

Towards a robust, resilient wellbeing economy for Scotland

Report on written submissions to the Advisory Group
on Economic Recovery

Report on written submissions to the advisory group on economic recovery

1. Introduction.....	4
1.1 About this report	4
1.2 The 4 Capitals.....	5
2. Business - economic capital	7
2.1 Investment (general) and the Scottish National Investment Bank	8
2.2 Higher and Further Education (Direct economic impacts).....	12
2.3 Existing institutions (economic development)	15
2.4 Fiscal Framework	15
2.5 Tax.....	16
2.6 Conditionality	19
2.7 Rural.....	20
2.8 City deals, Local Economic Partnerships, Regional Economic Partnerships	21
2.9 Data.....	22
2.10 Housing	24
2.11 Creative industries, tourism and hospitality.....	25
2.12 Digital.....	27
2.13 Transport.....	29
3. Human Capital - Education and Skills	32
3.1 Fair Work	33
3.2 Skills	34
3.3 Employability schemes	37
3.4 Jobs Guarantee	37
3.5 Labour market reform	38
4. Social Capital - Equalities	39
4.1 Place based interventions	40
4.2 Equalities	42
4.3 Third Sector.....	45
4.4 Care Sector including carers	46
5. Natural Capital – Environment	49
5.1 Prioritisation of green investment and climate change policies	49
5.2 Measurement and assessment.....	58
6. Submissions from Business.....	60
6.1 Scotland’s Competitive Advantage	60
6.2 Businesses and Sectors	60
6.3 Labour Market and Skills	61
6.4 Net Zero Wellbeing Economy	62

Report on written submissions to the advisory group on economic recovery

6.5	Collaboration.....	62
7.	Submissions from Individuals	64
7.1	Business - economic capital	64
7.2	Human Capital - Education and Skills	66
7.3	Social Capital.....	67
7.4	Natural Capital – Environment.....	68
8.	List of submissions	71

1. Introduction

1.1 About this report

The Advisory Group on Economic Recovery was given less than three months to consider and advise on Scotland's path to economic recovery after the COVID-19 pandemic. A key part of the Group's approach was a dynamic programme of engagement around the country, together with a process to gather external evidence, insights and advice, at pace, from a wide cross-section of organisations, businesses and individuals across Scotland.

This evidence-gathering had four main strands:

- A series of specific inputs, survey and research activity commissioned from particular organisations and individuals;
- A written request to a range of key organisations for submissions in response to a set of structured issues for consideration;
- A structured programme of engagement with business organisations and individual business leaders organised on the Group's behalf by Scottish Enterprise; and
- An open call for views on the Scottish Government's website, based on a series of questions and issues.

The specific inputs mentioned in the first point above were summarised in the Group's main report, and were published individually on the Scottish Government's website alongside the report itself.

This report provides a summary of the other strands, which between them generated some 400 wide-ranging written contributions in a period of under a month. Its aim is twofold: to give a picture of the range of views and evidence submitted to the Group to inform its discussions, and equally importantly to create a structured depository of material that may assist future policy development by the Scottish Government and others.

The Group decided to view Scotland's economy through the lens of four "pillars" of capital – business (financial and physical capital), people (human capital), community (social capital) and environment (natural capital). Accordingly we have sought, as far as possible, to structure the summary of contributions under these four pillars: although some aspects of the contributions, and some of the proposals put forward, address more than pillar, or in some cases don't sit particularly neatly within that structure.

Report on written submissions to the advisory group on economic recovery

The summary tables are ordered alphabetically by organisation; some individual contributions are mentioned in the text. We have not sought to interpret, pass judgement on or offer a response to contributions: merely to lay them out thematically.

The key messages from businesses emerging from the programme organised by Scottish Enterprise are summarised separately in section 6. Some submissions from individual businesses sent directly to the Group towards the end of its work also appear in the main discussion.

Written contributions from individuals are summarised in section 7.

There is a list of submissions at the end of this report (section 8); and we are publishing all those for which we received consent to publish alongside this report, so that they can be consulted individually.

1.2 The 4 Capitals

As discussed above, the Group's report and, especially, the analytical annex were framed around the 4 Capitals:

- Environment – the world's stocks of natural assets, which include geology, soil, air, water and all living things;
- People - the knowledge, skills, and health that people accumulate throughout their lives;
- Community - the networks together with shared norms, values and understandings that facilitate co-operation within or among groups;
- Business – the financial, intellectual and physical assets from applying human productive activities to natural capital, which are used to provide a flow of goods and services.

These are illustrated in the figure below.

Under Business, we have also included those aspects of economic activity that relate directly to government – i.e. tax reform, the relationship between administrations – and the economic impact of higher and further education (although this sector is also covered under skills).



A submission from Anand. P, Blanchflower. D & Bovens. L, et. al.)¹ contained a wealth of useful description and analysis spanning all 4 Capitals. Extracts from this submission have been used within the introductions to each section.

Governments are now considering how to develop policies for economic recovery responding to Covid 19 and it is particularly welcome that some, like the Scottish government, are explicitly considering the issues for it calls the 'wellbeing economy'. There is no general, single definition of the wellbeing economy although the territory has been investigated from a theoretical and practical perspective by Sen (1985), Layard (2006), Anand and Piketty (2011), O'Donnell (2018) and many others. Within economics, these ideas have encouraged both the OECD and the United Nations to develop multi-dimensional indicators of population wellbeing which they continue to monitor. In the case of the United Nations, its Human Development Index has provided a basis for thinking about the wellbeing outcomes beyond income including health, education and latterly gender equity. In turn, the index has motivated the development of the millennium development goals more recently replaced by the sustainable development goals.

Within the OECD, a Better Life compendium and programme of work based on measurement and monitoring was instigated in 2011 and subsequently OECD policy analysis incorporates consideration of human wellbeing into its analysis of policy and the economic environment across its portfolio of work. National leaders in various countries have also drawn on concepts of wellbeing in their policies and this includes an exercise by the Office of National Statistics in the early 2010s which produced a wheel of over 40 indicators. This has had a lasting impact and perhaps more importantly, there are now government officials who are aware of the ways additional ways of assessing economic activity that add to the traditional financial measures.

Extract from Submission from Paul Anand et. al.

¹ Paul Anand, Open, London School of Economics, Oxford, UK, Danny Blanchflower, Dartmouth, USA, Luc Bovens, North Carolina, USA, Jan-Emmanuel De Neve, Oxford, Carol Graham, Brookings, USA, Brian Nolan, Oxford, UK, Christian Krekel, London School of Economics, UK, Johanna Thoma, London School of Economics, UK

2. Business - economic capital

For business, economic capital (as we use the term) includes physical, intellectual and financial assets. The traditional notion of (physical) capital is the outcome of applying human capital to natural capital to generate physical assets that provide a flow of goods or services, with the classic example being the machinery in a factory but also including wider aspects of public (or private) infrastructure (roads, bridges, power stations). Whilst some notions of intellectual capital are closely related to human capital, a reasonable view is to consider the “intangible assets” of organisations (goodwill, brand recognition and intellectual property) that are wider than a single person, whilst accepting that this also has links to social capital in some respects. Finally, financial capital consists of the financial resources of organisations and is crucial in making decisions around the use of the other capitals.

Use a wellbeing lens to prioritise or refine economic policy. The wellbeing economy framework can be applied to all areas of conventional economic policy in which case it may generate insights, and sensitivities to need, that do not emerge easily or at all from a traditional efficiency-plus-equity approach. The experience of OECD and UNDP can be drawn on here. In this case of governmental response to Covid 19, wellbeing outcomes related to the labour market events can be used to identify issues and opportunities additional to traditional questions of productivity and workforce composition as we demonstrate below

Consider implications of shortening value chains around the world. It has been suggested that in the medium term, some companies and in some cases, countries will take action to shorten their value chains for at least some classes of goods, such as food, health-care supplies and digital related products. This could lead to a reduction in exports combined with greater opportunities for some home based producers. The issues may not be significant for some countries but many will need to consider what might be done if a major export industry were to suffer from other countries reducing their imports.

Ensure taxes due from digital activity follow citizens. The rise of online retailing is causing tax revenues to be diverted from places where people live and work to the jurisdictions where head-offices are located. Because taxes exist to provide public goods within a jurisdiction, this is becoming increasingly problematic for the financing of their provision. Two thirds of the world’s privately owned newer companies valued more than \$1bn are based in just two countries for example, and so it is important for wellbeing economies that principles of fairness be brought to bear more closely on the taxation of large digital corporations.

Develop early indicators. It is important to recognise that at international level there is considerable awareness of the changing data environment. National statistical offices are involved in developing new measures and methods of data collection and the production of early indicators by the UK Office of National Statistics appears to have been of value. It could be useful to policy makers in Scotland to have early indicators of sales based on monthly reports from a sample of firms across the size range and covering all sectors, employment and investment on a monthly basis for the next 6 to 12 months for internal monitoring purposes. Business confidence data may already be collected in this way but might not be sufficiently specific. A repeated series would give economists in government a focal point set of figures to shape thinking and online panels can be developed at low cost. A similar survey of quality of life could be conducted quite affordably with citizens on a quarterly basis using online panels. Conventional data reporting cycles are often too slow for the needs that might be expected over the next year or two.

Extract from Submission from Paul Anand et. al.

2.1 Investment (general) and the Scottish National Investment Bank

Issues relating to investment featured prominently in submissions to the Group. We received a wide range of responses calling for specific investment in specific areas. Investment in Human capital (Skills and Education) is discussed in section 3 and Natural capital is covered in section 5 and more specific sector based investment is discussed within separate areas later in section 2. This specific section deals with those responses that were more general, or which related to the role and activities of the forthcoming Scottish National Investment Bank (the Bank).

A number of respondents made reference to the importance of the Bank in the economic recovery from Covid-19. There was a general view that the concept of the Bank was now even more important, with no dissenting voices on this issue at all. A number of respondents suggested that the missions of the Bank should be revisited and adapted to a post-C-19 context. For example, the Corra Foundation suggested a specific link to reach existing third sector organisations and social enterprises. A number of respondents, including Friends of the Earth, called for the Bank to have its level of capitalisation increased (from the existing £2 billion over 10 years): others (including the Wellbeing Economy Alliance) focused on how the Bank should align its work to existing frameworks. A significant number of respondents suggested a focus on natural capital.

Others who specifically mentioned Green Investment included:

- Paths for All
- Scottish Environment Link
- Scottish Renewables
- SSE
- Woodland Trust Scotland
- Stop Climate Chaos

Report on written submissions to the advisory group on economic recovery

The importance of patient capital or long-term investment was also emphasised by a number of submissions, including the Federation of Small Businesses (Scotland), Homes for Scotland and Scotland for Employee Ownership, with each putting forward suggestions relating to their specific areas of interest.

Corra Foundation	The Bank missions should be revisited and adapted to a post-C-19 context, including specific reference to existing third sector organisations and social enterprises.
HIE	Pivot the Bank to be responsive to needs of the recovery phase ensuring criteria doesn't discriminate against remote and rural Scotland. Information provision crucial.
SOSE	Use the Bank and other enterprise areas to develop investments for just transitions and small scale renewables. Maximise the green energy opportunities- offshore and onshore wind.
Unison	Role for an up scaled Bank in strategically targeted support for research and development programmes, including government, companies and universities, alongside investment in start-up companies in the solar panel industry, wind turbines and other forms of renewable energy.
Friends of the Earth Scotland	Increase the level of capitalisation of the Bank.
Poverty Alliance/ Wellbeing Economy Alliance	The Bank needs to align its work with frameworks such as the National Performance Framework and the Business Pledge.
Institute and Faculty of Advocates	The pandemic may lead to deferring a deferral in investment and so SNIB will have a key role to play in leveraging in private capital for enterprise and innovation.

As noted above, the Institute and Faculty of Advocates made specific reference to the potential role of the Bank in leveraging in private investment: this was picked up by several respondents in a wider context, for example the Clyde Gateway initiative, who underlined the importance of derisking investment in regeneration areas; and SOLACE, who suggested accelerating economic infrastructure investment programmes, including measures to strengthen the delivery and maximise the impact of City / Growth Deals (see section 2.8).

Turning to infrastructure investment, the Infrastructure Commission for Scotland² made a number of suggestions as shown in the table below:

² The Commission fed into the work of the group at an early stage and the record of their response is taken from their final report.

Leadership	To provide leadership and demonstrate intent, the Scottish Government should prioritise all new infrastructure investment decisions based on their contribution to the delivery of an inclusive net zero carbon economy.
Place	To achieve an inclusive net zero carbon economy, the Scottish Government should put “place” at the heart of coherent, infrastructure prioritisation and planning.
Making the most of existing assets	Most of the underlying infrastructure that will be used in 30 years’ time already exists today. It is therefore essential that these assets are most effectively and efficiently utilised, maintained and enhanced to net zero carbon readiness
Heat and Transport	Key priorities for Scotland in reaching net zero carbon over the next 30 years will be accelerating the decarbonisation of heat and transport.
Regulation	To incentivise investment at the necessary pace and scale to meet future infrastructure requirements for Scotland, regulation will be a critical component to the delivery of a 30-year inclusive net zero carbon economy vision.
Digital & Technology	Ensure every citizen, organisation and business in Scotland has the ability to access digital public services, to undertake trade and commerce and to participate in future global economic markets regardless of geographic location.
The role of the public	Much greater participation of the public needs to be incorporated as an integral part of infrastructure investment decision-making.
Independent long-term advice	To enable government, regulators and industry to make the transition to a long-term, coherent, systems wide approach to place-based infrastructure strategy and planning.

Aspects of this were picked up by a number of other submissions, including the Corra Foundation. Digital and Technology investment is specifically considered in section 2.12 and issues around data in in section 2.9. A number of respondents stressed the importance of a fully updated Infrastructure Investment Plan for Scotland. There were also a number of suggestions around the importance of planning and appraisal systems. This included suggestions from Scottish National Women’s Organisation, The Poverty and Inequality Commission, Women’s Enterprise Scotland and the WISE Centre for Economic Justice that specifically mention equalities issues (picked up in section 4.2). A more general view on the importance of investor focused planning was submitted by the Glasgow Economic Recovery Group (see box below).

Investor Focused Planning – A critical element in planning the future needs of businesses is to ensure that forums are in place to understand the impact lockdown has had across sectors and develop feedback channels that allow new policies and intervention support to be developed.

It will be important to take existing funding arrangements and reallocate them to businesses most impacted by COVID-19.

Submission by Glasgow Economic Recovery Group

Specifically, the importance of taking a wider than purely economic view on investment was a common theme amongst many submissions. Natural capital components of this topic are discussed in section 5. Of particular note was the promotion of the concept of social return on investment and/or the notion of “preventative spend”. See box below on submission from YouthLink Scotland.

A concerted effort needs to take place on the social return for investment in youth work. The youth work sector is therefore crucial to any meaningful renewal. The “common weal” benefits from having young people who are engaged in positive activities – they make valuable contributions to their communities.

YouthLink Scotland commissioned research by Hall Aitken established the huge economic and social value of youth work. The social return on investment of youth work in Scotland is at least 3:1 – this means that for every £1 invested in youth work, at least £7 of value was created and the total value of youth work in Scotland is at least £656 million. This value includes both savings to public spend and economic gains (and this is a conservative estimate to avoid over-claiming – the actual impact could be much greater). Hall Aitken also outlined some of the longer-term outcomes of youth work resulting in reduced costs to the education system, increased personal earnings from better qualifications, reduced wage scar from youth unemployment, positive health behaviours such as reduced incidence of depression, reduced incidence of obesity, reduced incidence of STIs, greater productivity due to reduced absences, reduced costs of criminal justice

In 2011, the Christie Commission report called for moves towards preventative spending, estimating that as much as 40 per cent of all spending on public services is accounted for by interventions that could have been avoided by prioritising a preventative approach. Yet budget cuts have meant that Scotland is moving in the opposite direction and preventative work is not being prioritised. Instead, high levels of public resources are poured into alleviating social problems and tackling “failure demand” – demand which could have been avoided by earlier preventative measures.

Submission from Youthlink Scotland.

Investment in specific sectors was a common theme and is dealt with in the sectoral analysis in subsequent sections:

- Housing (Section 0)
- Creative Industries, Tourism and Hospitality (Section 2.11)
- Digital (Section 2.12)
- Third sector (Section 4.3)
- Care sector (Section 4.4)

2.2 Higher and Further Education (Direct economic impacts)

Submissions stressed how hard the sector will be hit by the consequences of the pandemic. The Scottish Funding Council (SFC) estimated that Scottish universities face a loss of around £72 million in the current academic year. In their more optimistic Scenario 1, where the normal intake of new international students drops by half, Scottish Universities will face a collective operating deficit of £383.5 million in 2020-21: in their more pessimistic Scenario 2, if there is a complete drop in new international students in 2020-21, there could be an operating deficit of £651 million. Somewhere between the two would seem to be a reasonable likely case: even allowing for some new and returning international students, and further mitigating actions by institutions, SFC might still expect a deficit of at least £450-500 million. All 18 Scottish universities are expected to go into deficit in 2020-21 (the analysis does not include OU Scotland). See box for further details.

Universities

The OBR calculates that education will take the single hardest hit, with 90% of output affected. The higher education sector across the UK is particularly exposed to a fall in international students compared to other countries, as international students account for a higher proportion of our student bodies than most other countries. The current funding arrangements in Scotland have encouraged the growth of international and rUK students to cross-subsidise home student tuition, research activities and PhD students that are not funded at full economic cost.

Many universities are modelling 100% reductions in new intakes. Beyond the next academic year, there are cumulative annual effects from reduced international student intakes, with many institutions modelling 25-50% reductions in new intakes in 2021-22; 10-25% reductions in 2022-23; and 5-10% reductions in 2023-24.

Many universities will be operating at a severely increased deficit. 18 universities will report deficits in 2020-21. Three universities are projecting to move into a negative cash position by the end of 2020-21. The forecast net overdraft position for the three institutions amounts to around £54 million.

In the short term, the main impacts are cash-flow from paused grants; disrupted recruitment and inhibited staff retention; and the interruption of research.

Colleges

For this academic year, Scottish colleges face a loss of around £25 million due to COVID-19. All but three colleges are now forecasting deficits in 2019-20. The impact in 2020-21 is expected to be even more severe.

The 2019-20 sector-adjusted operating position is expected to move from a near break-even position to a deficit of £25 million. Six colleges had projected deficits pre-COVID;

however, only three colleges (two of which are non-incorporated) are now forecasting surpluses.

The main COVID-19 financial impacts include lower income from the following funding streams: European Social Fund; Fair Work Development Fund; tuition fees and education contracts; Skills Development Scotland; nursery; accommodation; catering; short-courses including evening classes; and other commercial activity including international income.

Submission from Scottish Funding Council

Universities Scotland made a number of detailed suggestions – see box.

Current situation

Universities and other organisations have changed and innovated, so has government. For instance, the Scottish Funding Council decided on a range of measures to adjust the bureaucratic burden on institutions whilst maintaining key reporting requirements. A positive legacy of the pandemic should be a fresh questioning of such systems and a resulting streamlining.

Universities' rapid transfer to wholly online delivery, building on a strong foundation already in place, will most likely have an enduring legacy which will enhance the student experience and drive innovation.

Investment in funding an undergraduate degree:

- has a rate of return of 7.2%;
- is repaid 19 years after a student's graduation; and
- generates over a graduate's lifetime a net benefit to public finances of £22,000.

Further, an increased investment in R&D of 8.6%:

- yields a net benefits from increased taxation worth NPV £3.5 billion;
- a rate of return of 27.1%; and
- is exceeded by the tax revenue generated as a result by year 6.

University capital investment yields major direct economic impacts with a GVA of over 5:1 for every £1 invested. A number of other countries, including economies often compared to Scotland such as New Zealand and the Nordic nations have already taken decisions to make additional investment in high level skills as part of a package of measures to support individuals and the post-COVID economy.

Further Policy prescriptions

Support mechanisms should be modified. The definitions of 'innovation' used in many schemes limit the scope to support organisations, particularly small and medium-sized enterprises (SMEs).

Collaborative projects between universities and public or private partners should be increased to address challenges arising from the pandemic.

Increase utilisation of innovation vouchers with larger projects and 'in kind' funding. Investment could be drawn from capital underspends as focused through universities this is categorised as capital spend and maximise use of mechanisms such as Knowledge Transfer Partnerships and sustain/increase capacity for business incubation and 'science parks'.

Consideration should be given to increasing the number of fully funded Taught Post Graduate (TPG) places in key economic sectors and the current TPG loan support package should be enhanced;

The university sector is considering whether, in combination with the above, the reduced fee for TPG courses offered by each institution to their own alumni might be offered reciprocally across the sector;

Developing upskilling and life-long learning through 'microcredentials' modules (standalone skills driven modules)

Submission from Universities Scotland

Reform Scotland noted the 2019 position of the university sector and issues around reliance on foreign students. Colleges Scotland also noted the college sector's role in supporting economic Recovery – and highlighted PACE- type services via colleges and a key role in working with SMEs in terms of engagement and support for innovation. This theme was picked up by the Glasgow Economic Recovery Group who suggested:

- Continuing education for those leaving schools / colleges / university – find ways of keeping people in further or higher education to ensure they continue to develop skills during the downturn including developing an enhanced curriculum for senior phase pupils due to leave school – with young people being encouraged now to stay in school, what will they be learning and how?
- Additional tertiary education provision – support graduates and school leavers in the next 6-12 months via top-up courses and additional postgraduate provision - would require some changes to be made via the Scottish Funding Council.

There was also discussion of the civic role of universities (Carnegie Trust UK) as anchor institutions and the idea of a review of the wider sector. See box.

A short SFC-led review of the Further and Higher Education sectors together with the scientific research institutes should be undertaken to ensure a new collegiate approach to support the broader natural economy in the form of education and training, research and innovation and consultancy, and business advice; reporting within three months.

Submission from Scotland's Rural College

Edinburgh University provided a detailed and technical submission with a range of policy suggestions that are covered under the other capitals and the Data discussion in section 2.9. Stirling University submitted a transport specific analysis that is covered in section 2.13 and section 5.

The role of universities in terms of Human Capital is discussed in section 3.

2.3 Existing institutions (economic development)

A small number of respondents covered issues specifically around the existing institutions in the economic development landscape (note that the City Region Deals and Economic Partnerships are covered separately in section 2.8). This was primarily around encouraging greater links between bodies. For example Kelvin Valley and Falkirk LEADER Local Action Group suggested ensuring research institutions are closely linked to growth hubs.

There was some very limited discussion of the idea of decentralising agencies and departments into locations where the benefit would be felt the most in terms of jobs and salaries and demographic stabilisation. These could act as the anchor institutions, in a similar manner to that suggested for universities in areas that are struggling because of lost sectors such as tourism. However, these suggestions did not really pick up on the impact on existing jobs in those instructions; and there were no specific detailed examples or proposals put forward.

Highlands and Island Enterprise suggested there should be encouragement of the devolution of substantial research and innovation funding to Scotland, especially to increase R&D capacity in institutions in less well-served regions. This was driven by the need for skills to support the “green recovery/revolution” to be assessed in a regional context and institutions resourced to respond effectively; ensuring that rural Scotland has the skills needed to develop and support a green economy

A number of other suggestions are picked up in Place-based Interventions (section 4.1) or under Skills (section 3.2) where the link to existing institutions is more tenuous.

Finally, Social Enterprise Scotland suggested that too many public services in Scotland are organisation-centred to suit institutions; whereas the third sector and social enterprise focus on structural, productive capacity - creating human capital, with local impact and outcomes and the genuine co-production, design and delivery of citizen centred services.

2.4 Fiscal Framework

There were a small number of submissions that related to the Fiscal Framework between the Scottish and UK Governments. Many of these submissions specifically related to tax powers

and are covered in section 2.5. The framework itself is due to be reviewed in 2021/22. The situation is summed up well in the submission from Low Incomes Tax Reform. See box.

It should be noted that Scotland's particular combination of funding sources may place constraints upon some of its options that may not be faced by the UK as a whole. This is because the UK government has monetary sovereignty, i.e. the exclusive authority to designate the legal tender forms of payment, and to control the issuance and retirement of the legal tender. Scotland does not have this ability. Instead, it is funded by a combination of revenues from Scottish taxes, the block grant and limited borrowing.

Submission from Low Incomes Tax Reform

The Scottish Council of Voluntary Organisations was amongst those calling for a thorough evaluation of the Fiscal Framework that should then inform future proposals and decisions. Low Incomes Tax Reform were more specific in suggesting an examination of the fiscal impacts of the coronavirus support programmes and how funding announced by the UK Government has translated into funds available for the Scottish Government, via the Block Grant. This will help to establish whether the Fiscal Framework has operated as expected and whether it has worked appropriately in these exceptional circumstances.

A substantial submission on this topic was received from Reform Scotland. See box.

Powers of the Parliament: Prior to this crisis, Scotland did not have an adequate tax basket, borrowing powers and fiscal settlement to allow it to try different fiscal measures. That lack of tools, particularly with reference to borrowing powers, is now even more acute. There is a limit to what can be done, and what stimulus can be employed, when the powers are so hugely restricted. Corporation Tax has been devolved to Northern Ireland. It needs to be devolved to Scotland too. This would also correct the current situation where two self-employed people have similar income/profit levels, with one paying corporation tax to Westminster and the other income tax to Holyrood. Borrowing powers need to be reviewed and the planned revision of the fiscal framework, planned for 2021, should be brought forward.

Immigration: Scotland has a far greater reliance on immigration than the rest of the UK. The crisis has highlighted our need for working-age immigrants in key worker roles. Scottish-specific solutions are required. Current legislation would require this to be managed from Westminster, but Scotland-specific programmes have been used before and need to be again.

Submission from Reform Scotland

2.5 Tax

There were a large number of submissions on tax (or charge) reform. A significant number of these would require further devolution of powers.

A selection of those that could be undertaken with existing powers is shown in the table below.

Built Environment Forum Scotland	Changes to taxation structures for traditional buildings towards Incentivisation for use and reuse of traditional buildings
Citizen's Advice Scotland	The water charging system can be improved - System that links a household's weekly income or wealth with their Council Tax band when determining who should receive assistance
HIE	Review of non-domestic rates and land and buildings transaction tax (LBTT). mechanisms, including planning regulation and taxation, to address the issues of empty and second homes
Historic Environment Scotland	No rates reduction to empty properties.
Homes for Scotland	LBTT reliefs for energy efficiency
Inclusion Scotland	Reform tax system to reduce regressivity, especially Council Tax.
Scottish Land Commission	Considering bringing all non-domestic land onto the valuation role and replacing existing non-domestic rates with some form of land value tax. Tax incentives - to encourage the repurposing of commercial property, avoid the creation of another legacy of persistent land dereliction and support a smoother structural transition
Scottish Property Federation	Discussion of stability of LBTT revenues.
SOLACE Scotland	Fiscal levers to reflect local priorities
The Poverty and Inequality Commission	Reform council tax and introduce new, innovative local taxes such as those highlighted by IPPR Scotland
Unison	Permitted debt levels for public bodies will need to be sharply increased. The government should make use of its powers to borrow through issuing long term bonds. There is also considerable scope for savings in the use of PF/PPP/NPD schemes ³ through closer monitoring and in some cases refinancing schemes. The reform of local government finance to build a stronger more equitable system able to support public enterprise.

³ https://www.audit-scotland.gov.uk/uploads/docs/report/2020/nr_200128_npd_hubs_pr.pdf

Report on written submissions to the advisory group on economic recovery

In terms of Air Passenger Duty, there were a number of submissions in favour of abolition for economic recovery reasons, perhaps in the short term (for the tourism and hospitality sectors): but a corresponding number that suggested an increase for environmental reasons.

In terms of areas where the SG does not have current powers, the most common suggestions were variations to VAT, to inform local and national policy choices; windfall taxes on digital or crisis-related profits; and the introduction of forms of wealth taxation.

HIE	Power to vary VAT to address other policy priorities and support community led solutions.
Friends of the Earth Scotland	Improve the fairness of the tax system by supporting progressivity of a broad tax base that complements labour income taxation with the taxation of capital.
Highland Boundary Ltd	Lower corporation tax for start-ups and small businesses Vary taxation between sectors to encourage inward investment and innovation Follow examples of other countries in positive wealth distribution. Higher taxation to provide for all in society
Historic Environment Scotland	VAT – repairs vs New Build
Paths for All	Control of taxes aligned to road transport (Vehicle Excise Duty and Fuel Duty) to improve places to live and public transport
Poverty Alliance/ Wellbeing Economy Alliance	A windfall tax should be explored as some firms will have made significant gains from the pandemic. Reshape the economy to one that creates more equal outcomes from the outset, ‘predistribution’ – influence bad firm behaviour
Royal Scottish National Orchestra	A renewed ability to claim orchestra or theatre tax relief, unless this could be maintained on the basis of the previous (Pre Covid 19) year’s accounts, perhaps at 80% reflecting the principles of the furlough scheme.
Scottish Communities Finance Ltd	A wealth tax will allow the benefits of AI/ Robotics/Social Media to be more widely spread as the implications for employment and social interaction from these developments is significant. Development of SG tax levers; Tourist taxes-aid remuneration and up-skilling of tourist industry.
Scottish Communities Finance Ltd	Wealth taxes have to be introduced so that the immediate financial burden of COVID and the longer term transition to greener economy doesn’t fall on employees and small taxpayers. A wealth tax will allow the benefits of AI/ Robotics/Social Media to be more widely spread as the implications for employment and social interaction from these developments is significant.

Report on written submissions to the advisory group on economic recovery

	<p>Development of SG tax levers; Tourist taxes-aid remuneration and up-skilling of tourist industry. An energy fund based on the proceeds of renewable energy developed. Road taxes-put towards green transport infrastructure.</p>
Scottish Human Rights Commission	<p>Explore taxation options on wealth and corporate revenues from the digital sector as one which will make extra profits due to the pandemic</p>
Scottish Human Rights Commission	<p>Rights based approach to (progressive) tax reform</p>
Scottish Land Estates	<p>VAT on tourism businesses should be cut. By increasing the threshold for VAT registration or allowing a lower rate for small business, growth will be encouraged and could lead to a positive impact on the amount of taxation collected. Allowing greater use of sideways tax relief will help to secure the future of diversified businesses and enable them to survive for the future.</p> <p>Skills development and training to be eligible to similar tax treatment to research & development tax credits.</p>
STV	<p>An advertising tax credit to leverage the power of advertising to kick-start the economy;</p>
SURF	<p>Introducing a 'Tobin Tax' on financial trading.</p>
The Poverty and Inequality Commission	<p>Include requiring large companies to publish their country by country reporting, under either OECD or Global Reporting Initiative standards, to level the playing field for smaller and domestic companies. Businesses could be also be incentivised through the tax system to promote positive business practices such as fair work or low carbon approaches.</p>
Transform Scotland	<p>Effort should be made to shift taxation from investment and labour on to polluting activities, particularly highlighting that there is no case for reducing taxation on aviation.</p>
Transition Black Isle	<p>Tax system reconfiguration Wealth Tax</p>

2.6 Conditionality

There were a number of submissions that suggested various forms of conditionality to government support, both generally and in the context of Covid-19 recovery. Some of these related to Fair Work and the business pledge: but the majority related to climate change. Some specific examples are shown in the table below.

Report on written submissions to the advisory group on economic recovery

Aberdeen Climate Action	Align government spending to net zero through conditionality on businesses support
Ecometrica Group	Overriding role of the state in the bail out will give it a much stronger say in regulation and performance
Just Transition Commission	Private sector engagement and commitments in relation to transition planning may be one appropriate pre-condition for companies currently lobbying for government funding or bailouts.
Poverty Alliance/ Wellbeing Economy Alliance	Making the adoption of at least the three core elements of the Business Pledge a condition of receiving public funds would do more to encourage best practice.
Scottish Environment LINK	Business support packages must be conditional on net zero measures taken by the company
Scottish Forum on Natural Capital	Decisions on financial or other support should be contingent on how applicant businesses are reducing emissions, managing land (where relevant), selecting suppliers, managing waste, and raising awareness of nature and climate change among employees and customers.
Women's Enterprise Scotland	Gender-based conditionality

2.7 Rural

There were a large number of submissions touching on rural issues. The differential impact of the virus on rural economies dependent on either tourism and hospitality or primary industries was a key theme of these submissions. There were numerous suggestions as to the policy responses that could mitigate these impacts. However, there was significant overlap between specifically rural issues and discussion in submissions around Place based Intervention (section 4.1) Employability (section 3.3), and issues around Natural Capital which is concentrated in Scotland's rural areas (section 5).

Aberdeen Climate Action	Create employment opportunities in rural and island communities through Scotland's blue economy by coastal regeneration, aquaculture and offshore renewables.
Crown Estate	Create employment opportunities in rural and island communities through Scotland's blue economy by coastal regeneration, aquaculture and offshore renewables. Promote community ownership of low carbon energy generation as a means of reducing fuel poverty and create more resilient local economies in rural and island communities.

Report on written submissions to the advisory group on economic recovery

HALO Scotland	<p>Commercial farming needs to move towards a sustainable farming industry improving soil carbon and fertility, local/regional food supply, climate-resilience, minimum emissions, and maximum biodiversity</p> <p>Research into plasma-reactor manufacture of nitrogen for agriculture should be accelerated.</p> <p>More applied research and appropriate allowances for innovation within the agricultural and rural sector.</p>
National Farmers’ Union Scotland	<p>Encourage consumption of local produce through Public procurement practices which support local sourcing.</p> <p>Adopt measures to protect and enhance capacity of food producers such as:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Encouraging farm diversification • Securing inward investment to enhance processing capacity • Maintaining flows of seasonal labour
Scottish Enterprise Rural Leaders	<p>Planning rules should be updated and fit for purpose with an eye on the growth of the economy and the potential benefits of new developments, whether commercial or residential. A “Rural first” policy is needed for future rollout of 5G and broadband provision</p>
Scottish Environment LINK	<p>Reform agricultural support payments to promote nature and climate-friendly food production.</p>
Scottish Natural Heritage	<p>Nature-based tourism – long-term investment in transforming land use and importance of future rural support</p>
SEPA	<p>Reduce environmental impact of food and drinks industry through working with SEPA and NFUS to move more quickly through regulation and deploy new methods.</p> <p>Implement Sustainable Growth Agreements with food and drinks sector to improve resource efficiency.</p>
SOSE	<p>Development of traditional national infrastructure such as road and rail will help develop rural economies in the South of Scotland.</p>

2.8 City deals, Local Economic Partnerships, Regional Economic Partnerships

There was widespread confirmation of the importance of the City Region Growth Deals and Local and Regional Economic Partnerships. Whilst it was generally viewed that the SG has a reasonable approach to localised economic development, there were calls for further local devolution of powers and responsibilities.

This was allied to several calls for the City Region Growth Deals to be reviewed and/or accelerated to ensure that investment and wider activity can respond to the post-virus landscape. There are obvious links to other capitals, including the suggestion that the City

Report on written submissions to the advisory group on economic recovery

Region Growth Deals, in particular, be used as a mechanism for promoting policies that assist the transition to net zero.

BT Group	The Scottish Government has a good track record in fostering collaboration across Scotland and addressing barriers that stifle innovation and progress. The City Deals are evidence of this progress but more can be done to ensure transparency behind the projects they support and how the Scottish Government measures their outcomes linked to the National Performance Framework.
Edinburgh Council	Further fiscal devolution should be supported. Local Government, or Local Authorities working together at the regional level, need greater freedom on a range of fiscal measures as well as agreement between central and local on what's most appropriate in differing economic circumstances
Historic Environment Scotland	City and Region growth deals provide good basis for recovery but concern over the impact on high streets due to the move away from historic offices
SLAED	An accelerated process should be put in place to allow Growth Deal investment to be delivered earlier
SOLACE Scotland	Suggest an accelerated process should be put in place to allow Growth Deal investment to be delivered earlier Accelerated economic infrastructure investment programmes, including measures to strengthen the delivery and maximise the impact of City / Growth Deals including consideration of supply chain management
Stop Climate Chaos Scotland	Establish a city-wide zero emission zone in operation in every city by 2030;

2.9 Data

A number of submissions highlighted the importance of improving targeted, economic and other forms of data to deal with the post COVID-19 economy. A number of submissions made the point of making stronger links between the National Performance Framework and policy delivery, particularly in the context of budget-setting. This has links to the discussion of improved analysis of environmental outcomes in section 5.2.

The Infrastructure Commission for Scotland advocated an approach based on resilience and suggested that to ensure Scotland's connectivity resilience, SG should prioritise support for an indigenous data centre market and investment in direct international fibre optic cables.

The Scottish Human Rights Commission pointed out that data gaps, the impacts of the virus on ongoing surveys, and the relative lack of real-time data were all factors that would impact on the ability of policy makers to target resources to an effective recovery.

A particularly data-focused submission was received from the University of Edinburgh. See box.

Focus on Data Ethics

Rapid introduction of surveillance technologies and data analysis have been introduced as “magic Bullets” to manage the return to the “new normal”, and as we testify in our response, efficient and ethical use of indeed data is in a key role in the recovery. However, the combination of increasingly powerful data analytics, a data-saturated and poorly regulated commercial environment, and the absence of standards for data practice in industry, university, non-profit, and government sectors has created a ‘perfect storm’ of ethical risks. We need to first consider what sources of data we already had and simply failed to use or act upon effectively. Then we need to identify any real data gaps that directly impede public health efforts and endanger global health, and what missing data will improve our ability to act & intervene. New data streams don’t help if the human and institutional failures that underlie the pandemic remain unaddressed.

Capture and Analyse COVID-19 Data

We strongly suggest that the Advisory Group on Economic Recovery should prioritise support for efforts to **capture data which can produce timely data-driven insights** and support research into the impacts of the pandemic (health, economic, social, environmental, and the interplay between them). If the opportunity to capture these data is missed, a crucial national data asset will be lost and our ability to learn from the impact of the crisis for the future will be severely undermined.

Ensure Access to Financial Data

The supply of financial data to support government economic policy making is extremely challenging. Additional government support to lobby companies to participate would be extremely welcome, as well as engaging around assessment of opportunities to support recovery. After the pandemic, a wider Government and public debate is needed as to how this type of **financial data is made available for public benefit research**

Harmonise Health & Wellbeing Data Models

Scotland has led the world in providing major insights from linked national healthcare data. However, current activities are built on specific projects with progress fragmented and frequently limited to single conditions or regions. There is a risk that realising value and public benefit from these resources will be squandered unless it is made more easily accessible. We propose an investment in each of our four regional safe havens and the national safe haven, to develop a **common data model for Scotland** that will ensure the rich local and regional data generated from across primary, secondary and social care is available on all persons living in Scotland with any acute or chronic condition.

Develop more sophisticated methods of tracking and measuring social and economic impacts

We need a more nuanced insight into the pattern of inequalities arising from Covid-19. There is already anecdotal evidence that the experience of inequality is being altered by the pandemic with invisible occupations notably in care, retail, transport, cleaning and maintenance rendered much higher profiles while the material reality and risk associated with low wage work remains unaltered. Data-driven toolkits should be developed to trace the impact on the employment patterns, health and wellbeing of key front-line workers post crisis. This might involve the deployment of inventive and computational methods that can transcend qualitative/quantitative divides and incorporate alternative data sources (e.g. internet search, locational and social media data).

Integrate Environmental Data

An integrated and balanced approach to data would help to redefine success measures, as a society and as an economy. By modelling cause and effect from climate actions to societal impact we can demonstrate the wider benefits of transitioning to a net zero economy, in particular on wellbeing, environment and biodiversity.

2.10 Housing

Numerous specific suggestions were made by a variety of respondents, including housing as tool for recovery with wellbeing benefits; specific financial support for the sector; the importance of mitigation of derelict and vacant land; affordability; and environmental measures.

There were some worries expressed about the regulatory burden on the industry: but this was balanced by significant calls for further intervention to ensure positive outcomes. A concern was expressed over the systems and guidance in place to estimate housing need and demand and the nature of National Records of Scotland population projections. (However, it should be noted that these mechanisms are the first, analytical part of the policy process and they form the basis not the totality of housing policy at a local level.)

Centre for Energy Policy	The continued availability of public and private finance is crucial if the energy efficiency of our housing stock is to improve to the extent required to meet mid-century net zero carbon targets, to reduce fuel poverty and to deliver sustained wider economy gains
Glasgow City Region	Expand social housing investment programmes
Homes for Scotland	Affordable housing – recent affordable housing investments have helped to transform communities. Continuing investment is important to support the revitalisation of communities and support for local residents – not least those young people who are likely to be worst impacted.

Report on written submissions to the advisory group on economic recovery

Scottish Futures Trust	SG should prioritise the continuation of Help to Buy and the First Home Fund after March 2021 and additional enhanced Help to Buy offer for NHS workers and other identified key workers.
Scottish Land Estates	There is an opportunity for increased housing investment across the public and private sectors to support an infrastructure recovery from COVID-19.
Scottish Property Federation	While environmental measures will be vitally important, they must be undertaken in a way which is sympathetic to the reality of renting and owning homes. Homeowners and landlords should not be put in the position of unrealistic and uneconomic expectations being placed on them which in turn will necessitate the removal of many affordable homes in rural areas from the open market.
SLAED	Negative impact of crisis on purpose built student accommodation.
SOSE	Housing should be considered national infrastructure and supply of new housing should meet the needs of the new economy. National housing guidance and projections should reflect a place rebalancing agenda, including seeking to address rural depopulation
Transition Stirling	Look at ways to encourage people to tackle dereliction, for example for housing where we could support mortgages that encourage self-build and self-restoration developing skills and using local tradespeople and look at how VAT is charged on building supplies to incentivise
Unison Scotland	Investment in housing –a green recovery, good housing stock and investment in social housing are all inter-connected. Better energy efficiency means lower fuel poverty and carbon emissions. Housing cooperatives can offer different benefits that could be helpful, and social housing could be more creative to offer different alternatives that give similar benefits. Working hubs could be created in towns and villages, or existing community facilities updated for this function. Workers who have realised it is possible to work remotely could use these spaces and their employer or university would pay toward the running costs
	Public sector pension funds remain underutilised in Scotland as sources of long term patient investment in social housing developments and renewable energy projects.

2.11 Creative industries, tourism and hospitality

There was fairly widespread support for the three inter-related sectors arguably impacted on most strongly by the crisis.

Report on written submissions to the advisory group on economic recovery

Many of the submissions dealt with the immediate situation and the need for short-term support: but there were wide acknowledgements of the importance of these sectors both in terms of economic impact and employment but also in terms of wider measures of wellbeing. There were some calls for specific tax reform (or adjustment), covered in section 2.5 but also some wider suggestions. See box.

Scottish Tourism Bonds *Scottish Government to be given powers to issue and promote bonds* that will in turn offer tourism businesses preferential loan interest and grants along with public infrastructure investment which will enable recovery in the sector. This private sector led source of funds can support investment into tourism: infrastructure, business co-financing, environmental improvements, staff training and leadership development, successful migration programmes, Covid-19 safety enhancements and ensuring that Scotland has a quality, competitive tourism product. We can shine more light on sustainability issues by linking them to eligibility for any funding from the Tourism Bond and support businesses demonstrating circular economy principles.

Submission from Scottish Tourism Alliance

A summary of some of the other wider responses are in the table below.

Archaeology Scotland	Impact of crisis on bodies that promote stewardship for built heritage including prioritisation when resources are diminished with 92,00 jobs in heritage tourism supply chain.
Keep Scotland Beautiful	Encourage more local tourism through better transport links
National Trust for Scotland	Importance of culture and creative industries and tourism
Scottish Community Heritage Alliance	Opportunity to kick-start tourism in areas where visitors will feel comfortable post COVID (away from city centres and usual honeypots).
Scottish Natural Heritage	Nature based tourism makes up about 40% of all tourism in Scotland, contributing £1.4bn to the Scottish economy, supporting approximately 40,000 jobs. Tourism is one of the key sectors that has been heavily impacted by Covid 19. Experience from the Natural & Cultural Heritage Fund (ERDF £5m) shows that there is significant demand for investing in visitor infrastructure to help remote and rural areas recover from Covid, particularly if there is renewed interest in staycations
SLAED	Development and promotion of IT creative industries in rural areas will help to combine quality of life with new opportunities
The Grant Rule Trust	Impact on tourism industry is an opportunity to re-think the strategy, to attract more engaged visitors seeking an "experience" holiday, rather than going for cheap and cheerful/free. Visitors should be encouraged to see themselves as temporary members of a community, not spectators at a zoo.

2.12 Digital

The Covid-19 pandemic has undoubtedly seen many businesses change their business models to adapt to the current situation which could have a beneficial impact on recovery. However, this will not be the case for all and it is therefore important that government continues to support and deliver policies to support digital transformation and skills by SMEs.

The Scottish Government's own Digital Economy Maturity Index shows that only 7% of businesses are classified as either Digital Champions or Digital Pioneers. Our own research reinforces the fact that SMEs need more support on their journey to fully utilising technologies.

Our latest research conducted in May and which polled over 1000 firms in Small Business Britain's UK community found many across the sector are actively embracing digital tools to power recovery:

- Two fifths (42 per cent) of small businesses have moved online due to the pandemic
- Over a third (37 per cent) are planning for less face to face contact in the future
- Over a third (39 per cent) now view digital skills and tools as a key focus area

Covid-19 has accelerated some of the key digital trends which were already underway. Long standing roadblocks are being rapidly resolved, and the crisis is likely to expedite digital adoption by several years. Organisations that were further along with their digital journeys seem to be weathering the storm more effectively. The underlying premise is that being more digital makes you more productive, flexible and resilient. The future of work is also likely to shift from location dependence to a distributed by default/work from anywhere strategy. Disruption due to the climate emergency and the digital revolution means that this makes strategic sense longer term. Remote working will no longer be seen as a barrier to achieving strategic goals, but an enabler.

More broadly, technology - particularly disruptive technologies such as 5G, IoT and Artificial Intelligence - will play an increasingly important role in Scotland's future economy, displacing many existing jobs but also creating many new, high value roles. In responding to Covid-19 it will be necessary to explore how digital technologies and innovation can help businesses respond to the crisis and contribute towards the economic recovery of Scotland, both in terms of the actions we need to put in place now, plus the steps we need to take to maximise the potential of technology and deliver a more resilient, thriving economy fit for the future. In part this will be as a result of SMEs being forced out of necessity to embrace increased digital maturity at an increasing pace and sophistication if they are to survive.

Submission from BT Group

There was a widespread view of the importance of access to digital services, with a clear link to the increases in remote working during the crisis. This was viewed as being particularly important in rural areas, where increasing connectivity is essential to addressing future

Report on written submissions to the advisory group on economic recovery

wellbeing. Poor connectivity not only reduces the flexibility of rurally-based employees, but prevents those living in these areas being able to fully engage with services beneficial to quality of life

COSLA	Further investment in increasing digital connectivity and related technologies. Close the digital divide
Dumfries and Galloway LEADER Local Action Group	Digital connectivity will be crucial to the recovery in the rural economy
FSB Scotland	Encourage businesses to lock in and exploit digital innovations made since lockdown Scotland's public sector economic development actors should create a joint programme to improve digital communications, transactions and data-sharing.
FVL Leader Local Action Group	Anything that can be done to speed up the roll out of R100, and support to communities not being covered, should be encouraged to reduce digital inequality.
Global Supply Chain & Procurement, Diageo PL	Accelerating investment in digital infrastructure to facilitate great flexible working and home working, should be considered.
Historic Environment Scotland	Importance of digital skills for remote working
Kelvin Valley and Falkirk LEADER Local Action Group	Increase rural digital equality through infrastructure
Scottish Islands Federation	Importance of digital connectivity for remote areas
SLAED	Support to maximise and accelerate the use of technology and capitalise on the digitalisation agenda will be crucial.
Transition Stirling	Digital economy – there has been an inequality of access to digital resources, which have been really necessary with people working and studying from home. This needs to be closed in order to be able to achieve a lot of what has been discussed- ensuring people are able to work from home.
University of Stirling	To support remote working as above, the immediate strategic investment priority for government should be to accelerate the provision of high speed broadband (fixed and 5G mobile) across all of Scotland.

Virgin Money	The COVID-19 crisis has accelerated public uptake of digital services and this provides an opportunity for the Scottish Government to lead on this change. Scotland should look to opportunities to capitalise on this pace of change and to make targeted policy decisions and investments
Women's Enterprise Scotland	Policy must support innovation in women owned businesses, for example, by developing digital skills for online trading. Technology companies could play a critical role by providing affordable or free access to digital tools and solutions to help the most vulnerable companies upgrade their technology and support them to survive.

Glasgow Economic Recovery Group, amongst others, made a specific point about digital skills: addressing digital inequalities in our communities is critical if we are meet long- term aspirations for our economy whilst addressing Inclusive Growth needs. Their policy proposals included:

- Conversion of digital loans to digital grants - enhancing the CodeClan model⁴.
- Including a digital audit/assessment during initial interaction of employability providers (SDS, DWP, GCC, FSS)

Digital Inclusion issues were picked up by other submissions including the Equality and Human Rights Commission, Carnegie Trust, and Culture Counts.

Equality and Human Rights Commission	All local authorities should seek to understand the incidence of digital exclusion of pupils facing socio-economic disadvantage in their areas and make urgent plans to support these pupils, including pupils formally or informally excluded from school prior to the introduction of social distancing measures
Carnegie Trust UK	Digital inclusion will be more important than ever - invest but need better data.
Virgin Money	Beyond digital infrastructure and broadband speed, there is an opportunity to provide increased access to digital upskilling and training to allow for a truly digitally inclusive society
Culture Counts	launch wide support for digital inclusion, skills and hardware

There was significant discussion of the importance of digital skills training that is picked up in section 3.2.

2.13 Transport

Much of the material submitted on transport relates to the future potential for a greening of the transport network and is covered in section 5. A few submissions made explicit reference to the impact of transport infrastructure on the wider economy.

⁴ For further details on CodeClan see <https://codeclan.com/>

Report on written submissions to the advisory group on economic recovery

Submissions confirmed that there were unprecedented reductions in transport (and emissions) during the height of lockdown); and it has been demonstrated through necessity that home working could replace much of the commuting normally undertaken. Business travel (much of which was by car and 'plane) has been (reasonably) successfully replaced by video-conferencing, and there has been an increase in walking and cycling, although much of this has been 'exercise' rather than necessarily serving essential needs such as food shopping.

Detailed analysis was provided by academics from the University of Stirling and University of Leeds. Their key policy prescriptions are detailed below. Whilst there is a clear overlap with natural capital, they also provide a wider view of potential transport- specific interventions.

Heriot Watt University also made specific transport recommendations around introducing a clean bus fund to stimulate domestic bus manufacturing and establishing a fund to support local authorities and regional transport authorities to start up public bus companies, using recent powers under the Transport (Scotland) Act 2019.

Given demand for public transport use may remain significantly suppressed for some time, the single most important intervention for a green recovery is to manage the rebound effect for car travel demand through reducing the need to travel whilst confidence is rebuilt (and a vaccine discovered) and putting in place meaningful alternatives for the duration. This suggests two principal policy responses:

- **Digital inclusion and remote working:** Strongly support (and for those jobs in the public sector under the direct control of government, mandate) continued working from home permanently. (This need not be full time, as even part time working reduces the demand for travel.) To support remote working as above, the immediate strategic investment priority for government should be to accelerate the provision of high speed broadband (fixed and 5G mobile) across all of Scotland. Recent Scottish Government initiatives on digital inclusion and the provision of connected devices to disadvantaged groups of people should be mainstreamed to all those that can benefit from them.
- **Car restraint:** Demand for travel by car must be actively restrained otherwise the outcome of the crisis will be that the Scottish Government's decarbonisation obligations will become impossible to meet. The policy toolkit for this is well known: reallocation of road space from cars to buses, cyclists and pedestrians, parking restraint, and road pricing.

It is acknowledged that the car restraint measures outlined above will be controversial and politically difficult to implement. They are, however, essential. Other policy interventions that should be actively considered to aid the green recovery include:

- Consistent reappraisal of the scientific evidence on physical distancing so that increasing the capacity of the public transport network by reducing the 2m rule (maintaining the use of face coverings if necessary) as soon as it is safe to do so is implemented.

Report on written submissions to the advisory group on economic recovery

- A complete reappraisal of public transport ticketing strategies to support the increase of capacity as above.
- Continued implementation of 'pop-up' space for walking and cycling with these schemes being made permanent segregated facilities via ongoing investment. It is imperative that immediate progress on this is made before the window of opportunity is closed. Above all, this requires a significant acceleration of effort by local authorities across Scotland to put appropriate measures in place as soon as possible.
- Temporary reallocation of road and parking space (including road closures) over the summer period to support the reopening of café, restaurant and other leisure businesses with sufficient outdoor space to enable physical distancing. Before the end of the summer there should be clear criteria for how these will be retained permanently.
- Switching resources from new build projects to road maintenance to eliminate the substantial maintenance backlog (which in itself causes economically costly disruption) whilst at the same time delivering road space reduction to manage demand, especially in cities.
- Accelerating the programme of upgrading the electricity supply grid and the provision of charging points to accommodate the largest possible proportion of electric vehicles in the fleet.
- An E-bike grant purchase scheme.
- Construction of segregated cycling 'super highways' designed to facilitate sustainable commuting up to the range of E-bikes to all of Scotland's major towns and cities.

Policies that are not consistent with a fair and green recovery and should not be pursued:

- Airport expansion and/or reduction in Air Passenger Duty.
- Vehicle scrappage schemes (unless to swap for an E-bike) and subsidies for car Personal Contract Hire schemes as were put in place post 2008 and led to an increase in car use.
- Free or cheaper parking in town and city centres.

Submission by Professor Iain Docherty, University of Stirling, Professor Greg Marsden, University of Leeds, Professor Jillian Anable, University of Leeds

3. Human Capital - Education and Skills

Human capital comprises the skills, knowledge and (crucially also) the health and wellbeing that people accumulate throughout their lives. As such it is a key component of labour (and hence, wider) economic productivity: but it also has personal and intrinsic value to individuals. Whilst there is a wealth of evidence that a healthy and well-educated population will increase economic growth, there is also an obvious link to reductions in poverty and inequality within economies and to more recent thinking on how improvements in human skills and knowledge can make climate change action and adaptation easier. The term “human capital” is usually used within economics texts, but is often associated with a narrow view of the economic impact of people rather than a rounded view that includes wellbeing: so the Group chose to use the wider concept of People to capture this aspect.

Develop policies that help to limit the consequences of ‘scarring’. It has been shown that those entering the labour market in a period of downturn suffer long-term negative consequences in health and other areas of life. Providing ways to connect such people to firms this year could include incentivising employment or apprenticeships. Helping university and school leavers spend a year in some kind of national volunteering service related to teaching or caring is another possibility. Alternatively, there might be support for those wishing to upgrade shortage skills particularly related to the digital field.

Develop a policy that protects the social and cognitive wellbeing of workers forced into premature retirement by making use of their experience and skills. It is likely, and there is supporting evidence from the US, that a consequence of Covid 19 will be to cause some workers to exit the labour earlier than planned. Notwithstanding legislation on age discrimination, older workers made redundant by Covid may find it hard to get another job and yet have skills and experience to share combined with needs to be socially and cognitively engaged. Thinking about skills, companies and not for- profits might be incentivised to develop mentoring programmes that make use of early retirees in this way. These positions may also have the effect of embedding firms more closely into the communities in which they exist, which could in turn be beneficial both for their employees and the communities where they exist.

Consider work-sharing schemes. There are examples where countries have developed work-sharing policies and giving additional incentives for this for a short period of time could mitigate problems of large numbers of discouraged workers, that is people who would like work but are not actively searching for it given the high levels of unemployment that look

immanent. Work-sharing in the short-term may be more valuable than other active labour market policies as a recent review of many studies finds the latter are less effective when unemployment is high.

Increase the development of digital skills. For the UK, there are shortages of skills related to IT and STEM subjects. There may be a need to increase general IT literacy of the workforce and also to increase the proportion of the workforce able to take on job roles that make more intensive use of digital skills (for example in finance or creative industries). Digital skill development if done in a work context allows workers to earn an income and be productive at the same time. That said, if there is a short term shortage of work, digital training for the unemployed may have low opportunity cost in terms of productivity.

Consider policies that promote wellbeing at work. There are also instrumental reasons for considering the wellbeing of employees. Significant relations between worker wellbeing on the one hand, and productivity, customer loyalty and retention on the other have been documented in research on management practices. Given that social relations at work are a key aspect of wellbeing at work, and given the need to physically distance, governments might consider commissioning guidance on good relations in the workplace.

Extract from Submission from Paul Anand et. al.

3.1 Fair Work

A number of responses were supportive of the accelerated development of Fair Work principles, particularly during the recovery phase. These include submissions from:

- Citizens' Advice Scotland
- Poverty Alliance/ Wellbeing Economy Alliance
- HIE
- STUC
- SURF
- Carnegie Trust UK
- Inclusion Scotland

A significant proportion, as discussed in section 2.6, linked Fair Work principles to conditionality of support for business. There were also numerous suggestions that there should be greater publicity about, and wider understanding of Fair Work principles amongst the Scotland's businesses.

3.2 Skills

As might be anticipated, there were a large number of submissions that suggested that there should be a refocusing of Scotland’s Skills Strategies to address the risks of unemployment, recognising the importance of high participation sectors. The scope of this document means it is not possible to go through all of the individual points and suggestions made, but a selection of the responses is outlined in the table below.

Anand et.al	Helping university and school leavers spend a year in some kind of national volunteering service related to teaching or caring or support for those wishing to upgrade shortage skills particularly related to the digital field - work-sharing policies and giving additional incentives for this for a short period of time could mitigate problems of large numbers of discouraged workers given high U.
BT Group	The importance of place-making in the design and execution of public policy has a key role to play, recognising that a ‘one size fits all’ approach is unlikely to work, and that the physical built environment and the supporting infrastructure, including digital, needs to be designed around the needs of communities, serving both their economic and societal needs.
Equality and Human Rights Commission	All local authorities should seek to understand the incidence of digital exclusion of pupils facing socio-economic disadvantage in their areas and make urgent plans to support these pupils, including pupils formally or informally excluded from school prior to the introduction of social distancing measures
Glasgow Economic Recovery Group	Priority Support for the Excluded: Create a targeted programme, delivered through Universities and Colleges, business and the voluntary sector, as a matter of urgency, STEM Skills – look to significantly increase education places for engineering and technology to support our innovation economy, although this may require some changes to how funding is delivered particularly for FE colleges Digital Skills – address digital inequalities. Conversion of digital loans to digital grants - enhancing the Codeclan model. Create an Emergency Regional Skills Programme – quickly set up a co-ordinated workforce development programme / council with responsibility for setting a regional skills programmes that cuts across business, education institutions, SDS and councils.
HALO Scotland	More training and staff development as well as promotion of benefits of sectors reliant on seasonal/migrant workers
Heriot-Watt	The economic fallout from Covid-19 will have the greatest impact on younger adults, particularly those less well-established in the labour market. There will be a major challenge to get people back into employment and a strong case can be made for supporting widespread education and

Report on written submissions to the advisory group on economic recovery

	reskilling, particularly relating to emerging challenges of a greener economy or improved social care if Scotland wishes to be the inventor of our future growth rather than the consumer.
Scottish Environment LINK	Retain and enhance skills by: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Promoting business ownership models that retain jobs and skills in the Scottish Economy such as Community ownership Public ownership Employee ownership • Green New Deal
Scottish Human Rights Commission	Small tax base = skills crucial for recovery The 'digital divide' and the potential that a digital first strategy could further marginalise already disconnected communities and groups
Scottish Land Estates	Training allowances available, focus on leisure & tourism, <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Skills Development Scotland & Lantra to expand Skills Matching Service to other rural sectors • Reduction on employer's national insurance and breaks for creating new positions • Companies able to create employment to be given enhanced support by enterprise companies • Skills development and training to be eligible to similar tax treatment to research & development tax credits.
Scottish Renewables	A specific suggestion around linking institutions to create a Renewables Transition Training fund - Scottish Government can utilise its education and skills powers and work with Skills Development Scotland and further education institutions to introduce a Renewables Transition Training Fund. A Renewable Transition Training Fund can support oil and gas professionals, supply chain businesses, tradesmen and public servants to acquire sustainable, exportable skills and join the renewable energy industry internationalise our industry, and can use its trade, export and investment powers to highlight that Scotland's skills can help other countries decarbonise their economies while maintaining economic growth.
SDS	Create a National Workforce Academy Aggregate & commission industry led content on 'open – platform' Breadth of learning for all types of transition training; bite sized; short sharp 10-week courses. Facilitated by tutorial support; learning performance assessment; accredited to SCQF qualifications Leverage the assets of FE colleges; Universities; private providers Empower Scottish workers to commit to personal 'upskilling & reskilling' 'Skills Wallet' to incentivise workers to upskill Stratified entitlements based on economic & skills needs Enable more rapid transition from declining occupations to areas of growth, in advance of disruption Enrich all learning with a greater emphasis on applied learning

Report on written submissions to the advisory group on economic recovery

SNH	Invest in skills, especially in youth employment
SURF	Targeted support to enterprise in deprived areas (Clyde Gateway as good practice) that tackles precarious employment as well as unemployment
The Poverty and Inequality Commission	People in poverty should be connected to jobs through active employment support schemes.

A number of suggestions were made specifically around apprenticeships. See table.

Colleges Scotland	Large impact on apprenticeships of crisis - Expand role of FWDF
Glasgow Economic Recovery Group	Find new ways of supporting young people through the next couple of years. Until school and 'out of school' care has been finalised this will impact disproportionately on females. Entry level jobs will also be impacted more as these roles generally don't have the ability to work from home.
Highlands and Islands Enterprise	A variety of apprenticeship models are essential to aid recovery and should be expanded and developed for emerging sectoral opportunities in blue and green growth. Apprenticeship models which work for remoter areas and where micro and small enterprises dominate are required
Scottish Renewables	The Scottish Government can utilise its education and skills powers and work with Skills Development Scotland and further education institutions to introduce a Renewables Transition Training Fund
SLAED	Targeted employer recruitment incentives for Micros/SMEs in priority sectors and or providing Apprenticeship and/or Fair Work opportunities should be supported
Solace Scotland	Targeted and bespoke active labour market policies alongside upskilling and re-skilling the workforce and safeguarding apprenticeships. Assess how these are delivered, developing new innovative approaches to work-based learning. Target sectors hardest hit by pandemic
South of Scotland Enterprise	broaden apprenticeships and encourage collaboration between small providers helping businesses to develop the digital skills to do this and recognising that not everything can be done on-line and social contact remains important. need to build on the significant investment in our digital learning and skills model to offer training opportunities within region rather than requiring people to travel for these opportunities.

3.3 Employability schemes

A number of submission focused on employability schemes. These responses tended to be around encouraging take-up, increasing support for different groups and to review existing schemes in the light of the post-virus economy.

Corra Foundation	Enhance support for employability schemes for key groups at risk of poverty – lone parents, disabled people, young people and deliver this through third sector organisations.
Glasgow Economic Recovery Group	Include a digital audit / assessment during initial interaction of employability provider (SDS, DWP, GCC, FSS)
Council on Deafness	There needs to be greater promotion of and take up of the UK ‘Access to Work’ benefits so that those affected by deafness and others are recruited, promoted and fulfil their economic potential.
Citizen’s Advice Scotland	Review Scotland’s employability provision to ensure it is focused on C19 impacts
Scottish Human Rights Commission	It will be important as the Scottish Government develops its plans for economic recovery that suitable investment is set out in the forthcoming Scottish budgets to facilitate the delivery of employability and re-training services that are targeted at those who require them most and aligned with the social and economic needs of Scotland post COVID-19.
SCVO	More specialist employability programmes will be vital in the context of increasing unemployment and a transition to a wellbeing orientated economy where skillsets will need to adapt. Those furthest from the labour market and hardest hit by the virus must be at the centre of new employability system.
Edinburgh University	Health and Social Care Skills partnership between the region’s universities and colleges as part of the Integrated Regional Employability and Skills programme.

3.4 Jobs Guarantee

A number of respondents raised the notion of a jobs guarantee, either state-driven or business-led.

SOLACE Scotland	Targeted and bespoke active labour market policies. E.g. job or wage guarantee schemes.
STUC	Introduce a nationally funded jobs guarantee programme, offering a 6 month job with accredited training.
Venture Scotland	Creating an intermediate labour market offer which supports a guaranteed offer of a job (incentivised via wage subsidy scheme/built-out ERI), apprenticeship, or high-quality training place for all young people out of work for more than six months. • Simplifying funding draw down for ESF programmes already reaching young people to support those sitting outside the JCP and Fair Start Scotland support
YouthLink Scotland	Consider preventative spending to improve outcomes for people and communities and reduce demands on public services. Point 6.10 of the Christie Commission. YouthLink Scotland would insist on consideration given to a statutory obligation on local authorities to provide universal and targeted youth work services.

3.5 Labour market reform

There were a small number of submission calling for more radical labour market reform. One key submission was by the STUC. See box.

<p>Create higher quality, better paid jobs:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Increasing the National Minimum Wage to £10 per hour • Introduce a nationally funded jobs guarantee programme offering a 6 month job with accredited training. • Introduce sectoral bargaining arrangements for sectors where labour is undervalued. <p>Share the number of hours worked across the economy by:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Introducing a four day week • Increase security of working hours by banning insecure contracts <p>And Introduce a Minimum Income Guarantee</p> <p>Submission by STUC</p>

SOLACE Scotland raised the notion of introducing a requirement for workers to be represented on company boards and suggested that employment law should be devolved to the SG.

4. Social Capital - Equalities

Social capital, can be thought of as the networks, together with shared norms, values and understandings that facilitate co-operation within or among groups. The concept has recently gained traction, but the term has been in use for over a century and the concepts go back further still. Whilst there are many definitions and debates over the various forms it can be divided into three main categories – bonds, bridges and linkages. Bonds are links to people based on a sense of common identity; bridges are somewhat wider (distant friends and associates); and linkages are wider still (across wider society). There is an argument that there is a strong link between social and human capital – simplistically, that social capital is a key mechanism in how individuals are able to “exploit” their own human capital.

Involve non-profit organisations in shaping the wellbeing economy. The charity sector does not feature prominently in economic thinking and analysis though from a wellbeing perspective this is unwarranted. Not-for-profits have a range of useful capacities from devising innovative and targeted programs to delivering services at scale. A very large spike in unemployment could take five to ten years to recover from and in the early years alternative uses of those who are without work are unlikely to result in substantial misallocations of resources.

Develop a response to the rise in mental health issues that will emerge following the multiple burdens of unemployment and social distancing. There is likely to be a greater wave of mental illness and it is known that early interventions tend to be more effective. Recent events are likely for some to have longer term impacts on productivity and so encouraging people to discuss mental health issues early will potentially have both human and financial benefits. Similarly, it is worth noting that there may be more support and interest in programs that address isolation in older age. A US surgeon general has described isolation as a major public health problem and there are similar trends in the UK. In economic terms, communities may be external goods for individuals and it is natural to expect underinvestment by individuals. On the other hand non-profit organisations, and possibly some firms, might be incentivised to develop effective programmes that address these needs.

Connect business support with gender equity goals. Government data for Scotland suggests that female employment is particularly concentrated in the finance, tourism and care sectors which leaves open a considerable opportunity to expand involvement in other sectors of employment. To address the issue, employers and industry sectors need to be welcoming to women and family friendly policies that enable and incentivise men to do more child care should be developed. Indeed policy-makers are likely to consider forms of equity

given recent research showing that in the UK and US that minorities, along with the young and least educated are being hardest hit.

Consider policies to reduce the likelihoods of evictions and homelessness. Policies to allow for rent and mortgage holidays have been made in various countries but now are coming to a close. Defaults and evictions, without a replacement policy may rise significantly and it would be useful if some follow-up policy could enable parties to renegotiate repayment terms or possibly even total amounts as happens in the commercial sector. The study of evictions has not yet had a high profile within economics though work by a Harvard sociologist looking at the 2008-9 financial crisis suggests that they may become a serious issue for workers in some sectors.

Extract from Submission from Paul Anand et. al.

4.1 Place based interventions

A large number of submissions discussed issues around place-based interventions and the importance of local action.

BT Group	The importance of place-making in the design and execution of public policy has a key role to play, recognising that a 'one size fits all' approach is unlikely to work, and that the physical built environment and the supporting infrastructure, including digital, needs to be designed around the needs of communities, serving both their economic and societal needs.
Carnegie Trust UK	Transform Local Outcome Improvement Plans (LOIPS) into local wellbeing plans. Invest in high street diversification
Glasgow City Region	Investment in place approach adopted.
HALO Scotland	Bottom up and social regeneration required where large businesses use their corporate responsibility budgets to create opportunity for all, based in towns. Economic policy is required within towns and rural communities City based approach won't work.
Hawick Congregational Community Church	Reducing inequality by supporting smaller charities and allowing churches and faith groups which run a lot of voluntary and community projects (including staffing) to participate because at present they are excluded from many opportunities even though many have businesses/social enterprises
HIE	Social and Community Infrastructure – Planning regime, empty second homes, procurement

Report on written submissions to the advisory group on economic recovery

Includem	<p>Need for a recovery stimulated from the grassroots up, as opposed to top down, situated in communities, thus allowing the benefits of:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • capacity building • reduced travel (less pollution) • smarter working practices to be embedded <p>supported by a new social contract based on how we need and value “public” services such as the NHS and 3rd sector.</p>
Inclusion Scotland	<p>Employment impacts higher for disabled people. Learn from experience of disabled people in terms of employment practices – flexible</p>
Just Transition Commission	<p>Inclusion of people/public/communities in decision making process.</p>
Midsteeple Quarter	<p>Empowering communities to take an active role in the stewardship of local assets and green-housing local enterprise, has to be a significant part of Scotland’s COVID transition. The current economics of the town centre presents a unique opportunity to gather prominent High Street properties into community ownership and position the community to drive a localised economic model</p>
Poverty Alliance/ Wellbeing Economy Alliance	<p>The community wealth building strategy recently launched in North Ayrshire is an example of how this approach to sustainable economic recovery can be delivered in practice.</p>
Scottish Communities Finance Ltd	<p>The expansion of democratic finance such as Community Bonds are very important in raising local capital to invest locally particularly as start-up finance and risk finance. These need to be better supported and better known to allow them to be utilised by other community actors such as Councils.</p>
Scottish Community Alliance	<p>Invest first in the infrastructure of resilience at the scale of community. This will require a major reassessment of how national priorities are pursued and the re-localisation of many aspects of the foundational economy including our food systems, energy distribution and generation, local transport, social care provision, community health services. <u>Development of the “New Deal for Communities”</u></p>
Scottish Land Commission	<p>Community led regeneration – many of the sites on the current vacant and derelict land register are very small and have the potential to be brought back into productive (if not necessarily commercial) use quickly and at relatively low cost by local community groups Land Assembly – if, as seems likely, one of the outcomes from the pandemic is a major reduction in demand for certain types of commercial</p>

Report on written submissions to the advisory group on economic recovery

	property then this could create significant opportunities for speculative investment.
SEPA	Help regeneration through innovation in place-based initiatives.
SLAED	A place based approach, using the five pillars of Community Wealth Building and the key local anchor institutions could help support local economies in recovery.
SNH	Building community and volunteering capacity
STUC	Introduce community wealth building programmes based developing zero carbon infrastructure.
SURF	Importance of place-based cross-sector collaboration
The Poverty and Inequality Commission	City Region Deals and Growth Deals are reviewed to ensure that investment can respond to the new circumstances and is underpinned by a committed to inclusive growth.
The Stove Network	Create a national task force of community initiators to attract public and private investment into community building through cultural events

Linked to place-based initiatives there was some discussion of community approaches to developing natural capital.

Poverty Alliance / Wellbeing Economy Alliance HIE	Scale up community-based responses to climate change, and particularly to support those effects that are taking place in disadvantaged communities. The community-led solutions that have already been developed need additional support from the Scottish Government – including via long term funding. Stressed the importance of community stewardship for natural capital.
--	---

4.2 Equalities

A large amount of the material submitted made reference to specific issues around equalities and protected characteristics.

Child Poverty Action Group	Implement measures to increase job security and pay in sectors where women are clustered. Identify characteristics of jobs that provide financial resilience for families
Close the Gap	To address women's inequality in the labour market, SG should implement a gendered response to the anticipated jobs recession, which includes interventions specifically designed to tackle the causes of women's inequality at work: integrating gender-sensitive data analysis and gender mainstreaming approaches into labour

Report on written submissions to the advisory group on economic recovery

	market and economic recovery policymaking, <i>Changes to inflexible workplace cultures, Addressing the undervaluation of women's work</i>
Engender	Significant analytical material that reinforces strongly the case for gender based interventions
Equality and Human Rights Commission	SG must comply with obligations of the Equalities Act 2010, including through the Public Sector Equality Duty and Fairer Scotland Duty. Robust information on inequalities required. Disaggregated
Glasgow Economic Recovery Group	Job Creation Programme focused on Key Groups – invest in programmes with forward thinking employers who can take on and support young people, females and BAME community members, get into the labour market through meaningful work.
Heriot-Watt	Driving forward policy and legislative change to improve the lives of society's most vulnerable will be key to ensuring a fair and just recovery.
Infrastructure Commission for Scotland	Government must develop appropriate mechanisms to screen each policy being considered as part of a green recovery for equity considerations.
Poverty Alliance/ Wellbeing Economy Alliance	Clear gendered perspective on recovery. Disability Employment Action Plan is urgently reviewed to take account of the new context.
Scottish Commission for People with Learning Disabilities	NPF : redesign of Scottish Core Survey Questions, utilising the 'conditions' question in the 2021 Census, to allow for learning/intellectual disability to be identified, inclusion in all surveys, other indicators developed.
Scottish Funding Council	Impact on different groups of education access
Scottish Human Rights Commission	Review of what is "quality work" and what is valuable. Fair work issues Disenfranchised voices in decision making - e.g. those of prisoners, Scottish Gypsy Travellers, care leavers, disabled people Rights based approach
Scottish Islands Federation	More ongoing provision of support for wellbeing and mental health are required for young people, as many of them are struggling through

Report on written submissions to the advisory group on economic recovery

	<p>this period, particularly those who are aged 16 – 25 who might be unemployed or living at home or living on their own.</p>
<p>Scottish Women’s Convention</p>	<p>Women specific issues: The impact on sectors, such as hospitality and retail, where women tend to dominate , seasonal working during the summer months is the norm, leaving many women business owners and employees at a major financial loss, financial difficulties for many women, particularly young women, in the hospitality sector where high dependent on tipping. 50/50 representation on advisory groups.</p>
<p>SCVO</p>	<p>The necessity for gender perspectives and women’s needs to be integrated into Scotland’s economic recovery.</p>
<p>SURF</p>	<p>Existing inequalities becoming “supercharged” – COVID + Brexit. Community collaboration in the face of increasing funding crises – how to maintain local connections and organisations. EQIA analysis of C19 policy. Young are important but so are the elderly. Capture and mitigate impacts across Gender</p>
<p>The Poverty and Inequality Commission</p>	<p>Consideration must be given to what action is needed enable businesses to reopen while addressing and mitigating the potential impacts for women and children – including looking at next phase of Job retention scheme, how childcare provisions can be extended for low-oncome households and increasing payments through the Best Start grants.</p> <p>The Transport Transition Plan must take account of lower income earners higher dependence on Public transport and areas extra capacity might be needed.</p>
<p>WISE Centre for Economic Justice</p>	<p>Feminist organisations in Scotland and globally have outlined the need for a feminist economic recovery plan, which recognises the gendered realities of the impact of the crisis. BAME - The recommendation for fair economic recovery is that, whilst Scotland cannot amend the Equality Act 2010, Scotland can explore ways to clearly embed the concept of intersectionality into policy, and mainstream the understanding that experiences of disadvantage are complex but identifiable</p>
<p>Women’s Enterprise Scotland</p>	<p>Significant material that reinforces strongly the case for gender based interventions</p>

4.3 Third Sector

The importance of the third sector was discussed by a number of respondents. There were a smaller number of specific policy ideas which are detailed in the table below.

Corra Foundation	There should be parity of esteem and a collective leadership, between Government and the Third sector, approach that values everyone's contribution equally and moves beyond outdated hierarchies of power. The Government should significantly enhance support for employability schemes for key groups at risk of poverty – lone parents, disabled people, young people and deliver this through third sector organisations. Issue a Scottish Charity Endowment 10-year renewable bond, backed by the Government (actually or by contingent liability) alongside a shift to longer-term, flexible funding agreements for third sector.
Argyll and Bute Council	Ensure the third sector is supported to adapt to the challenges that this situation presents.
Hawick Congregational Church	Reducing inequality by supporting smaller charities and allowing churches and faith groups which run a lot of voluntary and community projects (including staffing) to participate because at present they are excluded from many opportunities even though many have businesses/social enterprises
SCVO	Look at funding streams to provide stability to the sector. As recommended by the Scottish Parliament in November, SG should ' set up a working group, involving key stakeholders, to examine the longer term funding models available to statutory funders
SLAED	It is proposed that flexible job creation initiatives are developed to respond to the lack of opportunity within local labour markets exploiting the role of the public and third sector to provide quality work experience and an opportunity for the acquisition of necessary skills.
Social Enterprise Scotland	Too many public services in Scotland are organisation-centred to suit institutions; the third sector and social enterprise focus on structural, productive capacity - creating human capital, with local impact and outcomes and the genuine co-production, design and delivery of citizen centred services.

The submission from Samaritans Scotland is highlighted in the box below.

<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Cross governmental approach to suicide prevention through support for employment, welfare, housing, education and services. • Increased investment/funding for mental health organisations. • work with employers, employees, industry bodies and trade unions and the third sector to ensure support is tailored to the needs of particular sectors and workplaces • Innovative models for how the third sector works alongside government and statutory services are made sustainable • opportunity for improved knowledge sharing and partnership working between sectors • National and local government and services should consider how best to build on and sustain this increased social capital and work with the third sector to make volunteering a valued component within any framework for economic recovery. • Community support initiatives with peer support to target those at risk and suffering with mental health issues. • Increased provision of mental health care/services for frontline workers effected by the pandemic. <p>Submission from Samaritans Scotland</p>

4.4 Care Sector including carers

The care sector was a key area mentioned in submissions. The discussion tended to be around improving recognition and remuneration, skills and the idea of a “reset” for the sector.

Unison	Care Sector and key workers; The STUC are recommending a £2 per hour pay rise for key workers and a £10 per hour minimum wage.
Dumfries and Galloway LEADER Local Action Group	Invest in skills development for health and social care sector
Equality and Human Rights Commission	Further financial support or paid leave for carers and those with caring responsibilities.
Inclusion Scotland	Inclusion Scotland conducted an online survey of disabled people and carers during April. Over 800 people responded of whom more than half (53%) had experienced problems in accessing food.

Report on written submissions to the advisory group on economic recovery

	Provision of child-care and social care support is essential for a well-functioning modern economy and spending on these services should also be viewed as an investment in infrastructure
Inspired Enterprise Community Trust	Deliver transformation in the care home sector and any private profit incentives should be removed.
Scottish Commission for People with Learning Disabilities	Promote the voice of carers in challenging poverty of aspiration and economic opportunity for their disabled family member and themselves.
Scottish Islands Federation	A re-evaluation of social care and the bodies that deliver it throughout the islands should lead to the creation of independent island based care homes , offering better paid, quality local jobs in this sector, as has been highlighted by many island GPs
Scottish Islands Federation	A re-evaluation of social care and the bodies that deliver it throughout the islands should lead to the creation of independent island based care homes , offering better paid, quality local jobs in this sector, as has been highlighted by many island GPs.
Scottish National Women's Organisation	Access to high quality childcare and care is paramount to realising a sustainable wellbeing economy and a good society. Scottish Government measures to increase pay for the lowest paid childcare and social care workers by facilitating the payment of the Living Wage are welcome but piecemeal. The Living Wage is not a panacea for undervaluation as it does not address the crux of the problem, which is that the work is undervalued because it is predominantly women in these jobs.
Scottish Property Federation	Focus on health care sector – long term patient capital with increased reward for employees
Scottish Women's Convention	A wide scale review into the impact of both the private and public social care sector including the undervaluation of the work of employees
Unison Scotland	<u>Care Sector and key workers:</u> The STUC are recommending a £2 per hour pay rise for key workers and a £10 per hour minimum wage.
University of Edinburgh	Commit to an Integrated Skills Strategy (Q3) : Specifically, there's an opportunity to launch a new Health and Social Care Skills partnership between the region's universities and colleges as part of the Integrated Regional Employability and Skills programme.

Report on written submissions to the advisory group on economic recovery

WISE Centre for Economic Justice	A care-led economic renewal, Investment in Care to raise female employment and revisit remuneration.
WISE Centre for Economic Justice	A care-led economic renewal, Investment in Care to raise female employment and revisit remuneration.
Women's Enterprise Scotland	This includes valuing care as a key sector; valuing care as a growth sector; and including the sector in any future skills strategy. Better social protection for small businesses and self-employed needed

4.5 Social security and Citizens' basic income

There was relatively little mention of social security issues within submissions. References mainly relate to the existing transfer of powers.

Citizens' Advice Scotland	The social security system should act as a safety net for people
Scottish Women's Convention	Ensure that C19 does not delay Early Learning and Childcare provision and the roll out of Scottish social security benefits,

There was some limited discussion on Universal or Citizens' Basic Income concepts.

Culture Counts	Launch Universal Basic Income trials in the culture sector.
Reform Scotland	Basic Income: Reform Scotland first called for the introduction of Basic Income in 2016 and is one of a group of organisations advocating its benefits
Transition Stirling	Universal basic income, or ensuring there is a minimum income for all, could help reduce inequalities

5. Natural Capital – Environment

Natural capital is broadly defined as the world's stock of natural assets, which include geology, soil, air, water and all living things. There is an important distinction between the components of natural capital that are fixed, i.e. non-renewable, and those which, treated with respect, are renewable. For the former, the issues are around how a finite resource is used over time, raising issues of inter-generational equity; and, in the case of fossil fuels, how much should be used, given the externality of climate impacts. For renewables, the questions are around the technology to make best use of the asset (e.g. wave power) and how to avoid overuse or extraction - the "problem of the commons" (e.g. fishing).

Consider accelerating investment in low carbon infrastructure.

Direct wellbeing benefits from moving to a low carbon economy are more likely to be related to health than employment in the short to medium term. These benefits depend in part on how other countries behave but it may nonetheless be useful to invest in the construction of infrastructure, such as energy efficient buildings (particularly social housing which could help to address fuel poverty) and greener energy production.

Extract from Submission from Paul Anand et. al.

5.1 Prioritisation of green investment and climate change policies

The prioritisation of green investments of various forms was probably the single most widely discussed area. As may be expected, a large number of submissions made specific mention of the just transition to net zero. Many also included wider recommendations across other aspects of natural capital. See boxes for four examples of the scale and scope of submissions.

1. Build on success of existing Contracts for Difference scheme with ambitious programme of uncapped future auctions
2. Prioritise climate change mitigation and support the planning process to speed up the Net Zero transition
3. Ensure the right framework is in place to attract the investment in network infrastructure needed to meet Net Zero
4. Unlock additional private investment through a more ambitious approach to the RIIO T2 and ED2 price controls
5. Bring forward the petrol and diesel vehicle phase-out date to 2030
6. Maintain grant funding for EVs and home chargers
7. Support the roll-out of a comprehensive network of public EV chargepoints

8. Speed up action on energy efficiency and bring forward the Future Homes Standard to 2022
9. Increase grant funding for the roll-out of heat pumps and support heat pump-based heat networks
10. A new approach on smart metering to accelerate roll-out

Summary of submission from Scottish Power

Rapid moves to create a more circular economy are necessary in order to reduce our impacts on the environmental/biodiversity crisis as well as to contribute to reducing greenhouse gas emissions, including those of the products we consume, rather than just the emissions we create domestically. The most recent figure from 2016 showed greenhouse gas emissions embedded in imported goods and services from overseas made up 51.1% of Scotland's carbon footprint.

As the global population continues to grow, it has become clear that our current linear economy model, which is heavily extractive and relies on fossil fuels, is not sustainable in the long term. By moving to a circular model, we can make our economy more resilient making us less dependent on virgin material, much of which can come at high financial, environmental, and social cost.

Moving to a more circular economy can also tackle the growing problem of plastic pollution by reducing the damage caused by litter to our immediate environment. By keeping resources in the system, we reduce the impact of consumption on our planet, an important step as global material consumption recently passed 1 billion tonnes for the first time.

Crucially, a more circular economy can create new domestic industries and employment opportunities in reusing and recycling existing materials, while protecting the economy from any future disruptions to the global supply chain.

The Scottish Government was set to bring forward a Circular Economy Bill, which was understandably delayed by the pandemic. This delay in moving to a more circular economy risks losing opportunities for new start-ups or innovation in existing businesses, as well as the job creation, increased resilience, and contribution to our climate targets that a thriving circular economy can create. It's estimated that a circular economy would save Scotland 11 million tonnes of carbon dioxide a year by 2050 - a quarter of the current total.

To avoid moving backwards and missing these opportunities, our economic recovery should include targets for delivering a more circular economy, including targets on our material consumption, our carbon footprint, and a strategy for using biomass sustainably. Any Government investment in infrastructure should be led by investment in repair, repurposing, and recycling facilities - and not to incineration capacity or any other technologies that perpetuate the linear economy.

Submission from Friends of the Earth Scotland

Introduce a ban on burning on peatlands, forcing a change in thinking about upland land use and potentially investment in other uses;

Ban commercial peat extraction for horticulture and ban the sale of peat for horticultural use thus driving development of alternatives.

investment in the supporting framework as Regional Land Use Partnerships and Frameworks

Meeting Scotland's statutory emissions reduction targets must be central to a green, fair and sustainable economic recovery.

Behavioural changes such as increased local consumption, lower travel rates and working from home should be continued and accelerated by SG

Scotland's economic recovery measures should focus on investments that help put us on a path to net-zero, enhance biodiversity, reduce pollution and address equity issues.

Invest in renewable energy, building fit for the future, Green transport, cycling and walking, waste reduction and circular economy, Peatland and woodland, Transitioning Farming, Protecting marine carbon stores, Invest in climate justice

Direct investment in things like peatland restoration, woodland creation and management and changes in farming practice and funding.

Green conditionality on provision of public money and ensure new housing stock is Green.

Governments should sensibly use a mixture of regulation and incentives to help steer industries in desirable public policy directions. It should most emphatically not be relaxing environmental regulation.

Submission from Stop Climate Chaos Scotland

1. Grow and diversify green finance – The financing need for nature based solutions to the climate emergency and other societal problems is very large, estimated to be in the trillions of dollars. There is a huge amount of innovation worldwide to bring new sources of investment into natural capital and nature-based solutions. Scotland can help accelerate and support these innovative approaches to create new opportunities for private and corporate investment in nature that will help to address the net zero target.

2. Investing in nature based solutions - Investment in nature-based solutions can deliver carbon reductions at a fraction of the cost of engineered solutions, at the same time as enhancing natural assets and delivering a range of ecosystem services . An improved environment can stimulate further investment and increase workforce resilience. Specific opportunities for investing in nature based solutions include:

- Peatland restoration – investments in peatland provide multiple benefits, securing and enhancing critical ecosystem services including carbon storage, water retention and water quality, and supporting biodiversity and wildlife.
- Natural flood risk management provides a key means of building our resilience to climate change. For example, tree planting and riparian management improve water retention and quality, reduce flood risk, improve biodiversity, capture carbon and create attractive environments
- Natural coastal defences are a cost effective way of protecting coastal assets under threat from climate change induced sea level rise, currently protecting assets worth £13 billion.

3. Transforming land use and future rural support - the Committee for Climate Change highlights the need for transformative land use change if Scotland and the UK is to meet its climate change targets. The current CAP (Common Agriculture Policy) is worth around £500m per year. Refocusing this with a stronger emphasis on investing in natural capital to

address the twin challenges of biodiversity and climate change will make land based businesses more resilient to economic and environmental challenges.

4. Urban Green Infrastructure targeted at improving disadvantaged areas makes our towns and cities more attractive for people to live and work in, and attracts jobs, businesses and investment. The current ERDF investment in Green Infrastructure of £37m was oversubscribed and there are many opportunities to do more. This would help contribute to inclusive growth and the principles of a Just Transition. Studies show that every £1 invested in GI can generate around £20 of benefits and savings.

5. Sustainable marine management and incentives – the replacement mechanism for the Common Fisheries Policy needs to be refocused on resilience and recovery in the marine environment, and on assisting coastal and marine businesses to grow sustainably. The new Scottish Marine Environmental Enhancement Fund will provide a mechanism for sectors that use the marine environment to contribute to practical conservation and restoration projects to help strengthen the resilience of the marine and coastal environment

6. Active travel networks enable low or zero carbon transport, and provide opportunities for people to improve and maintain their physical and mental health. The National Walking & Cycling Network generates £85m of expenditure from its 6000 kilometres of paths, trails and canal towpaths and provides additional health benefits such as reducing the risk of a range of illnesses including depression.

Submission from SNH

There were numerous suggestions around the Green New Deal or related concepts. See box for example.

Launch **Green New Deal** to build net zero carbon infrastructure

- The programme should be designed to create skilled jobs and build Scottish supply chains.
- This should include investment in natural assets such as reforestation and peatland restoration.
- Pay for this through a carbon tax and leveraging in private capital.

Submission from Scottish Environment [link](#)

A number of submissions dealt specifically with energy issues. See boxes.

Local councils could develop municipal energy and transport companies leading to tighter controls on green indicators alongside an additional revenue stream for the council. Public sector pension funds remain underutilised in Scotland as sources of long term patient investment in social housing developments and renewable energy projects.

The Scottish Government must now take the lead and exert the public ownership, direction and control that is needed to make sure that our communities and our workforce gain the full benefits of the transition to green energy. We need strategically targeted support for research and development programmes including government, companies and universities, alongside investment in start-up companies in the solar panel industry, wind turbines and other forms of renewable energy. An up scaled SNIB must play a role in this.

Submission from Unison Scotland

The Scottish Government must avoid using its economic powers to preference oil and gas, delivering a 'fossil fuel lock-in' within Scotland's energy system which would inhibit efforts to increase the deployment of renewable energy technologies and risk the achievement of our net-zero target.

The Scottish Government can utilise its education and skills powers and work with Skills Development Scotland and further education institutions to introduce a Renewables Transition Training Fund. A Renewable Transition Training Fund can support oil and gas professionals, supply chain businesses, tradesmen and public servants to acquire sustainable, exportable skills and join the renewable energy industry internationalise our industry, and can use its trade, export and investment powers to highlight that Scotland's skills can help other countries decarbonise their economies while maintaining economic growth.

Heat makes up 55% of Scotland's energy use and decarbonising heating is essential if we are to meet our targets for 2030.

Use the public estate as a primer to create supply chains and local manufacturing and developing the skills we'll need in the future, now.

The Scottish Government can work in partnership with industry to develop an economic plan that ensures the long-term future of our economy and energy is low-carbon. Led by a Scottish Cabinet Secretary this plan should deploy the powers of The Scottish Government and establish the support required to maximise economic opportunities and job creation across all the renewable technologies that form our energy system.

Submission from Scottish Renewables

Government should set a deliverable longer-term target of at least 75GW of offshore wind by 2050.

The UK should develop world-leading commercial scale projects for both gas-fired generation with CCS and hydrogen power generation by the mid-2020s. Low-carbon thermal power stations should be used to catalyse investment in shared decarbonisation infrastructure for industrial clusters

Report on written submissions to the advisory group on economic recovery

Government should explore ways to channel strategic investment into key enabling infrastructure needed to unlock local supply chain opportunities, and explore incentives. The UK should seek to deploy the most extensive and efficient charging network in the world by 2025, with local bodies empowered to tender for charge point assets.

To deploy low-carbon heat at scale and get the most value from taxpayer funding for clean heat, there should be a move from a system of grants to provision of 'interest free' loans for home and business owners making their properties 'net zero ready', with further support available to those less able to pay

Submission from Scottish Southern Electric

Scotland has significant natural resources and technical expertise that make it well suited for the rapid expansion required in renewable energy generation if we are to meet our climate targets. Currently we have an ambition for a "largely decarbonised" electricity system by 2032, and a target for "the equivalent of 50% of the energy for Scotland's heat, transport, and electricity consumption to be supplied from renewable sources" by 2030

These are unambitious, represent a slow growth in the renewables sector, and don't align with our new climate targets. Instead, to stimulate opportunities in the renewables sector as part of a Just and Green Recovery and a Just Transition, the Scottish Government should set a target for 100% of electricity and 85% of total energy generated, not just consumed, in Scotland to be from renewables by 2030.

As well as reducing emissions associated with energy, this has potential to act as a driver for continued Government intervention in renewable energy, and create jobs in new or expanded renewable energy.

Submission from Friends of the Earth Scotland

Other submissions considered more specific issues such as woodlands. See box.

The role that natural capital can play Managing native and ancient woodland, provides job opportunities as well as benefits for biodiversity and carbon sequestration - needs to be better recognised in the Scottish forestry sector.

Investment in timber as a high quality, sustainable material that locks in carbon Managing deer in Scotland

Increasing the urban tree canopy cover

Submission from Woodland Trust Scotland

A number of submission made specific points around Biodiversity. See box.

**RSPB
Scotland**

Now is the time to properly integrate biodiversity considerations across policy areas and departments.

Report on written submissions to the advisory group on economic recovery

	<p>Brexit will see the end of the hugely important EU LIFE funding stream that has delivered so much for Scotland's biodiversity - Scottish projects account for c. 21% of the UK LIFE funding allocation. Large-scale nature restoration projects are particularly affected by the loss of LIFE funding.</p> <p>In addition to legislation, we must invest in policies and structures that will better protect our biodiversity from the key drivers of loss identified in the UN IPBES and State of Nature reports, particularly those that are known to be intensifying in Scotland.</p>
Scottish Environment LINK	Protect and enhance biodiversity through investment in catchment scale habitat restoration and linkage projects as part of a Nature Network for Scotland.
Scottish Wildlife Trust	Reduce the hidden cost of damage to biodiversity. Establish a £1bn green conservation fund using existing infrastructure and natural capital and combine with conservation finance models to leverage in private capital.

Some specific mention was made of strategies for Scotland's peatlands.

Various	Consider the long-term financial value of peatland carbon trading and its global value by supporting its restoration in an equitable way.
Stop Climate Chaos Scotland	Direct investment in things like peatland restoration, woodland creation and management and changes in farming practice and funding. Ban commercial peat extraction for horticulture and ban the sale of peat for horticultural use thus driving development of alternatives.

Other contributions in this area included:

- HIE
- Environment & Forestry Directorate, Scottish Government
- Scottish Natural Heritage

A summary of key points from submissions can be found in the table below.

Aberdeen Climate Action	Develop semi-permanent work gangs. These work gangs would expand low-carbon infrastructure: rail electrification, 'deep refurbishment' for housing, local and micro grids to facilitate energy resilience and trading, conversion of gas boilers to hydrogen, conversion of electrical-only to heat pumps, road conversion to separate vehicle, bus/metro/tram, cycle and pedestrian routes.
--------------------------------	--

Report on written submissions to the advisory group on economic recovery

Centre for Energy Policy	Design and plan recovery with strong foundation in net-zero. Government could consider how they can make best use of use public resources to support effective retrofitting programmes and developing strong domestic supply chains to enable Scottish households to become more energy efficient Implement the Energy Efficient Scotland programme proposed by CEP
Citizens' Advice Scotland	Cost-effective energy efficiency improvements - creating well-paid work, and ultimately reducing household costs for people on low incomes and Improved targeting of energy efficiency measures – health factors
Corra Foundation	Tax relief on energy costs for home working (HMRC) programme of renovation and retrofitting homes to decrease fuel poverty, increase energy efficiency
Friends of the Earth Scotland	SG to leverage its new relationship with the business community by directing it towards delivering social and environmental priorities
HIE	Green energy transformation using natural assets –wave, tidal More appropriate policy to support primary production is required with procurement regulations which place greater store on the environmental and socio-economic benefits of local supply and distribution
Infrastructure Commission for Scotland	SG should establish a route map for the implementation of a viable outcome focused system of resource use, reduction, collection, treatment and repurposing to support the creation of a vibrant circular economy
Oil and Gas UK	Invest in low carbon infrastructure, renewables and carbon capture to: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Utilise and retain skills in the oil and gas sector Support the oil and gas supply chain to diversify and pivot to renewables.
Scottish Environment LINK	Prioritising the transition to a zero-carbon circular economy while embracing the Just Transition agenda. A regulatory level playing field for reducing carbon production to ensure that all business compete on other matters and not undercut competitors by ignoring the Climate Emergency. Expand business grant and advice schemes supporting innovation & adoption of circular economy
Scottish Forum on Natural Capital	With an increasing focus on sustainability and resilience, Scotland has the opportunity to utilise its expertise in finance to accelerate impact-based investment to support energy transition and decarbonisation.
Scottish Futures Trust	The upgrading of the electricity grid will be important to support the roll out of EV charging points and heat decarbonisation – direct taxpayer subsidy in addition to Ofgen RAB

Report on written submissions to the advisory group on economic recovery

Scottish Natural Heritage	Investing in nature based solutions to CC: Grow and diversify green finance, Transforming land use and future rural support, Urban Green Infrastructure, Sustainable marine management and incentives, Active travel networks
Scottish Renewables	All government support for the economy and business post-Covid should be coherent with regard to: a) Scotland's commitment to reach Net Zero by 2045; b) the First Minister's statement on protecting and enhancing our stock of natural capital and c) Scotland's ambitions for a wellbeing economy
Scottish Southern Electric	. To deploy low-carbon heat at scale and get the most value from taxpayer funding for clean heat, there should be a move from a system of grants to provision of 'interest free' loans for home and business owners making their properties 'net zero ready', with further support available to those less able to pay
SSE	Net zero power system by 2040 Strategic investment in networks • green fiscal rule • offshore wind revolution • building on market successes• green-light shovel-ready transmission investments • enable electrification locally • optimise connections Leading the charge on electric vehicles: • turbo-charged infrastructure • clean Corporate fleets Clean industrial revolution • flexible low-carbon power generation • ccs and hydrogen clusters • low-carbon and home-grown supply chains Green buildings for green jobs • home improvement Stimulus • low-carbon Heat incentives • heat decarbonisation pathway
STUC	Support a Just Transition to Introduce a £13 billion green investment stimulus package. This will: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Create 150,000 new jobs, retaining the skills of those employed in the oil & gas sector. • Accelerate SG climate priorities like building active travel routes, reforestation & retrofitting buildings. Create publicly owned energy and infrastructure companies to maximise green job creation.
SURF	Controls should be put in place to ensure projects and schemes funded by SG to create jobs in a zero-carbon economy should create high quality jobs and utilise or develop local supply chains. Investment to tackle the environmental and economically corrosive problem of vacant and derelict land
Unison	Local councils could develop municipal energy and transport companies leading to tighter controls on green indicators alongside an additional revenue stream for the council. Public sector pension funds remain underutilised in Scotland as sources of long term patient investment in social housing developments and renewable energy projects.

Report on written submissions to the advisory group on economic recovery

Other similar suggestions were made by a range of institutions including:

- Historic Environment Scotland
- RSPB Scotland
- Scotland’s Rural College
- Scottish Enterprise Rural Leaders
- Scottish Islands Federation

There were a limited number of dissenting voices:

Counterview: View that two possible priorities for economy after lockdown ends, namely decarbonisation and economic recovery are mutually exclusive.
 Very negative over costs of wind farms – costs and intermittency. And that move to Greener energy would “kill economy”
 (Global Warming Policy Foundation)

Use the pandemic recovery to further green recovery but also “The danger is that green agenda has reduced priority over returning the economy to pre-covid times.” (Kincardine Estates)

5.2 Measurement and assessment

There was some discussion of measurement and assessment, primarily around embedding green principles within appraisal and decision making. See table.

Ecometrica Group	Use a wellbeing lens to prioritise or refine economic policy. The wellbeing economy framework can be applied to all areas of conventional economic policy
Inclusion Scotland	Government should work with environmental voluntary organisations to embed green recovery principles at the very beginning of decision-making process. Adopt a Future Generations principle to address long term challenges such as climate change (non-partisan way). Consider impact on disabled people in terms of urban and infrastructure planning, housing, transport, energy efficiency, waste management, risk management and emergency planning. Importance of good access to information
Infrastructure Commission for Scotland	SG should develop an infrastructure assessment framework and methodology that will enable system wide prioritisation of infrastructure investment decisions based on their contribution to net zero.

Report on written submissions to the advisory group on economic recovery

National Trust for Scotland	Importance of NPF for wellbeing and circular economy
Scotland's Rural College	The Chief Economist should undertake a regular analysis of the performance of the natural economy and its target potential compared to benchmark economies, alongside further development of the natural capital assessment.
Scottish Natural Heritage	Mainstreaming natural capital accounting
SCVO	Ensuring that policy and budgetary decisions concerning economic recovery are environmentally stress-tested.
University of Edinburgh	Integrate Environmental Data By modelling cause and effect from climate actions to societal impact we can demonstrate the wider benefits of transitioning to a net zero economy, in particular on wellbeing, environment and biodiversity.

6. Submissions from Business

Key themes and priorities raised by businesses both through the open call to views and directly to Lord Smith of Kelvin were summarised by Scottish Enterprise and are reproduced below.

6.1 Scotland's Competitive Advantage

The recovery will be lengthy and troublesome for the business community, and remains highly dependent on the length of restrictions, any recurrence of the virus, and the effectiveness of the government response.

Scotland has several natural asset strengths, particularly in the food and drink, tourism, renewables and technology sectors. In order to thrive and for opportunities to emerge, realistic and pragmatic changes are required to reduce regulatory obstacles and create a welcoming, enterprise-led market. This recovery and acceleration should not be achieved at the expense of other sectors, rather there needs to be rational prioritisation.

At a macro-economic level, there is a requirement for long term, patient capital investment to support profitable sectors, ensuring that Scotland continues to maintain global competitive advantage while remaining cognisant that sectors will recover at a varying pace. Moreover, infrastructure spending will be key to recovery and should be steered towards resilience for managing future risks, such as climate change. There is wide consensus that this crisis presents Scotland with an opportunity to emerge as a leader in renewable technology and production with strong support for green infrastructure, including energy transition, decarbonisation and carbon capture utilisation and storage.

6.2 Businesses and Sectors

Additionally, it is considered that the robustness of the supply chain will be critical to Scotland's recovery, re-building local suppliers where necessary. The food, pharmaceutical and energy sectors should be actively considered in assessing the strength in depth of the supply chain and revisions to the public procurement process should follow to enable appropriate resilience. Furthermore, Scotland should capitalise on opportunities presented through digital technology and decisive data-led decision making as has been evident through the crisis, which has demonstrated technological adoption and acceleration.

At an enterprise level, there are a range of risks identified regarding employment, debt, markets and investment. Particular concern is given to those sectors where there is a requirement for large numbers of people participation, primarily hospitality, tourism and travel. Methods to stimulate demand and modifications to social distancing specifications will be

Report on written submissions to the advisory group on economic recovery

crucial to viable levels of demand. Retail, food and drink, creative industries and education will also be heavily impacted, and, across engineering base, there is severe pressure on oil and gas and aerospace.

Across all sectors, SMEs are most exposed, particularly regarding short-term cash flow. While cash flow funding is the immediate priority, patient, longer term support will be required for investment in R&D and innovation, supply chain development, apprenticeships and training and infrastructure and practices that can improve productivity.

Access to loan and equity funding for early stage businesses will be required to foster new businesses, particularly in technology-led sectors. There is a consensus that government focus should be on viable businesses, with caution and de-prioritisation for sectors and businesses that were in structural decline before the crisis. Support should therefore be linked to the broader societal priorities, especially those with sustainability credentials. There is consensus that the recovery from this crisis presents Scotland with an opportunity to become a global leader in renewable energy and green technology, a core natural strength. This is a moment to accelerate that opportunity not retract commitments.

Throughout, there needs to be a tailored regional and local response, acknowledging the differentiation throughout the country. The attractiveness and vibrancy of cities and urban areas will be vital to the recovery of industries throughout Scotland, particularly tourism and the creative sectors. This is especially true in Scotland's overall ability to attract exceptional talent. A better eco-system is required to ensure a more joined-up and effective enterprise network across Scotland.

6.3 Labour Market and Skills

The stress to the labour market will have implications for different groups, unemployment, future of work and managing existing and emerging inequalities. The move towards home and remote working will remain permanent or semi-permanent in several sectors. This provides opportunity for increased productivity and greater flexibility. However, unless managed effectively and creatively, it risks deepening inequalities for certain groups namely those with disabilities, minority ethnic groups, women and the young and old. As there is increased dispersal of work, digital skills and infrastructure will become even more vital to the economy, therefore securing universal, fast digital access will be vital to tackling inequality. Additionally, the costs of homeworking will need to be considered ranging from health and safety practices to energy use.

Some sectors will see largescale decline resulting in significant unemployment. This will make reskilling a national priority particularly for those at the bottom of the labour market and young people entering the job market. Research shows that those facing long term unemployment will likely be hardest hit, so creative consideration is required in alleviating this trajectory. A reduced working week has been intimated, however a broader approach to flexible working will be required to accommodate multiple industries and demographics.

Reskilling should focus on future opportunities and industries and be delivered in partnership between business and education providers. Programme opportunities and workplace training through higher and further education should be accessible and affordable for all, regardless of geography, so every effort should be made to facilitate online learning. Further, the talent pool should be broadened by using greater flexibility to bring in people with caring responsibilities, disabilities and older people.

The employer and employee partnership will be critical to ensuring that fairness is reflected through the economy, so employee voices should be engaged and represented through workplace decision making.

6.4 Net Zero Wellbeing Economy

To build a wellbeing economy there will need to be a plan for inclusive growth and a strategy focused on achieving Net Zero outcomes. This will require the recovery to take advantage of Scotland's natural strengths, both in sustainability and health and wellbeing.

The move to homeworking and on-line shopping has created a compelling opportunity for remote communities if it is properly enabled by digital access. Further there is opportunity to redress the current imbalance that exists across Scotland by incentivising urban-rural migration. There should be a focus on communities and regions that have been hardest hit by the crisis, recognising the importance of place leadership. Special attention should be paid to ensuring all communities and people can participate in the new economy, recognising that the third sector has a key role in enabling vulnerable groups.

The crisis has the potential to be the catalyst for transformational change. Reduced travel and pollution as well as an increased reliance on local economies creates opportunity for rural and local natural environments. This presents the case to build community resilience through construction and infrastructure programmes, such as building greener, smarter, affordable homes, as well as the restoration of derelict buildings and re-use of commercial property.

Routes to a Net Zero economy require debate as to whether the focus be on incentivisation of mainstream businesses or a re-invented economy. However, taxation should be actively considered as a means to stimulate the economy's transition to Net Zero.

6.5 Collaboration

Central to the overall recovery will be the corresponding roles and relationships between institutions across Scotland. Its success will depend on more collegiate politics across UK, Scotland, regional partnerships and local authorities. Full recognition should be given to regional variation and circumstances, with the roles of communities and volunteers harnessed for a more participative democracy. People should be fully engaged in the national effort to revive and restore the economy.

Report on written submissions to the advisory group on economic recovery

People and business' trust in government will be vital in the recovery and vice versa. This will require ongoing understanding and empathy of the evolving change. Required will be a continuous engagement with business organisations in designing and delivering recovery and greater data sharing between business and government.

Scotland needs to take more advantage of its size and ability to make bold decisions by layering the strategic forums and programme management that can stifle decision making, in particular the acceleration of planning and regulatory reduction.

7. Submissions from Individuals

This section outlines the key messages received through submissions from individuals. The text below serves as a narrative outline of insights, rather than direct quotations from said individuals, as a way to cover over 100 responses, many of whom wished to retain anonymity.

The insights outlined below are organised using the approach taken in the above report, through the 4 Capitals framework. Though they are shown within specific capitals, they often cut across several and are not to be seen as mutually exclusive.

7.1 Business - economic capital

By far the greatest number of observations from many individual responses received focused on areas of economic change, perhaps unsurprisingly given the context of the survey. Below will serve as an outline of the recurring areas of insight, as well as those of a more specific nature.

Many responses related to ways forward for different industries, as well as the necessity for business support. Related to this were insights which highlighted the need for improved supply chains and the need to support local, regional and national supply chains over that of international. This focus on what might be called the internal aspects of the economy was also reflected in respondents' attitudes to collaboration between local authorities and the Scottish Government, with insights suggesting there should be greater communication as well as delegated decision-making to a local level.

Several responses highlighted the need for a greater focus on manufacturing within Scotland, with one respondent calling for the delivery of a National Manufacturing Institute (although this perhaps suggests a lack of awareness of the National Manufacturing Institute Scotland (NMIS) – www.nmis.scot). Alongside this were calls for stronger links between public and private sector and the public procurement process to be simplified to be more SME-friendly for increased competition and business growth.

Opinion was split on the topic of public ownership of national assets, with many respondents calling for further nationalisation, while others saw this as inefficient and costly and noted their opposition to any further public intervention of this nature.

Report on written submissions to the advisory group on economic recovery

Many responses raised the issues facing the tourism sector in Scotland, highlighting the severe impact and the necessity for intervention and support to maintain a key contributor to the Scottish economy. The insights related to this spanned several areas, including transport infrastructure, financial support and diversification as well as addressing geographic inequalities between central and other regions of Scotland.

Specific proposals included:

- An increased number of ferries to accommodate greater number of tourists more economically and efficiently.
- The introduction of a tourism tariff over the next 10 years
- Specific promotion of Scottish tourism to natives encouraging 'staycations' to boost the sector
- Investment in green transport infrastructure
- The necessity of national infrastructure to be publically owned and run.

There were a large number of submissions on tax (or charge) reform. A significant number would require further devolution of powers. This can be seen in suggestions such as the removal or remodelling of the Barnett formula to increase Scotland's control of its budget.

Several responses also argued for taxes to be raised for those earning more. This can be seen to link to the Social Capital pillar relating to equity amongst society. Linked to this were calls for increased vigilance on those utilising tax minimisation schemes. However, not all observations relating to tax were related to individuals, with some suggesting increased taxes for carbon-intensive or socially impeding businesses, products or services. This can be seen in calls for increased conditionality on business support and investment, with some suggesting finance should be linked to the National Performance Framework, wellbeing and low carbon conditions.

Most clearly linked to the Natural Capital pillar were suggestions to increase tax on carbon-intensive sectors, industries and products such as oil and gas. One respondent's proposal for supporting the financial recovery of Scotland's high street went so far as to suggest higher tax rates for online businesses such as Amazon to reduce the effect of the pandemic on physical shops.

However, some submissions, though low in number, argued that there should be a reduction in personal and corporate tax rates to increase Scotland's attractiveness to high earners and big business.

As noted in the above sections of this report, there were a number of individual responses that suggested various forms of conditionality to government support, both generally and in the context of Covid-19 recovery. Some of these related to wellbeing and social equity, but the majority related to climate change.

Two specific examples were related to the alignment of business support with the NPF and net-zero targets and social conditionality that requires reinvestment of profits back into the community, with the potential for the creation of new employment opportunities locally.

Report on written submissions to the advisory group on economic recovery

Again, as above there were a number of submissions that touched upon rural issues. The differential impact of the virus on rural economies dependent on either tourism and hospitality or primary industries was the key observation of those who submitted responses. Also closely related to responses addressing rural issues was the importance of access to digital services, with a clear link to the increases in remote working during the crisis.

While the majority of responses in this area called specifically for an increase in digital/broadband infrastructure and increased digital equity across Scotland, others were linked to renewables and the subsequent industries. One proposal was that there should be a focus to diversify industry in rural areas of Scotland away from an over-reliance on tourism, with more done to establish jobs within the renewables sector. This could be the restoration of peatland, reforestation or wind and wave technology. One respondent also called for increased investment in rural businesses but specifically those within the area of AgriTech and local food production. It was also argued that the status and security of agricultural jobs needed to be improved to encourage domestic uptake in a sector that is in need of workers.

Other responses do not lend themselves well to a sub-category: so the summary below serves to highlight areas of insight spanning the Economic Pillar more broadly.

Several responses related to working practices and roles in the context of remote working and the remuneration of key workers beyond the crisis. Some suggestions here included the introduction of a shorter working week of 3-4 days and local business hubs for remote working. In other areas, there were calls for increased support for private landlords who may have seen rental income decrease significantly during the pandemic.

7.2 Human Capital - Education and Skills

Insights in the context of Human Capital, largely related to education and skills, were commonly around the changing working environment and shift to more digital orientated working.

As is noted in the above report, there were, from individuals, also several submissions that suggested that there should be a refocus of Skills Strategies to address risks of unemployment, recognising the importance of high participation sectors. This can be seen in such suggestions of developing new skills programmes for future working environments to be funded and implemented going forward. Several responses specifically highlighted the need for further investment in digital skills training to aid in remote working, a practice many viewed as an inevitable aspect of future working practices.

Report on written submissions to the advisory group on economic recovery

Reskilling was also the focus of several responses, highlighting a need to retrain for future employment opportunities. These suggestions often focussed on the growing renewables industry.

Upskilling was also suggested as a route for improved productivity, notably within the manufacturing sector, in which it was suggested there be an increased uptake in such digital upskilling in areas such as large scale robotics within the shipbuilding industry.

A number of submission focused on employability. These responses tended to be around encouraging take-up, increasing support for different groups and to review existing schemes in the light of the post-virus economy. A recurring suggestion amongst individuals' responses was to target youth employment to ensure future job prospects. Insights related to youth, though mentioned here, often related heavily to Social Capital and equalities and the need to ensure no disadvantage to youth entering the job market. Suggestions in this area often specifically related to jobs within the agricultural sector, an area already under pressure from a lack of youth within the workforce. Graduate schemes aimed at Scottish youth were also suggested to increase entry into the job market.

Another line of insight from respondents was in relation to the skills subjects and employability. It was suggested that there should be a more tailored approach to teaching practical subjects directly linked to employment alongside academic subjects.

There were calls to reform the education model in Scotland to align more closely with the Nordic model, in which children begin schooling later and there is a greater focus on outdoor learning.

A greater focus on entrepreneurship and enterprise skills within early education was also suggested within the responses received. Linked to this several responses highlighted the need for an increase in financial awareness and engagement in schools.

Related to the development of digital skills was the call for a unified digital platform across all Scottish schools to increase equity and efficiency across the country.

7.3 Social Capital

Social Capital in the context of the individual responses here links to insights into equalities including economic, social, digital and geographic.

Many submissions discussed issues around place-based interventions and the importance of local action. Insights in this area often focussed on the need for local authorities to have more

Report on written submissions to the advisory group on economic recovery

decision making powers to be able to tailor decisions to local needs and desires within the community. This was, within several submissions, related to community/local authority involvement in renewable energy/heating initiatives and land use for said projects.

Several submissions called for interventions and increased support for areas outwith the central belt of Scotland. This ranged from calls for an increase in investment within businesses and enterprise building to increasing the attractiveness of these areas as a place to live and work, especially if remote working practices are to continue post crisis.

Several of the submissions made reference to specific issues around equalities and protected characteristics. In contrast to the responses from businesses many of the individual insights received highlighted financial/economic inequalities within Scotland and called for the introduction of Universal or Citizens' Basic Income.

Another area in which there was a strong call for development was within Scotland's digital infrastructure, specifically related to an increase in high performance broadband supply. This was especially highlighted in relation to rural areas and what many felt was the current lack of supply.

Economic or financial equality was also highlighted within submissions calling for greater recognition of key worker and low-paid retail and service industry roles. Many submissions called for an increase in wage rates and/or salaries as well as more security in employment.

As mentioned above in relation to conditionality there were several responses that highlighted the need for a greater conditionality in support. Specifically, many respondents highlighted the need for prioritisation of social standards or conditions as well as environmental. This was often related to business practices to aid in reaching net-zero as well as higher levels of staff wellbeing.

7.4 Natural Capital – Environment

Insights related to Natural Capital and the environment, for the most part, related to renewable energy production and low carbon technology and the financial means to do so. There were also, as mentioned above, many responses calling for greater environmental conditionality within support provision. Many submissions highlighted the need for environmental conditions to be linked to green initiatives and the National Performance Framework.

In terms of prioritisation of green investment and support, the responses reflected many of those from the overall responses highlighted in the above report. Respondents highlighted the need for an investment-led recovery with a focus on the Green and Blue economy and the promotion of behavioural change led by a Circular Economy or doughnut economics approach.

Some responses highlighted the desire to follow example nations such as New Zealand, Iceland and South Korea's wellbeing model approaches.

Several submissions suggested the introduction of government loan schemes targeted at decreasing environmental impact, through which businesses could access finance to help reduce their carbon footprint for example. Linked to this, it was suggested that carbon-intensive industries or products should be penalised through higher taxation of such goods or services. Aligned with this several respondents suggested there be incentives for those entering or within the renewables sector, specifically for SMEs.

As part of boosting competition in and increasing engagement with the renewables industry, it was also suggested that regulation within public procurement be reformed to increase likelihood and ability of SMEs to compete for contracts in this area. It was also suggested that planning requirements for renewable energy assets be relaxed to increase development in this area.

Transport infrastructure was also a topic covered in many responses. Many submissions highlighted the need for far increased investment in green infrastructure e.g. walking, cycling and electric vehicle charge points. This was also mentioned in the context of place-based interventions, with a focus on energy infrastructure and its links to local resilience through job creation, and increased efficiency of transport routes for tourism, such as the building, maintenance and running of low carbon ferries. The rural nature of Scotland was also noted as a significant barrier to the adoption of electric vehicles and something that should be addressed immediately.

Some further more specific examples of suggestions covered the introduction of a 'green' day in which, on a weekly basis, there would be an increased focus on green transport, as well as a suggestion related to housing in which an increase in EPC standards and regulation was recommended.

Carbon capture was also raised by several submissions which sought an increase in investment in carbon capture technologies and called for Scotland to become a world leader in this area. Related to this was the call to better utilise rural areas for production and storage of renewable energy and to make use of this within local setting in which it is captured. There were also suggestions to subsidise the grid connection for MW+ to further enable low carbon technologies to be implemented in such settings.

Responses also highlighted the potential of hydrogen produced from offshore wind to be exported. However, it was noted that for this to be beneficial for Scotland the wealth creation must remain within Scottish companies. This was evident in respondents calling for offshore wind production to utilise Scottish supply chains over internationals as can currently be the case.

Greater investment in renewable and low-carbon technology research and development was also noted to be of significant importance with advancements in Scotland's natural resources such as wind and wave power notable examples. Several respondents suggested greater investment in tidal energy/power as both a means of reaching net-zero but as a way to grow the economy and increase job opportunities within more rural areas.

Some submissions highlighted the role of green space over the course of the pandemic and its relationship to both mental health and equalities. Some insights noted the lack of accessible green space such as gardens and allotments during lockdown and the negative affect this had had on individuals and families. This was also linked to increased biodiversity within green space and calls for policies to be aligned with a greater contribution to promoting biodiversity.

As discussed above many of the insights related to natural capital also fall heavily within the other three capitals. This can be seen in examples such as the call for green conditionality for financial investment or support as well as links to greater emphasis on wellbeing through NPF alignment. Insights linked to wellbeing can also be seen in this form of conditionality that may also promote areas of improvement linked to social and economic capital such as increased remote working practices.

There were also several calls for the increased prominence and speed of the Just Transition process. This was highlighted in the need for high quality sustainable jobs related to, as discussed above, the renewable energy sector. Alongside this were calls for Scotland's Green New Deal to be brought forward with increased focus on the area and related policies.

8. List of submissions

The organisations who submitted to the group and gave permission for publication are listed below.

(Built Environment Forum Scotland
4c Design Ltd
A Heart for Duns
Aberdeen Climate Action
Aberdeen Harbour Board
Aberdeenshire Council
Air Services Training (Engineering) Limited Perth
Archaeology Scotland
Argenta
Argyll and Bute Council
Association of the British Pharmaceutical Industry Scotland (ABPI Scotland)
Blackadder Caravan Park Ltd
Capital Theatres (King's and Festival Theatres, Edinburgh)
Carnegie Trust UK
Centre for Energy Policy, University of Strathclyde
Changeworks
Charlotte Street Partners
Chartered Institute of Taxation
Child Poverty Action Group (CPAG) in Scotland
CIPD Scotland
Citizens Advice Scotland
Close the Gap
Colleges Scotland
Community Land Scotland
Corra Foundation
COSLA
Crown Estates Scotland
Cultural Advisory Group
Culture Counts
deafscotland (Scottish Council on Deafness)
Development Trusts Association Scotland
Dumfries & Galloway LEADER Local Action Group
Ecometrica Group
Edinburgh and South East Scotland City Region Deal Partnership
Edinburgh Business School
Engender
Enterprise and Skills Strategic Board
Environment and Forestry Directorate
Existing Homes Alliance Scotland
Federation of Small Businesses
Fife Council
Foodmek Ltd

Report on written submissions to the advisory group on economic recovery

Friends of the Earth Scotland
FVL LEADER Local Action Group
Glasgow City Region
Glasgow Economic Recovery Group
Global Warming Policy Foundation
GlobalScot Swiss Regional Advisory Board
Highlands and Islands Enterprise
Historic Environment Scotland
Homes for Scotland
In capacity as Chair of Tay Cities Management Group, on behalf of Tay Cities Joint Committee
Includem
Inclusion Scotland
indie Semiconductor
Inspired Community Enterprise Trust LTD (The Usual Place)
Just Transition Commission
Keep Scotland Beautiful
Kelvin Valley and Falkirk LEADER Local Action Group
Landfall Strategy Group
Landworkers' Alliance
Low Incomes Tax Reform Group
Mark Diffley Consultancy and Research Ltd
Mcal Merchant Ltd
McCall Research
Midsteeple Quarter
Mobile UK
National Farmers Union Scotland
National Farmers' Union Scotland (NFU Scotland)
NFRC
North Ayrshire Council
NTT DATA UK and Toupay Ventures Ltd
Obesity Action Scotland
OGUK / Oil and Gas UK
On behalf of Scottish Communities Finance Ltd, InspirAlba, Senscot and SocialFirmsScotland
pale blue dot energy
Paths for All
Planning Democracy
Planning Democ
racy
Poverty and Inequality Commission
Professor Paul Anand et al
PURE Spa & Beauty
Reform Scotland
RSPB Scotland
RWE & Innogy Renewables (joint response)
Samaritans Scotland
SCDI

Report on written submissions to the advisory group on economic recovery

Scotch Whisky Association
Scotland for EO
Scotland's Rural College
Scottish Commission for People with Learning Disabilities (SCLD)
Scottish Community Alliance
SCOTTISH COMMUNITY HERITAGE ALLIANCE (SCHA)
Scottish Engineering
Scottish Enterprise
Scottish Environment LINK
Scottish Federation of Housing Associations
Scottish Funding Council
Scottish Futures Trust
Scottish Human Rights Commission
Scottish Islands Federation
Scottish Land Commission
Scottish Land Commission
Scottish Local Authorities Economic Development Group
Scottish Maritime Cluster
Scottish National Women's Organisation
Scottish Natural Heritage
Scottish Property Federation
Scottish Renewables
SCOTTISH SALMON PRODUCERS ORGANISATION
Scottish Tourism Alliance
Scottish Trades Union Congress
Scottish Wildlife Trust
Scottish Women's Convention
SCVO
Slogarie Farm
Solace Scotland
Solar Trade Association
South of Scotland Enterprise
Stirling Council
Stone Federation GB
Stop Climate Chaos Scotland
Strathard Life, Live here, Live well.
STV
Sustainable Inshore Fisheries Trust
Sustaining Dunbar, with Community Carrot, Dunbar Basics Bank, Dunbar
Community Bakery, Dunbar Community Council, North Light Arts, The Ridge SCIO,
St Anne's Scottish Episcopal & Methodist Church
Tarmac
The Business Services Association (BSA)
The Digital Skills Partnership (Scotland's IS)
The Grant Rule Trust
The Growth Partnership
The National Trust for Scotland
The Stove Network

Report on written submissions to the advisory group on economic recovery

Transform Scotland d
Transition Black Isle
Transition Stirling
Unison Scotland
Universities of Stirling and Leeds
Universities Scotland
Venture Trust
Wellbeing Economy Alliance and the Poverty Alliance
WISE Centre for Economic Justice, Glasgow Caledonian University
WK ProTour - Der SchottlandBerater
Women's Enterprise Scotland
Woodland Trust Scotland
Works+
Young Scot
YouthLink Scotland

The individuals who submitted to the group and gave permission for publication are listed below.

Alan Hepburn
Alexander Davey
Angus Campbell
Anne Johnson
Brian McMonagle
C J M MacKenzie
Clare Messer
Cllr Lynne Devine
David Alexander, OBE
David Dickson
David Scrimgeour MBE
David Wilkinson
Derek Logie
Donald McKenzie
Dr Salma Abbasi
Emma Erwin
Gary Kildare
Gary Steel
Gill Dean
Gordon Harrison
Graeme Blackett
Hugh Fraser
James Pringle
Jean Ferguson
John Kerr
Jon Palmer
Judy Wilkinson
Julian Paren
Karen Ormiston

Report on written submissions to the advisory group on economic recovery

Les Allan
Lisa Kabouridis
Mark Hope
Mark Maciver
Mike Fenwick
Mike Haseler BSc MBA
Omar Shaikh
Rajiv Naik
Rick Clark
Rodney Stares
Roger Gifford
Ronald Morrison
Sandra Patterson
Stephen Wood MSc
Steve Buchanan
Steve Kennedy
Taner Dosluoglu
Tony Fitzpatrick
William Boyd Findlay



Scottish Government
Riaghaltas na h-Alba
gov.scot

© Crown copyright 2020

OGL

This publication is licensed under the terms of the Open Government Licence v3.0 except where otherwise stated. To view this licence, visit nationalarchives.gov.uk/doc/open-government-licence/version/3 or write to the Information Policy Team, The National Archives, Kew, London TW9 4DU, or email: psi@nationalarchives.gsi.gov.uk.

Where we have identified any third party copyright information you will need to obtain permission from the copyright holders concerned.

This publication is available at www.gov.scot

Any enquiries regarding this publication should be sent to us at

The Scottish Government
St Andrew's House
Edinburgh
EH1 3DG

ISBN: 978-1-83960-942-8 (web only)

Published by The Scottish Government, September 2020

Produced for The Scottish Government by APS Group Scotland, 21 Tennant Street, Edinburgh EH6 5NA
PPDAS750886 (09/20)

W W W . g o v . s c o t