

FOI REQUEST (FOI 18/03161)

Question

Any correspondence (emails, letters, phone calls, handwritten notes or any other documents) between the lead official on FOI request 18/02269 and/or Scottish Government ministers and/or the SG FOI Unit and/or special advisers regarding the response to that FOI request.

Information should include: a detailed timeline (with dates) of when the lead official contacted ministers/special advisers (and vice versa); any notes or comments or suggestions offered by ministers or special advisers to the lead official; any input from the SG FOI Unit; any advice or comments from ministers/spads rejected by the lead official; any advice or comments from ministers/spads accepted by the lead official; any correspondence (as defined previously) on the use of exemptions; any correspondence (as defined previously) on material to be redacted; any information on delays to the FOI response; any information on who received the FOI to clear, when they responded and what they said; and any information on delays to the FOI response.

Response

Timeline of Communication

No.	Date	Type (meeting or correspondence)
1.	19 September 2018	E-mail from the FOI lead official to the office of the Cabinet Secretary for Finance, Economy and Fair Work
2.	19 September 2018	Draft response
3.	19 September 2018	E-mail from the FOI lead official to the office of the Cabinet Secretary for Justice
4.	19 September 2018	E-mail from the FOI lead official to the office of the Cabinet Secretary for Transport, Infrastructure and Connectivity
5.	19 September 2018	E-mail from the FOI lead official to the office of the First Minister
6.	19 September 2018	E-mail from the First Minister's office to the FOI lead official
7.	19 September 2018	E-mail from the Cabinet Secretary for Transport, Infrastructure and Connectivity's Office to the FOI lead official
8.	24 September 2018	E-mail from the Cabinet Secretary for Justice's office to the FOI lead official
9.	25 September 2018	E-mail from the FOI Lead Official to the Minister for Rural Affairs and the Natural Environment's Office
10.	26 September 2018	E-mail from the office of the Minister for Rural Affairs and the Natural Environment's Office to the FOI lead official
11.	26 September 2018	E-mail from the FOI Lead Official to the Minister for Rural Affairs and the Natural Environment's Office
12.	26 September 2018	E-mail from the office of the Minister for Rural Affairs and the Natural Environment's Office to the FOI lead official
13.	27 September 2018	E-mail from the FOI lead official to Special Advisers office
14.	1 October 2018	E-mail from the FOI Lead Official to the Cabinet Secretary for Finance, Economy and Fair Work
15.	1 October 2018	Draft response letter

No.	Date	Type (meeting or correspondence)
16.	1 October 2018	Draft response
17.	9 October 2018	E-mail from the Cabinet Secretary for Finance, Economy and Fair Work's office to the FoI Lead Official

Communication content

Document 1 - E-mail from the FoI lead official to the office of Cabinet Secretary for Finance, Economy and Fair Work

From: [Redacted]

Sent: 19 September 2018 09:33

To: Cabinet Secretary for Finance, Economy and Fair Work

Subject: FMEL FoI - Trawl Request

Importance: High

[Redacted]

We have an FMEL FoI request asking for details of all correspondence between Jim McColl and Ministers, SCS or SpAds. Attached is where we have gotten to so far with the knowledge that we have.

I know PO don't tend to keep any information but could someone please have a look and let me know if Mr MacKay has had any other engagements with Mr McColl that aren't on our list?

Many thanks

[Redacted]

Document 2 – Draft response

MR [REDACTED] FOI REQUEST (FOI 18/02269)

Question

Details of any meetings or correspondence between SG ministers SCS or SpAds and Jim McColl regarding either Ferguson's Shipyard or loans and grants to Clyde Blowers Limited.

Response

We have separated the response between the two parts of the question, namely:

- (I) Details of any meetings or correspondence between SG ministers, SCS [members of the Senior Civil Service] or SpAds [special advisers] and Jim McColl regarding Ferguson's Shipyard;
- (II) Details of any meetings or correspondence between SG ministers, SCS [members of the Senior Civil Service] or SpAds [special advisers] and Jim McColl regarding loans and grants to Clyde Blowers Limited.

Part One – Details of any meetings or correspondence between SG ministers, SCS [members of the Senior Civil Service] or SpAds [special advisers] and Jim McColl regarding Ferguson's Shipyard

Date	Type (meeting or correspondence)
12 July 2017	Meeting between DG Economy and the Chief Executive of Transport Scotland and Jim McColl
27 July 2017	Phone call between the Chief Executive of Transport Scotland and Jim McColl
27 July 2017	Phone call between DG Economy and Jim McColl
27 July 2017	Phone call between the Cabinet Secretary for Finance and the Constitution and Jim McColl
28 July 2017	Email from Jim McColl to the Cabinet Secretary for Finance and the Constitution and DG Economy
2 August 2017	Email from Jim McColl to the Cabinet Secretary for Finance and the Constitution, the Cabinet Secretary for Economy, Jobs and Fair Work and DG Economy
2 August 2017	Email from DG Economy to Jim McColl
2 August 2017	Email from Jim McColl to DG Economy
2 August 2017	Phone call between DG Economy and Jim McColl
5 September 2017	Letter from Jim McColl to Scottish Ministers
2 October 2017	Phone call between DG Economy and Jim McColl
6 October 2017	Phone call between the Minister for Transport and the Islands and Jim McColl
6 November 2017	Letter from Jim McColl to the Minister for Transport and the Islands
9 November 2017	Letter from the Minister for Transport and the Islands to Jim McColl
13 November 2017	Letter from Jim McColl to the Minister for Transport and the Islands
21 December 2017	Meeting between DG Economy and Jim McColl
22 December 2017	Phone call between the Minister for Transport and the Islands and Jim McColl
19 January 2018	Meeting between DG Economy and Jim McColl
2 February 2018	Phone call between DG Economy and Jim McColl
5 February 2018	Email from Jim McColl to DG Economy
6 February 2018	Email from DG Economy to Jim McColl
6 February 2018	Email from Jim McColl to DG Economy
15 February 2018	Email from Jim McColl to DG Economy
20 February 2018	Meeting between the Minister for Transport and the Islands and Jim McColl
14 March 2018	Email from DG Economy to Jim McColl
20 March 2018	Email from Jim McColl to the Minister for Transport and the Islands
26 March 2018	Phone call between the Minister for Transport and the Islands and Jim McColl
30 March 2018	Email from Jim McColl to the Minister for Transport and the Islands
3 April 2018	Phone call between the First Minister and Jim McColl
10 April	Meeting between Jim McColl and Erik Ostergaard; DG Economy and Chief Executive of Transport Scotland in attendance
24 April 2018	Phone call between the Cabinet Secretary for Finance and the Constitution and Jim McColl
4 May 2018	Phone call between DG Economy and Jim McColl
13 May 2018	Email from Jim McColl to the Cabinet Secretary for Finance and the Constitution
21 May 2018	Email from Jim McColl to DG Economy
22 May 2018	Email from Jim McColl to DG Economy

23 May 2018	Email from Jim McColl to DG Economy
24 May 2018	Phone call between the Cabinet Secretary for Finance and the Constitution and Jim McColl
2 June 2018	Email from Jim McColl to DG Economy
5 June 2018	Email from DG Economy to Jim McColl
5 June 2018	Meeting between the Cabinet Secretary for Finance and the Constitution and Jim McColl
6 June 2018	Email from Jim McColl to DG Economy
14 June 2018	Email from Jim McColl to DG Economy

Part Two

The Scottish Government holds no information regarding loans and grants to Clyde Blowers Limited.

Document 3 - E-mail from the FoI lead official to the office of the Cabinet Secretary for Justice

From: [Redacted]
Sent: 19 September 2018 09:37
To: Cabinet Secretary for Justice
Subject: FMEL FoI - Trawl Request
Importance: High

PO

We have an FMEL FoI request asking for details of all correspondence between Jim McColl and Ministers, SCS or SpAds. Attached [document 2] is where we have gotten to so far with the knowledge that we have.

As the Cabinet Secretary was still responsible for Transport at the time, this includes correspondence he was involved in. Are you able to tell if the Cabinet Secretary has had any other engagements with Mr McColl that aren't on our list?

Many thanks
[Redacted]

Document 4: E-mail from the FoI lead official to the office of the Cabinet Secretary for Transport, Infrastructure and Connectivity

From: [Redacted]
Sent: 19 September 2018 09:38
To: Cabinet Secretary for Transport, Infrastructure and Connectivity
Subject: FMEL FoI - Trawl Request
Importance: High

PO

We have an FMEL FoI request asking for details of all correspondence between Jim McColl and Ministers, SCS or SpAds. Attached [document 2] is where we have gotten to so far with the knowledge that we have.

Are you able to tell me if the Cabinet Secretary has had any other engagements with Mr McColl that aren't on our list?

Many thanks
[Redacted]

Document 5: E-mail from the FoI lead official to the office of the First Minister

From: [Redacted]
Sent: 19 September 2018 09:41
To: First Minister
Subject: FMEL FoI - Trawl Request
Importance: High

PO

We have an FMEL FoI request asking for details of all correspondence between Jim McColl and Ministers, SCS or SpAds regarding FMEL. Attached [document 2] is where we have gotten to so far with the knowledge that we have.

Are you able to tell me if the First Minister has had any other engagements with Mr McColl other than the phone call we have listed on April 3rd 2018?

Many thanks
[Redacted]

Document 6: E-mail from the First Minister's office to the FoI lead official

From: [Redacted] **On Behalf Of** First Minister
Sent: 19 September 2018 11:15
To: [Redacted]
Subject: RE: FMEL FoI - Trawl Request

Hi [Redacted]

The First Minister met with Jim McColl on 31 May 2017.

Kind regards,
[Redacted]

Document 7: E-mail from the Cabinet Secretary for Transport, Infrastructure and Connectivity's office to the FoI lead official

From: [Redacted] **On Behalf Of** Cabinet Secretary for Transport, Infrastructure and Connectivity
Sent: 19 September 2018 16:02
To: [Redacted] Cabinet Secretary for Transport, Infrastructure and Connectivity
Subject: RE: FMEL FoI - Trawl Request

[Redacted]

We had a number of email exchanges with Mr McColl's office to set up an introductory chat that happened on 13 August.

The attached email covers the contact.

Let me know if you need anything further.

Thanks
[Redacted]

Document 8: E-mail from the Cabinet Secretary for Justice's office to the FoI lead official

From: [Redacted] **On Behalf Of** Cabinet Secretary for Justice
Sent: 24 September 2018 14:11
To: [Redacted] Cabinet Secretary for Justice
Cc: [Redacted]
Subject: RE: FMEL FoI - Trawl Request

Hi [Redacted]

I've searched our inboxes and it's a nil return but ours would only cover Mr Yousaf from his appointment as Cab Sec Justice from 26th June onwards.

Thanks,
[Redacted]

Document 9: E-mail from the FoI lead official to the Minister for Rural Affairs and the Natural Environment's Office

From: [Redacted]
Sent: 25 September 2018 23:59
To: Minister for Rural Affairs and the Natural Environment; [Redacted]
Subject: RE: FMEL FoI - Trawl Request

[Redacted]

See attached [document 2]. The request is for Details of any meetings or correspondence between SG ministers SCS or SpAds and Jim McColl regarding either Ferguson's Shipyard or loans and grants to Clyde Blowers Limited.

For the meetings we've included links to the Ministerial engagements publication and we've searched Maccs for correspondence too. Everything we've found is in the attached.

Cheers, [Redacted]

Document 10: E-mail from the Minister for Rural Affairs and the Natural Environment's Office to the FoI lead official

From: [Redacted] **On Behalf Of** Minister for Rural Affairs and the Natural Environment
Sent: 26 September 2018 08:31
To: [Redacted] Minister for Rural Affairs and the Natural Environment; [Redacted]
Subject: RE: FMEL FoI - Trawl Request

[Redacted]

I've had a look through the old Transport box and found the attached, which don't appear on the list you provided.

[Redacted]

Document 11: E-mail from the FoI lead official to the Minister for Rural Affairs and the Natural Environment's Office

From: [Redacted] **On Behalf Of** Strategic Industrial Projects
Sent: 26 September 2018 17:23
To: Minister for Rural Affairs and the Natural Environment; [Redacted]
Subject: RE: FMEL FoI - Trawl Request

Thanks [Redacted]

There's one email I can't locate. It may be referred to another email that's why it's on the list. It is in the old mailbox?

30 March 2018	Email from Jim McColl to the Minister for Transport and the Islands
---------------	---

Cheers, [Redacted]

Document 12: E-mail from the office of the Minister for Rural Affairs and the Natural Environment's Office to the FoI lead official

From: [Redacted] **On Behalf Of** Minister for Rural Affairs and the Natural Environment
Sent: 26 September 2018 17:28
To: [Redacted] Minister for Rural Affairs and the Natural Environment; [Redacted]
Subject: RE: FMEL FoI - Trawl Request

[Redacted]

Please see attached, I think that's what you were looking for.

Thanks

[Redacted]

Document 13: E-mail from the FoI lead official to the Special Advisers office

From: [Redacted]
Sent: 27 September 2018 14:42
To: FoI SpAds PO
Cc: [Redacted] Rollison R (Richard); [Redacted] Maxwell S (Stewart) (Special Adviser); McCaig C (Callum); [Redacted] Pacitti F (Frances); DG Economy; McAllan M (Mary); PS/Transport Scotland
Subject: FoI 18 02269 Bateman - Proposed response

SpAds

We received FoI/18/02269 from Mr [Redacted] who asked for: "Details of any meetings or correspondence between SG ministers SCS or SpAds and Jim McColl regarding either Ferguson's Shipyard or loans and grants to Clyde Blowers Limited."

Attached [document 16] is the draft reply letter and the draft response. We have consulted relevant private offices and searched the MACCS system. For Ministerial meetings we have pointed Mr [Redacted] to published information.

We would be very grateful if you could clear the response before it goes for Ministerial approval. Please note this case is late as it was due for response by 21-09-2018.

Regards,

[Redacted]

Document 14: E-mail from FoI lead official to the Cabinet Secretary for Finance, Economy and Fair Work

From: [Redacted]
Sent: 01 October 2018 13:57
To: Cabinet Secretary for Finance, Economy and Fair Work

Cc: Cabinet Secretary for Transport, Infrastructure and Connectivity; Rollison R (Richard); [Redacted]
Subject: For Immediate Response - FMEL FoI Request
Importance: High

PO
Cc: For Info

We received an FoI request from Mr [Redacted] requesting details of all meetings between Jim McColl and Ministers, SpAds or SCS.

Attached is the proposed reply letter and response.

Please note this FoI is now late. I would be grateful if this could be cleared by the Cabinet Secretary asap to avoid any further delays. Sincere apologies for the late turnaround.

Please be aware there are a further 6 FMEL related Fols currently being worked on.

Kind regards
[Redacted]

Document 15 – Draft response letter

Economic Development Directorate



Scottish Government
Riaghaltas na h-Alba
gov.scot

T: [Redacted]
E: [Redacted]

Mr [Redacted]

Sent by email to: [\[Redacted\]](#)

«Date»

Our ref: Fol/18/02269

Dear [Redacted]

REQUEST UNDER THE FREEDOM OF INFORMATION (SCOTLAND) ACT 2002 (FOISA)

Thank you for your request dated 24 August 2018 under the Freedom of Information (Scotland) Act 2002 (FOISA).

Your request

You asked the Scottish Government for: “Details of any meetings or correspondence between SG ministers SCS or SpAds and Jim McColl regarding either Ferguson's Shipyard or loans and grants to Clyde Blowers Limited.”

Response to your request

I enclose a response to the information you requested.

Your right to request a review

If you are unhappy with this response to your FOI request, you may ask us to carry out an internal review of the response, by writing to Mary McAllan, Director of Economic Development, 3rd Floor, 5 Atlantic Quay, Glasgow, G2 8LU
([REDACTED])

Your review request should explain why you are dissatisfied with this response, and should be made within 40 working days from the date when you received this letter. We will complete the review and tell you the result, within 20 working days from the date when we receive your review request.

If you are not satisfied with the result of the review, you then have the right to appeal to the Scottish Information Commissioner.

More detailed information on your appeal rights is available on the Commissioner's website at:

<http://www.itspublicknowledge.info/YourRights/Unhappywiththeresponse/AppealingtoCommissioner.aspx>.

Yours sincerely

Jennifer Moore

Document 16 – Draft response

[REDACTED] **FOI REQUEST (FOI 18/02269)**

Question

Details of any meetings or correspondence between SG ministers SCS or SpAds and Jim McColl regarding either Ferguson's Shipyard or loans and grants to Clyde Blowers Limited.

Response

Ministerial Engagements

The Scottish Government proactively publishes all Ministerial engagements with information on the date, organisation/attendees and the subject of the engagement.

Details of Scottish Ministers' engagements can be found on the Scottish Government website here:

https://beta.gov.scot/publications/?term=Ministerial&publicationTypes=transparency_data. The latest published information covers the period to June 2018, information for July 2018 is due for publication in early October and August 2018 in data in early November.

Please note that: (a) one meeting between the then Cabinet Secretary for Finance and the Constitution (Derek Mackay MSP) and Jim McColl which took place on 5 June 2018 was not recorded on the published log due to an administrative error and (b) Cabinet Secretary for Transport, infrastructure and Connectivity (Michael Matheson MSP) met Jim McColl on 13 August.

Ministerial engagements for the period before May 2016 have been archived and can be viewed here: <https://beta.gov.scot/publications/ministerial-engagements-travel-and-gifts-archive/>.

Other than Ministerial Engagements

For the remainder of the response, we have separated it by subject matter, thus:

- (III) Details of any meetings [non-Ministerial] or correspondence between SG Ministers, SCS [SG Senior Civil Servants] or SpAds [SG special advisers] and Jim McColl regarding Ferguson's Shipyard;
- (IV) Details of any meetings [non-Ministerial] or correspondence between SG Ministers, SCS [SG Senior Civil Servants] or SpAds [SG special advisers] and Jim McColl regarding loans and grants to Clyde Blowers Limited.

One – Details of any meetings [non-Ministerial] or correspondence between SG Ministers, SCS [SG Senior Civil Servants] or SpAds [SG special advisers] and Jim McColl regarding Ferguson's Shipyard

No.	Date	Type (meeting or correspondence)
1.	4 May 2017	Meeting between Liz Ditchburn (Director General Economy, Scottish Government), Mary McAllan (Director of Economic Development, Scottish Government), Gordon Wales (Chief Financial Officer, Scottish Government) and Adrian Gillespie (Director Operations, Scottish Enterprise) and Jim McColl (Chairman and CEO Clyde Blowers Capital)
2.	7 June 2017	Meeting between DG Economy, John Nicholls (Transport Scotland), representatives of CMAL and Jim McColl
3.	12 July 2017	Meeting between DG Economy, Roy Brannen (Chief Executive of Transport Scotland) and Jim McColl
4.	28 July 2017	Email from Jim McColl to the Cabinet Secretary for Finance and the Constitution and DG Economy

No.	Date	Type (meeting or correspondence)
5.	2 August 2017	Email from Jim McColl to the Cabinet Secretary for Finance and the Constitution, the Cabinet Secretary for Economy, Jobs and Fair Work and DG Economy
6.	2 August 2017	Email from DG Economy to Jim McColl
7.	2 August 2017	Email from Jim McColl to DG Economy
8.	10 August 2017	Email from Jim McColl to DG Economy
9.	28 August	Meeting between DG Economy, Roy Brannen (Transport Scotland), Gordon Wales (Scottish Government), Richard Rollison (Scottish Government) and Jim McColl
10.	30 August 2017	Letter from DG Economy to Jim McColl
11.	31 August 2017	Letter from Jim McColl to DG Economy
12.	31 August 2017	Letter from DG Economy to Jim McColl
13.	5 September 2017	Letter from Jim McColl to Scottish Ministers
14.	6 November 2017	Letter from Jim McColl to the Minister for Transport and the Islands
15.	9 November 2017	Letter from the Minister for Transport and the Islands to Jim McColl
16.	13 November 2017	Letter from Jim McColl to the Minister for Transport and the Islands
17.	21 December 2017	Meeting between DG Economy and Jim McColl
18.	19 January 2018	Meeting between DG Economy and Jim McColl
19.	5 February 2018	Email from Jim McColl to DG Economy
20.	6 February 2018	Email from DG Economy to Jim McColl
21.	6 February 2018	Email from Jim McColl to DG Economy
22.	15 February 2018	Email from Jim McColl to DG Economy
23.	14 March 2018	Email from DG Economy to Jim McColl
24.	16 March 2018	Email from Jim McColl to DG Economy
25.	16 March 2018	Email from DG Economy to Jim McColl
26.	20 March 2018	Email from Jim McColl to the Minister for Transport and the Islands
27.	30 March 2018	Email from Jim McColl to the Minister for Transport and the Islands
28.	10 April	Meeting between Jim McColl and Erik Ostergaard (CMAL); DG Economy and Chief Executive of Transport Scotland in attendance
29.	12 April 2018	Email from Jim McColl to DG Economy
30.	24 April 2018	Email from Jim McColl to DG Economy
31.	5 May 2018	Email from Jim McColl to DG Economy
32.	5 May 2018	Email from DG Economy to Jim McColl
33.	7 May 2018	Email from Jim McColl to DG Economy
34.	13 May 2018	Email from Jim McColl to DG Economy
35.	14 May 2018	Email from Jim McColl to DG Economy
36.	21 May 2018	Email from Jim McColl to DG Economy
37.	22 May 2018	Email from Jim McColl to DG Economy
38.	23 May 2018	Email from Jim McColl to DG Economy
39.	2 June 2018	Email from Jim McColl to DG Economy
40.	5 June 2018	Email from DG Economy to Jim McColl
41.	6 June 2018	Email from Jim McColl to DG Economy
42.	6 June 2018	Email from Jim McColl to DG Economy
43.	7 June 2018	Email from Jim McColl to DG Economy
44.	11 June 2018	Email from DG Economy to Jim McColl
45.	14 June 2018	Email from Jim McColl to DG Economy

No.	Date	Type (meeting or correspondence)
46.	13 August 2018	Meeting between the Cabinet Secretary for Transport, Infrastructure and Connectivity and Jim McColl, Frances Pacitti (Transport Scotland) in attendance
47.	16 August 2018	Meeting between Jim McColl, DG Economy, Chief Executive of Transport Scotland and Mary McAllan (Director of Economic Development, Scottish Government)

Two – Details of any meetings [non-Ministerial] or correspondence between SG Ministers, SCS [SG Senior Civil Servants] or SpAds [SG special advisers] and Jim McColl regarding loans and grants to Clyde Blowers Limited.

The Scottish Government holds no information regarding loans and grants to Clyde Blowers Limited.

Document 17: E-mail from the office of the Cabinet Secretary for Finance, Economy and Fair Work's office to the FoI lead official

From: [Redacted] **On Behalf Of** Cabinet Secretary for Finance, Economy and Fair Work

Sent: 09 October 2018 18:57

To: [Redacted] Cabinet Secretary for Finance, Economy and Fair Work

Cc: Cabinet Secretary for Transport, Infrastructure and Connectivity; Rollison R (Richard); [Redacted]

Subject: RE: For Immediate Response - FMEL FoI Request

[Redacted]

Cab Sec is content to clear.

[Redacted]