

COPIES OF EMAILS FOR RELEASE WITH REDACTIONS

14 February 2015 to 13 February 2016

From: Kellett J (Janine)

Sent: 11 February 2015 16:35

To: [REDACTED];[REDACTED];[REDACTED];[REDACTED];[REDACTED];[REDACTED];[REDACTED];
[REDACTED];[REDACTED];[REDACTED]

Cc: [REDACTED];[REDACTED];[REDACTED];[REDACTED];[REDACTED];[REDACTED];[REDACTED]

Subject: Saltire Prize update - February 2015

Dear Challenge Committee Members,

It is almost a year since we last met. I hope you are all well.

There has been a lot of activity in Scotland since our last meeting on 18 March 2014. We have had a referendum on Scottish independence; we have a new First Minister, Nicola Sturgeon; and we have a new Scottish cabinet. Some ministers have stayed on in their previous roles, including our energy minister Fergus Ewing and the environment secretary Richard Lochhead.

It has been a turbulent year for the marine sector. We witnessed the sad demise of the UK's leading wave technology developer, Pelamis Wave Power, in November 2014, while our other leading wave company, Aquamarine Power, took the decision to downsize its business significantly in December 2014. Both had been competitors for the Saltire Prize. On a more positive note for one of the competitors, Atlantis Resources reached financial close on the first phase of the MeyGen tidal energy project in September 2014.

After our last meeting and the Committee's decision that a prize redesign was needed, [REDACTED]. An updated submission will go to ministers proposing an overhaul of the Saltire Prize and the other Saltire Prize-badged events such as the Saltire Prize medal and lecture. We have decided that instead of offering an annual medal and presenting an annual lecture, it would make more sense to offer these in alternate years. That means there will not be a Saltire Prize medal awarded at this year's Scottish Renewables conference dinner. We hope to be in a position to launch a new Saltire Prize later this year - ideally at the Scottish Renewables marine conference in September 2015.

I would therefore propose that the Challenge Committee does not meet, as it usually does, in the margins of the Scottish Renewables annual conference in March 2015. It is more likely that we will have a September meeting this year, although a conference call may be needed before that.

The developments of the last year show there are still significant hurdles for wave and tidal technologies to overcome in the path to commercial roll-out. It also

confirms what the Challenge Committee already knew, that a prize for array deployment is premature when developers may need to reconsider the fundamentals of device design.

The lessons we have learned are that more support is needed for research and development and demonstration, and that support mechanisms have to be tailored to the technology type. You may have heard that we recently announced a completely new initiative to support wave technology development. Wave Energy Scotland (WES) will bring together the best engineering and academic minds to collaborate in a programme to improve device, subsystem and component design. WES has already acquired the intellectual property and a range of assets from Pelamis Wave Power and the WES team is in discussion with a number of wave developers about possible projects. The first open calls for bids for collaborative projects between technology developers and WES are being prepared and details will be announced in the coming weeks.

I will write to you again when I have feedback from ministers on the revised proposals. In the meantime, if you have any questions, do not hesitate to get in touch.

Best wishes,

Janine

Janine Kellett
Head of Offshore Renewables Policy Team
Energy and Climate Change Directorate
[REDACTED]
[REDACTED]

From: Kellett J (Janine)
Sent: 11 March 2015 11:26
To: [REDACTED]
Subject: RE: RONAMIC's Ocean Power

Dear Mr Helder,

Thank you for your interest in the Scottish Government's £10 million Saltire Prize. I'm afraid I cannot find any previous correspondence from you. Can you advise when you made contact and how?

The Scottish Government recognises that there are many ways in which energy can be harnessed from the power of the sea. Different technologies are at different stages of development and this competition has chosen to focus on the conversion of energy from waves and tidal streams into electrical output.

As you will have noted from the recent article in the press, this is an ambitious prize. The competition guidelines were developed in 2008 and you'll be aware that

the whole energy sector is now operating in very different circumstances. The marine renewables industry has taken momentous steps forward since that date, but the path to commercialisation is taking longer and proving more difficult than all of us initially expected. The Saltire Prize Challenge Committee – the independent group charged with overseeing the prize – has been keeping the prize criteria and competitor progress under review and we may consider options for reshaping the prize to better reflect the circumstances of the wave and tidal sectors. In the meantime, I have attached to this email a copy of the current Saltire Prize competition guidelines and application form, which will give you more information on the criteria for entering the competition. Section 7 of the competition guidelines deals specifically with the qualification requirements.

You might also wish to visit our website at www.saltireprize.com.

Thanks again for your interest and I am sorry that it has proved so difficult to reach us.

Best wishes,

Janine

Janine Kellett
Head of Offshore Renewables Policy Team
Energy and Climate Change Directorate
[REDACTED]
[REDACTED]

From: Ronamic | Casper Helder [REDACTED]
Sent: 09 March 2015 11:13
To: Jowitt, Paul W
Subject: RONAMIC's Ocean Power

Dear Professor Jowitt,

We tried several times to directly contact Saltire prize, but we don't hear anything back.

Maybe you, as one of the main committee members of Saltire prize, can help me.

RONAMIC developed a strong integrated device which consists of a TEC (tidal), a WEC (wave) and two VAWT wind turbines.

This will result in a fundamental and substantial lower LCOE than any other current Ocean Power systems in the world.

Main features are the strong synergy of many systems, components and facilities.

We cooperate with various industrial parties and universities and NGO's over the whole world to develop Ecological Sustainable Ocean Power.

Shell and TATA Steel are key partners on this project, we are working with them for already a few months.

The device is reliable, survivable and is capable of generating dispatchable high value renewable electricity on demand. Promising performances are:

- Generation of multi MW clean electricity from wave, tidal and wind from Ocean Power, including shifted electricity generation(energy storage)
- Energy storage on the grid side
- Grid services like leveling the demand curve (load leveling) and ensuring power quality and reliability by providing ancillary services

The basic principle of the TEC was approved for the first step in Shell's GameChanger.

For the next phase, Shell and RONAMIC decided that an independent expert in Ocean Power has to research the feasibility of the RONAMIC technology. DNV-GL will do this research and feasibility study.

In the attachment a leaflet pitch is included.

We are aware of recent news of Saltire prize: *Saltire Prize Unattainable for Scottish Wave, Tidal Energy Developers*

Link http://www.offshorewind.biz/2015/03/02/saltire-prize-unattainable-for-scottish-wave-tidal-energy-developers/?utm_source=emark&utm_medium=email&utm_campaign=Daily%20update%20Offshore%20Wind%2C%202015-03-03&uid=48467

Can you tell me if and how we can submit our project proposal in the Saltire Prize?

Best regards,

Casper Helder

RONAMIC

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

From: Kellett J (Janine)

Sent: 01 April 2015 18:08

To: Minister for Business, Energy and Tourism

Cc: [REDACTED];[REDACTED];[REDACTED];[REDACTED];[REDACTED];[REDACTED];[REDACTED]
[REDACTED];[REDACTED];[REDACTED];[REDACTED];[REDACTED];[REDACTED];[REDACTED];
[REDACTED]

Subject: Saltire Prize - Redesign - submission to ministers - April 2015



Kevin

Please find attached a submission asking Mr Ewing to approve plans to redesign the Saltire Prize.

Regards,

Janine

Janine Kellett
Head of Offshore Renewables Policy Team
Scottish Government

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

From: Janine Kellett
Energy Division
1 April 2015
Minister for Business, Energy and Tourism

SALTIRE PRIZE REDESIGN

Purpose

1. To ask you to approve plans to review and redesign the Saltire Prize, in light of recent developments in the marine energy sector.

Priority

2. Routine.

Background

3. The £10 million Saltire Prize was established seven years ago to accelerate the commercial development of wave and tidal technologies. It fulfilled a commitment set out in the 2007 SNP manifesto to launch a Saltire Prize to promote future innovation and technological endeavour, with a focus on developing Scotland's renewable generation capacity. The competition initially attracted strong global interest and received over 150 expressions of interest from 31 different countries, but only five companies formally entered the competition: Aquamarine Power (wave), Pelamis Wave Power (wave), MeyGen (tidal), ScottishPower Renewables (tidal) and West Islay Tidal (tidal).

4. The original Saltire Prize competition guidelines were developed in 2008 following consultation with leading representatives of the marine energy sector and the scientific community. A number of prize design options were considered by a

technical advisory panel. Two options were then presented to the Saltire Prize Challenge Committee, who made the final decision.

5. The marine renewables industry has taken momentous steps forward since 2008, but the path to commercialisation is taking longer and proving more difficult than any of us expected. There is increasing recognition that the development paths of wave and tidal stream technologies are quite different. The Scottish Government took an early lead in introducing a more tailored approach to the way we support the two sectors by refocusing our Marine Renewables Commercialisation Fund and establishing Wave Energy Scotland. However, this is not reflected in the Saltire Prize, meaning that wave and tidal technologies are competing against each other in spite of their differences in maturity.

First extension to Saltire Prize timeline

The competition was originally scheduled to run until 2015. However, industry feedback following a consultation in 2009 was that an extension of the timeline was necessary to provide competitors with sufficient time to secure funding, consents and a grid connection. The then enterprise minister Jim Mather announced in March 2010 that the competition period would be extended until 2017. [REDACTED]

Saltire Prize Challenge Committee recommendation

6. The prize has always been considered ambitious but it has been clear for some time that the challenge of achieving more than **100 gigawatt hours of electrical output over a continuous two year period** is too high and that the extended deadline of 2017 is still too soon. To win the prize, a competitor would need to have a 20MW scale project fully installed and operating by this summer. Even the most advanced of our Saltire Prize competitors, MeyGen, will not begin installing its 6MW demonstration project until 2016. At its meeting in March 2014, the Saltire Prize Challenge Committee – the independent group that oversees the prize – agreed that the challenge as set was not achievable and that the prize was no longer a credible stimulus to the sector. **The committee concluded that a review was needed.**

[REDACTED]

Recent developments in the sector and press interest

7. Last year was a turbulent one for the marine sector. We witnessed the sad demise of one of our Saltire Prize competitors, Pelamis Wave Power, in November 2014, while another competitor, Aquamarine Power, took the decision to downsize its business significantly in December 2014.

[REDACTED]

From: Andrew Buglass [REDACTED]
Sent: 09 April 2015 13:41
To: Kellett J (Janine)
Subject: Re: Form Submission - New Form - Saltire Prize Challenge Committee

Dear Janine

Thanks -please find updated bio attached.

Best for a call for me would be tomorrow at around 1030 if that works for you? I'm travelling so it would be great if you could call me on my mobile (number below).

I look forward to speaking soon - please let me know if that time is not convenient.

all the best
Andrew

Andrew Buglass

Andrew Buglass has been a developer and a financier of large scale energy projects since 1992. His experience spans energy projects in over 30 countries, working for PowerGen plc and Unocal Corporation among others. From 2009 to 2014, Andrew ran Royal Bank of Scotland's energy financing team in London, and led it to become the leading lender to the UK renewables sector 2011-13.

At the end of 2014, Andrew established a consulting practice which provides strategic and commercial advice to innovative companies delivering low carbon projects and emergent technologies.

Andrew is a regular expert contributor to government and industry groups on policy and financing issues. Much of this work has been carried out in his role as Co Chair of the Low Carbon Finance Group. In addition, he holds a number of other advisory and non executive roles.

Andrew Buglass

[REDACTED] [REDACTED]
[REDACTED] [REDACTED]
[REDACTED] [REDACTED]
[REDACTED] [REDACTED]

[REDACTED]



On 9 Apr 2015, at 14:40, [REDACTED] wrote:

Thanks Andrew. I am delighted that you are remaining a member of the committee.

Terry did send me an email and he is also very keen for you to remain on the group so I will add your new contact details to our mailing list. We will also need an updated biographical note from you for our Saltire Prize website.

<http://www.saltireprize.com/committee/andrew-buglass>

It would be great to have a chat in the next few days. I'm around tomorrow, Monday and Tuesday. Let me know when suits you.

Best wishes,

Janine

Janine Kellett

Head of Offshore Renewables Policy Team

Energy and Climate Change Directorate

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

From: Andrew Buglass [REDACTED]

Sent: 08 April 2015 15:27

To: Kellett J (Janine)

Subject: Re: Form Submission - New Form - Saltire Prize Challenge Committee

Dear Janine

It's good to hear from you - I hope you're well. Thanks for the contact - I did let Terry know that I'd be delighted to remain a member of the Committee but held off contacting you as I thought he, as Chair, should have a chance to discuss it with you first.

Please see below my new contact details. I will be very happy to have a chat over the coming days if helpful to give you a little background on what I'm now doing. I'm very keen to continue to help with matters Saltire, and indeed offshore renewables generally, if I can!

Looking forward to speaking before long

All the best

Andrew

Andrew Buglass

[REDACTED] [REDACTED]

[REDACTED] [REDACTED]

[REDACTED] [REDACTED]

[REDACTED] [REDACTED]

[REDACTED] [REDACTED]

[REDACTED]



On 8 Apr 2015, at 14:08, Squarespace [REDACTED] wrote:

Name: Janine Kellett

Email Address: [REDACTED]

Subject: Saltire Prize Challenge Committee

Message: Dear Andrew,

I hope you are well. I understand from Terry Garcia that you are no longer at RBS. We are still keen for you to remain a member of the Saltire Prize Challenge Committee if you are willing and able. If you wish to remain a member, can you send me your new contact details? I will, of course, understand if you would prefer to step down.

Best wishes,

Janine

(Sent via *Buglass Energy Advisory*)

From: Kellett J (Janine)

Sent: 10 April 2015 15:12

To: [REDACTED];[REDACTED];[REDACTED];[REDACTED];[REDACTED];[REDACTED];[REDACTED];
[REDACTED];[REDACTED];[REDACTED]

Cc: [REDACTED];[REDACTED];[REDACTED];[REDACTED];[REDACTED];[REDACTED];[REDACTED]

Subject: Saltire Prize update - April 2015

Dear Challenge Committee members,

As you are aware, we recently asked the energy minister to approve plans to redesign the Saltire Prize. I am pleased to tell you that Mr Ewing has agreed to this recommendation.

Scottish Renewables – the trade association for Scotland’s renewable energy sector – has offered to convene a focus group of its members to suggest revised competition criteria. They will do this initial scoping work free of charge and present a number of options. As the focus group members will be industry experts rather than prize experts, we would then need to seek validation of these options from an independent expert with an understanding of innovation prizes. We will tender for this work in the usual way. It would be for the Challenge Committee to make the final decision on the revised prize guidelines.

On Challenge Committee involvement in the process, there are a number of options. You can get involved now; after the focus group stage; or after the expert validation stage. I would be interested in your thoughts on this.

I would also welcome your views on the initial ‘instruction’ to Scottish Renewables. So that the focus group is clear on the task, I propose something along the following lines.

The Saltire Prize Challenge Committee would like the focus group to suggest three new prize options that:

- (i) recognise the different technological maturity of wave and tidal technologies;
- (ii) are likely to drive behaviour in the ocean energy sector;
- (iii) will help keep Scotland at the forefront of ocean energy innovation;
- (iv) strike the right balance between being ambitious and achievable;
- (v) will encourage the supply chain to work with developers to help address barriers to deployment of ocean energy technologies.

I would be happy to arrange a video conference so that we can discuss this instruction in more detail. This will also give us the opportunity to discuss how we make the best use of your time in the redesign process.

I will send an online poll separately to check your availability.

[REDACTED]

In the meantime, I welcome any initial comments or questions that you may have.

Best wishes,

Janine

Janine Kellett

Head of Offshore Renewables Policy Team
Energy and Climate Change Directorate

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

From: JP Office [REDACTED]

Sent: 11 April 2015 10:57

To: Kellett J (Janine)

Subject: RE: Saltire Prize update - April 2015

Dear Janine

Thanks for your email yesterday, and for the update that this included.

That sounds like a pretty good process, in the circumstances, and I'm pleased to hear that this will still be going ahead. [REDACTED]

In terms of the Challenge Committee, and my own role on that, I think it would be most useful for me to get involved after that final (expert validation) stage. It looks to me as if things will be pretty much sorted before then – by people much more qualified than myself!

Best wishes
Jonathon

Jonathon Porritt | Founder Director |
[REDACTED]

Forum for the Future
[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

From: Bernie Bulkin [REDACTED]
Sent: 11 April 2015 20:04
To: [REDACTED];[REDACTED];[REDACTED];[REDACTED];[REDACTED];[REDACTED];[REDACTED];
[REDACTED];[REDACTED];[REDACTED];
Cc: [REDACTED];[REDACTED];[REDACTED];[REDACTED];[REDACTED];[REDACTED];[REDACTED];
Subject: RE: Saltire Prize update - April 2015

Agree it would be a good idea to discuss this as a group. Assuming you still want to have us as a Committee, then we would need to play a role in such decisions. Of course you can certainly do these without us, and you have already drafted something without us.

A couple of quick comments: Not sure why you have started using 'ocean energy' rather than marine. I certainly prefer marine myself, because it can include wave, tidal, and run of river technologies.

I am not happy with 'ambitious yet achievable' as a criterion, because it suggests that you know what can be done before you offer the prize, indeed to meet the achievable criterion you would have to know how it could be done. So what is the point of offering a prize for something that we know how to do already.

Not at all convinced that the supply chain is the problem.

But I would be interested in hearing the views of others.

Bernie Bulkin

From: Kellett J (Janine)
Sent: 13 April 2015 14:44
To: 'Nicholas Eisenberger'
Cc: Terry D. Garcia
Subject: RE: Saltire Prize update - April 2015

Thanks Nicholas. I agree that we could do a better job with the promotion side. [REDACTED] a revised prize will need a new marketing strategy.

I hope you can participate in the conference call.

Best wishes,
Janine

Janine Kellett
Head of Offshore Renewables Policy Team
Energy and Climate Change Directorate
[REDACTED]
[REDACTED]

From: Nicholas Eisenberger [REDACTED]
Sent: 10 April 2015 15:33
To: Kellett J (Janine)
Cc: Terry D. Garcia
Subject: Re: Saltire Prize update - April 2015

Thank you, Janine. This is very good news. I agree with everything you listed below. I might add something about branding and marketability (i.e., as I feel we could do a better job promoting this effort worldwide under a revised approach). This is not just about the re-design of the prize, but about the resources allocated and approach used to market it.

I am happy to help. As I have just successfully completed a three year \$38MM fundraising effort for a new XPRIZE (more time and effort than ever expected or desired, but finally done!), I think I can be most helpful just before, during, or after the expert validation stage.

Very best and congratulations!

Nicholas

Nicholas Moore Eisenberger
Managing Partner | **Pure Energy Partners** [REDACTED]
Co-Founder | **The Cleanweb Initiative** | [REDACTED]
[REDACTED] | [REDACTED]
[REDACTED] [REDACTED]

From: Kellett J (Janine)
Sent: 13 April 2015 14:50
To: 'Jaison Morgan'
Cc: Lynn Van Deventer
Subject: RE: Saltire Prize update - April 2015

Jaison – thanks for your email and I'm happy to find a suitable time for a private chat. We could speak tomorrow afternoon (Tuesday) if that suits you. Otherwise, it will probably have to be next week. Can you let me know your availability?
Best wishes,
Janine

Janine Kellett
Head of Offshore Renewables Policy Team
Energy and Climate Change Directorate
[REDACTED]
[REDACTED]

From: Jaison Morgan [REDACTED]
Sent: 10 April 2015 16:32
To: Kellett J (Janine)
Cc: Galbraith L (Lindsay); Lynn Van Deventer
Subject: Re: Saltire Prize update - April 2015

Janine:

I'd like to coordinate a time to discuss your email. As the only "prize expert" on the Committee (none of our Committee members have ever been responsible for the design or development of any prizes, much less the redesign/redevelopment of one, and I taught a class on this subject at MIT), I'd like to have a frank conversation about how you can best use my volunteer time. My firm (www.commonpool.org) does this around the world for major commercial brands, government agencies, and the largest philanthropic organizations. You may find proof of those claims in the fact that the Committee Chair (Terry Garcia) uses our firm for all of the prizes at National Geographic Society (here are two examples: www.terrawattprize.com & www.natgeochallenges.com). In fact, it was Terry's and Neil Kermod's recommendation at the close of our last meeting that Saltire Staff should spend some time with our firm discussing next steps. From your email, it appears that you've charted a new course, and I am offering to spend some time discussing those decisions and how they compare to similar case studies, where we've been able to provide a lot of help.

I would want to host that conversation with just the core team at Saltire (not as a Committee conference call). And, I would be happy to discuss how we might schedule a more intensive training session (we do this for a lot of clients). Let me know when you would be available.

Jai

Jaison Morgan
Managing Principal
[REDACTED]
[REDACTED]



From: Kellett J (Janine)
Sent: 29 April 2015 13:34
To: [REDACTED];[REDACTED];[REDACTED];[REDACTED];[REDACTED];[REDACTED];[REDACTED];

[REDACTED];[REDACTED];[REDACTED];[REDACTED]

Subject: Saltire Prize Challenge Committee conference call - SPCC10 - note of meeting - 24 April 2015



Dear Challenge Committee members,

Please find attached a note of the conference call that took place on Friday 24 April.

Mary, Nicholas, Jonathon, Bernie – I note that you can all make a call on **Friday 8 May at 14:30**. Would you like me to set this up so that we can recap on the earlier discussion and gather your thoughts?

Best wishes,

Janine

Janine Kellett

Head of Offshore Renewables Policy Team
Energy and Climate Change Directorate

[REDACTED]
[REDACTED]

**SCOTTISH GOVERNMENT'S SALTIRE PRIZE CHALLENGE COMMITTEE
TENTH MEETING – 24 APRIL 2015
BY CONFERENCE CALL**

Attendees

Terry Garcia	National Geographic (chair)
Neil Kermod	European Marine Energy Centre
Andrew Buglass	Buglass Energy Advisory
Professor Paul Jowitt	Heriot-Watt University
Jaison Morgan	Common Pool
Janine Kellett	Scottish Government (secretariat)
Julie Steel	Scottish Government (secretariat)

1. Welcome and introductions
 - 1.1 Janine Kellett thanked those present for joining the conference call.
2. **Apologies**

2.1 It was noted that this call only involved five of the nine challenge committee members as it had been difficult to find a date and time that suited all. It was agreed that the Saltire Prize secretariat would consult separately with the other four members.

3. Conference call aims

3.1 Janine set out the objectives of the conference call, which were (i) to consider challenge committee members' involvement in the prize redesign process; and (ii) to discuss the role of Scottish Renewables in helping define a new challenge and the steer the committee should give to them.

4. Redesign process

[REDACTED]

4.1 [REDACTED] Scottish Renewables, Scotland's trade association for the renewables sector, consulted some of its members and found that they were still very supportive of a marine innovation prize. Scottish Renewables offered to assist with the review by bringing together a focus group – free of charge – to suggest revised prize options. This information was relayed to the energy minister who approved the plans.

[REDACTED]

4.2 Janine said that some committee members had fed back initial thoughts by email on the latest position. All were pleased that there was ministerial agreement to a review and most welcomed the involvement of an industry body in the process. There was a desire from some members for greater involvement in the prize design process and concerns from others about the role of Scottish Renewables (as their members would have an interest in winning the prize and because they are not experts in designing prizes). Janine said that there would be no obligation for the committee to accept the ideas put forward by Scottish Renewables and acknowledged the need for further validation of options by a prize expert. Julie Steel advised that other neutral parties would be represented on the group, including the European Marine Energy Centre, the Offshore Renewable Energy Catapult and the Carbon Trust. She also added that Scottish Renewables expected its focus group to have three or four meetings.

4.3 Committee members felt that messaging on the redesigned prize was important and that the relaunch would have to be accompanied by a new set of carefully developed messages, acknowledging that the previous prize had failed for valid reasons.

4.4 Terry asked if it was worth opening up the opportunity to a wider audience to get a greater variety of thoughts on what an appropriate Saltire Prize challenge might be. It was agreed that there would potentially be value in this and that we could issue a statement explaining that we have asked Scottish Renewables to help us define a new challenge and inviting target groups (for example, other industry bodies

or renewables/environmental consultancies) to submit ideas via Scottish Renewables.

5. Challenge Committee involvement

5.1 On Committee members' involvement, those on the call were very keen for regular consultation at each stage of prize development. Janine said that some members had written to say they were happy with involvement at a later stage. It was therefore agreed that individual members would have the option of participating or not at each stage.

6. Steer to Scottish Renewables

6.1 A discussion followed about the draft instruction to Scottish Renewables. Jaison Morgan suggested that the Scottish Renewables focus group might also want to consider what new prize entrants might gain from participating but not winning (for example, are there other incentives such as introductions to venture capitalists, easier access to sites etc?). Janine added that one criticism of the current prize was that it excluded smaller developers who nonetheless had big ambitions. In line with Bernie Bulkin's suggestion by email, it was agreed to amend ocean energy to marine energy. The secretariat agreed to take all these points into consideration and redraft the instruction (see revised instruction at **annex A**).

7. AOB

[REDACTED]

7.1 There was no other business and the call ended.

Janine Kellett
Offshore Renewables Policy Team
April 2015

ANNEX A

INSTRUCTION TO SCOTTISH RENEWABLES

Aspiration: Accelerate the commercial development of wave and tidal technologies that can cost effectively and sustainably harness marine energy for the benefit of communities around the world.

Barriers: There are high costs and risks associated with these emerging technologies. Reduced investor appetite has hampered the development of the sector.

Objectives: Promote innovation in marine renewables. Rebuild investor confidence in the sector. Keep Scotland at the forefront of a global energy endeavour and international efforts to tackle climate change. Support the creation of a marine energy industry.

The Saltire Prize Challenge Committee would like the focus group to suggest three new prize options that:

- (i) recognise the different technological maturity of wave and tidal technologies;
- (ii) are likely to promote collaborative working and drive ambition in the marine energy sector;
- (iii) will help keep Scotland at the forefront of marine energy innovation;
- (iv) motivate entrants to take part (for example, the main cash prize may not be the only motivator; there may be other incentives such as introductions to panels of potential investors, support with business or marketing plans, provision of performance verification certificates etc).
- (v) are inclusive and encourage participation from a full range of marine energy technology developers;
- (vi) motivate other stakeholders, especially the large engineering companies, to work with developers (e.g. on subsystem innovation) to help address barriers to deployment of ocean energy technologies.

-----Original Appointment-----

From: Kellett J (Janine)

Sent: 23 April 2015 11:57

To: [REDACTED];[REDACTED];[REDACTED];[REDACTED];[REDACTED];[REDACTED];[REDACTED];[REDACTED];

Subject: Saltire Prize Challenge Committee conference call - 14:30 UK time

When: 24 April 2015 14:30-15:30 (UTC) Dublin, Edinburgh, Lisbon, London.

Where: Dial in details attached

UK Freefone:	[REDACTED]
--------------	------------

Chairperson passcode:	[REDACTED]
Participant passcode:	[REDACTED]

For global access numbers, please visit:
<http://www.btconferencing.com/publicsector/globalaccess/>

From: Kellett J (Janine)
Sent: 29 April 2015 13:40
To: 'Neil Kermode'; [REDACTED];
Cc: Steel J (Julie)
Subject: RE: Challenge Committee - SPCC10 - minutes of conference call on 24 April 2015

Neil, don't worry. Lindsay Leask at SR is aware that we won't be treating what they send us as a finished product but I agree that it is a good idea to spell out in the written instruction that there will be next steps. Obviously, I haven't sent SR anything yet as I am waiting for the feedback from other committee members.
Janine

Janine Kellett
Head of Offshore Renewables Policy Team
Energy and Climate Change Directorate
[REDACTED]
[REDACTED]

From: Neil Kermode [REDACTED]
Sent: 29 April 2015 13:35
To: Kellett J (Janine); [REDACTED];
Cc: Steel J (Julie)
Subject: RE: Challenge Committee - SPCC10 - minutes of conference call on 24 April 2015

Janine & Terry,

Very helpful notes.

My only suggestion is whether the instruction to SR should be clear about the steps to be taken after their suggestions are received. I would be concerned if they went off trying to design the competition in detail.

I think we are looking for some imaginative thinking with a sectoral grounding and then to get the ideas further developed by those with prize experience. I would not want the SR team to go too far and I think there is less chance of this if 'the next steps' were included in the brief.

Just a thought,

Neil

Neil Kermode
Managing Director

[REDACTED]
[REDACTED]
[REDACTED]

From: Kellett J (Janine)
Sent: 07 May 2015 14:50
To: [REDACTED];[REDACTED];[REDACTED];[REDACTED];
Subject: Saltire Prize Challenge Committee follow up call
When: 08 May 2015 14:30-15:30 (UTC+00:00) Dublin, Edinburgh, Lisbon, London.
Where: 4.7 (dial in details attached)

<< File: Challenge Committee - SPCC10 - minutes of conference call on 24 April 2015.docx >>

Bernie, Nicholas, Jonathon,

I hope you can still join us for the call tomorrow at **14:30 UK time**. This is a follow up to the conference call meeting on 24 April so that you can feed in your views (note of earlier meeting attached for ease of reference).

Best wishes,

Janine

UK Freefone:	[REDACTED]
Chairperson passcode:	[REDACTED]
Participant passcode:	[REDACTED]

For global access numbers, please visit:
<http://www.btconferencing.com/publicsector/globalaccess/>

From: Kellett J (Janine)
Sent: 12 May 2015 13:15
To: [REDACTED];[REDACTED];[REDACTED];[REDACTED];[REDACTED];[REDACTED];[REDACTED];
[REDACTED];[REDACTED];[REDACTED];[REDACTED];[REDACTED];
Cc: [REDACTED];[REDACTED];
Subject: Saltire Prize Challenge Committee conference call - SPCC10 - note of meetings on 24 April 2015 and 8 May 2015



Dear Challenge Committee members,

We have now had the opportunity to consult with all of you and we are very grateful for your input. Please find attached a revised meeting note, which includes a summary of the follow up discussion that took place on 8 May 2015 (see pp. 4 and 5). There have been minor additions to the instruction to Scottish Renewables at annex A. I will assume you are now content for me to forward the instruction on but do get in touch if you have any further points.

Best wishes,

Janine

Janine Kellett

Head of Offshore Renewables Policy Team

Energy and Climate Change Directorate

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

**SCOTTISH GOVERNMENT'S SALTIRE PRIZE CHALLENGE COMMITTEE
TENTH MEETING – 24 APRIL 2015
BY CONFERENCE CALL**

Attendees

Terry Garcia	National Geographic (chair)
Neil Kermod	European Marine Energy Centre
Andrew Buglass	Buglass Energy Advisory
Professor Paul Jowitt	Heriot-Watt University
Jaison Morgan	Common Pool
Janine Kellett	Scottish Government (secretariat)
Julie Steel	Scottish Government (secretariat)

1. Welcome and introductions

1.1 Janine Kellett thanked those present for joining the conference call.

2. Apologies

2.1 It was noted that this call only involved five of the nine challenge committee members as it had been difficult to find a date and time that suited all. It was agreed that the Saltire Prize secretariat would consult separately with the other four members.

3. Conference call aims

3.1 Janine set out the objectives of the conference call, which were (i) to consider challenge committee members' involvement in the prize redesign process; and (ii) to discuss the role of Scottish Renewables in helping define a new challenge and the steer the committee should give to them.

4. Redesign process

[REDACTED]

4.1 [REDACTED] Scottish Renewables, Scotland's trade association for the renewables sector, consulted some of its members and found that they were still very supportive of a marine innovation prize. Scottish Renewables offered to assist with the review by bringing together a focus group – free of charge – to suggest revised prize options. This information was relayed to the energy minister who approved the plans.

[REDACTED]

4.2 Janine said that some committee members had fed back initial thoughts by email on the latest position. All were pleased that there was ministerial agreement to a review and most welcomed the involvement of an industry body in the process. There was a desire from some members for greater involvement in the prize design process and concerns from others about the role of Scottish Renewables (as their members would have an interest in winning the prize and because they are not experts in designing prizes). Janine said that there would be no obligation for the committee to accept the ideas put forward by Scottish Renewables and acknowledged the need for further validation of options by a prize expert. Julie Steel advised that other neutral parties would be represented on the group, including the European Marine Energy Centre, the Offshore Renewable Energy Catapult and the Carbon Trust. She also added that Scottish Renewables expected its focus group to have three or four meetings.

4.3 Committee members felt that messaging on the redesigned prize was important and that the relaunch would have to be accompanied by a new set of carefully developed messages, acknowledging that the previous prize had failed for valid reasons.

4.4 Terry asked if it was worth opening up the opportunity to a wider audience to get a greater variety of thoughts on what an appropriate Saltire Prize challenge might be. It was agreed that there would potentially be value in this and that we could issue a statement explaining that we have asked Scottish Renewables to help us define a new challenge and inviting target groups (for example, other industry bodies or renewables/environmental consultancies) to submit ideas via Scottish Renewables.

5. Challenge Committee involvement

5.1 On Committee members' involvement, those on the call were very keen for regular consultation at each stage of prize development. Janine said that some

members had written to say they were happy with involvement at a later stage. It was therefore agreed that individual members would have the option of participating or not at each stage.

6. Steer to Scottish Renewables

6.1 A discussion followed about the draft instruction to Scottish Renewables. Jaison Morgan suggested that the Scottish Renewables focus group might also want to consider what new prize entrants might gain from participating but not winning (for example, are there other incentives such as introductions to venture capitalists, easier access to sites etc?). Janine added that one criticism of the current prize was that it excluded smaller developers who nonetheless had big ambitions. In line with Bernie Bulkin's suggestion by email, it was agreed to amend ocean energy to marine energy. The secretariat agreed to take all these points into consideration and redraft the instruction (see revised instruction at **annex A**).

7. AOB

[REDACTED]

7.1 There was no other business and the call ended.

FOLLOW UP WITH OTHER CHALLENGE COMMITTEE MEMBERS 8 MAY 2015 BY CONFERENCE CALL

Attendees

Professor Paul Jowitt	Heriot-Watt University
Bernie Bulkin	Former Chief Scientist at BP
Nicholas Moore Eisenberger	Pure Energy Partners
Chris Stark	Scottish Government
Janine Kellett	Scottish Government (secretariat)

1. Apologies

1.1 Janine welcomed members to the call and recorded apologies from Jonathon Porritt. She added that Jonathon had emailed to say he was content with the minutes of the last call and the revised instruction to Scottish Renewables. Chris Stark introduced himself and explained that he was replacing Mary McAllan as the senior Scottish Government representative on the challenge committee.

2. Conference call aims

2.1 Janine explained that the purpose of this follow up call was to seek the views of those who had not been able to participate in the conference call on 24 April.

3. Discussion

3.1 Bernie Bulkin said that he had concerns about the first draft of the instruction to Scottish Renewables, which asked them to suggest prize options that were 'ambitious and achievable'. Janine said that this point had been discussed during the last call and members had agreed to remove the line.

3.2 Nicholas Eisenberger said it was important to learn from the earlier experience, particularly whether we could do a better job of promoting the revised prize. He also felt that committee members could be used more, not only in the prize redesign process but as ambassadors for Scotland's marine energy sector.

3.3 Committee members felt that it would be worthwhile asking Scottish Renewables to consider marine energy achievements outside Scotland, to ensure that we did not devise a new competition that had already or nearly been won in another part of the world. It was also agreed that Scottish Renewables should consider how other technology/renewable energy innovation prizes have operated and what made them successful (e.g. the European Solar Prize). These points have been added to the instruction at annex A.

3.4 Members said they would be keen to be involved at each stage of the prize redesign process and wanted the opportunity to assess the options put forward by Scottish Renewables. However, they were divided on whether a prize expert would be needed after that. Some felt that it was better to take one step at a time, and that the involvement of a prize expert could be decided once the committee had had the opportunity to consider the work by Scottish Renewables. Neil Kermodie had previously suggested (by email) that it should be made clear to Scottish Renewables that there may be further development work required after they have submitted their options.

3.5 There was no other business and the call ended.

Janine Kellett
Offshore Renewables Policy Team
May 2015

ANNEX A

INSTRUCTION TO SCOTTISH RENEWABLES

Aspiration: Accelerate the commercial development of wave and tidal technologies that can cost effectively and sustainably harness marine energy for the benefit of communities around the world.

Barriers: There are high costs and risks associated with these emerging technologies. Reduced investor appetite has hampered the development of the sector.

Objectives: Promote innovation in marine renewables. Rebuild investor confidence in the sector. Keep Scotland at the forefront of a global energy endeavour and

international efforts to tackle climate change. Support the creation of a marine energy industry.

The Saltire Prize Challenge Committee would like the focus group to suggest three new prize options that:

- (i) recognise the different technological maturity of wave and tidal technologies;
- (ii) are likely to promote collaborative working and drive ambition in the marine energy sector;
- (iii) will help keep Scotland at the forefront of marine energy innovation;
- (iv) motivate entrants to take part (for example, the main cash prize may not be the only motivator; there may be other incentives such as introductions to panels of potential investors, support with business or marketing plans, provision of performance verification certificates etc).
- (v) are inclusive and encourage participation from a full range of marine energy technology developers;
- (vi) motivate other stakeholders, especially the large engineering companies, to work with developers (e.g. on subsystem innovation) to help address barriers to deployment of ocean energy technologies.

In developing the prize options, it would be helpful to consider how far the marine energy sector has developed around the globe to ensure that the revised Saltire Prize is genuinely exploring new frontiers. It would also be useful to assess how other technology/renewable energy innovation prizes have operated and what made them successful (e.g. the European Solar Prize).

14 February 2016 to 13 February 2017

From: Jaison Morgan [REDACTED]
Sent: 12 April 2016 22:18
To: [REDACTED];[REDACTED];
Subject: Re: Saltire prize - Scottish Renewables Review - Draft paper

Lindsay & Janine:

It's great to hear from you. I've read the materials from Scottish Renewables, and I see that they've arrived at some productive conclusions. Our firm agrees that an overhaul of the program (short of discarding the notion of prizes altogether) is smart.

In fact, we remain committed to supporting that work. While I am a member of the Committee, during our last meeting, both Terry Garcia and Neil Kermode suggested that your team should work with our company to explore options. For context, you may recall that we have been responsible for developing successful prizes around the world and have shared our expertise with Niall and Scottish Renewables on many occasions (even speaking during the first Saltire Lecture for them at the University of Strathclyde on this subject).

For those who are not familiar with our expertise, here is some context.

Our Company Website: www.commonpool.org
Our TEDx talk on the history of prizes and current trends among sponsors: <https://youtu.be/NyOaolcCeMY> (which includes Scottish exemplars)
And, in addition to the 12 case studies on our company website, here are others that are either currently active or about to launch:

[The Food to Market Challenge](#) (sponsored by the Chicago Community Trust), currently active
[The MIT Inclusive Innovation Competition](#) (Massachusetts Institute of Technology), currently active
[The Water Innovation Challenge](#) (Arizona Community Foundation), launches next week

Our clients range in prize types and sizes from **\$100 million** to much smaller increments of cash rewards and other incentives (as low as **\$50**). In every case, we develop the process and infrastructure to deliver appropriate incentives for driving participation - this would be essential to calibrating how you would divide (or add to) your current resources for this project.

I will plan to join our next call, schedules permitting, but you are welcome to contact at any time at [REDACTED] (mobile). Have a great week.

Jai

Jaison Morgan
Managing Principal & CEO
[REDACTED]
[REDACTED]



[REDACTED]

From: JP Office [REDACTED]
Sent: 13 April 2016 09:34
To: [REDACTED]
Cc: [REDACTED];[REDACTED];[REDACTED];
Subject: RE: Saltire prize - Scottish Renewables Review - Draft paper

Dear Lindsay

Thank you so much for the draft report on the Saltire Prize from Scottish Renewables.

I thought this was really helpful in terms of summarising where we are now, after the inevitable hiatus, and giving some very strong pointers for the future.

I noticed in the draft report the acknowledgement that it would make sense, at this stage, to be looking for some 'new Ambassadors'. I think that is absolutely right, and for me it makes sense now to step down formally as one of those involved in the Saltire Prize up until now.

So I won't be filling in the doodlepoll – but will wish you all well from afar!

Best wishes
Jonathon

Jonathon Porritt | Founder Director |
[REDACTED]

[Forum for the Future](#)
[REDACTED]
[REDACTED]

SCOTTISH GOVERNMENT'S SALTIRE PRIZE CHALLENGE COMMITTEE CONFERENCE CALL – 20 April 2016

Attendees

Terry Garcia
Neil Kermod
Bernie Bulkin

Nicholas Moore Eisenberger
Jaison Morgan
Janine Kellett
Lindsay Galbraith

National Geographic (chair)
European Marine Energy Centre
Writer and adviser on energy and
environment matters
Pure Energy Partners
Common Pool
Scottish Government (secretariat)
Scottish Government (secretariat)

1. Welcome and introductions

1.1 Janine Kellett thanked those present for joining the conference call.

2. Apologies

2.1 Apologies were received from Andrew Buglass, Paul Jowitt and Chris Stark. It was noted that Jonathon Porritt has stepped down from the Challenge Committee.

3. Conference call aims

3.1 Janine gave a summary of Saltire Prize developments in the past 12 months. There had been further negative press coverage following the demise and downsizing of two of the prize competitors and a topical parliamentary question in the latter half of 2015 (Orkney MSP Liam McArthur asked for the £10m prize funds to be handed immediately to struggling wave and tidal power companies). [REDACTED] Scottish Renewables completed its draft report in March 2016 and submitted it to the Scottish Government. Lindsay Galbraith then forwarded it to committee members. Janine summarised the report findings: the focus group did not unanimously agree that a prize was the best way to support the wave and tidal industries but they did agree that the £10m prize pot should be made available to support the industry. She explained that ministers would not decide on the future of the prize until after the election but that they would want to hear the views of committee members.

4. Scottish Renewables review: comments from committee members

4.1 Bernie Bulkin said that it was clear that we could not have a generation prize given the position of the wave energy sector. He noted that the report did not propose a prize for a breakthrough technology, which could have been interesting. Janine said that Wave Energy Scotland was set up with the aim of delivering disruptive technologies that can have a major impact on device cost and/or performance.

4.2 Nicholas Moore Eisenberger said that it would be unfair for industry to call for the funds when they have not met the competition requirements. He added that although the industry is not where we want it to be, the prize has brought attention and focus to the marine energy sector in Scotland. He concluded that the prize had had a net positive impact.

4.3 Terry Garcia said that ultimately the future of the Saltire Prize would be a decision for the Scottish Government. He said that the question is whether the Saltire Prize brand is still of value and could be used to positive effect to promote Scotland's marine energy ambitions.

4.4 Jaison Morgan said the size of a prize is not as important as creating and executing an effective prize process. He said that a prize needs to be marketed and resourced properly if it is to succeed.

4.5 Nicholas said that the original aims of the prize were perfectly valid and the question that faces us now is how to turn the effort to date into something of ongoing value. He highlighted Richard Branson's \$25m Earth prize, which attracted criticism in the press. Naomi Klein has written a book about how Branson has failed to deliver on his climate change pledges. However, Richard Branson has been able to evolve. Similarly, we need to learn from our experience, take control of the debate and find the next evolutionary step. Nicholas said that he would be glad to help Scotland with that, and that the Scottish Government should look at this not as a failure but as an opportunity.

4.6 Bernie said he was very supportive of this approach and suggested having a day or two of brainstorming. He added that there was a lot of useful learning from other technologies, including wind and solar, and how they have evolved. It would be worth thinking about what it would take for marine to get to the same stage as these more mature technologies. Neil Kermode agreed that a day of brainstorming would be useful.

Action: Nicholas offered to forward a copy of the Bloomberg New Energy Finance summit report to the Scottish Government [received].

4.7 Terry concluded by saying that the Scottish Government should not apologise too much. The intention behind establishing the prize was right and no other country has done more to promote marine renewables.

5. AOB

5.1 Janine thanked everyone for their participation and words of encouragement and said she would be in touch again post-election.

5.2 There was no other business and the call ended.

From: Garcia, Terry [REDACTED]
Sent: 01 July 2016 02:57
To: [REDACTED]
Cc: Garcia Terry
Subject: Changes...including my email address

After 17 years, today is my last official day at NGS. I am immensely proud to have helped lead this institution and I look forward to continuing to support it in every way possible. It has been a rewarding journey but now its time for me to turn my attention to long awaited exciting new ventures. Naturally, I plan to continue to be involved with the vital issues and causes I have devoted so much time to over the years. I have no doubt that our paths will soon cross again.

Please stay in touch. My contact information is:

[REDACTED]
[REDACTED]

With warm regards,

Terry

Terry D. Garcia
Chief Science and Exploration Officer

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

14 February 2017 to 13 February 2018

From: Jaison Morgan [REDACTED]
Sent: 13 January 2017 04:57
To: Kellett J (Janine)
Cc: [REDACTED]; [REDACTED]
Subject: Re: Saltire Prize teleconference (14:40 GMT)

Janine & Saltire Team:

Greetings from London. I am here after meeting with the UK Department of Business, Energy & Industrial Strategy (formerly the UK Department of Energy & Climate Change). The UK is part of an initiative, **Mission Innovation** (MI), which includes 23 member states. MI has committed to developing and launching a series of prizes and challenge competitions to induce new breakthroughs for clean energy solutions. Our firm has been selected as the agency responsible for the design, development, and management of those programs. I am departing this morning to make a presentation to the Canadian government. Fortunately, the US, UK, and Canadians have formed a Committee to oversee our work, which may allow me to revisit London over the next few months. As we gain traction, I would be happy to offer your team updates and look forward to our next steps overhauling the Saltire Prize.

I am going to be back in DC next week and - as always - plan to meet with Terry when I'm there. He and I have spoken several times about repositioning the Saltire Prize. And, I await your invitation to have a discussion about what the Scottish government plans to do. While I know that you are coordinating another call with our Committee, I maintain that group calls are not sufficient to rework the program, and I know of no other firm that has the seasoned experience and track record that we offer. I hope that we can apply our expertise to fix the Saltire Prize (a cause of personal importance to me after spending 7+ years, as a member of this group).

Have a great week.

Jai

Jaison Morgan
Managing Principal & CEO
[REDACTED]
[REDACTED]



[REDACTED]

Please consider the environment before printing this e-mail.

This transmission is confidential and intended solely for the person(s) or organization(s) to whom it is addressed. It may contain privileged and confidential information. If you are not the intended recipient, you should not copy, distribute, or take any action in reliance on it. If you are considering forwarding this message, please seek permission

before distributing. If you have received this transmission in error, please destroy and notify immediately by phone at +001-310-266-6226. Thank you.

On Tue, Jan 10, 2017 at 6:00 PM, [REDACTED] wrote:

Dear Challenge Committee members,

Happy new year to you all.

It would be great to have a chat about the next steps for the Saltire Prize.

Can you let me know your availability for a conference call by completing the attached doodle poll? The chair and deputy chair have already completed the poll.

<http://doodle.com/poll/4cz3bnpzcyiy6kue>

I look forward to speaking to you soon.

Best wishes,

Janine

Janine Kellett

Head of Marine Energy Policy
Energy and Climate Change Directorate
[REDACTED]
[REDACTED]

From: Stevenson N (Natalie)
Sent: 25 January 2017 14:02
To: [REDACTED];[REDACTED];[REDACTED];[REDACTED];[REDACTED]
Subject: Saltire Prize Challenge Committee - SPCC12 - meeting papers and dial in details for meeting on 27 January 2017 at 15:00 (UK time)



Dear members of the Saltire Prize Challenge Committee,

Firstly, I wanted to introduce myself. I will be taking over from Lindsay Edgar to help with the Saltire Prize.

Please find attached an agenda and discussion paper for Friday's meeting. A short note of the last call on 10 November 2016 will follow separately.

Dial in details for Friday's call are as follows:

Toll-Free Dial-In Number:	[REDACTED]
Std International Dial-In Number:	[REDACTED]
Conference Code:	[REDACTED]
Leader PIN:	[REDACTED]
Dial-in Numbers	View a complete list of dial-in numbers here.
Additional resources:	Go to http://www.intercalleeurope.com/rphelp for more information, including a user guide, list of phone commands and international dial-in numbers.

We look forward to speaking to you soon.

Kind regards
Natalie

Natalie Stevenson
Policy Officer
Local Energy Systems and Emerging Technologies
Energy and Climate Change Directorate

Scottish Government

[REDACTED]
[REDACTED]
[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

SALTIRE PRIZE CHALLENGE COMMITTEE
Friday 27 January 2017, 15:00 – 16:00
[By conference call]

AGENDA

Item	Paper no.
1. Welcome and introductions <ul style="list-style-type: none">• apologies• minutes of last call	SPCC12 (01)
2. Update on recent energy policy developments in Scotland	
3. Saltire Prize redesign	SPCC12 (02)

4. Any other business and close

SALTIRE PRIZE DISCUSSION PAPER

Background

1. The £10 million Saltire Prize was established in December 2008 to accelerate the commercial development of wave and tidal technologies. It fulfilled a commitment set out in the 2007 SNP manifesto to launch a Saltire Prize to promote future innovation and technological endeavour, with a focus on developing Scotland's renewable generation capacity.

2. The prize has always been considered ambitious but it has been clear for some time that the challenge of achieving more than 100 gigawatt hours of electrical output over a continuous two year period is too high, and that the extended deadline of 2017 is still too soon for anyone to win the prize. To win the prize, a competitor would have needed to have a 20MW scale project fully installed and operating by summer 2015. Even the most advanced of the remaining competitors, MeyGen, has not yet completed installation of its 6MW demonstration project.

[REDACTED]

Outcome of Scottish Renewables review (May 2016)

3. Scottish Renewables convened a focus group of its members to gather feedback on the existing challenge and discuss prize options for the future.

4. Consultees agreed that the Saltire Prize had helped promote Scotland as a leader in wave and tidal energy and its introduction was a strong indicator of the Scottish Government's support, which has helped build confidence and drive investment in the sector. There was also consensus that the Saltire Prize had succeeded in both showcasing Scotland's indigenous marine energy resources, and in putting Scotland on the world stage as a leading centre for the development of a greener, more sustainable future.

5. However, consultees also felt that the Saltire Prize had not accelerated technological developments and innovation as much as anticipated due to a number of factors: the £10m prize fund is deemed minor in terms of overall project spend and is not available during the construction phase when costs and risks are at their highest; there is a shortage of sites with affordable grid connections; and the ambitious competition criteria means that only those developing utility-scale projects (i.e. 20MW+) are able to take part.

6. The draft report concludes that there is appetite within the wave and tidal industries to compete in a new appropriately structured prize. [REDACTED] All stressed the critical importance of continuation of political and financial support for both the wave and tidal sectors.

7. While there was not unanimous support for a new prize, the focus group did propose three new prize options: (i) a single large prize for reaching a specified number of operational hours; or (ii) multiple smaller prizes for reaching technological/device component milestones; or (iii) multiple smaller prizes for reaching a combination of specified operational hours and technology milestones.

8. Officials first discussed the findings of the review with members of the Saltire Prize Challenge Committee. Committee members felt strongly that the prize has not been a failure as it has inspired technology developers, elevated the profile of the industry and enabled us to show progress in the field of marine renewables.
[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

Conclusion

9. The challenge has done a lot to raise the profile of Scotland's marine energy sector and has drawn international attention to the planet-saving potential of marine energy. It has sparked the interest of wave and tidal technology developers around the globe and has put Scotland and its marine energy expertise on the map. In addition, we know from our conversations with Saltire Prize competitors that they have made considerable investments since entering the competition.

10. Since the Saltire Prize was established, additional prize elements have been developed that have helped promote Scotland's marine expertise. These include the Saltire Prize Lecture; the Saltire Prize Medal; a Saltire Prize sponsored doctorate in collaboration with the Energy Technology Partnership (ETP); the Power of the Sea, a one off junior photography competition; and the Junior Saltire Prize. They have helped to build and maintain momentum, keep Scotland's marine energy sector in the public eye, and develop wider benefit.

[REDACTED]

Next steps

11. With only two competitors, neither of whom are able to meet the generation challenge, the current prize cannot continue. We therefore need to consider how the three new prize options proposed by the focus group – along with any others – address both the original objectives (see annex B) and industry concerns at paragraph 6.

12. The options proposed by the focus group have not been developed in any detail. If we wish to proceed with one of these options, we will need to seek specialist input to determine what appropriate milestones/operating hour targets might be (NB initial thoughts are that operational hours would not be a sufficiently meaningful metric). There are other prize options we may wish to add to this list, such as, (iv) multiple smaller prizes for demonstrating the most effective cost reduction while maintaining strong device/component performance or reliable power.

13. Finally, we need to ensure that the new prize complements existing Scottish Government policy, in that we do not want the Saltire Prize to duplicate the work of **Wave Energy Scotland**¹ or to overlook the direction set out in the **draft energy strategy for Scotland**.

¹ Applicants to Wave Energy Scotland may be supported to take projects from the earliest stage of development through to proving and demonstration, but they must meet specific stage gate criteria to progress.

[REDACTED]
[REDACTED]

[REDACTED] [REDACTED]	[REDACTED] [REDACTED] [REDACTED] [REDACTED]	[REDACTED] [REDACTED] [REDACTED] [REDACTED] [REDACTED]	[REDACTED] [REDACTED] [REDACTED] [REDACTED]	[REDACTED] [REDACTED] [REDACTED]	[REDACTED] [REDACTED] [REDACTED] [REDACTED] [REDACTED] [REDACTED] [REDACTED]	[REDACTED] [REDACTED] [REDACTED] [REDACTED] [REDACTED]	[REDACTED] [REDACTED] [REDACTED]
[REDACTED] [REDACTED] [REDACTED]							
[REDACTED] [REDACTED] [REDACTED] [REDACTED]							
[REDACTED] [REDACTED] [REDACTED] [REDACTED]							
[REDACTED] [REDACTED] [REDACTED] [REDACTED] [REDACTED] [REDACTED] [REDACTED]							

INSTRUCTION TO SCOTTISH RENEWABLES (MAY 2015)

Aspiration: Accelerate the commercial development of wave and tidal technologies that can cost effectively and sustainably harness marine energy for the benefit of communities around the world.

Barriers: There are high costs and risks associated with these emerging technologies. Reduced investor appetite has hampered the development of the sector.

Objectives: Promote innovation in marine renewables. Rebuild investor confidence in the sector. Keep Scotland at the forefront of a global energy endeavour and international efforts to tackle climate change. Support the creation of a marine energy industry.

The Saltire Prize Challenge Committee would like the focus group to suggest three new prize options that:

- (i) recognise the different technological maturity of wave and tidal technologies;
- (ii) are likely to promote collaborative working and drive ambition in the marine energy sector;
- (iii) will help keep Scotland at the forefront of marine energy innovation;
- (iv) motivate entrants to take part (for example, the main cash prize may not be the only motivator; there may be other incentives such as introductions to panels of potential investors, support with business or marketing plans, provision of performance verification certificates etc).
- (v) are inclusive and encourage participation from a full range of marine energy technology developers;
- (vi) motivate other stakeholders, especially the large engineering companies, to work with developers (e.g. on subsystem innovation) to help address barriers to deployment of ocean energy technologies.

In developing the prize options, it would be helpful to consider how far the marine energy sector has developed around the globe to ensure that the revised Saltire Prize is genuinely exploring new frontiers. It would also be useful to assess how other technology/renewable energy innovation prizes have operated and what made them successful (e.g. the European Solar Prize).

From: Stevenson N (Natalie)

Sent: 26 January 2017 14:59

To: [REDACTED] [REDACTED] [REDACTED] [REDACTED] [REDACTED]

Subject: RE: Saltire Prize Challenge Committee - SPCC12 - meeting papers and dial in details for meeting on 27 January 2017 at 15:00 (UK time)



Dear members of the Saltire Prize Challenge Committee,

I now enclose the minutes of the last teleconference call on 10 November 2016.

Kind regards
Natalie

Natalie Stevenson

Policy Officer
Local Energy Systems and Emerging Technologies
Energy and Climate Change Directorate

Scottish Government

[REDACTED]
[REDACTED]
[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

SCOTTISH GOVERNMENT'S SALTIRE PRIZE CHALLENGE COMMITTEE ELEVENTH MEETING – 10 NOVEMBER 2016 BY CONFERENCE CALL

Attendees

Terry Garcia
Neil Kermod
Bernie Bulkin
Andrew Buglass
Professor Paul Jowitt
Jaison Morgan
Sue Kearns
Lindsay Edgar

National Geographic (chair)
European Marine Energy Centre
Author
Buglass Energy Advisory
Heriot-Watt University
Common Pool
Scottish Government
Scottish Government (secretariat)

1. Welcome and introductions

1.1 Lindsay Edgar thanked those present for joining the conference call and introduced Sue Kearns, the deputy director of energy in the Energy and Climate Change Directorate.

2. Apologies

2.1 Apologies were noted from Nicholas Moore Eisenberger and Janine Kellett.

3. Conference call aims

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

Discussion

4. [REDACTED] Jaison Morgan said he was glad to hear the news and that there were many interesting ways of redesigning the prize. Bernie Bulkin expressed a willingness to gather and brainstorm ideas on prize options. Paul Jowitt said that he was pleased that the competition was continuing. Members agreed that we did not need to be too apologetic about amending the prize as it was well understood that the original competition guidelines were extremely ambitious. However, it was felt that the relaunch would need careful handling.

5. AOB

5.1 There was no other business and the call ended.

Offshore Renewables Policy Team
November 2016

From: Neil Kermod [REDACTED]
Sent: 01 February 2017 09:26
To: Kellett J (Janine)
Cc: [REDACTED]
Subject: RE: Saltire Prize

Thanks Janine,

I absolutely understand and can feel your frustration too. [REDACTED] The study may well be useful and may help show the scale of the support needed in addition to the prize. [REDACTED]

Anyway: enough on that from me for the moment.

Let me know how we can help with the study.

Neil

Neil Kermode
Managing Director
The European Marine Energy Centre (EMEC) Limited

[REDACTED]
[REDACTED]
[REDACTED]

-----Disclaimer-----

This document is confidential and intended solely for the use of the individual(s) to whom it is addressed. If you are not the intended recipient, please inform the sender immediately and be advised that any unauthorised use of this document is strictly prohibited.

-----Our Details-----

Registered in Scotland with Registered Number SC249331. Registered Office: Old Academy Business Centre, Back Road, Stromness, Orkney, KW16 3AW Tel: 01856 852060. VAT Registration Number: GB 828 8550 90

From: [REDACTED]
Sent: 31 January 2017 12:27
To: Neil Kermode [REDACTED]
Cc: [REDACTED]
Subject: RE: Saltire Prize

Neil

I am aware of the frustration on the Committee and I know that one of the Challenge Committee members is very keen to secure the redesign work. He has written to us frequently on that matter, not on behalf of the Committee but on behalf of his company.

[REDACTED]

On the last call, the Committee asked us to carry out work to review the current state of the industry/state of the market. We intend to commission that work and we will report back to the Committee soon.

Janine

Janine Kellett
Head of Emerging Technologies
Energy and Climate Change Directorate
[REDACTED]
[REDACTED]

From: Neil Kermode [REDACTED]
Sent: 30 January 2017 16:36
To: Kellett J (Janine)
Cc: [REDACTED]
Subject: Saltire Prize

Janine,

Sorry I was late onto the call on Friday, but I wanted to drop you a line after reflecting on it.

I think the Committee are all still very supportive of making the prize work, [REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED] My gut feel at the moment is that it is the lack of a market and the concomitant lack of deployment that is holding back improvement and innovation. However we can test options with our customer base if required.

Neil

Neil Kermode
Managing Director
The European Marine Energy Centre (EMEC) Limited

[REDACTED]
[REDACTED]
[REDACTED]

From: Neil Kermode [REDACTED]
Sent: 01 March 2017 08:41
To: Kellett J (Janine)
Subject: RE: Research spec for Saltire Prize Challenge Committee

Janine,

Understood..... I know the joys of rushed tying only too well!

Yes we are part of the supply chain, but also a strategic asset to Scotland... so on the edge of that cabal rather than the middle.

OK with Henry.

N

Neil Kermode
Managing Director
The European Marine Energy Centre (EMEC) Limited

[REDACTED]
[REDACTED]
[REDACTED]

-----Disclaimer-----

This document is confidential and intended solely for the use of the individual(s) to whom it is addressed. If you are not the intended recipient, please inform the sender immediately and be advised that any unauthorised use of this document is strictly prohibited.

-----Our Details-----

Registered in Scotland with Registered Number SC249331. Registered Office: Old Academy Business Centre, Back Road, Stromness, Orkney, KW16 3AW Tel: 01856 852060. VAT Registration Number: GB 828 8550 90

From: [REDACTED]
Sent: 28 February 2017 17:01
To: Neil Kermode [REDACTED]
Cc: [REDACTED]
Subject: RE: Research spec for Saltire Prize Challenge Committee

Thanks. Will add supply chain (presumably you are part of the supply chain?)
And I meant the IEA OES chair - now Henry Jeffrey. Was scribbling quickly.

Janine Kellett
Head of Emerging Technologies
Energy and Climate Change Directorate
[REDACTED]
[REDACTED]

From: Neil Kermode [REDACTED]
Sent: 28 February 2017 16:47
To: Kellett J (Janine)
Cc: [REDACTED]
Subject: RE: Research spec for Saltire Prize Challenge Committee

Janine,

This extract seems to cover the bases.

A few thoughts:
Would you plan for the author to present to the Committee and take questions?
The list of Qualitative interviews should include the supply chain as it is not just about project developers. I also take it the contractor would be tasked to speak to EMEC too?
I don't think the chair of the IEA is appropriate, but the chair of the IEA OEE group would be.

Hope this helps.

Neil

Neil Kermode
Managing Director
The European Marine Energy Centre (EMEC) Limited

[REDACTED]
[REDACTED]
[REDACTED]

-----Disclaimer-----

This document is confidential and intended solely for the use of the individual(s) to whom it is addressed. If you are not the intended recipient, please inform the sender immediately and be advised that any unauthorised use of this document is strictly prohibited.

-----Our Details-----

Registered in Scotland with Registered Number SC249331. Registered Office: Old Academy Business Centre, Back Road, Stromness, Orkney, KW16 3AW Tel: 01856 852060. VAT Registration Number: GB 828 8550 90

From: [REDACTED]
Sent: 27 February 2017 17:03
To: Neil Kermode [REDACTED]

Cc: [REDACTED]

Subject: Research spec for Saltire Prize Challenge Committee

Neil

Here's the draft description of what we plan to commission for the Saltire Prize Challenge Committee. Are there other areas you think the committee will expect to see covered?

3. Aims & Objectives

The objectives of this research will be:

- To better understand the current state of the UK marine energy industry
- To chart recent technological developments, deployment activity and industry achievements in the sector (e.g. status of specific devices and projects; development of disruptive enabling technologies; demonstration of single devices; deployment of first arrays)
- To analyse deployment forecasts (current pipeline of projects consented or in the consenting process) and the state of the market (e.g. investor activity and involvement of utilities and large engineering firms)
- To explore current policy initiatives/government signals from UKG and devolved administrations, and identify drivers for success or changes that would encourage greater progress and future investment in the sector
- To set UK development in the context of global activity

4. Methods

Tenderers are invited to put forward proposals on how to best meet the research objectives within the budget available. A full explanation of their chosen approach, including any limitations, should be provided.

Suggested methods include:

1. Review of existing literature, e.g. RUK report, IRENA reports, IEA Ocean Energy Systems annual report,
2. Qualitative interviews with people involved in the industry, e.g. technology and project developers, leading academics
3. Qualitative research into global position (interviews with OEE and chair of IEA??)

Janine Kellett

Head of Emerging Technologies

Scottish Government

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

From: Kellett J (Janine)
Sent: 28 August 2017 16:15
To: [REDACTED] [REDACTED] [REDACTED] [REDACTED]
Cc: [REDACTED]
Subject: RE: Invitation to tender - Wave and tidal energy: state of the industry report

Dear Saltire Prize Challenge Committee members,

I hope you are all well.

You will recall that earlier this year we commissioned a 'state of the industry' report to inform your deliberations on a new Saltire Prize. The successful bidders were Aquatera and Caelulum Ltd. We recently met with the report authors to discuss a first draft of their report. We have asked for some revisions but hope to have a final version to share with you soon.

Regards,

Janine

Janine Kellett
Head of Emerging Technologies
Energy and Climate Change Directorate
Scottish Government
[REDACTED]
[REDACTED]
[REDACTED]
[REDACTED]
[REDACTED]

From: Kellett J (Janine)
Sent: 14 March 2017 13:14
To: [REDACTED] [REDACTED] [REDACTED] [REDACTED]
Cc: [REDACTED]
Subject: FW: Invitation to tender - Wave and tidal energy: state of the industry report

Dear Saltire Prize Challenge Committee members,

We have tendered for the piece of work you asked for on the current state of the marine energy industry. The final report should be ready by August 2017.

Do let me know if you have any questions.

Regards,

Janine

Janine Kellett
Head of Emerging Technologies
Energy and Climate Change Directorate
[REDACTED]
[REDACTED]

From: Ciara O'Connor [REDACTED]
Sent: 14 March 2017 12:57
To: Kellett J (Janine)
Subject: FW: Invitation to tender - Wave and tidal energy: state of the industry report

Hi Janine,

The invitation to tender has now been issued and is also live on our website. Here's the link in case useful:
http://www.climateexchange.org.uk/files/5614/8949/5390/ITQ_Wave_and_tidal_energy_state_of_the_industry.pdf

It might be wise for us to set some time aside to discuss our review of proposals, when the time comes. Would you have time between 9:00 and 11:00 on the 4 April?

Thanks,

Ciara.

Ciara O'Connor
Project and Information Manager

ClimateXChange
[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]
[REDACTED]
[REDACTED]
[REDACTED]

From: Lee Callaghan [REDACTED]
Date: Tuesday, 14 March 2017 at 12:49
To: O'CONNOR Ciara [REDACTED]
Subject: Invitation to tender - Wave and tidal energy: state of the industry report

Dear All

Please find attached the specification for a review of the current state and potential of the wave and tidal industries being commissioned by **ClimateXChange**, Scotland's Centre of Expertise on Climate Change.

The attached documents outline the work that we require. If you wish to tender for this work please respond according to the attached documents.

Proposals need to be submitted to [REDACTED] and cc'd to [REDACTED] for evaluation **by noon on Tuesday 28 March 2017**. Please feel free to share this invitation to tender with any colleagues that may be interested in bidding.

Mrs Lee Callaghan
Administrator
ClimateXChange
[REDACTED]
[REDACTED]
[REDACTED]
[REDACTED]
[REDACTED]
[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

From: Kellett J (Janine)
Sent: 28 August 2017 17:38
To: [REDACTED] [REDACTED] [REDACTED] [REDACTED]
Cc: [REDACTED]
Subject: Saltire Prize Challenge Committee - SPCC13 (01) - minutes of meeting on 27 January 2017

Dear all,

I couldn't see a record of us sending you the minutes of the last meeting so am attaching them here. Let me know if there are any corrections.

Regards,

Janine

Janine Kellett
Head of Emerging Technologies
Energy and Climate Change Directorate
[REDACTED]
[REDACTED]

**SCOTTISH GOVERNMENT'S SALTIRE PRIZE CHALLENGE COMMITTEE
TWELFTH MEETING – 27 JANUARY 2017
BY CONFERENCE CALL**

Attendees

Terry Garcia
Neil Kermod
Bernie Bulkin
Andrew Buglass
Professor Paul Jowitt

National Geographic (chair)
European Marine Energy Centre
Author
Buglass Energy Advisory
Heriot-Watt University

Jaison Morgan
Anna Kynaston
Janine Kellett
Julie Steel
Natalie Stevenson

Common Pool
Scottish Government
Scottish Government
Scottish Government
Scottish Government (Secretariat)

1. Welcome and introductions

1.1 Janine Kellett thanked those present for joining the conference call and introduced Anna Kynaston, Head of the Low Carbon Support Unit, and Natalie Stevenson, who is taking over from Lindsay Edgar as the secretary to the committee.

2. Apologies

2.1 Apologies were noted from Nicholas Moore Eisenberger and Sue Kearns.

2.2 Natalie ran through the minutes of the last meeting. These were approved with a minor change to the attendee list.

3. Conference call aims

3.1 Janine provided an update to committee members on the draft Scottish Energy Strategy published on 24 January 2017 (a link to the strategy was included in the discussion paper).

4. Saltire Prize redesign discussion

4.1 The committee discussed the redesign of the Saltire Prize. Members recognised that it was a difficult period for the marine energy industry with no clear route to market. [REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

4.2 There was a high level discussion about possible new prize options but members felt that they needed up-to-date evidence about the state of the industry and an understanding of what leading companies were doing before they could evaluate prize options. The Saltire Prize secretariat agreed to commission a report on the current state of the industry. Neil Kermode said that knowledge of the market was also needed. He added that EMEC holds a database of marine devices and would be willing to share that information with whoever was commissioned to prepare the report.

Action: Scottish Government to commission a report on the current state of the marine energy industry.

4.3 Jaison Morgan said that without the required infrastructure, any new prize would fail. Andrew Buglass said that cost was an important lens to look through and that marine energy would have to stack up against offshore wind.

4.4 The committee discussed whether the prize should just focus solely on tidal energy given its more advanced state of development and given that Wave Energy Scotland (WES) exists to support wave energy technology development. However, it was thought that this could be controversial.

4.5 [REDACTED] It was agreed that the committee would reconvene once the state of the industry report was ready.

5. AOB

5.1 There was no other business and the call ended.

Emerging Technologies Policy Team
February 2017

From: Neil Kermod [REDACTED]
Sent: 29 January 2018 11:29
To: Kellett J (Janine)
Cc: Lisa MacKenzie
Subject: FW: BBC interview questions - re Saltire prize
Importance: High

Janine,

The BBC are more actively looking at the Saltire Prize (see below).... We need some lines to take on this.

I am back to back with meetings today, so please call my mobile and I will try and escape to take your call. Alternatively I am in first thing tomorrow morning.

Neil

Neil Kermod
Managing Director
The European Marine Energy Centre (EMEC) Limited

[REDACTED]
[REDACTED]
[REDACTED]

-----Disclaimer-----

This document is confidential and intended solely for the use of the individual(s) to whom it is addressed. If you are not the intended recipient, please inform the sender immediately and be advised that any unauthorised use of this document is strictly prohibited.

-----Our Details-----

Registered in Scotland with Registered Number SC249331. Registered Office: Old Academy Business Centre, Back Road, Stromness, Orkney, KW16 3AW Tel: 01856 852060. VAT Registration Number: GB 828 8550 90

From: Lisa MacKenzie
Sent: 29 January 2018 11:18

To: Neil Kermode [REDACTED]
Subject: FW: BBC interview questions - re Saltire prize

Neil, following my email last week, Magnus has sent through some queries re the Saltire Prize. I've told him you're tied up with the Board meeting until Wed, however he's asking for a quick response in the next 24 hours – is this possible?

Thanks
Lisa

Lisa MacKenzie
Commercial & Marketing Manager
The European Marine Energy Centre (EMEC) Limited

[REDACTED]
[REDACTED]
[REDACTED]

-----Disclaimer-----

This document is confidential and intended solely for the use of the individual(s) to whom it is addressed. If you are not the intended recipient, please inform the sender immediately and be advised that any unauthorised use of this document is strictly prohibited.

-----Our Details-----

Registered in Scotland with Registered Number SC249331. Registered Office: Old Academy Business Centre, Back Road, Stromness, Orkney, KW16 3AW Tel: 01856 852060. VAT Registration Number: GB 828 8550 90

From: Magnus Bennett [REDACTED]
Sent: 29 January 2018 11:12
To: Lisa MacKenzie [REDACTED]
Subject: Questions for Neil Kermode

Hi Lisa,

Here's a few questions which I hope Neil can respond to over the next 24 hours in his capacity as deputy chair of the Saltire prize challenge committee.

1. The Saltire Prize website states that a focus group of industry representatives and other marine energy experts would produce a report "later in 2016", which would then go to the Saltire Prize Challenge Committee "for consideration and approval." Where are you now in the process? (Can we expect a development soon?)
2. The website lists nine members of the committee. One of them – Mr Porritt - has confirmed that he left the committee "some years ago". How many members are currently active?
3. When did the committee last meet in person? One member has informed me the committee has only had "occasional telephone meetings" over the last few years. Is that the case?
4. Do committee members receive payment/expenses for their services or has it always been voluntary?

5. Whatever outcome there is regarding the prize, do you feel it has been a worthwhile exercise? If so, can you expand on that?

Many thanks for your time.

Regards,

Magnus
[REDACTED]

From: Terry Garcia [REDACTED]
Sent: 29 January 2018 15:41
To: Kellett J (Janine)
Subject: Fwd: BBC inquiry re: Saltire Prize

Hi Janine
Happy new year. I hope you are doing well.

Please see the email below from Magnus Bennett of the BBC new website. He is apparently making the rounds among the committee members (Jaison Morgan received an email from him last week). How do you wish to respond? Best, Terry

Terry D Garcia
Exploration Ventures
[REDACTED]
[REDACTED]
[REDACTED]
[REDACTED]
[REDACTED]

Begin forwarded message:

From: Magnus Bennett [REDACTED]
Subject: BBC inquiry re: Saltire Prize
Date: January 29, 2018 at 5:09:37 AM EST
To: [REDACTED] [REDACTED]

Dear Mr Garcia,

I write for the BBC news website.

I am currently looking at where we are with the £10m Saltire Prize which was set up a decade ago by the Scottish government to encourage innovation and investment in marine energy technology.

I see you are listed on the Saltire Prize website as being chair of the challenge committee.

Can you tell me whether you are still involved with the committee? If so, can you tell me where things stand now?

A couple of years ago, the Scottish government said revised prize options would be put to the committee for approval. Has that indeed happened yet?

Thank you for your time.

Kind regards,

Magnus Bennett
BBC Scotland
[REDACTED]

From: Kellett J (Janine)
Sent: 29 January 2018 16:36
To: [REDACTED] [REDACTED] [REDACTED] [REDACTED]
Subject: Saltire Prize - approach by BBC journalist

Dear Saltire Prize Challenge Committee members,

I understand that some of you have been approached by a journalist from the BBC. These are the questions he sent to Neil Kermode but I know that others have been approached.

1. The Saltire Prize website states that a focus group of industry representatives and other marine energy experts would produce a report “later in 2016” , which would then go to the Saltire Prize Challenge Committee “for consideration and approval.” Where are you now in the process? (Can we expect a development soon?)
2. The website lists nine members of the committee. One of them – Mr Porritt - has confirmed that he left the committee “some years ago”. How many members are currently active?
3. When did the committee last meet in person? One member has informed me the committee has only had “occasional telephone meetings” over the last few years. Is that the case?
4. Do committee members receive payment/expenses for their services or has it always been voluntary?
5. Whatever outcome there is regarding the prize, do you feel it has been a worthwhile exercise? If so, can you expand on that?

If you wish, you may direct the journalist to the Scottish Government’s communications team. The email address is [REDACTED]

I advised you last August that we hoped to have a final version of the ‘state of the industry report’ to share with you soon. The final draft is due to reach us today and we will meet the consultants on Wednesday 31 January to discuss it. I will be in touch with you soon to discuss next steps.

In the meantime, I will arrange for the Saltire Prize website to be updated.

Regards,

Janine

Janine Kellett

Head of Emerging Technologies
Directorate for Energy and Climate Change

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

From: Kellett J (Janine)

Sent: 29 January 2018 17:08

To: 'Bernie Bulkin'

Subject: RE: Saltire Prize - approach by BBC journalist

Thanks Bernie.

Janine Kellett

Head of Emerging Technologies
Directorate for Energy and Climate Change

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

From: Bernie Bulkin [REDACTED]

Sent: 29 January 2018 17:07

To: Kellett J (Janine)

Cc: [REDACTED] [REDACTED] [REDACTED] [REDACTED] [REDACTED]

Subject: Re: Saltire Prize - approach by BBC journalist

Yes, he contcted me last week and i referred him to you

Bernie Bulkin

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

Read my book, Crash Course, now on Amazon hard copy and kindle