

Your Request

Anything circulated to stakeholders meaning all of those involved in the process of preparing and publishing the report in question, particularly including ICEA members, Scottish government staff, Education Scotland staff and Scottish Ministers. Part 2 of this request therefore applies to comments from all of these individuals.

Response to your request

I enclose a copy of the information you requested. The report was drafted by the Secretariat, in consultation with, and on behalf of, the Council.

While our aim is to provide information whenever possible, an exemption under section 38(1)(b) of FOISA applies to some of the information you have requested because it is personal data of a third party, i.e. name, address, date of birth, qualifications, CV, etc. and disclosing it would contravene the data protection principles in Schedule 1 to the Data Protection Act 1998. This exemption is not subject to the 'public interest test', so we are not required to consider if the public interest in disclosing the information outweighs the public interest in applying the exemption.

An exemption under section 30(b)(i) of FOISA also applies to some of the information you have requested as it relates to unused draft press releases/press lines and media handling strategies (including timings of the report publication and background advice). We are not required to disclose the content of such advice/discussions as doing so would substantially inhibit the use of free and frank provision of advice.

Document 1 – Draft Initial Report

[attachment labelled as document 1]

Document 2 – Email Correspondence

From: [redacted – exemption applies]

Sent: 30 March 2017 14:11

To: [redacted – exemption applies]

Subject: Re: Draft Minutes and Report of the Second Meeting of the ICEA

Dear [redacted – exemption applies]

Thanks for the report. I think it is an excellent summary of the meeting. I've made a few suggestions in track changes. These are limited in number but important, I think. There are also a couple of comments which you may find helpful.

With best wishes

[redacted – exemption applies]

[attachment labelled as document 2]

From: [redacted – exemption applies]

Sent: Tuesday, March 28, 2017 4:53 AM

To: [redacted – exemption applies]

Cc: [redacted – exemption applies]

Subject: Draft Minutes and Report of the Second Meeting of the ICEA

Dear Council Members

I attach the draft minutes and report from the second meeting of the International Council. Could you let me know if you have any comments by close on Friday 31 March? Both the minutes, and the report, will be published on the Scottish Government website once they have been cleared by yourselves and the Deputy First Minister.

Kind regards

[redacted – exemption applies]

[attachment same as document 1]

Document 3 – Email Correspondence

From: [redacted – exemption applies]

Sent: 04 April 2017 14:27

To: [redacted – exemption applies]

Subject: Re: Draft Minutes and Report of the Second Meeting of the ICEA

Thanks [redacted – exemption applies]. Would you consider "assuming" or "taking on" leadership roles" rather than "playing." This is minor so feel free to ignore it if you wish.

[redacted – exemption applies]

On Mar 27, 2017 3:53 PM, [redacted – exemption applies], wrote:

Dear Council Members

I attach the draft minutes and report from the second meeting of the International Council. Could you let me know if you have any comments by close on Friday 31 March? Both the minutes, and the report, will be published on the Scottish Government website once they have been cleared by yourselves and the Deputy First Minister.

Kind regards

[redacted – exemption applies]

[attachment same as document 1]

Document 4 – Email Correspondence

From: [redacted – exemption applies]

Sent: 31 March 2017 14:18

To: [redacted – exemption applies]

Subject: Re: Draft Minutes and Report of the Second Meeting of the ICEA

[redacted – exemption applies]

These look fine to me, a good summary.

Best

[redacted – exemption applies]

On 27 March 2017 at 08:52, [redacted – exemption applies], wrote:

Dear Council Members

I attach the draft minutes and report from the second meeting of the International Council. Could you let me know if you have any comments by close on Friday 31 March? Both the minutes, and the report, will be published on the Scottish Government website once they have been cleared by yourselves and the Deputy First Minister.

Kind regards

[redacted – exemption applies]

[attachment same as document 1]

Document 5 – Email Correspondence

From: [redacted – exemption applies]

Sent: 04 April 2017 21:39

To: [redacted – exemption applies]

Cc: [redacted – exemption applies]

Minutes and Report of the Second Meeting of the ICEA

Dear [redacted – exemption applies]

Thank you for you and your colleagues' work on these materials. I agree they are a fair recording of our meetings and our proposed report. I have attached some minor edits to both documents.

With best regards,

[redacted – exemption applies]

[attachment labelled as document 5]

From: [redacted – exemption applies]

Sent: April-04-17 9:20 AM

To: [redacted – exemption applies]

Cc: [redacted – exemption applies]

Subject: Re: Draft Minutes and Report of the Second Meeting of the ICEA

Dear [redacted – exemption applies]

Thank you so much for these. I think they are detailed, fair and largely accurate recording of our discussions.

There is one alteration - as group I think we emphasize evidence-informed, rather than evidence-based. Theses about professional judgment informed by best evidence, not dependent on a fixed view of such evidence.

Second, it would be helpful to include reference to the discussion with students that [redacted – exemption applies] initiated...that students would like to discuss contemporary social issues more in school but, apart from one course, feel that the focus on examinations crowds out the time for doing that.

Looking forward to working with you next time.

[redacted – exemption applies]

On Mon, Mar 27, 2017 at 4:52 PM, [redacted – exemption applies], wrote:
Dear Council Members

I attach the draft minutes and report from the second meeting of the International Council. Could you let me know if you have any comments by close on Friday 31 March? Both the minutes, and the report, will be published on the Scottish Government website once they have been cleared by yourselves and the Deputy First Minister.

Kind regards

[redacted – exemption applies]

[attachment same as document 1]

Document 6 – Email Correspondence

From: [redacted – exemption applies]
Sent: 10 April 2017 14:38
To: [redacted – exemption applies]
Subject: Re: Draft Minutes and Report of the Second Meeting of the ICEA

[redacted – exemption applies]

I was supposed to send my response already earlier about the minutes. I was reading comments from others and have actually nothing to add to those. I am also happy with your suggestion below.

Best,

[redacted – exemption applies]

From: [redacted – exemption applies]
Sent: 10 April 2017 15:03
To: [redacted – exemption applies]
Cc: [redacted – exemption applies]
Subject: Re: Draft Minutes and Report of the Second Meeting of the ICEA

Thanks, [redacted – exemption applies]

How about this?

- Identify a systematic, sequenced and selective plan for literacy, including a research based approach to improving learning and development, that ensures they can both achieve targeted academic goals while being responsive to the unique needs of each learner.

[redacted – exemption applies]

From: [redacted – exemption applies]
Date: Monday, April 10, 2017 at 6:08 AM
To: [redacted – exemption applies]
Cc: [redacted – exemption applies]
Subject: RE: Draft Minutes and Report of the Second Meeting of the ICEA

Dear Council Members

Thank you for your comments on the draft minutes and report, most of which I have been able to incorporate quite easily. However, I wanted to clarify the language I include around the recommendation on literacy and numeracy. [redacted – exemption applies] has asked for a reconsideration of the language and, as this is the Council's report, I need you all, as a Council, to agree on the wording used.

I have tweaked the recommendation slightly to take into account [redacted – exemption applies] concerns – I don't want to change it too much from what was stated at the meeting. Are you happy with the following:

- Identify a systematic, sequenced and selective plan for literacy, including a research based approach to improving learning and development, that ensures they can both can be delivered in a dynamic fashion across the curriculum rather than in isolation .

If you are not content, could you please suggest alternative wording? I should be grateful if you could get back to me as soon as possible, as I need to put this to DFM tomorrow.

Thanks in advance

[redacted – exemption applies]

From: [redacted – exemption applies]
Sent: 28 March 2017 15:53
To: [redacted – exemption applies]
Cc: [redacted – exemption applies]
Subject: Re: Draft Minutes and Report of the Second Meeting of the ICEA

Thanks for the opportunity to review and comment. I have made a comment within the text (see attachment) related to the idea of a "systematic, sequenced, and selective plan" for literacy and numeracy achievement. I hope we can re-consider this language in terms of the degree to which that phrase suggests responsiveness to different learners' learning needs and styles, and the extent to which such language positions teachers as professionals who are knowledgeable of a range of research-based approaches to literacy and numeracy

Comment [U1]: The research in literacy is not in agreement that any one "plan" for delivering literacy instruction is effective for all students. Instead, the research shows that a dynamic and multi-faceted approach should be taken to literacy instruction that allows teachers to be responsive to the learning needs of each child, as the learner grows and develops. Perhaps we can consider language that suggests a plan for literacy and numeracy instruction is broadly inclusive of research-based approaches to improving literacy and numeracy instruction and learning/development. This plan would include a blend of cognitive and socioculturally based instructional practices that our "well-trained" professionals above can draw from, using their teacher judgment in making decisions about the specific type of instruction a learner needs given the student's I development stage, the learning task at hand, and social/cultural factors.

I am happy to provide references as needed related to these claims in literacy education. I also work with a number of colleagues who do work in STEM education and equity and can work with them to provide relevant sources as needed as well.

instruction and development and who can draw from a range of strategies that work to ensure each child receives the most appropriate form of instruction.

Thanks for your great work in drafting the report.

All my best,

[redacted – exemption applies]

[attachment labelled as document 6]

From: [redacted – exemption applies]

Date: Tuesday, March 28, 2017 at 3:03 AM

To: [redacted – exemption applies]

Cc: [redacted – exemption applies]

Subject: RE: Draft Minutes and Report of the Second Meeting of the ICEA

Dear all,

Let me start first with suggestions for revision. In the report,

- para 5: probably more appropriate to say “As a result, the Council identified three priority areas where it feels the Scottish Government needs to concentrate its efforts in order to deliver the improvements set out in the NIF, whilst retaining the vision and holistic approach of CfE.”
- Para 12: I think we had a suggestion about teachers advancing by playing leadership roles in leading change in pedagogy in a certain subject area.

Thank you.

Best wishes,

[redacted – exemption applies]

From: [redacted – exemption applies]

Sent: Tuesday, March 28, 2017 4:53 AM

To: [redacted – exemption applies]

Cc: [redacted – exemption applies]

Subject: Draft Minutes and Report of the Second Meeting of the ICEA

Dear Council Members

I attach the draft minutes and report from the second meeting of the International Council. Could you let me know if you have any comments by close on Friday 31 March? Both the minutes, and the report, will be published on the Scottish Government website once they have been cleared by yourselves and the Deputy First Minister.

Kind regards

[redacted – exemption applies]

[attachment same as document 1]

Document 7 – Email Correspondence

From: [redacted – exemption applies]

Sent: 18 April 2017 12:13

To: [redacted – exemption applies] Deputy First Minister and Cabinet Secretary for Education and Skills

Cc: First Minister; Minister for Childcare and Early Years; Minister for Further Education, Higher Education and Science; DG Learning & Justice; Robertson FMG (Fiona); Maxwell B (Bill); Bell D (Donna); Hicks C (Clare); Bruce A (Andrew); MacDougall A (Audrey); Logan G (Graeme); [redacted – exemption applies]; McAllister C (Colin); [redacted – exemption applies]

Subject: RE: International Council of Education Advisers - Second Meeting - Submission seeking approval to publish minutes and report

[redacted – exemption applies]

Thanks. DFM is content with these recommendations.

[redacted – exemption applies]

From: [redacted – exemption applies]

Sent: 11 April 2017 16:40

To: Deputy First Minister and Cabinet Secretary for Education and Skills

Cc: First Minister; Minister for Childcare and Early Years; Minister for Further Education, Higher Education and Science; DG Learning & Justice; Robertson FMG (Fiona); Maxwell B (Bill); Bell D (Donna); Hicks C (Clare); Bruce A (Andrew); MacDougall A (Audrey); Logan G (Graeme); [redacted – exemption applies] McAllister C (Colin); [redacted – exemption applies]

Subject: International Council of Education Advisers - Second Meeting - Submission seeking approval to publish minutes and report

[redacted – exemption applies]

I attach a routine submission seeking the Deputy First Minister's approval to publish the minutes of the second meeting of the International Council of Education Advisers (ICEA), and the report of the initial findings of the ICEA. Both documents have been seen and agreed by the members of the Council.

Please contact me should you require any further information.

[redacted – exemption applies]

[attachment labelled as document 7]

Document 8 – Email Correspondence

From: [redacted – exemption applies]

Sent: 11 April 2017 16:40

To: Deputy First Minister and Cabinet Secretary for Education and Skills

Cc: First Minister; Minister for Childcare and Early Years; Minister for Further Education,

Higher Education and Science; DG Learning & Justice; Robertson FMG (Fiona); Maxwell B (Bill); Bell D (Donna); Hicks C (Clare); Bruce A (Andrew); MacDougall A (Audrey); [redacted – exemption applies] McAllister C (Colin); [redacted – exemption applies]

Subject: International Council of Education Advisers - Second Meeting - Submission seeking approval to publish minutes and report

[redacted – exemption applies]

I attach a routine submission seeking the Deputy First Minister's approval to publish the minutes of the second meeting of the International Council of Education Advisers (ICEA), and the report of the initial findings of the ICEA. Both documents have been seen and agreed by the members of the Council.

Please contact me should you require any further information.

[redacted – exemption applies]

[attachment same as document 7]

Document 9 – Email Correspondence

From: Deputy First Minister and Cabinet Secretary for Education and Skills

Sent: 25 July 2017 12:20

To: [redacted – exemption applies]

Cc: Robertson FMG (Fiona); Bell D (Donna); [redacted – exemption applies]; Communications DFM & Education; McAllister C (Colin); [redacted – exemption applies]

Subject: RE: Publication date for ICEA Report

[redacted – exemption applies]

Sorry for the delay on this.

DFM is content for the report to be published.

[redacted – exemption applies]

From: [redacted – exemption applies]

Sent: 12 July 2017 10:40

To: [redacted – exemption applies]

Cc: Robertson FMG (Fiona); Bell D (Donna); [redacted – exemption applies]; Communications DFM & Education; McAllister C (Colin); [redacted – exemption applies]

Subject: RE: Publication date for ICEA Report

Hi [redacted – exemption applies]

Can you let me know if the DFM has made a decision on this please? We are keen to get the report published online as soon as possible.

The DFM cleared an FOI response stating that the report will be published within 12 weeks of the request date which is the 27th July and we have also received media queries asking what the status of the report is.

Grateful if you could let me know.

Many thanks,

[redacted – exemption applies]