that respects and recognises devolution.
- The Agriculture Bill fails that test and must be amended so that any provisions applying across the UK have been agreed with the devolved administrations.

### **We are aware Wales published a joint progress report with Defra on discussions to create a UK farm support framework and is taking powers through the Defra Bill.**

- As Welsh ministers have acknowledged, Wales is in a very different place from Scotland because Wales voted to leave.
- Scotland voted to remain and our position must be guided by that.
- Powers over farm support are devolved and we are clear they should stay devolved.
- Just as each part of the UK operates distinct and different CAP schemes now, so we can continue to operate farm support schemes which best support our farming and food production needs and interests in the future.

**[REDACTED]**

### **Quote from NFUS President Andrew McCornick, from an NFUS News Release on the Bill (published 12 Sept)**

- “We have been crystal clear that the interests of Scottish agriculture will be best served by Scotland setting its own future policy so that it respects and underpins the unique agricultural profile of Scotland”

### **Other Useful Quotes**

- “Agriculture is devolved to the Scottish Government and should remain devolved. And the UK Agriculture Bill should not change that” – NFUS Director of Policy Jonnie Hall, 21 September 2018, from his NFUS Blog.
- “A future agricultural policy that ignores food production will be damaging for farmers and the public alike” – NFU President Minette Batters, 12 September 2018.

## UK AGRICULTURE BILL

- “The opportunity of achieving a comprehensive reform, balancing the needs of food, farming and the countryside appears to have been missed” – Chief Executive of the Tenant Farmers’ Association George Dunn, 12 September 2018.

*[REDACTED]*

**From:** [REDACTED]

**Sent:** 01 October 2018 13:42

**To:** Cabinet Secretary for the Rural Economy <CabSecRE@gov.scot>

**Cc:** Cabinet Secretary for Government Business and Constitutional Relations

<CabSecGBCR@gov.scot>; Cabinet Secretary for the Environment, Climate Change and Land Reform

<CabSecECCLR@gov.scot>; Minister for Rural Affairs and the Natural Environment

<MinisterRANE@gov.scot>; [REDACTED]

**Subject:** UK Agriculture Bill - Update

Dear all,

Further to previous updates, [REDACTED] has asked me to pass on the following brief summary of recent and forthcoming developments on Defra's Agriculture Bill.

As ministers are aware, a legislative consent memorandum is being prepared in line with Scottish Parliament Standing Orders, and a letter was sent to the Presiding Officer explaining that on this occasion SG would not meet the 'normally within two weeks' deadline from introduction of the Bill at Westminster. In line with Standing Orders, the memorandum will explain why SG does not plan to table a legislative consent motion. [REDACTED]

Agriculture and constitution officials have also been in contact with their respective Welsh counterparts to find out how the Welsh Government plans to address the issue of legislative consent. Of course Wales is in a different position from Scotland, because the Welsh Government wishes to take powers via this Westminster Bill and must therefore recommend consent for at least part of the Bill. [REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

We understand that the Second Reading of the Bill at Westminster will be on 10 October. Defra officials have told us that from this coming week they would like to reinstate weekly four-way official-level teleconferences with the devolved administrations, which took place over the summer but stopped when the Bill was introduced.

Policy officials and lawyers are considering possible amendments to the Bill and [REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

Many thanks,

[REDACTED]

**From:** [REDACTED]

**Sent:** 02 August 2018 11:52

**To:** [REDACTED]

**Subject:** RE: EU Withdrawal - UK Agriculture Bill - SGLD briefing note - legal rural

**[REDACTED]**

Thanks for sight of this. Happy with what you say on producer organisations and on fair dealing. **[Redacted]**

On WTO, I have been arguing to Defra that this is not reserved, on the basis that it is the observation and implementation of an international obligation **[REDACTED]** rather than about the conduct of international relations. **[REDACTED]**

Also, there is an argument from Defra that they need these powers, rather than rely on the provisions in the Scotland Act 1998 etc to divvy up quantitative obligations, because what they are proposing is not about the international obligation per se, but about establishing a domestic framework that sets our own limits somewhat below what the international obligation requires so as to ensure that we never come close to breaching the limits.

Setting a domestic limit on agricultural spending is surely a devolved matter, even if there is an international obligation lurking in the background.

I've been arguing to Defra that what we need is a more rounded provision that has any regulations being made by the Secretary of State only with the agreement of the DAs. I doubt that Defra will concede this, but we might get them as far as a statutory requirement for consultation – even the Scotland Act 1998 requires that.

I also have a concern, raised with Defra, that their current provision is too broad in that it allows limits to be set on all agricultural support, not just that which is limited by the WTO AonA.

**[REDACTED]**

## Updated version of UK government's Agriculture Bill, 31 August 2018

### SG officials' analysis of main changes compared with the previous draft Bill

- In the new version of the bill, there has been a lot of reordering and small drafting changes; on the face of it, these do not appear to be significant, however officials will check through them in more detail.
- The disputed clauses on WTO, Producer Organisations and Statutory Industry Codes seem to be unchanged, and therefore the disagreement about whether they are reserved remains.

#### ***[REDACTED]***

- Part 2 of the bill, which deals with the modification of legislation in relation to England, appears to confirm that the phase out of Direct Payments in England will take place over a period of 7 years, starting in 2021.
- Part 3 of the bill, which deals with the collection and sharing of data, looks like it has been changed from a UK wide set of powers to an England-only set of powers (as we requested), but this will need to be checked with legal and policy colleagues to ensure that it is acceptable.
- Powers for Wales and Northern Ireland have been added in this version of the Bill. ***[REDACTED]***

**From:** [REDACTED]

**Sent:** 03 September 2018 13:15

**To:** Cabinet Secretary for the Rural Economy <CabSecRE@gov.scot>

**Cc:** Cabinet Secretary for the Environment, Climate Change and Land Reform <CabSecECCLR@gov.scot>; Cabinet Secretary for Government Business and Constitutional Relations <CabSecGBCR@gov.scot>; Minister for Rural Affairs and the Natural Environment <MinisterRANE@gov.scot [REDACTED]

**Subject:** Urgent: additional briefing for Ag Bill call with Gove

Cabinet Secretary/PS,

Please find attached the following material to update Mr Ewing's briefing pack.

At Annex B, the speaking note should be replaced with the attached updated version. The main changes are:

- to acknowledge receipt of the new draft of the Bill late last Friday and flag up one specific technical legal point (see below);
- to confirm that SG has now sent its legal views on the disputed clauses;
- to call into question the idea of publishing any kind of report on progress on a UK framework.
- to include a reference to the convergence funding review as requested.

Annex D, which was a Defra draft note of outstanding issues with SG's suggested tracked changes, should be replaced by the attached which is a revised Defra draft following comments from all the DAs. However this even does not carry great weight because a) it has not been agreed between administrations and b) it is already out of date because it was circulated before SGLD sent in SG's legal comments.

Annex F should be replaced by the attached new draft Bill dated 31 August. There has not been time to carry out a complete analysis of the new draft Bill, but Annex C should be supplemented by the attached short note which summarises the main changes between the previous draft Bill and the latest one. This note among other things mentions a new legal issue which Defra are saying is simply a technicality, but which we will need SGLD to analyse to check whether it is acceptable in devolution terms.

Many thanks,

[REDACTED]

## UK AGRICULTURE BILL

**ISSUE: 12 Sept** - The UK Government introduced its Agriculture Bill. It:

- a) creates powers in England to create a new policy to replace the EU Common Agricultural Policy after Brexit, and to manage the transition from the CAP,
- b) creates similar powers, at their request, for Wales and Northern Ireland (in the case of Wales, as a stopgap till the Welsh Assembly legislates), and
- c) creates UK-wide powers in three policy areas which UKG asserts are reserved.

These three areas are:

- Rules on farm payments needed to comply with WTO obligations;
- Rules on giving special status to groups of farmers ('Producer Organisations') to exempt them from some parts of competition law;
- Powers to create statutory codes of fair conduct in agri-food supply chains.

**[REDACTED]**

Defra previously announced that in England all farm income support will be removed in favour of environmental payments, and the Bill confirms that income support in England will be phased out over 7 years starting 2021.

### Top Lines

- The UK Government's Agriculture Bill completely fails to deliver on promises made to Scotland during the EU referendum.
- The Tories claimed Scottish farmers would continue to receive at least the same level of funding as they currently do.
- The Bill also rides roughshod over the devolved settlement.
- Until the attempts to grab key powers that impact on farming and food production are addressed we cannot and will not bring forward legislative consent motions for primary Brexit legislation like this.
- The UK Government might be content to leave farmers in England high and dry without the support they need to provide quality food, we are not.

### **We have serious concerns that this bill could impose unwanted policies and rules on Scottish farmers in areas of devolved competency**

- The UK Government is attempting to grab key powers on farming and food production.
- For example, as drafted, this Bill could potentially affect the Scottish Parliament's ability to provide support for active beef and sheep farmers.
- It could also impact on Less Favoured Area Support for farmers working in the toughest areas.
- Defra asserts that the UK-wide powers in its Bill only affect reserved areas, but we refute this absolutely.
- For example, Defra asserts that everything to do with World Trade Organisation rules is reserved.
- However, it has always been clear that implementing international obligations in devolved policy areas is a devolved matter.
- We will not be bringing forward legislative consent motions until this is resolved and the Sewell convention is made operable again.

## UK AGRICULTURE BILL

### **We are considering options for future legislation against the background of this wider legislative consent issue**

- We are not opposed to UK-wide frameworks where these are in Scotland's interests, and have taken part in detailed discussions around these in good faith.
- However, frameworks must be agreed, not imposed and must happen in a manner that respects and recognises devolution.
- The Agriculture Bill fails that test and must be amended so that any provisions applying across the UK have been agreed with the devolved administrations.

### **We are aware Wales published a joint progress report with Defra on discussions to create a UK farm support framework and is taking powers through the Defra Bill.**

- As Welsh Ministers have acknowledged, Wales is in a very different place from Scotland because Wales voted to leave.
- Scotland voted to remain and our position must be guided by that.
- Powers over farm support are devolved and we are clear they should stay devolved.
- Just as each part of the UK operates distinct and different CAP schemes now, so we can continue to operate farm support schemes which best support our farming and food production needs and interests in the future.

### **Quote from NFUS President Andrew McCornick, from an NFUS News Release on the Bill (published 12 Sept)**

- “We have been crystal clear that the interests of Scottish agriculture will be best served by Scotland setting its own future policy so that it respects and underpins the unique agricultural profile of Scotland”

### **Other useful quotes**

- “Agriculture is devolved to the Scottish Government and should remain devolved. And the UK Agriculture Bill should not change that” – NFUS Director of Policy Jonnie Hall, 21 September 2018, from his NFUS Blog.
- “A future agricultural policy that ignores food production will be damaging for farmers and the public alike” – NFU President Minette Batters, 12 September 2018.
- “The opportunity of achieving a comprehensive reform, balancing the needs of food, farming and the countryside appears to have been missed” – Chief Executive of the Tenant Farmers' Association George Dunn, 12 September 2018.

**[REDACTED]**

## **Update on Agriculture Bill progress**

- The Bill will receive its second Reading on 10<sup>th</sup> October
- Defra have this week shared a proposed timescale which indicates that the Committee Stage of the Bill may start on 18 Oct and run until 1 November (these are the earliest start and finish times envisaged) with the window for amendments being 19 to 31 Oct.
- ***[REDACTED]***
- ***[REDACTED]***

## **Annex A**

***[REDACTED]***

**From:** [REDACTED]

**Sent:** 05 October 2018 11:53

**To:** [redacted]

**Subject:** Agriculture Bill - possible amendments

We are meeting on Monday afternoon to discuss possible SG amendments to the Agriculture Bill.

I attach some straw-man instructions on the bits that fall to me.

**[REDACTED]**

***Attachments withheld Section 29(1) – Formulation of Scottish Government Policy***

**From:** [REDACTED]  
**Sent:** 09 August 2018 16:56  
**To:** [REDACTED]  
**Subject:** RE: UK Agriculture Bill - update

**[REDACTED]**

You are seeking advice on clause 33 of the Agriculture Bill, which relates to the World Trade Organisation Agreement on Agriculture.

I attach a note from Defra summarising the clause, which will be useful background to what the clause does.

There have been a number of discussions with Defra and the DAs on this, starting back in January when the WTO Agriculture provisions were put forward by the UK Government as an area where they thought “framework” was necessary. More recent discussions have been on their proposal for the Bill, and most recently with actual sight of their draft provisions.

**[REDACTED]**

And looking further ahead, the clause sets limits for England as well as for Scotland, Wales and NI. If we did get into a position where the WTO limits became a real constraint, it could provide some protection for the devolved administrations against policy decisions in England that took up a disproportionate share of the WTO limits and constrained our support for agriculture unfairly.

**[REDACTED]**

9 August 2018

**From:** [REDACTED]  
**Sent:** 09 October 2018 13:07  
**To:** [REDACTED]  
**Subject:** Agriculture Bill

**[REDACTED]**

I've sketched out some policy instructions for potential amendments to the Agriculture Bill. **[REDCATED]**

**[REDACTED]**

The amendments cover the WTO provisions, producer organisations and fair dealing. **[REDCATED]**

The amendments also cover geographical indications, although these will be more difficult to draft. I've mentioned red meat levy, but our hope is still that Defra will come up with the goods.

**[REDACTED]**

**[REDACTED]**

9 October 2018

**Attachment withheld** – information otherwise accessible at following link – Explanatory notes with amendments.

<https://www.gov.scot/binaries/content/documents/govscot/publications/correspondence/2018/10/proposed-amendments-to-the-uk-agriculture-bill/documents/sg-amendments-to-the-uk-agriculture-bill---explanatory-note---23-oct-2018/sg-amendments-to-the-uk-agriculture-bill---explanatory-note---23-oct-2018/govscot%3Adocument>