

Just Transition Commission

Advice for a Green Recovery



Contents

Foreword from Chair	3
Executive Summary	4
Introduction	5-6
Impacts of COVID-19	7–8
Priorities for a just green recovery	9–14
Recommendations for a just green recovery	15–23

Foreword from Chair

Our country, like others around the world, is currently going through a time of unprecedented upheaval and change. COVID-19 represents the most serious public health emergency the world has faced in a generation and has already taken a devastating toll on our society.

Rightly, our minds have been focused on the here and now; how we navigate ourselves through this crisis in a way which protects the health of the population while ensuring our business and community infrastructure remain intact. As lockdown measures are cautiously eased, governments around the world are beginning to turn their attention to how we can recover from the damage caused by the virus.

Climate change, the grand challenge of this generation, has not gone away. When we published our interim report in February we were clear about the need to ramp up action and take steps to ensure the benefits of climate action were felt widely, while the costs did not unfairly burden those least able to pay. That message is every bit as relevant now as it was then. With plans for investment and interventions in the economy being drawn up, there is an opportunity to accelerate our transition to a net-zero economy while healing the scars left on our society by the pandemic. The recent announcement of redundancies at Scotland's world-class bus manufacturer highlights the precarious position of many who can contribute to our net-zero transition. We also know that the impact of COVID-19 has not been felt equally across society, and that marginalised groups have been hit the hardest. Now more than ever it is vital we consider the equity aspects of our transition to net-zero.

We were tasked with advising on a just transition to net-zero in Scotland and in this report we have outlined how COVID-19 impacts on that challenge. We have identified several actions we believe government should consider as part of a just and green recovery. In doing this, we have engaged with the wider policy landscape, taking account of advice already submitted to government by the Committee on Climate Change, the Advisory Group on Economic Recovery, the Climate Emergency Response Group and many others. Rather than duplicate existing work, we have sought to focus on areas of the recovery specific to our remit.

We continue to progress our work plan in order to submit a final report to Ministers in early 2021. Our report will come at an important time for Scotland, before a new Parliament is elected and as plans for showcasing Scotland to the world at COP26 in Glasgow are being developed. We hope this report will help lay the foundations for a just transition to net-zero, allowing us to recover from COVID-19 in a way which builds a fairer, greener society for all.

Professor Jim Skea Chair Just Transition Commission

Executive Summary

- **1.1** This report responds to a request by the Cabinet Secretary for Environment, Climate Change and Land Reform, asking for advice in relation to a green recovery from the current pandemic. We have been asked specifically to consider the green recovery through a just transition lens, building on the work of other groups such as the Committee on Climate Change.
- 1.2 In this report, we add to the consensus calling for an economic recovery from COVID-19 that is consistent with Scotland's climate ambition, but with an increased emphasis on equity. We have an opportunity to reset our progress towards a net-zero economy in a way that also actively tackles inequality and promotes regional cohesion.
- **1.3** We have spoken to a range of stakeholders and also discussed the recovery with key groups such as the Advisory Group on Economic Recovery and Climate Emergency Response Group. We have identified a number of Hot Spot areas that merit particular attention:
- \rightarrow Young people are especially at risk
- Patterns of transport use have changed, but there is great uncertainty about the permanence of these changes
- → There is an accelerated transition unfolding in the oil and gas sector
- → Some rural sectors and regions are especially hard hit.

- **1.4** We have used three criteria to assess our recommendations for immediate action:
- Do they set Scotland on a pathway to netzero?
- → Do they ensure the benefits of climate change action are shared widely, while the costs do not unfairly burden those least able to pay, or whose livelihoods are directly or indirectly at risk?
- Will they contribute to a just and fair economic recovery for Scotland, once the immediate emergency, created by COVID-19, has subsided?
- **1.5** We have produced a number of specific recommendations for immediate action that we believe can help build a fairer, greener economy.
- → Boost investment in warmer homes
- \rightarrow Back buses and support the supply chain
- Help the rural economy by helping Scotland's nature
- Maintain and create new jobs for oil and gas workers
- Align skills development for young and old
 with the net-zero transition
- Give a clear sense of direction and attach conditions to funding
- **1.6** The range and scale of interventions required to ensure a just transition will require sustained action and long-term planning. We will address the longer time frame when we produce our full report next year. Our aim in this report is to focus on practical recommendations to shape urgent action for the coming months.

Introduction

- **2.1** The Commission was established to make recommendations to Scottish Ministers on how we can transition to a net-zero economy by 2045 in a way which:
- maximises the economic and social opportunities that the move to a net-zero economy by 2045 offers
- builds on Scotland's existing strengths and assets
- understands and mitigates risks that could arise in relation to regional cohesion, equalities, poverty (including fuel poverty), and a sustainable and inclusive labour market
- 2.2 We published our <u>interim report</u> in February, laying out our emerging thinking and initial recommendations for government. Since then the pandemic has swept across the world, disrupting our lives and extracting a devastating toll on health and our wider society while demonstrating the impact that sudden and unplanned transitions can have.
- 2.3 This report has come about as a result of a request from the Cabinet Secretary for Environment, Climate Change and Land Reform, asking us for advice on a green recovery from the pandemic. We have been asked specifically to consider the green recovery through a just transition lens, building on the work of other groups such as the Committee on Climate Change. The Government set out the stages for its economic response to the pandemic in April: Response, Reset, Restart, and Recover.¹ It is the final stage of this plan that we are focussed on in this report.

- 2.4 While the pandemic has had a profound impact on our economy and the way we live our lives, it has also shone a cruel light on many of the structural inequalities that exist in our society. The public sector has been forced to intervene in the economy and in people's lives in a way some would have previously thought impossible.
- 2.5 On the climate change front, we have seen the understandable delay to both the Scottish Government publication of the updated Climate Change Plan and to COP26. While these decisions were inevitable in light of the unprecedented circumstances, we must be careful not to lose sight of the urgent need to tackle the climate challenge. The most recent statistics show Scotland's greenhouse gas emissions rose in 2018, a trend that desperately needs reversing and at pace. Now is the time for renewed commitment to reset our pathway to net-zero, while building a fairer and more resilient economy.
- 2.6 Many recent reports have called for a green recovery. In particular, we draw attention to the work of the Advisory Group on Economic Recovery (AGER) and the Climate Emergency Response Group (CERG). We have also gained insight from a wide range of sectors and there is a clear consensus on the importance of an investment-led recovery and the need to ensure the economic recovery is consistent with Scotland's climate ambitions.

¹ https://www.gov.scot/publications/coronavirus-covid-19-update-economy-secretarysstatement-economic-impact-covid-19-tuesday-21-april-2020/

Introduction

- 2.7 We have tried to bring another perspective to the existing commentary on green recovery, emphasising equity and the imperative of delivering a just transition to net-zero. In setting out our recommendations for government we have used three criteria to assess proposals:
- 1. Do they set Scotland on a pathway to netzero?
- 2. Do they ensure the benefits of climate change action are shared widely, while the costs do not unfairly burden those least able to pay, or whose livelihoods are directly or indirectly at risk?
- Will they contribute to a just and fair economic recovery for Scotland once the immediate emergency, created by COVID-19, has subsided?
- 2.8 We have also considered proposals from the perspective of the three main themes we identified in our interim report: planning ahead, broad engagement, and bringing equity to the heart of climate change policies.

- 2.9 We have identified four Hot Spot areas we believe merit particular and urgent attention from government and have developed a set of focussed recommendations that will help embed a just transition to net-zero as part of the green recovery. There is no doubt that our recovery from the harm caused by the pandemic is a monumental challenge for government, and we cannot shy away from that. But we would return to the message of our interim report – bold, decisive action from government can help deliver a fair and just transition to net-zero in Scotland.
- 2.10 The case for a just and green recovery is clear. We need to be focusing on how to embed fairness and ensure the people who need support most feel the benefits as we recover from the pandemic. We hope this report is helpful to government in this regard.

Impacts of COVID-19

- 3.1 The severity of the pandemic has required an unprecedented public health response, with large sections of our economy either ceasing or significantly reducing activity. The immediate consequences of this disruption can be seen in the large numbers of workers placed on furlough, increased numbers claiming unemployment support, and businesses struggling with cash flow and being forced to take on new debt. In the face of this we have seen unprecedented interventions in the economy from both Scottish and UK Governments to limit job losses and support businesses and third sector organisations through the crisis. At the local level, many communities, often led by local anchor organisations, have rallied together as vulnerable people were required to stay at home and the pandemic shut down social infrastructure such as libraries and community halls.²
- **3.2** The impacts of the pandemic cannot be understood by simply looking at economic aggregates such as GDP. We must not forget the impact this has had on people's wellbeing. Emerging evidence shows the impact lockdown and social distancing has had on mental health,³ and serious concerns have also been raised for victims of domestic abuse.⁴ Evidence from other parts of the UK has shown the virus has had a disproportionate impacts on Black and Minority Ethnic (BAME) workers.⁵
- **3.3** Our labour market was not working for everyone pre-crisis. On this, we could point to the significant numbers still experiencing underemployment,⁶ or the almost 70,000 working under zero hours contracts.⁷ The principles of Fair Work, a pillar of Scottish
- https://www.carnegieuktrust.org.uk/blog/conversations-with-communities-sharing-common-experiences-from-scotland-england-northern-ireland-and-wales/
 https://www.ifs.org.uk/uploads/The-mental-health-effects-of-the-first-two-months-of-
- Icckdown-and-social-distancing-during-the-Covid-19-pandemic-in-the-UK.pdf https://www.local.gov.uk/sites/default/files/documents/Domestic%20Abuse%20
- Guide%20UPDATED%20as%20of%2011%20May%20%28PM%29.pdf
- https://www.gov.uk/government/publications/covid-19-understanding-the-impact-on-5
- ame-communities https://www.gov.scot/publications/scotlands-labour-market-people-places-regions-
- statistics-annual-population-survey-2019/ https://www.ons.gov.uk/employmentandlabourmarket/ peopleinwork/employmentandemployeetypes/datasets/
- emp17peopleinemploymentonzerohourscontracts

Government Economic Strategy, are not experienced equally across society. One pre-crisis survey found that almost a fifth of respondents felt they had no effective voice at their place of work.8

- 3.4 The lockdown has heightened our awareness of these features of the labour market. Early evidence has shown low earners and those experiencing precarious work have been more likely to either lose their jobs or to be furloughed.9 Recent Scottish Government research has also highlighted that low earners, younger people, women, minority ethnic individuals, and disabled people are most at risk as the labour market is disrupted.¹⁰
- **3.5** For those able to stay in work, businesses and individuals have been forced to adapt to new ways of working at a pace previously unseen. However, the shift towards home working has not been uniform, being more common among higher earners.¹¹ While this will have been viewed as a positive by some, the rapid shift to homeworking has also created new concerns, with the potential for fundamental changes to working conditions being established with limited opportunity for employee consultation and involvement. Many workers on lower incomes have been required to continue travelling to their place of work. While there have been good examples of employer-employee engagement on health and safety matters, there has also been cases of employers not giving due attention to the concerns of their staff.12

- https://www.cipd.co.uk/knowledge/work/trends/goodwork/working-lives-scotland https://www.resolutionfoundation.org/publications/the-effects-of-the-coronaviruscrisis-on-workers/
- 10 https://www.gov.scot/publications/economic-impact-of-coronavirus-led-labour-
- market-effects-on-individuals-and-households/ 11 https://www.resolutionfoundation.org/app/uploads/2020/03/Doing-what-it-takes.pdf
- 12 http://www.stuc.org.uk/media-centre/news/1436/call-centres

Impacts of COVID-19

3.6 We now need look to across the horizon to what may follow later in the year. There have been warnings of large scale redundancies as the economy reopens and the UK Government furlough scheme is run down. For many workers, including those in previously high-quality employment such as in aviation, we have already seen those threats translated into redundancies or attempts to remove hard-won employment terms. Weak job creation will also greatly impact the labour market, and has been shown to be the dominant factor in explaining rises in unemployment during past recessions.¹³ This has prompted estimates that unemployment could reach as high as 10% later this year, with the impact likely to fall on those already disadvantaged.

3.7 The other impact of the lockdown has of course been the reductions in greenhouse gas emissions that have occurred. The disruption has meant a rapid transition to using less energy, travelling less, with output from heavy industry also curtailed. One study has estimated that global emissions may fall between 2–7% in 2020, with daily emissions estimated to have fallen by as much as 31% in the UK during lockdown.¹⁴ Data from road side monitoring has also shown significant improvements to air quality in streets across Scotland.¹⁵

3.8 While we have seen a step-change in people's behaviours through lockdown, many of the changes seen, such as reduced car travel, look as if they are starting to return to previous levels. In any case, ultimately it is the long-term trajectory of emissions that matter for climate change. As we have pointed out, based on the most recent figures, Scotland was not on a trajectory to meet net-zero by 2045 prior to the pandemic.

- 13 https://rsa.tandfonline.com/doi/abs/10.1080/09595238400185461#.Xv8wJPaSk2w
- 14 https://www.globalcarbonproject.org/news/ TemporaryReductionInCO2EmissionsDuringCOVID-19.html
- 15 http://www.scottishairquality.scot/news/?id=625

- **4.1** All of this builds the case for government intervention in the form of a just, green recovery. The need to create good quality jobs based on Fair Work principles has never been clearer, while at the same time we need to make sure investments support reductions in greenhouse gas emissions and do not lock us into high-carbon infrastructure. We are at a crucial point for delivering both a net-zero economy, and also one which is fair and works for people across the country.
- **4.2** In developing our thinking for what government should prioritise as part of a green recovery, we have identified a number of Hot Spots that we feel merit particular attention.

Hot Spot 1: Young people are especially at risk

- **4.3** As the pandemic swept across the country we saw the closure of schools and higher education institutions. At a crucial stage of their development, young people have had to adapt to distance learning and new methods of examination. For those leaving education and entering the job market for the first time, their prospects look very different to those in the same situation a year ago. At the same time, it is our young people that will live with the consequences if we fail to seize the opportunity to build a fairer, net-zero society. It is also our young people who are often the most motivated and vocal in calling for action. A green recovery is not only a response to the economic and climate crisis facing us, but an investment in the future of young people across the country.
- **4.4** We know from past recessions that young people leaving education and entering the labour market for the first time during a downturn are particularly vulnerable, and likely to experience persistent 'scarring effects' in the form of lower earnings and

employment.¹⁶ One recent study has projected that, even three years after leaving education, the employment rate for today's graduates will be 13% lower than it would have been without the impact of COVID-19.17 This effect is likely to be even higher for young people falling into the low and medium skilled category. The UK Government has recognised this threat, and recently announced plans for a Kickstart scheme to create subsidised jobs for people aged 16-24.18 In the coming months it will be important to scrutinise these proposals and assess the extent to which they deliver for young people, particularly in relation to the Scottish Government ambitions on just transition.¹⁹ We should support schemes that can deliver opportunities for young people to make a meaningful contribution to our netzero transition, while being paid a real Living Wage and earning valuable experience.

- **4.5** For those remaining in education through the pandemic, there have been concerns raised regarding both the long-term impact of school closures on attainment and social mobility. Prior to lockdown there was evidence of a persistent attainment gap in numeracy and literacy between the most and least deprived areas in Scotland.²⁰ There are reasons to believe these patterns will only have been exacerbated by recent events. With schools shut and learning taking place online, the amount of time children spend on school work is influenced by a variety of factors. One recent survey found that while 44% of middle class parents were spending more than four hours a day home-schooling, only one third of working class parents were doing so.²¹ This difference builds up over time and can lead to further diverging outcomes.
- https://www.ifs.org.uk/publications/10180
 https://www.resolutionfoundation.org/publications/class-of-2020/
- 18 Note this is similar in some respects to the AGER recommendation of implementing
- a 'Scottish Guarantee': <u>https://www.gov.scot/publications/towards-robust-resilient-wellbeing-economy-scotland-report-advisory-group-economic-recovery/</u>
 19 https://www.gov.uk/government/news/rishis-plan-for-jobs-will-help-britain-bounce-
- back 20 https://www.gov.scot/publications/achievement-curriculum-excellence-cfe-
- levels=2018-19/
- 21 https://www.suttontrust.com/our-research/covid-19-and-social-mobility-impact-brief/

- **4.6** Alongside evidence of the likely impact on attainment and earnings, this period has also affected young people's wellbeing. Survey work carried out earlier in the year showed that young people in Scotland are already worried about the effect the pandemic will have on their future prospects.²² Mental health is also a particular concern. Many with existing mental health needs have found their usual support network disrupted, and there have been warnings that many young people who previously did not require support may require it in the future.²³
- **4.7** All of this points to the need for government to provide continuing tailored support for young people. Failing to do this would risk increased inequality amongst young people and also between generations. Investing in young people, who are key to our country's future, should form a central part of a green recovery for Scotland. This will help build an economy that is climate-ready and that allows young people to fulfil their potential.

Hot Spot 2: Patterns of transport use have changed, but there is great uncertainty about future behaviour

- **4.8** Demand for public transport fell dramatically as lockdown was introduced and people shifted towards working from home where possible. Bus and rail operators reduced services relied on by many key workers who did not have an alternative. Personal car use also fell as travel for leisure purposes was restricted.²⁴
- **4.9** Road traffic and congestion fell as large numbers of people stopped commuting to work, which will have resulted in a reduction in carbon emissions from cars. We have seen an increase in walking and cycling, largely for exercise rather than commuter journeys. This will have had impacts on health, as active travel is known to bring significant health benefits.²⁵ Improvements to air quality have also been observed in streets across Scotland, which is known to have positive impact on cardiovascular health.²⁶



24 https://www.transport.gov.scot/our-approach/statistics/#63626 25 https://blogs.napier.ac.uk/tri/wp-content/uploads/sites/56/2019/10/Essential-Evidence-4-Scotland-No-17-Cobenefits-of-active-travel.pdf 26 https://blogs.napier.ac.uk/tri/wp-content/uploads/sites/56/2019/02/Essential-Evidence-

22 https://www.youthlinkscotland.org/media/4486/lockdown-lowdown-final-report.pdf 23 https://youngminds.org.uk/media/3708/coronavirus-report_march2020.pdf

4.10 As lockdown eased we began to see a rebound in car use, however. We have also seen evidence that people's perceptions of public transport may have changed, with the potential for long-term impacts on the viability of services if left unaddressed. While the evidence is still emerging, according to one survey 20% of people in Scotland feel they will use public transport less, even after the pandemic.²⁷ This is in part due to messaging from government early in the pandemic which emphasised the dangers of public transport rather than promoting certain positive behaviours to limit risks (wearing face coverings, social distancing etc).

4.11 Government has made funding available to local authorities for pop-up active travel infrastructure in an effort to lock-in some of the behaviour change seen during lockdown. Funding has also been made available to support the rapid deployment of bus priority infrastructure, which we support.²⁸ In addition, funding has been provided to support the bus and rail sectors, which have faced serious loss of revenue as a result of reduced passenger numbers.²⁹ Government will need to continue providing support and intervene in bus and rail services until passenger numbers recover if we are to retain routes.

- **4.12** While the outlook remains uncertain, there is no doubt the current situation is a potential turning point for the transport system in Scotland. People have experienced cleaner air in their streets and have adapted to travelling less. However, we must also recognise some of the risks. Firstly, there could be significant implications arising from the change in perceptions towards public transport and greater home working. Bus services in particular are more frequently
- 4-Scotland-No-5-Ambient-air-pollution-and-cardiac-damage.pdf
- 27 https://yougov.co.uk/topics/transport/survey-results/daily/2020/04/30/62ede/1 28 https://www.transport.gov.scot/news/10-million-for-pop-up-bus-priority-

29 http://www.parliament.scot/parliamentarybusiness/report.aspx?r=12590&mode=pdf

used by those on lower incomes and women.³⁰ Any threat to the viability of these services therefore carries huge equity implications. Secondly, domestic bus manufacturing and the associated jobs are at risk due to weakened demand from operators, both at home and abroad. We have already seen these risks translate into job losses for some.³¹ This manufacturing base was one of the positive examples we could previously point to in relation to Scotland's net-zero economy.

4.13 Government intervention to support a green recovery must seek not only to reduce emissions and embed the more positive trends we have seen in transport use in recent months, but crucially it must also address the equity and economic impacts that these changes may bring. There is an opportunity to improve the lives of the key workers we have depended on through this crisis and others who rely on our public transport system. While this undoubtedly represents a huge challenge, it is equally a rare opportunity to make a step change in delivering a fair and net-zero compliant transport system in Scotland.

infrastructure-in-scotland/

 ³⁰ https://www.transport.gov.scot/media/45852/sct09199889061.pdf
 31 https://www.alexander-dennis.com/media/news/2020/july/adl-moves-to-leanermanufacturing-model-as-falling-demand-for-new-buses-and-coaches-forcescompany-to-adjust/

Hot Spot 3: An accelerated transition is unfolding in the Oil and Gas sector

- **4.14** The North Sea oil and gas sector has been struggling with lower prices, caused in part by a reduced demand for its products resulting from the pandemic. This will undoubtedly have a significant impact on activity in the North Sea, with one study estimating roughly a third of known reserves will be uneconomic to extract unless the price recovers.³² While much of the focus is on the north east, the impacts of this will be felt throughout the supply chain which stretches across the country.
- **4.15** The hope for the sector had been that the increased deployment of offshore wind, decommissioning, hydrogen and carbon capture, utilisation and storage (CCUS) would see investment and workers transitioning to new emerging sectors and the economy of the north east gradually diversifying away from oil and gas. This was set out in the industry strategy, Roadmap 2035, which the Scottish Government was working with industry to implement prior to the pandemic. For there to be a smooth transition for the workforce, we are likely to need to see domestic manufacturing opportunities result from these new technologies. To date these have been limited, and whether Roadmap 2035 is fit for the current context of accelerated transition remains to be seen.
- **4.16** The industry has always suffered from periodic downturns. Increasingly there is debate as to whether the current crisis should be viewed as a structural rather than a cyclical shock, with the possibility of lower prices persisting for the foreseeable future.³³ There is increased evidence from investors of the risk of 'stranded assets'.³⁴ When we visited Aberdeen in 2019 we noted the risk that Vision 2035 would not



deliver a stable transition for workers should price assumptions prove optimistic.³⁵

4.17 Current events have shown that the need for diversification in the industry has never been greater, but this comes at a time when companies may be less able to invest in the transition. The supply chain would benefit from greater certainty and a strong sense of direction from government in the coming months if it is to invest in the next generation of technologies that will be the building blocks for a net-zero energy system. While technologies such as CCUS and hydrogen have long-term potential, the extent to which they can deliver support for jobs in the short-term has been questioned. Decommissioning offers more obvious opportunities for creating jobs in the nearterm. Investment is also happening now, and with more to come, in offshore wind.

³² https://www.abdn.ac.uk/research/acreef/documents/NSP-147.pdf 33 https://www.oxfordenergy.org/wpcrons/wp-content/uploads/2016/05/Adjustment-inthe-0il-Market-Structural-Cyclical-or-Both.pdf 34 https://carbontracker.org/reports/decline-and-fall/

³⁵ https://www.gov.scot/publications/just-transition-commission-meeting-papersseptember-2019/

4.18 All of this will, of course, have a major impact on the workforce. Focused action with clarity of intent will be needed to avoid loss of capacity and capability in the sector. Oil and Gas UK have estimated as many as 30,000 jobs could be lost over the next year and a half,³⁶ while trade union leaders have warned that the current crisis risks "extinguishing prospects of a just transition for oil and gas workers".³⁷ Digitalisation of the industry has accelerated, and while in many ways this is good, it could further contribute to lower demand for workers offshore. While much focus has been on the North Sea. we should also note that the downstream oil and gas sector and petrochemicals operations in central Scotland, also a source of high-paid quality employment over a long period, is faced with similar pressures.

4.19 To date, the Scottish Government has responded by announcing a £62 million Energy Transition Fund, focussed on supporting a programme of projects developed with industry to drive the transition to net-zero. The Strategic Leadership group convened by government also continues to meet, with a renewed focus on identifying actions to support the sector and its workforce through the crisis.³⁸ However, as the situation continues to unfold there will be a need to support further diversification and provide targeted support for displaced workers. The scale of the challenge presented is immense, but ultimately there is also an opportunity to build long-term prosperity in both the north east and central Scotland based on new, net-zero investments.

Hot spot 4: Some rural sectors and regions are especially hard hit

- **4.20** While the challenges facing rural Scotland are not homogenous, areas that are proportionally more reliant on sectors such as hospitality and tourism look likely to be especially hard hit by the pandemic. As lockdown is eased and the hospitality sector begins to reopen it seems unlikely that employment will recover rapidly. Rural Scotland has a higher proportion of SMEs (especially micro-enterprises) and self-employed, while employment in tourism and hospitality is often precarious and below the standards of Fair Work, which heighten these vulnerabilities.³⁹
- **4.21** Events unfolding in these communities have occurred against an already challenging backdrop, which includes long-standing issues such as depopulation, lack of affordable housing, and concentrated land ownership in some areas. This is combined with the impending challenges posed by Brexit for important sectors such as food and drink.
- **4.22** In addition to the pressure on these areas from the downturn in key sectors, the crisis has also exposed a lack of resilience in rural infrastructure, particularly broadband. While just over 4% of households in Scotland do not have access to a decent broadband connection, this percentage is notably higher in rural and island local authorities. People in these areas will have found it more difficult to work from home and adapt to new ways of working made necessary by lockdown.⁴⁰

36 https://oilandgasuk.co.uk/product/business-outlook-report/

37 https://www.rmt.org.uk/news/rmt-calls-for-urgent-action-to-protect-britains-energy/
 38 https://www.gov.scot/news/protecting-energy-sector-workforce-and-net-zero-ambitions/

39 https://fraserofallander.org/covid/regional-impacts-of-the-coronavirus-pandemic/ 40 https://spice-spollight.scot/2020/04/01/staying-connected-broadband-and-coronaviruscovid-19/

- **4.23** Concerns have also been raised regarding the impact of the lockdown on households living in fuel poverty. Housing in rural areas is less energy efficient, while also more likely to be off-gas grid meaning a greater reliance on electricity, oil and wood for heating.⁴¹ One estimate suggests that a lockdown during winter months could elevate heating bills by up to an average of £124 per month.⁴² This is likely to be particularly acute in rural areas, where households living in fuel poverty are already much more common.
- **4.24** A green recovery for Scotland must address the challenges facing the most vulnerable aspects of the rural economy. While the crisis has highlighted the need to strengthen the resilience of the rural economy so as to not be so reliant on individual sectors such as tourism, better quality infrastructure will be a key enabling factor. The green recovery is an opportunity to improve infrastructure such as broadband and transport links. The provision of energy efficient housing (with a mix of housing type to meet need) combined with improved broadband access can provide opportunities for employment, given the greater proportion of home working that can be found in rural Scotland. Creating business hubs to enable networking and collaboration will stimulate inclusive economic growth. A green recovery can also support new employment opportunities in areas such as forestry and peatland restoration. To do this, we will need to see both investment in rural communities and in Scotland's natural capital which is not only a key asset in our fight against climate change but a potential source of prosperity.



41 https://www.gov.scot/publications/scottish-house-condition-survey-2018-key-findings/ 42 eciu.net/analysis/reports/2020/lockdown-in-leaky-homes

- **5.1** With the challenge of delivering a recovery that lays the foundations for a net-zero society and improves the wellbeing of our country in mind, we must first consider the context for government action in the year ahead. We recognise there are some constraints on what Scottish Government can do. These constraints arise from the division of devolved/ reserved responsibilities, as well as funding challenges. The fiscal outlook in particular remains uncertain, and will depend in part on decisions made by the UK Government. While challenging, this cannot be used as an excuse for inaction or reverting to business as usual.
- **5.2** It is possible that future announcements from the UK Government may deliver some level of additional funding for the Scottish Budget. To date, Scottish Government policy has followed a similar path to the UK Government in terms of choosing how to spend additional monies. There is an opportunity to design a path tailored to Scotland's specific needs and challenges as we move into the recovery phase. Prioritisation of existing budgets must also be looked at urgently. If current programmes or investments are not aligned to the Scottish Government objective of a just, green recovery they must be revised. While we recognise the political challenges of this, it seems to us to be an unavoidable choice government must face up to regarding the design of its recovery package. Opportunities to attract private money towards policy priorities must also be considered.
- **5.3** There is a long list of actions that we know we must implement if we are to end our contribution to climate change. None of these have gone away. In the context of designing a recovery package for our society with finite resources, certain things make more sense to prioritise. Other reports have recommended actions for a green recovery that combine climate action with an economic response.⁴³ As stated above, we have sought to ensure that the questions of equity and justice are considered and have used the following criteria to assess individual measures:
- 1. Do they set Scotland on a pathway to netzero?
- 2. Do they ensure the benefits of climate change action are shared widely, while the costs do not unfairly burden those least able to pay, or whose livelihoods are directly or indirectly at risk?
- 3. Will they contribute to a just and fair economic recovery for Scotland once the immediate emergency, created by COVID-19, has subsided?
- 5.4 As with all our work, we would also draw attention to two key questions to be considered in all proposed measures: a) who pays? and b) who really benefits? Scrutinising projects to understand these questions is of utmost importance in the recovery from COVID-19.

⁴³ For instance, deliver emission reductions, help support job creation, and speed of implementation <u>https://www.smithschool.ox.ac.uk/publications/wpapers/</u> workingpaper20-02.pdf

- **5.5** A strong evidence base is needed to justify investments, given the competing priorities faced by government.44 While some climate investments may deliver on all three criteria (emissions, just transition, economic recovery), they will do so to different degrees, and the distribution of benefits may not necessarily be equitable. This does not remove the need to implement these, rather it means there is less justification for prioritising at this moment in time. In the current context, we need to pull out the obvious measures that deliver against the criteria set out above and prioritise their delivery.
- 5.6 We have set out the evidence base for our recommendations where possible, relying on work carried out by other organisations and experts. We believe the steps outlined in this report can contribute towards a recovery that helps build a fairer, greener economy in Scotland. Our individual recommendations for government along with their rationale are set out below.

Boost investment in warmer homes 1.

- Scotland already has energy efficiency 1.1 and fuel poverty programmes that could be scaled up as part of the recovery. There is strong evidence for the multiple benefits this would bring and many have highlighted this as a 'quick win' for government.⁴⁵ Specifically, we recommend:
- i. **Doubling budgets for the Warmer Homes Scotland and Energy Efficient Scotland** local authority area-based schemes.
- ii. Launching a non-domestic boiler scrappage scheme to help drive removal of higher emitting oil and gas boilers and support manufacturing opportunities for zero-emission heat solutions.

- iii. Incentivise those households that are able to contribute something now to installing energy-saving measures to do so, by expanding loan funding, 'cash back', equity release or similar schemes.
- 1.2 This scaling up should be combined with a rigorous assessment of the supply chain's capacity to deliver in the coming year, to ensure any budget allocated is spent. Work carried out under Warmer Homes Scotland and area-based schemes must continue to be subject to robust quality control standards and great care will be needed to ensure that these standards are not compromised in the rush to scale up programmes.⁴⁶

Rationale

1.3 Net-zero: Buildings remain an important source of greenhouse gas emissions in Scotland, with the residential sector alone accounting for roughly 15% of total emissions in 2018. The net-zero scenarios developed by the Committee on Climate Change imply that a significant roll-out of energy efficiency measures across the housing stock will be required, combined with decarbonisation of heat. The previous Climate Change Plan had outlined the need to reduce emissions from residential buildings by 23% and from non-domestic buildings by 53% (by 2032). It is likely that this ambition will need to be increased in light of the targets contained in the new Climate Change Act. Recent analysis by the International Energy Agency found improving building efficiency to be one of the most cost effective ways to reduce emissions.47

⁴⁴ Given the international interest in green recovery, much of the evidence base has been set out in publications by organisations such as the International Energy Agency: <u>https://</u> www.iea.org/reports/sustainable-recovery 45 These include, Committee on Climate Change, Climate Emergency Response Group,

International Energy Agency, amongst many others

⁴⁶ https://wearecitizensadvice.org.uk/net-zero-will-require-big-changes-in-our-homeswe-need-consumer-protections-to-match-3f280c6c51ad 47 https://www.iea.org/reports/sustainable-recovery/a-sustainable-recovery-plan-for-the-

energy-sector#abstract

- **1.4** Just Transition: there is evidence of health gains resulting from reductions to fuel poverty, and Scottish Government has recognised the importance ensuring everyone is able to keep their home warm as a matter of social justice.48 These are perhaps most likely to arise from targeted area-based programmes delivered by local authorities; lower income groups are more likely to be at risk of fuel poverty, and interventions to address this can therefore also help local areas reduce health inequalities.⁴⁹ Skilled jobs are also created through the retrofitting activity. Where this work leads to lower bills for the consumer, there may be additional stimulus for the economy. Crucially, this work is not able to be offshored and is spread around the country, often among SMEs that have been hard hit by the crisis.
- **1.5** Boiler scrappage offers a way for nondomestic users in rural and remote areas, often more reliant on fossil fuels, a mechanism to secure lower-emission hot water and heating. While there is less published evidence in relation to investment in non-domestic heat, this would create opportunities in installation work and potentially manufacturing across Scotland, including in rural and remote areas.
- **1.6 Economic Recovery:** this activity, particularly energy efficiency, can be introduced quickly. There is evidence that existing schemes have unmet demand and increased funding would allow work to be undertaken more rapidly than would otherwise be the case. Introduction of a non-domestic boiler scrappage scheme may take longer to implement, but would generate opportunities for the supply chain involved in the manufacture of zeroemission heat solutions that already exist in Scotland, as well as providing both the

public and private sector with opportunities to update their heating equipment. Both of the recommendations align with our rural economy Hot Spot and could also target young people, should opportunities be created in the form of apprenticeships.

2. Back buses and support the supply chain

- 2.1 The public transport system in Scotland is struggling to manage the consequences of the pandemic. Maintaining vital services that are relied upon by thousands, including the key workers we have depended on during this crisis, should be a priority. We have outlined a range of measures we believe will support this:
- i. rapidly roll-out spending of the £500 million previously committed to prioritise buses, including measures to reallocate motorway and other road space to high occupancy vehicles such as buses;⁵⁰
- ii. establish a nationwide bus scrappage scheme to replace older diesel buses with low emission and zero-emission buses;⁵¹
- iii. develop an enhanced and accelerated national plan for charging infrastructure for both public and private transport in the context of an overall strategy to support the electrification of road transport;
- iv. procure a fleet of new electric buses for use at COP26 to showcase Scotland's low and zero emission bus manufacture and stimulate greater international demand.

51 Older buses are often found to be used for school transport.

⁵⁰ If the barrier to prioritising bus measures or the infrastructure needed is because of lack of capacity at a local authority level, then support should be made available to them by establishing a shared team of experts for bus-related infrastructure projects – creating a steady pipeline of jobs as a result.

⁴⁸ https://www.researchgate.net/publication/329715376_Scottish_Public_Health_ Network_ScotPHN_Fuel_Poverty_Overview 49 https://assets.publishing.service.gov.uk/government/uploads/system/uploads/ attachment_data/file/357409/Review7_Fuel_poverty_health_inequalities.pdf

- 2.2 Together these measures would support our public transport system, deliver backing for our manufacturing base, while contributing to the net-zero transition. These would have to adhere to procurement rules, but we would urge government to fully consider how to support this recommendation within these confines. We also note that public trust will have to be rebuilt if passenger numbers are to return, and government must work with transport providers and passenger groups to promote positive messages about public transport and introduce measures to rebuild passenger confidence.
- 2.3 The opportunity to re-prioritise any existing transport spend, currently earmarked for increasing road capacity, and redirect it toward investments in low-carbon transport initiatives should be actively pursued.

<u>Rational</u>e

- 2.4 Net-zero: transport is now the highest emitting sector in Scotland, responsible for roughly 36% of greenhouse gas emissions in 2018. Emissions are largely unchanged on 1990 levels. A large proportion of this is due to personal car use. Measures that help us shift to more active and sustainable modes of transport (such as low or zero emission buses) will be necessary if we are to reduce emissions and reach net-zero by 2045.
- 2.5 Just Transition: Any reduction in bus services will have a significant impact on access to employment, social inclusion, and ultimately our economic recovery. Support for buses in the form of priority infrastructure will make these services more attractive and help them to regain the passenger numbers lost as a result of the pandemic. The wider proposals to support the take-up of new low and zeroemission buses will also help with this, by delivering a cleaner more modern service. Furthermore, the electrification of both public and private transport will reduce

emissions and improve air quality, bringing about health improvements, particularly in the places that suffer the poorest air quality.

- 2.6 Crucially, these proposals would also help support our domestic manufacturing base which is under pressure as a result of the pandemic. The recent announcement of redundancies at Scotland's worldclass bus manufacturer underlines the vulnerability of this sector.⁵² For these measures to be effective, government will need to consider a procurement strategy to ensure the domestic supply chain is prioritised. Procuring zero-emission electric buses for COP26 could be a once in a lifetime opportunity to promote Scottish manufacturing, and afterwards they could be leased to operators and local authorities, benefiting all of the country.
- 2.7 Developing an enhanced plan to accelerate charging infrastructure will support the adoption of zero-emission buses, as well as private vehicles. Again, there is evidence of short-term economic gains from this spending, arising from increased activity in domestic electricity supply chains.⁵³ Importantly, planning to accelerate the charging infrastructure would also help direct private investment toward government priorities in the recovery period.
- 2.8 Economic Recovery: these measures would provide support for our domestic supply chain. This supply chain will need to be preserved if we are to reduce emissions while maximising economic opportunities in the long-term. Many of these jobs are high-quality, skilled jobs. Bus scrappage schemes have in the past been found to deliver greater value than other possible measures, such as scrappage schemes for diesel cars.⁵⁴ All of these

53 https://bellona.org/publication/joint-paper-laying-the-foundations-for-a-net-zerosociety

⁵² https://www.alexander-dennis.com/media/news/2020/july/adl-moves-to-leanermanufacturing-model-as-falling-demand-for-new-buses-and-coaches-forcescompany-to-adjust/

⁵⁴ https://greenerjourneys.com/wp-content/uploads/2017/04/Improving-Air-Quality-in-Towns-and-Cities-PROF-DAVID-BEGG-Final.pdf

proposals would help government address the Hot Spot we identified in relation to transport and set us on the pathway to a fairer, net-zero transport system.

3. Maintain and create new jobs for oil and gas workers

- **3.1** The workforce in the oil and gas sector is facing a precarious future, brought about by the declining oil price and changes in demand. There is a need to create jobs in the short-term that will allow us to retain this workforce and the associated supply chains, so that they can be redirected towards our net-zero transition.
- **3.2** To sustain jobs in the short-term, and preserve capacity across the supply chain, we recommend that:
- i. A large scale decommissioning programme is created with capital support to drive critical activity in the North Sea, maintain essential skills and position the North Sea infrastructure for a new integrated future.
- **3.3** Focusing in particular on plugging and abandonment activity (where much of the value in decommissioning lies) would result in the creation of immediate jobs throughout the whole supply chain.
- **3.4** There is also an urgent requirement to build local supply chain capacity and capability for our energy transition. To exploit the whole-chain economic and employment opportunity from the energy transition rapid progress must be made in two clear areas: a) the acceleration and investment in critical development projects that pave the way for the net-zero energy system⁵⁵ and, b) action now that will improve the competitiveness of Scotland's energy supply chain and help us exploit the immediate

55 Such as floating wind, hydrogen, CCUS and/or decarbonisation of the North Sea

opportunities in the offshore wind sector. A package of action must include:

- i. the rapid delivery of the Floating Wind Centre of Excellence already committed to through ORE Catapult;
- ii. the acceleration of Scotland's industrial decarbonisation cluster, including Acorn;
- iii. the speeding up of new initiatives such as the Shetland Energy Hub;
- iv. public investment in facilitating infrastructure such as ports and harbours;
- v. direct investment in manufacturing facilities to build competitiveness in specific off-shore wind components and net-zero enabling technology.
- **3.5** Devolved powers should be used, where possible, to maximise domestic manufactured content in energy projects. Clear political leadership and clarity of intent brought by the above measures will build confidence, support jobs and ensure that the supporting supply chain redirects people, resources and training into these emerging markets.

Rationale

3.6 Net-zero: reaching our climate change targets will require large sustained increases to our renewable generation capacity, with much of this likely to come from offshore wind. Other technologies such as CCUS and hydrogen generation feature prominently in Committee on Climate Change scenarios and are seen as necessities if we are to meet net-zero. Decommissioning has no impact on emissions but conserves capacity in the short-term and provides a skills bridge as we develop our capability and supply chain through the energy transition.

- **3.7** Just Transition: if we are to replace the jobs lost over time in oil and gas we will need to grow the manufacturing base for next generation energy technologies. Adoption of these technologies must be accompanied by high-value manufacturing in the supply chain. The opportunities for this do exist, and are significant, but bold and decisive action will be needed to ensure they are delivered. Decommissioning could act as a bridge for workers displaced in recent months who could play a key role in these emerging energy industries and new manufacturing opportunities. Decommissioning would be available to particularly hard hit groups such as offshore drillers.
- 3.8 Economic Recovery: there will be a significant pipeline of work in offshore wind now, with a new ScotWind leasing round recently launched and continued opportunities in operations and maintenance for existing developments. We have identified a number of projects that would not only build on areas in which Scotland may enjoy a competitive advantage, but which could be implemented at pace. Given the maturity of the basin, there is a large number of potential decommissioning projects in the North Sea. However, there is a risk that projects are delayed as operators direct investment elsewhere. A comprehensive clear programme combined with support in this area would ensure activity could be quickly ramped up. Both sets of recommendations will help address the Hot Spot we have identified in relation to oil and gas. The oil and gas sector deal promised by the UK Government within the next five years may represent the single biggest opportunity to secure a just transition in this sector on the longer-term.

4. Help the rural economy by helping Scotland's nature

- **4.1** New employment opportunities in remote and rural areas may be subdued in the coming months, and we need to promote investments that can both protect and grow employment. This can be done through expanding climate-friendly habitats, and in particular:
- i. Supporting increased, diversified tree planting;
- ii. Confirming longer-term support for the Forestry Grant Scheme
- iii. Maximising supply chain opportunities arising from tree planting and existing commitments on peatland restoration.

Rationale

- 4.2 Net-zero: Peatland restoration is essential in order to meet net-zero, as damaged peat is a significant source of emissions. Once restored, peat has significant capacity to remove carbon from the atmosphere and to contribute to climate mitigation. Tree planting is also a good means of locking up carbon, but there is growing evidence that native species are more effective in capturing carbon than non-native productive species at scale and in the long term, although the latter can secure quick wins over the short term. Other factors, such as soil type, will also have implications for the ability to capture carbon, with potential carbon loss from planting on carbon rich soils.
- **4.3** Just Transition: These proposals could specifically benefit rural and remote communities, identified as one of the Hot Spots in our report. Many of the jobs may be suitable for young people, as well as more experienced workers with backgrounds in engineering and heavy machinery operation (including those from industries impacted

by the pandemic). Supporting community groups to access public funding and be actively involved in the decision-making process regarding land use will also help ensure the benefits of forestry/peatland restoration are shared as widely as possible. Evidence we have heard through the course of work has also pointed to the importance of community involvement and land tenure in managing land use changes, something we will continue to consider in advance of our final report.

- 4.4 Economic Recovery: Given that planting/ restoration takes place outdoors physical distancing would present less of a challenge in the coming months. This is an opportunity to help secure existing jobs and stimulate new ones in rural and remote areas – and not just directly, but also in the supply chain and support services needed. These activities could be ramped up quickly once planting season begins later in the year, and would yield wider benefits by stimulating economic activity in rural areas.
- **4.5** Continued investment in forestry and peatland restoration can create supply chain opportunities across Scotland. As part of our recovery we must make sure we are maximising the domestic supply chain and support service opportunities. These opportunities exist in a range of areas including in forest management and timber processing, forestry civil engineering, haulage, agents, accommodation in hotels and B&Bs, machinery and servicing contracts, tree nurseries, and research and education.⁵⁶

5. Align skills development – for young and old – with the net-zero transition

- **5.1** A clear need for our recovery from the pandemic will be getting people back into work quickly, and we highlighted support for young people as a particular Hot Spot. A package worth £100 million was recently announced, which included a national retraining scheme, along with a jobs guarantee for young people.⁵⁷ Where possible, these announcements should reflect government priorities on delivering a just transition to net-zero. We recommend:
- i. Ensuring retraining initiatives direct sufficient resources towards opportunities in the net-zero economy by giving strong direction to delivery agencies such as Skills Development Scotland and Scottish Enterprise.
- ii. Ensuring the young person's jobs guarantee promotes opportunities such as apprenticeships that are aligned with the transition to net-zero.
- **5.2** These programmes are already announced by government and will have to prioritise getting people into good jobs as quickly as possible. Not all jobs will be in sectors key to emission reduction (such as renewable energy etc). While this is the reality of delivering employment support in the midst of a recession, government should look to ensure money spent is helping us on our transition to net-zero where possible.
- **5.3** Attention should also be paid to specific groups of workers displaced by the current crisis, such as in the oil and gas and hospitality sectors. Opportunities for retraining, building on the legacy of successful initiatives like the Transition Training Fund, should be identified. PACE, led by Skills Development Scotland, will play a vital role in responding to redundancies

57 https://www.gov.scot/news/gbp-100-million-for-employment-support-and-training/

⁵⁶ https://forestry.gov.scot/images/corporate/pdf/economic-contribution-forestry-2015. pdf

and resourcing of this service will need to also be considered. This may also involve working with employers and trade unions to promote retraining opportunities among workers who have recently lost their jobs. The young person's job guarantee should provide meaningful work that gives valuable experience while paying the real Living Wage. This scheme could build on existing apprenticeship and training schemes in areas such as in construction, renewable energy and electric vehicles in order to contribute to the transition.

<u>Rational</u>e

- 5.4 Net-zero: reaching our climate change targets will require fundamental shifts in many sectors of our economy. The skills system needs to deliver an appropriately skilled workforce to ensure that actions needed to reduce emissions can be undertaken, and that Scotland can capture the economic opportunities on offer. To take just one example, a recent study estimated that reaching net-zero in the energy sector would require around 50,000 additional trained workers in Scotland between 2020 and 2050.⁵⁸
- **5.5 Just Transition:** retraining initiatives can allow workers made recently unemployed to contribute to Scotland's net-zero transition by opening up skilled employment opportunities in new and emerging sectors. As highlighted, opportunities exist for workers in sectors such as oil and gas to gain new qualifications that will allow them to move into new opportunities that support our transition. Depending on design, the young people the chance to contribute to Scotland's net-zero transition while earning a real Living Wage.

5.6 Economic Recovery: retraining and supporting young people are absolute necessities in our recovery. Ensuring they are aligned as much as possible with our ambition on a just transition to net-zero can build on existing programmes in place (such as apprenticeships), and can be progressed quickly. Similarly, experience in agencies such as Skills Development Scotland in administering the Transition Training Fund can be a valuable resource to draw on and will support the implementation of this recommendation. Support for young people is crucial to prevent long-term 'scarring' effects from developing in the form of lower earnings and unemployment.

6. Give a clear sense of direction and attach conditions to funding

- 6.1 Rebuilding from the harm caused by the pandemic is a monumental challenge and will require all sections of our society pulling in the same direction if we are to deliver a just and green recovery. Public funding cannot do this alone, and there is a need to steer private money in the direction of government priorities for the recovery. To do this, we recommend:
- i. The Scottish Government should make clear declarations of policy intent with respect to each of the recommendations in this report, providing confidence to those investing in, developing, and implementing the actions.
- Where public funds are used in support the recovery (either directly or to leverage private finance) the Scottish Government should ensure that the action will align with a just transition to net-zero.

58 https://www.nationalgrid.com/document/126256/download

- **6.2** Both of these points are closely related to the discussion in our interim report on the importance of planning. In particular, any state aid provided to companies in the recovery should be made conditional on the company having a credible, robust transition plan that supports emission reductions and continued economic prosperity. In an evidence session with the finance sector earlier in the year, we also heard of the importance of stable, long-term policy commitment from government to leverage private finance.⁵⁹
- 6.3 It is essential that recovery measures are developed with the goals of netzero and just transition in mind. This will include in key documents such as the Infrastructure Investment Programme and updated Climate Change Plan. We need to develop industries vital to netzero for the long-term, avoiding boomand-bust cycles that will impede career development and damage confidence.

Rationale

6.4 Net-zero: the Committee on Climate Change have been clear that support for carbon-intensive sectors in the recovery from the pandemic should be contingent on them taking real and lasting action on climate change.⁶⁰ Not doing so risks 'lockingin' emissions and jeopardises delivery of our targets on emission reduction. In 2019, the Committee on Climate Change estimated the annual cost of the transition to net-zero would be 1–2% of GDP up to 2050 for the UK as a whole. The public sector cannot meet this on its own, and leveraging private investment is an absolute necessity.

- 6.5 Just Transition: both points here strongly resonate with our interim report. Conditionality, in particular, could help advance the adoption of transition planning. In turn this would secure jobs and emission reductions over time, while helping rebuild our economy from the pandemic.
- 6.6 Economic Recovery: In making decisions about state aid in the coming months, government may have to balance the need to protect people's livelihoods now against the need to reduce emissions. Developing a robust set of principles for conditionality, underpinned by credible transition planning, can help balance these priorities. Creating a strong sense of direction and policy certainty for the private sector can be done quickly and would help ensure Scotland's public and private sectors pull in the same direction as we recover from the pandemic.

⁵⁹ https://www.gov.scot/publications/just-transition-commission-meeting-papers-

⁶⁰ https://www.theccc.org.uk/wp-content/uploads/2020/05/CCC-to-Cabinet-Secretary-Roseanna-Cunningham-Covid-19-recovery.pdf



© Crown copyright 2020

OGL

This publication is licensed under the terms of the Open Government Licence v3.0 except where otherwise stated. To view this licence, visit **nationalarchives.gov.uk/doc/open-government-licence/version/3** or write to the Information Policy Team, The National Archives, Kew, London TW9 4DU, or email: **psi@nationalarchives.gsi.gov.uk**

Where we have identified any third party copyright information you will need to obtain permission from the copyright holders concerned.

This publication is available at www.gov.scot

Any enquiries regarding this publication should be sent to us at The Scottish Government St Andrew's House Edinburgh EH1 3DG

ISBN: 978-1-83960-919-0 (web only)

Published by The Scottish Government, July 2020

Produced for The Scottish Government by APS Group Scotland, 21 Tennant Street, Edinburgh EH6 5NA PPDAS743526 (07/20)

www.gov.scot